



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth 1 Chwefror 2000

Tuesday 1 February 2000

Cynnwys Contents

- | | |
|----|---|
| 3 | Etholiad i'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd
<i>Election to the Committee on European Affairs</i> |
| 3 | Cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd
<i>Questions to the First Secretary</i> |
| 16 | Cwestiwn Brys: Gwyliadwriaeth E-bost
<i>Urgent Question: E-mail Surveillance</i> |
| 21 | Datganiad Busnes
<i>Business Statement</i> |
| 23 | Y Cynllun Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru
<i>The Education and Training Action Plan for Wales</i> |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Etholiad i'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd
Election to the Committee on European Affairs**

Y Llywydd: Cynigiaf

The Presiding Officer: I propose that

y dylai'r Cynulliad benderfynu rhoi Jocelyn Davies yn lle Elin Jones ar y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd, a hynny ar unwaith. *the Assembly resolves to replace with immediate effect, Elin Jones with Jocelyn Davies on the Committee on European Affairs.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

**Cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd
Questions to the First Secretary**

**Cynllun Strategol
Strategic Plan**

Q1 Pauline Jarman: Will the First Secretary report on any discussions he has had with the Secretary of State for Wales about the strategic plan? (OAQ3210)

C1 Pauline Jarman: A fydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd gystal â rhoi adroddiad am unrhyw drafod a fu rhyngddo ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru am y cynllun strategol? (OAQ3210)

The First Secretary (Alun Michael): I have regular discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales on a wide variety of issues. I sent him a copy of the draft plan for information on the day that it was published.

Pauline Jarman: Since the Better Wales plan is based on the assumption that Objective 1 funding must be used fully if it is to be effective, why have the First Secretary and the Secretary of State for Wales not been able to secure the necessary extra funding? Why does the 'A Better Wales' document also state that the spending review will only provide the opportunity for the Assembly to press its case for the additional resources needed, instead of stating that they will be guaranteed by the UK Government?

The First Secretary: I am getting tired of repeating the obvious. There is a process to go through. We have made clear what is required for us to deliver on Objective 1 funding. We achieved Objective 1 status for Wales and we have every intention of making it work. We are in negotiations with Europe and are having discussions with the UK Government, particularly the Treasury. That is in hand.

Dafydd Wigley: Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn derbyn bod agweddau canolog ar y cynllun strategol yn dibynnu ar gyllid. Yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf, beth bynnag fydd y sefyllfa o 2001 ymlaen, bydd yn rhaid inni gyllido rhaglenni a phrosiectau Ewropeaidd Amcan 1 o'r bloc Barnett sydd wedi cael ei ddiffinio ar ein cyfer ers dros flwyddyn. Dan amgylchiadau o'r math hyn, onid yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn derbyn, os yw arian yn mynd i mewn i brosiectau Ewropeaidd, nad yw'r arian hwnnw ar gael ar gyfer ysbytai ac ysgolion, a bod hynny yn anorfod yn tanseilio'r rhaglen a'r cynllun strategol a gyflwynodd ef i'r Cynulliad?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Yr ydych wedi colli'ch gafael ar resymeg, Dafydd. Fel Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, dros flwyddyn yn ôl, fe ddadleuais i gyda'r Trysorlys y byddai angen arian ychwanegol arnom yn y flwyddyn sydd yn dechrau ym mis Ebrill i sicrhau y byddai'n bosibl inni weithio gyda phrosiectau Amcan 1. Yr ydym

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd (Alun Michael): Caf drafodaethau rheolaidd ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar amrywiaeth eang o faterion. Anfonais gopi o'r cynllun drafft ato er gwybodaeth ar y diwrnod y'i cyhoeddwyd.

Pauline Jarman: Gan fod y cynllun Gwell Cymru yn seiliedig ar y rhagdybiaeth bod rhaid defnyddio arian Amcan 1 yn llawn os ydyw i fod yn effeithiol, pam nad yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru wedi gallu sicrhau'r arian ychwanegol angenrheidiol? Pam y mae'r ddogfen 'Gwell Cymru' hefyd yn datgan na fydd yr arolwg o wariant ond yn rhoi cyfle i'r Cynulliad wthio'r ddadl dros yr adnoddau ychwanegol angenrheidiol, yn lle rhoi sicrwydd ohonynt gan Lywodraeth y DU?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Yr wyf yn dechrau blino ar ailadrodd yr hyn sydd yn amlwg. Mae proses i'w dilyn. Eglurasom yr hyn sydd yn angenrheidiol er mwyn inni fynd â'r maen i'r wal o ran arian Amcan 1. Enillasom statws Amcan 1 i Gymru ac mae gennym bob bwriad o'i gael i weithio. Yr ydym yn negodi ag Ewrop ac yn cael trafodaethau â Llywodraeth y DU, yn enwedig y Trysorlys. Mae hynny ar y gweill.

Dafydd Wigley: I am sure that the First Secretary accepts that central aspects of the strategic plan depend on funding. During the next 12 months, whatever the situation will be from 2001 onwards, we will have to fund the European Objective 1 programmes and projects from within the Barnett block which has been defined for us for over a year. Under such circumstances, does the First Secretary not accept that, if money goes into European projects, that money will not be available for hospitals and schools, and that that will inevitably undermine the programme and the strategic plan that he presented to the Assembly?

The First Secretary: You have lost your grip on logic, Dafydd. As Secretary of State for Wales, over a year ago, I argued with the Treasury that we would need additional money in the year beginning in April to ensure that it would be possible for us to work with Objective 1 projects. We have already made it clear that we must succeed in

eisioes wedi ei gwneud yn amlwg fod yn rhaid inni lwyddo i gael arian ychwanegol i Gymru dros gyfnod Amcan 1, ac yr ydym yn gweithio i sicrhau bod yr arian ar gael.

William Graham: As regards implementation of the strategic plan, can you assure us that, wherever possible, and having regard to the terms of European Union conventions, local purchase will be given priority? We do not want any more reports of purchases being made abroad, particularly websites from America. Local purchase must be a priority, but the EU terms must be observed.

The First Secretary: I am not sure to what you are referring in terms of websites bought abroad. However, in our debate last week about the commissioning of the new Assembly building, we made it clear that we would ensure that, to the extent that it is possible within European procurement regulations—to which you are quite right to refer—indigenous materials would be used and companies in Wales would have the opportunity to be a part of the whole project. I am rather sad that the Conservative Party does not want to be an enthusiastic part of the process.

However, we should be wary of going too far down this line. In Wales, we depend on being able to export to England and Europe. Closing doors to those countries would send messages to them to close doors on our products. Therefore, we must be careful about how we use this double-edged weapon. It is appropriate for the landmark building of the new Assembly to convey messages about Wales and Welsh materials, and it was in that context that we debated it last week.

getting additional money for Wales over the Objective 1 period, and we are working to ensure that the money is available.

William Graham: O ran gweithredu'r cynllun strategol, a allwch roi sicrwydd i ni y rhoddir blaenoriaeth i brynu'n lleol, lle bynnag y bo modd, a chan roi sylw i amodau cytundebau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd? Nid ydym am gael rhagor o adroddiadau am brynu dramor, yn enwedig gwefannau o America. Rhaid i brynu lleol fod yn flaenoriaeth, ond rhaid ufuddhau i amodau'r UE.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Nid wyf yn sicr at beth yr ydych yn cyfeirio o ran gwefannau a brynwyd dramor. Fodd bynnag, yn ein dadl yr wythnos diwethaf ynghylch comisiynu adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, rhoesom ar ddeall mai deunyddiau cynhenid a ddefnyddid i'r graddau mwyaf posibl oddi mewn i'r rheoliadau prynu Ewropeaidd—y cyfeiriwch atynt yn gwbl briodol—ac y câi cwmnïau yng Nghymru gyfle i fod yn rhan o'r prosiect cyfan. Mae'n chwith gennyf braidd nad yw'r Blaid Geidwadol am fod â rhan frwdfrydig yn y broses.

Fodd bynnag, dylem fod yn wiliadwrus rhag dilyn y llwybr hwn yn rhy bell. Yng Nghymru, dibynnwn ar ein gallu i allforio i Loegr ac i Ewrop. Byddai cau drysau ar y gwledydd hynny'n anfon negeseuon atynt i gau drysau rhag ein cynhyrchion ni. Felly, rhaid inni fod yn ofalus ynglŷn â'r modd y defnyddiwn yr arf ddaufiniog hon. Mae'n briodol i adeilad nodedig y Cynulliad newydd cyfleu negeseuon am Gymru a deunyddiau o Gymru, ac yn y cyd-destun hwnnw y'i trafodasom yr wythnos diwethaf.

Grant Dampio'r Dreth Gyngor Council Tax Dampening Grant

Q2 David Davies: Will council tax dampening grants help to solve problems of social exclusion? (OAQ3192)

The First Secretary: The dampening effect is most significant in local authorities where a greater proportion of the population suffers from deprivation. It therefore follows that

Q2 David Davies: A fydd grantiau dampio treth y cyngor yn cynorthwyo i ddatrys problemau allgáu cymdeithasol? (OAQ3192)

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Mae'r effaith dampio'n fwyaf amlwg mewn awdurdodau lleol lle y mae cyfran fwy o'r boblogaeth yn dioddef o amddifadedd. Mae'n dilyn, felly, y

there will be a beneficial impact on many who are socially excluded. We have inherited an unsatisfactory formula for dividing up the local government cake, and the council tax dampening scheme was designed to protect council tax payers from the excessive council tax increases, that would result from the strict application of that formula.

David Davies: Is it not the case that, in hard-pressed rural areas such as Monmouthshire, there will be a further increase in social exclusion because of the effect of the council tax dampening grant scheme, which will mean less money in those areas for local services? Does he share the frustration of so many of us who live in Monmouthshire, such as the community councillors from Llanelli Hill in the public gallery behind me, who are fed up with receiving far less money than any other local authority in Wales, and resent the fact that £17 million from revenue support will be top-sliced in order to bail out four local authorities which have been Labour-run for generations and which have been appallingly mismanaged? Will he insist that the leaders of the three out of four Labour authorities that have mismanaged their funds be dragged before the appropriate Assembly Committees so that we may question them as to how they manage to overspend by so much and why we have to bail—

2:09 p.m.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Members should confine their supplementaries to one succinct question. The First Secretary will give us one succinct answer.

The First Secretary: I thought that there must be an audience somewhere. I said that we were trying to give short answers to questions. That is hardly appropriate when we are being harangued in that way. Your questions are a total misrepresentation. I point out to David that even if council tax in Monmouthshire increased by the projected amount, it would still have the second lowest council tax in Wales. He needs to look at the facts before playing to his audience.

Janet Davies: Top-slicing council budgets to

bydd effaith lesol ar lawer sydd wedi eu allgáu'n gymdeithasol. Etifeddasom fformwla anfoddhaol ar gyfer rhannu teisen llywodraeth leol, a dyfeisiwyd cynllun dampio'r dreth gyngor er mwyn gwarchod talwyr y dreth gyngor rhag codiadau gormodol yn y dreth gyngor, a ddigwyddai o ganlyniad i gymhwyso'r fformwla honno'n gaeth.

David Davies: Onid yw'n wir y bydd cynnydd pellach mewn allgáu cymdeithasol mewn ardaloedd gwledig sydd dan bwysau fel Sir Fynwy, oherwydd effaith cynllun grant dampio'r dreth gyngor, a fydd yn golygu bod llai o arian yn yr ardaloedd hynny ar gyfer gwasanaethau lleol? A yw'n rhannu pryder llawer ohonom sydd yn byw yn Sir Fynwy, fel y cynghorwyr cymuned o Llanelli Hill yn yr oriel gyhoeddus y tu ôl i mi, sydd wedi syrffedu ar dderbyn llawer llai o arian nag unrhyw awdurdod lleol arall yng Nghymru, ac yn ddig ynghylch y ffaith y bydd £17 miliwn o'r grant cynnal refeniw yn cael ei frigdorri er mwyn achub croen pedwar awdurdod lleol a gafodd eu rhedeg gan Lafur am genedlaethau ac sydd wedi eu camreoli'n ofnadwy? A fydd yn mynnu y caiff arweinyddion y tri o blith y pedwar awdurdod Llafur a gamreolodd eu cyllid eu llusgo gerbron Pwyllgorau priodol y Cynulliad fel y gallwn eu holi ynghylch sut y llwyddasant i orwario cymaint a pham y mae'n rhaid i ni eu hachub—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dylai'r Aelodau gadw at un cwestiwn cryno yn eu cwestiynau atodol. Bydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn rhoi un ateb cryno i ni.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Yr oeddwn yn sicr bod cynulleidfya yn rhywle. Dywedais ein bod yn ceisio rhoi atebion byr i gwestiynau. Prin bod hynny'n briodol pan gawn bregeth felly. Mae eich cwestiynau yn gamddarluniad llwyr. Dywedaf wrth David, hyd yn oed pe cynyddai treth y cyngor yn Sir Fynwy yn ôl y swm amcanol, byddai ganddi y dreth gyngor isaf ond un yng Nghymru o hyd. Mae angen iddo edrych ar y ffeithiau cyn chwarae i'w gynulleidfya.

Janet Davies: Mae brigdorri cyllidebau

help—rightly so in view of what has just been said—the four poorest councils in Wales is leading to swingeing increases in council tax throughout the country, causing serious financial difficulties for those on low income but above the threshold for relief. Will you point out to the Cabinet and the Finance Secretary, before the final budget decisions are made, the dire need for assistance from the Assembly for these taxpayers?

The First Secretary: There is an increase in council taxes which has been built in, in the assumption that over time the level of council expenditure covered through local taxation would be increased proportionately—it had gone down proportionately over several years. Damping is not intended to bail out inefficient, overspending or debt-ridden counties. It has been a feature of the settlement since 1996 and it reflects the inadequacies of the current formula used to calculate standard spending assessments. We said how much money was available in order to debate with the Welsh Local Government Association the extent of damping to protect those four authorities in particular—although it also applies, to a lesser extent to others—against what otherwise would have been massive increases. It is all part of one picture. It is not a question of taking money from one set of authorities to give it to another.

Kirsty Williams: How does Alun Michael see a proposed £70 hike in council tax for the people of Brecon and Radnor aiding social inclusion? The 1,000 residents of Knighton who signed the petition that I have here obviously do not think it will. Neither do I. Does he agree that the real issue here is not the damping scheme but the fundamental underfunding of local government, which began under the Tories, was continued by his administration and acquiesced to in this Chamber by Plaid Cymru when it failed to vote against your budget?

The First Secretary: No, I do not agree with that. The WLGA acknowledged last year that local authorities had the most generous settlement for many years. The projection for

cynghorau—ac yn iawn felly yng ngolwg yr hyn sydd newydd ei ddweud—er mwyn helpu'r pedwar cyngor tlotaf yng Nghymru yn arwain at godiadau aruthrol yn y dreth gyngor ledled y wlad, gan beri anawsterau ariannol difrifol i'r rhai sydd ar incwm isel ond sydd uwchlaw'r trothwy ar gyfer cymorth. A dynnwch chi sylw'r Cabinet a'r Ysgrifennydd Cyllid, cyn gwneir y penderfyniadau terfynol ar y gyllideb, at yr angen dybryd am gymorth o'r Cynulliad ar gyfer y trethdalwyr hyn?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Mae cynnydd yn y trethi cyngor sydd wedi ei gynnwys, gyda'r rhagdybiaeth y byddai lefel y gwariant gan gynghorau y telir amdano drwy drethiant lleol yn cynyddu'n gyfrannol dros amser—yr oedd wedi disgyn yn gyfrannol dros sawl blwyddyn. Ni fwriedir i ddampio achub croen siroedd sydd yn aneffeithlon, yn gorwario neu at eu clustiau mewn dyled. Mae wedi bod yn un o nodweddion y setliad ers 1996 ac yn adlewyrchu diffygion y fformwla bresennol a ddefnyddir i gyfrifo asesiadau gwariant safonol. Dywedasom faint o arian oedd ar gael er mwyn trafod gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru faint y dampio er mwyn gwarchod y pedwar awdurdod hynny yn arbennig—er ei fod hefyd yn berthnasol i eraill, i raddau llai—rhag yr hyn a fyddai fel arall yn godiadau enfawr. Mae'r cwbl yn rhan o un darlun. Nid yw'n fater o gymryd arian oddi ar un set o awdurdodau i roi i un arall.

Kirsty Williams: Sut y mae Alun Michael yn credu y bydd codiad arfaethedig o £70 yn y dreth gyngor i bobl Brycheiniog a Maesyfed yn cynorthwyo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol? Yn amlwg, nid yw'r 1,000 o drigolion Trefyclo a arwyddodd y ddeiseb sydd gennyf yma yn credu y gwnaiff hynny. Nid wyf yn credu y gwnaiff ychwaith. A yw'n cytuno mai'r mater gwirioneddol yma yw nid y cynllun dampio ond tanariannu sylfaenol llywodraeth leol, a ddechreuwyd o dan y Torïaid, a barhawyd gan ei weinyddiaeth ef ac a oddefwyd yn y Siambr hon gan Blaid Cymru pan fethodd â phleidleisio yn erbyn eich cyllideb?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Nac ydwyf, nid wyf yn cytuno â hynny. Cydnabu Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru y llynedd bod awdurdodau lleol wedi cael y setliad mwyaf

the three years that we indicated at that time, showed a massive improvement in their situation. Local government is under pressure. There is money going in to make a major input on education because of the high priority that we give to that. Money is going in for social services. That means there are priorities to be decided at a local level to which it is difficult for local authorities to respond. The only reason this is an issue this year is because some in local government forgot that an arrangement had been made since 1996 to have a damping scheme. We all agreed that the current arrangement is unsatisfactory and would be unfair to some of the poorest authorities in Wales. It has not been controversial in the same sense in previous years because it was not made an issue within local government in the same way in previous years.

hael ers blynyddoedd lawer. Dangosodd yr amcanestyniad ar gyfer tair blynedd a nodwyd gennym bryd hynny, welliant aruthrol yn eu sefyllfa. Mae llywodraeth leol o dan bwysau. Mae arian yn mynd i mewn i greu mewnbwn o bwys i addysg oherwydd y flaenoriaeth uchel a roddem i hynny. Mae arian yn mynd i mewn ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Golyga hynny fod blaenoriaethau sydd i'w penderfynu ar lefel leol y mae awdurdodau lleol yn ei chael yn anodd ymateb iddynt. Yr unig reswm pam y mae hyn o dan sylw eleni yw am fod rhai mewn llywodraeth leol wedi anghofio bod trefniant wedi ei wneud ers 1996 i gael cynllun dampio. Yr oeddem oll yn gytûn bod y trefniant presennol yn anfoddhaol ac y byddai'n annheg i rai o'r awdurdodau tlotaf yng Nghymru. Ni fu'n ddadleuol yn yr un ystyr mewn blynyddoedd cynt am na wnaethpwyd ef yn destun dadlau oddi mewn i lywodraeth leol yn yr un modd mewn blynyddoedd cynt.

Brian Gibbons: Does the First Secretary agree that the four councils mentioned have not only some of the most socially and economically deprived wards in Wales but the most socially and economically deprived wards in the United Kingdom, and that only this Welsh Labour Government has had the courage to take remedial action, pending the reform of the allocation formula?

Brian Gibbons: A yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn cytuno bod gan y pedwar cyngor a soniwyd amdanynt nid yn unig rai o'r wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig yn gymdeithasol ac yn economaidd yng Nghymru ond rhai o'r wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig yn gymdeithasol ac yn economaidd yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ac mai ond y Llywodraeth Lafur Gymreig hon a fu'n ddigon dewr i gymryd camau i wella hynny, nes diwygio'r fformwla dyrannu?

The First Secretary: It is my view that we needed to take action, and seek to do so in agreement with local government, to protect the poorest authorities. We ended up with a lower sum of damping, which was the WLGA's wish, rather than the higher figure that had been suggested and discussed in the Partnership Council. Damping is in some ways a crude instrument, because it is assessed at a local authority level. Social exclusion exists in other local authorities also. However, this is the right way to act until we can get a new formula in place.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Yn fy marn i, yr oedd angen inni weithredu, a ceisio gwneud hynny drwy gytundeb â llywodraeth leol, er mwyn gwarchod yr awdurdodau tlotaf. Yr hyn a gawsom yn y diwedd oedd swm dampio is, sef yr hyn a ddymunai Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yn hytrach na'r ffigur uwch a awgrymwyd ac a drafodwyd yn y Cyngor Partneriaeth. Mae'r dampio ar ryw ystyr yn offeryn amrwd, oherwydd fe'i hasesir ar lefel awdurdod lleol. Mae allgáu cymdeithasol yn bodoli mewn awdurdodau lleol eraill hefyd. Fodd bynnag, hon yw'r ffordd gywir i weithredu nes gallwn sefydlu fformwla newydd.

Dogfen Raglennu Sengl Amcan 1 **Objective 1 Single Programming Document**

Q3 Peter Black: What implications for the

C3 Peter Black: Pa oblygiadau sydd yn

Assembly's relations with Europe does the response by the European Commission to the single programming document on Objective 1 funding have? (OAQ3188)

The First Secretary: None, except to clarify the way ahead. At the turn of the year, we received a copy of the draft preliminary response from the Commission, which is a part of the negotiations with the Commission. The Commission's formal response to our Objective 1 single programming document, when it comes, will be another step in that process. Last week, I confirmed with the Commission and its officials that our interpretation of the draft response was correct.

Peter Black: I am pleased that my question gave the First Secretary a chance to report back on his meeting in Brussels or Strasbourg, whichever it was. Does he accept that the main issue for the Objective 1 areas of Merseyside, south Yorkshire, Cornwall and Wales is whether match funds will be available to deliver the programmes? Does he agree with Peter Kilfoyle that this may well be a resigning issue?

The First Secretary: We must understand that it is important that we have the resources to deal with the public expenditure cover, and to deal with match funding at an adequate level. We are engaged in that process. I would not like to make too direct a comparison with what goes on in the three English areas. There are big differences between the four Objective 1 areas. To clarify matters, our meetings were in Brussels and included a meeting with Commissioner Barnier.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Are you aware that one issue on which Europe needs to be satisfied is that Wales can make the best and fullest possible use of Objective 1 funds? You should not be surprised, therefore, at the deep disappointment there will be following your letter to me today, in which you are unable to give a guarantee or commitment that Wales will get the full £1.2 billion allocated by Europe or sufficient match funds for the year 2000-01. Given that Gordon Brown has a war chest of £7 billion at a conservative estimate—some estimates place it as high as

ymateb y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i'r ddogfen raglennu sengl ar Amcan 1 i berthynas y Cynulliad ag Ewrop? (OAQ3188)

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Dim, heblaw i oleuo'r ffordd ymlaen. Ar droad y flwyddyn, derbyniasom gopi o'r ymateb rhagarweiniol drafft oddi wrth y Comisiwn, sydd yn rhan o'r negodiadau gyda'r Comisiwn. Bydd ymateb ffurfiol y Comisiwn i'n dogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 1, pan ddaw, yn gam arall yn y broses honno. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cadarnheais gyda'r Comisiwn a'i swyddogion fod ein dehongliad o'r ymateb drafft yn gywir.

Peter Black: Yr wyf yn falch bod fy nghwestiwn wedi rhoi cyfle i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd adrodd yn ôl ar ei gyfarfod ym Mrwsel neu Strasbourg, pa un bynnag yr oedd. A yw'n derbyn mai'r prif fater i ardaloedd Amcan 1 Glannau Mersi, de Swydd Efrog, Cernyw a Chymru yw a fydd arian cyfatebol ar gael i gyflawni'r rhaglenni? A yw'n cytuno â Peter Kilfoyle y gallai hyn fod yn fater ymddiswyddo?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Rhaid inni ddeall ei bod yn bwysig inni gael yr adnoddau i ymdrin â swm y gwariant cyhoeddus, ac i ymdrin ag arian cyfatebol ar lefel ddigonol. Yr ydym yn ymwneud â'r broses honno. Ni hoffwn wneud cymhariaeth rhy uniongyrchol â'r hyn sydd yn mynd ymlaen yn y tair ardal yn Lloegr. Mae gwahaniaethau mawr rhwng y pedair ardal Amcan 1. Er mwyn rhoi gwedd eglurach ar hyn, ym Mrwsel yr oedd ein cyfarfodydd ac yr oeddent yn cynnwys cyfarfod â'r Comisiynydd Barnier.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A ydych yn ymwybodol mai un mater y mae angen rhoi sicrwydd i Ewrop yn ei gylch yw y gall Cymru ddefnyddio arian Amcan 1 yn y modd gorau a llawnaf posibl? Ni ddylech synnu, felly, at y siom fawr a fydd yn sgîl eich llythyr ataf heddiw, lle nad ydych yn gallu rhoi sicrwydd neu ymrwymiad y bydd Cymru'n derbyn y £1.2 biliwn cyfan a ddyrannwyd gan Ewrop neu arian cyfatebol digonol ar gyfer y flwyddyn 2000-01. O dderbyn bod gan Gordon Brown gist ryfel, ac ynddi £7 biliwn ar amcangyfrif gochelgar—a chymaint â £12

£12 billion, why is it that you cannot go back to the Treasury and argue the case for Wales for the year 2000-01? Why have you thrown in the towel so easily?

The First Secretary: Was that the headline in the press release, Ieuan? You should know better than to depend on conservative estimates. The fact is that I am far from throwing in the towel. I do not need to go back to the Treasury because I am there. We are engaged with the UK Government and the Treasury and engaged on the job. We are getting on with it and not just talking about it. I expressed again, in my letter to you, my determination to ensure that Wales, to use your words, can make the best and fullest use of the available finances to be able to draw down the £1.2 billion, as it figures at the moment, and to get the finances into Wales to meet the requirements for match funding. We are on the case, Ieuan. Support us on that and support us in challenging people to come up with the schemes that will transform the economy of Wales in the long term. It is the quality of the schemes that will make the difference and bring about the long-term, sustainable improvement in the quality of people's lives and the economy.

biliwn yn ôl rhai amcangyfrifon—pam na allwch fynd yn ôl i'r Trysorlys a dadlau'r achos dros Gymru ar gyfer y flwyddyn 2000-01? Pam y rhoesoch y ffidil yn y to mor rhwydd?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Ai hynny oedd y bennawd yn y datganiad i'r wasg, Ieuan? Dylech wybod yn well nag i ddibynnu ar amcangyfrifon gochelgar. Y ffaith amdani yw fy mod ymhell o roi'r ffidil yn y to. Nid oes angen imi fynd yn ôl i'r Trysorlys oherwydd yr wyf yno. Yr ydym wrthi gyda Llywodraeth y DU a'r Trysorlys ac yn mynd ymlaen â'r gwaith. Yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen ag ef ac nid yn siarad amdano'n unig. Mynegais eto, yn fy llythyr atoch, fy mhenderfyniad i sicrhau y bydd Cymru, a defnyddio'ch geiriau chi, yn gallu defnyddio'r arian sydd ar gael yn y modd gorau a llawnaf posibl er mwyn gallu codi'r £1.2 biliwn fel y cyfrifir ar hyn o bryd, a chael yr arian i Gymru er mwyn cyflawni'r gofynion ar gyfer arian cyfatebol. Yr ydym yn gweithio ar hynny, Ieuan. Cefnogwch ni ar hynny a chefnogwch ni wrth herio pobl i ddyfeisio'r cynlluniau a fydd yn trawsffurfio economi Cymru yn y tymor hir. Ansawdd y cynlluniau fydd yn gwneud y gwahaniaeth ac yn dwyn gwelliant tymor hir, cynaliadwy yn ansawdd bywydau pobl a'r economi.

Cynhwysiant Cymdeithasol (Tlodi ymysg Pensiynwyr) Social Inclusion (Poverty among Pensioners)

Q4 Jenny Randerson: In the light of the Assembly's policies on social inclusion, what initiatives do you have to deal specifically with poverty among pensioners? (OAQ3215)

C4 Jenny Randerson: Yng ngoleuni polisiau'r Cynulliad ar gynhwysiant cymdeithasol, pa fentrau y bwriadwch eu cyflwyno er mwyn ymdrin yn benodol â thlodi ymysg pensiynwyr? (OAQ3215)

The First Secretary: As a result of Government action, the oldest and poorest pensioners will soon be £500 a year better off than they were in 1997. Our social inclusion policies will help by addressing issues such as crime and transport and other services of particular concern to the elderly—I referred to social services a short time ago. We have provided more money for health and social services, of which elderly people are among the major users, as well as a range of measures that will benefit carers and those for whom they care. We have also substantially increased funding for the home

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: O ganlyniad i weithredau'r Llywodraeth, bydd y pensiynwyr hynaf a thlotaf yn £500 y flwyddyn ar eu hennill cyn hir nag oeddent yn 1997. Bydd ein polisiau cynhwysiant cymdeithasol o gymorth drwy ymdrin â materion fel troseddu a thrafnidiaeth a gwasanaethau eraill sydd o bwys arbennig i'r henoed—cyfeiriais at wasanaethau cymdeithasol ychydig amser yn ôl. Darparasom fwy o arian ar gyfer iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, lle y mae pobl oedrannus ymysg y defnyddwyr pennaf, yn ogystal ag amrediad o fesurau a fydd o les i

energy efficiency scheme from 1 April this year.

ofalwyr a'r rhai y maent yn gofalu amdanynt. Yr ydym hefyd wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol yr arian ar gyfer y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref o 1 Ebrill eleni.

2:19 p.m.

Jenny Randerson: Do you accept that we have a greater than average concentration of poor pensioners in Wales and that their plight will not be helped by an increase of only 75p a week in their pensions because some of them do not claim their dues? There are 750,000 pensioners in the UK not claiming their full rights. In particular, do you accept that life will be made even more difficult for pensioners if the Government goes ahead with plans to insist that benefits are paid into bank accounts from 2003? Do you realise that many pensioners do not have, and do not want, a bank account and that even if they opened one it would not be any use to them as the banks are closing local branches? Will you make urgent representations to the Government on this issue in order to save local services and local post offices, which perform such an important social function in local communities?

Jenny Randerson: A ydych yn derbyn bod gennym grynhoed uwch na'r cyfartaledd o bensiynwyr tlawd yng Nghymru ac na fydd cynnydd o ond 75c yr wythnos yn eu pensiynau'n gwella eu stad am nad yw rhai ohonynt yn hawlio'r hyn sydd yn ddyledus iddynt? Mae 750,000 o bensiynwyr yn y DU nad ydynt yn hawlio'r cwbl y mae ganddynt hawl iddo. Yn benodol, a ydych yn derbyn y bydd bywyd yn fwy anodd byth i bensiynwyr os bydd y Llywodraeth yn mynd ymlaen â'i bwriad i fynnu y caiff budd-daliadau eu talu i mewn i gyfrifon banc o 2003? A ydych yn sylweddoli nad oes cyfrif banc gan lawer o bensiynwyr, ac nad yw llawer am gael un, a hyd yn oed pe baent yn agor cyfrif na fyddai hynny o fudd iddynt gan fod y banciau'n cau canghennau lleol? A wnewch gyflwyno sylwadau ar frys i'r Llywodraeth ar y mater hwn er mwyn achub gwasanaethau lleol a swyddfeydd post lleol sydd yn cyflawni swyddogaeth gymdeithasol mor bwysig mewn cymunedau lleol?

The First Secretary: As you know, Jenny, we have made representations on the importance of post offices, not just in rural communities but in urban communities as well. I have been involved over many years—particularly through the Citizens Advice Bureaux movement—in promoting people's knowledge of their benefits and encouraging them to claim what is available to them. In Cardiff on 1 December with Alistair Darling, the Secretary of State for Social Security, we announced plans for joint ministerial committees to cover poverty among pensioners, as well as child poverty and the information revolution. I agree that poverty among pensioners can be addressed in several ways, including encouraging people to take up the benefits that are available to them.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Fel y gwyddoch, Jenny, cyflwynasom sylwadau ar bwysigrwydd swyddfeydd post, nid yn unig mewn cymunedau gwledig ond mewn cymunedau trefol hefyd. Bûm yn gysylltiedig dros flynyddoedd lawer—yn enwedig drwy fudiad y Canolfannau Cyngori—â hyrwyddo gwybodaeth ymysg pobl am eu budd-daliadau a'u hannog i hawlio'r hyn sydd ar gael iddynt. Yng Nghaerdydd ar 1 Rhagfyr gydag Alistair Darling, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Nawdd Cymdeithasol, cyhoeddasom gynlluniau ar gyfer cydbwyllgorau gweinidogol i roi sylw i dlodi ymysg pensiynwyr, yn ogystal â thlodi plant a'r chwyldro gwybodaeth. Cytunaf y gellir ymdrin â thlodi ymysg pensiynwyr mewn sawl ffordd, gan gynnwys annog pobl i hawlio'r budd-daliadau sydd ar gael iddynt.

David Melding: Many elderly people in Wales are concerned about the level of charges that they have to pay for social care and, in some instances, for nursing care. A

David Melding: Mae llawer o bobl oedranus yng Nghymru yn pryderu ynghylch lefel y costau y mae'n rhaid iddynt eu talu am ofal cymdeithasol ac, mewn rhai

central finding of the Royal Commission on the long-term care of the elderly is that such charges ought to be abolished. The Commission reported nearly a year ago. When might we have a response from this Administration, or must we wait for a derivative reply from London?

The First Secretary: As David knows, each Assembly Committee has had the opportunity to look at the allocation of the Assembly's resources. We need to consider the UK Government's response on what allocations are made across the UK on those issues that remain non-devolved. Wherever there is the opportunity to help elderly people I am convinced that all of us across the Assembly would wish to do so.

achosion, am ofal nyrsio. Un o ganfyddiadau canolog y Comisiwn Brenhinol ar ofal tymor hir am yr henoed yw y dylid dileu costau o'r fath. Mae bron flwyddyn ers i'r Comisiwn roi ei adroddiad. Pa bryd y cawn ymateb oddi wrth y Weinyddiaeth hon, ynteu a oes rhaid inni ddisgwyl am ymateb ail-law o Lundain?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Fel y gŵyr David, mae cyfle i bob Pwyllgor Cynulliad edrych ar y dyraniad o adnoddau'r Cynulliad. Mae angen inni ystyried ymateb Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch pa ddyraniadau a roddir ledled y DU ar y materion hynny sydd heb eu datganoli. Lle bynnag y mae cyfle i helpu pobl oedrannus, yr wyf yn sicr y bydd pawb ohonom ar draws y Cynulliad yn dymuno gwneud hynny.

Uwchgynhadledd y Ddaear 2002 Earth Summit 2002

C5 Geraint Davies: A wnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd ddatganiad ynghylch sut mae'n bwriadu sicrhau bod Cymru yn cyfrannu at y paratodiau ar gyfer uwchgynhadledd y ddaear yn 2002? (OAQ3209)

Q5 Geraint Davies: Will the First Secretary make a statement about how he intends to ensure that Wales contributes to the preparations for the earth summit in 2002? (OAQ3209)

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Deallaf nad yw hi'n bendant y bydd y Cenhedloedd Unedig yn parhau ag uwchgynhadledd yn 2002, 10 mlynedd wedi'r uwchgynhadledd yn Rio. Mae gan y Llywodraeth gyfrifoldeb i arwain trafodaethau rhyngwladol. Os cynhelir yr uwchgynhadledd, byddwn yn ceisio dylanwadu ar y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â'r math o faterion a gaiff eu trafod yn ogystal â gwneud cyfraniad cadarnahol i safbwynt y DU.

The First Secretary: I understand that it is not certain that the United Nations will continue with the summit in 2002, 10 years after the Rio summit. The Government has a responsibility to lead international discussions. If the summit takes place we will attempt to influence the Government on the kind of issues that will be discussed as well as to make a positive contribution to the UK position.

Geraint Davies: A wnewch sicrhau bod Cymru yn cael ei chynrychioli yn uwchgynhadledd y ddaear yn 2002? Y mae'n hanfodol bod swyddogion y Cynulliad yn ymwybodol o ddatblygiadau ar lefel gydwladol a'u bod yn adrodd i'r Cynulliad a'r Pwyllgor perthnasol.

Geraint Davies: Will you ensure that Wales is represented at the earth summit in 2002? It is vital that Assembly officials are aware of developments on an international level and report to the Assembly and the relevant Committee.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Byddwn yn edrych ymlaen i weld sut y bydd yr uwchgynhadledd yn datblygu. Os oes modd inni gael ein cynrychioli neu i ddylanwadu ar y drafodaeth, gwnawn hynny. Fel y deallaf, mae'n rhaid i gynnig fynd gerbron y Cenhedloedd Unedig er mwyn penderfynu

The First Secretary: We will look forward to see how the summit develops. If it is possible for us to be represented at or influence the discussion, we will do so. As I understand it, a proposal has to go before the United Nations in order to decide to hold the summit in the first place. As that develops,

cynnal y gynhadledd yn y lle cyntaf. Wrth i hynny ddatblygu, byddwn yn rhoi gwybodaeth i'r Cynulliad ac yn dadlau dros y syniadau mewn da bryd.

we will inform the Assembly and debate the ideas in good time.

Mick Bates: Given that the theme of the earth summit is sustainable development and that we have a statutory duty to promote that, would the First Secretary agree that the implementation of local Agenda 21 is essential for a framework to achieve sustainability in Wales? If so, what funding has he made available to ensure that all local authorities can fulfil local Agenda 21 activities?

Mick Bates: O gofio mai thema uwchgynhadledd y ddaear yw datblygu cynaliadwy a bod gennym ddyletswydd statudol i hyrwyddo hynny, a yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn cytuno bod gweithredu'r Agenda 21 leol yn holl bwysig i gael fframwaith er mwyn sicrhau cynaliadwyedd yng Nghymru? Os felly, pa arian a ddarparwyd ganddo i sicrhau y gall yr holl awdurdodau lleol gyflawni gweithgareddau'r Agenda 21 leol?

The First Secretary: I believe that Agenda 21 activities are funded within the general provision for local authorities. The sustainable development strategy, which we have out for consultation, offers an opportunity for local authorities as well as Assembly Members to comment on how they are proceeding so that their own responsibilities comply with an all-Wales strategy.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Credaf fod gweithgareddau Agenda 21 yn cael eu hariannu oddi mewn i'r ddarpariaeth gyffredinol i awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r strategaeth ddatblygu cynaliadwy, a gylchredwyd ar gyfer ymgynghori, yn cynnig cyfle i awdurdodau lleol yn ogystal ag Aelodau Cynulliad wneud sylwadau am y modd y maent yn mynd yn eu blaen fel bod eu cyfrifoldebau eu hunain yn cydymffurfio â strategaeth i Gymru gyfan.

David Davies: Does the First Secretary agree that encouraging local authorities to allow motorcycles to use bus lanes would contribute in a minor way to reducing pollution, and that this should be part of our agenda?

David Davies: A yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn cytuno y byddai annog awdurdodau lleol i ganiatáu i feiciau modur ddefnyddio lonydd bysiau yn gyfraniad bach at leihau llygredd, ac y dylai hynny fod yn rhan o'n agenda?

The First Secretary: That is a specific question, which I do not think I am qualified to answer. There are always implications for congestion and road safety in extending the use of bus lanes. That matter is better dealt with by road experts. Local authorities should look at the issues of congestion and speeding up traffic in their areas.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Cwestiwn penodol yw hwnnw na chredaf fy mod yn gymwys i'w ateb. Mae oblygiadau bob amser i dagfeydd traffig a diogelwch y ffyrdd wrth ymestyn y defnydd o lonydd bysiau. Ymdrinnir â'r mater hwnnw'n well gan arbenigwyr ffyrdd. Dylai awdurdodau lleol ystyried y materion sydd yn ymwneud â thagfeydd traffig a chyflymu traffig yn eu hardaloedd.

Cynllun Strategol Strategic Plan

Q6 Jocelyn Davies: Will the First Secretary report on progress towards completion of the strategic plan? (OAQ3212)

C6 Jocelyn Davies: A fydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd gystal â rhoi adroddiad am y cynnydd a gafwyd tuag at gwblhau'r cynllun strategol? (OAQ3212)

The First Secretary: The draft plan was published on 24 January. It received a generally warm welcome. Consultation on it, both within and outside the Assembly, will proceed until 3 March. The revised plan will then be debated by the Assembly and the final version published by the end of March.

Jocelyn Davies: The draft plan insists that by 2003 the health inequalities affecting Wales's most deprived communities will have been tackled. However, there is no plan of action for doing this. How do you propose to achieve this?

The First Secretary: You have to look at individual strategies for health improvement, the development of local health action plans and how that fits in with the reorganisation of the health service and the creation of a single health service in each area. We are trying to engage local authorities, health service bodies and voluntary organisations in the improvement of health in their areas and encourage people to do this at a local as well as a wider level. Many issues are linked—such as community redevelopment, health and job opportunities—in terms of improving the overall health of the local community, both in terms of health sense and as a healthy community sense.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Cyhoeddwyd y cynllun drafft ar 24 Ionawr. Rhoddwyd croeso cynnes iddo ar y cyfan. Bydd yr ymgynghori arno, oddi mewn ac oddi allan i'r Cynulliad, yn mynd ymlaen tan 3 Mawrth. Bydd y cynllun diwygiedig yn cael ei drafod wedyn gan y Cynulliad a chyhoeddir y fersiwn terfynol erbyn diwedd Mawrth.

Jocelyn Davies: Mae'r cynllun drafft yn mynnu yr eir i'r afael erbyn 2003 â'r anghydraddoldebau iechyd sydd yn effeithio ar gymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nid oes cynllun gweithredu i wneud hynny. Sut y bwriadwch ei gyflawni?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Rhaid ichi edrych ar strategaethau unigol ar gyfer gwella iechyd, datblygu cynlluniau gweithredu iechyd lleol a'r modd y mae hynny'n cyd-fynd ag ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd a chreu gwasanaeth iechyd sengl ym mhob ardal. Yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud i awdurdodau lleol, cyrff y gwasanaeth iechyd a mudiadau gwirfoddol gymryd rhan mewn gwella iechyd yn eu hardaloedd ac annog pobl i wneud hynny ar lefel leol yn ogystal ag ar lefel ehangach. Mae llawer o faterion yn gysylltiedig—fel ailddatblygu cymunedol, iechyd a chyfluoedd gwaith—o ran gwella iechyd cyffredinol y gymuned leol, yn yr ystyr o iechyd ac yn yr ystyr o gymuned iach.

Lwfansau Cynghorwyr Councillors' Allowances

Q7 Jonathan Morgan: Has the issue of councillors' allowances been raised at the Partnership Council? (OAQ3203)

The First Secretary: No.

Jonathan Morgan: That was brief. I thank the First Secretary for his reply. Will the First Secretary join with his colleagues in expressing concern at the latest pay hike for senior councillors in Cardiff and bring forward an Assembly Order to cap the amounts of money that can be paid in such circumstances?

The First Secretary: The Assembly and the Welsh Local Government Association co-operated to write an independent report to

C7 Jonathan Morgan: A godwyd mater lwfansau cynghorwyr yn y Cyngor Partneriaeth? (OAQ3203)

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Naddo.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr oedd hynny'n fyr. Diolchaf i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd am ei ymateb. A wnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd ymuno â'i gydweithwyr wrth fynegi pryder ynghylch y codiad diweddaraf yn y tâl i uwch gynghorwyr yng Nghaerdydd a chyflwyno Gorchymyn Cynulliad i gapio'r symiau o arian y gellir eu talu mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Cydweithiodd y Cynulliad a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i ysgrifennu adroddiad annibynnol er

provide guidelines for the remuneration of councillors in Wales. At present, it is a matter for individual local authorities. That all-Wales report is intended to provide a framework against which individual authorities can make their decisions.

Jenny Randerson: I declare an interest as a councillor in Cardiff. I think that you would perhaps join me in expressing concern at the amount of the allowances proposed for Cardiff and at the disparity between the two reports, which I am sure you have read. Could you comment on the fact that they seem to be based on different premises? The Welsh Local Government Association report refers to public service and states that there should not be a comparison between the allowances of local government officials and those of councillors. However, the Cardiff report draws that comparison and also compares allowances with those of industry. Are you not concerned, not perhaps so much at the difference in the level of allowances, but at the fact that we do not have a clear vision in Wales about the role of local councillors?

2:29 p.m.

The First Secretary: We should be careful about rushing to a judgment on these issues. I am concerned that this matter has become something of a political football. The wide variations in allowances paid by councils are the result of amendments made in 1995 by the Conservative Government to the Local Authorities (Members' Allowances) Regulations 1991. That opened up wide variations and differences and the need for individual local authorities to make decisions on their allowances. Getting an independent report was a sensible step forward. It is not a question of the Assembly telling local government what to do or of the WLGA telling authorities what they should do. A report has been produced independently and objectively, providing a framework against which decisions can be made by those responsible.

Pauline Jarman: In view of the First Secretary's description of this matter as a

mwyn darparu canllawiau ar gyfer gwobrwyio cynghorwyr yng Nghymru. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n fater i awdurdodau lleol unigol. Bwriedir i'r adroddiad hwnnw i Gymru gyfan roi fframwaith y gall awdurdodau unigol wneud eu penderfyniadau mewn perthynas ag ef.

Jenny Randerson: Datganaf fuddiant fel cynghorydd yng Nghaerdydd. Credaf y byddwch efallai fel minnau'n mynegi pryder ynghylch swm y lwfansau a gynigir ar gyfer Caerdydd a'r gwahaniaeth rhwng y ddau adroddiad, yr wyf yn sicr eich bod wedi eu darllen. A allech wneud sylw ar y ffaith ei bod yn ymddangos eu bod wedi eu seilio ar wahanol gynseiliau? Mae adroddiad Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru'n cyfeirio at wasanaeth cyhoeddus ac yn dweud na ddylid cymharu lwfansau swyddogion llywodraeth leol a rhai cynghorwyr. Fodd bynnag, mae adroddiad Caerdydd yn gwneud y gymhariaeth honno a hefyd yn cymharu lwfansau â'r rhai mewn diwydiant. Onid ydych yn pryderu, nid gymaint am y gwahaniaeth yn lefel y lwfansau efallai, ond am y ffaith nad oes gennym weledigaeth glir yng Nghymru am rôl cynghorwyr lleol?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Dylem fod yn ofalus rhag brysio i farnu ar y materion hyn. Pryderaf fod y mater hwn wedi dod yn bêl wleidyddol i ryw raddau. Mae'r amrywiadau mawr yn y lwfansau a delir gan gynghorau'n ganlyniad i newidiadau a wnaethpwyd yn 1995 gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol i Reoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Lwfansau Aelodau) 1991. Creodd hynny amrywiadau a gwahaniaethau mawr a'r angen i awdurdodau lleol unigol wneud penderfyniadau ar eu lwfansau. Yr oedd cael adroddiad annibynnol yn gam synhwyrol ymlaen. Nid yw'n fater o'r Cynulliad yn dweud wrth lywodraeth leol am yr hyn y ddylai ei wneud nac am Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru'n dweud wrth awdurdodau am yr hyn y dylent ei wneud. Lluniwyd adroddiad yn annibynnol ac yn wrthrychol, sydd yn rhoi fframwaith y gall y rhai cyfrifol wneud penderfyniadau o'i fewn.

Pauline Jarman: Yng ngolwg disgrifiad y Prif Ysgrifennydd o'r mater hwn fel 'pêl

'political football', does he think that the three Labour Members of Parliament for Cardiff constituencies, who made remarks on this scheme, have scored an own goal?

wleidyddol', a yw'n credu bod y tri Aelod Seneddol Llafur dros etholaethau yng Nghaerdydd, a wnaeth sylwadau am y cynllun hwn, wedi sgorio gôl gartref?

The First Secretary: They have expressed their views, as they are free to do.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Mynegasant eu barn, fel y maent yn rhydd i'w wneud.

Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

Gwyliadwriaeth E-bost E-mail Surveillance

The Presiding Officer: I have decided to allow a question under Standing Order No. 6.31 on an urgent matter of public importance.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi penderfynu caniatáu cwestiwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.31 ar fater o bwys cyhoeddus brys.

Jocelyn Davies: Will the First Secretary tell me whether there is e-mail surveillance by the Executive of AMs, their support staff or of the staff in the Office of the Presiding Officer on whose confidentiality Members in this Chamber rely? Will he make a statement on the security of our e-mail system? (EAQ3500)

Jocelyn Davies: A fydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd gystal â dweud wrthyf a oes gwyliadwriaeth e-bost gan y Weithrediaeth ar Aelodau Cynulliad, eu staff cynorthwyo neu'r staff yn Swyddfa'r Llywydd y mae'r Aelodau yn y Siambr hon yn dibynnu ar eu cyfrinachedd? A fydd gystal â gwneud datganiad ar warchodaeth ein system e-bost? (EAQ3500)

The First Secretary: Dealing with e-mail, the internet and new technology is new for all of us. I am assured that no surveillance of the use of the OSIRIS network by individuals or groups of users is carried out. The only occasions when e-mails are accessed, other than by the sender and the recipient, are, first, when either of them seek help from the service desk and give the service desk permission to access their e-mails—I have made use of that facility myself when a technical problem has arisen. Secondly, where a breach of security or a potential criminal offence or an infringement of the Assembly's rules is suspected. In such instances, instructions are issued by nominated officials of the Assembly's Business and Information Systems division—usually the IT security officer—to the contractors to undertake a specific investigation. In other words, investigations must be specific and authorised. Strict limits are placed on the extent to which e-mails are monitored. The Assembly security officer and those responsible for disciplinary and personnel management are consulted as

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Mae ymdrin ag e-bost, y rhyngwrdd a'r dechnoleg newydd yn beth newydd i bawb ohonom. Cefais sicrwydd na chyflawnir gwyliadwriaeth ar y defnydd o'r rhwydwaith OSIRIS gan unigolion na grwpiau o ddefnyddwyr. Yr unig achlysuron pan eir at negeseuon e-bost, heblaw gan yr anfonydd a'r derbynnydd, yw, yn gyntaf, pan yw'r naill neu'r llall yn gofyn cymorth gan y ddesg gwasanaeth ac yn rhoi caniatâd i'r ddesg gwasanaeth fynd at eu negeseuon e-bost—yr wyf wedi defnyddio'r cyfleuster hwn fy hun pan gododd problem dechnegol. Yn ail, pan fo amheuaeth o dorri gwarchodaeth neu drosedd troseddol posibl neu o dorri rheolau'r Cynulliad. Mewn achosion o'r fath, rhoddir cyfarwyddiadau gan swyddogion dynodedig yn adran Busnes a Systemau Gwybodaeth y Cynulliad—y swyddog gwarchodaeth technoleg gwybodaeth fel arfer—i'r contractwyr er mwyn cynnal ymchwiliad penodol. Mewn geiriau eraill, rhaid i'r ymchwiliadau fod yn benodol a bod wedi eu hawdurdodi. Rhoddir terfynau pendant ar y graddau y caiff negeseuon e-bost eu monitro. Ymgynghorir â

appropriate. No such investigations have been made into any e-mails sent or received by Assembly Members or their support staff. I am assured that were such an investigation necessary, the Presiding Officer would be consulted. Investigation of officials is a matter for the Permanent Secretary and his staff. For example, an investigation was made recently into two junior officials following the discovery of unauthorised materials on the system. The individuals concerned are presently subject to disciplinary proceedings.

There was recent publicity centring on an unauthorised disclosure of information, which was investigated. When the source was identified, appropriate action was taken and the Permanent Secretary is dealing with the matter. I stress that no Cabinet member is involved in any way, either directly or indirectly, as these matters are entirely in the Permanent Secretary's hands as the head of the civil service in the Assembly. It would be wrong in terms of natural justice and due process for us, as Assembly Members, to intervene.

Apart from the Office of the Secretary of State for Wales, no one outside the National Assembly for Wales has authority to access the OSIRIS network. The network is constructed to prevent unauthorised access and, in doing so, it has to meet the relevant national Government security standards. To ensure the security of the network we follow guidance issued by Government security experts. On the instructions of Assembly officials, testing is carried out on the network to identify and remedy any access problems. This follows standard industry practice and it is backed up by Government security advice. Under the Computer Misuse Act 1990—it is important for the Assembly to understand this—if unauthorised or criminal material is, for instance, downloaded, the Assembly itself is potentially liable, as well as the individual or individuals concerned. Therefore, security is important to protect the Assembly as a whole. I hope that my response has reassured you that security has to exist, for the integrity of the system and the protection of individual Assembly Members, as well as the Assembly as a body.

swyddog diogelwch y Cynulliad a'r rhai sydd yn gyfrifol am reoli disgyblaeth a phersonél fel y bo'n briodol. Ni fu ymchwiliadau o'r fath i unrhyw negeseuon e-bost a anfonwyd neu a dderbyniwyd gan Aelodau Cynulliad neu eu staff cynorthwyo. Cefais sicrwydd, pe bai angen ymchwiliad o'r fath, y byddid yn ymgynghori â'r Llywydd. Mae ymchwilio i swyddogion yn fater i'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol a'i staff. Er enghraifft, ymchwiliwyd yn ddiweddar i ddau is swyddog ar ôl darganfod deunyddiau anawdurdodedig ar y system. Mae achos disgyblu yn erbyn yr unigolion dan sylw ar hyn o bryd.

Yr oedd cyhoeddusrwydd yn ddiweddar ynghylch datgelu gwybodaeth heb ganiatâd, y bu ymchwiliad iddo. Pan ganfuwyd y ffynhonnell, cymerwyd camau priodol ac mae'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yn ymdrin â'r mater. Pwysleisïaf nad oes yr un aelod o'r Cabinet yn gysylltiedig â hyn o gwbl, yn uniongyrchol neu'n anuniongyrchol, gan fod y materion hyn yn gyfan gwbl yn nwylo'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol fel pennaeth y gwasanaeth sifil yn y Cynulliad. Ni fyddai'n iawn o ran cyfiawnder naturiol a threfn briodol i ni ymyrryd, fel Aelodau Cynulliad.

Heblaw am Swyddfa Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, nid oes gan neb y tu allan i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru awdurdod i gael mynediad i'r rhwydwaith OSIRIS. Mae'r rhwydwaith wedi ei adeiladu er mwyn atal mynediad anawdurdodedig ac, yn hynny o beth, rhaid iddo gyrraedd safonau gwarchodaeth perthnasol y Llywodraeth genedlaethol. Er mwyn sicrhau gwarchodaeth y rhwydwaith yr ydym yn dilyn arweiniad a gyhoeddir gan arbenigwyr diogelwch y Llywodraeth. Pan yw swyddogion y Cynulliad yn cyfarwyddo hynny, gwneir profion ar y rhwydwaith i ddynodi a chywiro unrhyw broblemau mynediad. Mae hyn yn dilyn yr ymarfer arferol mewn diwydiant ac fe'i hategir gan gyngor diogelwch y Llywodraeth. O dan y Ddeddf Camddefnyddio Cyfrifiaduron 1990—mae'n bwysig i'r Cynulliad ddeall hyn—os llwythir i lawr deunydd anawdurdodedig neu droseddol, er enghraifft, gallai'r Cynulliad ei hun fod yn atebol, yn ogystal â'r unigolyn neu'r unigolion dan sylw. Felly, mae gwarchodaeth yn bwysig er mwyn diogelu'r Cynulliad fel cyfangorff. Gobeithiaf fod fy

ymateb wedi rhoi tawelwch meddwl i chi fod rhaid wrth warchodaeth, er mwyn uniondeb y system ac i ddiogelu Aelodau Cynulliad unigol, yn ogystal â'r Cynulliad fel cyfangorff.

Peter Black: You stated that surveillance does not take place, but that a facility exists to examine e-mails and the system. Can you confirm that if such an inquiry took place, Assembly Members and their staff would not be included in it without their consent? Can you also confirm that any such investigation would be contained within the National Assembly for Wales's own staff and resources, and that we would not resort to employing other civil service staff in England or Scotland to carry out such an investigation?

Peter Black: Dywedasoeh nad yw gwyliadwriaeth yn digwydd, ond bod cyfleuster i archwilio negeseuon e-bost a'r system. A allwch gadarnhau, pe bai ymchwiliad o'r fath yn digwydd, na châi Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'u staff eu cynnwys heb eu cydsyniad? A allwch hefyd gadarnhau y byddai unrhyw ymchwiliad o'r fath wedi ei gadw oddi mewn i staff ac adnoddau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, ac na ddefnyddiem staff gwasanaeth sifil eraill yn Lloegr neu'r Alban i gynnal ymchwiliad o'r fath?

The First Secretary: You understand, Peter, that I have had to become an instant expert in these matters and there are some questions that I cannot answer fully. I hope that I can give a general indication. If Members have detailed points that they would like to pursue, I am happy to respond to them and obtain advice as appropriate. My understanding is that, if an investigation which involved an Assembly Member or a member of staff serving an Assembly Member were required, the Presiding Officer would be consulted in the first instance to protect the interests of Members. That seems entirely appropriate. It would be possible for a member of staff serving an Assembly Member to download material illegally and that could potentially lead to the Assembly's being liable. There must be a capacity for investigation, but it must be appropriately protected so that it cannot be abused.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Gwelwch, Peter, imi orfod dod yn arbenigwr ar unwaith yn y materion hyn a bod rhai cwestiynau na allaf eu hateb yn llawn. Gobeithiaf y gallaf roi awgrym cyffredinol. Os oes pwyntiau manwl gan yr Aelodau yr hoffent eu dilyn, byddaf yn falch o ymateb iddynt a chael cyngor fel y bo'n briodol. Yr hyn a ddeallaf fi yw, pe bai angen ymchwiliad oedd yn cynnwys Aelod Cynulliad neu aelod staff sydd yn gwasanaethu Aelod o'r Cynulliad, y byddid yn ymgynghori'n gyntaf â'r Llywydd er mwyn diogelu buddiannau'r Aelodau. Ymddengys hynny'n gwbl briodol. Byddai'n bosibl i aelod staff oedd yn gwasanaethu Aelod Cynulliad lwytho i lawr deunydd yn anghyfreithlon a gallai hynny arwain at wneud y Cynulliad yn atebol. Rhaid cael y gallu i ymchwilio, ond rhaid ei ddiogelu'n briodol fel na ellir ei gamddefnyddio.

The second point concerns the involvement of anyone from outside the Assembly. There could be circumstances in which Assembly officials might involve the police in investigations, but as far as the integrity of the civil servants in the Assembly is concerned, I am certain that that would be maintained within the integrity of this department. I will clarify any points that Members raise about which I am not certain.

Mae'r ail bwynt yn ymwneud â chynnwys rhywun y tu allan i'r Cynulliad. Gellid cael amgylchiadau lle y gallai swyddogion y Cynulliad gynnwys yr heddlu mewn ymchwiliadau, ond i'r graddau y mae a wnelo hyn ag uniondeb y gweision sifil yn y Cynulliad, yr wyf yn sicr y cedwid hynny oddi mewn i uniondeb yr adran hon. Byddaf yn egluro unrhyw bwyntiau y mae'r Aelodau'n eu codi nad wyf yn sicr yn eu cylch.

Rod Richards: What concerns Members—

Rod Richards: Yr hyn sydd yn peri pryder i

given the nature of the allegation made in the press—is that there might be general surveillance of all e-mail communications in the Assembly. Would the First Secretary be kind enough—and I appreciate he could not possibly answer this off the top of his head—to write to Members, giving them an assessment of the resources that would be required to monitor, collate and assess all the e-mails that go around the system? That would probably reassure Members that no such surveillance goes on.

The First Secretary: I have difficulty in finding time to monitor all my own communications, never mind those of others. Yes, the resources involved would be massive, but I hope that I have made clear that there is no general surveillance. There is a tight system of specific authorisation of investigation where there is suspicion of illegal acts or a breach of security. That is important to protect individuals and the Assembly as a whole. The other side of this is that we all want to be certain that our exchanges are secure. It is possible for e-mails to collect information that is not intended to be in them. It is possible for messages to be sent regularly to the Assembly that the recipients do not want. That is the nature of electronic communications. We need systems that protect us and allow proper investigations to take place when appropriate.

2:39 p.m.

Alison Halford: My knowledge of the Computer Misuse Act 1990 is scant, but my knowledge of privacy and the Freedom of Information Bill is more up-to-date. The allegation in the newspaper is that Whitehall could be monitoring e-mails. I won a case in the European Court of Human Rights against a chief constable who listened in on my telephone calls to gain an advantage in a case I was fighting. Your answer did not mention abuse of the Freedom of Information Bill. I understand that that Bill will extend to all sorts of electronic communications. You might like to respond further and give us a categorical assurance that we are not being monitored, or, if we are, that that monitoring

Aelodau—yng ngolwg natur y cyhuddiad a wnaethpwyd yn y wasg—yw ei bod yn bosibl bod gwyliadwriaeth gyffredinol ar yr holl negeseuon e-bost yn y Cynulliad. A fyddai'r Prif Ysgrifennydd mor garedig—a sylweddolaf na fyddai modd o gwbl iddo ateb hyn yn syth—ag ysgrifennu at yr Aelodau, gan roi asesiad iddynt o'r adnoddau a fyddai'n ofynnol er mwyn monitro, casglu ac asesu'r holl negeseuon e-bost sydd yn mynd o gwmpas y system? Mae'n fwy na thebyg y rhoddai hynny dawelwch meddwl i'r Aelodau nad yw gwyliadwriaeth o'r fath yn digwydd.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd monitro pob un o'm negeseuon fy hun, heb sôn am rai pobl eraill. Byddai'r adnoddau a fyddai ynghlwm â hynny'n anferth, ond gobeithiaf fy mod wedi rhoi ar ddeall nad oes gwyliadwriaeth gyffredinol. Mae system gaeth o awdurdodi penodol i ymchwilio pan fo amheuaeth o weithredoedd anghyfreithlon neu dorri gwarchodaeth. Mae hynny'n bwysig er mwyn diogelu unigolion a'r Cynulliad fel cyfangorff. Yr ochr arall i hynny yw bod pawb ohonom am fod yn sicr bod ein negeseuon yn ddiogel. Mae modd i negeseuon e-bost gasglu gwybodaeth na fwriedir iddi fod ynddynt. Mae'n bosibl i negeseuon cael eu hanfon yn rheolaidd i'r Cynulliad nad yw'r derbynwyr am eu cael. Peth felly yw cyfathrebu electronig. Mae arnom angen systemau sydd yn ein diogelu ac yn caniatáu ymchwiliadau addas pan fo hynny'n briodol.

Alison Halford: Mae'r wybodaeth sydd gennyf am y Ddeddf Camddefnyddio Cyfrifiaduron 1990 yn brin, ond mae gennyf wybodaeth fwy cyfoes am breifatrwydd a'r Mesur Rhyddid Gwybodaeth. Y cyhuddiad yn y papur newydd yw ei bod yn bosibl bod Whitehall yn monitro negeseuon e-bost. Enillais achos yn y Llys Iawnderau Dynol Ewrop yn erbyn prif gwnstabl a wrandawodd ar fy ngalwadau ffôn er mwyn cael mantais mewn achos yr oeddwn yn ei ymladd. Nid oedd sôn yn eich ateb am gamddefnyddio'r Mesur Rhyddid Gwybodaeth. Deallaf y bydd y Mesur hwnnw yn cynnwys pob math o gyfathrebu electronig. Efallai y byddwch yn dymuno ymateb ymhellach a rhoi sicrwydd

does not abuse the long-awaited Freedom of Information Bill. That would be quite improper.

The First Secretary: I understand the emphasis that you place on this in view of your own experience. I hope that I have made it clear that the suggestion that Whitehall could be monitoring e-mails within the Assembly is not true. Apart from the Office of the Secretary of State for Wales, no one outside the Assembly has authority to access the OSIRIS network. The integrity of our system is as good as is possible. I pick up from what you have asked, Alison, and from Rod's question and hints in questions from other colleagues, that it would be useful for a detailed briefing on these arrangements to be circulated to Members. I am happy to undertake for that to be done.

David Davies: We all, presumably, appreciate that if a computer is being used illegally, we need the capacity to investigate. However, it might concern us that if Siemens' staff can monitor e-mails, they can possibly monitor everything else within a computer. What safeguards exist to stop this access from being used for purely malicious reasons, or possibly, dare I say it, political ones? What safeguards are in place and what procedures must staff follow? Who monitors the monitors?

The First Secretary: My understanding is that in order for monitoring to take place, not only is the Assembly security officer's authority needed, but monitoring has to follow set procedures. I am not fully conversant with those procedures, but they ought to be indicated, at least in general terms, in the briefing that will be provided for Members. We need checks and balances that ensure that individuals are protected but that appropriate investigations can take place when necessary. That is always a difficult and complex balance to achieve, if you have a person who is willing to abuse procedure. The fact that we have people who download, on occasion, inappropriate material or even material that could lead to criminal action, is a problem within other public bodies with

diamod i ni nad ydym yn cael ein monitro, neu, os ydym, nad yw'r monitro'n camddefnyddio'r Mesur Rhyddid Gwybodaeth hir-ddisgwyliedig. Byddai hynny'n gwbl anghywir.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Deallaf y pwyslais a roddwch ar hyn yng ngolwg eich profiad eich hun. Gobeithiaf fy mod wedi rhoi ar ddeall nad yw'r awgrym y gallai Whitehall fod yn monitro negeseuon e-bost oddi mewn i'r Cynulliad yn wir. Ar wahân i Swyddfa Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, nid oes hawl gan neb y tu allan i'r Cynulliad i gael mynediad i'r rhwydwaith OSIRIS. Mae ein system mor gadarn ag y bo modd. Casglaf o'r hyn a ofynasoch, Alison, ac o gwestiwn Rod ac o'r awgrymiadau mewn cwestiynau gan gyd-Aelodau eraill, y byddai'n fuddiol cylchredeg cyfarwyddyd manwl ar y trefniadau hyn ymysg yr Aelodau. Yr wyf yn falch o ymgymryd i sicrhau y gwneir hynny.

David Davies: Mae pawb ohonom, yn ôl pob tebyg, yn deall bod rhaid cael y gallu i ymchwilio os defnyddir cyfrifiadur yn anghyfreithlon. Fodd bynnag, gallem bryderu, os yw staff Siemens yn gallu monitro negeseuon e-bost, eu bod efallai'n gallu monitro popeth arall mewn cyfrifiadur. Pa amddiffyniadau a geir i atal defnyddio'r mynediad hwn i ddibenion cwbl faleisus, neu efallai, a gaf feiddio dweud, dibenion gwleidyddol? Pa amddiffyniadau sydd a pha weithdrefnau y mae'n rhaid i'r staff eu dilyn? Pwy sydd yn monitro'r monitoriaid?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Yr hyn a ddeallaf yw mai'r hyn sydd yn ofynnol er mwyn monitro yw nid yn unig caniatâd swyddog diogelwch y Cynulliad, ond bod y monitro hefyd yn dilyn gweithdrefnau penodol. Nid wyf yn gwbl gyfarwydd â'r gweithdrefnau hynny, ond dylent gael eu nodi, yn fras o leiaf, yn y cyfarwyddyd a ddarperir i'r Aelodau. Mae arnom angen rhwystrau a gwrthbysau sydd yn sicrhau y diogelir unigolion ond bod modd i ymchwiliadau priodol ddigwydd pan fo angen. Mater anodd a chymhleth yw cadw'r ddysgl yn wastad yn hynny o beth, os oes gennych rywun sydd yn barod i gamddefnyddio'r drefn. Mae'r ffaith bod gennym rai sydd, ar brydiau, yn llwytho i lawr deunydd amhriodol neu hyd yn oed deunydd a allai arwain at achos troseddol, yn

commercial computer systems as well as in the Assembly. Therefore it should not be a great surprise to us. However, we need to protect ourselves against it to the greatest extent possible.

John Marek: I am pleased that the First Secretary will write to Members. We must give careful consideration to this matter. I would like to see clear guidelines as to what can and what cannot be done on this matter, now that it has been raised. Importantly, it would be right for everyone to know who the nominated people are and what rules they operate by. In the First Secretary's circular, I hope that he will define 'suspicion' better. Any investigation must be based on reasonable grounds and not simply be a fishing expedition. If it is to be a fishing expedition, then we ought to know. Finally, if an investigation is mounted, under closely defined circumstances, and the AM or his or her support staff are found to be in the clear, then they ought to be informed. I ask the First Secretary to reconsider these matters, and I await his communication with interest.

The First Secretary: You are right to say that whim alone must not inform any investigation. As I understand it, the criteria by which any investigation can be authorised are closely defined. Those criteria have been defined and developed not just out of the air, but by using the experience of Government security systems and the standards that apply to other Government departments and organisations, with the emphasis on the importance of maintaining the integrity of our system. As I have indicated, as far as the Assembly Members and their staff are concerned, the Presiding Officer is the guardian at the gate. That is reassurance for all of us. He not only has expertise in information technology, but the protection of the interests of Members at heart. It is for that reason that the protection has been placed with him.

problem oddi mewn i gyrff cyhoeddus eraill sydd â systemau cyfrifiadur masnachol yn ogystal ag yn y Cynulliad. Felly, ni ddylai beri syndod mawr i ni. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni ein diogelu ein hunain rhag hynny i'r graddau mwyaf posibl.

John Marek: Yr wyf yn falch y bydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelodau. Rhaid inni roi ystyriaeth ofalus i'r mater hwn. Hoffwn weld canllawiau pendant ynghylch yr hyn y gellir ac na ellir ei wneud ar y mater hwn, gan ei fod wedi ei godi. Pwysleisïaf y byddai'n iawn i bawb wybod pwy yw'r rhai a ddynodwyd a pha reolau y maent yn eu dilyn wrth weithredu. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd, yn ei gylchlythyr, yn diffinio 'amheuaeth' yn well. Rhaid i unrhyw ymchwiliad fod ar sail resymol a bod yn rhywbeth amgenach na thaith bysgota. Os mai taith bysgota ydyw i fod, dylem gael gwybod hynny. Yn olaf, os cynhelir ymchwiliad, mewn amgylchiadau a ddiffinnir yn fanwl, ac y ceir bod yr Aelod Cynulliad a'i staff ategol yn ddieuog, dylid rhoi gwybod iddynt am hynny. Gofynnaf i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd ailystyried y materion hyn, a disgwyliaf ei neges â diddordeb.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud na ddylid seilio unrhyw ymchwiliad ar fympwy'n unig. Fel y deallaf, mae'r meini prawf y mae'n rhaid eu cyflawni er mwyn awdurdodi ymchwiliad wedi eu diffinio'n fanwl. Nid yw'r meini prawf hynny wedi eu diffinio a'u datblygu o ddim byd, ond drwy ddefnyddio profiad systemau diogelwch y Llywodraeth a'r safonau sydd yn berthnasol i adrannau a chyrff eraill y Llywodraeth, gan roi pwys ar gynnal cadernid ein system. Fel y nodais, o ran yr Aelodau Cynulliad a'u staff, y Llywydd yw ceidwad y porth. Mae hynny'n rhoi tawelwch meddwl i bob un ohonom. Nid yn unig y mae ganddo arbenigedd mewn technoleg gwybodaeth, ond mae gwarchod buddiannau'r Aelodau yn agos i'w galon hefyd. Oherwydd hynny y rhoddwyd y warchodaeth yn ei ddwylo ef.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Secretary (Andrew Davies): Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Mae'r

Business on Tuesday 8 February is as I reported last week. Business on Wednesday 9 February will now also include a motion to approve the Planning Panel guidance. Business on Tuesday 15 February is as I reported last week. On Wednesday 16 February, business will include a motion to delegate the functions of the third transfer of functions Order, which was approved in Plenary last week. On Tuesday 29 February, there will be a motion to approve the Local Authorities (Alteration of Requisite Calculations) (Wales) Regulations 2000 and a motion to approve the special grant report on asylum seekers and, also, a motion authorising the Assembly's application to join the Wales European Centre in Brussels. As discussed in the Business Committee, on Wednesday 1 March there will be a special St David's Day debate and I am consulting members of the Business Committee on what the subject of that debate should be. We will hopefully be able to announce that in Plenary next week.

I gave a commitment last week that I would schedule a debate on the Nantygwyddon landfill site at the first opportunity. I will do that as soon as we have agreed the terms of reference and obtained the full cost benefit analysis, working with Members and officials. I hope that I will be able to finalise a date for the debate and announce it in next week's business statement. Finally, following the Business Committee meeting this morning, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined, in accordance with Standing Order No. 22.5, that the following draft Orders need not be considered by a Subject Committee: the Local Authorities, (Alteration of Requisite Calculations) (Wales) Regulations 2000, the Education (Education Standards Grants) (Wales) Regulations 2000 and the Railtrack plc (Rateable Value) (Wales) Order 2000 and the Seeds (Fees) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2000. Arrangements will be made, following Plenary today, to post this statement on the intranet and the internet.

2:49 p.m.

busnes ddydd Mawrth 8 Chwefror fel yr adroddais yr wythnos diwethaf. Bydd y busnes ddydd Mercher 9 Chwefror bellach yn cynnwys cynnig i gymeradwyo canllawiau'r Panel Cynllunio. Mae'r busnes ddydd Mawrth 15 Chwefror fel yr adroddais yr wythnos diwethaf. Ddydd Mercher 16 Chwefror, bydd y busnes yn cynnwys cynnig i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau'r trydydd Gorchymyn trosglwyddo swyddogaethau, a gymeradwywyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf. Ddydd Mawrth 29 Chwefror, bydd cynnig i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Newid y Cyfrifiadau Angenrheidiol) (Cymru) 2000 a chynnig i gymeradwyo'r adroddiad grant arbennig ar geiswyr lloches a, hefyd, gynnis yn awdurdodi cais y Cynulliad i ymuno â Chanolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru ym Mrwsel. Fel y trafodwyd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, ddydd Mercher 1 Mawrth bydd dadl Gŵyl Dewi arbennig ac yr wyf yn ymgynghori ag aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Busnes ynghylch yr hyn a ddylai fod yn destun i'r ddadl honno. Gobeithiaf y gallwn i gyhoeddi hynny mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos nesaf.

Rhoddais ymrwymiad yr wythnos diwethaf y byddwn yn amserlennu dadl ar safle tirlenwi Nantygwyddon ar y cyfle cyntaf. Byddaf yn gwneud hynny gynted ag y byddwn wedi cytuno ar y cylch gwaith ac wedi derbyn y dadansoddiad cost a budd llawn, gan weithio gyda'r Aelodau a'r swyddogion. Gobeithiaf y gallaf bennu dyddiad y ddadl hon a'i gyhoeddi yn y datganiad busnes yr wythnos nesaf. Yn olaf, ar ôl cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oes angen i'r Gorchymynion drafft canlynol gael eu hystyried gan Bwyllgor Pwnc: Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Newid y Cyfrifiadau Angenrheidiol) (Cymru) 2000, Rheoliadau Addysg (Grantiau Safonau Addysg) (Cymru) 2000 a Gorchymyn Railtrack plc (Gwerth Ardrethol) (Cymru) 2000 a Rheoliadau Hadau (Ffioedd) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000. Gwneir trefniadau, ar ôl y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw, i osod y datganiad hwn ar y fewnwyd a'r rhyngwyd.

Y Cynllun Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru The Education and Training Action Plan for Wales

The Presiding Officer: I have selected the following amendments: amendments 1 and 4 in the name of Christine Humphreys, amendments 2, 7 and 8 in the name of Jonathan Morgan, amendments 3, 5 and 9 in the name of Elin Jones and amendment 6 in the name of Alun Cairns.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol y gwelliannau canlynol: gwelliannau 1 a 4 yn enw Christine Humphreys, gwelliannau 2, 7 ac 8 yn enw Jonathan Morgan, gwelliannau 3, 5 a 9 yn enw Elin Jones a gwelliant 6 yn enw Alun Cairns.

The Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training (Tom Middlehurst): I propose that

Yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 (Tom Middlehurst): Cynigiau fod

the Assembly

y Cynulliad

a) welcomes the report by the Assembly's Post-16 Education and Training Committee and its overall recommendations for implementing the education and training action plan;

(a) yn croesawu'r adroddiad gan Bwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 y Cynulliad a'i argymhellion cyffredinol ar gyfer rhoi'r cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant ar waith;

(b) endorses the overall principles, objectives and outcomes set out in the education and training action plan for Wales;

(b) yn cefnogi'r egwyddorion, yr amcanion a'r canlyniadau cyffredinol a nodir yn y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant i Gymru;

(c) agrees that education and training are intimately and equally related to securing community development; social inclusion; and wealth creation, together with personal fulfilment, enrichment and enjoyment; that these dimensions are of equal and vital importance; and that the artificial divide between education and training should be removed;

(c) yn cytuno bod cysylltiad clòs a chydradd rhwng addysg a hyfforddiant a'r broses o sicrhau datblygiad cymunedol; cynhwysiant cymdeithasol; a chreu cyfoeth ynghyd â chynorthwyo pobl i fwynhau a chyfoethogi'u bywydau a chyflawni'u dyheadau personol; bod pob un o'r dimensiynau hyn yr un mor hanfodol bwysig; ac y dylid dileu'r rhaniad artiffisial rhwng addysg a hyfforddiant;

(d) recognises the essential contributions of employers, trades unions, local government, the voluntary sector, practitioners and a wide range of other partners necessary to realise the plan;

(d) yn cydnabod cyfraniadau allweddol cyflogwyr, undebau llafur, llywodraeth leol, y sector gwirfoddol, ymarferwyr ac amrywiaeth eang o bartneriaid eraill sydd yn angenrheidiol er mwyn rhoi'r cynllun ar waith;

(e) notes the work under way by the Economic Development Committee to ensure that enterprise functions currently undertaken by training and enterprise councils are properly developed as part of the national economic development strategy;

(e) yn nodi'r gwaith sydd ar y gweill gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y swyddogaethau menter, a gyflawnir ar hyn o bryd gan y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter, eu datblygu'n briodol fel rhan o'r strategaeth ddatblygu economaidd genedlaethol;

(f) endorses the structural changes

(f) yn cymeradwyo'r newidiadau strwythurol

recommended by the Post-16 Education and Training Committee and the principle of locating skill-related enterprise functions with the new National Council for Education and Training for Wales; and

(g) agrees that the Executive puts in hand the necessary work with training and enterprise councils and the Further Education Funding Council for Wales so as to be able to implement the new arrangements for post-16 education and training by 1 April 2001, handling all staffing issues arising from the reorganisation with openness and fairness.

It is a privilege and a responsibility to open this flagship debate today, which takes forward recommendations contained in the education and training action plan for Wales. Our people have high expectations of this Assembly and our vision of Wales as a learning country; one in which individuals, businesses and communities flourish and prosper. The motion will help us realise that vision.

Education and training are equally valuable and important in achieving our goal of making Wales an inclusive society with a buoyant economy. Our aim must be to create—in Wales and for Wales—a world-class education and training system, which benefits everyone; a new modern system that is integrated, coherent and sharply focused on the knowledge and skills needs of individuals and employers and which drives out unnecessary competition and wasteful duplication.

This is a challenging objective that demands radical reform. Political consensus and partnership are, therefore, the prerequisites of radical reform. The Assembly's Post-16 Education and Training Committee has set the right pathway to achieve that. For the first time, business will have full participation at all levels in the new arrangements across the spectrum of post-16 learning and it will be wholly involved in the planning and delivery of education and training. We will provide easily accessible good quality information, advice and guidance on learning

a argymhellir gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, a'r egwyddor o roi'r cyfrifoldeb am swyddogaethau menter sydd yn gysylltiedig â medrau ar ysgwyddau'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant newydd i Gymru; ac

(g) yn cytuno y dylai'r Weithrediaeth roi cychwyn ar y gwaith angenrheidiol gyda'r cynghorau hyfforddi a menter a Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru fel y gellir gweithredu'r trefniadau newydd ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant ar ôl 16 oed erbyn 1 Ebrill 2001, gan ymdrin â'r holl faterion yn ymwneud â staffio sydd yn deillio o'r ad-drefnu mewn ffordd agored a theg.

Braint a chyfrifoldeb yw agor y ddadl arloesol hon heddiw, sydd yn mynd ag argymhellion a geir yn y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant i Gymru yn eu blaen. Mae ein pobl yn disgwyl llawer oddi wrth y Cynulliad hwn a'n gweledigaeth o Gymru fel gwlad sydd yn dysgu; un lle y mae unigolion, busnesau a chymunedau'n ffynnu ac yn llwyddo. Bydd y cynnig hwn yn ein helpu i wireddu'r weledigaeth honno.

Mae addysg a hyfforddiant yr un mor werthfawr a phwysig er mwyn cyrraedd ein nod o droi Cymru'n gymdeithas gynhwysol gydag economi hyfyw. Y nod y bydd yn rhaid inni wrtho yw creu—yng Nghymru ac er mwyn Cymru—system addysg a hyfforddiant ymhlith y gorau yn y byd, sydd o les i bawb; system fodern newydd sydd yn integredig, yn gydlynol ac yn canolbwyntio'n fanwl ar y wybodaeth a'r medrau y mae ar unigolion a chyflogwyr eu hangen ac sydd yn cael gwared ar gystadlu diangen a dyblygu gwastraffus.

Mae hyn yn amcan ymestynnol sydd yn gofyn diwygio radicalaidd. Mae consensws gwleidyddol a phartneriaeth, felly, yn anhepgor ar gyfer diwygio radicalaidd. Mae Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 y Cynulliad wedi pennu'r llwybr iawn i gyflawni hynny. Am y tro cyntaf, gall busnes gyfranogi'n llawn ym mhob lefel yn y trefniadau newydd ar draws ystod dysgu ôl-16 a bydd yn cymryd rhan lawn wrth gynllunio a chyflenwi addysg a hyfforddiant. Byddwn yn darparu gwybodaeth, cyngor ac arweiniad o ansawdd da sydd yn hawdd eu

opportunities to people of all ages through our proposals for Careers Wales. We will remove artificial barriers to learning, which will open up access for pupils and students, enhance choice, increase participation and promote social inclusion more effectively. We will raise standards through continuous improvements in quality and outcomes year-on-year so that Wales can compete in the global market place on an equal footing with other nations. Bringing education and training together, planning and providing in partnership, working for the good of our people and for the good of Wales are the hallmarks of radical reform.

I welcome the Subject Committee's report on the action plan and I thank the chair, Cynog Dafis, for his skilful chairmanship of the process, and I thank all Committee members for their spirited and intense deliberations over recent months and, indeed, all those who contributed to the Committee's work. We will continue to work closely together and with others to ensure that the reforms are implemented in a balanced and evolutionary way. However, we will not rush our fences; we will seek to maintain the momentum created by ETAG and augmented by the Committee's work. We must begin the implementation process and give the staff concerned reassurances about their future. I pay tribute to the professionalism and hard work of staff in organisations that will be affected by change, particularly those in the Further Education Funding Council for Wales and the training and enterprise councils, which will be replaced by the new arrangements. We will rely heavily on their expertise and commitment in building the new partnership that we all want to see.

During the transition period, I am determined that all staff will be treated fairly, that good employment practices will be followed and that staff will understand that there will be worthwhile and challenging jobs in the new council or other successor organisations. The commitment and vigour with which the Committee and the Cabinet have considered the action plan and the involvement of so many organisations in developing distinctive proposals for Wales is testament to the real

cyrraedd ar gyfleoedd dysgu i bobl o bob oed drwy ein cynigion ar gyfer Gyrfaodd Cymru. Byddwn yn dileu rhwystrau ffug rhag dysgu, a bydd hyn yn ehangu mynediad ar gyfer disgyblion a myfyrwyr, yn hybu dewis, yn cynyddu cyfranogiad ac yn hybu cynhwysiant cymdeithasol yn fwy effeithiol. Byddwn yn codi safonau drwy welliannau parhaus mewn ansawdd a chanlyniadau flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn fel y gall Cymru gystadlu yn y farchnad fyd-eang yn gyfartal â chenedloedd eraill. Dod ag addysg a hyfforddiant at ei gilydd, cynllunio a darparu mewn partneriaeth, gweithio er lles ein pobl ac er lles Cymru yw nodau amgen y diwygiad radicalaidd.

Croesawaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor Pwnc ar y cynllun gweithredu a diolchaf i'r cadeirydd, Cynog Dafis, am gadeirio'r broses yn fedrus, a diolchaf i holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor am eu trafodaethau brwd a hwyliog dros y misoedd diwethaf hyn ac, yn wir, i bawb a gyfrannodd at waith y Pwyllgor. Byddwn yn parhau i gydweithio'n agos â'n gilydd a chydag eraill er mwyn sicrhau y rhoddir y diwygiadau ar waith mewn modd cytbwys a datblygol. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn rhuthro'n fyrbwyll; byddwn yn ceisio cynnal y momentwm a grewyd gan y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant ac a hybwyd drwy waith y Pwyllgor. Rhaid inni ddechrau'r broses gweithredu a rhoi sicrwydd i'r staff cysylltiedig am eu dyfodol. Talaf deyrnged i broffesiynoldeb a gwaith caled y staff yn y sefydliadau y bydd y newid yn effeithio arnynt, yn enwedig y rhai yng Nghyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru a'r cynghorau hyfforddi a menter, a gaiff eu disodli gan y trefniadau newydd. Byddwn yn dibynnu'n helaeth ar eu harbenigedd a'u hymroddiad wrth greu'r bartneriaeth newydd y mae pawb ohonom am ei gweld.

Yn ystod y cyfnod pontio, yr wyf yn benderfynol y caiff yr holl staff eu trin yn deg, y dilynir arferion cyflogaeth da ac y deall y staff y bydd swyddi buddiol ac ymestynnol yn y cyngor newydd neu gyrff olynol eraill. Mae'r ymrwymiad a'r egni a welwyd yn y Pwyllgor a'r Cabinet wrth ystyried y cynllun gweithredu a'r rhan a chwaraeodd cynifer o gyrff wrth ddatblygu cynigion penodol ar gyfer Cymru yn dyst o wir werth llywodraeth ddatganoledig. Mae'n

value of devolved government. It demonstrates that the Assembly has brought about a new era of openness, co-operation and partnership; principles which run through everything the Assembly does.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn galw Cynog Dafis, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, i gyflwyno ei adroddiad i'r Cynulliad.

Cynog Dafis: Deallais y byddai'r Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 yn cyflwyno'r cynnig yn ffurfiol. Serch hynny, mae wedi gwneud mwy na hynny ac felly mae wedi dwyn peth o gynnwys fy araith. Fel yna y mae yn y Cynulliad. Ni ddylem roddi gormod o bwyslais ar gytundebau anffurfiol.

Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i ddweud gair ynglŷn ag argymhellion y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ar adroddiad y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant, ETAG. Pwysleisiaf nad wyf yn siarad am y cynnig; yr wyf yn cyflwyno adroddiad ar ran y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16. Pan drafododd y Pwyllgor ym Mehefin y llynedd sut i ddelio ag adroddiad ETAG, penderfynwyd gwneud mwy na rhoi sêl bendith ar yr argymhellion. Mewn cyfres o wrandawiadau, rhoddwyd cyfle i 21 o grwpiau a sefydliadau wyntyllu'r ystyriaethau o'r newydd. Derbyniwyd 33 o eitemau o dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig. Cytunwyd geiriad ein hadroddiad terfynol ym mis Rhagfyr, gan gyrraedd consensws ar wahân i anghytundeb ar sawl mater pwysig gan Jonathan Morgan. Cofnodwyd y rheini ar dudalen 3 yr adroddiad. Bydd Jonathan Morgan yn siarad amdanynt yn ddiweddarach.

Diolchaf i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 am drafodaeth oleuedig. Mae gennym Bwyllgor sylweddol a synhwyrol. Diolchaf i bawb a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth ac, yn arbennig, diolch i'r clerc, Julia Annand, a'r dirprwy glerc, Stephen Thomas, am eu gwaith diflino, trwyadl a rhagorol. Yn ogystal, yr wyf yn llongyfarch yr adran gyfieithu ar fersiwn Cymraeg darllenadwy a chlir. Cyfieithiad ydyw ond nid yw'n darllen felly.

dangos bod y Cynulliad wedi dod ag oes newydd o weithredu agored ac ar y cyd ac o bartneriaeth; egwyddorion sydd yn rhan o bopeth a wneir gan y Cynulliad.

The Presiding Officer: I call Cynog Dafis, the Chair of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee, to present his report to the Assembly.

Cynog Dafis: I understood that the Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training would formally propose the motion. However, he has done more than that and has therefore stolen some of the contents of my speech. That is how it is in this Assembly. We should not put too much emphasis on informal agreements.

I am pleased to have the opportunity to comment on the Post-16 Education and Training Committee's recommendations on the Education and Training Action Group's report. I emphasise that I am not speaking to the motion; I am presenting a report on behalf of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee. When the Committee discussed in June of last year how to deal with the ETAG report, it was decided to do more than rubber stamp the recommendations. In a series of hearings, 21 groups and institutions were given the opportunity to air the issues anew. Thirty-three items of written evidence were received. The wording of our final report was agreed in December, and we arrived at consensus, apart from disagreement on several important issues by Jonathan Morgan. These are recorded on page 3 of the report. Jonathan Morgan will speak about them later.

I thank the members of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee for enlightened discussion. We have a substantial and sensible Committee. I thank everybody who presented evidence and, in particular, I thank the clerk, Julia Annand, and the deputy clerk, Stephen Thomas, for their tireless, thorough and excellent work. In addition, I congratulate the translation department on a readable, clear Welsh version. It is a translation but it does not read as such.

Mae ein hargymhellion ar gyfer ailwampio addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16, sydd at ei gilydd yn cymeradwyo rhai ETAG, yn rhai arwyddocaol. Mae holl berwyl y ddau adroddiad, ynghyd â nifer o ddogfennau eraill a gyhoeddwyd cyn ac ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, yn sefydlu cysylltiad cryf rhwng addysg a hyfforddiant a'r anturiaeth genedlaethol—yr ymdrech i greu Cymru lewyrchus, hyderus, gynaliadwy a chyfiawn. Mae hyn yn dra gwahanol i'r ystyriaethau a fu'n gyrru agenda addysg Cymru yn y gorffennol. Croesawaf y newid pwyslais hwnnw yn frwd. Yr wyf yn hyderus fod hynny yn adlewyrchu barn y Pwyllgor. Erbyn hyn, deallwn fod datblygu adnoddau dynol yn allweddol i ddatblygu economaidd ac felly i adfywiad cenedlaethol Cymru.

Nid yw hynny'n golygu bod gwerthoedd addysgol traddodiadol—meithrin diwylliant a'r meddwl cwestiyngar ymreolus, mawrygu dysg er ei fwyn ei hunan—yn cael eu hanghofio. Ddim o gwbl. Mae'n rhaid cyrraedd cydbwysedd, ac mae ymdrech deg i ddisgrifio'r cydbwysedd hwnnw yn yr egwyddorion a ddisgrifir ar dudalennau 6 i 8 o'n hadroddiad. Anogaf Aelodau i edrych ar yr egwyddorion hynny. Credwn y dylent yrru agenda addysg a hyfforddiant o hyn ymlaen.

Bydd gweithredu ein hargymhellion yn golygu ailstrwythuro pellgyrhaeddol ar ddarparu addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16. Nid oes amheuaeth am hynny, nac ychwaith y gall yr ailstrwythuro hwnnw fod yn anghysurus ar adegau, fel sydd yn wir gydag unrhyw newid radical. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn oedd flaenaf ym meddyliau'r Pwyllgor oedd lles myfyrwyr, anghenion cymdeithas a'r genedl, anghenion busnes a budd yr economi. Dylai'r rheini ddod yn gyntaf, yn hytrach nag unrhyw fuddiannau sefydliadol. Wedi dweud hynny, mae'n hanfodol parchu cyfraniad y sefydliadau presennol ac, yn arbennig, yr angen i sicrhau morâl ac iawnderau i'r staff sydd yn gweithio yn y sefydliadau hynny. Heb eu hewyllys da a'u cydweithrediad, ni chyflawnir unrhyw beth.

2:59 p.m.

Mae angen inni i gyd sylweddoli ein bod yn

Our recommendations for revamping post-16 education and training, which by and large endorse those of ETAG, are significant. The whole thrust of both reports, together with several other documents published before and since the establishment of the Assembly, establishes a strong connection between education and training and the national enterprise—the endeavour to create a prosperous, confident, sustainable, just Wales. This is significantly different from the considerations which drove Wales's education agenda in the past. I welcome this shift of emphasis enthusiastically. I am confident that this reflects the Committee's view. By now, we understand that the development of human resources is crucial to economic development and therefore to the revitalisation of Wales as a nation.

This does not mean that traditional educational values—the nurturing of culture and the independent questioning mind, the celebration of learning for its own sake—are forgotten. Not at all. A balance must be struck and there is a fair attempt to describe that balance in the principles which are set out on pages 6 to 8 of our report. I urge Members to look at those principles. We believe that they should drive the education and training agenda from now on.

Implementing our recommendations will involve a far-reaching restructuring of the provision of post-16 education and training. There is no doubt about that, nor that this restructuring might at times be uncomfortable, as is true with any radical change. However, forefront in the minds of the Committee was the welfare of students, the needs of society and the nation, business needs and the interest of the economy. These should come first, rather than any institutional interests. Having said that, it is essential to respect the contribution of existing institutions and, particularly, the need to safeguard morale and the rights of staff who work in those institutions. Without their good will and co-operation, nothing will be achieved.

We must all realise that we live in a

byw mewn cyfnod chwyldroadol ym maes addysg. Mae technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu yn trawsnewid y broses o ddysgu ac yn ailddiffinio rôl yr athro, yn galluogi i ddysgu ddigwydd mewn amrywiol leoliadau—nid yn unig mewn ysgol neu goleg—a thrwy wahanol gyfryngau. Yn gynyddol, bydd efrydwyr yn mynnu cael pecynnau dysgu a phatrwm o gymwysterau y bydd modd eu teilwra i’w hanghenion unigol. Byddant, wrth gwrs, yn dysgu gydol eu hoes. Nid dewis mewn *vacuum* y byddant yn ei wneud, ond dewis yng nghyd-destun y fframwaith cymdeithasol, cenedlaethol a rhyng-genedlaethol ac yng ngoleuni gofynion y farchnad lafur. Bydd angen gwybodaeth a chynghor o ansawdd uchel i’w galluogi i ddewis yn ddoeth. Mae sefydlu Gyrfaedd Cymru ar sail y cwmnïau gyrfaol presennol a menter cyfarwyddo’r cynghorau menter a hyfforddiant yn elfen allweddol yn y diwygiadau yr ydym yn eu hargymell.

Yr oedd y Pwyllgor o’r farn, fel yr oedd y grŵp gweithredu, y dylai cydweithio a phartneriaeth rhwng sefydliadau a ddarparwyr ddisodli’r farchnad gystadleuol sydd wedi nodweddu’r patrwm ers degawd a mwy. Mae wedi achosi cryn dipyn o ddyblygu a gwastraff ac, i raddau, wedi gweithio yn erbyn lles myfyrwyr. Bydd y consortia cymunedol yn allweddol yn y trawsnewidiad hwn. Argymhellwn mai partneriaethau o ddarparwyr y dylai’r rhain fod ac y dylai eu rôl hwy gynnwys nodi anghenion eu hardaloedd, anghenion addysg a hyfforddiant unigolion a chyflogwyr, a llunio datganiad ar sut y byddai blaenoriaethau yn cael eu diwallu yn fwy priodol ac effeithiol gan y gwahanol ddarparwyr. Byddai cydlynw ar drefniadau marchnata a byddai prospectws ar y cyd i gonsortiwm cyfan yn cael ei lunio. Byddai’n rhaid i’r cynlluniau hynny gael eu cymeradwyo gan y cyngor cenedlaethol yn unol â gofynion y Cynulliad.

O fewn y patrwm cydweithredgar hwn, yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn rhagweld y byddai staff, mewn rhai amgylchiadau, yn gweithio ar draws y ffin rhwng coleg addysg bellach ac ysgol. Mae hyn yn bwysig am ei fod yn rhoi ystywythder newydd i’r ddarpariaeth. Nid yw ond yn deg inni nodi, serch hynny, ein bod wedi cael ein rhybuddio, gan yr undebau yn

revolutionary period in education. Information and communications technology is transforming the process of learning and redefining the role of the teacher, enabling learning to take place in various locations—not just in a school or college—and through different media. Increasingly, students will insist on having learning packages and a pattern of qualifications that can be tailored to their individual needs. They will, of course, be lifelong learners. They will not make a choice in a vacuum, but in the context of the social, national and international framework and in the light of the needs of the labour market. High quality information and advice will be needed to enable them to choose wisely. The establishment of Careers Wales on the basis of the present career companies and the training and enterprise councils’ guidance initiative is a key element in the reforms that we recommend.

The Committee was of the opinion, as was the action group, that co-operation and partnership between institutions and providers should replace the competitive market that has characterised the pattern for over a decade. It has caused a significant amount of duplication and waste and, to some extent, has worked against the welfare of students. The community consortia will be crucial in this transformation. We recommend that these should be partnerships of providers and that their role should include identifying their areas’ needs, the education and training needs of individuals and employers, and drawing up a statement on how priorities would be more appropriately and effectively met by the different providers. Marketing arrangements would be co-ordinated and a joint prospectus for the whole consortium drawn up. These plans would have to be approved by the national council in accordance with the Assembly’s requirements.

Within this co-operative pattern, the Committee foresaw that staff, in some circumstances, would work across the boundary between a further education college and a school. This is important as it gives new flexibility to the provision. It is only fair for us to note, however, that we were warned, particularly by the unions, that working

arbennig, bod telerau gwaith yn y ddau sector hwn—addysg bellach ac ysgolion—yn dra gwahanol ac y gallai hynny wneud gweithio ar draws sectorau yn anodd. Bydd angen ystyried y cwestiwn hwn yn fanwl.

Wrth sôn am yr undebau, mae'r Pwyllgor am syrthio ar ei fai, o ran y diffyg cydnabyddiaeth yn ein hadroddiad i rôl yr undebau. Yr ydym am esbonio ein bod yn derbyn bod eu cyfraniad yn holl bwysig. Mae bai arnom ni nad yw hynny wedi cael ei ddatgan yn glir yn yr adroddiad.

Dyma'r lle priodol, efallai, imi gyfeirio at y pryderon a fynegwyd ynglŷn â dysgu cyfrwng Cymraeg o dan yr oruchwyliaeth newydd. Mae record colegau addysg bellach yn alaethus yn y maes allweddol hwn, tra bod dosbarthiadau chwech ysgolion wedi gwneud yn well o lawer—yn enwedig yn yr ysgolion dwyieithog penodedig, ond nid yn unig yn yr ysgolion hynny. Mae ein hadroddiad yn nodi bod

'hyrwyddo dwyieithrwydd a sicrhau twf addysg a hyfforddiant trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg'

yn un o swyddogaethau'r cyngor cenedlaethol ac yn rhoi rôl allweddol i ddarparwyr addysg Gymraeg yn y consortia. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn gadarn yn ei farn bod yn rhaid ehangu'r ddarpariaeth addysg a hyfforddiant cyfrwng Cymraeg ôl-16 yn sylweddol.

Trafododd y Pwyllgor yr haen ranbarthol. Yr oedd bron pawb yn cytuno â'r angen am lefel ranbarthol o weithgarwch i sicrhau bod swyddogaethau y cyngorau menter a hyfforddiant yn cael eu diogelu a'u gwella. Bu peth anghytundeb ynglŷn â hyn, a chryn lobïo. Penderfynodd y Pwyllgor yn erbyn sefydlu byrddau rhanbarthol yn dal cyllidebau dirprwyedig ymreolus. Yn hytrach, penderfynwyd argymhell bod swyddfeydd a staff rhanbarthol y cyngor cenedlaethol yn cael cyfrifoldeb am hyfforddiant yn y gwaith a rhai materion cysylltiedig.

Yr ydym hefyd wedi argymhell paneli ymgynghorol rhanbarthol lle byddai dylanwad busnes yn nerthol. Prif rôl y rhain

conditions in these two sectors—further education and schools—are very different and that that could make cross-sector working difficult. This question needs to be considered in detail.

On the unions, the Committee admits that it is at fault, in terms of the lack of recognition in our report of the role of unions. We want to explain that we accept that their contribution is vital. We are at fault for not stating that clearly in the report.

This, perhaps, is the appropriate place for me to refer to the concerns expressed about Welsh medium education under the new system. The record of further education colleges is appalling in this key area, while school sixth forms have done much better—especially in the designated bilingual schools, but not only in those schools. Our report notes

'to promote bilingualism and ensure the growth of Welsh medium education and training'

as one of the national council's functions and gives a key role to providers of Welsh medium education in the consortia. The Committee is firm in its opinion that the provision of Welsh medium post-16 education and training must be substantially expanded.

The Committee discussed the regional tier. Almost everyone agreed on the need for a regional level of activity to ensure that the functions of the training and enterprise councils were safeguarded and improved. There was some disagreement on this, and considerable lobbying. The Committee decided against the establishment of regional boards holding autonomous delegated budgets. Rather, it was decided to recommend that regional offices and staff of the national council have responsibility for training in the workplace and some associated matters.

We have also recommended regional advisory panels where the influence of business would be powerful. Their primary

fyddai

‘cyfrannu at ddatblygiad cynlluniau prynu hyfforddiant yn y gwaith i’w cyflwyno i’w hystyried gan y Cyngor.’

Yr ydym yn argymhell y dylai’r paneli

‘sefydlu cysylltiadau gwaith agos â’r Fforymau Economaidd Rhanbarthol, y WDA yn rhanbarthol a’r Cyrff Hyfforddi Cenedlaethol i ehangu amrediad gwaith y busnesau wrth gynllunio a chyflwyno hyfforddiant yn y gwaith a helpu consortia lleol i ymestyn eu cysylltiadau â byd busnes.’

Mae hynny’n dangos pwysigrwydd creu cysylltiadau llorweddol ar y gwahanol lefelau—enedlaethol, rhanbarthol a lleol—rhwng addysg a hyfforddiant, a datblygu economaidd.

Mae penderfyniad y Pwyllgor i beidio â chefnogi byrddau rhanbarthol â chyllidebau dirprwyedig wedi cael ei ddehongli fel rhyw fath o fychanu ar gyfraniad busnes i addysg a hyfforddiant. Achubaf ar y cyfle i ddatgan nad oes dim byd pellach o feddwl nac o fwrriad y Pwyllgor. Mae’r Pwyllgor am i bobl fusnes fod â llais nerthol mewn penderfyniadau a chynlluniau ynglŷn â hyfforddiant ac addysg, trwy’r paneli rhanbarthol a thrwy ddylanwad y rheini ar y consortia cymunedol, a thrwy’r cyngor cenedlaethol. Yr ydym yn argyhoeddedig fod yr adeiladwaith yr ydym yn ei argymhell yn rhoi’r cyfle am hynny.

Mae’n hargymhellion ni ynglŷn â lleoliad priodol amrywiol strategaethau’r cynghorau menter a hyfforddiant i’w gweld ar dudalennau 25-26, ac mae’r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd hefyd yn ystyried y mater. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor o’r farn fod sicrhau parhad wrth gyflawni’r swyddogaethau hynny yn bwysig dros ben, a hefyd sicrhau nad yw arbenigedd staff presennol y cynghorau menter a hyfforddiant, sydd yn gwneud y gwaith ar hyn o bryd, yn cael ei golli.

Yr oeddwn yn siomedig i glywed prifathro ysgol ar y radio y bore yma yn sôn am

role would be

‘to contribute to the development of plans for purchasing workbased training for submission to, and consideration by, the Council itself.’

We recommend that the panels

‘should establish close working links with the Regional Economic Fora, the WDA regionally and the National Training Organisations to widen the range of business involvement in the planning and delivery of workbased training and help the local consortia extend their engagement with business.’

That indicates the importance of creating horizontal contacts on the different levels—national, regional and local—between education and training, and economic development.

The Committee’s decision not to support regional boards with delegated budgets has been interpreted as some kind of downgrading of the contribution of business to education and training. I take this opportunity to state nothing could be further from the Committee’s mind or intention. The Committee wishes business people to have a powerful voice in decisions and plans concerning training and education, through the regional panels, through their influence upon the community consortia, and through the national council. We are convinced that the structure that we recommend will give them that opportunity.

Our recommendations concerning the appropriate location of the various training and enterprise councils’ functions are to be seen on pages 25-26 and the Economic Development Committee is also considering this matter. The Committee believed that ensuring continuity in fulfilling these functions is extremely important, as also was ensuring that the expertise of existing TEC staff, who carry out the work at present, is not lost.

I was disappointed to hear a headteacher talking on the radio this morning about

Fuddsoddwyr mewn Pobl a'r posibilrwydd y byddai'r ddarpariaeth honno yn cael ei cholli. Nid oes perygl o hynny. Cyfrifoldeb i'r cyngor cenedlaethol fydd Buddsoddwyr mewn Pobl yn ôl ein hargymellion ni. Bydd y rhaglen honno a rhai eraill yn cael eu hestyn drwy swyddfeydd rhanbarthol lle mae'n fwy na thebyg y bydd yr un aelodau staff ag sydd yna ar hyn o bryd yn darparu ar eu cyfer. Mae'n drueni fod camargraff fel hyn yn cael ei greu yn ddiangen ac yr wyf yn gresynu bod hynny'n digwydd.

I gloi, yr wyf yn dod at y cyngor cenedlaethol, a fydd ag enw gwell, yr wyf yn gobeithio, na'r acronym erchyll, CETW. DYSG, efallai, os na all rhywun feddwl am enw gwell. Yr ydym yn argymhell rhoi'r parchus arswydus gyfrifoldeb am gyllido holl addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16, ac eithrio addysg uwch, ac am y swyddogaethau eraill a restrir ar dudalen 11 a 12 yn ein hadroddiad ni, i'r cyngor cenedlaethol. Dim ond trwy ddod â'r cyfrifoldebau am yr holl ffrydiau cyllido ynghyd yn yr un lle y byddai modd sicrhau cyd-dynnu i gyflwyno patrwm diwriad o ddysgu gydol oes. Dyna oedd barn mwyafrif y Pwyllgor.

Rhaid pwysleisio y bydd cyfrifoldeb mawr ar y cyngor hwn, ei gadeirydd, ei brif weithredwr a'i staff. Mae hwn yn gorff cyhoeddus anadrannol eithriadol o bwysig sydd yn atebol i'r Cynulliad. Bydd pwysau a chyfrifoldeb mawr ar y bobl sydd yn ei redeg. Dim ond y gorau a wnaiff y tro.

Un o dasgau cyntaf a phwysicaf y cyngor cysgodol, a fydd yn cael ei sefydlu tua mis Awst eleni, fydd datblygu mewn cydweithrediad ag eraill, gan gynnwys awdurdodau lleol trwy Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, fformwla gyllido gyffredin a theg. Fformwla gyffredin, ie, ond nid un haearnaid ac anystwyth. Yr ydym eisiau i'r ffomiwla adlewyrchu amrywiaeth amgylchiadau a gofynion, y gwelir rhestr ohonynt ar dudalen 23. Bydd y Pwyllgor yn derbyn adroddiadau gan y cyngor wrth i'r gwaith o lunio'r fformwla fynd rhagddo.

Investors in People and the possibility that that provision would be lost. There is no danger of that happening. Investors in People will be the responsibility of the national council according to our recommendations. That programme and others will be delivered through the regional offices where, more than likely, the same staff members as at present will be making provision for them. It is sad that this kind of wrong impression is created unnecessarily and I regret that that has happened.

In conclusion, I come to the national council, which I trust will have a better name than the awful acronym CETW. DYSG, perhaps, if no one can suggest a better name. We recommend that the awesome responsibility for funding all of post-16 education and training, with the exception of higher education, and for the other functions listed on pages 11 and 12 of our report, be given to the national council. Only through bringing responsibility for all of the funding strands together in one place could pulling together to deliver a seamless pattern of lifelong learning be ensured. That was the opinion of the majority of the Committee.

It must be emphasised that there will be an onerous responsibility on this council, its chairperson, its chief executive and its staff. This is an extremely important non-departmental public body answerable to the Assembly. There will be great pressure and responsibility for the people who run it. Only the best will do.

One of the first and most important tasks of the shadow council, which will be established around August this year, will be the development, in co-operation with others, including local authorities through the Welsh Local Government Association, of a fair and common funding formula. A common formula, yes, but not an inflexible and rigid one. We want the formula to reflect the diversity of circumstances and needs, a list of which can be found on page 23. The Committee will receive reports from the council as the work of designing the formula proceeds.

3:09 p.m.

Ni chyfeiriais hyd yn hyn at gwricwlwm ac nid wyf yn bwriadu sôn llawer am hyn. Fodd bynnag, ar dudalen 7 yn yr ochr Gymraeg o'r adroddiad ceir adran ar gwricwlwm a chymwysterau. Yr ydym yn argymhell bod y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 yn ystyried a ellid datblygu'r model cymwysterau sydd yn cael ei ymgorffori o fewn y cynigion am fagloriaeth Gymreig mewn ffordd sydd yn cyd-fynd â'r cynlluniau am fframwaith cymwysterau cyffredinol ar ôl 16. Mae'n werth cyfeirio at hynny a gwn fod y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 yn mynd i'w ystyried.

Mae'r Pwyllgor, a minnau, o'r farn y bydd gweithredu'r argymhellion hyn yn sefydlu rhan bwysig o'r adeiladwaith sefydliadol a all wneud ein hadfywiad cenedlaethol yn bosibl. Fodd bynnag, dim ond deallusrwydd, dychymyg ac ymroddiad pobl a all roi bywyd yn yr adeiladwaith hwnnw.

Christine Humphreys: Cynigiaf welliant 1. Yn dilyn pwynt (a), ychwanegu cymal newydd, ac yna ail rifo fel y bo'n briodol:

yn croesawu'n arbennig y cyfle a ddaeth yn sgîl datganoli i Gymru ddewis ei chyfeiriad ei hun i raddau helaeth mewn addysg a hyfforddiant ar ôl 16 oed.

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 4. Yn dilyn pwynt (c), ychwanegu cymal newydd, ac yna ail rifo fel y bo'n briodol:

yn cydnabod goblygiadau ariannol cynnal addysg drwy gyfrwng yr iaith Gymraeg ac addysg mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac felly'n cydnabod na fydd yr un meini prawf hyfywedd yn gymwys ar gyfer pob chweched dosbarth.

Trof at y gwelliannau eraill ar yr agenda. Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliannau 3, 5 a 9 yn enw Elin Jones. Byddwn yn ymatal ar welliant 6 yn enw Alun Cairns. Byddwn yn pleidleisio yn erbyn gwelliannau 2, 7 ac 8 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

Mae'r gwelliant cyntaf yn fy enw i yn rhoi'r cyfle inni ymfalchïo yn y ffaith fod datganoli wedi digwydd a'i fod yn gweithio. Mae'r modd y rhoddodd y Mesur Dysgu a Medrau

I have not referred so far to the curriculum and do not intend to say much about this. However, on page 7 in the Welsh language side of the report, there is a section on the curriculum and qualifications. We recommend that the Pre-16 Education Committee considers whether the qualifications model incorporated within the proposals for a Welsh baccalaureate can be developed in a way that conforms with the plans for a post-16 framework for general qualifications. It is worth referring to that and I know that it will be considered by the Pre-16 Education Committee.

The Committee, and myself, are of the opinion that the implementation of these recommendations will establish an important part of the institutional structure that can make our national revitalisation possible. However, only the intelligence, imagination and commitment of people can breathe life into that structure.

Christine Humphreys: I propose amendment 1. After point (a), insert a new clause, and then renumber as appropriate:

welcomes in particular the opportunity that devolution has given Wales to choose its own direction to a considerable extent in post-16 education and training.

I also propose amendment 4. After point (c), insert a new clause, and then renumber as appropriate:

recognises the financial implications of maintaining Welsh language education and education in rural areas, and therefore recognises that the same viability criteria will not apply for every sixth form.

I turn to the other amendments on the agenda. We will support amendments 3, 5 and 9 in the name of Elin Jones. We will abstain on amendment 6 in the name of Alun Cairns. We will vote against amendments 2, 7 and 8 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

The first amendment in my name allows us the opportunity to take pride in the fact that devolution has taken place and that it is working. The way in which the Skills and

gyfle i'r Cynulliad wneud penderfyniadau allweddol am addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 yng Nghymru yn enghraifft eglur o ddatganoli ar waith.

Mae'r broses yr ydym wedi mynd drwyddi yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ers mis Mehefin yn dangos y gwahaniaeth y mae datganoli wedi'i wneud. Cafodd pob mudiad a effeithir gan argymhellion ETAG y cyfle i leisio barn o flaen y Pwyllgor yn gyhoeddus. Ystyriodd y Pwyllgor eu pryderon a'u syniadau wrth lunio'r ddogfen sydd gerbron heddiw.

Nid dangos datganoli ar waith yn unig a wnaeth gwaith y Pwyllgor; bu hefyd yn enghraifft wych o wleidyddiaeth gynhwysol. Cafodd pob plaid o fewn y Pwyllgor y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddogfen derfynol. Manteisiwyd ar y cyfle hwnnw i greu dogfen yng ngwir ystyr consensws, ar ôl gwrando, trafod, brwydro, ychydig o anghytuno a chyfaddawdu yn y pen draw.

Atefag eiriau Tom Middlehurst a thalu teyrnged i'r modd yr arweiniwyd gwaith y Pwyllgor gan y Cadeirydd, Cynog Dafis. Atefag hefyd eiriau Cynog wrth leisio fy ngwerthfawrogiad o waith caled a phroffesiynol clerod y Pwyllgor a gweision sifil eraill, a hynny weithiau o dan bwysau amserlen dynn.

Mae gwelliant 4 yn fy enw i yn gofyn i'r Cynulliad gydnabod bod oblygiadau ariannol i gynnal addysg a hyfforddiant drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac i gynnal addysg a hyfforddiant yn ein hardaloedd gwledig. Rhaid rhoi ystyriaeth arbennig i'r sefydliadau sydd yn dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg er mwyn eu hamddiffyn. Mae perygl y bydd ysgolion Cymraeg mewn ardaloedd seisnigaidd yn cael eu boddi gan gonsortiwm lleol o gyrff sydd yn dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg yn bennaf, yn enwedig colegau addysg bellach. Mae eu record hwy o ddarparu addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn eithaf gwael, fel y crybwyllodd Cynog. Apeliad ar y colegau addysg bellach i ystyried y sefyllfa'n ddwys. Gall eu cyfraniad tuag at gynyddu'r defnydd o'r iaith Gymraeg fod yn allweddol. Ar y

Learning Bill gave the Assembly the ability to make key decisions on post-16 education and training in Wales is a clear example of devolution at work.

The process that we have been through in the Post-16 Education and Training Committee since June shows the difference that devolution has made. Every organisation that is affected by the ETAG recommendations has had the opportunity to voice its opinion publicly before the Committee. The Committee considered their concerns and ideas while preparing the document before us today.

The Committee's work has not only shown devolution at work; it has also been an excellent example of inclusive politics. Every party in the Committee had the opportunity to contribute to the document. Advantage of that opportunity was taken to create a document in the true meaning of consensus, after listening, discussing, battling, disagreeing a little and compromising in the end.

I endorse the words of Tom Middlehurst and pay tribute to the way in which the Committee's work has been led by the Chair, Cynog Dafis. I also endorse Cynog's words in voicing my appreciation of the professional and hard work of the Committee clerks and other civil servants, occasionally carried out under the pressure of a tight schedule.

Amendment 4 in my name asks the Assembly to recognise that there are financial implications to maintaining education and training through the medium of Welsh and maintaining education in our rural areas. The institutions that teach through the medium of Welsh must be given special consideration in order to protect them. There is a danger that Welsh-medium schools in anglicised areas will be drowned out by a local consortium of bodies that teach mainly through the medium of English, especially further education colleges. Their record of providing Welsh-medium education is quite poor, as Cynog mentioned. I appeal to the further education colleges to consider the situation in earnest. Their contribution to increasing the use of the Welsh language could be crucial. On the

cyfan, myfyrwyr sydd yn dewis cyrsiau addysg bellach sydd yn aros yn eu bro a gwasanaethu'r boblogaeth. Mae hynny'n cynnwys y rhai y mae'r Gymraeg yn famiaith iddynt.

Un ffordd o amddiffyn y Gymraeg ac ysgolion gwledig yw drwy ddefnyddio'r dechnoleg newydd, sydd yr ateb i bron bob cwestiwn y dyddiau hyn. Gyda chynadledda fideo, mae'n bosibl cadw dosbarthiadau eithaf bach mewn ysgolion a rhoi'r cyfle i fyfyrwyr ddewis peidio â theithio allan o'u dalgylch i gael addysg. Fodd bynnag, mae dibyniaeth ar dechnoleg newydd yn dod â phroblemau yn ei sgîl ac mae ysgolion eisoes wedi dysgu'r wers honno gyda chyfrifiaduron. Nid prynu cyfrifiaduron yw diwedd y gân. Mae'n rhaid cael cyllideb ychwanegol i'w cynnal a'u cadw, i brynu darnau newydd iddynt ac i gyflogi technegwyr i edrych ar eu hôl. Yn ystod y cwtogi mawr yng nghyllidebau ysgolion ym mlynnyddoedd olaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf, y technegwyr oedd y cyntaf i golli eu swyddi mewn rhai ysgolion. Byddai'n ddiddorol cynnal arolwg o'n hysgolion i weld faint o gyfrifiaduron sydd yn segur neu heb gael eu defnyddio'n llawn oherwydd diffyg cyllid.

Bydd yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad roi arweiniad clir i'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru ar y math o flaenoriaethau y bydd yn disgwyl iddynt gael eu hadlewyrchu mewn unrhyw fformwla gyllid o ran hyfywedd dosbarthiadau chweched dosbarth a dosbarthiadau yn ein hysgolion gwledig, yn ogystal â syniadau ynglŷn â sut i ariannu'r ddibyniaeth ar dechnoleg newydd.

We are rather disappointed with Alun Cairns's amendment 6 and its reference to comparisons with England. We felt, as a Committee, that we had prepared a document for Wales that was different and gave devolution its place. To have it compared with the situation in England was rather disappointing. We acknowledge that business has a vital role to play in the new CETW and in the local consortia, but it should not be at the expense of other partners. The Committee was determined to create true partnerships but it cannot do that if one partner is more

whole, students who choose further education courses stay in their local areas and serve the population. That includes those who have Welsh as their first language.

One way of defending the Welsh language and rural schools is through using the new technology, which is the answer to nearly all questions these days. With video conferencing, it is possible to maintain fairly small classes in schools and give students the opportunity to choose not to travel outside their catchment area to receive education. However, dependency on new technology brings problems in its wake and schools have already learned that lesson with computers. It is not just a matter of buying computers. Additional funding is needed to maintain them, to buy new parts for them and to employ technicians to look after them. During the large cutbacks in school budgets in the final years of the last Conservative Government, the technicians were the first to lose their jobs in some schools. It would be interesting to survey our schools to see how many computers are idle or are not being used fully because of insufficient funding.

The Assembly will have to give clear guidance to the National Council for Education and Training on the kind of priorities that it will expect to be reflected in any financial formula in terms of viability of sixth forms and classes in our rural schools, in addition to ideas on how to fund the dependency on new technology.

Yr ydym yn siomedig braidd ynghylch gwelliant 6 Alun Cairns a'i gyfeiriad at gymariaethau â Lloegr. Teimlem, fel Pwyllgor, ein bod wedi paratoi dogfen ar gyfer Cymru oedd yn wahanol, a rhoddodd i ddatganoli ei briod le. Yr oedd gweld ei chymharu â'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr braidd yn siomedig. Cydnabyddwn fod gan fusnes rôl holl bwysig i'w chwarae yn y Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant newydd ac yn y consortia lleol, ond ni ddylai hynny fod ar draul partneriaid eraill. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn benderfynol o greu gwir

equal than others.

The voices of all sectors must be heard. Each sector could justifiably claim that it needed a stronger voice. The voluntary sector has already voiced its concern at what it considers is a lack of representation in the system. The voluntary sector makes a great contribution in terms of drawing socially excluded people into education and training and it reaches many more people than the statutory sector. The business sector needs to work out exactly who will represent it on the consortia: the Confederation of British Industry, the Federation of Small Businesses or independent business people. While we are talking about business interests, we must remember that the employer's voice is not the only voice in business. Trades unions also have a part to play and should perhaps have representatives among the business representatives.

We have problems with Alun Cairns's amendment and we will abstain on it because of his reference to the regional level. We would like to hear what those in the Economic Development Committee have to say when they report in six months' time.

3:19 p.m.

I will deal briefly with Jonathan Morgan's amendments 2, 7 and 8, which we will vote against. Amendment 2 deals with school sixth forms. At the beginning of the ETAG process, I had some sympathy for Jonathan's point of view; in fact, it was my point of view at the beginning of the Committee's deliberations. However, as the process has progressed, reality has come to the forefront. The reality is that school sixth forms are part of the local education and training provision. To exclude them from the community consortia and the drawing up of local plans would do the schools and local education authorities a great disservice. They must be there, fighting their corner, from day one. Excluding them would also make a nonsense of the concept of all education and training providers working together in partnership.

partneriaethau ond ni allwn wneud hynny os yw un partner yn fwy cyfartal nag eraill.

Rhaid gwrando ar y lleisiau o bob sector. Gallai pob sector honni'n deg bod arno angen llais cryfach. Mae'r sector gwirfoddol eisoes wedi mynegi pryder ynghylch yr hyn a wêl yn ddiffyg cynrychiolaeth iddo yn y system. Mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn fawr ei gyfraniad o ran denu rhai a gafodd eu hallgáu yn gymdeithasol i addysg a hyfforddiant ac mae'n cyrraedd llawer mwy o bobl na'r sector statudol. Mae angen i'r sector busnes ddatrys y cwestiwn o bwy yn union fydd yn ei gynrychioli ar y consortia: Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach neu bobl fusnes annibynnol. Tra'n sôn am fuddiannau busnes, rhaid inni gofio nad llais y cyflogwr yw'r unig lais mewn busnes. Mae gan yr undebau llafur hwythau ran i'w chwarae a dylent efallai gael cynrychiolwyr ymhlith cynrychiolwyr busnes.

Mae gennym amheuon ynghylch gwelliant Alun Cairns a byddwn yn ymatal arno oherwydd ei gyfeiriad at yr haen ranbarthol. Hoffem glywed yr hyn sydd gan y rhai yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i'w ddweud pan fyddant yn adrodd ymhen chwe mis.

Yr wyf am ymdrin yn fyr â gwelliannau 2, 7 a 8 Jonathan Morgan, y byddwn yn pleidleisio yn eu herbyn. Mae gwelliant 2 yn ymdrin â dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion. Ar ddechrau proses y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant, yr oeddwn yn cydymdeimlo i ryw raddau â safbwynt Jonathan; a dweud y gwir, hwnnw oedd fy safbwynt i ar ddechrau trafodaethau'r Pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, wrth i'r broses fynd rhagddi, daeth realiti i'r amlwg. Y realiti yw bod dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion yn rhan o'r ddarpariaeth addysg a hyfforddiant leol. Byddai eu cau allan o'r consortia cymunedol ac o lunio cynlluniau lleol yn gwneud cam mawr â'r ysgolion a'r awdurdodau addysg lleol. Rhaid iddynt fod yno, yn ymladd drostynt eu hunain, o'r diwrnod cyntaf un. Byddai eu cau allan hefyd yn nacáu'r cysyniad o'r holl ddarparwyr addysg a hyfforddiant yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd mewn partneriaeth.

Amendments 7 and 8 deal with the formation of regional tiers and seem, again, to be asking us to slavishly follow the English line. Devolution has given us the ability to create a different structure for Wales. A structure based on community consortia gives us the opportunity to discuss local solutions to local needs, giving regional offices an advisory role. We must accept that the training and education needs in Anglesey are entirely different from those in Alyn and Deeside, but both have their parts to play in a regional plan for education and training.

On Jonathan's advocating of ad-hoc community consortia, I realise that schools and interested organisations are already coming together, but we must issue a warning that if strong school and college links are formed on an ad-hoc basis, that could have a detrimental effect on nearby areas. The ETAG process has been an object lesson for democracy in Wales and, on behalf of the Liberal Democrats, I look forward to similar measures, emanating from Westminster, which allow us to plough our own furrow in the future.

Jonathan Morgan: I propose amendment 2. In point (b) after 'plan for Wales' insert

but opposes the proposal in the plan, reflected in Clause 36 of the Learning and Skills Bill, that ultimate responsibility for funding school sixth forms is transferred from elected local authorities to the unelected National Council for Education and Training for Wales.

I also propose amendment 6 in the name of Alun Cairns. In point (d) after the words 'realise the plan' add

and consequently endorses the Secretary of State for Education and Employment's commitment to include a minimum 40 per cent business membership of the Learning and Skills Council in England, and makes the same commitment for the National Council for Education and Training for Wales and its

Mae gwelliannau 7 a 8 yn ymwneud â ffurfio haenau rhanbarthol ac ymddengys, eto, eu bod yn gofyn inni ddilyn y llwybr yn Lloegr yn wasaidd. Mae datganoli wedi rhoi'r gallu inni greu strwythur gwahanol i Gymru. Mae strwythur sydd yn seiliedig ar gonsortia cymunedol yn rhoi cyfle inni drafod atebion lleol i anghenion lleol, gan roi rôl ymgynghorol i swyddfeydd rhanbarthol. Rhaid inni dderbyn bod yr anghenion hyfforddiant ac addysg ym Môn yn gwbl wahanol i'r rhai yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, ond mae ganddynt ill dau ran i'w chwarae mewn cynllun rhanbarthol ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant.

Ynglŷn â dadl Jonathan dros consortia cymunedol *ad hoc*, sylweddolaf fod ysgolion a chyrff sydd â buddiant yn dod at ei gilydd eisoes, ond rhaid inni rybuddio y gallai cysylltiadau cryf rhwng ysgolion a cholegau, os ffurfir hwy ar ffurf *ad hoc*, fod yn ddrwg eu heffaith ar ardaloedd cyfagos. Bu proses y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant yn wers ddangos i ddemocratiaeth yng Nghymru ac, ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, edrychaf ymlaen at fesurau tebyg, a ddaw o San Steffan, fydd yn caniatáu i ni ddilyn ein cwys ein hunain yn y dyfodol.

Jonathan Morgan: Cynigïaf welliant 2. Ym mhwynt (b), ar ôl 'cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant i Gymru' ychwaneger

ond yn gwrthwynebu'r cynnig yn y cynllun, a adlewyrchir yng Nghymal 36 y Mesur Dysgu a Medrau, bod y cyfrifoldeb yn y pen draw am ariannu dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion yn cael ei drosglwyddo o awdurdodau lleol etholedig i'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru nad yw wedi'i ethol.

Cynigïaf hefyd welliant 6 yn enw Alun Cairns. Ym mhwynt (d), ar ôl y geiriau 'rhoi'r cynllun ar waith' ychwaneger

ac felly yn ategu ymrwymiad yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth i gynnwys lleiafswm o 40 y cant o aelodau o fyd busnes ar Gyngor Dysgu a Medrau Lloegr, ac yn gwneud yr un ymrwymiad i'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru a'i haen ranbarthol;

regional tier;

I also propose amendment 7. In point (f) delete all text and replace with

regrets that the Learning and Skills Bill currently being considered by the House of Lords does not give the regional tier of the National Council for Education and Training for Wales autonomous budgets or distinct powers, and fears that the advisory nature of these regional committees might undermine full business participation in them, and;

I also propose amendment 8. Add a new point (f) and renumber subsequent points as necessary:

(f) agrees that there is no need for the Assembly to establish community consortia for education and training, but encourages local education and training providers to come together in voluntary associations across Wales as is happening at present;

I am grateful to be able to contribute to the Assembly's most important debate since its inception last year. For the first time, the Assembly's proceedings have led directly to legislation going before Parliament in Westminster. The product of these deliberations can be seen in the Learning and Skills Bill, which will go through its committee stage in the Upper House during the week ahead. Therefore, we can point to a policy area where we are having a direct impact at Westminster.

I am told that many people and Assembly Members switch off when they hear the term 'ETAG'. It is not, perhaps, the best acronym that could be used to describe this important programme. Similarly, many of the acronyms in the report have an impersonal ring to them. This should not, however, delude Members into believing that this process is not crucial. I am sure that we all agree that these findings will shape the nature of post-16 education and training for many years to come.

I will not describe the principal proposals in

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 7. Ym mhwynt (f) dileer yr holl destun a rhodder yn ei le

yn gresynu nad yw'r Mesur Dysgu a Medrau sydd yn cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd gan Dŷ'r Arglwyddi yn rhoi cyllidebau penodedig na phwerau ar wahân i haen ranbarthol Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru, ac yn pryderu y gallai natur ymgynghorol y pwyllgorau rhanbarthol hyn danseilio cyfranogiad busnes llawn ynddynt, a;

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 8. Ychwaneger pwynt (f) newydd ac ailrifo'r pwyntiau dilynol fel y bo'r angen:

(f) yn cytuno nad oes angen i'r Cynulliad sefydlu consortia cymunedol addysg a hyfforddiant, ond yn annog darparwyr addysg a hyfforddiant lleol i ddod ynghyd mewn cymdeithasau gwirfoddol ar draws Cymru, yn yr un modd â'r hyn sydd yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd;

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gael cyfrannu i ddadl bwysicaf y Cynulliad ers ei sefydlu y llynedd. Am y tro cyntaf, mae trafodion y Cynulliad wedi arwain yn uniongyrchol at roi deddfwriaeth gerbron y Senedd yn San Steffan. Gellir gweld canlyniad y trafodion hyn yn y Mesur Dysgu a Medrau, fydd yn mynd drwy ei gam pwyllgor yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi yn ystod yr wythnos sydd i ddod. Felly, gallwn nodi maes polisi lle'r ydym yn cael effaith uniongyrchol yn San Steffan.

Dywedir wrthyf fod llawer o bobl a llawer o Aelodau Cynulliad yn cau'u clustiau pan glywant y term 'ETAG'. Efallai nad hwn yw'r acronym gorau y gellid ei ddefnyddio i ddisgrifio'r rhaglen bwysig hon. Yn yr un modd, mae tinc amheronol i lawer o'r acronymau yn yr adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylai hyn gamarwain yr Aelodau i gredu nad yw'r broses hon yn dyngedfennol. Yr wyf yn sicr ein bod oll yn gytûn y bydd y canfyddiadau hyn yn ffurfio natur addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 am flynyddoedd lawer i ddod.

Nid wyf am ddisgrifio'r prif gynigion yn yr

the report. However, I will mention the parts of the report with which I agree wholeheartedly. The Welsh Conservatives approve of the future skills needs approach that the Assembly has adopted. The old dichotomy between business-led provision and further education-led provision was not only false, but hopelessly out of date. The 'Future Skills Wales' report outlines a better long-term approach to this challenge. We must embrace that approach with enthusiasm in our deliberations now and in years to come.

The national targets for education and learning are a positive step forward. These targets, which are mentioned in the ETAG report, represent an interesting approach to improving standards. We must be ambitious for our children if we are to fulfil some of the aspirations set out in the 'A Better Wales' document, which was published last week.

The proposal to establish Careers Wales is also a constructive suggestion. ETAG's idea of a national, all-age information, advice and guidance service starting next year will help to clarify careers advice for everyone. This new 'brand' will explain to users what services are available and how they can access them.

The Welsh Conservative Party also agrees with the establishment of the National Council for Education and Training for Wales, although like the Assembly Secretary and the Chairman of the Committee, I hope we can find a more suitable name. We also agree that this body, in succeeding the Further Education Funding Council, should co-ordinate, not only further education, but work-based training and lifelong learning. Such strategies require a holistic approach and this strategy needs to be co-ordinated through a single facilitator on a national basis.

In June last year, the Assembly Secretary invited the Post-16 Education and Training Committee to report on the ETAG proposals. That was a welcome step that indicated a new

adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn sôn am y manau o'r adroddiad y cytunaf yn llwyr â hwy. Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n cymeradwyo'r dull anghenion medrau'r dyfodol a fabwysiadwyd gan y Cynulliad. Nid yn unig yr oedd yr hen hollt rhwng darpariaeth dan arweiniad busnesau a darpariaeth dan arweiniad addysg bellach yn un ffug, yr oedd hefyd yn anobeithiol o hen-ffasiwn. Mae'r adroddiad 'Sgiliau Dyfodol Cymru' yn amlinellu dull tymor hir gwell o ymdrin â'r her hon. Rhaid inni groesawu'r dull hwnnw'n frwd yn ein trafodion yn awr ac yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod.

Mae'r targedau cenedlaethol ar gyfer addysg a dysgu yn gam cadarnhaol ymlaen. Mae'r targedau hyn, a grybwyllir yn adroddiad y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant, yn ddull diddorol o wella safonau. Rhaid inni fod yn uchelgeisiol dros ein plant os ydym i gyflawni rhai o'r dyheadau a nodir yn y ddogfen 'Gwell Cymru', a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf.

Mae'r cynnig i sefydlu Gyrfaoedd Cymru hefyd yn awgrym adeiladol. Bydd syniad y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant o wasanaeth gwybodaeth, cyngor ac arweiniad cenedlaethol i bob oed i ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf yn gymorth i roi gwedd eglurach ar gyngor gyrfaoedd i bawb. Bydd y 'brand' newydd hwn yn egluro i'r defnyddwyr pa wasanaethau sydd ar gael a sut y gallant eu cyrraedd.

Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru hefyd yn cytuno â sefydlu Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru, er fy mod yn gobeithio, fel yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad a Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor, y gallwn gael enw mwy addas. Cytunwn hefyd y dylai'r corff hwn, wrth gymryd lle'r Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach, gydlyn, nid yn unig addysg bellach, ond hyfforddiant yn y gwaith waith a dysgu gydol oes hefyd. Mae angen dull cyfannol i ymdrin â strategaethau o'r fath ac mae angen cydlynu'r strategaeth hon drwy un hwylusydd yn genedlaethol.

Ym Mehefin y llynedd, rhoddodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad wahoddiad i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 adrodd ar gynigion y Grŵp Gweithredu

openness to thinking in the Assembly. It is fair to say that the Committee grasped this opportunity, and it represented the real input that Assembly Committees should have into policy development. Committees should not be mere consultees, but have real teeth and be able to influence policy development on a broad scale. On my party's behalf, I thank the officials, the clerk and the deputy clerk of the Committee for their sterling work in supporting us throughout our deliberations. It was a lengthy process and they deserve full praise.

As our Committee Chairman indicated earlier, I dissented from some of the main recommendations in the report. After listening to many of the witnesses and experts who gave up valuable time to inform us about the situation in the education and training sector, I felt strongly that there were serious areas of concern, which we did not address sufficiently. These areas of dissent are not only reflected in the Conservative Group's four amendments, but also in the report itself.

Amendment 2 deals with the administration's proposal to transfer ultimate responsibility for school sixth-form funding from elected local authorities to an unelected body. It is more than a little ironic that the very parties that in the late 1980s and 1990s were talking about the influence of quangos and the reduction in the influence of democratic bodies, are now advocating taking some of the powers of local government away from local institutions and handing them to a centralised bureaucracy. It has not escaped comment that Members of the three other parties, who were critical of quangos, now argue that these powers should be exercised by an unelected body. We will have to reflect upon that.

Their position is even more shocking given the opposition that was expressed by many of the teaching unions. The National Union of Teachers Cymru, for example, told the Committee that teachers were 'terrified' of this change. They believed that such a change would undermine the viability of school sixth forms across Wales. There is much talk from

Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Yr oedd hynny'n gam i'w groesawu oedd yn dangos agwedd agored newydd at feddwl yn y Cynulliad. Teg yw dweud bod y Pwyllgor wedi gafeael yn y cyfle hwn, a dangosodd y mewnbwn gwirioneddol a ddylai fod gan Bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad wrth ddatblygu polisi; ni ddylai Pwyllgorau fod yn ymgynghoredigion yn unig, dylai fod ganddynt ddannedd â'r gallu i ddylanwadu ar ddatblygiad polisi ar raddfa eang. Ar ran fy mhlaid, diolchaf i swyddogion, clerics a dirprwy glerc y Pwyllgor am eu gwaith rhagorol yn ein cynorthwyo drwy gydol ein trafodion. Yr oedd yn broses hirfaith ac maent yn haeddu pob clod.

Fel y nododd Cadeirydd ein Pwyllgor yn gynharach, anghytunais â rhai o'r prif argymhellion yn yr adroddiad. Ar ôl gwrandao ar lawer o'r tystion a'r arbenigwyr a roddodd o'u hamser prin i roi gwybod i ni am y sefyllfa yn y sector addysg a hyfforddiant, teimlais yn gryf fod rhai meysydd o bwys difrifol, nad oeddem wedi rhoi digon o sylw iddynt. Mae'r meysydd y bu anghytuno arnynt i'w gweld nid yn unig ym mhedwar gwelliant y Grŵp Ceidwadol, ond yn yr adroddiad ei hun.

Mae gwelliant 2 yn ymdrin â chynnig y weinyddiaeth i drosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb terfynol am ariannu dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion o awdurdodau lleol etholedig i gorff anetholedig. Mae'n eironig iawn bod yr union bleidiau, a oedd yn sôn yn hwyr yn y 1980au a'r 1990au hwyr am ddylanwad cwangos a'r lleihad yn ddylanwad cyrff democrataidd, yn dadlau bellach o blaid gymryd rhai o bwerau llywodraeth leol oddi wrth sefydliadau lleol a'u rhoi i fiwrocratiaeth ganoledig. Nid aeth yn ddisylw bod Aelodau o'r tair plaid arall, oedd yn feirniadol o'r cwangos, bellach yn dadlau y dylai'r pwerau hyn gael eu harfer gan gorff anetholedig. Bydd yn rhaid inni fyfyrion yn ei gylch.

Mae eu safbwynt yn fwy cywilyddus fyth yng ngolwg y gwrthwynebiad a fynegwyd gan lawer o undebau'r athrawon. Er enghraifft, dywedodd Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon Cymru wrth y Pwyllgor fod yr athrawon yn 'arswydo' rhag y newid hwn. Credent y byddai newid o'r fath yn tanseilio hyfywedd dosbarthiadau chwech mewn

the further education sector and others of a single funding formula that would apply to school sixth forms and the further education sector. However, we must get to grips with the fact—and this was raised in the Committee—that schools add value to the learning experiences of students. The pastoral care, the breadth of teaching experience and the extracurricular activities of school sixth forms combine to offer students a rounded educational experience. The Post-16 Education and Training Committee, or perhaps CETW, will have to examine that in depth before any moves are taken towards a single funding formula.

There were concerns that to hive off school sixth form funding from local authorities would jeopardise the future of school sixth forms. There is no question about that. It was a strong concern expressed in Committee and something that many teaching unions brought to the table. The Assembly Secretary may jump to his feet and tell us that local education authorities will continue to distribute the money provided by CETW. That is true, but it is no more than a cheap accounting trick. The person who will make the decisions in this respect and ultimately decide how much money sixth forms will get, will sit in a comfortable office somewhere in Cardiff. Is that what the other three parties meant when they talked of a bonfire of quangos? That is the antithesis of local democracy, not the fulfilment of it. When Members complain in the future about the threat to—

3:29 p.m.

Gareth Jones: A glywais yn iawn pan gyfeiriasoch at swyddfa rhyw gwmni yng Nghaerdydd? A ydym yn cymryd yn ganiataol y bydd pencadlys CETW yng Nghaerdydd?

Jonathan Morgan: Perhaps I was making a wild assumption. It would not be a company, but a quango, which I assume would be based

ysgolion ledled Cymru. Mae llawer o sôn gan y sector addyg bellach ac eraill am fformwla ariannu sengl a fyddai'n cynnwys dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion a'r sector addysg bellach. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r ffaith—a chodwyd hyn yn y Pwyllgor—fod ysgolion yn ychwanegu gwerth at brofiadau dysgu myfyrwyr. Mae gofal bugeiliol, ehangder y profiad addysgu a gweithgareddau allgwrwicwlaidd dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion gyda'i gilydd yn cynnig profiad addysgol crwn i fyfyrwyr. Bydd yn rhaid i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, neu'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru efallai, ystyried hynny'n fanwl cyn cymryd unrhyw gamau tuag at fformwla ariannu sengl.

Mynegwyd pryderon y byddai cymryd arian dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion oddi wrth awdurdodau lleol yn peryglu dyfodol dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion. Nid oes dwywaith am hynny. Yr oedd yn bryder cryf a fynegwyd yn y Pwyllgor ac yn fater a godwyd gan lawer o undebau'r athrawon yn y trafodaethau. Efallai y bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad yn neidio ar ei draed ac yn dweud wrthym y bydd awdurdodau addysg lleol yn parhau i ddosbarthu'r arian a ddarperir gan y Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru. Mae hynny'n wir, ond nid yw'n ddim ond ystryw cyfrifo rhad. Bydd y sawl fydd yn penderfynu ar hyn ac yn penderfynu yn derfynol faint o arian a gaiff dosbarthiadau chwech, yn eistedd mewn swyddfa gyfforddus rhywle yng Nghaerdydd. Ai hynny oedd ym meddwl y tair plaid arall wrth sôn am goelcerth o gwangos? Dyma'r gwrthwyneb i ddemocratiaeth leol, nid y cyflawniad ohoni. Pan fydd Aelodau'n cwyno yn y dyfodol am y bygythiad i—

Gareth Jones: Did I hear correctly when you referred to the office of some company in Cardiff? Are we taking it for granted that CETW's headquarters will be in Cardiff?

Jonathan Morgan: Efallai fy mod yn gwneud rhagdybiaeth ddi-sail. Ni fyddai'n gwmni, ond yn gwango, y cymeraf y byddai

in the nation's capital. My reference was more to do with the individual sitting in a comfortable office. The location of that office is not what concerns me. The point that I wanted to make was that—

Peter Black: Of course, I want the office to be in Swansea. On the bonfire of quangos, is it now the Conservative Party's policy to burn all the quangos that they established during their 18 years of Government?

Jonathan Morgan: I will return to that in a moment. In the future, when Members complain about the threat to school sixth forms in their constituencies because of changes that we have agreed, they should be consistently reminded that it was the Assembly, in rubber stamping this report, that signed up to the transferral of sixth-form funding to this unelected body. We may have to return to that in the future.

Amendment 8 deals with one of ETAG's wonderful acronyms: CCETs or community consortia for education and training. These CCETs were a prominent part of the ETAG report and of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee report. However, CCETs are mysteriously absent from today's motion and from the Learning and Skills Bill, which is going through the House of Lords. That is because the administration's plans for CCETs are all at sea. I was astonished, during Committee evidence sessions on CCETs, that the administration did not have a clue as to what we would do with them. Nobody could tell us how much they would cost, what the boundaries would be for establishing them or when they would be established. Therefore, the backtracking on this issue is probably understandable.

I am wholly in favour of co-operation between training providers. That is crucial, and I think that we all recognise that. However, we do not need the dead hand of government intervention marshalling providers into a network of mini quangos.

wedi ei leoli ym mhrifddinas y wlad. Yr oedd y cyfeiriad yn ymwneud yn fwy â'r unigolyn yn eistedd mewn swyddfa gyfforddus. Nid lleoliad y swyddfa honno yw'r hyn sydd yn fy mhoeni. Y pwynt yr oeddwn am ei wneud oedd bod—

Peter Black: Wrth gwrs, yr wyf am i'r swyddfa fod yn Abertawe. Ynghylch y goelcerth o gwangos, ai polisi'r Blaid Geidwadol bellach yw llosgi'r holl gwangos a sefydasant yn ystod eu 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth?

Jonathan Morgan: Dychwelaf at hynny ymhen eiliad. Yn y dyfodol, pan fydd Aelodau'n cwyno am y bygythiad i ddosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion yn eu hetholaethau oherwydd y newidiadau a gytunasom, dylid eu hatgoffa'n gyson mai'r Cynulliad, wrth roi sêl bendith ar yr adroddiad hwn, a gytunodd i drosglwyddo ariannu dosbarthiadau chwech i'r corff anetholedig hwn. Efallai y bydd yn rhaid inni ddychwelyd at hynny yn y dyfodol.

Mae gwelliant 8 yn ymdrin ag un o acronymau rhyfeddol y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant: CCETs neu gonsortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant. Yr oedd lle amlwg i'r consortia hyn yn adroddiad y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant ac yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16. Fodd bynnag, mae'r consortia cymunedol yn rhyfeddol o absennol o'r cynnig heddiw ac o'r Mesur Dysgu a Medrau, sydd yn mynd drwy Dŷ'r Arglwyddi. Mae hynny oherwydd bod cynlluniau'r weinyddiaeth ar gyfer consortia cymunedol yn ddryswch llwyr. Synnais, yn ystod sesiynau tystiolaeth y Pwyllgor ar gonsortia cymunedol, nad oedd gan y weinyddiaeth yr un syniad am yr hyn a wnaem â hwy. Ni allai neb ddweud wrthym beth fyddai eu cost, beth fyddai'r ffiniau ar gyfer eu sefydlu neu pa bryd y caent eu sefydlu. Felly, mae'r ailfeddwl ar y mater hwn yn ddealladwy, mae'n debyg.

Yr wyf yn llwyr o blaid cydweithredu rhwng darparwyr hyfforddiant. Mae hynny'n holl bwysig, a chredaf fod pob un ohonom yn cydnabod hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid oes arnom angen llaw farw ymyrraeth y llywodraeth yn trefnu darparwyr yn

Many voluntary organisations and consortia of training providers are already being established across Wales. Let us not jump in and upset this emerging picture with ill-defined ideas about CCETs. If we let nature take its course, we may well end up with a far better arrangement.

Amendment 7 deals with the regional tier of the national council. That has been discussed separately by the Post-16 Education and Training Committee and the Economic Development Committee. Members who have read only the original ETAG report may not know what we are talking about but, as the ETAG deliberations continued within Committee, it emerged that the Government intended to establish a regional tier. It appears to me that this is a half-hearted attempt to respond to the serious concerns of the business community about the regional tier in Wales. However, no details of this regional tier were provided until the end of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee's deliberations in November.

The Committee was presented with three options. First, the original suggestion of no regional tier as contained, or as not contained, in the ETAG report. Secondly, a toothless tier with no distinct powers and no autonomous budget, which were appropriately called regional advisory panels. Finally, we were offered the option, endorsed by employers, of a regional tier with meaningful powers and autonomous budgets. Even the Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training and the Executive recognised in the Committee proceedings that this option was viable. Therefore, the Welsh Conservative Party strongly favours the final option because it is the only one that will give credibility to the system and encourage businesses and business leaders to become actively involved. A series of advisory panels will turn out to be nothing more than a set of glorified talking shops.

This is compounded by the fact that the

rhwydwaith o gwangos bychain. Mae llawer o fudiadau gwirfoddol a chonsortia o ddarparwyr hyfforddiant eisoes yn cael eu sefydlu ledled Cymru. Na foed inni neidio i mewn a drysu'r darlun sydd yn datblygu â syniadau niwlog ynghylch consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant. Os gadawn i natur ddilyn ei hynt, efallai y bydd gennym drefniant llawer gwell yn y pen draw.

Mae gwelliant 7 yn ymwneud â haen ranbarthol y cyngor cenedlaethol. Trafodwyd hynny ar wahân gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 a'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Efallai na wŷr yr Aelodau na ddarllenasant ond adroddiad gwreiddiol y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant am beth yr ydym yn sôn ond, wrth i drafodaethau'r Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant barhau o fewn y Pwyllgorau, daeth yn amlwg bod y Llywodraeth yn bwriadu sefydlu haen ranbarthol. Ymddengys i mi fod hyn yn ymgais glaeaf i ymateb i bryderon difrifol y gymuned fusnes ynghylch yr haen ranbarthol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, ni ddarparwyd manylion am yr haen ranbarthol hon tan ddiwedd trafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 yn Nhachwedd.

Cyflwynwyd tri dewis i'r Pwyllgor. Yn gyntaf, yr awgrym gwreiddiol na ddylid cael haen ranbarthol fel y'i ceir, neu fel nas ceir, yn adroddiad y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Yn ail, haen ddiddannedd heb bwerau penodol a chyllideb annibynnol, a galwyd yn briodol yn baneli ymgynghorol rhanbarthol. Yn olaf, cynigiwyd y dewis i ni, a gefnogwyd gan gyflogwyr, o haen ranbarthol â phwerau ystyrlon a chyllidebau annibynnol. Yr oedd hyd yn oed yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 a'r Weithrediaeth yn cydnabod yn nhrefnadaethau'r Pwyllgor fod y dewis hwn yn ymarferol. Felly, mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru'n gryf o blaid y dewis olaf am mai hwn yw'r unig un fydd yn rhoi hygyrdd i'r system ac yn cymell busnesau ac arweinyddion busnes i gymryd rhan weithredol. Bydd cyfres o baneli ymgynghorol yn datblygu'n ddim amgenach na chasgliad o siopau siarad mawreddog.

Yn ychwanegol at hynny y mae'r ffaith bod

Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training has failed to give a similar commitment in line with that of the Secretary of State for Education and Employment, to ensure that 40 per cent of places on the national council and its regional tier go to employer representatives. The only conclusion that we can draw is that business involvement is less important to this administration than the Labour administration at Westminster. This concern was eloquently expressed by Dr Elizabeth Haywood, the outgoing head of CBI Wales. Dr Haywood said over the weekend:

‘The proposals being put forward for post-16 training and education are very bad for business as they remove employer influence’.

This institution—and I say this with great regret as a constructive Member of the Assembly—has patently failed in its first big test with regard to a meaningful partnership with business. We have come up with a proposal that will appease some in the further education sector but will manifestly fail to engender partnership with business and the business community. Perhaps, with the benefit of hindsight—hindsight being the perfect science—we should have initiated a joint meeting, committee or sub-committee between the Post-16 Education and Training Committee and the Economic Development Committee. Some observers noticed that party spokesmen from both opposition parties appeared to completely contradict the approach taken by their counterparts in the Post-16 Education and Training Committee on the issue of the regional tier. There are clearly differences of opinion within political parties. I sincerely hope that those members of the Economic Development Committee will have the courage to reiterate their serious concerns in this debate even if that means that they must defy their party whip.

I emphasise my support for many of the key recommendations of the ETAG report. Careers Wales, national targets and the Future Skills Wales approach are valuable tools for future advancement. We need a National Council for Education and Training for Wales to co-ordinate further education,

yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 wedi methu â rhoi ymrwymiad tebyg yn unol â'r un yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth, i sicrhau bod 40 y cant o'r seddau ar y cyngor cenedlaethol a'i haen ranbarthol yn mynd i gynrychiolwyr y cyflogwyr. Yr unig gasgliad y gallwn ddod iddo yw bod presenoldeb byd busnes yn llai pwysig i'r weinyddiaeth hon nag i'r weinyddiaeth Lafur yn San Steffan. Mynegwyd y pryder hwn yn huawdl gan Dr Elizabeth Haywood, pennaeth ymadawol Cyd-ffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain Cymru. Dywedodd Dr Haywood dros y penwythnos:

‘Mae'r cynigion a roddir gerbron ar gyfer hyfforddiant ac addysg ôl-16 yn ddrwg iawn i fusnes gan eu bod yn tynnu ymaith ddylanwad y cyflogwr’.

Mae'n amlwg bod y sefydliad hwn—a dywedaf hyn â gofid mawr fel Aelod adeiladol o'r Cynulliad—wedi methu yn ei brawf pwysig cyntaf mewn perthynas â phartneriaeth ystyrllon â busnes. Lluniasom gynnig a fydd yn dyhuddo rhai yn y sector addysg bellach ond a fydd, mae'n amlwg, yn methu â meithrin partneriaeth â busnes a'r gymuned fusnes. Efallai, ag ôl-ddoethineb—ac ôl-ddoethineb yw'r wyddor berffaith—y dylasem fod wedi sefydlu cyfarfod, pwyllgor neu is-bwyllgor ar y cyd rhwng y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 a'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Sylwodd rhai sylwebyddion ei bod yn ymddangos bod llafaryddion y pleidiau o'r ddwy wrthblaid yn croesddweud yn llwyr yr ymagwedd a fabwysiadwyd gan eu cymheiriaid yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ar fater yr haen ranbarthol. Mae'n amlwg bod gwahaniaethau barn oddi mewn i'r pleidiau gwleidyddol. Gwir obeithiaf y bydd yr aelodau hynny o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn ddigon dewr i ailfynegi'r pryderon difrifol sydd ganddynt yn y ddadl hon hyd yn oed os yw hynny'n golygu bod rhaid iddynt herio chwip eu plaid.

Pwysleisiaf fy mod yn cefnogi llawer o argymhellion allweddol adroddiad y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Mae Gyrfaoedd Cymru, targedau cenedlaethol a dull gweithredu Sgiliau Dyfodol Cymru yn arfau gwerthfawr ar gyfer cynnydd yn y dyfodol. Mae arnom angen Cyngor

lifelong learning and work-based training. However, the Assembly will live to regret any decision to pass funding responsibility for school sixth forms from elected local authorities to an unelected quango. We will show our promise of partnership with business to be hollow and rhetorical if we vote for a toothless regional tier without meaningful employer involvement. I appeal to all Members to stop and rethink. It is not too late to change our minds but this is the last opportunity.

Elin Jones: Cynigiaf welliant 3. Yn mharagraff C, yn dilyn 'ynghyd â', ychwanegu 'datblygiad deallusol a diwylliannol'.

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 5. Yn dilyn paragraff C, ychwanegu paragraff newydd ac ail rifo fel y bro'n briodol:

yn ategu hefyd yr alwad am dwf sylweddol yn y ddarpariaeth trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 9. Yn dilyn paragraff (f), ychwanegu paragraff newydd ac ail rifo fel y bo'n briodol:

yn cefnogi hefyd yr alwad am fformwla ariannu cenedlaethol newydd i adlewyrchu'r angen i ddiogelu hygrychedd, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac yn cydnabod yr angen i roi ystyriaeth ofalus i effaith fformwla ariannu cyffredin ar ddarpariaeth addysg cyn 16 oed.

Croesawaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar ad-drefnu addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cymeradwyo'r adroddiad yn llawn. Ein bwriad wrth gyflwyno'r gwelliannau yw tanlinellu rhai materion o bwys. Mae'r broses o lunio'r adroddiad hwn wedi bod yn drylwyr a chyfrifol. Yr wyf yn hyderus ein bod ni fel Pwyllgor, ac fel unigolion ar y Pwyllgor hwnnw, wedi rhoi clust i bob barn.

Bwriad yr adroddiad hwn yw dod ag addysg, hyfforddiant a'r byd busnes yn agosach at ei glydd, i leihau dyblygu o fewn y gyfundrefn ac i sicrhau integreiddio. Yr oedd hi'n drueni

Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru er mwyn cydlynu addysg bellach, dysgu gydol oes a hyfforddiant yn y gwaith. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn edifar gan y Cynulliad am unrhyw benderfyniad i drosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros ariannu dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion o awdurdodau lleol etholedig i gwango anetholedig. Byddwn yn dangos bod ein haddewid o bartneriaeth â busnes yn un wag a rhethregol os pleidleisiwn dros haen ranbarthol ddiddannedd sydd heb gysylltiad ystyrlon â'r cyflogwyr. Apeliaf ar yr holl Aelodau i aros ac ailfeddwl. Nid yw'n rhy hwyr inni ailfeddwl ond dyma'r cyfle olaf.

Elin Jones: I propose amendment 3. In point (c) after 'together with', insert 'intellectual and cultural development.'

I also propose amendment 5. After point (c), insert new paragraph and re-number as appropriate:

endorses also the call for significant growth in Welsh medium provision.

I also propose amendment 9. After point (f), insert new paragraph and re-number as appropriate:

supports also the call for a new national funding formula to reflect the need to protect accessibility particularly in rural areas and recognises the need for careful consideration to be given to the effect of a common funding formula on pre-16 educational provision.

I welcome the Committee's report on the reorganisation of post-16 education and training. Plaid Cymru fully endorses the report. Our intention in proposing these amendments is to underline some important issues. The process of formulating this report has been thorough and responsibly carried out. I am confident that we as a Committee, and as individuals on that Committee, have listened to all opinions.

The report's intention is to bring education, training and the business world closer together, to cut down on duplication within the system and to ensure integration. It was a

mawr, yn ystod cyfnod trafod adroddiad ETAG yn y Pwyllgor, fod cymaint o bolareiddio dadleuon wedi digwydd ymysg y cyrff o'r gwahanol sectorau. Yr oedd polareiddio barn a oedd ymhell o fod yn adeiladol ar adegau. Heddiw, felly, mae gennym adroddiad sydd yn cynnig cyfle i integreiddio holl addysg ôl-16 ac sydd yn rhoi'r cyfle i gynllunio addysg a hyfforddiant yn strategol ar lefel genedlaethol tra'n parhau i ymateb i anghenion cyflogwyr yn lleol, yn rhanbarthol a chenedlaethol.

Nid yw'r Pwyllgor Addysg ac Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ar fin cyrraedd cyfnod ôl-ETAG. Megis dechrau y mae'r gwaith o weithredu argymhellion ETAG. Fe fydd angen i'r Pwyllgor drafod cynnwys y Mesur a fydd yn mynd drwy San Steffan y tymor hwn. Mesur yw hwn a fydd yn galluogi gweithredu newidiadau ETAG yng Nghymru. Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i atgoffa'r Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 fod y Pwyllgor wedi datgan yn glir y dymuniad i weld y newidiadau fel y maent yn berthnasol i Gymru yn cael eu cynnwys o fewn y ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd yn hytrach na'r ddeddfwriaeth gynradd.

Bydd angen i'r Pwyllgor oruchwylio'r gwaith o sefydlu'r cyngor cenedlaethol. Yn bwysicach, bydd yn rhaid i'r Pwyllgor a'r Cyngor drafod dyfeisio'r fformwla gyllido gyffredin i addysg ôl-16. Y fformwla hon yw allwedd llwyddiant neu fethiant y gyfundrefn newydd i raddau helaeth. Yn y gorffennol, arferion cyllido sydd wedi achosi i golegau gystadlu yn erbyn ysgolion. Y fformwla gyllido newydd fydd yr allwedd i sicrhau gwaredu cystadleuaeth o'r gyfundrefn.

3:39 p.m.

Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi bod yn awyddus i ddiogelu a datblygu rhai elfennau o'r gyfundrefn addysg. Tanlinellwn hyn mewn dau o'n gwelliannau.

Bydd angen cyllido addysg o fewn consortia gwledig mewn modd nad yw'n tanseilio hyfywedd ysgolion gwledig. Yr ydym eisiau gweld cydweithio agos rhwng colegau ac ysgolion i ddarparu ystod ehangach o bynciau ôl-16, yn hytrach na system a allai arwain at

great pity, during the period of discussion on the ETAG report in the Committee, that there was so much polarisation of arguments among the bodies from the different sectors. There was polarisation of opinion that was at times far from being constructive. Today, therefore, we have a report which gives us an opportunity to integrate all post-16 education and which gives us the opportunity to plan education and training strategically at a national level while continuing to respond to employer's needs locally, regionally and nationally.

The Post-16 Education and Training Committee is not about to reach a post-ETAG period. We are only just starting on the work of implementing ETAG's recommendations. We will need to discuss the contents of the Bill that will go through Parliament this term. This Bill will enable the implementation of ETAG's changes in Wales. I take this opportunity to remind the Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training that the Committee has clearly stated its wish to see the changes that are relevant to Wales contained in the secondary legislation rather than the primary legislation.

The Committee will need to supervise the work of establishing the national council. More importantly, the Committee and the Council must discuss devising the common funding formula for post-16 education. This formula is the key to the success or the failure of the new system to a great extent. In the past, funding customs caused colleges to compete against schools. The new funding formula will be the key to ensuring that we remove competition from the system.

The Committee has been keen to secure and develop some aspects of the education system. We underline this in two of our amendments.

Education will need to be funded within rural consortia in a way that does not undermine the viability of rural schools. We want to see close co-operation between colleges and schools to provide a wider range of post-16 subjects, rather than a system that could lead

ddirwyiad dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Mae ETAG hefyd yn gyfle i hyrwyddo twf addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg a dwyieithog yn y sector ôl-16. Ar hyn o bryd, prin yw'r cyfleon i dderbyn addysg Gymraeg mewn unrhyw goleg addysg bellach yng Nghymru. Yr ydym eisiau gweld cyfundrefn gyllido sydd yn annog datblygiad addysg Gymraeg ôl-16 mewn ysgolion a cholegau ar lefel academiaidd a galwedigaethol.

Mae angen i ETAG sicrhau gwell integreiddio rhwng addysg, hyfforddiant a'r byd busnes a chyflogaeth. Am y tro cyntaf, bydd cyfle i fyd busnes gael mewnbyn i gynllunio holl ystod addysg ôl-16 ar lefelau lleol, rhanbarthol a chenedlaethol. Bydd yn parhau i gael dylanwad sylweddol ar gydlynw cyfleon hyfforddiant ar lefel ranbarthol a chenedlaethol. Bydd gan y byd busnes rôl a chyfraniad sylweddol i'r gyfundrefn newydd, a gobeithiaf y bydd yn ymrwymo i'r her newydd hon, er lles myfyrwyr ac er lles busnesau.

O greu'r gyfundrefn newydd, byddwn hefyd eisiau gweld cydweithio agosach rhwng addysg a hyfforddiant a'r asiantaethau datblygu economaidd. Dylai bwrdd y cyngor cenedlaethol a bwrdd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru gyd-gyfarfod yn achlysurol, a dylai rhanbarthau'r awdurdod a'r cyngor drafod a chynllunio ar y cyd. Gall fod rôl i'r fforymau economaidd yn cydlynw'r gweithgaredd hwn.

Gallai cydweithio ar lefel ranbarthol gael ei hwyluso pe bai Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a'r cyngor cenedlaethol yn rhannu swyddfeydd rhanbarthol mewn rhai achosion. Hefyd, gall fod rôl i'r asiantaethau menter gydweithio â'r consortia lleol er mwyn hyrwyddo gwell dealltwriaeth rhwng darparwyr addysg a hyfforddiant a busnes ar lefel leol.

Mae nifer wedi sôn dros y chwe mis diwethaf nad hwn yw'r amser delfrydol i ailstrwythuro addysg ôl-16 a hyfforddiant, a ninnau ar fin cychwyn rhaglenni Amcan 1 a 3 yng Nghymru. Mae honno'n ddadl gref, ond rhaid

to the decline of sixth forms in rural areas.

ETAG is also an opportunity to promote the growth of Welsh medium and bilingual education in the post-16 sector. At present, the opportunities to receive a Welsh education in any further education college in Wales are scarce. We want to see a funding system that encourages the development of post-16 Welsh medium education in schools and colleges at academic and vocational levels.

ETAG needs to ensure better integration between education, training and the business and employment world. For the first time, there will be an opportunity for the business world to have an input into the planning of the whole range of post-16 education at local, regional and national levels. It will continue to have a substantial influence on co-ordinating training opportunities at regional and national levels. The business world will have a substantial role and contribution to the new system, and I hope that it will commit itself to this new challenge, in the interests of students and businesses.

In creating the new system, we would also want to see closer co-operation between education and training and the economic development agencies. The board of the national council and the board of the Welsh Development Agency should occasionally have joint meetings, and the Agency's regions and the council should discuss and plan jointly. There could be a role for the economic fora in co-ordinating this activity.

Co-operation at a regional level could be facilitated if the Welsh Development Agency and the national council were to share regional offices in some cases. Also, the enterprise agencies could have a role in working with the local consortia to promote better understanding between education and training providers and business at a local level.

Many have said over the past six months that this is not the ideal time to restructure post-16 education and training, as we are about to embark on Objective 1 and 3 programmes in Wales. That is a strong argument, but we

sicrhau yn awr y cymerir camau i lunio pecynnau cenedlaethol i ddatblygu sgiliau ac adnoddau pobl er mwyn defnyddio Amcan 1 ac Amcan 3 yn llawn.

Nid oes amheuaeth y bydd y cyfnod ailstrwythuro yn un ansefydlog i'r bobl sydd ar hyn o bryd yn gweithio yn y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter a'r cyngor cyllido. Yr oeddwn yn gweithio i Fwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig pan unwyd hi ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Gwn am yr effaith negyddol y gall y fath ansicrwydd swydd ei gael ar berfformiad gwaith unigolyn. Yr oeddwn yn gadeirydd UNISON yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, a gwn am bwysigrwydd parhad amodau gwaith o un cyflogwr i'r nesaf. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig o ddeall yr wythnos diwethaf nad oes cydnabyddiaeth undeb mewn dau o'r pedwar CHM yng Nghymru. Cymeraf cyfle heddiw i ofyn i'r Ysgrifennydd sicrhau bod amodau Rheoliadau Trosglwyddo Busnesau (Gwarchod Cyflogaeth) yn berthnasol ar gyfer trosglwyddiad llyfn o staff o'u cyflogwr blaenorol i'r cyngor cenedlaethol. Mae'r cynsail ar gyfer hyn wedi ei osod a'i gadarnhau yn yr achos tribiwnlys diwydiannol diweddar ynglŷn â throsglwyddo staff o TARGED, Cyngor Hyfforddi a Menter Gogledd Orllewin Cymru, i CELTEC, Cyngor Hyfforddi a Menter Gogledd Cymru.

Mae'r adroddiad felly yn cynnig cyfle unigryw i greu cyfundrefn integreiddiedig ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 er lles yr economi ac er lles yr unigolyn sydd yn dysgu o fewn y gyfundrefn.

Gorffennaf drwy ddweud fy mod yn gweld un cyfle ychwanegol o fewn yr adroddiad: cyfle y mae Gareth Jones eisoes wedi cyfeirio ato. Mewn sylwadau blaenorol yn y Siambr hon, yr wyf i, ac eraill, wedi ceisio hyrwyddo gwasgaru ein gwasanaethau sector cyhoeddus drwy Gymru a'u datganoli o Gaerdydd. Yr ydym ar fin creu corff cenedlaethol newydd. Dyma gyfle unigryw i ddangos i bawb yng Nghymru ein bod o ddifrif ynglŷn â rhannu cyfleoedd drwy Gymru. Nid oes amheuaeth fod angen i rai bobl yng Nghaerdydd, gan gynnwys Jonathan Morgan, sylweddoli bod Cymru yn fwy na Chaerdydd yn unig.

must now ensure that steps are taken to formulate national packages for developing people's skills and resources so that Objective 1 and Objective 3 can be used fully.

There is no doubt that the restructuring period will be an unstable one for the people who currently work in the training and enterprise councils and the funding council. I was working for the Development Board for Rural Wales when it was amalgamated with the WDA. I know the negative effect that that kind of job uncertainty can have on an individual's work performance. I was chair of UNISON during that period, and I know the importance of continuity of conditions of service from one employer to the next. I was disappointed to learn last week that there is no union recognition in two of the four TECs in Wales. I take this opportunity to ask the Secretary to ensure that the conditions of the Transfer of Undertakings (Protection of Employment) Regulations are relevant for a smooth transfer of staff from their former employer to the national council. The precedent for this has already been set and confirmed in the recent industrial tribunal case concerning the transfer of staff from TARGED, the North West Wales Training and Enterprise Council, to CELTEC, the North Wales Training and Enterprise Council.

The report therefore offers a unique opportunity to create an integrated system for post-16 education and training for the benefit of the economy and the individual who is learning within the system.

I will finish by saying that I see one additional opportunity in this report: one to which Gareth Jones has already referred. In previous comments in this Chamber, I, and others, have tried to promote distributing our public sector services throughout Wales and devolving them from Cardiff. We are on the brink of creating a new national body. This is a unique opportunity to show everyone in Wales that we are serious about sharing opportunities throughout Wales. There is no doubt that some people in Cardiff, including Jonathan Morgan, need to realise that Wales consists of more than just Cardiff.

Byddai sefydlu pencadlys y cyngor cendlaethol—neu pencadlys DYSG, fel bedyddiodd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 y sefydliad heddiw—y tu allan i Gaerdydd, o fewn ardal Amcan 1 o bosibl, yn gam cychwynnol bendigedig yn y broses o ddatganoli o Gaerdydd i Gymru.

Jonathan Morgan: As I indicated in my opening remarks, I am not concerned about where this institution is located. The point was that decisions about the funding of school sixth forms would ultimately be taken by one individual sitting in a comfy office. As a Conservative, I believe strongly in those decisions being taken at the lowest possible level, whether that be in a school or a local authority.

Alun Pugh: On 17 November, Phil Williams opened his contribution to a Plenary meeting with the statement,

‘In some ways, my whole life has been a preparation for this debate’.

Having spent 15 years of my career in post-school education, I have some idea today of how he felt on that Wednesday afternoon. Questions about potted plants show the Assembly at its worst and contribute hugely to negative perceptions of it. In contrast, the way that the Post-16 Education and Training Committee has dealt with the reform of post-compulsory education in Wales shows the Assembly at its best. I have heard many favourable comments from former colleagues who have followed the long progress of this debate on the internet and digital television. They saw the detailed scrutiny of proposals and the willingness of the Executive to engage in a productive dialogue with the Subject Committee, not as mere consultees, but as an integral part of policy development. As a member of that Committee, I place on record my thanks to Cynog Dafis for his able chairing of the Committee and to Tom Middlehurst, the Assembly Secretary, for his willingness to listen.

Locating the national council's headquarters—or the headquarters of DYSG, as the Chair of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee baptised the institution today—outside Cardiff, possibly within an Objective 1 area, would be a superb initial step in the process of devolving from Cardiff to Wales.

Jonathan Morgan: Fel y nodais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, nid wyf yn ymboeni ynghylch lleoliad y sefydliad. Y pwynt oedd y byddai penderfyniadau ynghylch ariannu dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion yn cael eu gwneud yn derfynol gan un unigolyn yn eistedd mewn swyddfa gyfforddus. Fel Ceidwadwr, credaf yn gryf y dylid gwneud y penderfyniadau hynny ar y lefel isaf bosibl, boed hynny mewn ysgol neu mewn awdurdod lleol.

Alun Pugh: Ar 17 Tachwedd, dechreuodd Phil Williams ei gyfraniad i gyfarfod â'r Cyfarfod Llawn â'r ddatganiad,

‘Mewn rhai ffyrdd, mae fy holl fywyd wedi bod yn baratoad ar gyfer y ddadl hon.’

Ar ôl treulio 15 mlynedd o'm gyrfa mewn addysg ôl-ysgol, mae gennyf ryw syniad heddiw o'r modd y teimlai y prynhawn Mercher hwnnw. Mae cwestiynau am blanhigion mewn potiau yn rhoi'r wedd waethaf o'r Cynulliad ac yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at agweddau negyddol tuag ato. Ar y llaw arall, mae'r modd yr ymdriniodd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 â diwygio addysg ôl-orfodol yng Nghymru yn rhoi'r wedd orau o'r Cynulliad. Clywais lawer o sylwadau ffafriol gan gyn-gydweithwyr a ddilynodd hynt hir y ddadl hon ar y rhyngwrwyd ac ar deledu digidol. Gwelsant yr archwilio hir o'r cynigion a pharodrwydd y Weithrediaeth i gymryd rhan mewn deialog gynhyrchiol â'r Pwyllgor Pwnc, nid fel ymgynghorwyr yn unig, ond fel rhan hanfodol o ddatblygiad polisi. Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor hwnnw, rhoddaf ar gof a chadw fy niolch i Cynog Dafis am gadeirio'r Pwyllgor yn fedrus ac i Tom Middlehurst, yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad, am ei barodrwydd i wrando.

The ETAG report was lying in the in-tray of Yr oedd adroddiad y Grŵp Gweithredu

the Post-16 Education and Training Committee members when we took office last May. However, a Welsh Labour initiative proposed these far-reaching reforms of a post-16 system that is currently predicated upon market forces and competition among providers. Indeed, Peter Hain's fingerprints are still on the document. The current system is a classic case of market failure. It has not worked in the interests of providers. More importantly, it has not worked in the interests of the Welsh economy and, most important of all, it has not served students' and learners' needs.

We have all heard of mis-selling in the financial services industry. As part of Mrs Thatcher's casino economy, many people have lost out on their pensions as a result of bad advice. Tens of thousands of people in Wales are now receiving letters stating that their mortgage endowments are less safe and sensible—

David Davies: May I ask what this has to do with ETAG?

Alun Pugh: It is relevant because there has also been significant mis-selling in education and training. When colleges were semi-privatised and encouraged to compete with schools and put on an ambitious growth path, with a declining unit of resource, the result was predictable. Students are encouraged to enrol at an institution regardless of whether that institution's curriculum is best for them. Some students have been attracted to colleges when, frankly, they would have been better off in school and vice versa: some school students would have been better off going to college or undertaking a modern apprenticeship. The system encourages that behaviour. Indeed, it is surprising that schools and colleges were not displaying prominent 'Trespassers will be enrolled' notices on their premises.

3:49 p.m.

No one would design a funding system like ours. It is unfair, illogical and costly to administer. It cannot be right that identical twins who take identical programmes of study in different institutions receive widely

Addysg a Hyfforddiant yn gorwedd ar ddesg aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 pan gymerasom ein swyddi Fai diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, menter gan Lafur Cymru a gynigiodd y diwygiadau pell-gyrhaeddol hyn i system ôl-16 sydd yn seiliedig ar rymoedd y farchnad a chystadlu ymysg darparwyr. Yn wir, mae ôl bysedd Peter Hain ar y ddogfen o hyd. Mae'r system bresennol yn enghraifft glasurol o fethiant y farchnad. Ni weithiodd er budd y darparwyr. Yn bwysicach, ni weithiodd er budd economi Cymru ac, yn bwysicaf oll, ni ddiwallodd anghenion y myfyrwyr a'r dysgwyr.

Clywsom oll am gamwerthu yn y diwydiant gwasanaethau ariannol. Fel rhan o economi casino Mrs Thatcher, mae llawer o bobl ar eu colled o ran eu pensiynau o ganlyniad i gyngor gwael. Yn awr mae degau o filoedd o bobl yng Nghymru'n derbyn llythyrau sydd yn dweud bod eu gwaddolion morgais yn llai diogel a synhwyrol—

David Davies: A gaf ofyn beth sydd a wnelo hyn â'r Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant?

Alun Pugh: Mae'n berthnasol gan fod cryn gamwerthu wedi digwydd mewn addysg a hyfforddiant. Pan gafodd y colegau eu lled-breifateiddio a'u hannog i gystadlu ag ysgolion a'u rhoi ar ben llwybr cynnydd uchelgeisiol, gyda sylfaen adnoddau oedd yn lleihau, gellid rhagweld y canlyniad. Anogir myfyrwyr i gofrestru mewn sefydliad pa un ai cwricwlwm y sefydliad hwnnw sydd orau iddynt ai peidio. Denwyd rhai myfyrwyr i golegau pan fuasai'n well iddynt fod yn yr ysgol, a dweud y gwir, ac fel arall: buasai wedi bod yn well i rai myfyrwyr ysgol fynd i goleg neu ddilyn prentisiaeth fodern. Mae'r system yn annog yr ymddygiad hwnnw. Yn wir, mae'n syndod nad oedd ysgolion a cholegau'n dangos arwyddion 'Cofrestrir tresmaswyr' yn amlwg ar eu tir.

Ni fyddai neb yn dyfeisio system ariannu fel ein system ni. Mae'n annhreg, yn afresymegol ac yn ddrud i'w gweinyddu. Ni all fod yn iawn bod gefeilliaid unfath sydd yn dilyn rhaglenni astudio unfath mewn

different levels of funding, paid by different agencies through different funding methodologies. Mr Heath Robinson is not dead. He is alive and well, and employed in post-16 funding.

The current funding system produces absurd results. For example, conversational German is not funded by the Further Education Funding Council for Wales, but oral German is, provided that there is an assessment at the end of the course. The prospect of assessment is worrying, especially for adults who want to return to education after a break of many years. All over Wales, well-paid curriculum experts have laboured mightily to ensure that the curriculum extracts the last drop of revenue from the recurrent funding methodology. That effort could have been better deployed in developing courses to meet the needs of local students and businesses.

The further education sector in Wales has responded well to hugely challenging growth targets, but the previous Government never properly funded that growth. That is in huge contrast to the current position, where Welsh Labour is backing its commitment to post-16 education with a substantial injection of cash. How was this unfunded growth paid for? The National Association of Teachers in Further and Higher Education would point to the substantial drop in pay and conditions suffered by lecturers during the Tories' years in office; the loss of national conditions of service; pay falling behind their colleagues in schools; and substantial redundancies, including compulsory ones.

Twenty years ago, I was a NATFHE branch secretary, but I would not wish to return to the so-called silver book conditions of service. A modern, post-compulsory education system needs flexibility in the deployment of its key asset—staff. However, graduate further education lecturers who teach A levels in colleges have a fair point when they compare their pay and conditions to those enjoyed by school teachers. When large numbers of school teachers start to

gwahanol sefydliadau yn derbyn lefelau ariannu sydd yn wahanol iawn, a delir gan wahanol asiantaethau drwy fethodolegau ariannu gwahanol. Nid yw Mr Heath Robinson wedi marw. Mae'n fyw ac yn iach, ac fe'i gyflogir mewn ariannu ôl-16.

Mae'r system ariannu bresennol yn arwain at ganlyniadau chwerthinllyd. Er enghraifft, nid ariennir Almaeneg sgysiol gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru, ond ariennir Almaeneg llafar, ar yr amod bod asesiad ar ddiwedd y cwrs. Mae'r disgwyliad o asesiad yn peri gofid, yn enwedig i oedolion sydd am ddychwelyd i addysg ar ôl toriad o lawer o flynyddoedd. Ledled Cymru, mae arbenigwyr cwricwlwm â chyflog da wedi ymlafnio er mwyn sicrhau bod y cwricwlwm yn tynnu'r diferyn olaf o refeniw o'r fethodoleg ariannu bresennol. Buasai wedi bod yn well defnyddio'r ymdrech honno i ddatblygu cyrsiau i ateb anghenion myfyrwyr a busnesau lleol.

Mae'r sector addysg bellach yng Nghymru wedi ymateb yn dda i dargedau cynnydd ymestynnol aruthrol, ond nid oedd y Llywodraeth flaenorol erioed wedi ariannu'r cynnydd hwnnw'n iawn. Mae hynny mewn gwrthgyferbyniad llwyr â'r sefyllfa bresennol, lle y mae Llafur Cymru'n ategu ei ymrwymiad i addysg ôl-16 â chwistrelliad sylweddol o arian. Sut y talwyd am y cynnydd hwnnw heb ei ariannu? Byddai Cymdeithas Genedlaethol Athrawon Addysg Bellach ac Uwch yn cyfeirio at y gostyngiad sylweddol mewn tâl ac amodau a ddioddefodd darlithwyr yn ystod y blynyddoedd bu y Torïaid mewn grym; colli amodau gwasanaeth cenedlaethol; eu tâl yn colli tir yn erbyn eu cydweithwyr mewn ysgolion; a nifer fawr o ddiswyddiadau, gan gynnwys rhai gorfodol.

Ugain mlynedd yn ôl, yr oeddwn yn ysgrifennydd cangen Cymdeithas Genedlaethol Athrawon Addysg Bellach ac Uwch, ond ni ddymunwn fynd yn ôl at amodau gwasanaeth y llyfr arian bondigrybwyll. Mewn system addysg ôl-orfodol, fodern y mae angen hyblygrwydd wrth drefnu ei phrif ased—ei staff. Fodd bynnag, mae gan ddarlithwyr addysg bellach graddedig sydd yn dysgu Safon Uwch mewn colegau bwynt teg pan gymharant eu tâl a'u

benefit substantially from the performance management package currently being discussed, further education teaching, I fear, will look like a poor alternative. I would like to see further education lecturers who perform similar jobs to school teachers being treated with parity of esteem, in the same way as academic and vocational qualifications should be treated with parity of esteem.

The new National Council for Education and Training will replace five quangos—a useful contribution to the bonfire. This new body must be seen to take its strategic lead from this place. It must operate on a short leash—not at arm's length—and political decisions should be made here. The council must be a technical body that provides the Assembly with expert advice and guidance, and must not run its own agenda.

Elin Jones is right. The devil is not so much in the detail, but in the recurrent funding methodology. The new body must, as an early task, take into account three key issues—Welsh medium provision, rurality and the hidden curriculum. When colleges became incorporated and there was a new funding methodology, recreational sport, for example, was not paid for and the consequence was fairly disastrous: sport in further education colleges declined. I do not think that Graham Henry would ever forgive us if we allowed that to be repeated throughout post-16 education. We can move fairly rapidly towards a common method of funding, but we cannot move rapidly to a common unit of resource. We need some convergence, but we do not need financial destabilisation for sixth forms.

No speech of mine would be complete without a reference to information and communications technology. I have seen many good small scale examples around Wales of schools, libraries and schools and colleges co-operating on this. However, I do not see a strategic plan for information and communications technology across Welsh education bringing together all schools, colleges, large employers, community centres

hamodau â'r rhai a fwynheir gan athrawon ysgol. Pan fydd niiferoedd mawr o athrawon ysgol yn dechrau elwa'n sylweddol o'r pecyn rheoli perfformiad a drafodir ar hyn o bryd, mae arnaf ofn y bydd dysgu addysg bellach yn ymddangos yn ddewis gwael. Hoffwn weld darlithwyr addysg bellach sydd yn cyflawni swyddi tebyg i athrawon ysgol yn cael eu trin â'r un parch, yn yr un modd ag y dylid trin cymwysterau academiaidd a galwedigaethol â'r un parch.

Bydd y Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant newydd yn cymryd lle pum cwango—cyfraniad buddiol i'r goelcerth. Rhaid i'r corff newydd hwn dderbyn ei arweiniad strategol o'r lle hwn. Rhaid iddo weithredu ar dennyn byr—nid ar hyd braich—a dylid gwneud penderfyniadau gwleidyddol yma. Rhaid i'r cyngor fod yn gorff technegol sydd yn rhoi cyngor ac arweiniad arbenigol i'r Cynulliad, ac ni ddylai redeg ei agenda ei hun.

Mae Elin Jones yn gywir. Nid y manylion sydd yn dyngedfennol gymaint â'r fethodoleg ariannu rheolaidd. Fel un o'i orchwyllion cyntaf, rhaid i'r corff newydd gymryd tri mater allweddol i ystyriaeth—darpariaeth gyfrwng Cymraeg, gwledigrwydd a'r cwricwlwm cudd. Pan ymgorfforwyd y colegau a phan oedd methodoleg ariannu newydd, ni thelid am chwaraeon adloniadol, er enghraifft ac yr oedd y canlyniad yn eithaf trychinebus: bu dirywiad mewn chwaraeon mewn colegau addysg bellach. Ni chredaf y byddai Graham Henry byth yn maddau i ni pe caniatuem i hynny ddigwydd drwy addysg ôl-16. Gallwn symud yn weddol gyflym at ddull ariannu cyffredin, ond ni allwn symud yn gyflym at sylfaen adnoddau gyffredin. Mae arnom angen rhywfaint o gydgyfeirio, ond nid oes arnom angen dadsefydlogi ariannol mewn cysylltiad â dosbarthiadau chwech.

Ni fyddai'r un araith yn gyflawn gennyf heb gyfeiriad at dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Gwelais lawer o enghreifftiau da ar raddfa fechan o amgylch Cymru o ysgolion, llyfrgelloedd ac ysgolion a cholegau'n cydweithio ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni welaf gynllun strategol ar gyfer technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu ar draws addysg yng Nghymru er mwyn dod â'r holl ysgolion, colegau, cyflogwyr mawr,

and so on, including the huge resource of material that is available at the National Library for Wales. They currently have a digitisation project; its only fault is that it is far too small.

On the input of business, high standards of education and training are a precondition for economic development, healthy communities and personal fulfilment. Jonathan's comments were a little mischievous. It is absolutely right that business has a strong and powerful voice in the planning process, but it cannot have a dominant voice. No group should. Instead we must build a coalition of educationalists, large and small employers and the voluntary sector—the real cinderellas here. I also want the representatives of workers in post-16 education to have a voice. Reading *The Western Mail* last Saturday on my way to a relaxing visit to Cardigan—I went for the weather, it was excellent last weekend—I read a strange message from the new head of the CBI. I believe that a mature and mutually respectful debate about complex issues is better carried out around a table than in 22 point headlines. However, to be fair to him, he is new to the job and I am sure that he will get the hang of it when he has more experience.

To conclude, we have the makings of a world-class education and training system, free of the Berlin walls that have damaged the system for far too long. As someone who has spent most of his professional career dealing with the impact of post-school policy, I warmly commend the Post-16 Education and Training Committee's report and the Executive's motion to the Assembly.

Phil Williams: I will be brief but my point will be important. Questions of education and training involve two committees. Quite properly, post-16 education in schools and the corresponding functions of further education colleges are the sole responsibility of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee and it has carried out its work very thoroughly. It has been a model to other Committees and has proposed reform that is

canolfannau cymunedol ac yn y blaen at ei gilydd, gan gynnwys yr adnodd deunydd anferth sydd ar gael yn Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru. Mae ganddynt brosiect digideiddio ar hyn o bryd; yr unig ddiffyg ynddo yw ei fod yn rhy fach o lawer.

Ynghylch mewnbwn busnes, mae safonau addysg a hyfforddiant uchel yn rhagamod ar gyfer datblygu economaidd, cymunedau iach a chyflawniad personol. Yr oedd sylwadau Jonathan braidd yn ddrygionus. Mae'n gwbl gywir bod gan fusnes lais cryf a phwerus yn y broses cynllunio, ond ni all gael llais sydd yn drech na phawb. Ni ddylai'r un grŵp gael llais felly. Yn lle hynny rhaid inni greu cynghrair o addysgwyr, cyflogwyr mawr a bach a'r sector gwirfoddol—y rhai a gaiff eu hanghofio'n aml. Yr wyf hefyd am i gynrychiolwyr gweithwyr mewn addysg ôl-16 gael llais. Wrth ddarllen *The Western Mail* ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf ar fy ffordd i ymweliad hamddenol ag Aberteifi—euthum yno oherwydd y tywydd, yr oedd yn ardderchog y penwythnos diwethaf—darllenais neges ryfedd gan bennaeth newydd Cyd-ffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain. Credaf ei bod yn well cael trafodaeth aeddfed gyda pharch gan y naill at y llall am faterion cymhleth o amgylch y bwrdd na drwy benawdau 22 pwynt. Fodd bynnag, a bod yn deg ag ef, mae'n newydd i'r swydd ac yr wyf yn sicr y daw i'w deall ar ôl cael mwy o brofiad.

I derfynu, mae gennym ddeunydd system addysg a hyfforddiant ymhlith y gorau yn y byd, yn rhydd oddi wrth y gwahanfuriau a andwyodd y system yn rhy hir o lawer. Fel un a dreuliodd y rhan fwyaf o'i yrfa broffesiynol yn ymdrin ag effaith polisi ôl-ysgol, cymeradwyaf yn gynnes adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 a chynnig y Weithrediaeth i'r Cynulliad.

Phil Williams: Byddaf yn gryno ond bydd y pwynt sydd gennyf yn bwysig. Mae materion addysg a hyfforddiant yn cynnwys dau bwyllgor. Yn gwbl briodol, mae cyfrifoldeb am addysg ôl-16 a swyddogaethau cyfatebol y colegau addysg bellach yn perthyn yn gyfan gwbl i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 a chyflawnodd ei waith yn drwyadl iawn. Bu'n batrwm i Bwyllgorau eraill ac mae wedi cynnig diwygiad hir-

long overdue. I also understand that several of the enterprise functions of the TECs will be the responsibility of the Economic Development Committee and, although they are much smaller functions, I hope that members of that Committee will show the same responsibility.

However, there is one function that could have concerned both Committees: the provision of workplace training, especially schemes such as the modern apprenticeship scheme. That has been discussed mainly by the Post-16 Education and Training Committee, but it is central to our economic strategy and it is an essential component of our aim to improve the skills of our workforce to meet present and future needs. There would have been a case, at an early stage, for the joint meeting of the two Committees and, as a general point, I would like this to be considered as part of this Assembly's procedures in dealing with topics that overlap the responsibilities of two Committees. We never had a full joint meeting, although we had a valuable meeting with the Chair and Secretary of the Committee last week.

Unfortunately, the area of joint concern has become one of the two major sources of conflict in discussions on the ETAG proposals. The future of the regional tier of workplace training is especially controversial. There is a strong case for having a regional tier because this level is best matched to the economic fora. Furthermore, when one considers the pattern of travel to work as opposed to the pattern of travel to college, the regional level has a natural function. It also fits in well with the developing cluster of industry that is a feature of the modern economy. My concern is centred on one sentence in the recommendations, that is, the lack of precision in the description of the functions of the regional panels. At present, in the wording of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee recommendations, the regional panels are described as advisory panels, the primary role of which would be to:

ddisgwylidig. Deallaf hefyd y bydd nifer o swyddogaethau menter y Cynghorau Hyfforddi a Menter yn gyfrifoldeb i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ac, er eu bod yn swyddogaethau llai o lawer, gobeithiaf y bydd aelodau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw'n amlygu'r un cyfrifoldeb.

Fodd bynnag, mae un swyddogaeth y gallasai'r ddau Bwyllgor fod wedi ymwneud â hi: darparu hyfforddiant yn y gweithle, yn enwedig cynlluniau fel y cynllun prentisiaeth fodern. Trafodwyd hynny gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 yn bennaf, ond mae'n ganolog i'n strategaeth economaidd ac yn elfen hanfodol yn ein nod o wella medrau ein gweithlu er mwyn diwallu anghenion y presennol a'r dyfodol. Byddai dadl dros gyd-gyfarfod o'r ddau Bwyllgor, mewn cyfnod cynnar ac, fel pwynt cyffredinol, hoffwn weld ystyried hynny fel rhan o weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad hwn wrth ymdrin â phynciau sydd yn gorgyffwrdd cyfrifoldebau dau Bwyllgor. Ni chawsom gyd-gyfarfod llawn erioed, er inni gael cyfarfod gwerthfawr â Chadeirydd ac Ysgrifennydd y Pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf.

Yn anffodus, daeth y maes y mae gan y ddau ddiddordeb ynddo yn un o'r ddau brif achos gwrthdaro mewn trafodaethau ar gynigion y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Mae dyfodol yr haen ranbarthol o hyfforddiant yn y gweithle yn arbennig o ddadleuol. Mae dadl gref dros gael haen ranbarthol oherwydd hon yw'r lefel sydd yn cyfateb orau i'r fforymau economaidd. Yn ogystal, pan mae rhywun yn ystyried y patrwm teithio i'r gwaith o'i gyferbynnu â'r patrwm teithio i'r coleg, mae swyddogaeth naturiol i'r haen ranbarthol. Mae hefyd yn cydweddu'n dda â'r clwstwr datblygol o ddiwydiannau sydd yn nodweddiadol ar yr economi modern. Mae'r pryder sydd gennyf yn canolbwyntio ar un frawddeg yn yr argymhellion, sef y diffyg manyldeb yn y disgrifiad o swyddogaethau'r paneli ranbarthol. Ar hyn o bryd, yng ngeiriad argymhellion y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, disgrifir y paneli ranbarthol fel paneli ymgynghorol, a'u prif rôl fyddai:

'contribute to the development of plans for 'cyfrannu at ddatblygiad cynlluniau prynu

purchasing work-based training for submission to and consideration by the council itself'.

3:59 p.m.

For such a controversial topic, that is too vague. It has, rightly or wrongly, been suggested that the most influential leaders of industry and business would not be willing to contribute to a regional advisory panel unless there was certainty that a real job would be done and unless the panels had a real function. The wording of the present recommendations could be said to justify uncertainty, at least, in this area where we want to encourage the maximum degree of partnership. The word 'advice' is a little worrying. To refer back to a previous debate, giving advice is anyone's right, as I was told in no uncertain manner when I asked whether the Economic Development Committee could give advice on the map for regional selective assistance. I was told that I could give advice to the barman in the pub that night but that no-one need take any notice.

It is essential that the regional panels—I would prefer the name 'regional committees'—have a clearly defined job that will underline Cynog's point: that they have an important role in the provision of workplace training. Provided that the regional panels have that role and it is clearly shown as such, there will be no problem in attracting the leaders of industry and business to what is an important ingredient for the success of their enterprise. Therefore, these regional panels should be given the responsibility—in close co-operation with the regional officials—to consider the proposals for work-based training from the CCETs, to improve those proposals and to combine them into a coherent regional plan with clearly defined priorities.

There can be no doubt that the ultimate decision lies with the council. The council must balance the needs of the different regions in allocating the appropriate budget. In other words, when a plan is provided with clearly defined priorities, the council must decide where the line is drawn across the list

hyfforddiant yn y gwaith i'w hystyried gan y cyngor.'

Mae hynny'n rhy amwys ar gyfer pwnc dadleuol. Awgrymwyd, yn gam neu'n gymwys, na fyddai'r arweinyddion diwydiant a busnes mwyaf dylanwadol yn barod i gyfrannu i banel ymgynghorol rhanbarthol oni bai fod sicrwydd y byddai'n cyflawni swydd o waith iawn ac oni bai fod swyddogaeth wirioneddol gan y paneli. Gellid dweud bod geiriad yr argymhellion presennol yn cyfiawnhau ansicrwydd, o leiaf, yn y maes hwn lle'r ydym am annog y lefel o bartneriaeth fwyaf posibl. Mae'r gair 'cyngor' yn peri gofid braidd. A chyfeirio'n ôl at ddadl flaenorol, mae gan bawb hawl i roi cyngor, fel y dywedwyd wrthyf yn blwmp ac yn blaen pan ofynnais a gâi'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd roi cyngor ar y map ar gyfer cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Dywedwyd wrthyf y cawn roi cyngor i'r barman yn y dafarn y noson honno ond na fyddai neb yn gorfod cymryd sylw.

Mae'n holl bwysig bod y paneli rhanbarthol—byddai'n well gennyf yr enw 'pwyllgorau rhanbarthol'—yn cael gwaith a ddiffinnir yn fanwl a fydd yn tanlinellu pwynt Cynog: bod ganddynt rôl bwysig yn y ddarpariaeth o hyfforddiant yn y gweithle. Cyhyd â bod y rôl honno gan y paneli rhanbarthol a'i bod wedi ei nodi'n glir fel hynny, ni cheir anhawster wrth ddenu arweinyddion diwydiant a busnes at yr hyn sydd yn elfen bwysig ar gyfer llwyddiant eu busnes. Felly, dylid rhoi'r cyfrifoldeb i'r paneli rhanbarthol hyn—mewn cydweithrediad agos â'r swyddogion rhanbarthol—i ystyried y cynigion am hyfforddiant yn y gwaith oddi wrth y Consortia Cymunedol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant, gwella'r cynigion hynny a'u cyfuno mewn cynllun rhanbarthol cydlynol ac iddo flaenoriaethau a ddiffinnir yn eglur.

Yn ddios, y cyngor biau'r penderfyniad terfynol. Rhaid i'r cyngor gadw'r ddysgl yn wastad rhwng anghenion y gwahanol ranbarthau wrth ddyrannu'r gyllideb briodol. Mewn geiriau eraill, pan roddir blaenoriaethau eglur mewn cynllun, rhaid i'r cyngor benderfynu lle y dylid tynnu'r llinell

of priorities. Furthermore, the council must have the power to introduce elements of training—and that has been missing in the past—determined by a proper consideration of future skill needs. The regional panels will shape the year-by-year provision of workplace training. With defined functions, the leaders of industry and business can be sure that they will have a real role in shaping the provision of workplace training that meets the needs as they see them.

Although I express a personal emphasis in this matter, it is not incompatible with the main recommendations. I only seek a clarity that is absent in this crucial area. That lack of clarity has been exploited by many people in different ways. I am not advocating a re-establishment of the old TECs, where regional bodies had complete control of autonomous budgets. I am convinced that many of the concerns expressed forcibly over the last weeks are genuine and that we should ensure—and there is widespread agreement on this—that this uncertainty should be resolved.

Jenny Randerson: I speak as someone who has a foot in both camps, in terms of the background to the role of post-16 education, because I spent 23 years teaching in further education and I am currently a governor in a school with one of the largest sixth forms in Wales. I therefore value school sixth forms greatly. Also, the only official sixth form college in Wales is in my constituency. I am not a member of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee, but during this process I have been subject to a great deal of lobbying, as we all have. The wide variety of opinion has been interesting. Normally when we are lobbied, there appears to be a consensus but we have heard diverse views on this subject. That is understandable because people come from different backgrounds and have different vested interests. I am certain of one fact, and that is the desperate need to improve the circumstances and funding of the further education colleges and the further education sector in Wales. Alun Pugh referred to a crisis of morale among further education lecturers. They have suffered a reduction in

ar draws y rhestr o flaenoriaethau. Yn fwy na hynny, rhaid i'r cyngor gael yr hawl i gyflwyno elfennau hyfforddiant—a bu hynny ar goll yn y gorffennol—a bennir drwy ystyriaeth briodol o anghenion medrau yn y dyfodol. Bydd y paneli rhanbarthol yn llunio'r ddarpariaeth o hyfforddiant yn y gweithle o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. O roi iddynt swyddogaethau diffiniedig, gall arweinwyr diwydiant a busnes fod yn sicr y bydd ganddynt rôl wirioneddol wrth lunio'r ddarpariaeth o hyfforddiant yn y gweithle sydd yn ateb yr anghenion fel y'u gwelant.

Er fy mod yn mynegi pwyslais personol yn y mater hwn, nid yw'n anghyson â'r prif argymhellion. Y cwbl a geisïaf yw eglurder sydd yn absennol yn y maes holl bwysig hwn. Manteisiwyd ar y diffyg eglurder hwnnw gan lawer o bobl mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Nid wyf yn dadlau dros ailsefydlu'r hen Gynghorau Hyfforddi a Menter, lle'r oedd gan gyrff rhanbarthol reolaeth lwyr dros gyllidebau annibynnol. Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig bod llawer o'r pryderon a fynegwyd yn gryf dros yr wythnosau diwethaf yn ddilys ac y dylem sicrhau—ac mae cytundeb eang ar hyn—y bydd yr ansicrwydd hwn wedi ei ddatrys.

Jenny Randerson: Siaradaf fel un sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r ddwy ochr, o ran y cefndir i rôl addysg ôl-16, oherwydd treuliais 23 blynedd yn dysgu mewn addysg bellach ac yr wyf ar hyn o bryd yn llywodraethwr mewn ysgol sydd ag un o'r dosbarthiadau chwech mwyaf yng Nghymru. Felly gwerthfawrogaf ddosbarthiadau chwech yn fawr. Hefyd, mae'r unig goleg dosbarth chwech swyddogol yng Nghymru yn fy etholaeth i. Nid wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, ond yn ystod y broses hon profais lawer iawn o lobïo, fel y gwnaethom i gyd. Bu'r amrywiaeth barn eang yn ddiddorol. Fel arfer pan yw rhai yn ein lobïo, ymddengys fod consensws ond clywsom safbwyntiau gwahanol ar y pwnc hwn. Gellir deall hynny oherwydd daw pobl o wahanol gefndiroedd ac mae ganddynt wahanol fuddiannau ynddo. Yr wyf yn sicr o un ffaith, a hynny yw'r angen dybryd i wella amgylchiadau ac ariannu'r colegau addysg bellach a'r sector addysg bellach yng Nghymru. Cyfeiriodd Alun Pugh at argyfwng morâl ymysg darlithwyr addysg bellach.

relative pay levels and a severe reduction in the terms and conditions of their employment, which have led to a recruitment crisis. An increase in casual work underlies this situation. There has always been a large casual workforce in further education colleges, but the casual workforce is now so large that running the colleges has become a real problem.

I would be the first to say that teachers do not receive a fair deal, but further education lecturers are their poor relations. We must bear in mind that, in Wales, most A level and equivalent courses and almost all vocational courses, apart from general national vocational qualifications, are undertaken in further education colleges, not in schools. We are talking about the future quality and standard of our young—and occasionally not so young—people throughout Wales. We have had post-16 education on the cheap for far too long in Wales. The difference in funding between school sixth forms and further education colleges can be as much as £1,000 per head in the case of two young people studying the same course in different institutions. However, there can also be a difference of almost that amount between one sixth form and another in different parts of Wales, which is equally unfair. We must level the playing field and do so by increasing the funding.

The Conservatives' amendment 2 ignores the level of dissatisfaction among many teachers and head teachers about the dramatic differences in funding between areas. There is a strong lobby that would tell us to take all school funding out of the hands of local councils. I do not agree with that. However, the proposals before us allow a decent minimum standard to be set and allow a new transparency. Schools would know how much would be allowed per pupil and per course, and would therefore know how much they should receive from their local education authority. The LEA would still have a hand in that. The dramatic differences in areas currently exist because areas are not aware of how much other areas receive. The differences are haphazard and cannot be explained by simple factors such as rurality or school size. Jonathan Morgan's concerns

Dioddefasant ostyngiad mewn lefelau tâl cymharol a gostyngiad enbyd yn nhelerau ac amodau eu cyflogaeth, sydd wedi arwain at argyfwng recriwtio. Cynydd mewn gwaith ysbeidiol sydd wrth wraidd y sefyllfa hon. Bu gweithlu ysbeidiol mawr erioed mewn colegau addysg bellach, ond mae'r gweithlu ysbeidiol gymaint bellach fel bod rheoli'r colegau'n broblem wirioneddol.

Fi fyddai'r cyntaf i ddweud nad yw athrawon yn cael bargaen deg, ond darlithwyr addysg bellach yw'r perthnasau tlawd. Rhaid inni gofio bod, yng Nghymru, y rhan fwyaf o gyrsiau Safon Uwch a chyrsiau cyfatebol a bron bob cwrs galwedigaethol, ar wahân i gymwysterau galwedigaethol cenedlaethol cyffredinol, yn cael eu dilyn mewn colegau addysg bellach, nid mewn ysgolion. Yr ydym yn sôn am ansawdd a safon ein pobl ifanc—ac weithiau rhai nad ydynt mor ifanc—yn y dyfodol ledled Cymru. Cawsom addysg ôl-16 yn rhad yn rhy hir o lawer yng Nghymru. Gall y gwahaniaeth mewn ariannu rhwng dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion a cholegau addysg bellach fod yn gymaint â £1,000 y pen yn achos dau berson ifanc sydd yn dilyn yr un cwrs mewn gwahanol sefydliadau. Fodd bynnag, gellir cael gwahaniaeth hefyd sydd bron gymaint â hynny rhwng un dosbarth chwech ac un arall mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru, sydd yr un mor annheg. Rhaid inni sicrhau cysondeb a hynny drwy gynyddu'r cyllid.

Mae gwelliant 2 y Ceidwadwyr yn anwybyddu lefel yr anfodlonrwydd a geir ymysg llawer o athrawon a phrifathrawon ynghylch y gwahaniaethau ariannu trawiadol rhwng ardaloedd. Mae lobi gryf a fyddai'n dweud wrthym y dylem gymryd yr holl ariannu i ysgolion allan o ddwylo cynghorau lleol. Ni chytunaf â hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynigion sydd ger ein bron yn caniatáu pennu safon leiaf foddhaol ac yn caniatáu tryloywder newydd. Byddai'r ysgolion yn gwybod faint a gâi ei ganiatáu fesul disgybl a fesul cwrs, ac yn gwybod felly faint y dylent ei dderbyn oddi wrth eu hawdurdod addysg lleol. Byddai gan yr awdurdod addysg lleol ran yn hynny o hyd. Mae'r gwahaniaethau trawiadol rhwng ardaloedd ar hyn o bryd gan nad yw ardaloedd yn ymwybodol o faint y mae ardaloedd eraill yn ei dderbyn. Mae'r gwahaniaethau'n digwydd ar hap a damwain

are legitimate. We must protect our school sixth forms, but they will be dealt with through the instructions provided by the Assembly, as an elected body. We will inform the education and training council about what we want it to deliver. We hold the key and we are elected.

ac ni ellir eu hegluro drwy ffactorau syml fel gwledigrwydd neu faint yr ysgol. Mae pryderon Jonathan Morgan yn rhai dilys. Rhaid inni warchod ein dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion, ond ymdrinnir â hwy drwy'r cyfarwyddiadau a roddir gan y Cynulliad, fel corff etholedig. Byddwn yn rhoi gwybod i'r cyngor addysg a hyfforddiant am yr hyn yr ydym am iddo ei gyflawni. Gennym ni y mae'r allwedd ac yr ydym wedi'n hethol.

4:09 p.m.

I would not support this if I felt it would do anything other than help small rural schools. Let us be accurate about this. Small rural sixth forms are struggling and will only survive if they are able to co-operate with other institutions in their areas. The Conservatives have a real nerve. They introduced competition—divisive, destructive, wasteful, cut-throat competition. I know of a young person who decided to leave her school and go to her local sixth form college. In her first week at college, her school contacted her three times begging her to go back. She did so and three months later, she was back at the sixth form college asking to be accepted, saying that she had made a mistake and had been pressurised. The sixth form college could not take her back until the following year, because the course had already started. Wasteful, cut-throat competition spoiled a year of that girl's life.

Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi hyn pe bawn yn teimlo y gwnâi rywbeth heblaw helpu ysgolion gwledig bychain. Gadewch inni fod yn gywir ynghylch hyn. Mae dosbarthiadau chwech gwledig bychain mewn trafferthion ac ni fyddant yn goroesi oni bai eu bod yn gallu cydweithredu â sefydliadau eraill yn eu hardal. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn gwbl ddigywilydd. Cyflwynasant gystadlu—cystadlu cynhennus, dinistriol, gwastraffus, didrugaredd. Gwn am rywun ifanc a benderfynodd adael ei hysgol a mynd i'r coleg chweched dosbarth lleol. Yn ei hwythnos gyntaf yn y coleg, cysylltodd yr ysgol â hi dair gwaith gan ymbilio arni i fynd yn ôl. Gwnaeth hynny ac ymhen tri mis, yr oedd yn ei hôl yn y coleg chweched dosbarth yn gofyn am gael ei derbyn, gan ddweud ei bod wedi gwneud camgymeriad a bod pwysau wedi eu rhoi arni. Ni allai'r coleg chweched dosbarth ei derbyn yn ôl hyd y flwyddyn ganlynol, am fod y cwrs eisoes wedi dechrau. Yr oedd cystadlu gwastraffus, didrugaredd wedi difetha blwyddyn o oes y ferch honno.

David Davies: I note the Member's comments about the cut-throat manner with which the Conservatives dealt with education between 1979 and 1997. Is it not the case that, during those years, the number of pupils who went on to further education—to universities, polytechnics or colleges—rose from the one in eight it had been under the Labour Government in 1979, to one in three in about 1997? Will the Member join me in congratulating the previous administration for that enormous rise in the number of people who had an opportunity to enter into further education? Does she not agree that that was a lasting achievement of the previous

David Davies: Nodaf sylwadau'r Aelod am ddull didrugaredd y Ceidwadwyr wrth ymdrin ag addysg rhwng 1979 a 1997. Onid yw'n wir, yn ystod y blynyddoedd hynny, fod nifer y disgyblion a aeth i addysg bellach—i brifysgolion, colegau polytechnig neu golegau—wedi codi o un ym mhob wyth fel yr oedd o dan y Llywodraeth Lafur yn 1979 i un ym mhob tri erbyn tua 1997? A yw'r Aelod yn fodlon ymuno â mi wrth longyfarch y weinyddiaeth flaenorol am y cynnydd enfawr hwnnw yn y nifer a gafodd gyfle i fynd i addysg bellach? Onid yw'n cytuno bod hynny'n gamp arhosol ar ran y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol?

Conservative Government?

Jenny Randerson: I am happy to agree that the number of people who went on to sixth form education increased considerably under the Conservative Government. I would praise the people who made a grotty system work, rather than the exhortations of the Tory Government.

The culture of competition must be replaced by one of co-operation, and to do this, we must kick-start the proposals. It is no good going along the lines of 'we will co-operate'. The culture of competition is far too deeply embedded in these institutions. They must be brought together and we must ensure that we rely on all parties getting together. Above all, sixth forms must not be excluded from the consortia. We owe them a voice. Without a voice, school sixth forms will not survive. They will be frozen out. They must have the opportunity to put forward their case. The Conservatives' proposals would mean the slow—or not so slow—death of many school sixth forms in Wales.

There is a long way to go on these proposals. The devil, as we have already been told this afternoon, lies in the detail, which is still to be determined. That is in our hands. This plan provides a good outline, but there is a long way to go if we are to provide the skills and the post-16 sector that the children, young people and adults of Wales deserve.

Ann Jones: I pay tribute to members of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee, whose deliberations have covered the issues in depth. I will address my remarks to the reforms proposed for the careers service. Here I pay tribute to my colleague Christine Chapman, who unfortunately is absent with a back problem—I am sure we wish her a speedy recovery. In the Committee's discussions, Christine detailed the reasoning behind the changes to the careers service in Wales. The report mentions the change in the nature of jobs and learning in Wales. In future, people will be expected to play a much greater role in planning their careers

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn falch o gytuno bod y nifer a aeth i addysg dosbarth chwech wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Rhoddwn glod i'r rhai a lwyddodd i weithredu system wael, yn hytrach nag i anogaethau'r Llywodraeth Doriad.

Rhaid rhoi diwylliant o gydweithredu yn lle'r un o gystadlu, ac i wneud hynny, rhaid inni roi hwb ymlaen i'r cynigion. Nid oes diben dweud rhywbeth fel 'byddwn yn cydweithredu'. Mae'r diwylliant o gystadlu wedi'i wreiddio'n rhy ddwfn yn y sefydliadau hyn. Rhaid dod â hwy at ei gilydd a rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn dibynnu ar gyd-dynnu rhwng y partïon. Yn fwy na dim, ni ddylid cau allan dosbarthiadau chwech o'r consortia. Maent yn haeddu cael llais gennym. Heb gael llais, ni fydd dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion yn goroesi. Fe'u caeir allan. Rhaid iddynt gael y cyfle i gyflwyno eu hachos. Byddai cynigion y Ceidwadwyr yn golygu tranc araf—neu nid mor araf—llawer o ddosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru.

Mae ffordd bell o'n blaen gyda'r cynigion hyn. Y manylion, fel y dywedwyd wrthym eisoes y prynhawn yma, sydd yn dyngedfennol, ac mae'r rhain eto i'w penderfynu. Mae hynny yn ein dwylo ni. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn rhoi braslun da, ond mae ffordd bell o'n blaen os ydym i ddarparu'r medrau a'r sector ôl-16 y mae plant, pobl ifanc ac oedolion Cymru yn eu haeddu.

Ann Jones: Talaf deyrnged i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, a roddodd sylw manwl i'r materion yn eu trafodaethau. Cyfeiriaf fy sylwadau at y diwygiadau a gynigir ar gyfer y gwasanaeth gyrfaeodd. Talaf deyrnged yma i'm cyd-Aelod Christine Chapman, sydd yn absennol gwaetha'r modd oherwydd problem â'i chefn—yr wyf yn sicrhau ein bod yn dymuno adferiad buan iddi. Yn nhrafodaethau'r Pwyllgor, disgrifiodd Christine y rhesymu sydd y tu ôl i'r newidiadau i'r gwasanaeth gyrfaeodd yng Nghymru. Mae'r adroddiad yn sôn am y newid yn natur swyddi a dysgu yng Nghymru. Yn y dyfodol, disgwylir i bobl

than they have done in the past, because there have been wholesale changes in the employment market. Gone are the days of a job for life. We have patterns of work that are characterised by short-term contracts, continual re-skilling, personal development and the need to sometimes change careers completely.

Careers service companies are well placed to provide professional guidance on the options available. Therefore, the ETAG report recommended that the Assembly should establish a national all-age information, advice and guidance service, namely Careers Wales, by April of next year. That service would be based upon, and be founded on the current eight careers service companies in Wales, which will be developed to operate under the Careers Wales brand. This will draw together provision currently provided by careers service companies, the adult guidance initiative and learndirect.

The careers service in Wales, and the professionals who work in it, are extremely good at handling change. The quality of the service provision has not diminished as it has moved from being under local authority control to independent companies. I think that it has improved. That is a key factor in ensuring that Careers Wales will be a successful venture. I am sure that it will. This new all-age information, advice and guidance body will provide invaluable advice to trainers and learners, and will give excellent careers guidance to everyone in Wales who seeks it. People do not realise the extent of the good work that the careers service companies in Wales already undertake, and this progression to Careers Wales will hopefully further raise the profile and subsequently the effectiveness of careers guidance professionals throughout Wales.

The careers service is already innovative and has an excellent track record of inter-agency working. Careers services work with social services, education providers, probation

chwarae rhan fwy o lawer wrth gynllunio eu gyrfaedd nag a wnaethant yn y gorffennol, oherwydd bu newidiadau ar raddfa eang yn y farchnad gyflogaeth. Mae dyddiau'r swydd am oes ar ben. Mae gennym batrymau gweithio a nodweddir gan contractau tymor byr, dysgu medrau newydd yn barhaus, datblygiad personol a'r angen weithiau i newid gyrfa'n llwyr.

Mae cwmnïau'r gwasanaeth gyrfaedd mewn sefyllfa dda i ddarparu arweiniad proffesiynol ar y dewisiadau sydd ar gael. Felly, argymhellodd adroddiad y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant y dylai'r Cynulliad sefydlu gwasanaeth gwybodaeth, cyngor ac arweiniad cenedlaethol i bob oed, sef Gyrfaedd Cymru, erbyn Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Byddai'r gwasanaeth hwnnw wedi ei seilio a'i sylfaenu ar yr wyth cwmni gwasanaeth gyrfaedd presennol yng Nghymru, fydd yn cael eu datblygu i weithredu o dan frand Gyrfaedd Cymru. Bydd hyn yn cyfuno'r ddarpariaeth a gyflwynir ar hyn o bryd gan y cwmnïau gwasanaeth gyrfaedd, y fenter arweiniad i oedolion a chyswllt dysgu.

Mae'r gwasanaeth gyrfaedd yng Nghymru, a'r gweithwyr proffesiynol sydd yn gweithio ynddo, yn arbennig o dda wrth ymdopi â newid. Nid yw ansawdd y gwasanaeth a ddarperir wedi lleihau wrth symud o reolaeth awdurdodau lleol i gwmnïau annibynnol. Credaf ei fod wedi gwella. Mae hynny'n ffactor allweddol wrth sicrhau y bydd Gyrfaedd Cymru yn fenter lwyddiannus. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd. Bydd y corff gwybodaeth, cyngor ac arweiniad newydd hwn i bob oed yn darparu cyngor amhrisiadwy i hyfforddwyr a dysgwyr, ac yn rhoi arweiniad gyrfaedd rhagorol i bawb yng Nghymru fydd yn ei geisio. Nid yw pobl yn sylweddoli cymaint o waith da a gyflawnir gan y cwmnïau gwasanaeth gyrfaedd yng Nghymru eisoes, a bydd y cam hyn ymlaen at Gyrfaedd Cymru, gobeithiaf, yn cynyddu proffil a drwy hynny effeithiolrwydd y gweithwyr proffesiynol mewn arweiniad gyrfaedd ledled Cymru.

Mae'r gwasanaeth gyrfaedd yn un arloesol eisoes ac mae ganddo record ardderchog o weithio rhyngasiantaethol. Mae'r gwasanaethau gyrfaedd yn gweithio gyda

services and the voluntary sector, and much of that work goes unnoticed. The proposals, and hopefully the structure after today, will build on the strengths of the eight career companies in Wales and will reflect their strong focus on meeting local needs. It is also clear that the independent nature of Careers Wales is positive and we must take care to nurture that.

One key recommendation in the Committee report is that Careers Wales should provide support for all young people, but should focus on those identified as at risk of disaffection. Early attention and action are vital in this, as well as collaborative working arrangements. The careers service companies already have an excellent track record on this issue and I am sure their work will continue and flourish as a result of the new arrangements that will be put in place.

I know of some of the work being undertaken in prisons in south Wales by Mid Glamorgan Careers to help with offenders' rehabilitation programmes. I pay tribute to the careers work that is done by the Youth Gateway in my constituency. It has been giving youngsters in my constituency the opportunity to equip themselves with the skills that they will need to improve their lives. It also gives them a positive attitude and the self-belief that they are important. They can go on to forge a career and be a valuable asset to their community, despite, perhaps, a disaffected background earlier in life.

These are elements of work that people often do not realise that the careers service undertakes, but they are important elements on the road to recovery and in the revitalisation of Wales's economy, skills and knowledge base. The new service will work in close partnership with other service providers, employers and their clients. The Llandrillo College and its satellite service in Rhyl College are working together closely in partnership with Careers Wales, local agencies and sixth forms from local high schools. That is an excellent example of the kind of joined-up approach that the entire system aims at encouraging.

gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, darparwyr addysg, gwasanaethau prawf a'r sector gwirfoddol, ac mae llawer o'r gwaith hwnnw'n osgoi sylw. Bydd y cynigion, a'r strwythur ar ôl heddiw, gobeithiaf, yn datblygu cryfderau'r wyth cwmni gyrfaedd yng Nghymru ac yn adlewyrchu eu ffocws manwl ar ddiwallu anghenion lleol. Mae hefyd yn amlwg bod natur annibynnol Gyrfaedd Cymru'n gadarnhaol ac y bydd yn rhaid inni datblygu hynny'n ofalus.

Un o'r argymhellion allweddol yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor yw y dylai Gyrfaedd Cymru ddarparu cymorth i'r holl bobl ifanc, ond y dylai ganolbwyntio ar y rhai y dynodir eu bod mewn perygl o ymddieithrio. Mae sylw a gweithredu cynnar yn holl bwysig yn hynny, yn ogystal â threfniadau gweithio ar y cyd. Mae gan y cwmnïau gwasanaeth gyrfa record ardderchog eisoes ar y mater ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd eu gwaith yn parhau ac yn ffynnu o ganlyniad i'r trefniadau newydd a sefydlir.

Gwn am rywfaint o'r gwaith a gyflawnir mewn carchardai yn ne Cymru gan Gyrfaedd Morgannwg. Ganol wrth gynorthwyo â rhaglenni ailsefydlu troseddwy. Talaf deyrnged i'r gwaith gyrfaedd a wneir gan Youth Gateway yn fy etholaeth. Rhoddodd gyfle i bobl ifanc yn fy etholaeth i gael y medrau y bydd arnynt eu hangen i wella eu bywydau. Mae hefyd yn rhoi ymagwedd gadarnhaol iddynt a'r hyder i deimlo eu bod yn bwysig. Gallant fynd ymlaen i greu gyrfa a bod yn gaffaeliad gwerthfawr i'w cymuned, er gwaethaf, efallai, gefndir dieithriedig yn gynharach yn eu hoes.

Mae'r rhain yn elfennau yn eu gwaith nad yw pobl yn aml yn sylweddoli bod y gwasanaeth gyrfaedd yn eu cyflawni, ond maent yn elfennau pwysig wrth adfer ac wrth adfywio economi, medrau a sylfaen wybodaeth Cymru. Bydd y gwasanaeth newydd yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth agos â darparwyr gwasanaethau eraill, cyflogwyr a'u cleientiaid. Mae Coleg Llandrillo a'i wasanaeth cysylltiol yng Ngholeg y Rhyl yn cydweithio'n agos mewn partneriaeth â Gyrfaedd Cymru, asiantaethau lleol a dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion uwchradd lleol. Mae hynny'n esiampl ragorol o'r math o ddull cydgysylltiol y mae'r system

gyfan yn ceisio ei hybu.

Careers Wales is a further step in the direction of building a new Wales that is at ease with lifelong learning, continuing development and the vanguard of advice and guidance from people working in the careers service whose efforts largely go unreported but are paramount to a successful, vibrant Wales.

Jocelyn Davies: There are several references in the Committee report to the need to meet the education and training requirements of people with learning difficulties and special needs. However, I wonder how near we are to that reality. Statements of special needs, which parents the length and breadth of Wales struggle to obtain for children with learning difficulties, ensure that children registered at schools have a statutory right to have their needs met, whatever subject or courses they follow. That is not the case at further education institutions. Due to the pressures on resources and staff, FE colleges can only offer special educational provision for a limited number of subjects.

The support offered by statements of special needs disappears for those no longer at school, and we cannot pretend that we are tackling social exclusion if we fail to accommodate the 20 per cent of us who have special needs. Over half our prison population is illiterate, so the potential benefit from tackling this problem is enormous. Having concrete ramps up to the doors is not enough. I am aware that much good work is done on this, but it is still a bit of a lottery. I wonder what plans the Secretary has to improve the special needs provision and what guarantee we can give that our statutory obligation of treating people equally is met?

4:19 p.m.

I have two other concerns that arise out of the proposed restructuring. The first relates to management and to the damning report by the Welsh Affairs Select Committee on Gwent College, where mismanagement of

Mae Gyrfaedd Cymru'n gam pellach tuag at adeiladu Cymru newydd sydd yn gartrefol â dysgu gydol oes, datblygu parhaus a'r flaengad o gyngor ac arweiniad gan weithwyr yn y gwasanaeth gyrfaedd y mae eu hymdrechion yn osgoi sylw gan mwyaf ond sydd o'r pwys mwyaf i sicrhau Cymru lwyddiannus, fywiog.

Jocelyn Davies: Mae amryw o gyfeiriadau yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor at yr angen i ddiwallu gofynion addysg a hyfforddiant pobl ag anawsterau dysgu ac anghenion arbennig. Fodd bynnag, tybed pa mor agos yr ydym at y realiti hwnnw. Mae datganiadau o anghenion arbennig, y mae rhieni ar hyd a lled Cymru'n ymladd i'w cael i blant ag anawsterau dysgu, yn sicrhau bod hawl statudol gan blant a gofrestrir mewn ysgolion i gael diwallu eu hanghenion, pa bynnag bynciau neu gyrsiau a ddilynant. Nid yw hynny'n wir mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach. Oherwydd y pwysau ar adnoddau a staff, ni all colegau addysg bellach ond cynnig darpariaeth addysgol arbennig ar gyfer nifer gyfyngedig o bynciau.

Daw'r gefnogaeth a gynigir gan ddatganiadau o anghenion arbennig i ben i rai sydd wedi gadael yr ysgol, ac ni allwn gymryd arnom ein bod yn mynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol os methwn â chynnwys y 20 y cant ohonom sydd ag anghenion arbennig. Mae dros hanner poblogaeth ein carchardai'n anllhythrennog, felly mae'r budd y gellid ei gael drwy ymdrin â'r broblem hon yn enfawr. Nid yw cael rampiau concriid at y drysau'n ddigon. Gwn fod llawer o waith da'n digwydd ar hyn, ond mae'n dal i fod yn fater o hap a damwain i ryw raddau. Tybed pa gynlluniau sydd gan yr Ysgrifennydd i wella'r ddarpariaeth anghenion arbennig a pha sicrwydd y gallwn ei roi y bydd ein rhwymedigaeth statudol i drin pobl yn gyfartal yn cael ei chyflawni?

Mae dau fater arall sydd yn codi o'r ailstrwythuro arfaethedig yn peri pryder i mi. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â rheoli a'r adroddiad damniol gan y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig ar Goleg Gwent, lle'r aeth

epic proportions went undetected for a long time by its governing body, its auditors, the Welsh Office and the funding council. It is vital, as colleges become accountable to a far larger funding body, that the lines of accountability are not weakened. Past mistakes and management failures must not be repeated. The shadow council must give close attention to this issue when it is established in the summer.

My other point touches on the Government's recent document, 'A Better Wales', in which there is no reference to how the Government intends to improve conditions for staff in further education colleges. That must be a priority, as the unions in the FE sector continue to report that disillusionment and job insecurity is a constant source of worry for lecturers. The report repeats that a culture of lifelong learning needs to be established, but in many institutions only half the staff have long-term contracts. While rhetoric about the creation of a learning country keeps appearing, the job insecurity of those we expect to do the teaching worsens. What will be done to improve staff morale?

The new structure will, I hope, be judged on the results that it achieves—which will hopefully include catering for those with disadvantages, improving staff conditions and ensuring that colleges are not mismanaged—and not just on the qualifications that are obtained.

Val Feld: I join all those who have welcomed these proposals and the broad-based consultation that has taken place. It seems that this is a process—I am sorry to say the words 'this is a process not an event'—but it certainly is a process and a debate that will continue. It is important to remember that one of the early actions that Peter Hain took when Labour came into power was to consider how to tackle the problems of division and competition in our post-16 education and training system.

I am conscious that the training and enterprise councils were very much Conservative ideas and were part of the culture of bringing competition and business

camreoli dybryd ymlaen am gyfnod hir heb ei ddarganfod gan ei gorff llywodraethol, ei archwilwyr, y Swyddfa Gymreig a'r cyngor cyllido. Mae'n holl bwysig, wrth i gynghorau ddod yn atebol i gorff cyllido llawer mwy, na wanheir y llinellau atebolrwydd. Rhaid sicrhau na fydd camgymeriadau a methiannau rheoli'r gorffennol yn ailddigwydd. Rhaid i'r cyngor cysgodol roi sylw manwl i'r mater hwn pan sefydlir ef yn yr haf.

Mae'r pwynt arall sydd gennyf yn cyffwrdd â dogfen ddiweddar y Llywodraeth, 'Gwell Cymru', lle nad oes cyfeiriad at y modd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu gwella'r amodau i staff mewn colegau addysg bellach. Rhaid i hynny fod yn flaenoriaeth, gan fod yr undebau yn y sector addysg bellach yn dal i adrodd bod dadrithiad ac ansicrwydd swyddi yn achos pryder parhaus i ddarlithwyr. Mae'r adroddiad yn ailddatgan bod angen sefydlu diwylliant o ddysgu gydol oes, ond mewn llawer o sefydliadau dim ond hanner y staff sydd â chontractau tymor hir. Tra bo'r rhethreg am greu gwlad sydd yn dysgu yn dal i ymddangos, mae ansicrwydd swyddi'r rhai y disgwyliwn iddynt gyflawni'r dysgu yn gwaethgu. Beth a wneir i godi morâl y staff?

Caiff y strwythur newydd ei farnu, gobeithiaf, yn ôl ei ganlyniadau—a fydd, gobeithiaf, yn cynnwys darpariaeth ar gyfer rhai ag anfanteision, gwella amodau staff a sicrhau na chamreolir colegau—ac nid yn ôl y cymwysterau a enillir yn unig.

Val Feld: Ymunaf â phawb a groesawodd y cynigion hyn a'r ymgynghori eang a ddigwyddodd. Ymddengys fod hyn yn broses—mae'n ddrwg gennyf yngan y geiriau 'proses yw hon ac nid digwyddiad'—ond proses ydyw, yn sicr, a dadl a fydd yn parhau. Mae'n bwysig cofio mai un o'r camau cyntaf a gymerodd Peter Hain pan ddaeth Llafur i rym oedd ystyried sut i ymdrin â phroblemau ymrannu a chystadlu yn ein system addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter yn syniadau Ceidwadol i raddau helaeth a'u bod yn rhan o'r diwylliant o ddod â chystadlu a phobl busnes i

people into the development of education and training. That was very much a part of the Conservative agenda and was linked to taking further education colleges—and many of our Welsh higher education institutions—out of democratic control.

It has been a difficult time for those who run our TECs. Many are people that I have worked with in different capacities and who have struggled to find a role. However, I do not believe that there is, or can be, or could have been a role for them in Wales, where we place great value on education. The Labour movement was firmly built on the principles of access to education and education accessible to all as a route out of poverty and inequality.

I am pleased that we have returned to that agenda and that there is such widespread support across the different parties in the Assembly for the way forward. This is about bringing accountability and responsiveness back into the education system. I take Jonathan's point about the number of quangos being burned. It may be that the embers are burning rather low. However, this is an important part of that process. We will take it forward as there is further consultation and participation as regards how this framework is put into place. It is particularly important from my perspective and that of the Economic Development Committee—you have already heard from Phil on this issue—that this framework and the programme to roll out education and training is central in our national economic development strategy. That recognises the fundamental importance of education and training in terms of high level skills, vocational skills, lifelong learning and the early stages and routes into education, to our economic development strategy. It is also important to our Objective 1 and 3 programmes and a range of other programmes and targets.

I will address three issues, two of which have been dealt with before: the role of business and the involvement of the trade unions. The third is the funding formula. On the role of business, I am pleased that it appears that the parties are not going down the line proposed by Alun Cairns. There has been a great deal

ddatblygu addysg a hyfforddiant. Yr oedd hynny'n rhan o'r agenda Geidwadol i raddau helaeth ac yr oedd yn gysylltiedig â chymryd colegau addysg bellach—a llawer o'n sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru—oddi wrth reolaeth ddemocrataidd.

Bu'n gyfnod anodd i'r rhai sydd yn rhedeg ein cynghorau hyfforddi a menter. Mae llawer ohonynt yn rhai y bûm yn gweithio â hwy mewn gwahanol swyddogaethau ac a frwydrodd i sicrhau rôl. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf fod rôl iddynt, nac y gallai fod nac y gallasai fod, yng Nghymru, lle y gwelwn werth mawr mewn addysg. Codwyd y mudiad Llafur yn gadarn ar egwyddorion mynediad i addysg ac addysg sydd ar gael i bawb fel ffordd allan o dlodi ac anghydraddoldeb.

Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi dychwelyd at yr agenda honno a bod cefnogaeth mor eang ar draws y gwahanol bleidiau yn y Cynulliad i'r ffordd ymlaen. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â dod ag atebolrwydd ac ymatebolrwydd yn ôl i'r system addysg. Cymeraf bwynt Jonathan ynghylch nifer y cwangos a losgir. Efallai fod y tân yn llosgi'n isel. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn rhan bwysig o'r broses honno. Awn ymlaen â hyn wrth i ymgynghori a chyfranogi pellach ddigwydd ynghylch y modd y sefydlir y fframwaith hwn. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig o'm safbwynt i a'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd—clywsoch eisoes gan Phil ar y mater hwn—fod y fframwaith hwn a'r rhaglen i ymestyn addysg a hyfforddiant yn ganolog yn ein strategaeth ddatblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Mae hynny'n cydnabod pwysigrwydd sylfaenol addysg a hyfforddiant o ran medrau lefel uchel, medrau galwedigaethol, dysgu gydol oes a'r cyfnodau cynnar a llwybrau at addysg, i'n strategaeth ddatblygu economaidd. Mae hefyd yn bwysig i'n rhaglenni Amcan 1 a 3 ac amrediad o raglenni a thargedau eraill.

Yr wyf am ymdrin â thri mater y trafodwyd dau ohonynt o'r blaen: rôl busnes a rhan yr undebau llafur. Y trydydd yw'r fformwla ariannu. Ynghylch rôl busnes, yr wyf yn falch ei bod yn ymddangos nad yw'r pleidiau'n dilyn y ffordd a gynigiwyd gan Alun Cairns. Bu llawer iawn o lobio er mwyn

of lobbying to try to lock us into a formula that could result in business people being representatives on regional committees or on the council. That is not the kind of co-operation and collaboration that we need. There are many in the business community who have worked in the public, private or voluntary sectors and have a range of expertise and experience. One legacy of the TECs is the notion of civic entrepreneurs, people who have worked across the different sectors. We can and should draw those people into membership of the regional committees and the national council. However, we need to think carefully about the range of skills and experience we need to deliver what is so vital on the ground.

We are right not to get locked into a formula. We have such a formula for structural funds to create balance. However, in this area a formula that requires us to have so many public sector members and so many private sector members would lock us into a notion of 'them' and 'us' and suggest that we do not have common ground. It is important that as we address the skills needs in our businesses now and in the future, we also look critically at the skills needs in the public sector, including the health service and education. We desperately need to look at up-skilling people so that they can deliver public services and develop the enterprise we need in those services.

Linked to that is the involvement of the trade unions. I endorse what several people have said about the importance of the trade unions being involved in this process. I hope that we will ensure that they are represented and engaged in this programme as it rolls out. I endorse Alun Pugh's remarks, as well as Elin's, about the poor conditions that exist for part-time lecturers in so many of our further education colleges—Jenny spoke about this as well. If we are to deliver quality education that achieves real results, we must look after those who deliver it. I see at quite close quarters the experience of people in that sector. They do not know from one term to the next whether they have a contract, they

ceisio ein cau mewn fformwla a allai arwain at wneud pobl fusnes yn gynrychiolwyr ar bwyllgorau rhanbarthol neu ar y cyngor. Nid yw hynny y math o gydweithio a chydweithredu sydd eu hangen arnom. Mae nifer yn y gymuned fusnes a weithiodd yn y sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol ac sydd ag amrediad o arbenigedd a phrofiad. Un peth a etifeddwyd oddi wrth y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter yw'r syniad o entrepreneuriaid dinesig, rhai a weithiodd ar draws y gwahanol sectorau. Gallwn a dylem ddenu'r bobl hynny i fod yn aelodau o'r pwyllgorau rhanbarthol a'r cyngor cenedlaethol. Fodd bynnag, dylem feddwl yn ofalus ynghylch yr amrediad o fedrau a phrofiad y mae arnom eu hangen er mwyn cyflenwi'r hyn sydd mor hanfodol ar lawr gwlad.

Mae'n iawn inni beidio â chael ein cau mewn fformwla. Mae gennym fformwla o'r fath ar gyfer cronfeydd strwythurol er mwyn cael cydbwysedd. Fodd bynnag, yn y maes hwn byddai fformwla sydd yn gofyn inni gael hyn a hyn o aelodau o'r sector cyhoeddus a hyn a hyn o'r sector preifat yn ein gorfodi i dderbyn y syniad o 'nhw' a 'ni' ac yn awgrymu nad oes gennym dir cyffredin. Mae'n bwysig ein bod, wrth ymdrin â'r anghenion medrau yn ein busnesau yn awr ac yn y dyfodol, yn edrych yn feirniadol ar yr anghenion medrau yn y sector cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys y gwasanaeth iechyd ac addysg. Mae angen dybryd inni ystyried uwchraddio medrau pobl fel y gallant gyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a datblygu'r mentergarwch y mae arnom ei hangen yn y gwasanaethau hynny.

Yn gysylltiedig â hynny y mae rhan yr undebau llafur. Ategap yr hyn a ddywedodd nifer o bobl am bwysigrwydd cynnwys yr undebau llafur yn y broses hon. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn sicrhau eu bod wedi eu cynrychioli a'u cynnwys yn y rhaglen hon wrth iddi gael ei gweithredu. Ategap sylwadau Alun Pugh, yn ogystal â rhai Elin, am yr amodau gwael a geir ar gyfer darlithwyr rhan-amser mewn cynifer o'n colegau addysg bellach—siaradodd Jenny am hynny hefyd. Os ydym i gyflenwi addysg o ansawdd da sydd yn sicrhau canlyniadau gwirioneddol, rhaid inni ofalu am y rhai sydd yn ei chyflenwi. Gwelaf brofiad pobl yn y sector hwnnw yn eithaf agos. Ni wyddant o

have no time to prepare their lectures and many receive no support, induction or training to integrate them and give them a sense of where they fit in the bigger picture and in the colleges' education programmes. I hope to see that as an important part of this process.

4:29 p.m.

Finally, I am pleased that we will look at skills and at how funding formulas work because another Tory legacy that holds us back is the strict attachment to output-related funding. There is a place for output-related funding but, at grassroots level, it prevents us from taking education and training to the people who need it and from delivering the great tradition of community education that we have in Wales.

Last week, I visited a group of Bangladeshi women on an English as a second language course in my constituency. Their tutor was struggling to keep the course going because of the requirement that the students should produce written diaries and portfolios. The majority of the women were not literate in their first language, let alone in English. So there are times when output-related funding formulas severely restrict the work that we can do at the grassroots level, which affects how we engage people across Wales and our lifelong learning agenda. I hope that that can be part of how we take forward the consideration of the programmes.

I will endorse the point made about stability in this sector once the new framework is set up. The employees in the work-based and the work-related training sector must feel almost as if they are on the Circle Line given the amount of changes in those sectors. That makes it difficult for them to gain a sense of where they are working and to learn lessons about what does and does not work well so that they can build the skills of our people.

un tymor i'r nesaf a fydd ganddynt contract, nid oes ganddynt amser i baratoi eu darlithoedd a cheir llawer nad ydynt yn derbyn unrhyw gefnogaeth, cyflwyniad neu hyfforddiant i'w hintegreiddio a rhoi iddynt ymdeimlad o'u lle yn y darlun ehangach ac yn rhaglenni addysg y colegau. Gobeithiaf weld hynny'n rhan bwysig o'r broses hon.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn falch y byddwn yn edrych ar fedrau a sut y bydd fformwlâu ariannu'n gweithio oherwydd un peth arall a etifeddwyd oddi wrth y Toriaid sydd yn ein dal yn ôl yw'r cysylltiad caeth ag ariannu sydd yn gysylltiedig ag allbynnau. Mae lle i ariannu sydd yn gysylltiedig ag allbynnau ond, ar y lefel fwyaf lleol, mae'n ein rhwystro rhag mynd ag addysg a hyfforddiant at y bobl y mae arnynt eu hangen a rhag cyflawni'r traddodiad mawr o addysg gymunedol sydd gennym yng Nghymru.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, ymwelais â grŵp o fenywod o Fangladesh oedd ar gwrs dysgu'r Saesneg fel ail iaith yn fy etholaeth. Yr oedd eu tiwtor yn brwydro i gadw'r cwrs i fynd oherwydd y gofyniad i'r myfyrwyr lunio dyddiaduron a phortffolios ysgrifenedig. Nid oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r benywod yn llythrennog yn eu hiaith gyntaf, heb sôn am yn y Saesneg. Felly mae adegau pan yw fformwlâu ariannu sydd yn gysylltiedig ag allbynnau'n cyfyngu'n ddifrifol ar y gwaith y gallwn ei wneud ar y lefel fwyaf lleol, sydd yn effeithio ar y modd yr ydym yn cynnwys pobl ledled Cymru a'n hagenda dysgu gydol oes. Gobeithiaf y gall hynny fod yn rhan o'r modd y ydym yn datblygu ystyriaeth o'r rhaglenni.

Ategaf y pwynt a wnaethpwyd am sefydlogrwydd yn y sector hwn ar ôl sefydlu'r fframwaith newydd. Rhaid bod y gweithwyr yn y sector hyfforddiant yn y gwaith a chysylltiedig â gwaith yn teimlo bron fel pe baent ar y *Circle Line* yng ngolwg y nifer o newidiadau yn y sectorau hynny. Mae hynny'n ei gwneud yn anodd iddynt feithrin ymdeimlad o'r lle y maent yn gweithio ynddo a dysgu gwersi am yr hyn sydd yn gweithio'n dda a'r hyn nad yw fel y gallant ddatblygu medrau ein pobl.

Karen Sinclair: I welcome the report and congratulate the Committee on its work. It is so exciting. As we all know, partnership is the only way forward to ensure that young people are offered impartial advice when they make these decisions, which will impact heavily on their lives. I raise a point on which I would like clarification from the Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training today, if possible, because it would allay many fears. This reiterates Elin's point. Can he assure us that TUPE regulations will apply to TEC staff who transfer? Tom and I have corresponded about this and it would reassure people were that issue discussed today and an assurance given that consultation would take place with unions on the transfer of staff and their terms and conditions.

Richard Edwards: I welcome the education and training action plan for Wales and the Committee's report and how it focuses the debate on post-16 education in Wales on educational priorities, not on the values of the market place and wasteful competition. The importance of education and educational values in skilling people, unlocking creativity and in empowering all members of society cannot be overestimated when tackling social inclusion and increasing economic prosperity. I welcome the Committee's recognition of the importance of flexible provision. Society is changing at lightning speed and educational provision must reflect that. The Committee has obviously thought long and hard about the need for flexibility and about the best framework for achieving a coherent and seamless delivery in the post-16 sector. The Committee believes that the option B model for the regional tier best meets the local needs, with a minimal administrative burden. I would welcome more information on how many staff will be employed at a regional level and what the exact role of the regional bodies will be. I also echo a point made by Karen Sinclair. There must be proper dialogue with the people most affected by the changes, especially the current employees of the TECs. Their employment rights must be

Karen Sinclair: Croesawaf yr adroddiad a llongyfarchaf y Pwyllgor ar ei waith. Mae mor gyffrous. Fel y gŵyr pawb ohonom, partneriaeth yw'r unig ffordd ymlaen er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn cael cynnig cyngor diduedd pan ydynt yn gwneud y penderfyniadau hyn a fydd yn effeithio'n fawr ar eu bywydau. Codaf bwynt yr hoffwn gael eglurhad arno gan yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 heddiw, os oes modd, oherwydd byddai hynny'n tawelu llawer o ofnau. Mae hyn yn ailadrodd pwynt Elin. A oes modd iddo roi sicrwydd inni y bydd y Rheoliadau Trosglwyddo Ymgymeriadau (Gwarchod Cyflogaeth) yn berthnasol i staff y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter sydd yn trosglwyddo? Bu Tom a minnau'n gohebu ar y mater hwn a byddai'n rhoi tawelwch meddwl i bobl pe gellid trafod y mater hwnnw heddiw ac y rhoddid sicrwydd y byddai ymgynghoriad â'r undebau ynghylch trosglwyddo staff a'u telerau ac amodau.

Richard Edwards: Croesawaf y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant i Gymru ac adroddiad y Pwyllgor a'r modd y mae'n canolbwyntio sylw'r ddadl ar addysg ôl-16 yng Nghymru ar flaenoriaethau addysgol, nid ar werthoedd y farchnad a chystadlu gwastraffus. Ni ellir gorbrisio pwysigrwydd addysg a gwerthoedd addysgol wrth ddysgu medrau i bobl, datgelu gallu creadigol a galluogi holl aelodau cymdeithas wrth fynd i'r afael â chynhwysiant cymdeithasol a chynyddu ffyniant economaidd. Croesawaf gydnabyddiaeth y Pwyllgor o bwysigrwydd darpariaeth hyblyg. Mae cymdeithas yn newid fel y gwynt a rhaid i'r ddarpariaeth addysgol adlewyrchu hynny. Mae'n amlwg bod y Pwyllgor wedi meddwl yn hir ac yn galed am yr angen am hyblygrwydd ac am y fframwaith gorau er mwyn sicrhau darpariaeth gydlynol a di-fwlch yn y sector ôl-16. Mae'r Pwyllgor o'r farn mai model dewis B ar gyfer yr haen ranbarthol sydd yn ateb anghenion lleol orau, gyda'r lleiaf posibl o faich gweinyddol. Byddwn yn falch o gael mwy o wybodaeth am faint o staff a gyflogir ar lefel ranbarthol a beth fydd union rôl y cyrff ranbarthol. Ategaf hefyd bwynt a wnaethpwyd gan Karen Sinclair. Rhaid cael deialog iawn â'r bobl yr effeithir arnynt fwyaf gan y newidiadau, yn enwedig gweithwyr presennol y cynghorau hyfforddi a

protected.

Moving on to ground that has been covered by Alun Pugh, Elin Jones, Jenny Randerson and Val Feld in particular, the devil is in the detail and serious consideration needs to be given to the proposed funding methodology for post-16 education. The Assembly must not abrogate its responsibility. We are told that a legacy of the competitive approach is a so-called more efficient FE sector. That claim is made constantly. The reality—as most of us know—is a sector characterised by differential funding and worsening pay and employment conditions. If we recognise that the FE sector plays the most vital role in providing lifelong future skills, then we must respect and remunerate all providers in the post-16 sector accordingly. There has to be fairness and equity and a level playing field. A world-class post-16 education system demands staff of the highest quality. However, what masquerades as efficiency in the FE sector is serious under-funding and unprecedented attacks on the people who work in FE institutions, leaving differential levels of pay and employment conditions.

Teachers in schools have national pay scales which are honoured, job security and proper financial recognition for the work that they do—certainly compared to the many teachers in post-16 education, who are far less fortunate. If people do the same job, be that in a sixth form college or in FE college, then there should be parity. We cannot claim to have a coherent, unified approach if parity does not exist. It is not good enough to say that employment contracts are matters for individual employers. That is a cop out. I spoke earlier about the importance of flexibility. Flexibility must go hand in hand with stability in the post-16 sector. They need not be mutually exclusive.

The Berlin Wall in post-16 education has come down. The challenge now is for the

menter. Rhaid gwarchod eu hawliau cyflogaeth.

Gan symud i faes a drafodwyd gan Alun Pugh, Elin Jones, Jenny Randerson a Val Feld yn enwedig, mae'r manylion yn dyngedfennol a rhaid rhoi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i'r fethodoleg ariannu arfaethedig ar gyfer addysg ôl-16. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad beidio ag ymrwthod â'i gyfrifoldeb. Dywedir wrthym mai un peth a etifeddwyd o'r dull cystadleuol yw'r hyn a elwir yn sector addysg bellach mwy effeithlon. Honnir hynny'n gyson. Y realiti yw—fel y gŵyr y rhan fwyaf ohonom—sector a nodweddir gan ariannu gwahaniaethol a thâl ac amodau cyflogaeth sydd yn gwaethygu. Os cydnabyddwn mai'r sector addysg bellach sydd yn chwarae'r rôl fwyaf hanfodol wrth ddarparu medrau gydol oes yn y dyfodol, rhaid inni barchu a thalu'r holl ddarparwyr yn y sector ôl-16 yn unol â hynny. Rhaid cael tegwch a chyfiawnder a chae chwarae gwastad. Mae system addysg ôl-16 sydd ymhlith y gorau yn y byd yn gofyn am staff o'r ansawdd gorau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r hyn sydd yn ffugio bod yn effeithlonrwydd yn y sector addysg bellach yn danariannu difrifol ac yn ymosodiadau na fu eu bath o'r blaen ar y bobl sydd yn gweithio mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach, gan adael lefelau gwahaniaethol o dâl ac amodau cyflogaeth.

Mae gan athrawon mewn ysgolion raddfeydd cyflog cenedlaethol a gaiff eu parchu, diogelwch swyddi a chydabyddiaeth ariannol briodol am y gwaith a wnânt—yn sicr o'u cymharu â'r nifer fawr o athrawon mewn addysg ôl-16, sydd yn llawer llai ffodus. Os yw pobl yn cyflawni'r un gwaith, boed hynny mewn coleg chweched dosbarth neu mewn coleg addysg bellach, dylai fod cydraddoldeb rhyngddynt. Ni allwn honni bod dull gweithredu cydlynol, unedig os nad oes cydraddoldeb. Nid yw'n ddigon da dweud bod contractau cyflogaeth yn faterion i gyflogwyr unigol. Esgus dros wneud dim yw hynny. Siaradas yn gynharach am bwysigrwydd hyblygrwydd. Rhaid i hyblygrwydd fynd law yn llaw â sefydlogrwydd yn y sector ôl-16. Gellir cael y naill gyda'r llall.

Dymchwelwyd y Mur Berlin yn addysg ôl-16. Yr her bellach yw i'r cyrff addysg a

new education and training bodies and the Assembly, as their political master, to usher in an era of quality and equity for all.

John Griffiths: As a member of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee, I add my voice to those who have commended how the Committee has dealt with these matters. It has been an exercise in open mindedness and in having a constructive approach from Committee members. There was an interesting dynamic as the Committee meetings proceeded and the policy agenda developed and changed. It is a credit to the Committee that it developed in that way. I commend Cynog's excellent chairing of the Committee. I also commend Tom Middlehurst's contribution as the Assembly Secretary on the Committee. It is right to say, as many have said, that this is a constructive way forward for Wales. The ETAG agenda was well formulated and I hope that it will be well implemented also. As a Committee and as an Assembly as a whole, together with the Cabinet, we will be watching keenly to see that that implementation takes place—as we all hope it will—to greatly improve publicly funded post-16 education and training in Wales.

We know that much improvement is needed and many people have mentioned this. We need greater rationality and coherence. We must end the wasteful and damaging competition of recent times. I hope and expect that all of this will be keenly watched over by the Assembly. I will turn briefly to adult education, which keenly interests me, due to my background. I left school without taking any exams and later returned to education in a local further education college. I then went on to university and a worthwhile career before coming to the Assembly. I hope that, as an Assembly Member, my career will continue to be worthwhile. I would like to see the opportunity that was afforded to me through further education extended to people throughout Wales. We all know that there are communities that do not benefit from current educational, economic and general opportunities in Wales. Social inclusion is one of our great cross-cutting themes in the Assembly, and rightly so. It obviously has an important role to play in this agenda of

hyfforddiant newydd a'r Cynulliad, fel eu meistr gwleidyddol, hebrwng i mewn cyfnod o ansawdd da a chydraddoldeb i bawb.

John Griffiths: Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, ategaf eiriau'r rhai a gymeradwyodd y modd yr ymdriniodd y Pwyllgor â'r materion hyn. Bu'n ymarferiad ar arfer meddwl agored ac o gael ymagwedd adeiladol ar ran aelodau'r Pwyllgor. Yr oedd dynamig diddorol wrth i gyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor fynd rhagddo ac wrth i'r agenda bolisi ddatblygu a newid. Mae'n glod i'r Pwyllgor ei fod wedi datblygu felly. Cymeradwyaf y modd rhagorol y cadeiriodd Cynog y Pwyllgor. Cymeradwyaf hefyd gyfraniad Tom Middlehurst fel yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad oedd yn eistedd ar y Pwyllgor. Mae'n gywir dweud, fel y dywedodd llawer, fod hyn yn ffordd adeiladol ymlaen i Gymru. Lluniwyd agenda'r Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant yn dda a gobeithiaf y caiff ei gweithredu'n dda hefyd. Fel Pwyllgor ac fel Cynulliad cyfan, ynghyd â'r Cabinet, byddwn yn gwylio'n graff i sicrhau y ceir gweithredu—fel yr ydym oll yn gobeithio—er mwyn cael gwelliant mawr mewn addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 a noddir gan y cyhoedd yng Nghymru.

Gwyddom fod angen llawer o wella a soniodd llawer o bobl am hynny. Mae arnom angen mwy o resymoldeb a chydlynad. Mae'n rhaid inni roi diwedd ar gystadlu gwastraffus a niweidiol y cyfnod diweddar. Gobeithiaf a disgwyliaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn cadw gwyliadwriaeth graff ar hyn. Trof yn fyr at addysg oedolion, y mae gennyf ddiddordeb brwd ynddi, oherwydd fy nghefnidir. Gadewais yr ysgol heb sefyll unrhyw arholiadau a dychwelyd i addysg yn ddiweddarach mewn coleg addysg bellach lleol. Euthum ymlaen wedyn i brifysgol a gyrfa fuddiol cyn dod i'r Cynulliad. Gobeithiaf y bydd fy hgnyrfa, fel Aelod Cynulliad, yn parhau i fod yn fuddiol. Hoffwn weld ymestyn y cyfle a gefais i drwy addysg bellach i bobl ledled Cymru. Gwyddom oll fod cymunedau nad ydynt yn elwa o'r cyfleoedd addysgol, economaidd a chyffredinol a geir yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Cynhwysiant cymdeithasol yw un o'n pynciau trawsbynciol mawr yn y Cynulliad, a hynny'n briodol. Mae'n amlwg bod iddo rôl

allowing the communities of Wales, including the disadvantaged ones, such as the council estates of Newport East that I represent, to benefit from the opportunities available.

4:39 p.m.

Adult education and the opportunities provided by the voluntary sector as well as further and higher education colleges and universities, also have an important role. It is true to say, as others have mentioned, that there are problems with the funding formulae for some of these providers because the formula that is applicable in a particular case requires a course to have a certain output, formality and structure that often do not exist. We must show greater imagination in how we approach these matters. I hope that CETW will set the kind of example that is required and I will be taking an interest in that. I am a member of the Workers Educational Association and know that it, along with other organisations and trade unions will be taking a keen interest in how the agenda develops. We will return to that as a Committee.

We have a great tradition of self-help and self-education in Wales, exemplified by the libraries funded by miners. I would like that important and meaningful tradition built upon. The Assembly could tap into that in taking this agenda forward. If we can empower the most disadvantaged communities, the benefits will transform Wales. That is a large part of the Assembly's agenda and this issue is relevant to that. It is relevant to social inclusion in terms of developing people and ensuring their fulfilment. That would be beneficial in terms of reducing crime and regenerating communities. It would also bring economic benefits by bringing people back into the workforce and would improve skills, training and employability, returning people to the fold, as it were, in terms of bringing them back into mainstream society. Through CETW, I would like us to show imagination in terms of how the funding mechanism works. It should be imagination across the scale, allowing the current providers, which

bwysig i'w chwarae yn yr agenda hon, sef sicrhau y caiff cymunedau Cymru, gan gynnwys y rhai difreintiedig, fel yr ystadau cyngor yn Nwyrain Casnewydd a gynrychiolaf, elwa o'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael.

Mae rôl bwysig hefyd i addysg oedolion a'r cyfleoedd a ddarperir gan y sector gwirfoddol yn ogystal â'r colegau a phrifysgolion addysg bellach ac uwch. Gwir yw dweud, fel y soniodd eraill, fod problemau gyda'r fformwlâu ariannu ar gyfer rhai o'r darparwyr hyn am fod y fformwla sydd yn berthnasol mewn achos penodol yn mynnu allbwn, ffurfioleb a strwythur penodol mewn cwrs nad ydynt yn bod yn aml. Rhaid inni fod yn fwy dyfeisgar yn y modd yr ymdriniwn â'r materion hyn. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru'n rhoi'r math o esiampl y mae ei hangen a byddaf yn ymddiddori yn hynny. Yr wyf yn aelod o Fudiad Addysg y Gweithwyr a gwn ei fod ef, ynghyd â chyrff eraill a'r undebau llafur yn ymddiddori'n frwd yn y modd y bydd yr agenda'n datblygu. Dychwelwn at hynny fel Pwyllgor.

Mae gennym draddodiad mawr o hunangymorth a hunanaddysgu yng Ngymru, y gwelir enghreifftiau ohono yn y llyfrgelloedd a ariannwyd gan y glowyr. Hoffwn inni datblygu ar y traddodiad pwysig ac ystyrlon hwnnw. Gallai'r Cynulliad ddefnyddio hynny wrth fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda hon. Os gallwn alluogi'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig, bydd y manteision yn trawsffurfio Cymru. Mae hynny'n rhan bwysig o agenda'r Cynulliad ac y mae'r mater hwn yn berthnasol i hynny. Mae'n berthnasol i gynhwysiant cymdeithasol o ran datblygu pobl a sicrhau eu cyflawniad. Byddai hynny'n fanteisiol o ran lleihau troseddu ac adfywio cymunedau. Deuai hefyd â manteision economaidd drwy ddod â phobl yn ôl i'r gweithlu a gwella medrau, hyfforddiant a chyflogadwyedd, yn dod â phobl yn ôl i'r gorlan, fel petai, o ran dod â hwy'n ôl i brif ffrwd y gymdeithas. Hoffwn inni amlygu dychymyg, drwy'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru, o ran y modd y bydd y mecanwaith

are eager and willing to provide the necessary assistance, to develop meaningful schemes and to see them implemented. As a member of the Committee, I will be keen to ensure that that happens.

Gareth Jones: Hoffwn longyfarch y Pwyllgor ar ei waith da mewn maes anodd, lle bu ymdrechion yn y gorffennol yn fethiant. Yr wyf yn sicr yr arweinia cadeiryddiaeth y Pwyllgor a chyfraniad pob aelod at lwyddiant y tro hwn. O ddarllen yr adroddiad, yr wyf yn falch o weld yr ymgynghori manwl sydd yn amlwg wedi digwydd. Mae'r adroddiad a'r argymhellion yn dangos y ffordd ymlaen. Mae angen symud ymlaen o'n sefyllfa bresennol. Fel y clywsom gan eraill, sefyllfa o gystadleuaeth rhwng sefydliadau yw hi. Gwneir defnydd aneffeithlon o adnoddau a chamleolir unigolion ar gyrsiau anaddas. Dyna pam yr edrychaf ymlaen at weld corff annibynnol fel Gyrfaedd Cymru yn chwarae rhan arbennig yn y maes hwn. Mae'r sefyllfa neu gyfundrefn, yn arwain at arbenigo yn rhy gynnar o lawer gan fod diffyg ehangder i'r unigolyn yn y cwricwlwm. Mae'r system yn methu â phontio'r academiaidd a'r galwedigaethol. Yn bennaf, mae'n rhwystro busnes a diwydiant yng Nghymru rhag ychwanegu gwerth i'w gweithgareddau oherwydd prinder sgiliau priodol ymysg ein pobl ifanc. Mae'r adroddiad yn cyfeirio at yr holl bethau pwysig hyn ac yn dangos y ffordd ymlaen. Maent yn argymhellion gwerthfawr.

Ar y llaw arall, mae'n drist sylweddoli na fydd yr holl newidiadau ôl-16 yn yr arholiadau Safon Uwch ac atodol sydd yn dod i rym yn ein hysgolion a'n colegau o fis Medi yn ateb gofynion ETAG. Bydd yn rhaid ailedrych ar natur darpariaeth Safon Uwch ac atodol yn fuan yng ngoleuni'r argymhellion sydd yn cael eu trafod. Cyfeiriaf at hynny yn gryno y prynhawn yma.

Yr wyf yn falch bod yr argymhellion yn sicrhau y rhoir ystyriaeth deg i wledigrwydd a rôl bwysig y chweched dosbarth ac addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn ein hysgolion. Dyna pam y mae'r argymhellion ar dudalen 23 y cynllun gweithredu mor bwysig, lle y dywed y Pwyllgor y dylid sianelu cyllid ar gyfer

ariannu'n gweithio. Dylid cael dychymyg drwyddi draw, gan ganiatáu i'r darparwyr presennol sydd yn awyddus ac yn barod i ddarparu'r cymorth angenrheidiol, ddatblygu cynlluniau ystyrlon a gweld eu gweithredu. Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor, byddaf yn awyddus i sicrhau y digwydd hynny.

Gareth Jones: I congratulate the Committee on its good work in a difficult field, in which where past efforts failed. I am sure that the chairmanship of the Committee and the contributions of every member will lead to success this time. Having read the report, I am glad to see the detailed consultation that has obviously taken place. The report and recommendations show the way forward. We need to move on from the present situation. As we have heard from others, it is a situation of competition between institutions. Inefficient use is made of resources and individuals are wrongly placed on unsuitable courses. That is why I look forward to seeing an independent body like Careers Wales playing a specific role in this field. The situation or system leads to specialism far too early because of the lack of breadth for the individual in the curriculum. The system cannot bridge the academic and the vocational. Primarily, it prevents business and industry in Wales from adding value to their activities because of the lack of appropriate skills among our young people. The report refers to all these important things and shows the way forward. They are valuable recommendations.

On the other hand, it is sad to realise that all the post-16 changes in the A level and AS level exams that come into effect in our schools and colleges from September will not meet ETAG's requirements. There will be a need to reconsider the nature of the A and AS level provision in the light of the recommendations that are being discussed. I refer briefly to that this afternoon.

I am glad that the recommendations ensure that a fair consideration will be given to rurality and the important role of the sixth form and Welsh-medium education in our schools. That is why the recommendations on page 23 of the action plan are so important, where the Committee states that funds for

dosbarthiadau chwech drwy'r awdurdodau addysg lleol. Efallai fy mod yn fwy o optimist am hynny na'm cyfaill Jonathan Morgan.

sixth forms should be channelled through the local education authorities. Perhaps I am more of an optimist on that than my friend Jonathan Morgan.

Dau beth sydd dan sylw: y cyllid a'r cwricwlwm. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn rhoi pwyslais ar gyflwyno fformwla gyllido deg. Gofynna i'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad gomisiynu'r cyngor i gynnal astudiaeth fanwl o faterion megis darpariaeth mewn ardaloedd gwledig, addysg Gymraeg a'r effaith a gaiff y newidiadau mewn cyllid dosbarthiadau chwech ar ddarpariaeth addysg cyn 16 oed, yn arbennig mewn ysgolion llai mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Yr wyf yn falch bod dymuniad i'r astudiaeth honno gael ei chyflawni. Gobeithiaf y gwelwn y fformwla ddiwygiedig yn dod gerbron y Cynulliad fel y gallwn ei thrafod, oherwydd mae'r fformwla ei hun a sut yr ydych yn cyllido yn allweddol.

Two things are under consideration: the funding and the curriculum. The Committee places an emphasis on introducing a fair funding formula. It asks the Assembly Secretary to commission the council to hold a detailed study of matters such as the provision in rural areas, Welsh education and the effect that the changes in sixth form funding will have on the provision of pre-16 education, especially in smaller schools in rural areas. I am glad that there is a desire for that study to be undertaken. I hope that we will see the revised formula coming before the Assembly so that it may be discussed, because the formula itself and how you fund are vital.

Yr allwedd a'r prawf ar yr ailstrwythuro hwn fydd y cwricwlwm ac ansawdd profiadau dysgu'r unigolyn. Er na fu'r Pwyllgor yn trafod y cwricwlwm mewn manylder, mae wedi argymhell ei bod yn bwysig bwrw ymlaen yn erbyn cefndir a fyddai'n anelu at gyfannu addysg academiaidd a galwedigaethol cyn ac ar ôl 16 oed. Mae'r argymhelliad fod y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 yn ystyried y fagloraeth Gymreig fel cyfrwng i bontio'r academiaidd a'r galwedigaethol mewn fframwaith cymwysterau cyffredinol ôl-16 yn bwysig felly. Byddai'r cymhwyster hwnnw yn gwneud llawer i unioni'r cam a wneir ar hyn o bryd, lle rhoddir statws i Safonau Uwch yn unig. Ystyrir y cymwysterau eraill fel rhai atodol. Nid oes dim o'i le ar roi statws i Safonau Uwch, ond byddai'r fagloraeth yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd cyraeddiadau addysgol pob myfyriwr, pe baent yn academiaidd neu'n alwedigaethol, ac yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at dynnu'r unigolyn i mewn i'r broses o ddysgu gydol oes ac yn datrys rhai agweddau ar allgáu cymdeithasol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn symud ymlaen o ddifrif i ystyried y cymhwyster hwn. Mae'n allweddol i ddatblygiadau ôl-16 pellach.

The key and the test on this restructuring will be the curriculum and the quality of the individual's learning experiences. Although the Committee did not discuss the curriculum in detail, it has recommended that it is important to move forward against a background that aims to integrate academic and vocational education before and after 16 years of age. The recommendation that the Pre-16 Education Committee consider the Welsh baccalaureate as a means to bridge the academic and the vocational in a general post-16 qualification framework is therefore important. That qualification would do much to put right the present injustice, where status is only given to A levels. The other qualifications are considered to be supplementary. There is nothing wrong with giving status to A levels, but the baccalaureate would emphasise the importance of every student's educational attainments, whether academic or vocational, and would contribute substantially towards drawing the individual into the process of lifelong learning and solve some aspects of social exclusion. I hope that the Assembly will move forward earnestly to consider this qualification. It is crucial to further post-16 developments.

Mae un ystyriaeth fach ond pwysig ar ariannu'r fagloraeth: deallaf fod £7 miliwn ar gael yn y gronfa cymell partneriaeth.

There is one small but important consideration on funding the baccalaureate: I understand that £7 million is available in the

Byddwn yn croesawu arian o'r gronfa honno i ariannu cynllun peilot y fagloriaeth Gymreig. Mae amcangyfrif o ychydig dros £1 miliwn dros dair blynedd wedi'i nodi. Edrychwn ymlaen i weld hynny'n digwydd. Byddai ymgymryd â'r fagloriaeth hon yn creu partneriaeth agos yn ein sefydliadau.

partnership incentive fund. I would welcome money from that fund to fund the Welsh baccalaureate pilot scheme. An estimate of just over £1 million over three years has been noted. We look forward to see that happening. Undertaking this baccalaureate would create a close partnership in our institutions.

Rhaid inni beidio â meddwl bod popeth ar ddigwydd yma yng Nghaerdydd. Os sefydlir cyngor, apelïaf arnoch i edrych y tu allan i Gaerdydd. Os ydych eisiau lleoliad delfrydol, nid oes unman yn well nag etholaeth Conwy.

We must not think that everything will happen here in Cardiff. If a council is to be established, I appeal to you to look outside Cardiff. If you want an ideal location, there is nowhere better than the Conwy constituency.

4:49 p.m.

Tom Middlehurst: I thank every Assembly Member who contributed so fully to this important debate. I have listened carefully to the contribution from Cynog Dafis, in his role as Chair of the Subject Committee, and indeed to every other Member. There have been many constructive contributions, which take forward the proposals in the action plan and the recommendations in the Post-16 Education and Training Committee's report. I also join with other Committee Members in appreciating the Committee Secretariat's work. It dealt with this in an exemplary fashion. It was an enormous challenge for all of us, not least for the Committee Secretariat, and I commend it for its contribution to the Committee's work.

Tom Middlehurst: Diolchaf i bob Aelod Cynulliad a gyfrannodd mor llawn i'r ddadl bwysig hon. Gwrandewais yn astud ar gyfraniad Cynog Dafis, yn ei rôl fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Pwnc, ac yn wir ar bob Aelod arall. Bu llawer o gyfraniadau adeiladol, sydd yn datblygu'r cynigion yn y cynllun gweithredu a'r argymhellion yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16. Ymunaf hefyd ag aelodau eraill o'r Pwyllgor wrth ganmol gwaith Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Pwyllgor a drafododd hyn mewn modd rhagorol. Yr oedd yn her aruthrol i bob un ohonom, ac i Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Pwyllgor yn anad neb, a chanmolaf hi am ei chyfraniad i waith y Pwyllgor.

The current structures and systems are clearly confusing for learners and providers and make choice difficult in a bewildering maze of wasteful competition and bureaucracy. The system lacks coherence and encourages unhelpful rivalry between providers. That has prevented us from achieving better standards and responding to the changing needs of the labour market. That is in spite of the best efforts of those who work in the education and training sector.

Mae'n amlwg bod y strwythurau a'r systemau presennol yn peri dryswch i ddysgwyr a darparwyr ac yn ei gwneud yn anodd dewis oddi mewn i ddrysfa bensiyrddanol o gystadlu gwastraffus a biwrocratiaeth. Mae diffyg cydlynïad yn y system ac mae'n cymell ymgiprys di-fudd rhwng darparwyr. Mae hynny wedi'n rhwystro rhag cyflawni safonau gwell ac ymateb i anghenion newidiol y farchnad lafur. Mae hynny er gwaethaf ymdrechion gorau'r rhai sydd yn gweithio yn y sector addysg a hyfforddiant.

There is no doubt that the current arrangements let Wales down. Too many of our people are turned off learning. Too many of the courses available are poorly related to the skills needed to attain employment. Drop-out rates are too high, wasting resources and

Nid oes dwywaith bod y trefniadau presennol yn gwneud cam â Chymru. Mae gormod o'n pobl yn cael eu diflasu gan y syniad o ddysgu. Mae gormod o'r cyrsiau sydd ar gael heb gysylltiad digonol â'r medrau sydd yn angenrheidiol i gael gwaith. Mae'r cyfraddau

human potential. Levels of achievement are too variable and often too low. Quality standards are uneven. Too many employers are failing to invest in the skills of their workforce. There is no longer such a thing as a job for life. In the 1950s, 1960s and 1970s, youngsters could leave school with a minimum of qualifications and find a lasting job that paid well. That is no longer the case. There is a rapidly declining number of low-skill jobs and those unfortunate enough to have poor skills get locked in the low-skills trap. The key facts sustain this view. One in nine pupils leave school without any GCSEs. Over a third of a million of adults of working age have no qualifications at all. Over two-fifths of the working age population have low numeracy skills and one in six have low reading skills. This situation cannot continue. We must improve standards and raise achievement levels.

The outcomes of our ETAG work and the deliberation of the Committee address these issues. They present an innovative agenda to raise our performance to meet some challenging targets over the next four years. We must meet the challenge head on. The success of any reform must be measured by the outcomes. I therefore urge the Assembly to endorse the outcomes of targets set out in the action plan as proposed. Outcomes will not be solely quantitative, because our commitment to lifelong learning is not just about qualifications and preparing people for employment; it is also about enabling individuals to achieve their aspirations, engaging the disaffected and developing our community so that all our people can contribute to society and the economy. The opportunity is before us.

The current system for securing funding for post-16 education and training in Wales is complex. It involves many different providers, along with numerous agencies and organisations responsible for allocating funding. Broadly, local education authorities fund provision for school sixth forms and

gadael yn rhy uchel, gan olygu gwastraff o adnoddau a photensial dynol. Mae'r lefelau cyrhaeddiad yn rhy amrywiol ac yn rhy isel yn aml. Mae'r safonau ansawdd yn rhy anwastad. Mae gormod o gyflogwyr yn methu â buddsoddi ym medrau eu gweithlu. Bellach nid oes y fath beth â swydd am oes. Yn y 1950au, 1960au a'r 1970au, gallai pobl ifanc adael yr ysgol â nifer fach o gymwysterau a chael swydd barhaol oedd yn talu'n dda. Nid yw hynny'n wir bellach. Mae nifer y swyddi medrau isel yn disgyn yn gyflym ac mae'r rhai sydd yn ddigon anlwcus i fod â medrau gwael yn cael eu dal yn y fagl medrau isel. Mae ffeithiau allweddol yn ategu'r farn hon. Mae un ym mhob naw o ddisgyblion yn gadael yr ysgol heb unrhyw TGAU. Mae dros un ran o dair o filiwn o oedolion o oed gweithio heb unrhyw gymwysterau o gwbl. Mae gan dros ddwy ran o bump o'r boblogaeth o oed gweithio fedrau rhifogrwydd isel ac y mae gan un ym mhob chwech fedrau darllen isel. Ni all y sefyllfa hon barhau. Rhaid inni wella safonau a chodi lefelau cyrhaeddiad.

Mae canlyniadau gwaith y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant a thrafodaeth y Pwyllgor yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn. Maent yn cyflwyno agenda arloesol er mwyn codi ein perfformiad fel ei fod yn cyrraedd rhai targedau ymestynnol dros y pedair blynedd nesaf. Rhaid inni gwrdd â'r her wyneb yn wyneb. Rhaid mesur llwyddiant unrhyw ddiwygiad yn ôl y canlyniadau. Felly anogaf y Cynulliad i gadarnhau canlyniadau'r targedau a nodir yn y cynllun gweithredu fel y'u cynigir. Ni fydd y canlyniadau'n rhai meintiol yn unig, oherwydd mae ein hymrwymiad i ddysgu gydol oes yn ymwneud â mwy na chymwysterau a pharatoi pobl ar gyfer cyflogaeth; mae'n ymwneud hefyd â galluogi unigolion i gyflawni eu dyheadau, cynnwys y rhai a ddieithriwyd a datblygu ein cymuned fel y gall pawb gyfrannu i gymdeithas a'r economi. Mae'r cyfle o'n blaen.

Mae'r system gyfredol ar gyfer sicrhau ariannu i addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 yng Nghymru yn gymhleth. Mae'n cynnwys llawer o ddarparwyr gwahanol, ynghyd â'r nifer fawr o asiantaethau a chyrrff sydd yn gyfrifol am ddarparu arian. Yn fras, mae awdurdodau addysg lleol yn ariannu'r

adult community education, the Further Education Funding Council for Wales funds further education institutions, and training and enterprise councils fund work-based training, related programmes and other initiatives. The voluntary sector provision contributes further to this complicated, disjointed system, which is perplexing for students and employers alike.

Our social and economic structures require a coherent, integrated and progressive all-Wales post-16 education and training system. The action plan recommends that the Assembly establish a single organisation—the National Council for Education and Training for Wales—to be responsible for all post-16 learning in Wales, except higher education. The Cabinet and the Post-16 Education and Training Committee have endorsed that recommendation as the way forward. I support wholeheartedly the action plan's recognition of the need to break down the artificial divide between education and training. This principle, allied to partnership, underpins all the main recommendations in the action plan and the Committee's report.

The Learning and Skills Bill, which is currently before Parliament, will enable the Assembly to establish the new council, which will focus partnerships on customer needs, on collaboration rather than competition, and on cutting out wasteful bureaucracy. The Bill will also extend the remit of Estyn, the inspectorate service in Wales, to include all post-16 learning that is secured and funded by the National Council for Education and Training for Wales. That will help to ensure that CETW's annual budget of some £400 million is spent wisely and well, and in the interests of the learners it is expected to serve. Subject to enactment, the Bill will lay the foundations for all those involved in post-16 education and training to work in partnership, under the strategic aegis of this Assembly, to deliver and develop high quality education and training programmes for learning across the board. It will enable the new council to establish, maintain and sustain strong partnerships with stakeholders in the education and training world, and to

ddarpariaeth ar gyfer dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion ac addysg gymunedol i oedolion, mae Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru'n ariannu sefydliadau addysg bellach, ac mae'r cynghorau hyfforddi a menter yn ariannu hyfforddiant yn y gwaith, rhaglenni cysylltiedig a mentrau eraill. Mae darpariaeth y sector gwirfoddol yn cyfrannu ymhellach at y system ddigyswllt, gymhleth hon, sydd yn peri dryswch i fyfyrwyr a chyflogwyr fel ei gilydd.

Mae angen system addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 gydlynol, integredig a blaengar i Gymru gyfan ar gyfer ein strwythurau cymdeithasol ac economaidd. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu'n argymhell y dylai'r Cynulliad sefydlu un corff—Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru—i fod yn gyfrifol am yr holl ddysgu ôl-16 yng Nghymru, heblaw am addysg uwch. Mae'r Cabinet a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 wedi cadarnhau'r argymhelliad hwnnw fel y ffordd ymlaen. Cefnogaf yn llwyr gydnabyddiaeth y cynllun gweithredu o'r angen i chwalu'r rhaniad artiffisial rhwng addysg a hyfforddiant. Mae'r egwyddor hon, ynghyd â phartneriaeth, yn sylfaen i'r holl brif argymhellion yn y cynllun gweithredu ac yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor.

Bydd y Mesur Dysgu a Medrau, sydd gerbron y Senedd ar hyn o bryd, yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i sefydlu'r cyngor newydd fydd yn canolbwyntio sylw'r partneriaethau ar anghenion cwsmeriaid, ar gydweithredu yn hytrach na chystadlu, ac ar ddileu biwrocratiaeth wastraffus. Bydd y Mesur hefyd yn ymestyn cylch gwaith Estyn, y gwasanaeth arolygiaeth yng Nghymru, fel ei fod yn cynnwys yr holl ddysgu ôl-16 a gaiff ei sicrhau a'i ariannu gan y Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru. Bydd hynny'n gymorth i sicrhau bod cyllideb flynyddol y Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru o tua £400 miliwn yn cael ei wario'n ddoeth ac yn dda, ac er budd y dysgwyr y disgwylir iddo eu gwasanaethu. Os daw i rym, bydd y Mesur yn gosod y sylfeini fel y gall pawb sydd yn gysylltiedig ag addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 weithio mewn partneriaeth, o dan adain strategol y Cynulliad hwn, er mwyn cyflenwi a datblygu rhaglenni addysg a hyfforddiant o ansawdd uchel ar gyfer dysgu o bob math.

complement the Government's Welfare to Work agenda. Partnerships will be vital for the new council to meet the Assembly's priorities for post-16 learning. It will also be important for the council to recognise and consider the impact of its work on wider agendas for Wales such as increased social inclusion, a stronger economy and equality of opportunity.

The new structure of CETW will plan and manage its functions at a national, regional and local level. The council will set the framework for delivering post-16 education and training in Wales. The Learning and Skills Bill makes provision for it to establish regional committees to cover the same areas as the Assembly's Regional Committees and the existing TECs. The regional committees will be chaired by a member of the council. They will have a key role in identifying regional skills needs and a strong, vital influence over the way the budget for work-based training is used. They will also be in a position to influence the use of funds for post-16 education in their areas. I envisage that the business community will have significant representation on these committees.

At local level the community consortia for education and training will help plan the delivery of programmes in their localities. The distinct components of local community consortia will have equal status and will be funded directly by the council. Here too, business will have the important role of bringing its expertise and influence to bear on the local skills needed and on their delivery. Business people will have a major impact on the skills revolution we intend to bring into effect. It is vital that business is involved at all levels in the new arrangements, and that various voices are heard loud and clear. I want the business community to know that the Assembly gratefully acknowledges the leadership and commitment of business leaders to the development of work-based training over the years. I welcome their offers of active participation in the new structures

Galluoga'r cyngor newydd i sefydlu, cadw a chynnal partneriaethau cryf â chyfranogion ym myd addysg a hyfforddiant, ac i gyflenwi agenda o Fudd-dal i Waith y Llywodraeth. Bydd partneriaethau'n holl bwysig i'r cyngor newydd fel y gall gyflawni blaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad ar gyfer dysgu ôl-16. Bydd hefyd yn bwysig i'r cyngor gydnabod ac ystyried effaith ei waith ar agendâu ehangach ar gyfer Cymru fel gwell cynhwysiant cymdeithasol, economi cryfach a chyfle cyfartal.

Bydd strwythur newydd y Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru yn cynllunio ac yn rheoli ei swyddogaethau ar lefel genedlaethol, rhanbarthol a lleol. Bydd y cyngor yn gosod y fframwaith er mwyn cyflenwi addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 yng Nghymru. Mae'r Mesur Dysgu a Medrau'n galluogi ef i sefydlu pwyllgorau rhanbarthol ar gyfer yr un ardaloedd â Phwyllgorau Rhanbarthol y Cynulliad a'r cyngorau hyfforddi a menter presennol. Bydd y pwyllgorau rhanbarthol dan gadeiryddiaeth aelod o'r cyngor. Bydd ganddynt rôl allweddol wrth ddynodi anghenion medrau rhanbarthol a dylanwad cryf, holl bwysig dros y modd y defnyddir y gyllideb ar gyfer hyfforddiant yn y gwaith. Byddant mewn sefyllfa hefyd i ddylanwadu ar y defnydd o arian ar gyfer addysg ôl-16 yn eu hardaloedd. Rhagwela'r y bydd cynrychiolaeth sylweddol o'r gymuned fusnes ar y pwyllgorau hyn.

Ar lefel leol bydd y consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant yn helpu i gynllunio'r modd y cyflenwir rhaglenni yn eu hardaloedd. Bydd statws cyfartal i elfennau neilltuoel y consortia cymunedol lleol ac fe'u hariennir yn uniongyrchol gan y cyngor. Yma hefyd, bydd rôl bwysig gan fusnes o ran defnyddio ei arbenigedd a'i ddylanwad mewn perthynas â'r medrau y mae eu hangen yn lleol ac ar eu cyflenwi. Bydd pobl fusnes yn fawr eu dylanwad ar y chwyldro medrau yr ydym am ei gweithredu. Mae'n holl bwysig bod busnes yn cymryd rhan ar bob lefel yn y trefniadau newydd, ac y clywir gwahanol leisiau'n glir. Yr wyf am i'r gymuned fusnes wybod bod y Cynulliad yn cydnabod yn ddiolchgar arweiniad ac ymrwymiad arweinwyr busnes wrth ddatblygu hyfforddiant yn y gwaith dros y blynyddoedd. Croesawaf eu cynigion i

and confirm our determination that business will have a continuing substantial role in the new arrangements.

gyfrannu'n weithgar yn y strwythurau newydd a chadarnhaf ein bod yn benderfynol y bydd rôl sylweddol barhaus i fusnes yn y trefniadau newydd.

The action plan stresses the imperative of focusing and linking education and training programmes more effectively to deliver the skill needs of the Welsh economy. One major recommendation is that all education provision be informed by the labour market information identified by the study, 'Future Skills Wales'. That provides a wealth of information on the skills needed to support a successful economy. Organisations can use this information in their planning. We need to take strategic action. To help take this forward I have set up the Future Skills Taskforce to provide a short, sharp assessment of the policy implications of 'Future Skills Wales'. The assessment will show how these can be taken forward so that employers can find people with relevant skills to help their companies outperform their worldwide competitors. Another measure we are taking with our partners is establishing a skills unit. This will provide a resource to support action by partners, including linking to European funding. These measures will help us to achieve our objectives for the economy and social inclusion, and will lead to improvements in health, wealth and help us tackle inequalities.

Mae'r cynllun gweithredu'n pwysleisio'r rheidrwydd i ganolbwyntio a chysylltu rhaglenni addysg a hyfforddiant yn fwy effeithiol er mwyn cyflenwi anghenion medrau economi Cymru. Un o'i brif argymhellion yw y dylai'r holl ddarpariaeth addysg gael ei goleuo gan y wybodaeth ar y farchnad lafur a ddynodwyd yn yr astudiaeth 'Sgiliau Dyfodol Cymru'. Mae hynny yn darparu toreth o wybodaeth am y medrau sydd yn angenrheidiol er mwyn cynnal economi llwyddiannus. Gall cyrff ddefnyddio'r wybodaeth hon wrth gynllunio. Mae angen inni weithredu'n strategol. Er mwyn datblygu hyn sefydlais y Tasglu Sgiliau'r Dyfodol er mwyn darparu asesiad byr, eglur o oblygiadau polisi 'Sgiliau Dyfodol Cymru'. Bydd yr asesiad yn dangos sut y gellir bwrw ymlaen â'r rhain fel y gall cyflogwyr ddod o hyd i rai â'r medrau perthnasol er mwyn helpu eu cwmnïau i berfformio'n well na'u cystadleuwyr ledled y byd. Mesur arall yr ydym yn ei weithredu gyda'n partneriaid yw sefydlu uned sgiliau. Bydd hon yn darparu adnodd i gynorthwyo gweithredu gan bartneriaid, gan gynnwys cysylltu ag arian Ewropeaidd. Bydd y mesurau hyn yn ein helpu i gyflawni'n hamcanion ar gyfer yr economi a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol, ac yn arwain at welliannau mewn iechyd, cyfoeth ac yn ein helpu i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau.

4:59 p.m.

For the voluntary sector, ETAG proposed that a new strategic direction should be taken by CETW and the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales. It proposed that that should focus on areas of greatest need; on developing a means of evaluating returns on investment and on developing a tailored programme and funding stream based on clear criteria. These are laudable recommendations, which are supported by the Committee. If they are to be taken forward they must be accompanied by sound value for money standards and evaluation. We will work in partnership with the voluntary sector to achieve these aims.

Ar gyfer y sector gwirfoddol, cynigiodd y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant y dylai'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru a Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ddilyn cyfeiriad strategol newydd. Cynigiodd y dylai hynny ganolbwyntio ar yr ardaloedd mwyaf anghenus; ar ddatblygu dull o werthuso'r enillion a geir drwy fuddsoddi ac ar ddatblygu rhaglen wedi ei theilwra a ffrwd ariannu sydd yn seiliedig ar feini prawf eglur. Mae'r rhain yn argymhellion clodwiw, a gefnogir gan y Pwyllgor. Os ydynt i gael eu datblygu rhaid iddynt gyd-fynd â safonau gwerth am arian a gwerthuso cadarn.

Byddwn yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â'r sector gwirfoddol er mwyn cyrraedd y nodau hyn.

We must acknowledge the important contribution that the trade union movement can, and will, make to the future development of our programmes for the delivery of education and training in Wales. We want to secure their experience and commitment in the decision-making process. It is right that we recognise the important contribution that people working in the sector can bring to this debate.

The report identified possible savings of around £7.5 million in the first three years—money that will no longer be spent on the red tape associated with learning. However, the scale and timing of savings will depend on CETW's decisions on its organisational structure, which will in turn be influenced by decisions on how programmes are to be managed in future. To assist the new Council in taking this forward quickly, we have established a project management team, which involves representatives from TECs, FEFCW and other people, to consider all aspects of implementation. Success will depend upon a balanced approach to implementation. As part of that approach, we will commission studies of costs and savings arising from the structural reforms. I am sure that my colleague, Edwina Hart, will welcome that commitment.

Turning now to the amendments to the motion, I am sure that you will join me in supporting amendment 1 from Christine Humphreys. It states that devolution has given Wales the opportunity to choose its own direction for post-16 education and training.

Amendments 2, 7 and 8 in the name of Jonathan Morgan take us over familiar ground, as members of the Subject Committee are aware. We gave careful and lengthy consideration to these issues and to evidence from key stakeholders. The Committee's conclusions and recommendations are expressed in the report

Rhaid inni gydnabod y cyfraniad pwysig y gall, ac y bydd, y mudiad undebau llafur yn ei wneud i ddatblygu ein rhaglenni i gyflenwi addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym am sicrhau eu profiad a'u hymrwymiad yn y broses o benderfynu. Mae'n iawn inni gydnabod y cyfraniad pwysig y gall y rhai sydd yn gweithio yn y sector hwn ei roi i'r ddadl hon.

Dynododd yr adroddiad arbedion posibl o tua £7.5 miliwn yn y tair blynedd cyntaf—arian na werir mwyach ar y fiwrocratiaeth sydd yn gysylltiedig â dysgu. Fodd bynnag, bydd maint ac amseriad yr arbedion yn dibynnu ar benderfyniadau'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru ynghylch ei strwythur trefniadol, y dylanwedir arnynt yn eu tro gan benderfyniadau am y modd y rheolir rhaglenni yn y dyfodol. Er mwyn cynorthwyo'r Cyngor wrth ddatblygu hyn yn gyflym, sefydlasom dîm rheoli prosiect, sydd yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o'r cynghorau hyfforddi a menter, Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru a phobl eraill, er mwyn ystyried yr holl agweddau ar weithredu. Bydd llwyddiant yn ddibynnol ar ddull cytbwys o weithredu. Fel rhan o'r dull gweithredu hwnnw, byddwn yn comisiynu astudiaethau o gostau ac arbedion sydd yn deillio o'r diwygiadau strwythurol. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd fy nghydweithiwr, Edwina Hart, yn croesawu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw.

Gan droi'n awr at y gwelliannau i'r cynnig, yr wyf yn sicr yr ymunwch â mi wrth gefnogi gwelliant 1 oddi wrth Christine Humphreys. Mae'n nodi bod datganoli wedi rhoi cyfle i Gymru ddewis ei gyfeiriad ei hun ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16.

Mae gwelliannau 2, 7 a 8 yn enw Jonathan Morgan yn mynd â ni i dir cyfarwydd, fel y gŵyr aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Pwnc. Rhoesom ystyriaeth hir a gofalus i'r materion hyn ac i dystiolaeth gan gyfranogion allweddol. Datgenir casgliadau ac argymhellion y Pwyllgor yn yr adroddiad sydd ger ein bron heddiw. O ran y consortia cymunedol,

before us today. On the community consortia, I share ETAG's view that these should not be arbitrarily enforced partnerships. The reality is that these alliances are already beginning to form from the bottom up. We will consider and prepare a framework document to assist the council and the consortia in their work. I envisage that the framework would include arrangements for representing local communities, involving local employers in planning and delivery, and setting targets and measuring success. I do not feel it to be necessary to add further to what Cynog said in his report, but I would urge you to reject this amendment from Jonathan. It fails to acknowledge that we have to take a strategic direction to modernise post-16 learning in Wales.

I have no objection to supporting Elin Jones's amendments 3 and 5 to paragraph (c) of the motion. It underscores commitments that are already in the motion.

I also hope that you will endorse Christine Humphreys's amendment 4. It recognises that the needs of school sixth forms are diverse and varied. We must ensure that the new arrangements are sensitive to the needs of different settings. It was readily acknowledged by the Committee early in its deliberations that the approach should be flexible enough to encompass the needs of a variety of arrangements that exist in Wales. Those arrangements will enable schools to work in partnership with other practitioners. That has been raised in the debate today. There is a need to increase schools' viability, and to increase breadth and choice for students and learners.

Alun Cairns's amendment 6 endorses a minimum 40 per cent business membership for the national council and its regional committees. We have considered this issue carefully over recent months and have concluded that setting a percentage for any particular interest would be too narrow and artificial in both theory and practice. I have made my position clear on this issue. I have said repeatedly, and that has been endorsed by the First Secretary on a number of occasions, that business will have a strong influence in the new arrangements. We

rhannaf farn y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant na ddylai'r rhain fod yn bartneriaethau a orfodir yn fympwyol. Y gwir yw bod y cynghreiriau hyn yn dechrau ymffurfio eisoes, o'r gwaelod i fyny. Byddwn yn ystyried ac yn llunio dogfen fframwaith i gynorthwyo'r cyngor a'r consortia yn eu gwaith. Rhagwelaf y bydd y fframwaith yn cynnwys trefniadau i gynrychioli cymunedau lleol, gan gynnwys cyflogwyr lleol mewn cynllunio a chyflenwi, a phennu targedau a mesur llwyddiant. Ni chredaf fod angen ychwanegu at yr hyn a ddywedodd Cynog yn ei adroddiad, ond fe'ch anogaf i wrthod y gwelliant hwn oddi wrth Jonathan. Mae'n methu â chydabod bod rhaid inni ddilyn cyfeiriad strategol er mwyn moderneiddio dysgu ôl-16 yng Nghymru.

Nid oes gennyf wrthwynebiad i gefnogi gwelliannau 3 a 5 Elin Jones i baragraff (c) o'r cynnig. Mae'n tanlinellu ymrwymadau sydd yn y cynnig eisoes.

Gobeithiaf hefyd y byddwch yn cefnogi gwelliant 4 Christine Humphreys. Mae'n cydnabod bod anghenion dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion yn wahanol ac yn amrywiol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y trefniadau newydd yn ymateb i anghenion gwahanol sefyllfaoedd. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn barod iawn i gydnabod yn gynnar yn ei drafodaethau y dylai'r dull gweithredu fod yn ddigon hyblyg i gwmpasu anghenion amryw o drefniadau a geir yng Nghymru. Bydd y trefniadau hynny'n galluogi ysgolion i weithio mewn partneriaeth ag ymarferwyr eraill. Codwyd hynny yn y ddatl heddiw. Mae angen cynyddu hyfywedd ysgolion, ac ehangu'r ystod a'r dewis i fyfyrwyr a dysgwyr.

Mae gwelliant 6 Alun Cairns yn cefnogi aelodaeth o o leiaf 40 y cant o fydd busnes ar y cyngor cenedlaethol a'i bwyllgorau rhanbarthol. Rhoesom ystyriaeth ofalus i'r mater hwn dros y misoedd diwethaf hyn a dod i'r casgliad y byddai pennu canran ar gyfer unrhyw fuddiant penodol yn rhy gul ac artiffisial yn ddamcaniaethol ac yn ymarferol. Yr wyf wedi egluro fy safbwynt ar y mater hwn. Dywedais dro ar ôl tro, a chefnogwyd hynny gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd sawl gwaith, y bydd gan fusnes ddylanwad cryf yn y trefniadau newydd. Ni allwn gyflawni'r

cannot achieve these ambitious reforms without business. However, it is not necessary to specify a minimum level of business representation on the council. This Assembly will make appointments to the new council in accordance with Nolan principles. We want to ensure that the council's membership covers the broad range of interests involved in post-16 learning, and that no single element dominates. We hope and expect to receive many applications from the business sector. I particularly welcome applications from candidates who represent more than one interest. We do not wish to specify minimum membership levels for any interest. I urge you to reject Alun's rather prescriptive amendment.

Elin's amendment 9 highlights the needs of rural areas. I think that Elin would accept that the need for flexibility is not only restricted to rural areas. Disadvantaged urban areas have their own problems. I support the amendment as it identifies rural issues and concerns that have been expressed in the Committee. I am happy to support Elin's amendment on that basis.

In today's debate, we have had many positive contributions. I noted a number of comments. Jonathan Morgan questioned the basis of our decision to transfer sixth form funding to the national council. If we are to take a holistic approach to strategic decisions about funding post-16 education and training in Wales, we cannot leave one important element of that funding arrangement out of the equation. Notwithstanding that, we believe that the funding of sixth forms should be channelled via local education authorities. I endorse this approach, but it must be accompanied by a workable funding methodology. That issue has been raised by many Members in today's debate. This proposal is endorsed by the Welsh Local Government Association.

5:09 p.m.

Turning to some of the other issues that Jonathan Morgan raised, he questioned our commitment to abolishing quangos. We are making a substantial contribution to that

diwygiadau uchelgeisiol hyn heb fusnes. Fodd bynnag, nid oes angen dynodi lefel isaf o gynrychiolaeth busnes ar y cyngor. Bydd y Cynulliad hwn yn penodi i'r cyngor newydd yn unol ag egwyddorion Nolan. Yr ydym am sicrhau y bydd aelodaeth y cyngor yn cynnwys yr amrediad eang o fuddiannau sydd yn gysylltiedig â dysgu ôl-16, ac na fydd un elfen yn tra-arglwyddiaethu. Gobeithiwn a disgwyliwn dderbyn llawer o geisiadau oddi wrth y sector busnes. Croesawaf yn arbennig geisiadau oddi wrth ymgeiswyr sydd yn cynrychioli mwy nag un buddiant. Nid ydym yn dymuno dynodi lefelau aelodaeth isaf ar gyfer unrhyw fuddiant. Fe'ch anogaf i wrthod gwelliant Alun, sydd braidd yn orchmynnol.

Mae gwelliant 9 Elin yn tynnu sylw at anghenion ardaloedd gwledig. Credaf y byddai Elin yn derbyn nad yw'r angen am hyblygrwydd yn gyfyngedig i ardaloedd gwledig. Mae i ardaloedd trefol difreintiedig eu problemau eu hunain. Cefnogaf y gwelliant gan ei fod yn dynodi materion a phryderon gwledig a fynegwyd o fewn y Pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi gwelliant Elin ar y sail honno.

Yn y ddadl heddiw, cawsom lawer o gyfraniadau cadarnhaol. Nodais nifer o sylwadau. Yr oedd Jonathan Morgan yn cwestiynu sail ein penderfyniad i drosglwyddo ariannu dosbarthiadau chwech i'r cyngor cenedlaethol. Os ydym i gael ymagwedd gyfannol at benderfyniadau strategol ynghylch ariannu addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 yng Nghymru, ni allwn hepgor un elfen bwysig o'r trefniant ariannu hwnnw o'r hafaliad. Er gwaethaf hynny, credwn y dylid sianelu'r cyllid ar gyfer dosbarthiadau chwech drwy awdurdodau addysg lleol. Cefnogaf y dull gweithredu hwn, ond rhaid iddo gyd-fynd â methodoleg ariannu ymarferol. Codwyd y mater hwnnw gan lawer o Aelodau yn y ddadl heddiw. Cefnogir y cynnig hwn gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru.

Gan droi at rai o'r materion eraill a gododd Jonathan Morgan, cwestiynodd ein hymrwymiad i ddiddymu cwangos. Yr ydym yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at yr ymrwymiad

commitment. We will create one new Assembly sponsored public body to replace five existing ones. That goes some way to meet that particular commitment.

I dealt with the question that Jonathan Morgan and others raised about the nature and development of CCETs at local level. It is important that we allow those to develop almost organically. However, as an Assembly, we need to set a framework within which those organisations can develop. There must be a basic list of priorities if we are to ensure the viability of CCETs and if they are to deliver on the commitment to offer breadth, choice and opportunity.

Jenny Randerson raised the issue of funding and the disparity between further education and other areas. That is acknowledged and there are real concerns there. This is why one of early task of the National Council for Education and Training for Wales will be to instigate a detailed investigation into and comprehensive review of the funding methodology that can be seen to be credible and fair. That will be an enormous challenge for the National Council for Education and Training for Wales in its first year.

Jocelyn Davies mentioned her concerns with regard to special educational needs. I share those concerns. The Learning and Skills Bill places a duty upon the Assembly to ensure that arrangements are in place to deal with the special educational needs of people in post-16 and pre-19 education. I will ask the National Council for Education and Training for Wales to advise upon that.

Several Members have mentioned their concerns with regard to employment policies in colleges. These are matters for colleges. Richard Edwards said 'we do not want that answer; we do not want to bottle out'. However, the fact is that colleges are the employers, trade unions represent their staff and employment policies are matters for negotiation. We would be remiss if we did not reflect upon the concerns that have been expressed in the Chamber and the

hwnnw. Byddwn yn creu un corff cyhoeddus newydd a noddir gan y Cynulliad i ddisodli pump sydd yn bod ar hyn o bryd. Mae hynny'n cyfrannu i ryw raddau at yr ymrwymiad arbennig hwnnw.

Ymdriniais â'r cwestiwn a gododd Jonathan Morgan ac eraill am natur a datblygiad y consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant ar lefel leol. Mae'n bwysig inni ganiatáu i'r rheini ddatblygu'n organig bron. Fodd bynnag, fel Cynulliad, mae angen inni bennu fframwaith y gall y cyrff hynny ddatblygu oddi mewn iddo. Rhaid cael rhestr sylfaenol o flaenoriaethau os ydym i sicrhau hyfywedd y consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant ac os ydynt i allu gyflawni'r ymrwymiad i gynnig ehangder, dewis a chyfle.

Cododd Jenny Randerson fater ariannu a'r gwahaniaeth rhwng addysg bellach a meysydd eraill. Cydnabyddir hynny ac mae materion gwirioneddol yn y fan hyn. Dyna pam mai un o dasgau cynnar y Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru fydd dechrau ymchwiliad manwl i a chynnal adolygiad cynhwysfawr o'r fethodoleg ariannu y gellir ei weld ei fod yn un credadwy a theg. Bydd hynny'n her aruthrol i'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru yn ei flwyddyn gyntaf.

Soniodd Jocelyn Davies am ei phryderon mewn perthynas ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Rhannaf y pryderon hynny. Mae'r Mesur Dysgu a Medrau yn rhoi dyletswydd i'r Cynulliad sicrhau y sefydlir trefniadau i ymdrin ag anghenion addysgol arbennig pobl mewn addysg ôl-16 a chyn-19. Byddaf yn gofyn i'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru roi cyngor ar hynny.

Soniodd nifer o Aelodau am eu pryderon mewn cysylltiad â pholisïau cyflogaeth mewn colegau. Materion i'r colegau yw'r rhain. Dywedodd Richard Edwards 'nid ydym am gael yr ateb hwnnw; nid ydym am osgoi cyfrioldeb'. Fodd bynnag, y ffaith yw mai colegau yw'r cyflogwyr, yr undebau llafur sydd yn cynrychioli eu staff a bod polisïau cyflogaeth yn faterion i'w trafod. Byddem yn esgeulus pe na baem yn ystyried y pryderon a fynegwyd yn y Siambr a'r sylwadau a

representations made by trade unions. However, employment policies are matters for employers and for appropriate negotiation.

Ann Jones referred to the careers service in Wales and welcomed the establishment of Careers Wales. That has been widely welcomed throughout the sector. A single focus, all-age advice, information and guidance service is one that everyone welcomes. I look forward to working with Careers Wales in the delivery of the important functions for which it will be responsible in the new Wales that we envisage.

Val Feld referred to the contributions already made by many employers as community leaders and through their involvement in various organisations. I have no doubt that employers will respond and rise to the challenge and the opportunity that the new arrangements in Wales offer. At all levels in the new organisations, I am certain that business leaders will come forward, many of whom will be only too happy to bring their skills and experience to bear on this important issue of education and training. I welcome the enthusiasm shown in many quarters, which perhaps is not reflected in the media. Nevertheless, I am aware through travelling the length and breadth of Wales that there is a commitment to work with us to deliver this new agenda in Wales.

Val Feld also mentioned that the important and valuable contribution of lecturers and teachers needs to be recognised. That is obvious and we value the work they do. Their experience and expertise must be brought to bear in the consideration of the delivery of this agenda. I will ensure that those interests are properly represented in the new structures. I have covered most of the major issues raised in the debate. John Griffiths mentioned that he hoped that CETW would be innovative and imaginative. I share that hope. I hope that it will grasp the opportunities that will be available if the Bill proceeds as we expect, enabling us to introduce the measures in Wales.

gyflwynwyd gan yr undebau llafur. Fodd bynnag, mae materion cyflogaeth yn faterion i gyflogwyr ac i drafodaethau priodol.

Cyfeiriodd Ann Jones at y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru a chroesawodd sefydlu Gyrfaoedd Cymru. Bu croeso cyffredinol i hynny drwy'r sector. Mae gwasanaeth cyngor, gwybodaeth ac arweiniad i bob oed ag un ffocws yn un a groesewir gan bawb. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda Gyrfaoedd Cymru wrth iddynt gyflawni'r swyddogaethau pwysig y bydd yn gyfrifol amdanynt yn y Gymru newydd a ragwelwn.

Cyfeiriodd Val Feld at y cyfraniadau a wnaethpwyd eisoes gan lawer o gyflogwyr fel arweinwyr cymunedol a thrwy eu rhan mewn gwahanol gyrff. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd cyflogwyr yn ymateb i'r her ac yn achub ar y cyfle a gynigir gan y trefniadau newydd yng Nghymru. Ar bob lefel yn y cyrff newydd, yr wyf yn sicr y daw arweinwyr busnes ymlaen, lawer ohonynt o wirfodd calon i gyfrannu o'u medrau a'u profiad i'r pwnc pwysig hwn o addysg a hyfforddiant. Croesawaf y brwdfrydedd a amlygwyd mewn llawer cylch nas gwelir efallai yn y cyfryngau. Er hynny, yr wyf yn ymwybodol drwy deithio ar hyd a lled Cymru fod ymrwymiad i weithio gyda ni i wireddu'r agenda newydd hon yng Nghymru.

Dywedodd Val Feld hefyd fod angen cydnabod cyfraniad gwerthfawr darlithwyr ac athrawon. Mae hynny'n amlwg a gwerthfawrogn y gwaith a gyflawnant. Rhaid sicrhau eu profiad a'u harbenigedd wrth ystyried y modd y cyflenwir yr agenda hon. Byddaf yn sicrhau bod cynrychiolaeth briodol o'r buddiannau hynny yn y strwythurau newydd. Ymdriniais â'r rhan fwyaf o'r materion pwysig a godwyd yn y ddadl. Dywedodd John Griffiths ei fod yn gobeithio y byddai'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru'n arloesol ac yn ddyfeisgar. Rhannaf y gobaith hwnnw. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn gafael yn y cyfleoedd a fydd ar gael os â'r Mesur yn ei flaen fel yr ydym yn disgwyl, gan ein galluogi i gyflwyno'r mesurau yng Nghymru.

Gareth Jones raised the issue of qualifications. That is a matter for the Pre-16 Education Committee, but one upon which we will no doubt be consulted. He also made a bid for the headquarters to be located in Conwy. I take it that that was a serious bid, but even if it was not, what should be uppermost in our minds is the issue of staff, and where they are currently located. We must not lose sight of the impact of this change on the people who work in the sector. Appropriate consideration must be given to that, while acknowledging that this will be an all-Wales body and, therefore, ought to be seen as such. We should consider how best we can achieve that objective.

Elin Jones: Could you confirm that TUPE regulations will apply to the employees of TECs and funding councils in their transfer of employment to their new employers, the national council?

Tom Middlehurst: I will answer that question in due course, as it has been raised by yourself and by Karen Sinclair, and is a matter of great concern to staff currently working in the sector.

As regards the way ahead, I fully understand that change is unsettling, but it is necessary if we are to raise skill and talent in Wales to a level comparable to that of our competitors. We will do three things over the next year. First, we are determined to maintain the momentum of existing programmes delivered by TECs and the Further Education Funding Council for Wales, to ensure that existing targets and commitments are met. Secondly, we must take every possible opportunity to use European funding, from the new programmes that will come onstream, to the best effect. In some areas of business that will involve developing and deepening our response to education and skills needs across Wales. It will mean designing and delivering programmes to address our needs in order to make a real difference in Wales. Thirdly, we will plan to achieve a smoother handover of functions to the new council and other successor organisations.

Cododd Gareth Jones fater cymwysterau. Mae hynny'n fater i'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16, ond y mae'n sicr yr ymgynghorir â ni yn ei gylch. Gwnaeth gais hefyd am leoli'r pencadlys yng Nghonwy. Derbyniaf hynny fel cais difrifol, ond hyd yn oed os nad oedd, yr hyn a ddylai fod yn flaenaf yn ein meddwl yw'r mater o staff, a lle y maent wedi eu lleoli ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid inni beidio â cholli golwg ar effaith y newid hwn ar y bobl sydd yn gweithio yn y sector. Rhaid rhoi ystyriaeth briodol i hynny, gan gydnabod mai corff i Gymru gyfan fydd hwn ac y dylid, felly, ei weld fel hynny. Dylem ystyried sut y gallwn gyflawni'r nod honno orau.

Elin Jones: A oes modd ichi gadarnhau y bydd y Rheoliadau Trosglwyddo Ymgymeriadau (Gwarchod Cyflogaeth) yn berthnasol i weithwyr y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter a'r cynghorau cyllido wrth iddynt drosglwyddo eu cyflogaeth i'w cyflogwyr newydd, y cyngor cenedlaethol?

Tom Middlehurst: Byddaf yn ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw maes o law, gan ei fod wedi ei godi gennych chi a chan Karen Sinclair, a chan ei fod yn fater o'r pwys mwyaf i'r staff sydd yn gweithio yn y sector ar hyn o bryd.

O ran y ffordd ymlaen, yr wyf yn llwyr ddeall bod newid yn peri annifyrrwch, ond mae'n angenrheidiol os ydym i godi medrau a doniau yng Nghymru i lefel gymharol â'n cystadleuwyr. Byddwn yn gwneud tri pheth dros y flwyddyn nesaf. Yn gyntaf, yr ydym yn benderfynol o gynnal momentwm y rhaglenni presennol a gyflenwir gan y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter a Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru, er mwyn sicrhau cyflawni'r targedau a'r ymrwymadau presennol. Yn ail, rhaid inni fanteisio ar bob cyfle posibl i ddefnyddio arian Ewropeaidd, o'r rhaglenni newydd fydd ar gael, yn y modd mwyaf effeithiol. Mewn rhai meysydd busnes bydd hynny'n golygu datblygu a dyfnhau ein hymateb i anghenion addysg a medrau ledled Cymru. Bydd yn golygu cynllunio a chyflenwi rhaglenni i ateb ein hanghenion er mwyn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol yng Nghymru. Yn drydydd, byddwn yn cynllunio er mwyn trosglwyddo swyddogaethau'n haws i'r cyngor newydd a'r

cyrff olynol eraill.

My officials have already had initial discussions with senior executives, as existing organisations start to plan for the transition. Over the year ahead Assembly staff will work closely with senior teams from the sector, using their practical experience in developing sensible and robust arrangements for the future. This will be an example of partnership in action—a new, inclusive style of Assembly working in Wales.

One of the first questions that staff will ask is how the changes will affect them personally. I take the opportunity to put their minds at rest today. I emphasise that I expect good employment practice to be applied and for all staff to be treated in a fair and even-handed manner. Recruitment for senior management positions in the new council will be by competition. Below that level and for all of the positions in the council and other successor organisations, staff will transfer with their work. Those transfers will be subject to the Transfer of Undertakings (Protection of Employment) Regulations 1981. It has also been decided that staff whose present jobs are not recognisably transferable, will join the new council on terms comparable to those where TUPE applies directly.

Naturally, it will be for the council to consider what staffing levels are appropriate to its functions and the scale of its business operations. In the event that some reductions are indicated, the Assembly would expect the council to take appropriate steps to rationalise its staff structure. All businesses keep their staff costs under continual review and the council will be no exception. However, it must be remembered that savings in staff posts do not necessarily imply an equivalent scale of redundancies. Wherever possible, the council will be encouraged to profile its activities so as to take advantage of natural wastage and the termination of short-term contracts to absorb reductions in staffing levels. There will be the possibility of transfer or appointments to the Assembly, its

Mae fy swyddogion wedi cael trafodaethau dechreuol eisoes ag uwch weithredwyr, wrth i'r cyrff presennol ddechrau cynllunio ar gyfer y trawsnewid. Dros y flwyddyn sydd i ddod bydd staff y Cynulliad yn cydweithio'n agos ag uwch dimau o'r sector, gan ddefnyddio eu profiad ymarferol wrth ddatblygu trefniadau synhwyrol a chadarn ar gyfer y dyfodol. Bydd hyn yn enghraifft o bartneriaeth yn gweithredu—dull newydd, gynhwysol o weithio gan y Cynulliad yng Nghymru.

Un o'r cwestiynau cyntaf y bydd staff yn ei ofyn yw sut y bydd y newidiadau'n effeithio arnynt hwy'n bersonol. Manteisïaf ar y cyfle hwn i dawelu eu meddyliau heddiw. Pwysleisïaf fy mod yn disgwyl y cymhwysir ymarfer cyflogaeth da ac i'r holl staff gael eu trin yn deg ac yn gyfartal. Bydd y recriwtio i swyddi rheoli uwch yn y cyngor newydd yn digwydd drwy gystadlu. Islaw'r lefel honno, ac yn achos yr holl swyddi yn y cyngor a'r cyrff olynol eraill, bydd y staff yn trosglwyddo gyda'i gwaith. Bydd y trosglwyddiadau hynny'n ddarostyngedig i'r Rheoliadau Trosglwyddo Ymgymeriadau (Gwarchod Cyflogaeth) 1981. Penderfynwyd hefyd y bydd staff mewn swyddi a adnëbir yn anhrosglwyddadwy yn ymuno â'r cyngor newydd ar delerau tebyg i'r rhai lle y mae'r Rheoliadau Trosglwyddo Ymgymeriadau (Gwarchod Cyflogaeth) yn uniongyrchol berthnasol.

Wrth gwrs, mater i'r cyngor fydd penderfynu pa lefelau staffio sydd yn briodol ar gyfer ei swyddogaethau a maint y gweithrediadau busnes. Os gwelir bod angen rhai gostyngiadau, byddai'r Cynulliad yn disgwyl i'r cyngor gymryd camau priodol er mwyn rhesymoli ei strwythur staff. Mae pob busnes yn edrych yn barhaus ar ei gostau staff ac ni fydd y cyngor yn eithriad. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cofio nad yw arbedion mewn swyddi staff o reidrwydd yn golygu nifer gyfatebol o ddiswyddiadau. Lle bynnag y bo modd, anogir y cyngor i broffilio ei weithgareddau fel y gall fanteisio ar golli naturiol a therfynu contractau tymor byr er mwyn clustogi gostyngiadau mewn lefelau staffio. Bydd posibiliad hefyd o drosglwyddo neu benodiadau i'r Cynulliad, y cyrff a noddur

sponsored bodies or other parts of the public sector, for staff that may be surplus to the longer term needs of the new council when it has considered its organisational structure.

ganddo neu i rannau eraill o'r sector cyhoeddus, ar gyfer staff na fydd eu hangen efallai er mwyn cyflawni anghenion tymor hwy y cyngor newydd ar ôl iddo ystyried ei strwythur trefniadol.

5:19 p.m.

I believe that I have dealt with most of the concerns raised in the debate today. There is broad consensus within the education and training sectors that change is needed urgently. Although different views were expressed about how we can achieve what we wish, the need for change was not challenged in the Committee. Working hand in hand with practitioners, employers, trade unions, the voluntary sector and a wide range of other partners, we can build a new post-16 education and training system. The action plan shows us how. New arrangements will eliminate waste and duplication, increase choice for students, and avoid unnecessary competition. They will raise standards, enable us to achieve our learning targets and to turn Wales into a learning country for the benefit of individuals, their communities and business.

Credaf fy mod wedi ymdrin â'r rhan fwyaf o'r pryderon a godwyd yn y ddadl heddiw. Mae consensws eang oddi mewn i'r sectorau addysg a hyfforddiant bod angen newid ar frys. Er y mynegwyd gwahanol safbwyntiau ynghylch y modd y cyflawnwn yr hyn y dymunwn, nid oedd anghytuno yn y Pwyllgor â'r angen am newid. Drwy weithio law yn llaw ag ymarferwyr, cyflogwyr, undebau llafur, y sector gwirfoddol ac amrediad eang o bartneriaid eraill, gallwn adeiladu system addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 newydd. Dengys y cynllun gweithredu sut y gwnawn hynny. Bydd y trefniadau newydd yn dileu gwastraff a dyblygu, yn cynyddu'r dewis i fyfyrwyr, ac yn osgoi cystadlu diangen. Byddant yn codi safonau, yn ein galluogi i gyrredd ein targedau dysgu ac yn troi Cymru'n wlad sydd yn dysgu er budd unigolion, eu cymunedau a busnes.

The effects of this new system will be felt in many areas of our lives in improving basic skills, in tackling social exclusion and developing communities, and in wealth creation. It will equip individuals in Wales for the skills- and knowledge-based economy of the twenty-first century, and ensure that everyone has the opportunity to continue with education and training throughout their lives. The new structures will deliver a post-16 education and training system for Wales that is based firmly on quality, coherence and choice. I ask you to support the motion, oppose the amendments as I indicated earlier, and to support Christine Humphreys's amendments 1 and 4, and Elin Jones's amendments 3, 5 and 9.

Teimlir effeithiau'r system newydd hon mewn llawer o rannau o'n bywydau wrth wella medrau sylfaenol, wrth fynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol a datblygu cymunedau, ac wrth greu cyfoeth. Bydd yn paratoi unigolion yng Nghymru ar gyfer yr economi sydd yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth a medrau yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, ac yn sicrhau bod cyfle gan bawb i barhau ag addysg a hyfforddiant gydol eu hoes. Bydd y strwythurau newydd yn cyflenwi system addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 ar gyfer Cymru sydd wedi ei seilio'n gadarn ar ansawdd, cydlynad a dewis. Gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r cynnig, gwrthwynebu'r gwelliannau a nodais yn gynharach, a chefnogi gwelliannau 1 a 4 Christine Humphreys, a gwelliannau 3, 5 a 9 Elin Jones.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 45, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 1: For 45, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter

Butler, Rosemary
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Feld, Val
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Humphreys, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Marek, John
 Michael, Alun
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment adopted.

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 45.
Amendment 2: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 45.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Black, Peter
 Butler, Rosemary
 Dafis, Cynog

Morgan, Jonathan

Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Marek, John
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 3: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael

Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Marek, John
Melding, David
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 4: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian

Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Marek, John
Melding, David
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 45, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 5: For 45, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Marek, John
 Michael, Alun
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment adopted.

Gwelliant 6: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 40.
Amendment 6: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 40.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Feld, Val
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Marek, John

Michael, Alun
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Black, Peter
 German, Michael
 Humphreys, Christine
 Williams, Kirsty
 Randerson, Jenny

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 7: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 45.
Amendment 7: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 45.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Black, Peter
 Butler, Rosemary
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Feld, Val
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Humphreys, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Marek, John
 Michael, Alun
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 45.
 Amendment 8: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 45.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Black, Peter
 Butler, Rosemary
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Feld, Val
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Humphreys, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Marek, John
 Michael, Alun
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.

Amendment rejected.

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 45, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 9: For 45, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Marek, John
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment adopted.*

Amended motion:

that the Assembly

Y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

bod y Cynulliad

- | | |
|--|--|
| <p>(a) <i>welcomes the report by the Assembly's Post-16 Education and Training Committee and its overall recommendations for implementing the education and training action plan;</i></p> <p>(b) <i>welcomes in particular the opportunity that devolution has given Wales to choose its own direction to a considerable extent in post-16 education and training;</i></p> <p>(c) <i>endorses the overall principles, objectives and outcomes set out in the education and training action plan for Wales;</i></p> <p>(d) <i>agrees that education and training are intimately and equally related to securing community development; social inclusion; and wealth creation, together with intellectual and cultural development, personal fulfilment, enrichment and enjoyment; that these dimensions are of equal and vital importance; and that the artificial divide between education and training should be removed;</i></p> <p>(e) <i>recognises the financial implications of maintaining Welsh language education and education in rural areas, and therefore recognises that the same viability criteria will not apply for every sixth form;</i></p> <p>(f) <i>endorses also the call for significant growth in Welsh medium provision;</i></p> <p>(g) <i>recognises the essential contributions of employers, trades unions, local government, the voluntary sector, practitioners and a wide range of other partners necessary to realise the plan;</i></p> | <p>(a) <i>yn croesawu'r adroddiad gan Bwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 y Cynulliad a'i argymhellion cyffredinol ar gyfer rhoi'r cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant ar waith;</i></p> <p>(b) <i>yn croesawu'n arbennig y cyfle a ddaeth yn sgîl datganoli i Gymru ddewis ei chyfeiriad ei hun i raddau helaeth mewn addysg a hyfforddiant ar ôl 16 oed;</i></p> <p>(c) <i>yn cefnogi'r egwyddorion, yr amcanion a'r canlyniadau cyffredinol a nodir yn y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant i Gymru;</i></p> <p>(d) <i>yn cytuno bod cysylltiad clòs a chydradd rhwng addysg a hyfforddiant a'r broses o sicrhau datblygiad cymunedol; cynhwysiant cymdeithasol; a chreu cyfoeth ynghyd â datblygiad deallusol a diwylliannol, cynorthwyo pobl i fwynhau a chyfoethogi'u bywydau a chyflawni'u dyheadau personol; bod pob un o'r dimensiynau hyn yr un mor hanfodol bwysig; ac y dylid dileu'r rhaniad artifisial rhwng addysg a hyfforddiant;</i></p> <p>(e) <i>yn cydnabod goblygiadau ariannol cynnal addysg drwy gyfrwng yr iaith Gymraeg ac addysg mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac felly'n cydnabod na fydd yr un meini prawf hyfywedd yn gymwys ar gyfer pob chweched dosbarth;</i></p> <p>(f) <i>yn ategu hefyd yr alwad am dwf sylweddol yn y ddarpariaeth trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg;</i></p> <p>(g) <i>yn cydnabod cyfraniadau allweddol cyflogwyr, undebau llafur, llywodraeth leol, y sector gwirfoddol, ymarferwyr ac amrywiaeth eang o bartneriaid eraill sydd yn angenrheidiol er mwyn rhoi'r Cynllun ar waith;</i></p> |
|--|--|

- (h) notes the work under way by the Economic Development Committee to ensure that enterprise functions currently undertaken by training and enterprise councils are properly developed as part of the national economic development strategy;
- (i) endorses the structural changes recommended by the Post-16 Committee and the principle of locating skill-related enterprise functions with the new National Council for Education and Training for Wales;
- (j) supports also the call for a new national funding formula to reflect the need to protect accessibility, particularly in rural areas and recognises the need for careful consideration to be given to the effect of a common funding formula on pre-16 educational provision; and
- (k) agrees that the Executive puts in hand the necessary work with training and enterprise councils and the Further Education Funding Council for Wales so as to be able to implement the new arrangements for post-16 education and training by 1 April 2001, handling all staffing issues arising from the reorganisation with openness and fairness.
- (h) yn nodi'r gwaith sydd ar y gweill gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y swyddogaethau menter, a gyflawnir ar hyn o bryd gan y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter, eu datblygu'n briodol fel rhan o'r strategaeth ddatblygu economaidd genedlaethol;
- (i) yn cymeradwyo'r newidiadau strwythurol a argymhellir gan y Pwyllgor Ôl-16, a'r egwyddor o roi'r cyfrifoldeb am swyddogaethau menter sydd yn gysylltiedig â medrau ar ysgwyddau'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant newydd i Gymru;
- (j) yn cefnogi hefyd yr alwad am fformwla ariannu cenedlaethol newydd i adlewyrchu'r angen i ddiogelu hygyrchedd, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac yn cydnabod yr angen i roi ystyriaeth ofalus i effaith fformwla ariannu cyffredin ar ddarpariaeth addysg cyn-16 oed; ac
- (k) yn cytuno y dylai'r Weithrediaeth roi cychwyn ar y gwaith angenrheidiol gyda'r cynghorau hyfforddi a menter a Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru fel y gellir gweithredu'r trefniadau newydd ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant ar ôl 16 oed erbyn 1 Ebrill 2001, gan ymdrin â'r holl faterion yn ymwneud â staffio sydd yn deillio o'r ad-drefnu mewn ffordd agored a theg.

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amended motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Marek, John
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
Amended motion adopted.*

Y Llywydd: Dyna ddiwedd sesiwn heddiw. **The Presiding Officer:** That is the end of today's session. Thank you.
Diolch yn fawr.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.30 p.m.
The session ended at 5.30 p.m.*