Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)

The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)

Dydd Mercher 12 Ebrill 2000

Wednesday 12 April 2000

Cynnwys
Contents

3 Datganiad Personol gan Alun Michael
Personal Statement by Alun Michael

6 Cwestiynau i'r Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol a Thai
Questions to the Secretary for Local Government and Housing

13 Cwestiynau i'r Ysgrifennydd Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth
Questions to the Secretary for the Environment, Planning and Transport

21 Datganiad ar Lwfansau Cynghorwyr
Statement on Councillors' Allowances

36 Datganiad ar Gyllideb 2000-01
Statement on the 2000-01 Budget

49 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order

50 Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig
Revised Business Statement

51 Cymeradwyo Protocol Diwygiedig ar Ymddygiad yn y Siambr
Approval of Revised Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber

56 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order

57 Rhaglen Amcan 1
Objective 1 Programme

91 Dadl Fer: Swyddogaeth Marchnadoedd Ffermwyr mewn Cymunedau Ffyniannus
Short Debate: The Role of Farmers' Markets in Thriving Communities

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.

Datganiad Personol gan Alun Michael
Personal Statement by Alun Michael

Alun Michael: Diolch am y cyfle i ddweud gair personol ar ddiwrnod olaf y tymor.

I am grateful for the opportunity to make a short personal statement on the last day that I will attend a Plenary session as a Member of this Assembly. Today, I thank those who gave me the opportunity to bring the National Assembly for Wales into being and to lead it in its early life. I am confident that history will show that sound foundations were laid for the development of a mature and effective institution to an extent that even Members of this body may not have understood at that time. That required super human efforts by civil servants whose commitment to the Assembly has been wholly underestimated on all sides. There are many I could name but I will mention two of them: Jon Shortridge, who proved that he is more Sir Richard than Sir Humphrey, and Lawrence Conway, for it took a Grangetown boy to shape an effective cabinet office system for the new Wales.

On a personal level, I thank many Members and the Assembly staff for their kindness. I make it clear that I stand down as an optimist about the process of devolution. I make no bones about it, when I stood down as First Secretary it was in circumstances that damaged the image and standing of the Assembly, to whose role and development I remain wholly committed as I have been throughout my political life. My subsequent decision to stand down from the Assembly was not an easy one but the Assembly is additional and complementary to Parliament. Westminster remains as important to people in Wales as it ever was. We must ensure that both democratic bodies deliver the best for Wales. That is why, in the end, I responded positively to the unanimous request of Labour Party Members in Cardiff South and Penarth to continue my role in Welsh politics as their representative in the UK Parliament. I

Alun Michael: Thank you for the opportunity to say a personal word on the last day of term.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i wneud datganiad personol byr ar y diwrnod olaf y byddaf yn mynychu Cyfarfod Llawn fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad hwn. Heddiw, diolchaf i'r rheini a roddodd y cyfle imi ddod â Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i fodolaeth a'i arwain yn ei fywyd cynnar. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd hanes yn dangos y gosodwyd sylfeini cadarn ar gyfer datblygiad sefydliad aeddfed ac effeithiol i raddau na ddeallwyd efallai gan Aelodau'r corff hwn hyd yn oed ar y pryd. Gofynnai hynny am ymdrechion uwchddynol gan weision sifil y tanbrisiwyd eu hymroddiad i'r Cynulliad yn llwyr o bob tu. Gallwn enwi llawer, ond crybwyllaf ddau ohonynt: Jon Shortridge, a brofodd ei fod yn fwy Syr Richard na Syr Humphrey, a Lawrence Conway, oherwydd yr oedd angen bachgen o Grangetown i lunio system swyddfa gabinet effeithiol i'r Gymru newydd.

Ar lefel bersonol, diolchaf i lawer o Aelodau a staff y Cynulliad am eu caredigrwydd. Dywedaf yn groyw fy mod yn sefyll i lawr fel optimist ynghylch y broses datganoli. Heb afradu geiriau, pan ymddiswyddais fel Prif Ysgrifennydd yr oedd hynny mewn amgylchiadau a niweidiodd ddelwedd a safle'r Cynulliad, corff yr wyf fi'n dal i fod yn gyfangwbl ymroddedig i'w rôl a'i ddatblygiad fel y bûm gydol fy mywyd gwleidyddol. Nid oedd fy mhenderfyniad wedi hynny i ymddiswyddo o'r Cynulliad yn un hawdd, ond mae'r Cynulliad yn ategol a chyflenwol i'r Senedd. Mae San Steffan yn dal i fod cyn bwysiced i bobl yng Nghymru ag y bu erioed. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y ddau gorff democrataidd hyn yn cyflenwi'r gorau i Gymru. Dyna pam, yn y diwedd, y bu imi ymateb yn gadarnhaol i gais unfrydol Aelodau'r Blaid Lafur yn Ne Caerdydd a Phenarth i barhau â'm rôl yng

spelt out my reasons in a letter to them and to the Labour Party branches in mid and west Wales. However, let us be clear. I am not turning my back on the Assembly and certainly not on Wales. As the past week has again shown, there is a long way to go before the Assembly brings its relationship with the United Kingdom Government to full maturity. The relationship needs to be nurtured by politicians in both institutions and I pay tribute to Paul Murphy and David Hanson's efforts in that regard.

ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru fel eu cynrychiolydd yn Senedd y DU. Amlinellais fy rhesymau mewn llythyr atynt hwy ac at ganghennau'r Blaid Lafur yng nghanolbarth a gorllewin Cymru. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni fod yn glir. Nid wyf yn troi fy nghefn ar y Cynulliad ac yn sicr nid ar Gymru. Fel y dangosodd yr wythnos diwethaf eto, mae ffordd bell i fynd cyn i'r Cynulliad ddod â'i berthynas â Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i lawn aeddfedrwydd. Mae angen meithrin y berthynas hon gan wleidyddion yn y ddau sefydliad a rhoddaf deyrnged i ymdrechion Paul Murphy a David Hanson yn hynny o beth.

This Assembly is not a sovereign institution, nor should it be. It is a devolved body that must earn respect. It is of equal importance for men and women of vision and maturity to represent Wales at both levels of Government. As we have seen too often in this Chamber, it is easier to stir up discontent and discord than to broker agreement. Megaphone diplomacy is not the way to represent Wales unless you want the relationship to fail. That is why I deeply and sincerely believe that nationalism remains the greatest threat to devolution, slightly ahead of other forms of conservatism.

Nid sefydliad sofran yw'r Cynulliad hwn, ac ni ddylai fod ychwaith. Corff datganoledig ydyw y mae'n rhaid iddo ennill parch. Mae yr un mor bwysig i ddynion a gwragedd â gweledigaeth ac aeddfedrwydd gynrychioli Cymru ar y ddwy lefel o Lywodraeth. Fel y gwelsom yn rhy aml yn y Siambr hon, mae'n haws corddi drwgdeimlad ac anghydfod na sicrhau cytundeb. Nid diplomyddiaeth y corn siarad yw'r ffordd i gynrychioli Cymru oni bai fod arnoch eisiau i'r berthynas fethu. Dyna pam y credaf yn ddwys a diffuant mai cenedlaetholdeb yw'r bygythiad mwyaf i ddatganoli o hyd, ychydig ar y blaen i ffurfiau eraill ar geidwadaeth.

I leave, therefore, with a plea to true patriotism, a plea for all Members of the Assembly to understand that devolution is a settled and exciting place in which you have the opportunity to deliver dynamic devolution. That is not only my vision but one which was nurtured by visionaries such as Keir Hardie, Jim Griffiths, Emrys Jones, John Morris, John Reynolds and Labour leaders of more recent times.

Gadawaf, felly, gyda phle i wir wladgarwyr, ple ar i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad ddeall fod datganoli'n lle sefydlog a chyffrous lle cewch y cyfle i gyflwyno datganoli deinamig. Nid fy ngweledigaeth i yn unig yw hynny, ond un a arddelwyd gan weledwyr megis Keir Hardie, Jim Griffiths, Emrys Jones, John Morris, John Reynolds ac arweinwyr Llafur cyfnodau mwy diweddar.

I hope that there will be increasing realisation that Assembly Members alone cannot deliver devolution. You need to develop the vibrant partnership with people in business, the voluntary sector, the community sector and local government for which the structures were put in place during my time as First Secretary. That needs more than lip service. It needs a personal and sustained commitment to partnership from all Assembly Members. You must work with the 40 Members of Parliament who represent

Gobeithiaf y sylweddolir fwyfwy na all Aelodau'r Cynulliad eu hunain gyflwyno datganoli. Mae angen ichi ddatblygu'r bartneriaeth fyw gyda phobl mewn busnes, y sector gwirfoddol, y sector cymunedol a llywodraeth leol, y sefydlwyd y fframweithiau ar eu cyfer yn ystod fy nghyfnod fel Prif Ysgrifennydd. Mae angen mwy na sylw arwynebol ar hynny. Mae angen ymrwymiad personol a dyfalbarhaus i bartneriaeth gan holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Rhaid ichi weithio gyda'r 40 Aelod Seneddol

Welsh constituencies. My continuing contribution to Welsh politics will include trying to develop that as a two-way understanding.

sydd yn cynrychioli etholaethau yng Nghymru. Bydd fy nghyfraniad parhaus i wleidyddiaeth Cymru'n cynnwys ymgais i ddatblygu hynny fel dealltwriaeth ddwy ffordd.

As a passionate advocate of devolution, my enthusiasm has not dimmed. I will be as passionate an advocate of devolution as I have been in the past three decades of my life in Welsh politics. Call me a hopeless romantic if you will, but despite some of the evidence of the last three months, I believe in the Assembly's potential and I want to applaud your success. Please, colleagues, make us proud, make Wales proud, by rising above petty conflicts to rekindle the sense of purpose and destiny that marked our official opening.

Fel lladmerydd brwd dros ddatganoli, ni phallodd fy mrwdfrydedd. Dadleuaf mor angerddol dros ddatganoli ag a wneuthum yn nhri degawd diwethaf fy mywyd yng ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru. Gallwch fy ngalw'n rhamantydd anobeithiol os mynnwch, ond er gwaethaf peth o dystiolaeth y tri mis diwethaf, credaf ym mhotensial y Cynulliad a hoffwn gymeradwyo'ch llwyddiant. Da chi, gyd-Aelodau, gwnewch ni'n falch, gwnewch Gymru'n falch, drwy godi uwchlaw mân gecru i ailgynnau'r ymdeimlad o bwrpas a thynged a nodweddodd ein hagoriad swyddogol.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd (Rhodri Morgan): Ar ran y Cynulliad, diolchaf i Alun am y ffordd y mae wedi dweud ffarwél wrthym, oherwydd heddiw yw'r Cyfarfod Llawn olaf cyn toriad y Pasg ac erbyn diwedd y toriad bydd Alun wedi ymddiswyddo o'r Cynulliad a dychwelyd i San Steffan.

The First Secretary (Rhodri Morgan): On behalf of the Assembly, I thank Alun for the way that he has said farewell to us, as today is the last Plenary before the Easter recess and by the end of the recess Alun will have resigned from the Assembly and returned to Westminster.

I thank Alun for his positive message today in saying farewell to the Assembly as a Member. However, he is not saying farewell to the business matters that will come before the Assembly, or the hopes that everybody in Wales has for its future as an effective body that runs the domestic agenda on behalf of the three million of us who live in Wales. I thank Alun in the same spirit for his incredibly hard work in helping to establish the Assembly in its transitional phase, as he was the last Secretary of State for Wales to carry out the traditional duties of the 1964 to 1999 period of the office of Secretary of State for Wales and the first First Secretary of the Assembly. I also thank him for giving a strong indication that he wants to be an effective advocate for all Welsh matters and those that relate to the Assembly when he returns to Westminster. He is right: we will need strong and effective bridges between the Taff and the Thames in the future. He has promised to be one of those bridges and I look forward to working with him in the future, even though our roles may be slightly different.

Diolchaf i Alun am ei neges gadarnhaol heddiw wrth ffarwelio â'r Cynulliad fel Aelod. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ffarwelio â'r materion busnes a ddaw gerbron y Cynulliad, nac â'r gobeithion sydd gan bawb yng Nghymru ar gyfer dyfodol y Cynulliad fel corff effeithiol a fydd yn rhedeg yr agenda gartref ar ran y tair miliwn ohonom sydd yn byw yng Nghymru. Diolchaf i Alun yn yr un ysbryd am ei waith anhygoel o ddygn wrth helpu i sefydlu'r Cynulliad yn ei gyfnod trawsnewidiol, gan mai ef oedd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol olaf Cymru i gyflawni dyletswyddau traddodiadol swydd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a fodolai rhwng 1964 ac 1999, a Phrif Ysgrifennydd cyntaf y Cynulliad. Diolchaf iddo hefyd am roi arwydd cryf ei fod am fod yn lladmerydd effeithiol dros bopeth Cymreig a thros faterion sydd a wnelont â'r Cynulliad pan ddychwela i San Steffan. Y mae'n iawn: byddwn angen pontydd cryf ac effeithiol rhwng Taf a Thafwys yn y dyfodol. Mae wedi addo bod yn un o'r pontydd hynny ac edrychaf ymlaen at gydweithio ag ef yn y dyfodol, er y bydd ein rolau efallai ychydig

yn wahanol.

Alun, diolch yn fawr ichi am bopeth.

Alun, thank you very much for everything.

Y Llywydd: Ar ran y Cynulliad cyfan, eiliaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Rhodri. Diolch, Alun, am eich cyfraniad allweddol yn sefydliad y corff hwn a dymunaf yn dda ichi a'ch teulu yn y dyfodol.

The Presiding Officer: On behalf of the whole Assembly, I second what Rhodri said. Thank you, Alun, for your key contribution in setting up this body and I wish you and your family well for the future.

Cwestiynau i'r Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol a Thai
Questions to the Secretary for Local Government and Housing

Grant Refeniw Tai â Chymorth
Supported Housing Revenue Grant

Q1 Christine Humphreys: What consideration has been given to varying the percentage of supported housing revenue grant paid to foyer projects in Wales? (OAQ4746)

C1 Christine Humphreys: Pa ystyriaeth a roddwyd i amrywio'r canrannau o grant refeniw tai â chymorth a roddir i brosiectau *foyer* yng Nghymru? (OAQ4746)

The Secretary for Local Government and Housing (Peter Law): The first two foyers in Wales are in Swansea and Wrexham. I know that Wrexham is close to your heart and part of your constituency, Christine. Wrexham received a supported housing revenue grant allocation for 20 of its 40 bed spaces, and Swansea received an allocation for 15 out of 33. This is based on an inherited policy, which I am reviewing following a meeting of the Local Government and Environment Committee in Wrexham earlier this year. The cash amounts exceed £76,000 and £58,000 for Wrexham and Swansea respectively in the current year. Nonetheless, both foyers have revenue deficits. Having met with representatives of the foyer network in Wales to discuss their problems and possible solutions, I will consider this further.

Yr Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol a Thai (Peter Law): Mae'r ddau *foyer* cyntaf yng Nghymru yn Abertawe a Wrecsam. Gwn fod Wrecsam yn agos at eich calon ac yn rhan o'ch etholaeth, Christine. Cafodd Wrecsam ddyraniad grant refeniw tai â chymorth ar gyfer 20 o'i 40 o leoedd gwely, a chafodd Abertawe ddyraniad ar gyfer 15 allan o 33. Mae hyn yn seiliedig ar bolisi a etifeddwyd, yr wyf yn ei adolygu yn sgîl cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd yn Wrecsam yn gynharach eleni. Mae'r symiau ariannol yn fwy na £76,000 i Wrecsam a £58,000 i Abertawe yn y flwyddyn gyfredol. Serch hynny, mae diffyg refeniw gan y naill *foyer* a'r llall. Wedi cyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr y rhwydwaith *foyer* yng Nghymru i drafod eu problemau ac atebion posibl, fe ystyriaf hyn ymhellach.

Christine Humphreys: One of the difficulties is the prediction that only 50 per cent of people resident in the foyers will require counselling and support. Evidence shows that tenants cannot be placed neatly into such categories and that the majority, if not all, require some degree of support. Will you consider this when carrying out your review?

Christine Humphreys: Un o'r anawsterau yw'r broffwydoliaeth mai dim ond 50 y cant o drigolion y *foyers* fydd angen cwnsela a chefnogaeth. Dengys tystiolaeth na ellir gosod tenantiaid yn dwt i gategorïau o'r fath ac y bydd y mwyafrif, os nad pob un, angen rhyw gymaint o gefnogaeth. A wnewch ystyried hyn wrth wneud eich adolygiad?

2:10 p.m.

Peter Law: I will. Foyers can make a

Peter Law: Gwnaf. Gall *foyers* wneud

positive contribution to helping disadvantaged youngsters in their transition to independence. It is important that life skills training and employment opportunities are joined up with appropriate and integrated housing. I will take that into account. I pay tribute to the Wrexham foyer for the work it has done in fundraising. It has a strong committee that works hard and raised, I think, £50,000 over the last year. That is £1,000 a week. It is a lot of money to raise weekly. However, there is a problem with funding here. We learn as we go along and I will look at this carefully in future.

cyfraniad cadarnhaol i helpu ieuenctid difreintiedig wrth iddynt ymgyrraedd at annibyniaeth. Mae'n bwysig fod hyfforddiant sgiliau bywyd a chyfleoedd cyflogaeth yn cael eu cydgysylltu â thai priodol ac integredig. Cymeraf hynny i ystyriaeth. Talaf deyrnged i *foyer* Wrecsam am y gwaith a wnaeth i godi arian. Mae ganddo bwyllgor cryf a gweithgar a gododd, yr wyf yn meddwl, £50,000 yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Mae hynny'n £1,000 yr wythnos. Mae'n arian mawr i'w godi'n wythnosol. Fodd bynnag, mae problem gydag arian yn y fan hon. Dysgwn wrth inni fynd yn ein blaen ac edrychaf ar hyn yn ofalus yn y dyfodol.

Janet Davies: Given that the foyer movement is an important tool for the support and training of young people, do you have access to research into the most cost-effective ways of providing such support and training?

Janet Davies: O gofio bod y mudiad *foyer* yn arf pwysig ar gyfer cefnogi a hyfforddi pobl ifanc, a oes gennych fynediad at waith ymchwil i'r ffyrdd mwyaf cost-effeithiol o ddarparu cefnogaeth a hyfforddiant o'r fath?

Peter Law: As I said in my reply to the last question, we learn as we go along. I certainly want to learn as quickly as possible and the best way that I can do that is to meet people at the cutting edge in the foyers. I had a useful meeting in Wrexham with the foyer network to hear about the research that has been done and the new foyer that has recently opened in Newtown. I also heard about a foyer that no one knew existed, which is in Port Talbot and which we do not fund at present. It is run by the Young Men's Christian Association. Even Peter Black was surprised to hear about it. For once, I was able to trump him and tell him a fact about Port Talbot that he did not know. I will visit that foyer shortly. It is a good initiative and I compliment the YMCA on it. More research needs to be done and I will talk to the foyer network along with Assembly officials and the Welsh Local Government Association to find the best way forward for this interesting concept.

Peter Law: Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i'r cwestiwn diwethaf, yr ydym yn dysgu wrth fynd yn ein blaenau. Yn sicr mae arnaf eisiau dysgu cyn gynted ag y bo modd, a'r ffordd orau imi wneud hynny yw cyfarfod pobl ar flaen y gad yn y *foyers*. Cefais gyfarfod buddiol yn Wrecsam gyda'r rhwydwaith *foyer* i glywed am yr ymchwil a wnaethpwyd a'r *foyer* newydd a agorwyd yn ddiweddar yn y Drenewydd. Clywais hefyd am *foyer* na wyddai neb ei fod yn bodoli, ym Mhort Talbot, nad yw'n derbyn arian gennym ar hyn o bryd. Caiff ei redeg gan y Gymdeithas Gristnogol Dynion Ieuainc. Yr oedd hyd yn oed Peter Black wedi synnu o glywed amdano. Am unwaith, yr oeddwn yn gallu ei drympio a dweud ffaith wrtho am Bort Talbot nad oedd yn wybyddus iddo. Byddaf yn ymweld â'r *foyer* hwnnw cyn bo hir. Mae'n fenter dda a hoffwn longyfarch y Gymdeithas Gristnogol Dynion Ieuainc arni. Mae angen gwneud mwy o ymchwil, a byddaf yn siarad â'r rhwydwaith *foyer* ynghyd â swyddogion y Cynulliad a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i ganfod y ffordd orau ymlaen ar gyfer y cysyniad diddorol hwn.

Adolygiad o'r Fformwla Asesu Gwariant Safonol
Review of the Standard Spending Assessment Formula

Q2 Pauline Jarman: Will Peter Law set a date for a progress report on the review of the

C2 Pauline Jarman: A wnaiff Peter Law bennu dyddiad ar gyfer cyflwyno adroddiad

standard spending assessment formula to be presented to the Assembly? (OAQ4769) [R]

i'r Cynulliad ar hynt yr adolygiad o'r fformwla asesu gwariant safonol? (OAQ4769) [R]

Peter Law: This is a subject close to my heart. A progress report was given to the Local Government and Housing Committee members on 5 April. The Committee will have two further opportunities to discuss the review. In June it will discuss the final report of the distribution sub-group, the working group responsible for taking forward the review, and in the autumn the outcome of our consultation on the review will be considered by the Local Government and Housing Committee again.

Peter Law: Dyma bwnc agos at fy nghalon. Rhoddwyd adroddiad ar hynt yr adolygiad i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar 5 Ebrill. Caiff y Pwyllgor ddau gyfle pellach i drafod yr adolygiad. Ym mis Mehefin bydd yn trafod adroddiad terfynol yr is-grŵp dosbarthu, sef y gweithgor sydd yn gyfrifol am symud yr adolygiad ymlaen, ac yn yr hydref ystyrir canlyniad ein hymgynghoriad ar yr adolygiad gan y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai eto.

Pauline Jarman: The history of the standard spending assessment is a classic example of centralisation, which has left us with a complex system that is difficult to change. Does the Assembly Secretary agree that we need to avoid introducing a new formula that would centralise further and thus result in a failure to increase local accountability and reinvigorate local democracy? Also, does he support or oppose the concept of plan-based or performance-related funding as a means to obtain value for money from local government?

Pauline Jarman: Mae hanes yr asesiad gwariant safonol yn enghraifft glasurol o ganoli, sydd wedi'n gadael â system gymhleth sydd yn anodd ei newid. A yw'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad yn cytuno fod angen inni osgoi cyflwyno fformwla newydd a fyddai'n canoli ymhellach ac felly'n golygu na ellid cynyddu atebolrwydd lleol ac adfywio democratiaeth leol? Hefyd, a ydyw'n cefnogi ynteu'n gwrthwynebu cysyniad ariannu ar sail cynllun neu yn ôl perfformiad fel modd o sicrhau gwerth am arian gan lywodraeth leol?

Peter Law: On the latter, I think that it is reasonable to have plan-based funding to a degree, because we need to know where we are going and because communities want to be able to question local authorities about what value for money they can provide in their areas. That is only one part of a whole.

Peter Law: Ar yr olaf, yr wyf yn meddwl ei bod yn rhesymol cael ariannu ar sail cynllun i raddau, oherwydd mae angen inni wybod i ble yr ydym yn mynd ac oherwydd bod cymunedau eisiau gallu holi awdurdodau lleol ynghylch pa werth am arian y gallant ei ddarparu yn eu hardaloedd. Dim ond un rhan o gyfanrwydd yw hynny.

I agree with what has been said by almost everyone in this Chamber, that we need a review of the SSA. The sooner we have that review, the better. I was grateful to the WLGA for agreeing with the Welsh Office for the review to take place. Unfortunately it was not ready by this year. It is intended that it will be ready by next year, hence the consultation dates that I have read out. Hopefully we will all be able to see a fairer and more equitable distribution of resources for the good work that local authorities do.

Cytunaf gyda'r hyn a ddywedwyd gan bron bawb yn y Siambr hon, ein bod angen adolygiad o'r asesiad gwariant safonol. Gorau po gyntaf y cawn yr adolygiad hwnnw. Yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru am gytuno gyda'r Swyddfa Gymreig i'r adolygiad ddigwydd. Yn anffodus nid oedd yn barod erbyn eleni. Bwriedir y bydd yn barod erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, yn ôl y dyddiadau ymgynghori a ddarllenais ichi. Gobeithio y byddwn i gyd yn gallu gweld dosbarthiad adnoddau tecach a mwy cyfiawn ar gyfer y gwaith da a wneir gan awdurdodau lleol.

David Davies: Does the Secretary accept that the last local government settlement led to a calamitous rise in council tax bills for people living in Monmouthshire? Will he give an assurance that, if that formula is reworked, it will be reworked to take proper account of the costs of delivering services in a large rural area? At the same time, can he assure those council tax payers, some of whom I will address tonight, that they will never again have to suffer a similar rise in council tax as a result of the mismanagement of four Labour-run authorities and of a formula that punishes efficient rural councils such as Monmouthshire?

David Davies: A yw'r Ysgrifennydd yn derbyn fod y cytundeb llywodraeth leol diwethaf wedi arwain at godiad trychinebus mewn biliau treth cyngor i bobl sydd yn byw yn Sir Fynwy? A wnaiff roi sicrwydd, os yw'r fformwla honno i gael ei hailgyfrif, y'i hailgyfrifir i roi ystyriaeth briodol i gostau darparu gwasanaethau mewn ardal wledig fawr? Ar yr un pryd, a all sicrhau'r talwyr trethi cyngor hynny, y byddaf yn annerch rhai ohonynt heno, na fydd rhaid iddynt byth eto ddioddef codiad tebyg mewn treth cyngor o ganlyniad i gamreolaeth pedwar awdurdod a arweinir gan Lafur a fformwla sydd yn cosbi cynghorau gwledig effeithlon fel Sir Fynwy?

Peter Law: Your continuing peddling of this misinformation does nothing for the Assembly, local government or Monmouthshire County Council and its council tax payers. It is incorrect to blame those four authorities. I have told you that time and again, and I repeat it today. This is not their fault; they are not overspending authorities. They are not spendthrift authorities and their debts are not being paid for them. They are subject to an inherited formula that is not working properly. It has been out of step with local government for about the last five years, hence the reason for the damping grant. The reason in Monmouthshire—

Peter Law: Nid yw'r ffaith eich bod yn dal i bedlera'r anwireddau hyn yn gwneud lles i'r Cynulliad, llywodraeth leol na Chyngor Sir Fynwy a'i drethdalwyr. Mae'n anghywir beio'r pedwar awdurdod hynny. Dywedais hynny wrthych droeon, ac fe'i hailadroddaf heddiw. Nid eu bai hwy yw hyn; nid ydynt yn awdurdodau sydd yn gorwario. Nid ydynt yn awdurdodau afradlon ac nid yw eu dyledion yn cael eu talu drostynt. Maent yn dioddef o fformwla a etifeddwyd nad yw'n gweithio'n iawn. Mae'r fformwla allan ohoni o safbwynt llywodraeth leol ers rhyw bum mlynedd bellach, a dyna pam y rhoddwyd y grant lleddfu. Y rheswm yn Sir Fynwy—

Michael German: It was put in place by the Conservative Government.

Michael German: Y Llywodraeth Geidwadol a'i sefydlodd.

Peter Law: David Davies should remember that, but the Conservatives always have a short memory. I have noticed that, Mike. I have mentioned Monmouthshire's situation before. The reason is due to the Welsh Local Government Association's request. We brought in total standard spending for councils in line with budgets. That is a long-standing request. We introduced it this year and it caused a blip in Monmouthshire because of the many high-banded houses, Gs and Hs. That caused a ripple effect on the grant, which explains why it has happened. It is unfortunate, but it is just one of those situations. However, Monmouthshire County Council is a member of the WLGA. We complied with its request. I hope that the matter will settle down next year. However, by working through the Assembly and the

Peter Law: Dylai David Davies gofio hynny, ond cof byr fu gan y Ceidwadwyr erioed. Yr wyf wedi sylwi ar hynny, Mike. Yr wyf wedi sôn am sefyllfa Sir Fynwy o'r blaen. Mae'r rheswm yn ganlyniad i gais Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Cyflwynasom gyfanswm gwario safonol i gynghorau yn unol â chyllidebau. Dyna gais a fu'n sefyll ers tro byd. Fe'i cyflwynasom eleni ac achosodd broblem yn Sir Fynwy oherwydd y nifer fawr o dai band uchel G ac H. Achosodd hynny effaith adleisiol ar y grant, sydd yn esbonio pam y digwyddodd. Mae'n anffodus, ond fel yna y mae pethau weithiau. Fodd bynnag, mae Cyngor Sir Fynwy'n aelod o Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Cydymffurfiasom â chais y Gymdeithas. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y mater setlo i lawr y flwyddyn nesaf. Fodd bynnag, drwy weithio

WLGA, everyone is getting the best value that we can make available to them.

drwy'r Cynulliad a'r Gymdeithas, mae pawb yn cael y gwerth gorau y gallwn ei ddarparu iddynt.

The Presiding Officer: Before I call Peter Black to ask question 3, I wish to note that I had hoped that this afternoon we could have rehearsed for after Easter, when we will have sharper questions and answers.

Y Llywydd: Cyn imi alw ar Peter Black i ofyn cwestiwn 3, hoffwn nodi fy mod wedi gobeithio y buasem wedi gallu cael ymarfer y prynhawn yma ar gyfer wedi'r Pasg, pan gawn gwestiynau ac atebion mwy cryno.

Shelter Cymru (Trafodaethau)
Shelter Cymru (Discussions)

Q3 Peter Black: What discussions has Peter Law had with organisations such as Shelter Cymru regarding homelessness in Wales? (OAQ4747)

C3 Peter Black: Pa drafodaethau y mae Peter Law wedi eu cynnal â mudiadau fel Shelter Cymru ynglŷn â digartrefedd yng Nghymru? (OAQ4747)

Peter Law: Thank you, Peter, for the general support that you have always given on homelessness and rooflessness. I also thank the Committee for the good work that it has carried out on this subject. Since being appointed to my post last May, I have spent a lot of time visiting voluntary organisations. The first conference I attended was for Shelter. I have travelled all around the country and seen how dedicated these organisations are in helping the homeless through the provision of hostels and night shelters, bond boards, resettlement and support services, outreach work and floating support. I pay tribute to those organisations for the fine work that they do.

Peter Law: Diolch, Peter, am y gefnogaeth gyffredinol a roesoch bob amser ar fater digartrefedd a chysgu ar y stryd. Diolch i'r Pwyllgor hefyd am y gwaith da a gyflawnodd ar y pwnc hwn. Ers fy mhenodi i'm swydd fis Mai diwethaf, yr wyf wedi treulio llawer o amser yn ymweld â sefydliadau gwirfoddol. Cynhadledd gan Shelter oedd yr un gyntaf imi ei mynychu. Yr wyf wedi teithio dros y wlad i gyd ac wedi gweld mor ymroddgar yw'r cyrff hyn o ran helpu'r digartref drwy ddarparu hosteli a llochesi nos, byrddau bondiau, gwasanaethau adsefydlu a chefnogi, gwaith ymestyn allan a chefnogaeth arnofiol. Talaf deyrnged i'r cyrff hynny am y gwaith ardderchog a wneir ganddynt.

Peter Black: Would you agree with the sentiments expressed by John Puzey, Director of Shelter Cymru, at a meeting I attended at the weekend? Although the extra money for homelessness is welcome, until the Assembly puts housing at the centre of its agenda and starts to increase the amount of money available in this area, we will not have a proper strategy to deal with its impact on health and education.

Peter Black: A fyddech yn cytuno â sylwadau John Puzey, Cyfarwyddwr Shelter Cymru, mewn cyfarfod a fynychais dros y penwythnos? Er y croesewir yr arian ychwanegol ar gyfer digartrefedd, hyd nes bo'r Cynulliad yn rhoi tai ar ganol ei agenda ac yn dechrau cynyddu'r arian sydd ar gael yn y maes hwn, ni fydd gennym strategaeth briodol i ddelio â'i effaith ar iechyd ac addysg.

Peter Law: The Government of Wales places great importance on housing generally. That has been shown in the discussions and debates that we have had. I am proud to say that we have increased the homeless and roofless budget to a record figure this year. It has increased to 75 per cent, recognising problems that, perhaps, other people denied in the past, but there is no doubt that they

Peter Law: Mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n gosod pwysigrwydd mawr ar dai yn gyffredinol. Dangoswyd hynny yn y trafodaethau a'r dadleuon a gawsom. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud ein bod wedi cynyddu cyllideb digartrefedd a chysgu ar y stryd eleni i swm uwch nag erioed o'r blaen. Mae wedi cynyddu i 75 y cant, gan gydnabod problemau a wadwyd, efallai, gan bobl eraill

exist. The Finance Secretary made available a special allocation of £3.6 million for next year to deal with social exclusion, which, I am glad to say, all parties have supported. That is a measure of how this Government is fighting to tackle housing problems generally and the social exclusion that comes when people have no roof over their heads. We are dealing with it positively.

yn y gorffennol, ond sydd yn bodoli heb ronyn o amheuaeth. Darparodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid ddyraniad arbennig o £3.6 miliwn ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf i ddelio ag allgáu cymdeithasol, rhywbeth a gefnogwyd, mae'n dda gennyf ddweud, gan bob plaid. Dyna fesur o sut y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn ymladd yn erbyn problemau tai yn gyffredinol a'r allgáu cymdeithasol sydd yn digwydd pan nad oes gan bobl do dros eu pennau. Yr ydym yn delio ag ef yn gadarnhaol.

Janet Ryder: Would you agree with me that one group of potentially homeless people are the young people who live in care and move on at the age of 18 into independent living? That issue was highlighted in the Waterhouse report and it has also been highlighted in the Children (Leaving Care) Bill. What do you intend to do to ensure that the strategies that councils put in place to help prevent homelessness, especially among this vulnerable group, work?

Janet Ryder: A fyddech yn cytuno â mi mai un grŵp o bobl a all fod yn ddigartref yw'r bobl ifanc sydd yn byw mewn gofal ac sydd yn symud ymlaen yn 18 oed i fyw'n annibynnol? Tanlinellwyd hynny yn adroddiad Waterhouse ac fe'i hamlygwyd hefyd yn y Mesur Plant (Gadael Gofal). Beth a fwriadwch ei wneud i sicrhau bod y strategaethau a drefnir gan gynghorau i helpu atal digartrefedd, yn enwedig ymhlith y grŵp bregus hwn, yn gweithio?

Peter Law: I welcome your input as a member of the Local Government and Housing Committee, on the way forward following the Waterhouse report. There are many things to be considered and Jane Hutt and Rosemary Butler, as Assembly Secretaries with responsibility for social services, health and children, will be the key drivers. I am the Secretary for Local Government and Housing and have the responsibility for the funding of local authorities. By working with Welsh local government through the WLGA, and with the input of the Committee and other Assembly Secretaries, we can craft the type of policies necessary to reflect your concerns. Many issues must be discussed in future months.

Peter Law: Croesawaf eich mewnbwn fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, ar y ffordd ymlaen yn dilyn adroddiad Waterhouse. Mae llawer o bethau i'w hystyried, a'r ysgogwyr allweddol fydd Jane Hutt a Rosemary Butler, fel Ysgrifenyddion y Cynulliad â chyfrifoldeb am wasanaethau cymdeithasol, iechyd a phlant. Fi yw'r Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol a Thai a'm cyfrifoldeb i yw ariannu awdurdodau lleol. Drwy weithio gyda llywodraeth leol Cymru drwy Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, a chyda mewnbwn y Pwyllgor ac Ysgrifenyddion Cynulliad eraill, gallwn saernïo'r math o bolisïau sydd yn angenrheidiol i adlewyrchu'ch pryderon. Rhaid trafod sawl mater yn y misoedd sydd i ddod.

David Melding: Will the Secretary look at the model of day centres for homeless people and particularly the joint working that takes place, for example, with primary healthcare, but also the benefits agency, which can have a great impact on this vulnerable group of people?

David Melding: A wnaiff yr Ysgrifennydd edrych ar fodel canolfannau dydd i bobl ddigartref ac yn enwedig y cydweithio sydd yn digwydd, er enghraifft, gyda gofal iechyd sylfaenol, ond hefyd ar yr asiantaeth fudd-daliadau, a all gael effaith fawr ar y grŵp bregus hwn o bobl?

Peter Law: I am grateful to you, David, for mentioning that. In fact, the £3.6 million initiative for social exclusion that we recently

Peter Law: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi, David, am grybwyll hynny. Yn wir, mae'r fenter £3.6 miliwn ar gyfer allgáu

announced to local authorities and voluntary organisations gives them an opportunity to suggest where day hostels may be appropriately provided. I welcome that initiative because we do not have enough day hostels. We only have one full-time day hostel for the whole of Wales, which is the Huggard Centre in Cardiff. They do a wonderful job there and I admire them very much. However, there needs to be similar provision in other major centres of population. I have visited many day hostels and I want to pursue this with your support.

cymdeithasol a gyhoeddwyd gennym yn ddiweddar i awdurdodau lleol a chyrff gwirfoddol yn rhoi cyfle iddynt awgrymu ym mha le y gellid yn briodol ddarparu hosteli dydd. Croesawaf y fenter honno oherwydd nid oes gennym ddigon o hosteli dydd. Dim ond un hostel ddydd lawn-amser sydd gennym i Gymru gyfan, sef Canolfan Huggard yng Nghaerdydd. Gwnânt waith gwych yn y fan honno ac yr wyf yn eu hedmygu'n fawr iawn. Fodd bynnag, mae angen darpariaeth debyg mewn canolfannau eraill â phoblogaeth fawr. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â sawl hostel ddydd a hoffwn ddal ati gyda hyn gyda'ch cefnogaeth chi.

2:20 p.m.

Cynnal a Chadw ac Adfer Parciau
Maintenance and Restoration of Parks

Q4 Nick Bourne: Will Peter Law introduce any plans to assist with the maintenance and restoration of parks in urban areas as part of a wider urban regeneration scheme? (OAQ4756)

C4 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff Peter Law gyflwyno unrhyw gynlluniau i gynorthwyo â chynnal a chadw ac adfer parciau mewn ardaloedd trefol fel rhan o gynllun adfywio trefol ehangach? (OAQ4756)

Peter Law: Improvements to the physical environment, including recreational and open spaces in urban areas, are likely to be eligible for support through the Local Regeneration Fund, provided that proposals form part of integrated local regeneration strategies.

Peter Law: Mae gwelliannau i'r amgylchedd ffisegol, gan gynnwys mannau adloniannol ac agored mewn ardaloedd trefol, yn debygol o fod yn gymwys i gael cymorth drwy'r Gronfa Adfywio Lleol, ar yr amod fod cynlluniau'n ffurfio rhan o strategaethau adfywio lleol integredig.

Nick Bourne: Would the Secretary look at the case of Rock Park in Llandrindod Wells, which I visited recently? It is an excellent local park, which is run by volunteers with a little help from Powys County Council. It would benefit massively from a small injection of funds to help with the terrific tourism potential in the town, as well as providing a green line in the centre of Llandrindod Wells for local residents.

Nick Bourne: A fyddai'r Ysgrifennydd yn edrych ar achos Rock Park yn Llandrindod, lle y bûm yn ddiweddar? Mae'n barc lleol ardderchog, a redir gan wirfoddolwyr gydag ychydig o help gan Gyngor Sir Powys. Byddai'n elwa'n fawr o chwistrelliad bach o gyllid i helpu gyda'r potensial gwych i ddenu ymwelwyr i'r dref, yn ogystal â darparu llain werdd yng nghanol Llandrindod i'r trigolion lleol.

Peter Law: I am impressed with Rock Park at Llandrindod Wells, which I have visited. It is a little gem in Llandrindod Wells, as Llandrindod Wells is a little gem in Powys. I appreciate your point. We have only recently finished consultation on the Local Regeneration Fund, which will hopefully give us the opportunity to bring together many aspects of the community to take the

Peter Law: Yr wyf wrth fy modd gyda Rock Park yn Llandrindod, ac wedi bod yno hefyd. Mae'n em fach yn Llandrindod, yn yr un modd ag y mae Llandrindod yn em fach ym Mhowys. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'ch pwynt. Dim ond yn ddiweddar y gorffenasom ymgynghori ar y Gronfa Adfywio Lleol, a fydd gobeithio yn rhoi'r cyfle inni ddod â sawl agwedd ar y gymuned ynghyd i symud y

best schemes forward and to help them. The Heritage Lottery Fund has helped Rock Park at Llandrindod Wells, and I hope that we can do something positive to help in the future. If you would like to write to me about it, I would be pleased to respond.

cynlluniau gorau yn eu blaenau a'u helpu. Mae Cronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri wedi helpu Rock Park yn Llandrindod, a gobeithiaf y gallwn ni wneud rhywbeth cadarnhaol i helpu yn y dyfodol. Pe hoffech ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â hynny, byddwn yn falch o ymateb.

Brian Hancock: Many of our most deprived communities have witnessed the closure of recreation and play facilities. Given that it has been proven that good recreational and leisure facilities have a positive impact—that includes reducing youth crime—on the social well-being of our communities, does he agree that continued and sustained investment in play equipment and parks should form a part of a more comprehensive approach to community planning within Wales?

Brian Hancock: Mae llawer o'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig wedi gweld cau cyfleusterau hamdden a chwarae. O gofio y profwyd fod cyfleusterau hamdden a chwarae da yn cael effaith gadarnhaol—gan gynnwys lleihau troseddu gan bobl ifanc—ar les gymdeithasol ein cymunedau, a yw'n cytuno y dylai buddsoddiad parhaus a chyson mewn offer chwarae a pharciau ffurfio rhan o agwedd fwy cynhwysfawr at gynllunio cymunedol o fewn Cymru?

Peter Law: Green spaces and sustainable development are very important. The sum of £8.1 million is available in Wales from the New Opportunities Fund to help rural and urban communities to understand, improve and care for the environment by promoting access to green spaces of educational, recreational and environmental value and encouraging small community based projects. I agree with you and I want to take every opportunity to encourage such schemes. I look forward to Members like yourself being proactive in bringing them to my attention.

Peter Law: Mae lleiniau glas a datblygu cynaliadwy'n bwysig dros ben. Mae swm o £8.1 miliwn ar gael yng Nghymru o'r Gronfa Cyfleoedd Newydd i helpu cymunedau gwledig a threfol i ddeall, gwella a gofalu am yr amgylchedd drwy hyrwyddo mynediad i leoedd gwyrdd o werth addysgol, adloniannol ac amgylcheddol ac annog prosiectau bychain seiliedig yn y gymuned. Cytunaf â chi a hoffwn fanteisio ar bob cyfle i annog cynlluniau o'r fath. Edrychaf ymlaen i Aelodau fel chi weithredu'n rhagweithiol i ddod â hwy i'm sylw.

Cwestiynau i Ysgrifennydd yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth
Questions to the Secretary for the Environment, Planning and Transport

Hybu Arfer Gorau o ran Ailgylchu Defnyddiau a Nwyddau
Encouraging Best Practice in the Recycling of Materials and Goods

Q1 John Griffiths: What strategy will be followed to encourage best practice across Wales in the recycling of material and goods? (OAQ4751)

C1 John Griffiths: Pa strategaeth y bwriedir ei dilyn i hybu arfer gorau ledled Cymru o ran ailgylchu defnyddiau a nwyddau? (OAQ4751)

The Secretary for the Environment, Planning and Transport (Sue Essex): I hope that Michael Meacher and myself will publish the waste strategy for England and Wales shortly. This will set out the broad framework within which waste policy is expected to develop over the next 20 years. However, I am already committed to the development of a more detailed implementation strategy in 2001-02, which

Ysgrifennydd yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth (Sue Essex): Gobeithiaf y bydd Michael Meacher a mi'n cyhoeddi'r strategaeth gwastraff i Gymru a Lloegr cyn bo hir. Bydd hon yn amlinellu'r fframwaith bras y disgwylir i bolisi gwastraff ddatblygu o'i fewn dros yr 20 mlynedd nesaf. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf eisoes wedi ymrwymo i ddatblygu strategaeth weithredu fwy manwl yn 2001-02, a fydd yn canolbwyntio'n fwy

will focus more specifically on Welsh circumstances. It will include policies aimed at improving the level of recycling in Wales, and draw upon experience of best practice.

penodol ar amgylchiadau Cymru. Bydd yn cynnwys polisïau wedi'u hanelu at wella lefel ailgylchu yng Nghymru, ac yn manteisio ar brofiad o arfer gorau.

John Griffiths: The situation is very patchy across Wales. We are not good at recycling so there is a lot to be done. In my constituency, Newport County Borough Council has introduced fairly progressive policies in terms of the green box scheme, and Wastesavers is active in recycling household furniture. I am sure that you are aware of that, Sue. It would be useful if we had some idea of what is going on across Wales so that we could spread best practice.

John Griffiths: Mae'r sefyllfa'n ddarniog iawn ar draws Cymru. Nid ydym yn dda am ailgylchu felly mae llawer i'w wneud. Yn fy etholaeth, mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Casnewydd wedi cyflwyno polisïau eithaf blaengar yn nhermau'r cynllun blwch gwyrdd, ac mae Wastesavers yn brysur yn ailgylchu dodrefn tŷ. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o hynny, Sue. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bai gennym ryw syniad o'r hyn sydd yn digwydd ar draws Cymru fel y gallem ledaenu arfer da.

Sue Essex: We are not meeting recycling targets. There are historic reasons for that. However, we have some good examples in Wales where local authorities and voluntary agencies have got together to pioneer new ways. Your local patch, Newport, has some excellent examples. Local authorities have the responsibility through their recycling plans. However, if we are to make a difference, we must get sustainable plans that support voluntary activities locally. This is where people see the benefits of what they are doing. In addition, it must be something that is consistently worked through and applied over a long term. That will be the key to meeting our recycling targets in the long term.

Sue Essex: Nid ydym yn cyrraedd targedau ailgylchu. Mae rhesymau hanesyddol dros hynny. Fodd bynnag, y mae gennym rai enghreifftiau da yng Nghymru lle mae awdurdodau lleol ac asiantaethau gwirfoddol wedi dod at ei gilydd i arloesi gyda ffyrdd newydd. Mae rhai enghreifftiau rhagorol yn eich ardal leol chi, Casnewydd. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb gan awdurdodau lleol drwy eu cynlluniau ailgylchu. Fodd bynnag, os ydym am wneud gwahaniaeth, rhaid inni gael cynlluniau cynaliadwy a fydd yn cefnogi gweithgareddau gwirfoddol yn lleol. Dyma lle mae pobl yn gweld budd yr hyn y maent yn ei wneud. Yn ogystal, rhaid iddo fod yn rhywbeth y gweithir drwyddo yn gyson ac a weithredir dros dymor hir. Dyna fydd yr allwedd i gwrdd â'n targedau ailgylchu yn y tymor hir.

Jocelyn Davies: Sustainable waste management must be one of our priorities. However, how can we make the right choices about recycling and reuse without accurate data produced in Wales? What steps are being taken to ensure that we have that information in advance of the waste conference in the autumn?

Jocelyn Davies: Rhaid i reolaeth gwastraff gynaliadwy fod yn flaenoriaeth gennym. Fodd bynnag, sut y gallwn wneud y dewisiadau iawn ynghylch ailgylchu ac ailddefnyddio heb gael data cywir wedi'u cynhyrchu yng Nghymru? Pa gamau a gymerir i sicrhau y cawn yr wybodaeth honno cyn y gynhadledd ar wastraff yn yr hydref?

Sue Essex: I agree that there is a paucity of good information about waste. There are examples in Wales of sites that have been landfilled although we do not know what waste is in them. We are setting up a waste unit which brings together people from the Environment Agency, local government and

Sue Essex: Cytunaf fod prinder mawr o wybodaeth dda am wastraff. Y mae enghreifftiau yng Nghymru o safleoedd a gafodd eu tirlenwi er na wyddom pa wastraff sydd ynddynt. Yr ydym yn sefydlu uned reoli gwastraff a fydd yn dod â phobl o Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, llywodraeth leol a'r

the Assembly. By pulling information together we can try and rectify that. If we are to know whether we are meeting our targets, we need accurate information. I hope that we will have a way forward before the conference in October that you mentioned.

Cynulliad ynghyd. Wrth gyfuno gwybodaeth gallwn geisio unioni hyn. Os ydym am wybod a ydym yn cyrraedd ein targedau, mae angen gwybodaeth gywir arnom. Gobeithiaf y byddwn wedi cymryd camau mawr ymlaen cyn y gynhadledd honno y sonioch amdani ym mis Hydref.

Janice Gregory: Will you join me in congratulating the Bridgend Environmental Educators Partnership, affectionately known as BEEP, in its creation of an innovative environmental education website? I attended the launch on Monday 10 April. This website was created by Bridgend County Borough Council, the major partner, and local environmental partnerships such as Groundwork Bridgend and local schools.

Janice Gregory: A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Partneriaeth Addysgwyr Amgylcheddol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, neu BEEP fel y'i gelwir, am greu gwefan addysg amgylcheddol arloesol? Mynychais y cyfarfod lansio ddydd Llun 10 Ebrill. Crëwyd y wefan hon gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, y prif bartner, a phartneriaethau amgylcheddol lleol fel Groundwork Bridgend ac ysgolion lleol.

Sue Essex: Let us hope that they will beep loudly in the future. If we are to make this leap forward it is important that we engage the younger generation and that they see the links between costs and benefits. Keep Wales Tidy has made this week national spring clean week. I was in Merthyr Tydfil this morning taking part in a litter pick. However, what was important for the children was that they were collecting cans for which money would go towards their school and they would be able to use that money. They were forcibly reminded of the costs of dumping their waste and dropping it, often without thinking, and the benefit of keeping that waste. I support that forward-thinking project in Bridgend.

Sue Essex: Gobeithiwn y clywir eu *beep* yn uchel yn y dyfodol. Os ydym am gymryd y naid hon ymlaen mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cynnwys y to iau a'u bod hwy'n gweld y cysylltiadau rhwng costau a manteision. Mae Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus wedi cyhoeddi bod yr wythnos hon yn wythnos genedlaethol glanhau blynyddol. Yr oeddwn ym Merthyr Tudful y bore yma yn cymryd rhan mewn cyrch codi sbwriel. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn oedd yn bwysig i'r plant oedd eu bod yn casglu caniau a fyddai'n ennill arian i'w hysgol ac y byddent yn gallu defnyddio'r arian hwnnw. Cawsant eu hatgoffa'n rymus o gostau taflu eu sbwriel a'i ollwng, yn aml heb feddwl, ac o fanteision cadw'r sbwriel hwnnw. Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r prosiect blaengar hwnnw ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr.

David Davies: Sue Essex seemed unsure as to why we are not meeting our sustainable waste targets. Has she read the report of the Welsh Local Government Association—which her colleague seems to take seriously—that stated that one of the reasons for that is that we do not hypothecate the money that is raised from the landfill tax? Does she agree that the landfill tax should not be used as another stealth tax to fill the Chancellor's coffers but as a proper way of encouraging recycling waste?

David Davies: Ymddangosai Sue Essex yn ansicr ynghylch pam nad ydym yn cyrraedd ein targedau gwastraff cynaliadwy. A yw wedi darllen adroddiad Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru—y mae ei chyd-Aelod i'w weld yn rhoi cymaint o bwys arni—a nododd mai un o'r rhesymau dros hynny yw nad ydym yn pridiannu'r arian a godir o'r dreth tirlenwi? A yw hi'n cytuno na ddylid defnyddio'r dreth tirlenwi fel treth lechwraidd arall i lenwi coffrau'r Canghellor ond fel ffordd briodol o annog ailgylchu gwastraff?

Sue Essex: Landfill tax is an important point. I would like to see landfill tax and recycling tax credits. They could contribute to

Sue Essex: Mae treth tirlenwi'n bwynt pwysig. Hoffwn weld credydau treth ailgylchu a threth tirlenwi. Gallent gyfrannu

matching the gaps in terms of funding waste. I do not know if it makes a huge amount of difference to the money that Gordon Brown has to spend. I am sure that he does not count the pennies every week. However, we agree with the principle of trying to relate the income from landfill tax because what we want to achieve is less landfill happening. That is an important point to which we will return as we develop that waste strategy.

at lenwi'r bylchau o ran ariannu gwastraff. Ni wn a yw'n gwneud gwahaniaeth enfawr i'r arian sydd gan Gordon Brown i'w wario. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad yw'n cyfrif y ceiniogau bob wythnos. Fodd bynnag, cytunwn â'r egwyddor o geisio cysylltu'r incwm o dreth tirlenwi, oherwydd yr hyn sydd arnom eisiau'i gyflawni yw bod llai o dirlenwi'n digwydd. Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig y deuwn yn ôl ato wrth inni ddatblygu'r strategaeth gwastraff honno.

Mick Bates: Given the answer to the last question, will you press Michael Meacher to change the rules on landfill tax credits and enable local authorities to directly benefit from them and use the money to finance door-to-door recycling schemes and other projects to increase the appallingly small amount of household waste recycled in Wales?

Mick Bates: Yn wyneb yr ateb i'r cwestiwn diwethaf, a wnewch bwyso ar Michael Meacher i newid y rheolau ar gredydau treth tirlenwi a galluogi awdurdodau lleol i elwa'n uniongyrchol arnynt a defnyddio'r arian i dalu am gynlluniau ailgylchu o ddrws i ddrws a phrosiectau eraill i gynyddu'r swm pitw o wastraff domestig a ailgylchir yng Nghymru?

Sue Essex: You referred to what I said earlier about finding financial ways of implementing sustainable programmes. If we wish the voluntary sector to continue to play a part, we must look at ways of financing that. That point will be addressed when we discuss the waste strategy and it is something that the Committee will want to explore further.

Sue Essex: Cyfeiriasoch at yr hyn a ddywedais yn gynharach ynglŷn â dod o hyd i ffyrdd ariannol i weithredu rhaglenni cynaliadwy. Os dymunwn i'r sector gwirfoddol barhau i chwarae rhan, rhaid inni edrych ar ffyrdd o ariannu hynny. Ymdrinnir â'r pwynt hwnnw pan drafodwn y strategaeth gwastraff ac mae'n rhywbeth y bydd ar y Pwyllgor eisiau edrych arno ymhellach.

2:30 p.m.

Cario Nwyddau ar y Rheilffyrdd ar draws Ynys Môn
Sending Freight by Rail Across Anglesey

Q2 Peter Rogers: Will Sue Essex comment on the development of a scheme to send freight by rail across Anglesey? (OAQ4788)

C2 Peter Rogers: A wnaiff Sue Essex gynnig sylwadau ar ddatblygiad cynllun i drefnu bod nwyddau yn cael eu cario ar y rheilffyrdd ar draws Ynys Môn? (OAQ4788)

Sue Essex: We are fully committed to encouraging businesses across Wales to move more of their goods by rail. In partnership with the North Wales Economic Forum and Railtrack, the Assembly has already committed £0.5 million of its transport grant to fund the improvement of line speeds on the north coast mainline railway. As a result, these will reach 90 miles per hour. This will be completed by winter this year. This is particularly significant as we seek to encourage freight traffic to and from Ireland through the port of Holyhead.

Sue Essex: Yr ydym yn gwbl ymroddedig i annog busnesau ar hyd a lled Cymru i symud mwy o'u nwyddau ar y rheilffyrdd. Mewn partneriaeth â Fforwm Economaidd Gogledd Cymru a Railtrack, mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi ymrwymo £0.5 miliwn o'i grant trafnidiaeth i dalu am wella cyflymderau'r rheilffordd ar brif lein arfordir y gogledd. O ganlyniad, bydd y rhain yn cyrraedd 90 milltir yr awr. Cwblheir hyn erbyn y gaeaf eleni. Mae hyn yn arbennig o arwyddocaol wrth inni geisio annog traffig nwyddau i Iwerddon ac oddi yno drwy borthladd

We can also offer direct support to smaller rail freight projects with environmental benefit through the freight facilities grant.

Caergybi. Gallwn hefyd gynnig cymorth uniongyrchol i brosiectau cludo llai ar y rheilffyrdd sydd er budd yr amgylchedd drwy'r grant cyfleusterau cludo nwyddau.

Peter Rogers: Railtrack's network management statement for 2000 suggested improvements to the north Wales line, including the opportunity for additional freight services and the possibility of a gauge enhancement to W10w to Holyhead. Will you support that?

Peter Rogers: Awgrymodd datganiad rheoli rhwydwaith 2000 Railtrack welliannau i lein gogledd Cymru, gan gynnwys y cyfle am wasanaethau cludo nwyddau ychwanegol a'r posibilrwydd o gynyddu'r lled ar gyfer W10w i Gaergybi. A wnewch gefnogi hynny?

Sue Essex: The Welsh Development Agency is already carrying out a study. I recently had a transport meeting with the North Wales Economic Forum and I was encouraged to hear that the study was well advanced. The study looks at the possibilities that you mentioned of where rail freight will be going and the requirements of that. Essentially, the track of the north Wales line must be strengthened to allow piggybacking, where lorries travel on the rail freight. There is much scope but we must consider the report carefully when it is completed. We will then know what direction to take. It is primarily Railtrack's responsibility, although European funds may be relevant to that improvement.

Sue Essex: Mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru eisoes yn gwneud astudiaeth. Cefais gyfarfod trafnidiaeth yn ddiweddar gyda Fforwm Economaidd Gogledd Cymru ac yr oedd yn galonogol clywed bod yr astudiaeth wedi symud yn ei blaen yn dda. Mae'n edrych ar y posibiliadau a grybwyllwyd gennych ynghylch i ble y bydd nwyddau rheilffyrdd yn mynd, a gofynion hynny. Yn ei hanfod, rhaid cryfhau trac lein y gogledd i ganiatáu cario lorïau ar y trenau. Mae llawer o bosibiliadau ond rhaid inni ystyried yr adroddiad yn ofalus pan fydd wedi'i gwblhau. Wedyn cawn wybod pa ffordd i fynd. Cyfrifoldeb Railtrack ydyw yn bennaf, er y gall arian Ewropeaidd fod yn berthnasol i'r gwelliant hwnnw.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I thank Sue for her positive statement. An important, integral part of the development of the rail freight service is the location of the terminal. The current plan is to locate it in the port of Holyhead. Sue will know from meetings that I have had with her that there is considerable concern about access to that port by road and rail. Will Sue ask her officials to keep a careful eye on how the road and rail access into Holyhead port is maintained so that any new development bears in mind the need for a rail freight terminal and does not ignore that option?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Diolchaf i Sue am ei datganiad cadarnhaol. Rhan bwysig, integrol o ddatblygiad y gwasanaeth cludo nwyddau ar y rheilffordd yw lleoliad y derfynfa. Y cynllun ar hyn o bryd yw ei lleoli ym mhorthladd Caergybi. Bydd Sue'n gwybod yn sgîl cyfarfodydd a gefais â hi fod cryn bryder ynghylch mynediad i'r porthladd hwnnw ar y ffordd a'r rheilffordd. A wnaiff Sue ofyn i'w swyddogion gadw llygad barcud ar y modd y caiff y ffordd a'r rheilffordd i mewn i borthladd Caergybi eu cynnal fel yr ystyrir yr angen am derfynfa nwyddau rheilffordd mewn unrhyw ddatblygiad newydd ac nad anwybyddir yr opsiwn hwnnw?

Sue Essex: That is a good point. Holyhead terminal is developing in many ways and we had an useful discussion recently. As there is such deprivation in Holyhead, local jobs as well as transport considerations are aligned to this. I want to keep an eye on this and continue a dialogue with Ieuan and others.

Sue Essex: Dyna bwynt da. Mae terfynfa Caergybi'n datblygu mewn amryw o ffyrdd a chawsom drafodaeth fuddiol yn ddiweddar. Gan fod cymaint o amddifadedd yng Nghaergybi, mae a wnelo hyn â swyddi lleol yn ogystal ag ystyriaethau trafnidiaeth. Mae arnaf eisiau cadw llygad ar hyn a pharhau

deialog gyda Ieuan ac eraill.

Pwerau'r Cyngor Defnyddwyr Dŵr Newydd
Powers of the New Consumer Council for Water

Q3 Pauline Jarman: What powers will the new consumer council for water have to take action on behalf of its customers in Wales? (OAQ4731)

C3 Pauline Jarman: Pa bwerau fydd gan y cyngor defnyddwyr dŵr newydd i gymryd camau ar ran ei gwsmeriaid yng Nghymru? (OAQ4731)

Sue Essex: The water provisions in the Utilities Bill have now been withdrawn. These included proposals for a new consumer council for water. I am advised that a similar provision will be included in the draft Water Bill that will be published for consultation later this year.

Sue Essex: Mae'r darpariaethau dŵr yn y Mesur Cyfleustodau bellach wedi'u tynnu'n ôl. Yr oedd y rhain yn cynnwys cynigion ar gyfer cyngor defnyddwyr dŵr newydd. Dywedir wrthyf y cynhwysir darpariaeth debyg yn y Ddeddf Dŵr drafft a gyhoeddir ar gyfer ymgynghori yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Pauline Jarman: The consumer's concern is that arrangements that are finally agreed should include measures to ensure that the company must pay compensation to customers if their complaints are justified. What representation will you make to ensure that any new arrangements provide justice for customers?

Pauline Jarman: Pryder y defnyddiwr yw y dylai trefniadau y cytunir arnynt yn y diwedd gynnwys mesurau i sicrhau bod yn rhaid i'r cwmni dalu iawndal i gwsmeriaid os oes cyfiawnhad i'w cwynion. Pa sylwadau a wnewch i sicrhau y bydd unrhyw drefniadau newydd yn darparu cyfiawnder i gwsmeriaid?

Sue Essex: If the proposals remain the same as in the Utilities Bill, there will be a national consumer council for water that will be empowered to establish regional committees to assist its work. It will be required to have at least one regional committee in Wales. We will therefore have a direct relation to that. We would want consumer protection for complaints and so on, to which you refer, to be covered in the Bill. As the Bill comes through, we can have dialogue to ensure that its provisions match our expectations.

Sue Essex: Os bydd y cynigion yn aros yr un fath ag yn y Mesur Cyfleustodau, ceir cyngor defnyddwyr cenedlaethol ar gyfer dŵr a chanddo'r grym i sefydlu pwyllgorau rhanbarthol i gynorthwyo'i waith. Bydd yn rhaid iddo gael o leiaf un pwyllgor rhanbarthol yng Nghymru. Felly bydd gennym berthynas uniongyrchol â hwnnw. Byddem yn awyddus i'r Mesur roi gwarchodaeth i gwsmeriaid â chwynion ac ati, fel y cyfeiriasoch chi. Wrth i'r Mesur ddod drwodd, gallwn gael deialog i sicrhau bod ei ddarpariaethau'n cwrdd â'n disgwyliadau.

Alun Cairns: The windfall tax naturally hit Hyder and, therefore, Welsh consumers much harder than any other area in Britain. When the consultation on the establishment of a consumer council for water occurs, is it your intention that it should have the right to express concern and even regret on state policies as well as that of the provider?

Alun Cairns: Yn naturiol trawodd y ffawdelw Hyder ac, felly, ddefnyddwyr Cymru yn llawer caletach nag mewn unrhyw ran arall o Brydain. Pan geir yr ymgynghori ar sefydlu cyngor defnyddwyr dŵr, a ydyw'n fwriad gennych y dylai gael yr hawl i fynegi pryder a hyd yn oed ofid ynghylch polisïau'r wladwriaeth yn ogystal â pholisi'r darparwr?

Sue Essex: That is unlikely, Alun. The consumer council's role will be set out under parliamentary legislation and its

Sue Essex: Mae hynny'n annhebygol, Alun. Bydd rôl y cyngor defnyddwyr wedi'i phennu dan ddeddfwriaeth seneddol a'i

responsibility will be to assist consumers. I look forward to that piece of legislation.

gyfrifoldeb fydd cynorthwyo defnyddwyr. Edrychaf ymlaen at y ddeddfwriaeth honno.

Datblygu Cynaliadwy
Sustainable Development

C4 Cynog Dafis: Sut y bydd y broses gynllunio yn cyfrannu at ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy? (OAQ4733)

Q4 Cynog Dafis: How will the planning process contribute to the Assembly's commitment to sustainable development? (OAQ4733)

Sue Essex: 'Planning Guidance (Wales): Planning Policy', First Revision 1999 contributes to sustainable development by promoting a planning system that seeks to reconcile the needs of development and conservation and ensure economy, efficiency and amenity in the use of land. I am undertaking a review of national planning policy which will consider, among other things, how the sustainable development principles in the Assembly's recently issued sustainable development scheme can be further embedded in planning policy and guidance. I recognise, as I am sure you do, that a sound planning policy base will be an important context for the sustainable development scheme.

Sue Essex: Mae 'Canllawiau Cynllunio (Cymru): Polisi Cynllunio', Adolygiad Cyntaf 1999 yn cyfrannu at ddatblygu cynaliadwy drwy hyrwyddo system gynllunio sydd yn ceisio cymodi anghenion datblygu a chadwraeth a sicrhau darbodaeth, effeithlonrwydd ac amwynder wrth ddefnyddio tir. Yr wyf yn ymgymryd ag adolygiad o bolisi cynllunio cenedlaethol a fydd yn ystyried, ymhlith pethau eraill, sut y gall yr egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy yng nghynllun datblygu cynaliadwy diweddar y Cynulliad gael eu gwreiddio'n ddyfnach mewn polisi ac arweiniad cynllunio. Cydnabyddaf, fel chi mae'n siŵr, y bydd sylfaen polisi cynllunio cadarn yn gyd-destun pwysig i'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy.

Cynog Dafis: Gobeithiaf y bydd yr adolygiad hwn yn arwain at system gynllunio a fydd yn hwyluso twf ynni adnewyddadwy er mwyn inni achub ar y cyfle i feithrin a sefydlu diwydiant ynni cynaliadwy ar sail ein hadnoddau cyfoethog naturiol yn y maes hwn. Beth yw ymateb Sue i'r ffaith mai'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn Llundain sydd yn delio â cheisiadau am gynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy dros 50 megawat ac mai'r adran honno sydd â'r penderfyniad terfynol? A yw'n cytuno mai'r Cynulliad a ddylai gael y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw er mwyn datblygu strategaeth gyffredinol i'r diwydiant twf allweddol hwn a sicrhau bod penderfyniadau yn dderbyniol i bobl Cymru?

Cynog Dafis: I hope that this review will lead to a planning system that will facilitate the growth of renewable energy so that we can take advantage of the opportunity to foster and establish a sustainable industry based on our rich natural resources in this field. What is Sue's response to the fact that the Department of Trade and Industry in London deals with applications for renewable energy schemes of over 50 megawatts and that that department has the final decision? Does she agree that the Assembly should have that responsibility in order to develop a general strategy for this key growth industry and ensure that decisions are acceptable to the people of Wales?

Sue Essex: I know of your interest and enthusiasm for renewable energy, Cynog. Energy is the responsibility of the First Secretary, as it comes under the economic development brief. I am aware, as you are, that the decisions on many of those developments come under planning. A lack

Sue Essex: Gwn am eich diddordeb a'ch brwdfrydedd dros ynni adnewyddadwy, Cynog. Cyfrifoldeb y Prif Ysgrifennydd yw ynni, gan y daw o dan y brîff datblygu economaidd. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol, fel chi, y daw'r penderfyniadau ar lawer o'r datblygiadau hynny dan gynllunio. Mae

of strategic context makes it more difficult and we are making decisions on single applications without that strategic context. We need to get to grips with that and develop an adequate spatial policy for Wales. I am inclined to speak to the First Secretary to see if we can start a dialogue to tackle the issue of developing a spatial planning policy to adequately express our opportunity for establishing renewable energy.

diffyg cyd-destun strategol yn ei gwneud hi'n anoddach ac yr ydym yn gwneud penderfyniadau ar geisiadau unigol heb y cyd-destun strategol hwnnw. Mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hynny a datblygu polisi gofodol digonol i Gymru. Mae gennyf awydd siarad â'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i weld a allwn gychwyn deialog i fynd i'r afael â chwestiwn datblygu polisi cynllunio gofodol i fanteisio'n ddigonol ar ein cyfle i sefydlu ynni adnewyddadwy.

Michael German: I pursue the matter of planning guidance with respect to integrated transport. When you look at the transport problems of Wales you take into account road infrastructure repairs. How can you square the problem of making road improvements and, at the same time, try to encourage public transport where it may not exist, in particular in rural areas?

Michael German: Cyfeiriaf at fater canllawiau cynllunio parthed trafnidiaeth integredig. Pan edrychwch ar broblemau trafnidiaeth Cymru rhaid ystyried gwaith atgyweirio isadeiledd y ffyrdd. Sut mae unioni'r broblem o wella ffyrdd ac, ar yr un pryd, ceisio annog trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus lle efallai nad yw'n bodoli, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig?

Sue Essex: We will have the unitary development plans which local authorities are preparing. We also have the local transport plans that form an integrated package to cover road and rail. As you know, the Assembly's push at the moment is on integration of transport. We have produced several documents that establish the way forward on our transport policy. Many of the documents recognise the point to which you allude—the particular difficulties of rural areas in Wales where rail transport may not be an option and integration is more difficult. We must recognise that for some years many people in rural Wales will still depend on the car. However, there is a whole sector of people who do not and will never have access to cars. That is why we have put the bus subsidy in place for commercial operations and have invested money in community transport to ensure that the bus system is a reliable alternative for people in rural areas who do not have access to a car.

Sue Essex: Bydd gennym y cynlluniau datblygu unedol y mae awdurdodau lleol yn eu paratoi. Mae gennym hefyd y cynlluniau trafnidiaeth lleol sydd yn ffurfio pecyn integredig dros ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd. Fel y gwyddoch, integreiddio trafnidiaeth yw'r hyn y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei wthio ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi sawl dogfen sydd yn sefydlu'r ffordd ymlaen ar ein polisi trafnidiaeth. Mae llawer o'r dogfennau'n cydnabod y pwynt y cyfeiriwch ato—sef anawsterau penodol ardaloedd gwledig yng Nghymru lle efallai nad yw cludiant rheilffyrdd yn opsiwn a lle mae'n anos integreiddio. Rhaid inni gydnabod y bydd llawer o bobl yn y Gymru wledig yn dal i ddibynnu ar y car am rai blynyddoedd eto. Fodd bynnag, y mae sector cyfan o bobl sydd heb fynediad at geir ac na fydd ganddynt byth. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi sefydlu'r cynllun nawdd i fysus masnachol ac wedi buddsoddi arian mewn trafnidiaeth gymunedol i sicrhau bod y system bysus yn ddewis dibynadwy i bobl mewn ardaloedd gwledig sydd heb ddefnydd car.

2:40 p.m.

William Graham: What steps are being taken to ensure that local authorities are upholding central Government's commitment to build 60 per cent of new homes on brown-field sites?

William Graham: Pa gamau a gymerir i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn cadw at ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth ganolog i adeiladu 60 y cant o gartrefi newydd ar safleoedd tir llwyd?

Sue Essex: John Prescott announced the 60 per cent figure for England. There is not a 60 per cent figure for Wales and we discussed this at the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee last week. We will look at brown-field development in the planning guidance. We may not come up with a figure that we think is applicable for the whole of Wales, because there is a different situation between Ceredigion and Cardiff. We have a lot of brown land that we want to bring back into use in this area. The presumption is in the planning guidance, and we want to re-use recycled land wherever possible, to prevent too much green-field land being taken up.

Sue Essex: Cyhoeddodd John Prescott y ffigur 60 y cant ar gyfer Lloegr. Nid oes ffigur 60 y cant ar gyfer Cymru, a thrafodwyd hyn ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf. Byddwn yn edrych ar ddatblygu tir llwyd yn y canllawiau cynllunio. Efallai na chytunwn ar ffigur fydd yn addas ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, oherwydd ceir sefyllfa wahanol rhwng Ceredigion a Chaerdydd. Mae gennym lawer o dir llwyd yr ydym eisiau gwneud defnydd ohono eto yn yr ardal hon. Mae'r rhagdybiaeth yn y canllawiau cynllunio, ac mae arnom eisiau ailddefnyddio tir wedi'i ailgylchu lle bynnag y bo modd, er mwyn peidio â chymryd gormod o dir glas.

Lorraine Barrett: How will the Assembly's planning process and commitment to sustainability relate to the siting of mobile phone masts, particularly near schools?

Lorraine Barrett: Sut y bydd proses gynllunio'r Cynulliad a'i ymrwymiad i gynaliadwyedd yn effeithio ar leoliad mastiau ffôn symudol, yn enwedig yn agos at ysgolion?

Sue Essex: There are regulations in place but we will be looking, as part of this review, at the issue of phone masts and what can be done about them. I am aware that this issue is cropping up in many constituencies. It is a part of modern society and we need to consider whether we need to improve planning guidance on this. In terms of economic development, we need to ensure that the whole of Wales is able to get information technology. We will look at that, and the issue will go out to consultation.

Sue Essex: Mae rheoliadau ar hyn ond byddwn yn edrych, fel rhan o'r adolygiad hwn, ar gwestiwn mastiau ffôn a beth y gellir ei wneud amdanynt. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod y mater hwn yn codi'i ben mewn sawl etholaeth. Mae'n rhan o gymdeithas fodern ac mae angen inni ystyried a oes angen inni wella arweiniad cynllunio ar hyn. Yn nhermau datblygu economaidd, mae angen sicrhau y gall Cymru gyfan gael technoleg gwybodaeth. Edrychwn ar hynny, a cheir ymgynghori ar y mater.

Datganiad ar Lwfansau Cynghorwyr
Statement on Councillors' Allowances

The Secretary for Local Government and Housing (Peter Law): I will make a statement on the payment of members' allowances by Cardiff City and County Council. As the Secretary for Local Government, I have been concerned at the council's allowance scheme. I publicly asked them to consider their situation, as everyone here will know. A fortnight ago, the Assembly adopted a motion that called for the capping of all such allowances. The gravity of that decision did not escape me, and I regard it as very serious. I said that I

Yr Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol a Thai (Peter Law): Gwnaf ddatganiad ar daliad lwfansau aelodau gan Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd. Fel yr Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol, bûm yn bryderus ynghylch cynllun lwfansau'r cyngor. Gofynnais yn gyhoeddus iddynt ystyried eu sefyllfa, fel y gŵyr pawb yma. Bythefnos yn ôl, mabwysiadodd y Cynulliad gynnig yn galw am gapio pob lwfans o'r fath. Nid oeddwn yn ddall i ddifrifwch y penderfyniad hwnnw; mae'n ddifrifol dros ben yn fy ngolwg i. Dywedais y rhoddwn bythefnos i'r cyngor benderfynu, yn

would give the council a fortnight in which to decide, voluntarily, to revert to their previous system of members' allowances, or I would ask the Assembly to legislate. With the local government modernisation plans in mind, I said that the way forward on councillors' allowances was to convene a joint working group of Assembly Members and local government representatives, on an all party basis, and under the auspices of the partnership council. I made it clear that I saw the Boyne report as the starting point for that joint group's consideration.

wirfoddol, dychwelyd at eu system flaenorol o lwfansau aelodau, neu y byddwn yn gofyn i'r Cynulliad ddeddfu. Gyda'r cynlluniau i foderneiddio llywodraeth leol yn fy meddwl, dywedais mai'r ffordd ymlaen ar lwfansau cynghorwyr oedd galw cyd-weithgor o Aelodau'r Cynulliad a chynrychiolwyr llywodraeth leol, ar sail hollbleidiol, a than arolygaeth y cyngor partneriaeth. Dywedais yn glir fy mod yn gweld adroddiad Boyne fel y man cychwyn ar gyfer trafodaeth y cyd-weithgor hwnnw.

Following that debate, I wrote to the leader of Cardiff council calling for a response no later than today. I wrote again last Wednesday. It was right to give Cardiff a reasonable period of time in which to respond. I restated that yesterday, and the action of opposition Members in voting down the business statement was regrettable. Together with officials, I met the leader of Cardiff council last night at his request. We had an amicable and constructive discussion. I received a letter from the leader today, formally committing Cardiff council to restrict its total expenditure on members' allowances, of all kinds, in the financial year 2000-01, to £832,000.

Yn dilyn y ddadl honno, ysgrifennais at arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd yn galw am ymateb erbyn heddiw fan bellaf. Ysgrifennais eto ddydd Mercher diwethaf. Yr oedd yn iawn rhoi cyfnod rhesymol i Gaerdydd ymateb. Ailddatgenais hynny ddoe, a gresyn oedd i Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau wrthod y datganiad busnes. Ynghyd â swyddogion, cyfarfûm ag arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd neithiwr ar ei gais ef. Cawsom drafodaeth gyfeillgar ac adeiladol. Cefais lythyr oddi wrth yr arweinydd heddiw, yn ymrwymo cyngor Caerdydd yn ffurfiol i gyfyngu'i gyfanswm gwariant ar lwfansau aelodau, o bob math, yn y flwyddyn ariannol 2000-01, i £832,000.

I am satisfied that that figure corresponds to the total cost of Cardiff's former system of allowances, as they stood at 31 March 1999. It is a figure, at which I would have proposed to limit Cardiff's expenditure, if it had proved necessary to proceed with a capping regulation. I understand that Cardiff's expenditure on members' allowances would otherwise have been £1.052 million, a difference of £220,000. I am pleased that Cardiff has complied voluntarily, which protects the interest of the council taxpayer and should allow the joint working group to review the issue of members' allowances in a calmer atmosphere. I have made it clear that the Boyne report must be the starting point for the deliberations of the joint Assembly and Welsh Local Government Association working group.

Yr wyf yn fodlon fod y ffigur hwnnw'n cyfateb i gyfanswm cost system lwfansau flaenorol Caerdydd, fel yr oedd ar 31 Mawrth 1999. Mae'n ffigur y buaswn innau wedi cynnig cyfyngu gwariant Caerdydd iddo, pe buasai angen mynd ati i osod cyfyngiad. Deallaf y buasai gwariant Caerdydd ar lwfansau aelodau fel arall yn £1.052 miliwn, gwahaniaeth o £220,000. Yr wyf yn falch fod Caerdydd wedi cydymffurfio'n wirfoddol, sydd yn gwarchod buddiant trethdalwyr y cyngor, a dylai hyn ganiatáu i'r cyd-weithgor adolygu cwestiwn lwfansau aelodau mewn awyrgylch tawelach. Yr wyf wedi datgan yn glir mai adroddiad Boyne ddylai fod y man cychwyn ar gyfer trafodaethau cyd-weithgor y Cynulliad a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru.

It is worth remembering that the members' allowances working group was set up in response to representations from local government. Whatever their opinions are on

Mae'n werth cofio y sefydlwyd y gweithgor lwfansau aelodau mewn ymateb i sylwadau gan lywodraeth leol. Beth bynnag a feddyliant am argymhellion adroddiad

the Boyne report recommendations, there is no doubt that the WLGA supported the exercise at the time. That is why their logo appeared with the Assembly's on the front cover of the Boyne report. It is an important and carefully considered piece of work by a group of independent and knowledgeable people.

Boyne, nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru gefnogi'r ymarfer ar y pryd. Dyna pam yr ymddangosodd eu logo gyda logo'r Cynulliad ar glawr blaen adroddiad Boyne. Mae'n waith pwysig ac ystyriol gan grŵp o bobl annibynnol a gwybodus.

I wrote to Sir Harry Jones yesterday, as leader of the WLGA on the Partnership Council, and proposed the following terms of reference for the joint working group. It is to consider what would be an appropriate scheme of special responsibility allowances for Welsh local authorities in the light of the report of the members allowance working group—the Boyne report—and of such further material or representations as the group may agree to take into account and make recommendations accordingly. I look forward to a positive response to this. The sooner the joint working group starts considering the issues, the better for us all and particularly Welsh local government. There is a good measure of cross-party consensus that councillors need allowances at a realistic level, which support them adequately in the vital work that they do on behalf of their communities. I pay tribute to their work regularly in this Chamber. I hope, with goodwill on all sides, that the joint working group will be able to come up with agreed recommendations. It will then be for the Cabinet and the Assembly to decide whether those recommendations should be endorsed.

Ysgrifennais ddoe at Syr Harry Jones, arweinydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar y Cyngor Partneriaeth, a chynigiais y cylch gorchwyl canlynol i'r cyd-weithgor. Dylai ystyried beth fyddai'n gynllun priodol o lwfansau cyfrifoldeb arbennig i awdurdodau lleol Cymru yng ngoleuni adroddiad y gweithgor lwfansau aelodau—adroddiad Boyne—ac unrhyw ddeunydd neu sylwadau pellach y gallai'r gweithgor gytuno i'w hystyried, a gwneud argymhellion yn unol â hynny. Edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb cadarnhaol i hyn. Gorau po gyntaf y dechreua'r cyd-weithgor ystyried y materion, a hynny o safbwynt pob un ohonom a llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru yn enwedig. Mae cryn fesur o gonsensws traws-bleidiol fod angen lwfansau ar lefel realistig i gynghorwyr, fydd yn eu cynnal yn ddigonol yn y gwaith hanfodol a wnânt ar ran eu cymunedau. Rhoddaf deyrnged i'w gwaith yn rheolaidd yn y Siambr hon. Gobeithiaf, gydag ewyllys da ar y ddwy ochr, y bydd y cyd-weithgor yn gallu cyflwyno argymhellion y cytunwyd arnynt. Mater i'r Cabinet a'r Cynulliad wedyn fydd penderfynu a ddylid cadarnhau'r argymhellion hynny.

I have asked Gwenda Thomas, Chair of the Local Government and Housing Committee if she will chair the working party. She kindly agreed to that, and I hope that it will be endorsed in the Partnership Council. It is important that we act fairly and reasonably, as well as firmly. By giving Cardiff adequate time to consider my request, I have secured a satisfactory outcome on a voluntary basis. I have kept my assurance to the Assembly, the people of Wales and to Cardiff. I pay tribute to Cardiff council for this sensible and constructive decision. In the light of that decision, no useful purpose would be served by introducing a capping regulation for the authority at this time.

Yr wyf wedi gofyn i Gwenda Thomas, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, a wnaiff hi gadeirio'r gweithgor. Mae hi wedi cytuno'n garedig i wneud hynny, a gobeithiaf y cadarnheir hyn yn y Cyngor Partneriaeth. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gweithredu'n deg ac yn rhesymol, yn ogystal ag yn gadarn. Drwy roi digon o amser i Gaerdydd ystyried fy nghais, yr wyf wedi sicrhau canlyniad boddhaol ar sail wirfoddol. Yr wyf wedi cadw fy addewid i'r Cynulliad, i bobl Cymru ac i Gaerdydd. Talaf deyrnged i gyngor Caerdydd am y penderfyniad doeth ac adeiladol hwn. Yng ngoleuni'r penderfyniad hwnnw, ni fyddai unrhyw ddiben defnyddiol yn cael ei gyflawni drwy gyflwyno rheol gapio i'r awdurdod ar hyn o bryd.

Janet Ryder: There is a visual link between you holding up a piece of paper and proclaiming peace in our time, and a former Prime Minister who did the same. I hope your letter is slightly more substantial. I do not think anyone appreciates the brinkmanship that Cardiff council embarked on by leaving it until the very last minute. However, I welcome the council's action. With the theatricals over, we must develop a system of allowances that will be fair to all councillors and that will fully reflect the new responsibilities that they will be undertaking as the new structures of local government develop. I look forward to that work starting.

Janet Ryder: Mae'ch gweld chi'n dal darn o bapur i fyny ac yn cyhoeddi heddwch yn ein dydd yn taro tant â chyn Brif Weinidog a wnaeth yr un modd. Gobeithiaf fod ychydig mwy o sylwedd i'ch llythyr chi. Nid wyf yn meddwl fod neb yn gwerthfawrogi'r gêm beryglus a chwaraeodd cyngor Caerdydd drwy ei gadael tan y funud olaf un. Fodd bynnag, croesawaf weithred y cyngor. Â'r ddrama bellach ar ben, rhaid inni ddatblygu system lwfansau a fydd yn deg i bob cynghorydd ac yn adlewyrchu'n llawn y cyfrifoldebau newydd y byddant yn ymgymryd â hwy wrth i'r strwythurau llywodraeth leol newydd ddatblygu. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld dechrau'r gwaith hwnnw.

Will the group to which you refer be the Monday meeting of the Partnership Council's modernising group? Is that the group who will begin this work? Wherever or whoever that group is, it must start work as soon as possible and must develop a system of allowances that encourage more people from differing backgrounds to take a fuller part in local government.

Ai cyfarfod dydd Llun grŵp moderneiddio'r Cyngor Partneriaeth fydd y gweithgor y cyfeiriwch ato? Ai dyna'r grŵp fydd yn cychwyn y gwaith hwn? Lle bynnag neu bwy bynnag yw'r gweithgor hwnnw, rhaid iddo ddechrau gweithio cyn gynted ag y bo modd a rhaid iddo ddatblygu system o lwfansau a fydd yn annog mwy o bobl o wahanol gefndiroedd i gymryd rhan lawnach mewn llywodraeth leol.

Peter Law: I thank Janet for her positive comments and I endorse them. I am grateful for her kind comments, which reflect well on my negotiating skills. We had best value out of the fortnight of negotiation and I am pleased that it has resulted in this decision. I assure you that it will be an all-party working group. It will be a separate working group and will be organised as soon as possible. I will be in touch with you and other party representatives, because you will be able to play an important part in that.

Peter Law: Diolch i Janet am ei sylwadau cadarnhaol a ategir gennyf innau. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ei sylwadau caredig, sydd yn adlewyrchu'n dda ar fy sgiliau negodi. Cawsom y gwerth gorau allan o'r pythefnos o negodi ac yr wyf yn falch mai'r penderfyniad hwn yw'r canlyniad. Sicrhaf chi y bydd y gweithgor yn un holl-bleidiol. Bydd yn weithgor ar wahân ac fe'i trefnir cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Byddaf mewn cysylltiad â chi a chynrychiolwyr y pleidiau eraill, oherwydd byddwch chi'n gallu chwarae rhan bwysig yn hynny o beth.

Nick Bourne: I will continue with Janet's analogy. You are rather more like Neville Chamberlain than Janet led us to believe. This owes more—

Nick Bourne: Af ymlaen â chyffelybiaeth Janet. Yr ydych braidd yn fwy tebyg i Neville Chamberlain nag yr arweiniodd Janet ni i gredu. Mae hyn i'w briodoli fwy—

Peter Law: After what I said about Rock Park in Llandrindod Wells.

Peter Law: Ar ôl yr hyn a ddywedais am Rock Park yn Llandrindod.

Nick Bourne: That is past history.

Nick Bourne: Hen hanes yw hwnnw.

The First Secretary: Savaged by the dead sheep.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Wedi'i larpio gan y ddafad farw.

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

2:50 p.m.

Nick Bourne: This owes more to your presentational skills than to your negotiating skills. There is nothing in the statement about Russell Goodway's salary coming down. That has not escaped us. It is the major issue. There is mention of the budget coming down but that is different. We said yesterday that you would kick the ball into the long grass and that is what you have done today by setting up this working group. There is no guarantee at the end of the day that his salary will be lower than it is at the moment—£58,000. That is what this is about. It is what the people of Cardiff and Wales are concerned about. It is not only about Russell Goodway—it is about other council leaders who may seek to emulate his salary. I would be grateful if you could say whether his salary is coming down and whether you have a copper-bottomed guarantee on that in the budget. There is nothing about that in this statement. We will feel obliged to raise the question of the business statement again unless there is a copper-bottomed guarantee that his salary is coming down to what it was before the present increase. There is nothing in the statement to that effect. Although that is regrettable, there is no other device in our armoury relating to this. It is a shoddy compromise that is all about getting the Labour Party off the hook. It is not about getting Russell Goodway down to a reasonable salary for a job that reflects a combination of public service and professionalism. That is what we called for initially.

Nick Bourne: Mae hyn i'w briodoli fwy i'ch sgiliau cyflwyniadol na'ch sgiliau negodi. Nid oes unrhywbeth yn y datganiad ynghylch gostyngiad yng nghyflog Russell Goodway. Nid ydym wedi colli golwg ar hynny. Dyma'r prif fater. Mae sôn am ostyngiad yn y gyllideb ond peth gwahanol yw hynny. Dywedasom ddoe y byddech yn cicio'r bêl i'r glaswellt hir a dyna a wnaethoch heddiw drwy sefydlu'r gweithgor hwn. Nid oes dim gwarant ar ddiwedd y dydd y bydd ei gyflog yn is nag ydyw ar hyn o bryd—£58,000. Dyna asgwrn y gynnen. Dyna beth sydd yn poeni pobl Caerdydd a Chymru. Nid am Russell Goodway yn unig y mae hyn—mae a wnelo ag arweinwyr cynghorau eraill a allai geisio efelychu'i gyflog. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddweud a fydd ei gyflog ef yn dod i lawr ac a oes gennych warant bendant ar hynny yn y gyllideb. Nid oes dim am hynny yn y datganiad hwn. Teimlwn reidrwydd i godi cwestiwn y datganiad busnes eto hyd nes ceir gwarant bendant y daw ei gyflog ef i lawr i'r hyn ydoedd cyn y cynnydd presennol. Nid oes dim yn y datganiad i'r perwyl hwnnw. Er mai rhywbeth i resynu ato yw hynny, nid oes unrhyw ddyfais arall yn ein storfa i ddelio â hyn. Cyfaddawd gwael ydyw gyda'r bwriad o achub croen y Blaid Lafur. Nid mater o gael Russell Goodway i lawr i gyflog rhesymol am swydd sydd yn adlewyrchu cyfuniad o wasanaeth cyhoeddus a phroffesiynoldeb ydyw. Dyna beth yr oeddem yn galw amdano yn y lle cyntaf.

Peter Law: As someone once said, 'he would, wouldn't he?' Cardiff county council had an allowance system that was drawn up by an independent committee. Whether we agree with it or not, it was implemented. One must recognise that a great deal of good work is being done in Cardiff at present. This Assembly's powers enables it to cap the total overall budget for allowances. That is what we could have done but we did not need to do that because Cardiff county council has now given a voluntary agreement to do that. That is excellent. There has to be partnership and

Peter Law: Fel y dywedodd rhywun rywbryd, 'fe fyddai ef, oni fyddai?' Yr oedd gan gyngor sir Caerdydd system lwfansau a luniwyd gan bwyllgor annibynnol. Cytuno â hynny ai peidio, fe'i gweithredwyd. Rhaid cydnabod fod llawer iawn o waith da yn cael ei wneud yng Nghaerdydd ar hyn o bryd. Mae pwerau'r Cynulliad yn ei alluogi i gapio'r gyllideb gyffredinol ar gyfer lwfansau. Dyna beth y gallasem ei wneud ond ni fu angen gwneud hynny gan fod cyngor sir Caerdydd bellach wedi cytuno'n wirfoddol i wneud hynny. Mae hynny'n

trust between the Assembly and local government. Councillors are democratically elected on behalf of the people of the city and county of Cardiff. We must work in partnership with local government. That is what is important. We do not have power over individual salaries. That is a matter for each local authority. They are answerable at the ballot box to their constituents. To compare the Cardiff situation—because it is the capital city—with any other local authority is unfair and unnecessary. To be fair to local government, I have not heard of any other authority where there is a similar concern or problem. We have a good solution. We have a voluntary agreement and it is in the interest of the people of Cardiff and Wales.

ardderchog. Rhaid wrth bartneriaeth ac ymddiriedaeth rhwng y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol. Caiff cynghorwyr eu hethol yn ddemocrataidd ar ran pobl dinas a sir Caerdydd. Rhaid inni gydweithio â llywodraeth leol. Dyna sydd yn bwysig. Nid oes gennym rym dros gyflogau unigol. Mater i bob awdurdod lleol yw hynny. Maent yn atebol yn y bwth pleidleisio i'w hetholwyr. Annheg a diangen yw cymharu sefyllfa Caerdydd—am mai hi yw'n prifddinas—ag unrhyw awdurdod lleol arall. I fod yn deg â llywodraeth leol, ni chlywais am unrhyw awdurdod arall lle ceir pryder neu broblem debyg. Mae gennym ateb da. Mae gennym gytundeb gwirfoddol ac mae er budd pobl Caerdydd a Chymru.

Peter Black: The allowances retained by the Labour councillors in Cardiff are too high. There are also too many special responsibility allowances. However, this is a reasonable compromise. We can live with it for the time being and it has set a number of provisos. It was indicated in the press this morning that Russell Goodway will accept an allowance of £34,000 and it was implied that he previously received that sum. I understood that he received £29,000. That needs to be clarified. Liverpool is almost twice the size of Cardiff and its council leader receives £10,000. There are major differences between various councillors' allowances.

Peter Black: Mae'r lwfansau a gedwir gan gynghorwyr Llafur yng Nghaerdydd yn rhy uchel. Mae gormod o lwfansau cyfrifoldeb arbennig hefyd. Fodd bynnag, dyma gyfaddawd rhesymol. Gallwn fyw gydag ef am y tro ac mae wedi gosod nifer o amodau. Dywedwyd yn y wasg y bore yma y bydd Russell Goodway'n derbyn lwfans o £34,000 ac awgrymwyd ei fod yn cael y swm hwnnw yn flaenorol. Yr oeddwn i ar ddeall mai £29,000 yr oedd yn ei gael. Mae angen egluro hynny. Mae Lerpwl bron ddwy waith maint Caerdydd ac mae arweinydd ei chyngor yn cael £10,000. Mae gwahaniaethau mawr rhwng lwfansau gwahanol gynghorwyr.

It is also important that the full council of Cardiff City and County Council meets to endorse this recommendation. We have received a letter from Russell Goodway. This must be seen as an offer from the council as a whole before we can accept it. In the light of that offer, I agree with Peter that the legislation is no longer necessary and that we should therefore proceed with the joint working group looking at the Boyne report to find a workable scheme for Wales. Councils should not be imposed upon. Guidelines should be set within which councils can work. In relation to what Janet Ryder said, we need to encourage more people to come onto councils. The misapprehension about the Cardiff council allowance scheme is that raising allowances to high levels is the key to getting people involved in local democracy. That is not the key. The key is making sure

Mae'n bwysig hefyd fod cyngor llawn Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd yn cyfarfod i gadarnhau'r argymhelliad hwn. Yr ydym wedi derbyn llythyr oddi wrth Russell Goodway. Rhaid gweld hyn fel cynnig gan y cyngor yn ei gyfanrwydd cyn y gallwn ei dderbyn. Yng ngolau'r cynnig hwnnw, cytunaf â Peter nad oes angen deddfwriaeth mwyach ac y dylem felly fynd ati gyda'r cyd-weithgor sydd yn edrych ar adroddiad Boyne i ganfod cynllun a all weithio i Gymru. Ni ddylid gosod rheolau ar gynghorau. Dylid gosod canllawiau y gall cynghorau weithio o'u mewn. Mewn perthynas â'r hyn a ddywedodd Janet Ryder, mae angen inni annog mwy o bobl i ddod ar gynghorau. Y camresymu yng nghynllun lwfansau cyngor Caerdydd yw mai codi lwfansau i lefelau uchel yw'r allwedd i gael pobl i gyfranogi mewn democratiaeth leol. Nid dyna'r

that the council is open, inclusive and accountable and meets at times when working people can go to the meetings.

allwedd. Yr allwedd yw sicrhau bod y cyngor yn agored, yn gynhwysol ac yn atebol a'i fod yn cyfarfod ar amserau pan y gall pobl sydd yn gweithio fynychu'r cyfarfodydd.

Peter Law: I agree with those last comments. There will always be a voluntary element to a councillor's work. One has to recognise that there are far more responsibilities in large areas like Cardiff, the capital city of Wales, than in other places. All aspects need to be taken into account, which is why the working party will be so important. I hope that you will play a part as a member of that working party so that you can make a direct input. I cannot comment on what was in *The Western Mail* this morning, and I cannot comment on salaries because that is a matter for Cardiff county council, not for me. I can only talk about the total budgetary figure, which we now have a voluntary agreement to fix at a point before the Parkinson report, which was what all the furore was about.

Peter Law: Cytunaf gyda'r sylwadau diwethaf hynny. Bydd elfen wirfoddol bob amser i waith cynghorydd. Rhaid cydnabod fod llawer mwy o gyfrifoldebau mewn ardaloedd mawr fel Caerdydd, prifddinas Cymru, nag mewn lleoedd eraill. Rhaid cymryd pob agwedd i ystyriaeth, a dyna pam y bydd y gweithgor mor bwysig. Gobeithio y chwaraewch ran fel aelod o'r gweithgor hwnnw fel y gallwch gael mewnbwn uniongyrchol. Ni allaf wneud sylw ar yr hyn oedd yn *The Western Mail* y bore yma, ac ni allaf wneud sylw ar gyflogau gan mai mater i gyngor sir Caerdydd yw hwnnw, nid i mi. Ni allaf ond siarad am y ffigur cyllideb yn ei gyfanswm, y mae gennym bellach gytundeb gwirfoddol i'w gadw ar bwynt cyn adroddiad Parkinson, sef yr hyn yr oedd yr holl ddadlau yn ei gylch.

John Griffiths: I congratulate Peter and the Assembly for taking this speedy and effective action. It is a pity that the Conservatives are, as ever, churlish and unwilling to recognise the reality of the situation, which is that the Assembly has taken timely, effective and necessary action to deal with a situation that was causing a great deal of concern to the people of Cardiff and the rest of Wales. The Assembly is to be congratulated for showing this leadership. That reality must be recognised. There has been speedy, timely and necessary action to deal with a situation that required that response.

John Griffiths: Llongyfarchaf Peter a'r Cynulliad am weithredu'n gyflym ac effeithiol fel hyn. Mae'n drueni fod y Ceidwadwyr, fel arfer, yn ddi-ras ac yn gyndyn o gydnabod realiti'r sefyllfa, sef fod y Cynulliad wedi gweithredu mewn modd amserol, effeithiol ac angenrheidiol i ddelio â sefyllfa a oedd yn peri cryn bryder i bobl Caerdydd a gweddill Cymru. Rhaid llongyfarch y Cynulliad am ddangos yr arweinyddiaeth yma. Rhaid cydnabod y realiti hwnnw. Cafwyd gweithredu buan, amserol ac angenrheidiol i ddelio â sefyllfa a oedd yn galw am yr ymateb hwnnw.

As I said on a previous occasion, it should not be lost in the generality of the debate that councillors across Wales carry out sterling public service, often for little reward. Those of us with a local government background are acutely conscious of this. We do not want this to be lost in the criticism of the situation that prevailed before you took this action. That situation had developed too quickly and had gone too far. We all recognise that the way forward is partnership. Peter, you deserve congratulating for recognising that and for recognising the need to move forward in partnership with local government. That is the correct way forward. I hope that the

Fel y dywedais ar achlysur blaenorol, ni ddylid anghofio yng nghyffredinoledd y ddadl fod cynghorwyr ledled Cymru'n cyflawni gwasanaeth cyhoeddus rhagorol, a hynny yn aml am ychydig iawn o wobr. Mae'r rheini ohonom sydd â chefndir mewn llywodraeth leol yn ymwybodol iawn o hyn. Nid oes arnom eisiau i hyn gael ei golli yn y feirniadaeth o'r sefyllfa a fodolai cyn i chi weithredu fel y gwnaethoch. Yr oedd y sefyllfa wedi datblygu'n rhy gyflym ac wedi mynd yn rhy bell. Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod mai partneriaeth yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Peter, yr ydych yn haeddu canmoliaeth am gydnabod hynny ac am

working group considers the new reality of local government in Wales, the new modernisation and the cabinet structures. I hope that it also recognises the need to attract a cross-section of the population to become councillors, the sacrifices that people often make in terms of poor promotional prospects and the time spent on council activities that means that time cannot be given to family and career. That will all be considered as things are taken forward in partnership, as it should be, between the Assembly and local government.

gydnabod yr angen i symud ymlaen mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol. Dyna'r ffordd gywir ymlaen. Gobeithiaf y bydd y gweithgor yn ystyried realiti newydd llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, y moderneiddio newydd a'r strwythurau cabinet. Gobeithiaf hefyd y gwnaiff gydnabod yr angen i ddenu croestoriad o'r boblogaeth i fynd yn gynghorwyr, yr aberth a wneir gan y bobl hyn yn aml yn nhermau rhagolygon gwael am ddyrchafiad a'r amser a dreulir ar waith cyngor, sydd yn golygu na ellir rhoi amser i deulu a gyrfa. Ystyrir hynny i gyd wrth i bethau gael eu symud ymlaen mewn partneriaeth, fel y dylent, rhwng y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol.

Peter Law: I am grateful for those relevant points. I was a councillor for many years and I understand the sacrifice that families make, the promotional prospects that disappear through the window, and the time that has to be given to more work than there ever was under the old scheme. They were probably some of the sentiments behind the scheme that was introduced in Cardiff. However, it was the wrong thing at the wrong time. It was felt to be inappropriate. I understand that reaction, which I felt myself. However, that does not take away from the commitment of people in local authorities throughout Wales who give of their time to better their communities. We see it every day. I recognise it and I am sure that the working party will recognise it in its work on this important subject.

Peter Law: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y pwyntiau perthnasol hynny. Yr oeddwn innau'n gynghorydd am flynyddoedd lawer a deallaf yr aberth a wneir gan deuluoedd, y rhagolygon am ddyrchafiad sydd yn diflannu drwy'r ffenestr, a'r amser y mae'n rhaid ei roi i fwy o waith nag a fu erioed dan yr hen drefn. Dyna, mae'n debyg, rai o'r teimladau wrth wraidd y cynllun a gyflwynwyd yng Nghaerdydd. Fodd bynnag, hwn oedd yr ateb anghywir ar yr amser anghywir. Teimlid ei fod yn amhriodol. Deallaf yr ymateb hwnnw, a deimlais i fy hun. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n lleihau dim ar ymroddiad pobl mewn awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru sydd yn rhoi o'u hamser i wella'u cymunedau. Gwelwn hynny bob dydd. Yr wyf fi'n ei weld ac yr wyf yn siwr y bydd y gweithgor yn ei weld yn ei waith ar y pwnc pwysig hwn.

Jonathan Morgan: As one of those Members who has the great privilege of representing our capital city, I congratulate Assembly Members who supported the Conservative led motion to cap councillors' allowances. I thank you on behalf of the people of this city. I am dismayed that the Labour Party failed to support the motion.

Jonathan Morgan: Fel un o'r Aelodau hynny sydd â'r fraint fawr o gynrychioli'n prifddinas, llongyfarchaf Aelodau'r Cynulliad a gefnogodd gynnig y Ceidwadwyr i gapio lwfansau cynghorwyr. Diolch ichi ar ran pobl y ddinas hon. Yr wyf yn siomedig i'r Blaid Lafur fethu â chefnogi'r cynnig hwn.

3:00 p.m.

I will not pay tribute to Cardiff council or the lord mayor of the city. He has been dragged kicking and screaming into making the decision that was made at the last hour, last night. I do not think that this man has shown a positive attitude in his response to the work that has been done by opposition parties and

Ni thalaf deyrnged I gyngor Caerdydd nac arglwydd faer y ddinas. Fe'i llusgwyd dan gicio a sgrechian i wneud y penderfyniad a wnaethpwyd ar yr awr olaf, neithiwr. Nid wyf yn meddwl fod y dyn hwn wedi dangos agwedd gadarnhaol yn ei ymateb i'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan y gwrthbleidiau a chan y

the Conservative group in particular.

I have two points that I want Peter to clarify. If the total amount has reverted back to the original amount from 31 March 1999, how much money are the lord mayor, Russell Goodway, the deputy mayor and the deputy mayors in the cabinet, being paid? If they are being paid well in excess of what they were being paid until 31 March 1999, that money must be coming from somewhere. It could be the ordinary council members who see a reduction in their own expenses to cover an increase for those cabinet members. If the total amount has not changed and they receive an increase, that money must come from somewhere. Therefore, we want to see some figures and I hope that you can provide them.

I also want to know why a deal has been struck. Russell Goodway has agreed to cap the overall amount on councillors' allowances in the hope of an extra review. You will be mindful that this Assembly did not ask for an extra review. It instructed you to cap councillors' allowances in Wales. You have not done that. Therefore, what is the status of that motion? It was crystal clear: to cap councillors' allowances in Wales. You have not done that and I expect you to bring forward the necessary legislation.

Peter Law: Most other Members and I interpreted that as a reference to Cardiff council. In fairness, I do not know of any problems in other local authorities in Wales. You have tried to shame those authorities by making such a statement today. I regret that, because we always see such behaviour from the Tories. If you had had your way, we would have centralisation, as we saw so many times under the 18 years of Tory rule, we would have quangos running everything and you would eventually do away with local government altogether. That is the approach that we would have and people in communities would have no democratic say at all. We are against that, because we want people to be part of a partnership working with the Assembly and local government to get the best for their communities. That is what it is all about. I made it clear, I did not

grŵp Ceidwadol yn arbennig.

Mae gennyf ddau bwynt yr hoffwn i Peter eu clirio. Os yw'r cyfanswm wedi mynd yn ôl i'r swm gwreiddiol ar 31 Mawrth 1999, faint o arian a delir i'r arglwydd faer, Russell Goodway, y dirprwy faer a'r dirprwyon yn y cabinet? Os ydynt yn cael tâl llawer uwch na'r hyn yr oeddent yn ei gael tan 31 Mawrth 1999, mae'n rhaid fod yr arian hwnnw'n dod o rywle. Efallai mai'r cynghorwyr cyffredin fydd yn gweld gostyngiad yn eu treuliau hwy i dalu am godiad i'r aelodau cabinet hynny. Os nad yw'r cyfanswm wedi newid a'u bod hwy'n cael codiad, rhaid i'r arian hwnnw ddod o rywle. Felly, hoffem weld ffigurau, a gobeithiaf y gallwch eu darparu.

Hoffwn wybod hefyd pam y trawyd bargen. Mae Russell Goodway wedi cytuno i gapio cyfanswm lwfansau'r cynghorwyr gan obeithio am adolygiad ychwanegol. Chwi gofiwch na ofynnodd y Cynulliad hwn am adolygiad ychwanegol. Rhoddodd gyfarwyddyd ichi gapio lwfansau cynghorwyr yng Nghymru. Nid ydych wedi gwneud hynny. Felly, beth yw statws y cynnig hwnnw? Yr oedd yn glir fel grisial: capio lwfansau cynghorwyr yng Nghymru. Nid ydych wedi gwneud hynny a disgwyliaf ichi ddod â'r ddeddfwriaeth angenrheidiol ger bron.

Peter Law: Dehonglwyd hynny gan y rhan fwyaf o Aelodau eraill a mi fel cyfeiriad at gyngor Caerdydd. Er tegwch, ni wn am unrhyw broblemau mewn awdurdodau lleol eraill yng Nghymru. Yr ydych wedi ceisio dwyn cywilydd ar yr awdurdodau hynny drwy wneud y fath ddatganiad heddiw. Gresynaf am hynny, gan mai ymddygiad o'r fath a welwn o hyd gan y Torïaid. Pe baech chi wedi cael eich ffordd, byddem wedi cael canoli, fel y gwelsom gynifer o weithiau dan y 18 mlynedd o lywodraeth Dorïaidd, byddai gennym gwangos yn rhedeg popeth a byddech yn y pen draw yn gwneud i ffwrdd â llywodraeth leol yn gyfangwbl. Dyna beth fyddai gennym ac ni fyddai gan bobl yn y cymunedau unrhyw lais democrataidd o gwbl. Yr ydym ni yn erbyn hynny, oherwydd mae arnom eisiau i bobl fod yn rhan o bartneriaeth sydd yn gweithio gyda'r

shilly-shally about it. I told Cardiff council publicly, that either it withdraws or I will bring forward legislation. There has been no hole in the corner arrangement. It takes time to negotiate. That is reasonable. I have depersonalised this. I have talked about Cardiff council and in my discussions with Russell Goodway, he has been positive and acted in the interests of Cardiff, rightly recognising the Assembly's authority. I thank him for that and I am glad that we have an agreement, which is in our interest. As Janet Ryder and Peter Black said, we must look positively to the future and go forward with the working party to get fair and proper remuneration for our local government representatives.

Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol i sicrhau'r gorau i'w cymunedau. Dyna holl ddiben hyn. Dywedais hynny'n glir heb betruso. Dywedais wrth gyngor Caerdydd ar goedd, un ai ei fod yn tynnu'n ôl neu y byddwn yn cyflwyno deddfwriaeth. Ni fu unrhyw drefniant 'twll yn y gornel'. Mae negodi'n broses faith. Mae hynny'n rhesymol. Yr wyf wedi datbersonoli hyn. Siaradais am gyngor Caerdydd ac yn fy nhrafodaethau gyda Russell Goodway, bu'n gadarnhaol gan weithio er lles Caerdydd, tra'n cydnabod yn briodol awdurdod y Cynulliad. Diolchaf iddo am hynny ac yr wyf yn falch fod gennym gytundeb, sydd er lles inni. Fel y dywedodd Janet Ryder a Peter Black, rhaid inni edrych yn gadarnhaol i'r dyfodol a symud ymlaen gyda'r gweithgor i sicrhau tâl teg a phriodol i'n cynrychiolwyr llywodraeth leol.

Carwyn Jones: How much better it is, Llywydd, to see negotiation working instead of force. That is not something that the Welsh Conservatives understand. They introduced the capping system and implemented it ruthlessly. They were not interested in local democracy; they were only interested in capping and using force instead of negotiation. That was their opinion of local government. I am glad that you, Peter, have taken the view that negotiation with our partners in local government is a better way forward. Do you agree that at last people can say that we are looking at this situation and making a difference? Nobody can say now that the Assembly ignores matters. You, Peter, as the Secretary for Local Government and Housing can say that we have considered this and are ensuring that, where there are excessive rises, the Assembly will take action. You have done that through negotiation and I congratulate you on that. The ball has not been kicked into the long grass. The game has kicked off and you have scored under the post. We hear incoherent ramblings from the Welsh Conservatives. They are playing a different game that they always lose.

Carwyn Jones: Cymaint gwell, Lywydd, yw gweld negodi'n gweithio, yn hytrach na grym. Nid yw hynny'n rhywbeth a ddeellir gan Geidwadwyr Cymru. Cyflwynasant hwy'r drefn gapio, a'i gweithredu'n ddidostur. Nid oedd ganddynt ddiddordeb mewn democratiaeth leol; dim ond diddordeb mewn capio a defnyddio grym yn lle negodi. Dyna oedd eu barn hwy ar lywodraeth leol. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod chi, Peter, wedi cymryd y farn fod negodi gyda'n partneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol yn ffordd well ymlaen. A ydych yn cytuno y gall pobl o'r diwedd ddweud ein bod yn edrych ar y sefyllfa hon ac yn gwneud gwahaniaeth? Ni all neb ddweud mwyach fod y Cynulliad yn osgoi materion. Gallwch chi, Peter, fel Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ddweud ein bod wedi ystyried hyn a'n bod yn sicrhau, lle ceir codiadau gormodol, y bydd y Cynulliad yn gweithredu. Gwnaethoch hynny drwy negodi ac yr wyf yn eich llongyfarch ar hynny. Nid yw'r bêl wedi'i chicio i'r glaswellt hir. Mae'r gic gyntaf wedi'i chymryd ac yr ydych wedi sgorio o dan y pyst. Clywn falu awyr annealladwy gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig. Maent hwy'n chwarae gêm wahanol, un y maent bob amser yn ei cholli.

Peter Law: I agree with those wise words. I hope that the Conservatives are learning because they need to learn everyday about what this Assembly is doing. The Assembly is making the difference as far as the people

Peter Law: Cytunaf â'r geiriau doeth hynny. Gobeithiaf fod y Ceidwadwyr yn dysgu oherwydd mae angen iddynt ddysgu bob dydd am yr hyn y mae'r Cynulliad hwn yn ei wneud. Mae'r Cynulliad yn gwneud y

of Wales are concerned and they are seeing that in policy every day.

gwahaniaeth cyn belled ag y mae pobl Cymru yn y cwestiwn ac maent yn gweld hynny mewn polisïau bob dydd.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Some of the people who are shouting are trying to catch my eye to ask a question. They are not helping their chances.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae rhai o'r bobl sydd yn gweiddi yn ceisio dal fy llygad i ofyn cwestiwn. Nid ydynt yn helpu eu hachos.

Jenny Randerson: I make my usual declaration of interest as a Cardiff councillor. I pick up a few points in response to Peter. I deplore the length of time it has taken for anything to be done about this. It took three months for your party to respond and, in typical negotiating technique, it has taken until the last minute of the eleventh hour for Russell Goodway to respond. It is with regret that I recognise that the Assembly's power in this case is a blunt instrument. We have the power to cap the councillors' total allowance. You have chosen the logical figure but I point out to Jonathan that that figure allows for significant individual increases. I will explain why. There used to be 56 Labour councillors, of whom 46 received a special responsibility allowance under the old system. There are now only 50 Labour councillors—and I predict that next time there will be a lot fewer—but 27 receiving a special responsibility allowance. Therefore it allows for increases within that total figure. All of Cardiff's councillors should discuss this. I ask Peter to seek an assurance that this issue will be put formally to the council and that it will not be done purely on a voluntary, one-off, one member one decision basis and that there will be a rigorous decision that applies to all councillors with a special responsibility allowance. This applies to every member of the council.

Jenny Randerson: Gwnaf fy natganiad o fuddiant arferol fel cynghorydd Caerdydd. Codaf ambell bwynt mewn ymateb i Peter. Yr wyf yn gresynu y cymerwyd cymaint o amser i wneud unrhywbeth am hyn. Cymerodd dri mis i'ch plaid ymateb ac, mewn techneg negodi nodweddiadol, cymerodd tan funud olaf yr unfed awr ar ddeg i Russell Goodway ymateb. Gyda gofid y cydnabyddaf mai offeryn heb awch yw grym y Cynulliad yn yr achos hwn. Mae gennym y pŵer i gapio cyfanswm lwfansau cynghorwyr. Yr ydych wedi dewis y ffigur rhesymegol ond dywedaf wrth Jonathan fod y ffigur hwnnw'n caniatáu codiadau unigol sylweddol. Fe esboniaf pam. Arferai fod 56 o gynghorwyr Llafur, 46 ohonynt yn cael lwfans cyfrifoldeb arbennig dan yr hen drefn. Bellach dim ond 50 o gynghorwyr Llafur sydd—a rhagwelaf y bydd llawer llai y tro nesaf—ond 27 yn cael lwfans cyfrifoldeb arbennig. Felly caniateir ar gyfer codiadau o fewn y cyfanswm hwnnw. Dylai cynghorwyr Caerdydd i gyd drafod hyn. Gofynnaf i Peter geisio sicrwydd y caiff y mater hwn ei gyflwyno'n ffurfiol i'r cyngor ac na wneir hynny ar sail wirfoddol, unwaith-ac-am byth, un aelod un penderfyniad, ac y ceir penderfyniad cadarn a fydd yn berthnasol i bob cynghorydd sydd yn cael lwfans cyfrifoldeb arbennig. Mae a wnelo hyn â phob aelod o'r cyngor.

You referred to the new Cabinet system. I warn you that this Cabinet system gave birth to this appalling situation. You need to liaise closely with the Westminster Government in bringing controls on the potential excesses of the Cabinet system. Local government is now like the Wild West—we have thrown out the old rules from the old committee system and we have nothing in their place. I would like your assurance that there will be strict controls in their place. It is ironic that Conservatives, who are making so much noise here today, removed controls on

Bu ichi gyfeirio at y system Gabinet newydd. Rhybuddiaf chi mai'r system Gabinet hon a roddodd fod i'r sefyllfa warthus hon. Mae angen ichi gydweithio'n agos â Llywodraeth San Steffan i weithredu mesurau rheoli ar botensial gormodedd y system Gabinet. Mae llywodraeth leol fel y Gorllewin Gwyllt erbyn hyn—yr ydym wedi taflu'r hen reolau allan gyda'r hen drefn bwyllgorau ac nid oes gennym ddim yn eu lle. Hoffwn sicrwydd gennych y rhoddir mesurau rheoli llym yn eu lle. Mae'n eironig mai'r Ceidwadwyr, sydd yn cadw cymaint o dwrw yma heddiw, a

councillors' allowances in the first place. There is a case for the review that you have set up but I ask you to consider the damage this issue has done to local government throughout Wales. The public will not support massive allowances for councillors. The review body must learn from the mistakes of Cardiff and consider the excellent example of Liverpool.

ddileodd reolaeth dros lwfansau cynghorwyr yn y lle cyntaf. Mae achos dros yr adolygiad yr ydych wedi'i sefydlu, ond gofynnaf ichi ystyried y difrod a wnaeth y mater hwn i lywodraeth leol drwy Gymru gyfan. Ni wnaiff y cyhoedd gefnogi lwfansau anferth i gynghorwyr. Rhaid i'r corff adolygu ddysgu oddi wrth gamgymeriadau Caerdydd ac ystyried esiampl wych Lerpwl.

Peter Law: I appreciate you reminding us that the Conservatives removed the legislation in 1995. I am always grateful for these snippets that you occasionally bring to the debate. I have been open about the amount of time it has taken. I made my comments here in answer to Jonathan Morgan in March that if I felt that there were communities in which there was concern that allowances were inappropriate, I would take action accordingly. I have looked carefully at this for some time and I made a public statement some two weeks before we debated it in the Chamber. I gave Cardiff two weeks, which is appropriate and correct. We are not running a twopenny-halfpenny outfit. We are running the Government of Wales in the National Assembly for Wales and we have a duty to act in a proper, appropriate manner and to give local government, or whatever organisation with which we deal, appropriate time to respond. They had 14 days. All sorts of opinions will swirl around in a debate in 14 days and people will have all sorts of ideas. I would have failed in my duty if I had not given 14 days. Last night I eventually had a meeting with Cardiff City and County Council. As long as it was not at 3 p.m. this afternoon, that is fine. We have ensured a positive outcome that is in everybody's interest.

Peter Law: Diolch am ein hatgoffa mai'r Ceidwadwyr a ddiddymodd y ddeddfwriaeth yn 1995. Byddaf bob amser yn gwerthfawrogi'r pytiau hyn a gyflwynwch i'r ddadl o bryd i'w gilydd. Bûm yn agored am yr amser a gymerwyd gyda hyn. Gwneuthum fy sylwadau yma mewn ateb i Jonathan Morgan ym mis Mawrth y byddwn, pe teimlwn fod yna gymunedau lle'r oedd pryder fod lwfansau'n amhriodol, yn gweithredu ar hynny. Yr wyf wedi edrych yn ofalus ar hyn ers tro a gwneuthum ddatganiad cyhoeddus rhyw bythefnos cyn inni ei drafod yn y Siambr. Rhoddais bythefnos i Gaerdydd, sydd yn briodol ac yn gywir. Nid ydym yn rhedeg sioe geiniog a dimai. Yr ydym yn rhedeg Llywodraeth Cymru yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ac mae gennym ddyletswydd i weithredu mewn modd priodol a rhoi i lywodraeth leol, neu ba gorff bynnag y byddwn yn delio ag ef, amser priodol i ymateb. Cawsant 14 diwrnod. Bydd pob math o farn yn chwyrlïo o gwmpas mewn dadl mewn 14 diwrnod a bydd pobl yn cael pob math o syniadau. Buaswn wedi methu yn fy nyletswydd pe na bawn wedi rhoi 14 diwrnod. Neithiwr o'r diwedd cefais gyfarfod gyda Chyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd. Cyn belled nad am dri o'r gloch y prynhawn yma y digwyddodd hynny, mae popeth yn iawn. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau canlyniad cadarnhaol sydd er y gorau i bawb.

3:10 p.m.

I appreciate you acknowledging that a logical figure has been reached by voluntary agreement. A structure of allowances in Cardiff council is not a matter for me or for the Assembly, but for that council. We can only deal with the overall budgetary figure. We have done so and I hope that you will endorse it.

Gwerthfawrogaf eich sylw'n cydnabod y cyrhaeddwyd ffigur rhesymegol drwy gytundeb gwirfoddol. Nid mater i mi na'r Cynulliad yw strwythur lwfansau yng nghyngor Caerdydd, ond mater i'r cyngor hwnnw. Ni allwn ond delio â'r ffigur cyllideb cyffredinol. Gwnaethom hynny a gobeithiaf y gwnewch ei gadarnhau.

Cabinet systems—whatever your opinion on

Systemau cabinet—beth bynnag yw eich barn

them—are the future. As far as the UK Government is concerned, they are part of local government modernisation and will be introduced shortly. It is important that we consider local government modernisation in relation to the working party, and remember that members of those cabinets will have many more responsibilities and duties. We must be realistic. However, I recognise that we want to have much more debate and discussion about it as the Local Government Bill comes before the Assembly. The Committee has already started its discussions.

amdanynt—yw'r dyfodol. O safbwynt llywodraeth y DU, maent yn rhan o foderneiddio llywodraeth leol ac fe'u cyflwynir cyn hir. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried moderneiddio llywodraeth leol mewn perthynas â'r gweithgor, a chofio y bydd gan aelodau'r cabinetau hynny lawer mwy o gyfrifoldebau a dyletswyddau. Rhaid inni fod yn realistig. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddaf fod arnom eisiau cael llawer mwy o ddadlau a thrafod ar hyn wrth i Fesur Llywodraeth Leol ddod ger bron y Cynulliad. Mae'r Pwyllgor eisoes wedi dechrau ei drafodaethau.

Pauline Jarman: Did the agreement that you reached last night follow the council resolution or the word of the leader of Cardiff council? It seems to me that, under the existing legislation, he would not have the authority or the power to make that decision whether a cabinet system exists or not. What comfort can you give us that a council resolution to this effect will be tabled, if it has not been, and can command the unanimous support of all the membership of Cardiff council?

Pauline Jarman: A wnaeth y cytundeb y daethoch iddo neithiwr ddilyn penderfyniad y cyngor ynteu ai dilyn gair arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd a wnaethpwyd? Mae'n ymddangos i mi na fyddai ganddo na'r awdurdod na'r grym dan y ddeddfwriaeth bresennol i wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw, boed system gabinet yn bodoli ai peidio. Pa gysur allwch chi ei roi inni y cyflwynir penderfyniad cyngor i'r perwyl hwn, os na wnaethpwyd eisoes, ac y gall fynnu cefnogaeth unfrydol holl aelodau cyngor Caerdydd?

The Presiding Officer: Before Peter answers that, you must declare an interest.

Y Llywydd: Cyn i Peter ateb hwnnw, rhaid ichi ddatgan buddiant.

Pauline Jarman: I declare an interest as the non-claiming leader of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council.

Pauline Jarman: Yr wyf yn datgan buddiant fel arweinydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf, nad yw'n hawlio lwfans.

Peter Law: And a member of the cabinet—very impressive.

Peter Law: Ac aelod o'r cabinet—pwysig iawn.

I had an official meeting with the leader and chief executive of Cardiff council, together with other officials. I then had an assurance today in a letter from the lord mayor and leader of Cardiff council. In that letter, he states that, in the light of the commitment given, his colleagues have agreed voluntarily to limit, from today, the individual allowances paid to members so that the total amount of allowances to be paid for 2000-01 will not exceed the 1998-99 level, which is £832,322. That assurance has been publicly made and I expect Cardiff council to take the necessary legislative action to honour it. The letter confirms that it has immediately suspended those payments.

Cefais gyfarfod swyddogol gydag arweinydd a phrif weithredwr cyngor Caerdydd, ynghyd â swyddogion eraill. Wedyn cefais sicrwydd heddiw mewn llythyr oddi wrth yr arglwydd faer ac arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd. Yn y llythyr hwnnw, dywed fod ei gyd-aelodau, yng ngoleuni'r ymrwymiad a roddwyd, wedi cytuno'n wirfoddol i gyfyngu, o heddiw ymlaen, y lwfansau unigol a delir i aelodau fel na fydd cyfanswm y lwfansau a delir am 2000-01 yn ddim uwch na lefel 1998-99, hynny yw £832,322. Rhoddwyd y sicrwydd hwnnw'n gyhoeddus a disgwyliaf i gyngor Caerdydd weithredu'r ddeddfwriaeth angenrheidiol i'w anrhydeddu. Mae'r llythyr yn cadarnhau ei fod wedi atal y taliadau

hynny'n syth.

Jane Davidson: I respond to Jonathan Morgan. He asked why Labour Members had not supported his motion on capping councillors in Wales and said that that was a shame. Labour has no interest in doing so. Today, we are discussing a particular council and there has been much inappropriate personalisation in the local press and in the Chamber. I have a legitimate interest because my constituency includes part of Cardiff. It seems that the two fundamental things that have happened today have been lost. I would like Peter to assure me that he has achieved the same thing by voluntary agreement as he would have achieved by capping, and that the Assembly has no powers to alter individual members' allowances—that is a matter for local government.

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf yn ymateb i Jonathan Morgan. Gofynnodd ef pam nad oedd Aelodau Llafur wedi cefnogi'i gynnig ef ar gapio cynghorwyr yng Nghymru a dywedodd fod hynny'n gywilydd. Nid oes gan Lafur unrhyw ddiddordeb mewn gwneud hynny. Heddiw, yr ydym yn trafod cyngor arbennig a bu llawer o bersonoli amhriodol yn y wasg leol ac yn y Siambr. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb cyfreithlon oherwydd mae fy etholaeth yn cynnwys rhan o Gaerdydd. Mae'n ymddangos y collwyd y ddau beth sylfaenol a ddigwyddodd heddiw. Hoffwn i Peter fy sicrhau ei fod wedi cyflawni'r un peth drwy gytundeb gwirfoddol ag y buasai wedi'i gyflawni drwy gapio, ac nad oes gan y Cynulliad rym i newid lwfansau aelodau unigol—mater i lywodraeth leol yw hynny.

Peter Law: In my speech, I referred to the fact that the voluntary agreement that I obtained from the negotiations that I have led—after giving you an assurance two weeks ago that I would deal positively with this—has led to the same result that we would have had if we had gone ahead with a capping arrangement. That is much better because we are working in partnership and agreement. It has a ramification for the whole of Welsh local government because it is part of the Welsh Local Government Association, which has been helpful in these negotiations. I thank it for its co-operation. Individual allowances in any authority is not a matter for the Assembly.

Peter Law: Yn fy araith, cyfeiriais at y ffaith fod y cytundeb gwirfoddol a gefais drwy'r negodi a arweiniais—ar ôl rhoi sicrwydd ichi bythefnos yn ôl y byddwn yn delio'n gadarnhaol â hyn—wedi arwain at yr un canlyniad ag a gawsem petaem wedi mynd ymlaen â threfniant capio. Mae hynny'n llawer gwell gan ein bod yn gweithio drwy bartneriaeth a chytundeb. Mae i hyn oblygiadau i lywodraeth leol Cymru yn ei chyfanrwydd oherwydd mae'n rhan o Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, a'n cynorthwyodd yn y negodi hwn. Diolch iddi am ei chydweithrediad. Nid mater i'r Cynulliad yw lwfansau unigol mewn unrhyw awdurdod.

Richard Edwards: Unlike the moaning minnies—to coin a phrase—to my right, I pay tribute to you, Peter, for your pivotal role in resolving this sorry saga. You deserve the highest praise. You have delivered the objectives set for you by the Assembly. The Assembly, local government and its reputation and the people of Cardiff and Wales are in your debt. Well done.

Richard Edwards: Yn wahanol i'r cwynwyr ar y dde imi, talaf deyrnged ichi, Peter, am eich rôl ganolog wrth ddatrys y saga druenus hon. Yr ydych yn haeddu'r clod mwyaf. Yr ydych wedi cyflawni'r amcanion a osodwyd ichi gan y Cynulliad. Mae'r Cynulliad, llywodraeth leol a'i henw da a phobl Caerdydd a Chymru mewn dyled ichi. Da iawn chi.

Peter Law: Thank you, Richard.

Peter Law: Diolch, Richard.

David Davies: In the usual positive way that I like to contribute to this Chamber, I say how much we welcome this announcement. It was, despite what some Members say, the culmination of a Conservative campaign to

David Davies: Yn y ffordd gadarnhaol arferol yr hoffaf gyfrannu at y Siambr hon, dywedaf gymaint y croesawn y cyhoeddiad hwn. Yr oedd, er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywed rhai Aelodau, yn benllanw ymgyrch

get the leader of Cardiff City and County Council to pay himself a fair wage. I remind Members that the Conservative Party gave up one of its precious minority party debate slots to raise this issue. It was because of that Conservative campaign and because the other opposition parties supported us, that you had these meetings and forced this issue. What of the Labour Party? What was it doing when we had this debate? Labour abstained and sat on the fence. It now tries to claim credit for what we achieved. The Liberals who get up—

Geidwadol i gael arweinydd Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd i dalu cyflog teg iddo'i hun. Atgoffaf Aelodau yr ildiodd y Blaid Geidwadol un o'i slotiau gwerthfawr ar gyfer dadl plaid leiafrifol er mwyn codi'r mater hwn. Oherwydd yr ymgyrch Geidwadol honno ac oherwydd i'r gwrthbleidiau eraill ein cefnogi, y cawsoch chi'r cyfarfodydd hyn a gwthio'r mater hwn. Beth am y Blaid Lafur? Beth oedd hi'n ei wneud pan gawsom y ddadl hon? Atal ei phleidlais a wnaeth Llafur ac eistedd ar y ffens. Yn awr mae'n ceisio hawlio clod am yr hyn a gyflawnwyd gennym ni. Mae'r Rhyddfrydwyr sydd yn codi—

Michael German and Jenny Randerson *rose—*

Michael German a Jenny Randerson *a gododd—*

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

David Davies: The Liberals—

David Davies: Mae'r Rhyddfrydwyr—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I have pressed my red button. I advise you to sit down, otherwise the ejector machine will come on.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf wedi pwyso fy motwm coch. Fe'ch cynghoraf i eistedd i lawr, neu daw'r peiriant alldaflu ymlaen.

Michael German: Point of order—

Michael German: Pwynt o drefn—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will not take your point of order now. I remind David that this is not a debate, but a discussion on a statement. I will take all points of order relating to this event after the next statement, to which I hope to move to immediately.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni chymeraf eich pwynt o drefn yn awr. Atgoffaf David nad dadl yw hon, ond trafodaeth ar ddatganiad. Cymeraf bob pwynt o drefn ynglŷn â'r digwyddiad hwn ar ôl y datganiad nesaf, y gobeithiaf symud ato yn syth.

David Davies: What about his back pay and how much is he earning?

David Davies: Beth am ei ôl-gyflog a faint y mae'n ei ennill?

Glyn Davies: Yes, get to the point.

Glyn Davies: Ie, dewch at y pwynt.

Peter Law: Everyone who has been on this planet in the last few weeks knows that I have been publicly critical of Cardiff council's allowances because I thought that they were not appropriate. I have never sought to hide that. If something is not appropriate, I am the first one to say so, immaterial of who is involved. That has been the case with other members of my party and matters that had to be dealt with. I am pleased that we have been able to come to a voluntary solution. I thank Cardiff council for that. You asked, David, about what he will be paid. I do

Peter Law: Mae pawb a fu ar y blaned hon yn yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf yn gwybod y bûm yn feirniadol yn gyhoeddus o lwfansau cyngor Caerdydd am fy mod yn meddwl nad oeddent yn briodol. Nid wyf erioed wedi ceisio cuddio hynny. Os yw rhywbeth yn amhriodol, fi yw'r cyntaf i ddweud hynny, ni waeth pwy sydd dan sylw. Dyna fu'r achos gydag aelodau eraill o'm plaid a materion y bu'n rhaid delio â hwy. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi gallu cyrraedd ateb gwirfoddol. Diolchaf i gyngor Caerdydd am hynny. Holasoch, David, ynghylch beth a

not know what anyone will be paid following this decision today. That is a matter for Cardiff council.

delir iddo. Nid wyf yn gwybod beth a delir i neb ar ôl y penderfyniad hwn heddiw. Mater i gyngor Caerdydd yw hwnnw.

There is no back pay. However, I think that it would be appropriate for any arrangement that is reached in the new local government allowances working group to be applied retrospectively back to April 2000 as far as Cardiff is concerned. That would be correct, fair and appropriate. That is all I can say on that.

Nid oes ôl-gyflog. Fodd bynnag, credaf y byddai'n briodol i unrhyw drefniant a wneir yn y gweithgor lwfansau llywodraeth leol newydd gael ei ôl-ddyddio i Ebrill 2000 yn achos Caerdydd. Byddai hynny'n gywir, yn deg ac yn briodol. Dyna'r cwbl y gallaf ei ddweud ar hynny.

Datganiad ar Gyllideb 2000-01
Statement on the 2000-01 Budget

The Finance Secretary (Edwina Hart): I make a statement on the budget for 2000-01. This follows my earlier statement on 28 March. Since that time, my colleagues and I have consulted the relevant Committees and the other political parties on our proposals. I am grateful for all the comments that we have received and I believe that there is a fair measure of consensus.

Yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid (Edwina Hart): Gwnaf ddatganiad ar y gyllideb am 2000-01. Mae hyn yn dilyn fy natganiad cynharach ar 28 Mawrth. Ers hynny, mae fy nghyd-aelodau a mi wedi ymgynghori â'r Pwyllgorau perthnasol a'r pleidiau gwleidyddol eraill ar ein cynigion. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr holl sylwadau a dderbyniasom a chredaf fod cryn fesur o gonsensws.

I am also grateful to the other political parties and the Presiding Officer for allowing me to proceed by way of a statement. As I said on 28 March, Standing Order No. 19 is currently silent on the treatment of additional funds. We shall bring forward amendments to that Standing Order in the near future to remedy that situation and so that we can clarify the position in future years. I understand that the matter is on the agenda for the Business Committee meeting after the recess.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar hefyd i'r pleidiau gwleidyddol eraill a'r Llywydd am ganiatáu imi fynd ymlaen drwy gyfrwng datganiad. Fel y dywedais ar 28 Mawrth, mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19 yn ddistaw ar hyn o bryd ar driniaeth arian ychwanegol. Byddwn yn cyflwyno gwelliannau i'r Rheol Sefydlog honno yn y dyfodol agos i unioni'r sefyllfa honno ac fel y gallwn sicrhau eglurder ar y sefyllfa yn y dyfodol. Deallaf fod y mater ar agenda cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes ar ôl y gwyliau.

Some £158 million extra is available for this financial year. The bulk of it will go to health and education, the Assembly's main priorities. I confirm that £99 million extra will go to health. I propose to allocate a further £11 million from uncommitted carry-forward in other programmes, making a total provision of £110 million. This delivers a cash increase in the health sub-expenditure groups over last year of £293 million. That is an increase of 11.3 per cent in cash terms, or 9 per cent in real terms, that is, after taking inflation into consideration.

Mae rhyw £158 miliwn yn ychwanegol ar gael ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Aiff y rhan fwyaf o'r arian i iechyd ac addysg, sef prif flaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad. Cadarnhaf yr aiff £99 miliwn ychwanegol i iechyd. Bwriadaf ddyrannu £11 miliwn ar ben hynny o arian heb ei ymrwymo a gariwyd ymlaen mewn rhaglenni eraill, gan wneud cyfanswm darpariaeth o £110 miliwn. Mae hyn yn rhoi cynnydd ariannol o £293 miliwn dros y llynedd yng ngrwpiau is-wariant iechyd. Dyna gynnydd o 11.3 y cant mewn termau real, hynny yw, ar ôl cymryd chwyddiant i ystyriaeth.

3:20 p.m.

The total 2000-01 health authority allocation is now £2.2 billion. That is an overall cash increase of £196 million or 9.4 per cent in cash terms. This, of course, still leaves £80 million of new money available in the current year to address our spending priorities for improving health services in Wales and to invest in the future of the national health service.

Mae cyfanswm dyraniad 2000-01 i awdurdodau iechyd bellach yn £2.2 biliwn. Dyna gynnydd ariannol cyffredinol o £196 miliwn neu 9.4 y cant yn nhermau arian. Mae hyn, wrth gwrs, yn dal i adael £80 miliwn o arian newydd sydd ar gael yn y flwyddyn gyfredol i'w gyfeirio at ein blaenoriaethau gwariant ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru ac i'w fuddsoddi yn nyfodol y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

We will establish spending priorities for the use of these additional resources following consultation with the NHS and its partners, and the Health and Social Services Committee. The Assembly will also challenge the NHS to improve its performance and, as I indicated on 28 March, will expect the NHS to make significant progress in service delivery and in getting its house in order in light of the increased allocation. We will also set specific new targets for the delivery of the changes and developments funded from the £80 million.

Byddwn yn sefydlu blaenoriaethau gwariant ar gyfer defnyddio'r adnoddau ychwanegol hyn ar ôl ymgynghori â'r NHS a'i bartneriaid, a'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Bydd y Cynulliad hefyd yn herio'r NHS i wella'i berfformiad ac, fel y nodais ar 28 Mawrth, disgwyliwn i'r NHS gymryd camau sylweddol ymlaen o ran cyflwyno'r gwasanaeth a rhoi ei dŷ mewn trefn yng ngoleuni'r dyraniad ychwanegol. Byddwn hefyd yn pennu targedau penodol newydd ar gyfer cyflwyno'r newidiadau a'r datblygiadau a ariennir o'r £80 miliwn.

On education, as I previously indicated, £49.6 million will be allocated across the following priorities: additions to schools' budgets, capital investment in schools and a teacher recruitment package. I can now give more details. A sum of £20.5 million will be added to schools' delegated budgets. Primary schools will receive between £3,000 and £9,000, depending on their size. Secondary schools will receive between £30,000 and £50,000. Special schools will receive £15,000. Nursery schools will receive £3,000 and pupil referral units will also receive £3,000.

Ar addysg, fel y nodais o'r blaen, dyrennir £49.6 miliwn ar draws y blaenoriaethau canlynol: ychwanegiadau at gyllidebau ysgolion, buddsoddi cyfalaf mewn ysgolion a phecyn recriwtio athrawon. Yn awr gallaf roi mwy o fanylion. Ychwanegir swm o £20.5 miliwn at gyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion. Bydd ysgolion cynradd yn derbyn rhwng £3,000 a £9,000, yn dibynnu ar eu maint. Caiff ysgolion uwchradd rhwng £30,000 a £50,000. Caiff ysgolion arbennig £15,000. Caiff ysgolion meithrin £3,000 a bydd unedau cyfeirio disgyblion yn cael £3,000 hefyd.

These proposals were discussed and endorsed by the Pre-16 Education Committee on 29 March. I know that Members were particularly concerned that small schools should receive additions to their budgets. The proposals have also been discussed with the Welsh Local Government Association, which is content with the distribution of resources.

Cafodd y cynigion hyn eu trafod a'u cadarnhau gan y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 ar 29 Mawrth. Gwn fod Aelodau'n arbennig o bryderus y dylai ysgolion bychain gael ychwanegiadau at eu cyllidebau. Trafodwyd y cynigion hefyd gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, sydd yn fodlon gyda'r ffordd y dyrannwyd adnoddau.

Schools can use the funds as they wish. We expect them to use the moneys in ways that will improve standards and attain targets in

Caiff ysgolion ddefnyddio'r arian fel y mynnant. Byddwn yn disgwyl iddynt ddefnyddio'r arian mewn ffyrdd a fydd yn

school development plans. They could be used for books, equipment, staff costs, homework support or repairs. However, I am sure that all of you, like me, have every confidence that governing bodies, teachers and headteachers in schools will ensure that this money is wisely spent.

gwella safonau ac yn cyrraedd targedau yng nghynlluniau datblygu'r ysgolion. Gellid ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer llyfrau, offer, costau staff, cefnogi gwaith cartref neu waith atgyweirio. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr bod gan bob un ohonoch, fel fi, bob hyder y bydd cyrff llywodraethol, athrawon a phenaethiaid mewn ysgolion yn sicrhau y caiff yr arian hwn ei wario'n ddoeth.

The funds for schools will be distributed to local education authorities by means of a special grant report under section 88B of the Local Government Act 1988. The terms of the grant will require local authorities to distribute resources to schools as additions to their delegated budgets. The report will be laid shortly after the Assembly returns from its Easter recess.

Caiff yr arian i ysgolion ei ddosbarthu i awdurdodau addysg lleol drwy gyfrwng adroddiad grant arbennig dan adran 88B Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 1988. Dan delerau'r grant bydd gofyn i awdurdodau lleol ddosbarthu adnoddau i ysgolion fel ychwanegiadau at eu cyllidebau dirprwyedig. Gosodir yr adroddiad yn fuan wedi i'r Cynulliad ddychwelyd ar ôl gwyliau'r Pasg.

I know that capital provision for schools is one of the key priorities of the Assembly and the Pre-16 Education Committee in order to get all school buildings into good physical shape and properly maintained by 2010. I am therefore pleased to be able to announce an increase in schools' capital provision, above the £25 million I indicated previously. A sum of £26.8 million will be allocated to schools' capital.

Gwn mai darparu cyfalaf i ysgolion yw un o flaenoriaethau allweddol y Cynulliad a'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 er mwyn sicrhau bod pob adeilad ysgol mewn cyflwr ffisegol da ac wedi'i gynnal yn iawn erbyn 2010. Mae'n dda gennyf felly gyhoeddi cynnydd yn narpariaeth gyfalaf ysgolion, dros ben y £25 miliwn a nodais yn flaenorol. Dyrennir swm o £26.8 miliwn i gyfalaf ysgolion.

The detailed arrangements are being discussed with the WLGA, but we envisage funding by means of 100 per cent grant. Local authorities must demonstrate that their proposals are additional to their normal capital plans. That is important. We intend the moneys to be used for significant schemes, which local authorities would have difficulty funding from their normal capital programme. Local authority proposals must take account of their asset management plans and the conclusions of their school organisation plan on the need to add school places or remove surplus ones.

Mae'r trefniadau manwl yn cael eu trafod gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, ond rhagwelwn ariannu drwy gyfrwng grant 100 y cant. Rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ddangos fod eu cynigion yn ychwanegol at eu cynlluniau cyfalaf arferol. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Bwriadwn i'r arian gael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer cynlluniau sylweddol, y byddai awdurdodau lleol yn cael anhawster talu amdanynt o'u rhaglen gyfalaf arferol. Rhaid i gynigion yr awdurdodau lleol roi ystyriaeth i'w cynlluniau rheoli asedau a chasgliadau eu cynllun trefnu ysgolion ar yr angen i ychwanegu lleoedd ysgol neu ddileu rhai gormodol.

Finally, I indicated in my previous statement that we were looking at a teacher recruitment package. We examined the Department for Education and Employment's package and we do not believe that, as a whole, it would meet the circumstances in Wales. We have therefore developed our own package. It includes training and teaching grants and is

Yn olaf, nodais yn fy natganiad blaenorol ein bod yn edrych ar becyn recriwtio athrawon. Edrychasom ar becyn yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth ac nid ydym yn credu y byddai, ar y cyfan, yn cwrdd ag amgylchiadau yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi datblygu'n pecyn ein hunain felly. Mae'n cynnwys grantiau hyfforddi a dysgu a'i nod yw cynyddu nifer y

aimed at boosting the numbers of graduates entering teaching, with an improved graduate teacher programme. It is an employment-based route to teaching. It begins in September 2000 and the net additional cost of the scheme in 2000-01 is estimated at £2.3 million.

graddedigion sydd yn mynd i mewn i ddysgu, gyda gwell rhaglen ddysgu i raddedigion. Mae'n llwybr at ddysgu, yn seiliedig ar gyflogaeth. Mae'n dechrau ym Medi 2000 ac amcangyfrifir mai £2.3 miliwn fydd cost ychwanegol net y cynllun yn 2000-01.

The training and teaching grants will be for postgraduate secondary teaching trainees. In subjects where there are shortages—for example, maths, modern foreign languages, science, technology and Welsh—a training grant of £6,000 and an additional £4,000 for trainees who successfully complete their first year of teaching and continue to teach in those subjects will be provided—£10,000 in total. In other subjects, a training grant of £4,000 and a £2,000 bonus for trainees who successfully complete their first year of teaching and continue to teach will be provided—£6,000 in total.

Bydd y grantiau hyfforddi a dysgu ar gyfer graddedigion sydd yn hyfforddi i fynd yn athrawon uwchradd. Mewn pynciau lle ceir prinder—er enghraifft, mathemateg, ieithoedd tramor modern, gwyddoniaeth, technoleg a Chymraeg—darperir grant hyfforddi o £6,000 a £4,000 yn ychwanegol i hyfforddeion sydd yn cyflawni'u blwyddyn gyntaf o ddysgu'n llwyddiannus ac yn parhau i ddysgu yn y pynciau hynny—dyna gyfanswm o £10,000. Mewn pynciau eraill, darperir grant hyfforddi o £4,000 a £2,000 o fonws i hyfforddeion sydd yn cyflawni'u blwyddyn gyntaf o ddysgu'n llwyddiannus ac yn parhau i ddysgu—sef cyfanswm o £6,000.

In addition, schools that train teachers through the graduate teacher programme, aimed at mature students, will receive up to £13,000 to help meet the cost of recruitment and training. Rosemary Butler will make a separate announcement on the details of the package, but we believe that it is the right approach to meet our circumstances in Wales.

Ar ben hynny, bydd ysgolion sydd yn hyfforddi athrawon drwy'r rhaglen ddysgu i raddedigion, a anelir at fyfyrwyr aeddfed, yn cael hyd at £13,000 i helpu i dalu cost recriwtio a hyfforddi. Bydd Rosemary Butler yn gwneud cyhoeddiad ar wahân ar fanylion y pecyn, ond credwn mai dyma'r ffordd iawn i ateb ein hamgylchiadau ni yng Nghymru.

On transport, I confirm that £8.2 million will be made available and will be split between local authority integrated transport packages and safer community transport projects. As I previously indicated, despite increasing this year's transport grant settlement, bids still far exceeded resources available. We will therefore increase the allocation by a further £4.1 million. We are also keen to see the progress made in implementing some of the many worthwhile small-scale safety schemes that await funding. We propose to allocate £4.1 million towards this and we shall target this money taking into account the new Great Britain road safety strategy and the Assembly's own policies. The majority of this money will be allocated to local authorities, but some will be available to support trunk-road safety.

Ar drafnidiaeth, cadarnhaf y darperir £8.2 miliwn i'w rannu rhwng pecynnau trafnidiaeth integredig awdurdodau lleol a phrosiectau trafnidiaeth gymunedol fwy diogel. Fel y nodais o'r blaen, er inni gynyddu cytundeb grant trafnidiaeth eleni, bu'r ceisiadau'n llawer uwch na'r adnoddau oedd ar gael o hyd. Felly byddwn yn cynyddu'r dyraniad eto o £4.1 miliwn. Yr ydym yn awyddus hefyd i weld beth a gyflawnwyd i weithredu rhai o'r nifer o fân gynlluniau diogelwch gwerth chweil sydd yn aros am arian. Bwriadwn ddyrannu £4.1 miliwn tuag at hyn a byddwn yn targedu'r arian hwn gan gymryd i ystyriaeth strategaeth ddiogelwch ffyrdd newydd Prydain Fawr a pholisïau'r Cynulliad ei hun. Dyrennir y rhan fwyaf o'r arian hwn i awdurdodau lleol, ond bydd rhywfaint ar gael i gefnogi diogelwch ar y cefnffyrdd.

The Assembly has responsibility for the careful stewardship of Wales's beautiful countryside, for people today and future generations to enjoy. I am pleased to confirm that we are allocating £800,000 for the Countryside Council for Wales to promote the conservation of, and access to Wales's finest countryside and wildlife. In making this allocation, we shall ask the council to give priority to a number of measures. These will include the acceleration of a mapping exercise—required under the Countryside and Rights of Way Bill when enacted; the establishment of local access forums across Wales; and additional grants for voluntary bodies, such as the wildlife trusts and the local authorities in Wales's five areas of outstanding natural beauty. Sue Essex will make a separate announcement on the use of the extra funds for transport and the environment.

Mae gan y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb am stiwardiaeth ofalus dros gefn gwlad prydferth Cymru, er mwynhad pobl heddiw a chenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Mae'n dda gennyf gadarnhau ein bod yn dyrannu £800,000 i Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru i hyrwyddo cadwraeth a mynediad at gefn gwlad a bywyd gwyllt gorau Cymru. Wrth wneud y dyraniad hwn, byddwn yn gofyn i'r cyngor roi blaenoriaeth i nifer o fesurau. Bydd y rhain yn cynnwys cyflymu ymarfer mapio—fydd yn ofynnol dan y Mesur Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy pan wneir hwnnw'n ddeddf; sefydlu fforymau mynediad lleol ar draws Cymru; a grantiau ychwanegol i gyrff gwirfoddol, megis yr ymddiriedolaethau byd natur a'r awdurdodau lleol yn y pum ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol yng Nghymru. Bydd Sue Essex yn gwneud cyhoeddiad ar wahân ar ddefnydd yr arian ychwanegol ar gyfer trafnidiaeth a'r amgylchedd.

I can also confirm that I shall allocate an extra £1 million for economic development from uncommitted carry-forward resources to the Pathway to Prosperity fund for use in developing economic development programmes. Subject to the Committee's views, we will propose that these funds should be used for state aids and for support to credit unions.

Gallaf gadarnhau hefyd y byddaf yn dyrannu £1 miliwn yn ychwanegol at ddatblygu economaidd o adnoddau heb eu rhwymo a gariwyd ymlaen, i gronfa'r Ffordd i Ffyniant i'w ddefnyddio i ddatblygu gwahanol raglenni datblygu economaidd. Yn amodol ar farn y Pwyllgor, byddwn yn cynnig y dylid defnyddio'r arian hwn ar gyfer cymorth gan y wladwriaeth a chefnogaeth i undebau credyd.

Finally, I have one announcement that I did not signal on 28 March. If you were reading my script, I have changed the text. On 1 April, thanks to the decisions taken at the last budget by the Assembly, the National Museums & Galleries of Wales were able to give free entry to all children and young people of school age. This was universally welcomed and represents a significant step in widening access to the huge range of exhibits, paintings and other items on display. But this is only the first step. I am delighted to announce the further extension of free entry—this time to the over 60s and the unemployed. From 1 May, the museum will open its doors for seven days a week to these groups, apart from Cathays Park, which will continue to close on a Monday. This will cost £200,000 in 2000-01 and will be met from the carry-forward of uncommitted resources. I hope that the Assembly will support this measure, which will directly support our aims of social inclusion and

Yn olaf, mae gennyf un cyhoeddiad na soniais amdano ar 28 Mawrth. Os oeddech yn darllen fy sgript, yr wyf wedi newid y testun. Ar 1 Ebrill, diolch i'r penderfyniadau a wnaethpwyd yn y gyllideb ddiwethaf gan y Cynulliad, llwyddodd Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru i roi mynediad am ddim i blant a phobl ifanc oed ysgol. Croesawyd hyn yn gyffredinol ac mae'n cynrychioli cam arwyddocaol i ehangu'r cyfle i weld yr ystod anferth o arddangosiadau, paentiadau ac eitemau eraill a ddangosir. Ond dim ond y cam cyntaf yw hyn. Mae'n bleser gennyf gyhoeddi ymestyn ymhellach y cynllun mynediad am ddim—y tro yma i rai dros 60 a'r di-waith. O 1 Mai, bydd yr amgueddfa'n agor ei drysau am saith diwrnod yr wythnos i'r grwpiau hyn, ac eithrio Parc Cathays, a fydd yn dal i gau ar ddydd Llun. Bydd hyn yn costio £200,000 yn 2000-01 a thelir amdano o'r adnoddau heb eu rhwymo a gariwyd ymlaen. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r cam hwn, a

lifelong learning.

fydd yn cefnogi'n uniongyrchol ein hamcanion o safbwynt cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a dysgu gydol oes.

The detailed budgetary tables were circulated with this statement—they are formatted to reflect the new committee structures. They do not include the allocations coming from uncommitted carry-forward or the agricultural monies that I announced. These will be dealt with in-year. In this context, I shall make a statement regarding the carry-forward of resources between the last financial year and this when we return after the recess, when all the necessary figures are available. I will be delighted to take any questions on the statement.

Cylchredwyd y tablau cyllidebol manwl gyda'r datganiad hwn—maent wedi'u fformatio i adlewyrchu'r strwythurau pwyllgorau newydd. Nid ydynt yn cynnwys y dyraniadau a ddaw o arian heb ei rwymo a gariwyd ymlaen na'r arian amaethyddol a gyhoeddais. Ymdrinnir â'r rhain o fewn y flwyddyn. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, byddaf yn gwneud datganiad ynglŷn â chario adnoddau ymlaen rhwng y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf a hon pan ddychwelwn ar ôl y toriad, pan fydd yr holl ffigurau angenrheidiol ar gael. Byddaf yn falch o gymryd unrhyw gwestiynau ar y datganiad.

Dafydd Wigley: Diolchaf i Edwina am y datganiad ac am roi gwybod inni o flaen llaw am yr hyn yr oedd yn ceisio ei wneud. Cyfeiriaf at bedwar neu bum pennawd.

Dafydd Wigley: I thank Edwina for the statement and for informing us beforehand about what she was endeavouring to do. I refer to four or five headings.

Yn gyntaf, iechyd. Wrth groesawu'r arian ychwanegol, a wnaiff Edwina roi rhyw arweiniad ar beth fydd y sefyllfa o safbwynt y gwariant cyfalaf yn y sector iechyd? Cyfeiriodd at y sector gyfalaf o fewn addysg, ond nid o fewn iechyd. Gwyddom faint o wasgu a fu, a gobeithio y bydd arian cyhoeddus tuag at gyfalaf o fudd inni wrth ymwneud ag ysbytai newydd.

First, health. In welcoming the additional funding, will Edwina give some guidance on what the position will be from the point of view of capital expenditure in the health sector? She referred to the capital sector within education, but not within health. We know how much of a squeeze there has been, and we hope that public funding towards capital will be of assistance to us in dealing with new hospitals.

Mae lleihad o £9 miliwn yn y gyllideb tai a drosglwyddwyd. O ystyried cyflwr ein stoc tai a'r nifer o dai sydd yn disgwyl cael eu hadnewyddu, oni fyddai wedi bod yn fwy priodol i gadw'r arian hwnnw o fewn y sector dai, ac os oedd arian ychwanegol i Gymru, i geisio cyfeirio'r arian tuag at dai?

There is a reduction of £9 million in the transferred housing budget. Considering the condition of our housing stock and the number of houses awaiting renewal, would it not have been more appropriate to keep the money within the housing sector, and if there was additional money for Wales, to endeavour to direct that money towards housing?

Cyfeiriodd Edwina at y newidiadau ym myd addysg, yn arbennig ar gyfer hyfforddi athrawon a denu graddedigion i fod yn athrawon. Croesawn hynny yn fawr. A wnaiff ddweud wrthym faint o drafodaeth a fu gyda David Blunkett ynglŷn â'r datganiad a wnaeth ef cyn iddo wneud y datganiad? Mae'n rhaid cael cyd-ddealltwriaeth rhyngom ni yng Nghaerdydd a Llundain, neu byddwn mewn sefyllfa anodd iawn.

Edwina referred to the changes in education, particularly in teacher training and in attracting graduates to becoming teachers. We welcome that very much. Will she tell us how much discussion had there been with David Blunkett about the statement that he made prior to his making that statement? There must be an understanding between us in Cardiff and London, or we will be in a very difficult position.

3:30 p.m.

Ar y gyllideb ddatblygu economaidd, a ydwyf yn gywir i ddweud ein bod yn dal i gredu mai £25 miliwn sydd ei angen eleni ar gyfer y gwariant ar y rhaglenni Ewropeaidd newydd—nid y rhai sydd yn cario drosodd o'r flwyddyn ddiwethaf? Os yw hyn yn annigonol, a gawn sicrwydd y gallwn fynd i mewn i'r gronfa wrth gefn gyda'r Trysorlys er mwyn cael unrhyw arian angenrheidiol ar gyfer gweithredu rhaglen Ewrop uwchben y £25 miliwn hwn?

On the economic development budget, am I right in saying that we still believe that £25 million is required this year for expenditure on the new European programmes—not those that have been carried over from last year? If this money is inadequate, can we have an assurance that we can go into the contingency reserve with the Treasury in order to find any moneys required to implement the European programme above this £25 million?

Yn olaf, croesawaf y £780,000 ychwanegol ar gyfer archwilio. Mae hyn yn dangos ein penderfyniad fel Cynulliad i sicrhau bod gwerth am arian ar yr holl raglen wario cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ac os oes unrhyw wastraff y darganfyddir hynny a'i rwystro.

Finally, I welcome the extra £780,000 for audit. This shows our determination as an Assembly to ensure that there is value for money on the whole programme of public expenditure in Wales, and if there is any slippage that it be identified and prevented.

Edwina Hart: I totally concur with Dafydd's comments about the audit. We need to recognise all the value for money issues and be stringent in dealing with matters.

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd yn llwyr â sylwadau Dafydd ynglŷn â'r archwiliad. Mae angen inni gydnabod yr holl faterion gwerth am arian a bod yn llym wrth ddelio â materion.

On health, it will be for the Health and Social Services Committee and the Assembly Secretary to discuss priorities, but as I have said before, we would like to extend what we are able to do in terms of capital programmes. It is up to us to ensure that we get the right balance in that area to invest in the future in terms of capital programmes. I hope that the Health and Social Services Committee will develop that.

Ar iechyd, mater i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac Ysgrifennydd y Cynulliad fydd trafod blaenoriaethau, ond fel y dywedais o'r blaen, hoffem ehangu'r hyn y gallwn ei wneud yn nhermau rhaglenni cyfalaf. Mater i ni yw sicrhau y cawn y cydbwysedd iawn yn y maes hwnnw i fuddsoddi yn y dyfodol yn nhermau rhaglenni cyfalaf. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddatblygu hynny.

I share some concerns on housing, and the budgetary position on housing. I would have liked, if I could, to develop a more satisfactory financial means of supporting a housing strategy. As I indicated in my budget speech prior, this is an area that is of concern, and of concern to the Committee. I hope that when we come to the spending review and this year's budgets, we will perhaps be able to make further allocations in this area, from the whole.

Yr wyf yn rhannu rhai pryderon ynghylch tai, a'r sefyllfa gyda'r gyllideb ar gyfer tai. Buaswn wedi hoffi, pe medrwn, ddatblygu modd ariannol mwy boddhaol o gynnal strategaeth dai. Fel y nodais yn fy araith cyllideb yn gynharach, dyma faes sydd yn peri pryder, a phryder i'r Pwyllgor. Gobeithiaf pan ddeuwn at yr adolygiad gwariant a chyllidebau eleni, y gallwn efallai wneud dyraniadau pellach yn y maes hwn, allan o'r cyfan.

On education, I was not aware of the information regarding David Blunkett's announcement made in London. I read the

Ar addysg, nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o'r wybodaeth ynglŷn â chyhoeddiad David Blunkett a wnaethpwyd yn Llundain.

announcement on the front page of *The Guardian* in the morning and saw the details of the teaching package arrangements. This concerned me, and I raised the matter with Andrew Smith, the Chief Secretary to the Treasury, on Friday. It leaves us in a difficult position in Wales when announcements are made in this way. I am not the Secretary for Education and Children—I am the Finance Secretary. I understand that Rosemary Butler was aware of the position the day before the announcement and had some inclination. I was not aware of it.

Darllenais y cyhoeddiad ar dudalen flaen *The Guardian* yn y bore a gwelais fanylion y trefniadau pecyn dysgu. Achosodd hyn bryder imi, a chodais y mater gydag Andrew Smith, Pen Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys, ddydd Gwener. Mae'n ein gadael ni mewn sefyllfa anodd yng Nghymru pan wneir cyhoeddiadau fel hyn. Nid yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant wyf fi—yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid wyf fi. Deallaf fod Rosemary Butler yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa y diwrnod cyn y cyhoeddiad a bod ganddi ryw syniad. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol ohono.

This is a problem. England has decided in advance of the spending review to take the risk for the whole package. If we were to do the equivalent, and go for the whole package approach in 2000-01, it would have cost me £6.5 million, in 2001-02 it would have cost me £9.63 million, and in 2002-03 it could have cost as much as £12 million. I was not able to make a recommendation of that nature without knowing the outcome of the spending review within the Assembly's limited resources. It has raised a fundamental issue that I have discussed with the First Secretary. It is incumbent on us all to ensure that protocol arrangements are more than pieces of paper and that they actually mean something. We need to have a clear idea of what is going on in terms of spending departments. This has brought it home to me. We will now need to have difficult discussions on the teachers' recruitment package. I believe that the package that we have is correct for Wales and it is subject to review. However, I am aware that there is an England and Wales teaching marketplace, and we therefore need to be alert to all the issues that arise from that.

Mae hyn yn broblem. Cyn yr adolygiad gwariant, mae Lloegr wedi penderfynu mentro ar y pecyn cyfan. Pe baem ni'n gwneud yr un modd, ac yn mynd am y pecyn cyfan yn 2000-01, byddai wedi costio £6.5 miliwn imi, yn 2001-02 byddai wedi costio £9.63 miliwn imi, ac yn 2002-03 gallai fod wedi costio cymaint â £12 miliwn. Nid oeddwn yn gallu gwneud argymhelliad o'r fath heb wybod canlyniad yr adolygiad gwariant o fewn adnoddau cyfyngedig y Cynulliad. Mae wedi codi cwestiwn sylfaenol ac yr wyf wedi ei drafod gyda'r Prif Ysgrifennydd. Rhaid inni i gyd sicrhau bod trefniadau protocol yn fwy na darnau o bapur, a'u bod yn golygu rhywbeth go iawn. Mae angen inni fod â syniad clir o'r hyn sydd yn digwydd o ran adrannau gwario. Mae hyn wedi tanlinellu hynny i mi. Yn awr bydd angen inni gael trafodaethau anodd ar y pecyn recriwtio athrawon. Credaf fod y pecyn sydd gennym ni'n iawn ar gyfer Cymru ac mae'n destun adolygiad. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod yna farchnad athrawon i Gymru a Lloegr, a bod angen inni fod yn effro felly i'r holl faterion sydd yn codi o hynny.

On European programmes, Dafydd, like you, I want to ensure that these will be properly funded. I have already indicated that I am prepared to look at matters regarding funding in-year and I hope to have further discussions with the First Secretary to ensure that these matters are addressed during the coming months if the need arises. Your points on education, regarding our arrangements with Westminster, are very valid.

Ar raglenni Ewropeaidd, Dafydd, fel chi, yr wyf eisiau sicrhau y caiff y rhain eu hariannu'n iawn. Yr wyf eisoes wedi nodi fy mod yn barod i edrych ar faterion yng nghyswllt ariannu o fewn y flwyddyn a gobeithiaf gael trafodaethau pellach gyda'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i sicrhau y rhoddir sylw i'r materion hyn yn ystod y misoedd sydd i ddod os cyfyd yr angen. Mae eich pwyntiau ar addysg, parthed ein trefniadau gyda San Steffan, yn ddilys iawn.

Nick Bourne: I thank the Finance Secretary

Nick Bourne: Diolchaf i'r Ysgrifennydd

for her statement. We welcome the extra spending on health and education, particularly on health. I wonder whether you could say something about the debt provision and whether or not any of the increase will be required to pay off existing debts. Many health authorities have massive debts, and we wonder to what extent they are being directed to clear existing debts before spending new money on the sharp end of services. Could you also say something about public-private partnerships in healthcare? It has come to our attention this last week that at least one health authority in Wales, is buying in healthcare from the private sector. We are not concerned about that—we welcome it—but is it part of a national strategy? Is there any impact on the budgetary arrangements in relation to your statement today on those health considerations? It is Gwent Health Authority, if you were not aware.

Cyllid am ei datganiad. Croesawn y gwario ychwanegol ar iechyd ac addysg, yn enwedig ar iechyd. Tybed a allech ddweud rhywbeth am y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer dyled ac a fydd angen unrhyw faint o'r cynnydd i dalu dyledion presennol ai peidio. Mae gan nifer o awdurdodau iechyd ddyledion enfawr, a gofynnwn i ba raddau y cânt eu cyfarwyddo i glirio dyledion sydd yn bodoli cyn gwario arian newydd ar ben blaen y gwasanaethau. A allech ddweud rhywbeth hefyd am bartneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat mewn gofal iechyd? Daeth i'n sylw yr wythnos diwethaf fod o leiaf un awdurdod iechyd yng Nghymru yn prynu gofal iechyd i mewn o'r sector preifat. Nid ydym yn pryderu am hynny—yr ydym yn ei groesawu—ond a ydyw'n rhan o strategaeth genedlaethol? Oes yna unrhyw effaith ar y trefniadau cyllidebol mewn perthynas â'ch datganiad heddiw ar yr ystyriaethau iechyd hynny? Awdurdod Iechyd Gwent sydd gennyf dan sylw, rhag ofn nad oeddech yn ymwybodol.

On education, we welcome the increased spending. Could you say something about money being routed through education authorities? Is this necessary? I do not believe that it happens in England. The money could possibly go directly to schools. I wonder why we are not able to do that in Wales, if that is the position. I welcome what you say about the Westminster dimension—we need to keep that under review in relation to Dafydd Wigley's earlier points. I hope that you will undertake to do that.

Ar addysg, croesawn y cynnydd mewn gwariant. A allech ddweud rhywbeth ynghylch cyfeirio arian drwy awdurdodau addysg? A yw hyn yn angenrheidiol? Nid wyf yn credu ei fod yn digwydd yn Lloegr. Gallai'r arian o bosibl fynd yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion. Tybed pam na allwn wneud hynny yng Nghymru, os mai dyna'r sefyllfa. Croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedwch am ddimensiwn San Steffan—mae angen inni gadw golwg ar hwnnw yng nghyd-destun pwyntiau cynharach Dafydd Wigley. Gobeithiaf yr ymgymerwch i wneud hynny.

On the countryside, we are disappointed that more is not being done on the impact of the right to roam on landowners. There are financial implications for them. We raised this with you when you made your initial budget statement, and, perhaps unintentionally, you seem to be rather cavalier about their concerns, by saying that landowners are a minority. I am sure that you would welcome the opportunity today to say that they are dear to your heart and that you will do something for them. There are implications for them from some of these proposals, which will be costly in terms of the extra precautions that they must take and the extra expenses that they will have to meet. I would be grateful if you could say

Ynghylch cefn gwlad, yr ydym yn siomedig na wneir mwy ynglŷn ag effaith yr hawl i grwydro ar dirfeddianwyr. Mae goblygiadau ariannol iddynt hwy. Codasom hyn gyda chi pan wnaethoch eich datganiad cyllideb cyntaf, ac, efallai'n anfwriadol, yr ydych yn ymddangos braidd yn ffwrdd-â-hi am eu pryderon, gan ddweud mai lleiafrif yw tirfeddianwyr. Yr wyf yn siwr y croesawech y cyfle heddiw i ddweud eu bod yn agos at eich calon ac y gwnewch rywbeth drostynt. Mae goblygiadau iddynt hwy yn sgîl rhai o'r cynigion hyn, a fydd yn gostus yn nhermau rhagofalon ychwanegol y bydd yn rhaid iddynt eu cymryd a'r treuliau ychwanegol y bydd yn rhaid iddynt eu talu. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddweud rhywbeth am

something about that.

We welcome the broad thrust of the additional money for health and education—it is something for which we argued. Initially, in relation to your first budget, we voted against it because we did not think that there was enough for health.

Could I also ask you to say something about Objective 1 funding? This is a regular concern, but I think that it is appropriate to say that the comprehensive spending review limitations were breached in relation to health. Were representations made by you and the First Secretary to act likewise in relation to something that is equally vital for Wales—Objective 1 funding?

Edwina Hart: On Objective 1 funding, we made no representations to the Chancellor about pre-empting the spending review in terms of health. That decision was taken nationally. We were going along the road of making all the representations in the context of the comprehensive spending review and anticipating the outcomes in July. Our representations on a whole host of issues were therefore well known and documented for the Chancellor in respect of the comprehensive spending review. We genuinely had no indication that anything would be done in these terms in health. We continued making representations on Objective 1 and we did not lose an opportunity on Thursday and Friday during the Prime Minister's visit. I believe that it got into every aspect of conversation.

On the countryside, I did not want to sound too cavalier, because I am a Roundhead by nature. On landowners, in view of your comments, I will ask Sue Essex to consider this further.

Thank you for you comments on the Westminster question. It is important that we consider our relationships with Westminster to ensure, as I indicated before, that there is respect on both sides. We always adhere to the concordats by advising the appropriate people when we make an announcement, and I believe that it would be agreeable if the same thing happened to us.

hynny.

Croesawn ergyd gyffredinol yr arian ychwanegol ar gyfer iechyd ac addysg—dyma rywbeth y buom ninnau'n dadlau drosto. Ar y dechrau, yng nghyswllt eich cyllideb gyntaf, pleidleisiasom yn ei erbyn am nad oeddem yn meddwl fod yno ddigon ar gyfer iechyd.

A gaf i ofyn hefyd ichi ddweud rhywbeth am gyllid Amcan 1? Mae hwn yn bryder cyson, ond yr wyf yn meddwl ei bod yn briodol dweud y torrwyd cyfyngiadau'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant mewn perthynas â iechyd. A wnaethpwyd ceisiadau gennych chi a'r Prif Ysgrifennydd am weithredu tebyg mewn perthynas â rhywbeth sydd yr un mor hanfodol i Gymru—sef arian Amcan 1?

Edwina Hart: Ar arian Amcan 1, ni wnaethom unrhyw sylwadau i'r Canghellor parthed achub y blaen ar yr adolygiad gwariant yn nhermau iechyd. Cymerwyd y penderfyniad hwnnw yn genedlaethol. Yr oeddem yn mynd ar y trywydd o wneud yr holl sylwadau yng nghyd-destun yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant gan ragweld y canlyniadau ym mis Gorffennaf. Yr oedd ein sylwadau ar lu o faterion felly yn hysbys ac ar bapur i'r Canghellor yng nghyswllt yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Mae'n hollol wir nad oedd gennym unrhyw syniad y gwneid unrhyw beth yn y termau hyn ym maes iechyd. Parhaom i wneud sylwadau ar Amcan 1 ac ni wnaethom golli cyfle ddydd Iau a dydd Gwener yn ystod ymweliad y Prif Weinidog. Credaf iddo dreiddio i bob agwedd o'r sgwrs.

Ar gefn gwlad, nid oeddwn eisiau swnio'n rhy ffwrdd-â-hi; nid dyna fy natur. Ar dirfeddianwyr, yng ngoleuni'ch sylwadau, gofynnaf i Sue Essex ystyried hyn ymhellach.

Diolch am eich sylwadau ar gwestiwn San Steffan. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ystyried ein perthynas â San Steffan er mwyn sicrhau, fel y nodais o'r blaen, fod parch ar y ddwy ochr. Yr ydym bob amser yn glynu at y concordatau drwy hysbysu'r bobl briodol pan wnawn gyhoeddiad, a chredaf y byddai'n ddymunol pe caem yr un driniaeth yn ôl.

On education, officials have assured me that I have to route the money through the education authorities. That is the method—I cannot follow England's example. Let us be clear, local education authorities know what money must go out and why it is going through them. I have been assured that that is the only mechanism that was open to me in Wales. If the Pre-16 Education Committee was interested in addressing the issue, they could do so with the Secretary for Education and Children. That was the assurance that I received.

Ar addysg, mae swyddogion wedi fy sicrhau bod yn rhaid imi gyfeirio'r arian drwy'r awdurdodau addysg. Dyna'r dull—ni allaf ddilyn esiampl Lloegr. Gadewch inni fod yn glir, mae awdurdodau addysg lleol yn gwybod pa arian sydd yn gorfod mynd allan a pham ei fod yn mynd drwyddynt hwy. Cefais sicrwydd mai dyma'r unig fecanwaith oedd yn agored imi yng Nghymru. Pe bai gan y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 ddiddordeb mewn mynd i'r afael â'r cwestiwn hwn, gallent wneud hynny gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant. Dyna'r sicrwydd a dderbyniais.

I was interested in your comments on public-private partnership—an issue close to my heart. I am aware that sometimes health authorities in the public sector access private facilities. If the money is available in health authorities—there are private hospitals and we want to make a list of them—I have no objection for those facilities to be used. We must do everything possible to ensure that we minimise waiting times and reduce waiting lists and that we have value for money in terms of the money that is expended. Health cannot be measured in those terms. However, I am not aware of the detail of that. On debts, I have made the allocation in broad terms for health authorities. I will not go into detail on the specification of how they intend to use the money, but it is clear that our own health authority has welcomed it as it has helped them with specific debt problems. I do not have a clear picture of that, although I assume that the Secretary for Health and Social Services will have an indication of how it intends to use those additional funds.

Yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb yn eich sylwadau ar bartneriaeth gyhoeddus-breifat—mater agos at fy nghalon. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod awdurdodau iechyd yn y sector cyhoeddus weithiau'n defnyddio cyfleusterau preifat. Os yw'r arian ar gael mewn awdurdodau iechyd—y mae ysbytai preifat ac mae arnom eisiau llunio rhestr ohonynt—nid oes gennyf unrhyw wrthwynebiad i ddefnyddio'r cyfleusterau hynny. Rhaid inni wneud popeth posibl i sicrhau ein bod yn lleihau amserau aros i'r eithaf ac yn cwtogi rhestrau aros ac y cawn werth am arian yn nhermau'r arian a werir. Ni ellir mesur iechyd yn y termau hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn ymwybodol o fanylion hynny. Ar ddyledion, yr wyf wedi gwneud y dyraniad mewn termau eang i awdurdodau iechyd. Nid af i fanylder ar sut y bwriadant ddefnyddio'r arian, ond mae'n amlwg fod ein hawdurdod iechyd ein hunain wedi'i groesawu gan ei fod wedi'u helpu gyda phroblemau dyled penodol. Nid oes gennyf ddarlun clir o hynny, er fy mod yn tybio y bydd gan yr Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol syniad o sut y bwriedir defnyddio'r arian ychwanegol hwnnw.

3:40 p.m.

Peter Black: I welcome the Finance Secretary's statement and the much needed extra money in this year's budget. How much it is needed can be seen when the money is put into context. There is still a £500 million backlog in school building repairs, people have to wait longer for hospital treatment and there is a £1.2 billion repair bill for Welsh housing. I agree with Dafydd Wigley's comments. We must address the housing

Peter Black: Croesawaf ddatganiad yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid a'r arian ychwanegol yr oedd mawr ei angen yng nghyllideb eleni. Gellir gweld faint y mae ei angen pan roddir yr arian yn ei gyd-destun. Mae ôl-groniad o £500 miliwn o hyd mewn atgyweirio adeiladau ysgolion, mae'n rhaid i bobl aros yn hirach am driniaeth ysbyty ac mae bil atgyweirio o £1.2 biliwn ar gyfer tai yng Nghymru. Cytunaf â sylwadau Dafydd

issue and secure more money for it, given its impact on health and education.

Wigley. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â chwestiwn tai a sicrhau mwy o arian ar ei gyfer, o gofio'i effaith ar iechyd ac addysg.

School buildings and class sizes must be the top priorities in education. I hope that some of this money can be used to reduce class sizes for seven to 11-year-olds. That should now be our priority as we have started to sort out the younger age groups. The Finance Secretary said that nursery schools will receive an extra £3,000. Does this also apply to nursery units that are attached to primary schools or will that come out of the money that the primary school will receive?

Rhaid i adeiladau ysgol a maint dosbarthiadau fod y blaenoriaethau pennaf ym maes addysg. Gobeithiaf y gellir defnyddio rhywfaint o'r arian hwn i leihau maint dosbarthiadau i blant saith i 11 oed. Dyna ddylai'n blaenoriaeth fod yn awr gan ein bod wedi dechrau cael trefn ar y grwpiau oedran iau. Dywedodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y bydd ysgolion meithrin yn derbyn £3,000 ychwanegol. A ydyw hyn yn berthnasol hefyd i unedau meithrin sydd yn gysylltiedig ag ysgolion cynradd neu a ddaw hynny allan o'r arian a dderbynia'r ysgol gynradd?

On what basis will the additional £26.8 million capital funding for schools be divided between local education authorities? Edwina Hart indicated that a 100 per cent grant will be used. Will these grants go to the local education authority that makes the strongest case or will they be distributed on a pro rata basis according to the relevance, strength, size and needs of the LEA?

Ar ba sail y caiff y £26.8 miliwn o arian cyfalaf ychwanegol ar gyfer ysgolion ei rannu rhwng awdurdodau addysg lleol? Dywedodd Edwina Hart y defnyddir grant 100 y cant. A aiff y grantiau hyn i'r awdurdod addysg lleol a wnaeth yr achos cryfaf, ynteu a gânt eu dosbarthu ar sail pro rata yn ôl perthnasedd, cryfder, maint ac anghenion yr AALl?

There are also concerns that the graduate recruitment package may adversely affect recruitment in Wales. As graduates effectively have to wait nearly a year longer for their money, perhaps Edwina Hart would consider offering a little more in Wales to compensate them. Above all, it must be monitored closely for adverse effects as compared to England.

Mae pryderon hefyd y gall y pecyn recriwtio graddedigion effeithio'n andwyol ar recriwtio yng Nghymru. Gan fod yn rhaid i raddedigion i bob pwrpas aros bron flwyddyn yn hwy am eu harian, efallai y byddai Edwina Hart yn ystyried cynnig ychydig mwy yng Nghymru i'w digolledu. Yn anad dim, rhaid ei fonitro'n agos am effeithiau andwyol o gymharu â Lloegr.

Although we welcome paying money directly to schools this year, there are dangers attached to hypothecation, not least the impact on other services. I hope that we can compensate local government in future years by increasing the amount of money that is available to them, so that we do not have high council tax rises and cuts to essential services again.

Er ein bod yn croesawu talu arian yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion eleni, y mae peryglon ynghlwm wrth bridiannu, nid lleiaf yr effaith ar wasanaethau eraill. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ddigolledu llywodraeth leol yn y blynyddoedd a ddaw drwy gynyddu'r arian sydd ar gael iddynt, fel na chawn godiadau mawr mewn treth cyngor a thoriadau i wasanaethau hanfodol eto.

I urge the Finance Secretary and the Secretary for Health and Social Services to consider using the extra money for health to tackle the bed blocking issue that we raised in Plenary yesterday. It could also be used to re-establish a capital programme for Wales,

Anogaf yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid a'r Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ystyried defnyddio'r arian ychwanegol ar gyfer iechyd i fynd i'r afael â'r mater blocio gwelyau a godwyd gennym yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddoe. Gellid ei

increase the capacity of Welsh hospitals and invest more money in hospital staff, especially nurses and doctors. Tackling those four key health issues would be worthwhile.

ddefnyddio hefyd i ailsefydlu rhaglen gyfalaf i Gymru, cynyddu'r lle mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru a buddsoddi mwy o arian mewn staff ysbytai, yn enwedig nyrsys a meddygon. Byddai mynd i'r afael â'r pedwar mater iechyd allweddol hyn yn werth chweil.

Edwina Hart: The big issue in health is the link between health and social services. I reinforce how I anticipate that money should be used between the two areas to ensure that we can bolster the social services to address some of the problems in the health services. That must be a key message that has come through, especially from the Committee.

Edwina Hart: Y mater mawr ym maes iechyd yw'r cysylltiad rhwng iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Ategaf y modd y rhagwelaf y dylid defnyddio'r arian i sicrhau y gallwn atgyfnerthu'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i ymdrin â rhai o'r problemau yn y gwasanaethau iechyd. Rhaid i honno fod yn neges allweddol a ddaeth drwodd, yn enwedig o'r Pwyllgor.

We are all anxious to ensure that we have a decent capital programme that will allow the facilities to exist so that people can have better healthcare in Wales. We are restricted in budgetary terms, so we must make the money go further and work better.

Yr ydym i gyd yn awyddus i sicrhau bod gennym raglen gyfalaf dda a fydd yn caniatáu i'r cyfleusterau fodoli fel y gall pobl gael gwell gofal iechyd yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi'n cyfyngu yn nhermau'r gyllideb, felly rhaid inni wneud i'r arian fynd ymhellach a gweithio'n well.

I was in a dilemma on graduate recruitment. The money for entrants was paid up front by the Department for Education and Employment. I am old-fashioned on some matters. If someone wants to enter the teaching profession and £6,000 is offered, they should take the money. However, I would like to have a teacher at the end of that. It is nice to give £4,000 for the year and give the extra money when they have completed their probation year. At least we know that there is a chance that someone who has completed the probationary year will go into teaching. I do not see the point of a scheme that does not benefit us at its end. When I was young, if there had been a choice of schemes available to encourage young people to enter teaching, students of my generation would have accepted £6,000 from one scheme and then taken more money from another scheme. We must consider what outcome we want. You may call me a cynic, but if we want more teachers, we must secure a balance.

Yr oeddwn mewn cyfyng-gyngor ar recriwtio graddedigion. Cafodd yr arian ar gyfer ymgeiswyr ei dalu ymlaen llaw gan yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth. Yr wyf yn hen-ffasiwn ar rai materion. Os yw rywun eisiau mynd i mewn i'r proffesiwn dysgu ac y cynigir £6,000, dylent gymryd yr arian. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn gael athro ar ddiwedd hynny. Mae'n syniad da rhoi'r £4,000 am y flwyddyn a rhoi'r arian ychwanegol wedi iddynt gwblhau'u blwyddyn brawf. O leiaf gwyddom fod cyfle y bydd rhywun a gwblhaodd y flwyddyn brawf yn mynd i faes dysgu. Nid wyf yn gweld pwynt cynllun nad yw'n fanteisiol i ni ar ei ddiwedd. Pan oeddwn i'n ifanc, pe buasai dewis o gynlluniau ar gael i annog pobl ifanc i fynd i mewn i ddysgu, buasai myfyrwyr o'm cenhedlaeth i wedi derbyn £6,000 oddi wrth un cynllun ac wedyn wedi cymryd mwy o arian o gynllun arall. Rhaid inni ystyried pa ganlyniad yr ydym ei eisiau. Gallwch fy ngalw'n sinig, ond os yr ydym eisiau mwy o athrawon, rhaid inni sicrhau cydbwysedd.

Capital funding will be achieved by formula, in real terms, to local government. Only nursery schools that are separate units will receive £3,000. Class size is an ongoing issue and we are trying to ensure a reduction across

Sicrheir arian cyfalaf drwy fformwla, mewn termau real, i lywodraeth leol. Dim ond ysgolion meithrin sydd yn unedau ar wahân fydd yn derbyn £3,000. Mae maint dosbarthiadau'n fater parhaus ac yr ydym yn

the board. Housing is an area that concerns the administration. As I indicated to Dafydd, it is an area to which we need to return. I am anxious that we take action on school buildings. Although hostility has been felt in the Chamber towards the private finance initiative, it has delivered new necessary school buildings across Wales. As long as we can produce value for money, I do not care how we set about securing new school buildings and repairs to existing ones on behalf of Welsh schoolchildren.

ceisio sicrhau gostyngiad drwyddi draw. Mae tai'n destun pryder i'r weinyddiaeth. Fel y dywedais wrth Dafydd, dyma faes y mae angen inni ddod yn ôl ato. Yr wyf yn awyddus inni weithredu ar adeiladau ysgolion. Er y teimlwyd gelyniaeth yn y Siambr hon tuag at y fenter cyllid preifat, y mae wedi sicrhau adeiladau ysgol angenrheidiol newydd ar hyd a lled Cymru. Cyn belled ag y gallwn sicrhau gwerth am arian, nid oes ots gennyf fi sut yr awn ati i sicrhau adeiladau ysgolion newydd ac atgyweiriadau i adeiladau presennol ar ran plant ysgol Cymru.

Gareth Jones: I wneud pethau'n glir, gan fod yr wybodaeth hon yn cael ei gwneud yn gyhoeddus, hoffwn gael cadarnhad fod y £4,000 yn y flwyddyn hyfforddiant a'r £2,000 ddilynol ar gael i'r rheini a fydd yn cwblhau eu blwyddyn ddysgu gyntaf yng Nghymru.

Gareth Jones: To clarify matters, as this information is being made public, I would like confirmation that the £4,000 in the training year and the subsequent £2,000 will be available to those who complete their first teaching year in Wales.

Edwina Hart: The problem with the scheme is that it is for England and Wales. We had to ensure a scheme that would not allow us to jack-up things. It would have been nice for me to give more at the back end of that sum, but I could not complete financial terms with DfEE if we had a turf war on new teachers. Teachers who train in Wales will receive £4,000, with another £2,000 at the end of their probationary year.

Edwina Hart: Y broblem gyda'r cynllun yw ei fod ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr. Bu'n rhaid inni sicrhau cynllun na fyddai'n caniatáu inni jacio pethau. Byddai wedi bod yn braf imi roi mwy ar derfyn y swm hwnnw, ond ni allwn gystadlu ar delerau ariannol yn erbyn yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth pe caem frwydr am athrawon newydd. Bydd athrawon sydd yn hyfforddi yng Nghymru yn derbyn £4,000, a £2,000 arall ar ddiwedd eu blwyddyn brawf.

Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order

Peter Black: Point of order. I am in favour of robust debate, but the booing, hissing and shouting on my right is becoming more and more unacceptable. If we are to adopt this new protocol on conduct, we must ensure that Members try to maintain the dignity of the Chamber and the debate, and that we do not start to degenerate into the kind of yah-boo politics that is more common in the other place. Could we have some bearing on that, Llywydd, when you oversee proceedings?

Peter Black: Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf o blaid dadl fywiog, ond mae'r bwian, yr hisian a'r gweiddi ar y dde imi'n mynd yn fwyfwy annerbyniol. Os ydym am fabwysiadu'r protocol newydd hwn ar ymddygiad, rhaid inni sicrhau bod Aelodau'n ceisio cadw urddas y Siambr a'r ddadl, ac na ddechreuwn ddirywio i'r math o wleidyddiaeth *yah-boo* sydd yn fwy cyffredin yn y lle arall. Allem ni gael rhyw bwysau ar hynny, Lywydd, pan yr ydych yn goruchwylio trafodion?

The Presiding Officer: We are about to debate the revised Protocol on Conduct and your point will have bearing on that.

Y Llywydd: Yr ydym ar fin dadlau ar y Protocol diwygiedig ar Ymddygiad, a bydd eich pwynt yn berthnasol i hynny.

Michael German: My point of order relates

Michael German: Mae fy mhwynt o drefn

to the use of a name of a party. I do not know how many times we have to repeat this to ensure that it happens, but I am sure that you will do it, Llywydd. Perhaps you will repeat your ruling when the Member concerned returns to the Chamber.

yn ymwneud â'r defnydd o enw plaid. Ni wn faint o weithiau y mae'n rhaid inni ailadrodd hyn er mwyn gwneud yn siwr ei fod yn digwydd, ond yr wyf yn siwr y gwnewch chi, Lywydd. Efallai yr ailadroddwch eich dyfarniad pan ddaw'r Aelod dan sylw yn ôl i'r Siambr.

Standing Order No. 7.2 refers to language, but does it also refer to loud language? We have a sound amplification system here, which means that we do not need to be shouted at. I find that having to listen to someone shouting is oppressive on my ears.

Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.2 yn cyfeirio at iaith, ond a ydyw'n cyfeirio at iaith uchel hefyd? Mae gennym system chwyddo sain yma, sydd yn golygu nad oes angen gweiddi arnom. Y mae gorfod gwrando ar rywun yn gweiddi yn orthrwm ar fy nghlustiau.

The Presiding Officer: I would assume that the reference in our Standing Orders to courtesy shown to Members would include not being unnecessarily loud or troublesome.

Y Llywydd: Tybiaf y byddai'r cyfeiriad yn ein Rheolau Sefydlog at ddangos cwrteisi tuag at Aelodau yn cynnwys peidio â bod yn rhy uchel na chodi twrw.

Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig
Revised Business Statement

The Business Secretary (Andrew Davies): I do not intend to read out the business statement as it remains unchanged from the one I outlined yesterday. The one material difference is that the statement I indicated that Peter Law would make, has now been made. Although that statement was vetoed by the opposition parties, I am at a loss to know what other course I could have adopted yesterday as the statement had been agreed in the Business Committee earlier that day.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Nid wyf yn bwriadu darllen allan y datganiad busnes gan ei fod yn aros yr un fath â'r un a amlinellais ddoe. Yr un gwahaniaeth arwyddocaol yw bod y datganiad y dywedais y byddai Peter Law yn ei wneud, bellach wedi'i wneud. Er i'r datganiad hwnnw gael ei nacáu gan y gwrthbleidiau, ni wn beth arall y buaswn wedi gallu ei wneud ddoe gan y cytunwyd ar y datganiad yn y Pwyllgor Busnes yn gynharach y diwrnod hwnnw.

Nick Bourne: I have a question about the status of resolutions passed in debate. I have checked the wording of the resolution that was passed in relation to councillors' allowances, which required the administration to present legislation at an early opportunity to cap councillors' allowances, after referring specifically to councillor Russell Goodway's allowance. This raises a constitutional question about the effect of resolutions passed in this Chamber. That was explicit, but no commitment was made to it in the business statement despite the fact that the Assembly has made its voice heard on this issue.

Nick Bourne: Mae gennyf gwestiwn ynghylch statws penderfyniadau a gaiff eu pasio mewn dadl. Yr wyf wedi archwilio geiriad y penderfyniad a basiwyd ynghylch lwfansau cynghorwyr, a ofynnai i'r weinyddiaeth gyflwyno deddfwriaeth yn fuan i gapio lwfansau cynghorwyr, ar ôl cyfeirio'n benodol at lwfans y cynghorydd Russell Goodway. Mae hyn yn codi cwestiwn cyfansoddiadol ynglŷn ag effaith penderfyniadau a gaiff eu pasio yn y Siambr hon. Yr oedd hwnnw'n glir, ond ni wnaethpwyd ymrwymiad iddo yn y datganiad busnes er gwaethaf y ffaith fod y Cynulliad wedi lleisio'i farn ar y mater hwn.

Andrew Davies: A constitutional question has been raised and I believe that that is a matter on which I must adjudicate. On Peter Law's statement, if the comments that I have

Andrew Davies: Codwyd cwestiwn cyfansoddiadol a chredaf ei fod yn fater y mae'n rhaid imi ddyfarnu arno. Ar ddatganiad Peter Law, os yw'r sylwadau a

read are correct, then there is three-party support for the action undertaken by that the Secretary for Local Government and Housing. I cannot add anything to the statement that he made earlier.

ddarllenais yn gywir, yna mae cefnogaeth gan dair plaid i'r hyn a wnaethpwyd gan yr Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol a Thai. Ni allaf ychwanegu dim i'r datganiad a wnaeth ef yn gynharach.

3:50 p.m.

Jenny Randerson: Would you agree, in line with Nick Bourne's comment, which is factually accurate in terms of the resolution, that the appropriate thing will be for the Executive to raise the topic again next term? If we do so, we can take into account at that time the actions that have been taken in Cardiff council. That can be taken on board in the light of the resolution, and the Assembly can then decide what to do. After all, it is wrong that our resolution should be totally ignored, although I fully appreciate that perhaps an alternative process has taken place that is acceptable, or partially acceptable.

Jenny Randerson: A fyddech yn cytuno, yn unol â sylw Nick Bourne, sydd yn ffeithiol gywir o ran termau'r penderfyniad, mai'r peth priodol fydd i'r Weithrediaeth godi'r pwnc eto y tymor nesaf? Os gwnawn hynny, gallwn gymryd i ystyriaeth bryd hynny yr hyn fydd wedi digwydd yng nghyngor Caerdydd. Gellir ystyried hynny yng ngoleuni'r penderfyniad, ac wedyn gall y Cynulliad benderfynu beth i'w wneud. Wedi'r cwbl, nid yw'n iawn i'n penderfyniad ni gael ei anwybyddu'n llwyr, er fy mod yn sylweddoli'n llawn fod proses arall wedi digwydd efallai sydd yn dderbyniol, neu'n rhannol dderbyniol.

Andrew Davies: I will discuss this with you and colleagues in the Business Committee. We will be happy to bring it forward if colleagues feel that it is appropriate.

Andrew Davies: Fe drafodaf hyn gyda chi a chyd-aelodau yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. Byddwn yn hapus i ddod â'r mater gerbron os teimla cyd-aelodau fod hynny'n briodol.

The Presiding Officer: On the constitutional issue, which I will consider further, the Assembly's resolutions, indications of the Assembly's view, and the executions of such resolutions fall to the Assembly Executive. The Executive is accountable to the Assembly for its response. That is a political process in which we all engage. I will not pronounce that certain resolutions are binding over a certain period of time because that sort of thing could be subject to a legal test. I will reflect on this because it is not the first resolution that has been implemented differently to what might have been construed to be the intention of the Assembly at a given time. This is the nature of political organisation therefore I will say no more on it. I will reflect on it.

Y Llywydd: Ar y mater cyfansoddiadol, y rhoddaf ystyriaeth bellach iddo, mae penderfyniadau'r Cynulliad, mynegiadau o farn y Cynulliad, a gweithredu'r cyfryw benderfyniadau yn cwympo i Weithrediaeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r Weithrediaeth yn atebol i'r Cynulliad am ei ymateb. Proses wleidyddol yw honno yr ydym i gyd yn rhan ohoni. Ni wnaf ddatgan fod rhai penderfyniadau'n ein rhwymo dros gyfnod penodol o amser gan y gallai'r math yna o beth fod yn destun prawf cyfreithiol. Myfyriaf uwchben hyn oherwydd nid dyma'r penderfyniad cyntaf sydd wedi'i weithredu'n wahanol i'r hyn y gallesid ei gymryd fel bwriad y Cynulliad ar adeg benodol. Dyma natur trefniadaeth wleidyddol felly ni ddywedaf ragor amdano. Fe fyfyriaf amdano.

Cymeradwyo Protocol Diwygiedig ar Ymddygiad yn y Siambr
Approval of Revised Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber

The Business Secretary (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiaf fod

the Assembly resolves to adopt the revised

y Cynulliad yn penderfynu mabwysiadu'r

'Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber' laid in the Table Office on 5 April 2000.

'Protocol ar Ymddygiad yn y Siambr' diwygiedig a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Ebrill 2000.

The key change to the protocol is set out in the new paragraphs 7 to 9. It concerns the contents of Members' speeches and reflects discussions in the Chamber over the past few weeks, which followed a speech by a Member in which allegations were made against another Member. The revised paragraphs 7 and 8 remind Members that they enjoy absolute privilege under Section 77(1) of the Government of Wales Act 1998. They also draw Members' attention to the fact that that privilege brings with it the need to exercise restraint. If this revision is accepted, personal allegations against other Members or persons will normally be considered offensive. I stress 'normally' because if Members consider that exceptional circumstances justify departure from this Standing Order, they should consult the Presiding Officer in advance. It is hoped that by clarifying Standing Order No. 7.2 in this way, we will be able to engage in robust debate without the need to resort to the use of language that the Presiding Officer could consider to be disorderly, discriminatory or offensive. The draft revision has been considered by the Business Committee and the Committee on Standards of Conduct. It is commended by both Committees to the Assembly.

Amlinellir y newid allweddol i'r protocol yn y paragraffau newydd 7 i 9. Mae'n ymwneud â chynnwys areithiau Aelodau ac yn adlewyrchu trafodaethau yn y Siambr dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf, yn dilyn araith gan Aelod a oedd yn cynnwys honiadau yn erbyn Aelod arall. Mae'r paragraffau diwygiedig 7 ac 8 yn atgoffa Aelodau eu bod yn mwynhau braint absoliwt dan Adran 77(1) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Maent hefyd yn tynnu sylw Aelodau at y ffaith fod braint yn dwyn gyda hi yr angen i arfer ymatal. Os derbynnir y diwygiad hwn, bydd honiadau personol yn erbyn Aelodau neu bersonau eraill fel rheol yn cael eu hystyried yn dramgwyddus. Pwysleisiaf 'fel rheol' oherwydd os yw Aelodau'n ystyried bod amgylchiadau eithriadol yn cyfiawnhau gadael y Rheol Sefydlog hon, dylent ymgynghori â'r Llywydd ymlaen llaw. Gobeithir y gallwn, drwy egluro Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.2 yn y modd hwn, ymgymryd â dadlau bywiog heb yr angen i ymroi i ddefnyddio iaith y gallai'r Llywydd farnu ei bod yn groes i'r drefn, yn camwahaniaethu neu'n peri tramgwydd. Ystyriwyd y diwygiad drafft gan y Pwyllgor Busnes a'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Fe'i cymhellir gan y ddau Bwyllgor i'r Cynulliad.

Alison Halford: I hope that I am not being difficult by looking at the actual wording. Are we to always second guess what you might consider to be unacceptable language under Standing Order No. 7.2? Should it not read, 'which the Presiding Officer may consider', or am I being pedantic? We do not know how you will perceive a certain comment that we might make. Maybe your legal workers are looking at that.

Alison Halford: Gobeithiaf nad ydwyf yn bod yn anodd wrth edrych ar yr union eiriad. Oes rhaid inni geisio dyfalu o hyd beth y gallech chi ystyried yn iaith annerbyniol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.2? Oni ddylai ddarllen 'a all fod, ym marn y Llywydd', ynteu a ydwyf fi'n bod yn bedantig? Ni wyddom sut y byddwch chi'n ymateb i sylw penodol y gallem ei wneud. Efallai fod eich swyddogion cyfreithiol yn edrych ar hynny.

The Presiding Officer: Was that a point of order or a speech? I think it was a speech, therefore Andrew has to answer. If it was a point of order, I may need to answer.

Y Llywydd: Ai pwynt o drefn ynteu araith oedd hynny? Credaf mai araith ydoedd, felly rhaid i Andrew ateb. Os oedd yn bwynt o drefn, efallai y bydd angen i mi ateb.

Alison Halford: It was a question for you, Presiding Officer.

Alison Halford: Cwestiwn i chi ydoedd, Lywydd.

The Presiding Officer: I will take some time to reflect on it. I think I will leave it to Andrew.

Y Llywydd: Cymeraf beth amser i fyfyrio arno. Yr wyf yn meddwl y'i gadawaf i Andrew.

Jenny Randerson: I want to comment on it. Should I comment to you or to Andrew?

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf eisiau gwneud sylw arno. A ddylwn wneud y sylw i chi ynteu i Andrew?

The Presiding Officer: This is a debate on a motion. We have heard three speeches so far and you will be the fourth speaker.

Y Llywydd: Dadl ar gynnig yw hon. Yr ydym wedi clywed tair araith hyd yn hyn a chi fydd y pedwerydd siaradwr.

Jenny Randerson: I welcome this document whole-heartedly. It states that racist and sexist language should always be considered to be out of order. I am sure that the implication is that other language, such as homophobic language as well as racist and sexist language would also be considered to be out of order. I welcome it in particular for the reasons that Peter Black raised earlier. It is well known that the Conservative group campaigned against devolution and that they are disappointed at not being in the House of Commons. I regret that they seem to be intent on establishing principles of behaviour in this Chamber that are akin to those of the House of Commons. I call this behaviour that of the Tory boys but I will now apologise for that because I am not allowed to use that phrase in this Chamber. The phrase 'yah yah' has always amazed me and I am seeking a Welsh translation of it. Perhaps you could help me, Presiding Officer.

Jenny Randerson: Croesawaf y ddogfen hon yn galonnog. Mae'n datgan y dylid ystyried bob amser fod iaith hiliol a rhywiaethol yn groes i'r drefn. Yr wyf yn siwr mai'r ymhlygiad yw y byddai iaith arall, fel iaith homoffobig yn ogystal ag iaith hiliol a rhywiaethol, yn cael ei ystyried hefyd fel iaith groes i'r drefn. Fe'i croesawaf yn arbennig am y rhesymau a gododd Peter Black yn gynharach. Mae'n hysbys fod y grŵp Ceidwadol wedi ymgyrchu yn erbyn datganoli a'u bod yn siomedig nad ydynt yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Gresynaf eu bod fel petaent â'u bryd ar sefydlu egwyddorion ymddygiad yn y Siambr hon sydd yn debyg i'r rheini a geir yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Ymddygiad y bois Torïaidd yw'r enw a roddaf fi ar yr ymddygiad hwn ond ymddiheuraf am hynny yn awr oherwydd ni chaf ddefnyddio'r ymadrodd hwnnw yn y Siambr hon. Mae'r ymadrodd '*yah yah*' bob amser wedi fy syfrdanu i ac yr wyf yn chwilio am gyfieithiad Cymraeg ohono. Efallai y gallech fy helpu, Lywydd.

I noted that Peter Law was shouted down this afternoon. I hope that when we return next term we can start with new principles of behaviour. One almost does not notice that behaviour deteriorates, but I was brought up short a few weeks ago by someone who watches us on the television regularly. That person commented that the Conservative group was becoming noisier. The comment was that political effectiveness is usually in inverse proportion to the noise made. Nevertheless it is essential that we all show courtesy to each other.

Sylwais fod rhai'n gweiddi ar draws Peter Law y prynhawn yma. Gobeithiaf pan ddeuwn yn ôl y tymor nesaf y gallwn ddechrau gydag egwyddorion ymddygiad newydd. Bron na sylwir fod ymddygiad yn dirywio, ond dywedwyd y drefn wrthyf ychydig wythnosau'n ôl gan rywun sydd yn ein gwylio ar y teledu'n rheolaidd. Nododd y person hwnnw fod y grŵp Ceidwadol yn mynd yn fwy swnllyd. Ei sylw oedd fod effeithiolrwydd gwleidyddol fel arfer mewn cyfrannedd gwrthdro â'r twrw a wneir. Serch hynny mae'n hanfodol ein bod i gyd yn dangos cwrteisi i'n gilydd.

John Griffiths: I agree with Jenny that this is important because the expectations of the Assembly were that we would have a new

John Griffiths: Cytunaf â Jenny fod hyn yn bwysig oherwydd mai'r hyn a ddisgwylid o'r Cynulliad oedd y caem arddull wleidyddol

style of politics. We have achieved that in some way because there is a degree of informality in the Chamber. That is an improvement on Westminster. However, unfortunately we have not had that improvement to the extent that we had hoped in terms of lack of confrontational behaviour, which comes mainly from the Conservative Members. The Conservatives make a great deal of noise. I have heard people refer to them as using farmyard noises. That leaves a great deal to be desired in terms of how they conduct themselves. They have not taken on board the need for a new and different style of politics compared to the yah-boo politics at Westminster.

newydd. Yr ydym wedi cyflawni hynny mewn rhyw fodd oblegid ceir rhyw radd o anffurfioldeb yn y Siambr. Mae hynny'n welliant ar San Steffan. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus nid ydym wedi cael y gwelliant hwnnw i'r graddau yr oeddem wedi gobeithio yn nhermau diffyg ymddygiad gwrthdrawiadol, a ddaw yn bennaf o du'r Aelodau Ceidwadol. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn gwneud llawer iawn o dwrw. Yr wyf wedi clywed pobl yn dweud eu bod yn defnyddio synau'r buarth. Mae hynny'n gadael llawer i'w ddeisyfu yn nhermau'r modd y maent yn ymddwyn. Nid ydynt wedi derbyn yr angen am ddull newydd a gwahanol o wleidydda o gymharu â gwleidyddiaeth *yah-boo* San Steffan.

There is a great deal of cynicism among the public regarding politicians, and this type of confrontational, loud and aggressive behaviour feeds into that. In opinion polls on professions, politicians are often above estate agents, with lawyers and journalists above politicians. As a politician and a lawyer, I am sensitive to these matters and we must set an example and show that we support a new style of politics, especially in keeping with our commitment to equality of opportunity. Behaviour in this Chamber has often pandered to bigoted attitudes, be they racist, sexist, xenophobic or homophobic. We must get away from that. I hope that there will be a new start when we return after the Easter recess because that new start is needed badly.

Mae llawer iawn o sinigiaeth ymhlith y cyhoedd ynglŷn â gwleidyddion, ac mae'r math hwn o ymddygiad gwrthdrawiadol, swnllyd ac ymosodol yn bwydo hynny. Mewn polau piniwn ar broffesiynau, gosodir gwleidyddion yn aml uwchben gwerthwyr tai, gyda chyfreithwyr a newyddiadurwyr uwchben gwleidyddion. Fel gwleidydd a chyfreithiwr, yr wyf yn sensitif i'r materion hyn, a rhaid inni osod esiampl a dangos ein bod yn cefnogi dull newydd o wleidydda, yn enwedig yn unol â'n hymrwymiad i gyfle cyfartal. Mae ymddygiad yn y Siambr hon yn aml wedi tueddu at agweddau anoddefgar a chul, boed hiliol, rhywiaethol, senoffobig neu homoffobig. Rhaid inni symud oddi wrth hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd cychwyn newydd pan ddown yn ôl ar ôl toriad y Pasg gan fod mawr angen y cychwyn newydd hwnnw.

The Presiding Officer: Order. We have a short debate at 5 p.m. that I need to protect because it is a Conservative one—I would of course protect it whichever party was presenting it. Before the short debate, we need to discuss a major issue with several amendments and I had hoped to begin that debate before now. Therefore, I ask Members to be brief in their contributions to this debate.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae gennym ddadl fer am 5 o'r gloch y mae angen imi ei gwarchod gan mai un Geidwadol ydyw—byddwn, wrth gwrs, yn ei gwarchod pa bynnag blaid fyddai'n ei chyflwyno. Cyn y ddadl fer, mae angen inni drafod mater pwysig gyda nifer o welliannau ac yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio dechrau'r ddadl honno cyn hyn. Felly, gofynnaf i Aelodau fod yn gryno yn eu cyfraniadau i'r ddadl hon.

4:00 p.m.

Glyn Davies: I will be brief. I welcome this excellent statement and it will be fully supported by the Conservative Party, Llywydd. We always fully support your

Glyn Davies: Byddaf yn gryno. Croesawaf y datganiad ardderchog hwn ac fe'i cefnogir yn llwyr gan y Blaid Geidwadol, Lywydd. Yr ydym bob amser yn cefnogi'ch

actions and judgments and never question them outside this Chamber, which is not true of everyone else. We believe that debate in this Chamber should be robust. There are varying interpretations of the word 'robust' and perhaps the Conservative view is different to that of other groups. We believe that a degree of, shall we say, registration of our views on what Members say adds greatly to the debate and as long as that is proper in the judgment that you exercise, we think that that is perfectly okay.

gweithredoedd a'ch dyfarniadau'n llawn ac ni fyddwn byth yn eu cwestiynu y tu allan i'r Siambr hon, rhywbeth nad yw'n wir am bawb arall. Credwn y dylai'r dadlau yn y Siambr hon fod yn fywiog. Gellir dehongli'r gair 'bywiog' mewn sawl ffordd, ac efallai fod y farn Geidwadol yn wahanol i eiddo grwpiau eraill. Credwn fod rhyw gymaint o, dywedwn, gofrestru'n sylwadau ar yr hyn a ddywed Aelodau yn ychwanegu'n fawr at y ddadl a chyhyd ag y bo hynny'n briodol yn eich barn chi, yr ydym yn meddwl fod hynny'n berffaith iawn.

There was a suggestion during questions today and questions to the First Secretary yesterday that the Conservatives' different interpretation might in some way reflect our regard for the Assembly. Since being in this Assembly, we have given total support to its continuation. Many Members have made a similar statement and I repeat that since the referendum, the Conservative Party is totally committed to making this Assembly a success. We wish to see robust debate because we believe that that will benefit the Assembly far greater than the sitting-room politics that some Members seem to support.

Gwnaethpwyd awgrym yn ystod cwestiynau heddiw a chwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd ddoe y gallai dehongliad gwahanol y Ceidwadwyr adlewyrchu mewn rhyw fodd ein parch at y Cynulliad. Ers bod yn y Cynulliad hwn, yr ydym wedi rhoi cefnogaeth lwyr i'w barhad. Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi gwneud datganiad tebyg ac ailadroddaf fod y Blaid Geidwadol, ers y refferendwm, wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i sicrhau bod y Cynulliad hwn yn llwyddiant. Yr ydym yn dymuno gweld dadlau bywiog gan ein bod yn credu y bydd hynny'n llawer mwy buddiol i'r Cynulliad na'r wleidyddiaeth barlwr y mae rhai Aelodau fel petaent o'i phlaid.

Andrew Davies: In terms of the lack of time, I take on board the points that were made particularly Alison Halford's on the basis that a problem shared is a problem halved. I will consult with you Llywydd and my colleagues in the Business Committee about the interpretation of Standing Order No. 7.2.

Andrew Davies: Yn nhermau'r diffyg amser, derbyniaf y pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd, yn enwedig bwynt Alison Halford ar y sail fod problem wedi'i rhannu'n broblem wedi'i haneru. Ymgynghoraf â chi Lywydd a'm cyd-Aelodau yn y Pwyllgor Busnes ynglŷn â dehongliad Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.2.

Cynnig: O blaid 34, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 34, Abstain 11, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael

Ymataliodd yr aelodau canlynol:
The following members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Williams, Phil

Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Melding, David
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Motion adopted.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn derbyn bod hwn yn gais anarferol. Dyma'r tro cyntaf i'r cais hwn gael ei wneud. Yr ydym wedi cael sawl dadl ar Amcan 1 ond torrwyd amser y ddadl ddiwethaf ac ychydig o Aelodau yn unig a allodd gymryd rhan. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pwysau ar amser y Cynulliad ond gan mai hon yw'r drafodaeth olaf ar ddogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 1 cyn iddi fynd i Frwsel, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cael cymaint o amser â phosibl ar gyfer y drafodaeth. Ar ôl ymgynghori gydag Aelodau o'm grŵp a grwpiau eraill yn y Cynulliad gwnaf gais—a derbyniaf ei fod yn gais anarferol—i ymestyn y ddadl ar Amcan 1 tan 5.30 p.m ac i gynnal y ddadl fer rhwng 5.30 p.m. a 6.00 p.m. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r trafferth y mae hynny yn ei greu i nifer o Aelodau ond credaf fod y ddadl mor bwysig fel y dylem ei hymestyn o leiaf tan 5.30 p.m.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Point of order. I am sure that you will accept that this is an unusual request. This is the first time that this request has been made. We have had several debates on Objective 1 but the time of our last debate was curtailed and only a few Members were able to take part. I am aware of the pressure on the Assembly's time but as this debate is the final one on the Objective 1 single programming document before it goes to Brussels, it is important that we have as much time as possible for the debate. Having consulted with Members of my group and other groups in the Assembly I request—and I accept that it is an unusual request—that the debate on Objective 1 be extended until 5.30 p.m. and that the short debate be held between 5.30 p.m. and 6.00 p.m. I am aware of the inconvenience that that causes for many Members but I believe that this debate is so important that we should extend it to at least 5.30 p.m.

Y Llywydd: Os ydych yn gofyn am ohirio'r ddadl trwy gynnig trefniadol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16 neu ymestyn y ddadl o dan y rheoliadau sydd yn ymwneud ag ymestyn dadl, yn ôl fy nehongliad o'r Rheolau Sefydlog nid oes modd imi ymestyn amser ein sesiynau y tu hwnt i 5.30 p.m.

The Presiding Officer: If you are asking for the debate to be postponed through a procedural motion under Standing Order No. 6.16 or for the debate to be extended under the regulations that relate to extending a debate, according to my interpretation of the Standing Orders it is impossible for me to

Mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn glir ynglŷn â'r mater hwnnw. Mae modd inni ymestyn dadl o fewn yr amserlen honno, ond mae'r oriau penodedig yn glir. Nid ydym am sefydlu cynsail o ymestyn yr oriau mewn modd a all achosi anhawster, nid yn unig i Aelodau ond, yn bwysicach, i'r staff sydd yn gweithio inni—y rhai sydd yn gyfrifol am y cofnod, y cwestiynau a'r cyfieithu. Codwyd y mater yn anffurfiol mewn cyd-gyfarfod rhwng Aelodau, arweinyddion y pleidiau a minnau fel mater i'w drafod yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, mater i mi yw hwn ac ni allaf dderbyn cais heddiw am gynnig trefniadol i newid yr amserlen.

extend the time of our sessions beyond 5.30 p.m. The Standing Orders are clear on that matter. It is possible for us to extend a debate within that timetable, but the specified hours are clear. We do not want to set a precedent of extending hours, which could cause difficulty, not only for Members but, more importantly, for the staff who work for us—those responsible for the record, the questions and the translation. This matter was raised informally at a joint meeting between Members, party leaders and myself as a matter for discussion in the Business Committee. Under Standing Order No. 6.16, this is a matter for me and I cannot accept a request today for a procedural motion to change the timetable.

Rhaglen Amcan 1
Objective 1 Programme

The Presiding Officer: I have accepted amendments 1, 2, 3, 6 and 7 in the name of Phil Williams, amendments 4 and 8 in the names of Phil Williams, Alun Cairns and Michael German and amendment 5 in the name of Alun Cairns.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi derbyn gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 6 a 7 yn enw Phil Williams, gwelliannau 4 ac 8 yn enwau Phil Williams, Alun Cairns, a Michael German a gwelliant 5 yn enw Alun Cairns.

The First Secretary: I propose that

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Cynigiaf fod

the Assembly

y Cynulliad yn

1. Welcomes the important contribution that the Objective 1 programme will make to the economic, social and environmental regeneration of west Wales and the Valleys;

1. Croesawu'r cyfraniad pwysig y bydd y rhaglen Amcan 1 yn ei wneud i adfywiad economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd;

2. Endorses the Welsh European Partnership's proposals for the strategy, priorities and indicative measures for Objective 1 contained in the draft single programming document laid in the Table Office on 5 April 2000;

2. Cymeradwyo cynigion Partneriaeth Cymru ac Ewrop ar gyfer y strategaeth, y blaenoriaethau a'r mesurau dangosol ar gyfer Amcan 1 a geir yn y ddogfen raglennu sengl ddrafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Ebrill 2000;

3. Adopts the draft single programming document and requests the First Secretary, consulting as necessary with other political parties, to finalise the text in discussion with the European Commission and ensure a favourable Commission decision as soon as possible;

3. Mabwysiadu'r ddogfen raglennu sengl ddrafft a gofyn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd, gan ymgynghori â phleidiau gwleidyddol eraill yn ôl y gofyn, derfynoli'r testun ar y cyd â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a sicrhau penderfyniad ffafriol o du'r Comisiwn cyn gynted â phosibl;

4. Requests the First Secretary to secure an outcome from the UK spending review that

4. Gofyn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd sicrhau canlyniad o arolwg gwariant y Deyrnas

will enable the Assembly to meet its commitments under the programme without detriment to its non-European budgetary provisions;

5. Invites the First Secretary to agree the necessary arrangements with the partnership so that launch of the Objective 1 programme can take place before the end of July 2000.

Ieuan Wyn Jones is right to attribute huge importance to this afternoon's debate. I agree with him. This is the moment of truth as far as Objective 1 is concerned. It is not possible to overestimate the importance of getting this debate right or how important it was to get the single programming document right in order to get Objective 1 right when it is implemented in a couple of months' time.

This afternoon, we must express the essential unity of purpose of this Assembly, or at least the vast majority of it, in getting the single programming document into the correct shape ready for its submission to Brussels. The SPD is still in draft form until the end of this debate. It is the product of five months of long-drawn-out, difficult negotiations between the Commission and its Welsh partners. Those negotiations have been tough, but the end result, as the Economic Development Committee noted, represents a big step forward in coherence and in ability to turn people's dreams about what Objective 1 can do for Wales into reality. It has, with one exception, been accepted by the Commission in its negotiations.

Before I continue, I want to take this opportunity to pay tribute to the hard working Assembly staff, led by Michael Cochlin and Hugh Rawlins. I will also mention the people in the boiler room, above all Chris Johnes, Damien O'Brien and Jonathon Price who have laboured mightily to get this document into shape and have accepted suggestions from all quarters—the Assembly, the four parties, the Economic Development Committee and different bodies represented on the informal partnership that succeeded the taskforce. If all goes well in the next few days, they may be allowed up for air occasionally and their pallor from the work that they have done in the past few months can be remedied during the Easter vacation. I

Unedig a fydd yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i ysgwyddo'i ymrwymiadau o dan y rhaglen heb amharu ar y darpariaethau cyllidol na ddônt o Ewrop;

5. Gwahodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd i gytuno ar y trefniadau angenrheidiol gyda'r bartneriaeth er mwyn i raglen Amcan 1 allu cael ei lansio cyn diwedd Gorffennaf 2000.

Mae Ieuan Wyn Jones yn gywir i briodoli pwysigrwydd enfawr i ddadl y prynhawn yma. Yr wyf yn cytuno ag ef. Dyma'r awr dyngedfennol cyn belled ag y mae Amcan 1 yn y cwestiwn. Ni ellir gorbwysleisio pwysigrwydd y ddadl hon na pha mor bwysig oedd sicrhau bod y ddogfen raglennu sengl yn gywir er mwyn cael Amcan 1 yn iawn pan y'i gweithredir ymhen ychydig fisoedd.

Y prynhawn yma, rhaid inni fynegi undod pwrpas hanfodol y Cynulliad hwn, neu o leiaf ei fwyafrif llethol, i sicrhau bod y ddogfen raglennu sengl yn y ffurf gywir yn barod i'w chyflwyno i Frwsel. Mae'r ddogfen raglennu sengl yn dal ar ffurf drafft tan ddiwedd y ddadl hon. Mae'n gynnyrch pum mis o negodi hir ac anodd rhwng y Comisiwn a'i bartneriaid Cymreig. Bu'r negodi'n galed, ond mae'r canlyniad, fel y nododd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, yn cynrychioli cam mawr ymlaen o ran cydlyniaeth ac o ran y gallu i wireddu breuddwydion pobl ynghylch yr hyn y gall Amcan 1 ei wneud dros Gymru. Gydag un eithriad, fe'i derbyniwyd gan y Comisiwn yn ei negodiadau.

Cyn mynd ymlaen, hoffwn gymryd y cyfle hwn i dalu teyrnged i staff dyfal y Cynulliad, dan arweiniad Michael Cochlin a Hugh Rawlins. Soniaf hefyd am y bobl yn y boelerdy, sef yn bennaf Chris Johnes, Damien O'Brien a Jonathon Price a lafuriodd yn ddygn i roi ffurf ar y ddogfen ac a dderbyniodd awgrymiadau o bob cyfeiriad—gan y Cynulliad, y pedair plaid, y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'r gwahanol gyrff a gynrychiolwyd ar y bartneriaeth anffurfiol a olynodd y tasglu. Os aiff popeth yn iawn yn yr ychydig ddyddiau nesaf, gellir caniatáu iddynt ddod i fyny i gymryd eu gwynt yn achlysurol a gallant fanteisio ar doriad y Pasg i wella'r wedd welw sydd arnynt yn sgîl y gwaith a wnaethant yn yr ychydig fisoedd

pay them a huge tribute. Their work has been well beyond the call of duty. The end product is the single programming document, which calls to mind the delightful ceremony in which I took part in Aberystwyth on Saturday. We received the Pennal Letter back in Wales for the opening of an exhibition in the National Library of Wales. I am being completely fanciful in saying that this document is our Pennal Letter. That document was of huge importance to Wales. Since 1406, the quality of our democracy is slightly more organised, but I am sure that you agree that the quality of our political leadership has declined a lot in the past few weeks. However, this document is as important to the future of Wales as the Pennal Letter was and I hope that it does not take 594 years to get a reply from Brussels, as it did to get the Pennal Letter back.

diwethaf. Rhoddaf deyrnged enfawr iddynt. Bu eu gwaith ymhell y tu hwnt i alwadau dyletswydd. Cynnyrch eu llafur yw'r ddogfen raglennu sengl, sydd yn f'atgoffa o'r seremoni hyfryd y cymerais ran ynddi yn Aberystwyth ddydd Sadwrn. Derbyniasom Lythyr Pennal yn ôl i Gymru ar gyfer agor arddangosfa yn y Llyfrgell Genedlaethol. Yr wyf yn bod yn gwbl ffansïol wrth ddweud mai'r ddogfen hon yw'n Llythyr Pennal ni. Yr oedd y ddogfen honno'n aruthrol o bwysig i Gymru. Ers 1406, mae ychydig mwy o drefn ar ansawdd ein democratiaeth, ond yr wyf yn siwr y cytunwch fod ansawdd ein harweinyddiaeth wleidyddol wedi dirywio cryn dipyn yn yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddogfen hon cyn bwysiced i ddyfodol Cymru ag ydoedd Llythyr Pennal, a gobeithiaf na chymer 594 o flynyddoedd inni gael ateb o Frwsel, fel y cymerodd i gael Llythyr Pennal yn ôl.

I also want to thank many partner organisations—local authorities and other public sector bodies, universities and colleges, business organisations and the voluntary sector—which put in so much work to help develop the document. This will provide a framework for economic development over the next seven years in two thirds of Wales, which are the more deprived, lagging areas of the Welsh economy.

Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i nifer o gyrff fu'n bartneriaid inni—yn awdurdodau lleol a chyrff eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus, prifysgolion a cholegau, sefydliadau busnes a'r sector gwirfoddol—a gyfrannodd gymaint o waith i helpu i ddatblygu'r ddogfen. Bydd hyn yn darparu fframwaith ar gyfer datblygu economaidd dros y saith mlynedd nesaf mewn dwy ran o dair o Gymru, sef ardaloedd mwy difreintiedig, arafach, economi Cymru.

4:10 p.m.

The strategy in the document helps us fundamentally to emphasise improving the competitiveness of our small and medium sized enterprise sector so that we grow more of our own jobs and are less dependent on inward investment. It encourages greater use and understanding of information and communication technology, promotes innovation and skills development and sets up a development fund for small and medium-sized enterprises. It is about the Welsh wealth creation process. It reminds me of Sir Keith Joseph's error when he came to Wales about 25 years ago when, in a somewhat lordly fashion, he said that it was interesting that there was no Welsh word for entrepreneur. It was pointed out to him that it was not an English word either. He had second thoughts. The issue of how we generate more of our own jobs is of great

Mae'r strategaeth yn y ddogfen yn ein helpu yn sylfaenol i roi pwyslais ar wella cystadleurwydd ein sector busnesau bach a chanolig fel y gallwn dyfu mwy o'n swyddi ein hunain a dibynnu llai ar fuddsoddiad oddi allan. Mae'n annog mwy o ddefnydd a dealltwriaeth o dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, yn hyrwyddo arloesi a datblygu sgiliau ac yn sefydlu cronfa ddatblygu ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig. Mae'n ymwneud â'r broses o greu cyfoeth yng Nghymru. Mae'n fy atgoffa o gamgymeriad Syr Keith Joseph pan ddaeth hwnnw i Gymru ryw 25 mlynedd yn ôl pan ddywedodd, yn uchelwrol braidd, ei bod yn ddiddorol nad oedd gair Cymraeg am entrepreneur. Tynnwyd ei sylw nad gair Saesneg ydoedd ychwaith. Bu raid iddo ailfeddwl. Mae'r cwestiwn sut mae cynhyrchu mwy o'n swyddi ein hunain yn un pwysig iawn i

importance to the success of the project which is encapsulated in the single programming document. It will support community regeneration and the farm sector to diversify and adapt to rapidly changing markets. The changes reflect the desire to place emphasis on research, development and innovation to promote a more integrated model of rural development. This has led to some adjustments to the previous financial allocations.

lwyddiant y prosiect sydd wedi'i grisialu yn y ddogfen raglennu sengl. Bydd yn cefnogi adfywiad cymunedol a'r sector ffermio i arallgyfeirio ac ymaddasu i farchnadoedd sydd yn newid yn sydyn. Mae'r newidiadau'n adlewyrchu'r awydd i roi pwyslais ar ymchwil, datblygu ac arloesi er mwyn hyrwyddo model mwy integredig o ddatblygu gwledig. Mae hyn wedi arwain at rai addasiadau i'r dyraniadau ariannol blaenorol.

The one major outstanding issue remains the financial allocations to infrastructure. As I discussed at the Economic Development Committee this morning and with the other party leaders, the Commission is looking for further cuts in the infrastructure allocation. The financial tables in the document reflect the considered view of the partnership. We have already made concessions to the Commission's view that we allocated too much to infrastructure. We do not wish to make further cuts as the Commission has requested. The Commission has almost developed an obsession with reducing infrastructure spend on the grounds that it is about eight-lane motorways which do not create jobs except during the construction phase. That is their view which we heard again when my esteemed good friend and colleague, Graham Meadows, the Director of the European Commission's Regional Directorate, presented his evidence to the Economic Development Committee two weeks ago. However, I do not agree with him on that issue. Infrastructure investment does not have to be about eight-lane motorways. It can be the key to removing blockages to economic development. I intend to pursue the issue with the Commission to seek a satisfactory resolution with the help of the other party spokesmen I have been consulting on this matter. I shall be looking to test the water in Plenary this afternoon to see what views emerge.

Yr un cwestiwn mawr sydd ar ôl o hyd yw'r dyraniadau ariannol tuag at yr isadeiledd. Fel y trafodais yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd y bore yma a chydag arweinwyr y pleidiau eraill, mae'r Comisiwn yn edrych am doriadau pellach yn y dyraniad ar gyfer isadeiledd. Mae'r tablau ariannol yn y ddogfen yn adlewyrchu barn y bartneriaeth ar ôl ystyried y mater. Yr ydym eisoes wedi ildio tir i farn y Comisiwn ein bod wedi dyrannu gormod ar gyfer isadeiledd. Nid ydym am wneud toriadau pellach fel y gofynnodd y Comisiwn. Bron nad ydyw'r Comisiwn wedi datblygu obsesiwn gyda thorri gwariant ar isadeiledd ar y sail mai gwariant ydyw ar draffyrdd wyth lôn nad ydynt yn creu swyddi ac eithrio yn ystod y cam adeiladu. Dyna'u barn hwy, a glywsom eto pan gyflwynodd fy hybarch gyfaill a chydweithiwr da, Graham Meadows, Cyfarwyddwr Cyfarwyddiaeth Ranbarthol y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, ei dystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd bythefnos yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn cytuno ag ef ar y mater hwnnw. Nid oes raid i fuddsoddiad mewn isadeiledd ymwneud â thraffyrdd wyth lôn. Gall fod yr allwedd i symud rhwystrau i ddatblygu economaidd. Bwriadaf fynd ar ôl y mater gyda'r Comisiwn i geisio datrys y peth yn foddhaol gyda chymorth llefarwyr y pleidiau eraill yr ymgynghorais â hwy ar y mater hwn. Byddaf yn profi'r dŵr yn y Cyfarfod Llawn y prynhawn yma i weld pa sylwadau a ddaw i'r golwg.

Ron Davies: Time will not allow me to make the speech that I wanted to, so I take this opportunity to assure Rhodri that, as someone who represents a constituency within the Objective 1 area, I support his comment about defending the position on infrastructure spending. I urge him to be as robust as possible in resisting the Commission's

Ron Davies: Nid yw amser yn caniatáu imi wneud yr araith yr oeddwn am ei gwneud, felly cymeraf y cyfle hwn i sicrhau Rhodri fy mod, fel un sydd yn cynrychioli etholaeth o fewn yr ardal Amcan 1, yn cefnogi ei sylw ynghylch amddiffyn y safiad ar wariant ar yr isadeiledd. Anogaf ef i fod mor gadarn ag sydd yn bosibl wrth wrthsefyll ymdrechion y

attempts to reduce that commitment to infrastructure. In my Caerphilly and other valley constituencies, we are not looking for eight-lane motorways but for road improvements and town centre re-developments, the sort of things that are needed if we are to breathe economic life back into our communities.

Comisiwn i leihau'r ymrwymiad hwnnw i'r isadeiledd. Yng Nghaerffili ac mewn etholaethau eraill yn y Cymoedd, nid ydym yn edrych am draffyrdd wyth lôn ond am welliannau i'r ffyrdd ac ailddatblygu canol trefi, y math o bethau y mae eu hangen os ydym am anadlu bywyd economaidd newydd i mewn i'n cymunedau.

The First Secretary: I am grateful for those views. There has been a great deal of debate over the financial implications for the Assembly's budget and the comprehensive spending review, in terms of match funding: as regards the £1.2 billion from the Commission, where does the rest of the £2.4 billion come from over the next six or seven years? This matter will be addressed in the comprehensive spending review, barring the first year. The Government is undertaking the comprehensive spending review and it will be concluded in July. Since being appointed First Secretary I have discussed this matter with the Chief Secretary to the Treasury and more recently with the Prime Minister. On each occasion I took the opportunity to press for the necessary additional funding to enable Wales to fully benefit from the Objective 1 programme. This constant lobbying has begun to pay dividends. Last week I had a letter from the Chief Secretary to the Treasury—which I have shared with the leaders of the other political parties represented here—that confirms that the matter is being given significant prominence inside the comprehensive spending review process. Andrew Smith makes clear in that letter that the Government's goal is to ensure that all the Objective 1 allocations are fully taken up, not only in Wales but in the three English Objective 1 areas over the period 2000-06. The letter also states that the way is clear for the SPD to be submitted to the European Commission in good faith.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y sylwadau hynny. Bu llawer iawn o ddadlau ynghylch y goblygiadau ariannol i gyllideb y Cynulliad a'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, yn nhermau arian cyfatebol: yn achos yr £1.2 biliwn gan y Comisiwn, o ble y daw gweddill y £2.4 biliwn dros y chwech neu saith mlynedd nesaf? Ymdrinnir â'r mater hwn yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, ac eithrio yn y flwyddyn gyntaf. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn cynnal yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant ac fe'i orffennir ym mis Gorffennaf. Ers cael fy mhenodi'n Brif Ysgrifennydd yr wyf wedi trafod y mater hwn gyda Phrif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys ac yn fwy diweddar gyda'r Prif Weinidog. Ar y naill achlysur a'r llall manteisiais ar y cyfle i bwyso am yr arian ychwanegol angenrheidiol i alluogi Cymru i elwa'n llawn ar y rhaglen Amcan 1. Mae'r pwyso parhaus hwn wedi dechrau dwyn ffrwyth. Yr wythnos diwethaf cefais lythyr oddi wrth Brif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys—un yr wyf wedi'i rannu ag arweinwyr y pleidiau gwleidyddol eraill a gynrychiolir yma—yn cadarnhau fod y mater yn cael lle blaenllaw o fewn proses yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Eglura Andrew Smith yn y llythyr hwnnw mai nod y Llywodraeth yw sicrhau y cymerir pob dyraniad Amcan 1, nid dim ond yng Nghymru ond yn y tair ardal Amcan 1 yn Lloegr dros y cyfnod 2000-06. Dywed y llythyr hefyd fod y ffordd yn glir i'r ddogfen raglennu sengl gael ei chyflwyno i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd gydag ewyllys da.

Dafydd Wigley: O nodi geiriau Mr Smith ar y pwynt hwnnw, sef ei fod eisiau gweld y Cynulliad yn cymryd yr arian Ewropeaidd yn llawn yn ystod y flwyddyn hon yn ogystal â blynyddoedd canlynol, pe bai'r £25 miliwn sydd yn y gyllideb i dalu am yr arian cyfatebol a'r arian Ewropeaidd yn annigonol ar gyfer y flwyddyn hon, a yw'r Trysorlys yn awgrymu defnyddio'r gronfa wrth gefn i

Dafydd Wigley: Noting Mr Smith's words on that point, that he wants to see us take up the European money fully during this year as well as subsequent years, if the £25 million in the budget to pay for the match funding and the European money was insufficient for this year, is the Treasury suggesting using the contingency reserve to ensure that we can do that?

sicrhau ein bod yn medru gwneud hynny?

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Nid yw'r Trysorlys yn medru sicrhau'r hawl i ddefnyddio'r gronfa wrth gefn. Mae'r Trysorlys wedi gweld ac yn fodlon â'r ymadrodd a ddarllenodd Dafydd yn y llythyr at Michael Barnier, y comisiynydd sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb dros y mater hwn, sydd o hyd mewn ffurf ddrafft tan ddiwedd y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Mae'r Trysorlys wedi gweld yr ymadrodd ac yn fodlon arno.

The First Secretary: The Treasury cannot ensure the right to use the contingency reserve. The Treasury has seen and is happy with the phrase that Dafydd has read in the letter to Michael Barnier, the commissioner responsible for this issue, which remains in draft form until the end of today's debate. The Treasury has seen the phrase and is happy with it.

I also mention the European social fund and the possible transfer of responsibility to the Assembly of social fund expenditure within Wales. We all accept that the Objective 1 programme would be easier to administrate if the 30 or 40 per cent of expenditure that comes under the broad heading currently covered by the Department for Education and Employment budget—because it administers the European social fund—was transferred to us. While that is desirable, it would be more desirable to have the transfer of responsibility along with an equivalent transfer of the public expenditure cover from DfEE. We have so far been unable to agree with DfEE. I hope that by the end of the comprehensive spending review we will be able to agree a suitable figure for the full transfer of the appropriate public expenditure cover from DfEE to the Assembly. That would cover the European social fund expenditure or that kind of social fund expenditure that they would otherwise have to find from their public expenditure cover. They do not lose anything by transferring the expenditure cover in full. However, so far we have been unable to reach a formula for baseline transfer even though all sorts of promises have been made about a lesser amount in the baseline, plus in-year transfers of any insufficiency in the transferred baseline. That is not enough because we need it to be in our baseline to know where we stand. We are still arguing at official and political levels with DfEE over the transfer of the full public expenditure cover to enable the proper integration of the more training oriented and the less training oriented funds. In other words—to use old programme language, not new Objective 1 language—the European social fund and the European regional development fund. Combining those would ensure that we

Crybwyllaf hefyd gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd a'r posibilrwydd o drosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb i'r Cynulliad am wariant y gronfa gymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Derbyniwn y byddai'r rhaglen Amcan 1 yn haws i'w gweinyddu pe bai'r 30 neu 40 y cant o wariant a ddaw dan y pennawd bras sydd yn gyfrifoldeb cyllideb yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth ar hyn o bryd—am mai hi sydd yn gweinyddu'r gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd—yn cael ei drosglwyddo i ni. Er bod hynny i'w ddymuno, byddai'n well cael trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb ynghyd â throsglwyddiad cymesur o'r ddarpariaeth gwariant cyhoeddus o'r AACh. Hyd yn hyn nid ydym wedi gallu cytuno gyda'r AACh. Gobeithiaf erbyn diwedd yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant y byddwn yn gallu cytuno ar ffigur addas ar gyfer trosglwyddiad llawn y ddarpariaeth gwariant cyhoeddus briodol o'r AACh i'r Cynulliad. Byddai hynny'n ymdrin â'r gwariant perthnasol i gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd neu'r math hwnnw o wariant cronfa gymdeithasol y byddai'n rhaid iddynt fel arall ei dalu o'u darpariaeth gwariant cyhoeddus. Nid ydynt yn colli dim wrth drosglwyddo'r ddarpariaeth wario yn llawn. Fodd bynnag, hyd yma nid ydym wedi gallu cyrraedd fformwla ar gyfer trosglwyddo llinell sylfaen er y gwnaethpwyd pob math o addewidion ynghylch swm llai yn y llinell sylfaen, ynghyd â throsglwyddo yn ystod y flwyddyn ar gyfer unrhyw annigonolrwydd yn y llinell sylfaen a drosglwyddwyd. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon oherwydd mae arnom angen ei gael yn ein llinell sylfaen er mwyn gwybod ble'r ydym yn sefyll. Yr ydym yn dal i ddadlau ar lefelau swyddogol a gwleidyddol gyda'r AACh ynghylch trosglwyddo'r ddarpariaeth lawn ar gyfer gwariant cyhoeddus fel y gellir integreiddio'n iawn yr arian sydd yn

integrate the programmes as best we can.

ymwneud fwy â hyfforddiant a'r arian sydd yn ymwneud llai â hyfforddiant. Mewn geiriau eraill—a defnyddio iaith yr hen raglen, nid iaith newydd Amcan 1—y gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd a'r gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd. Byddai cyfuno'r rhain yn sicrhau y byddem yn integreiddio'r rhaglenni orau y gallem.

The budget for this financial year makes provision to meet the overhang payments from the old programmes as well as setting aside £25 million to meet expenditure on approved projects under the new programme. We have also made clear in the SPD that, should expenditure be greater than £25 million, we will ensure that funds are made available in-year to meet whatever is required. Dafydd raised the point about the contingency reserve. We would initially look at our own resources for underspends that we cannot spend in any other field of activity. If that were insufficient, we would make a claim on the contingency reserve. That is the procedure. The sum of £25 million is the best estimate that we believe we could get out of the door in the present financial year, which started 10 days ago. It would be a great credit to our administration if we could get £50 million out of the door rather than £25 million. As we know, Merseyside and the Highlands and Islands of Scotland did not spend any money during their first year. We have learnt certain precedents from them.

Mae'r gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon yn gwneud darpariaeth i dalu'r taliadau a gariwyd drosodd o'r hen raglenni yn ogystal â neilltuo £25 miliwn i dalu am wariant ar brosiectau a gymeradwywyd dan y rhaglen newydd. Yr ydym hefyd wedi egluro yn y ddogfen raglennu sengl os bydd gwariant yn fwy na £25 miliwn, y byddwn yn sicrhau y darperir arian yn ystod y flwyddyn i dalu beth bynnag sydd ei angen. Cododd Dafydd y pwynt am y gronfa wrth gefn. Byddem yn gyntaf yn chwilio yn ein hadnoddau ein hunain am danwario na ellir ei wario mewn unrhyw faes gweithgaredd arall. Pe bai hynny'n annigonol, byddem yn gwneud cais am swm o'r gronfa wrth gefn. Dyna'r drefn. Y swm o £25 miliwn yw'r amcangyfrif gorau y credwn y gallem ei gael drwy'r drws yn y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol, a ddechreuodd ddeg diwrnod yn ôl. Byddai'n glod mawr i'n gweinyddiaeth pe gallem gael £50 miliwn drwy'r drws yn hytrach na £25 miliwn. Fel y gwyddom, ni wariodd Glannau Mersi ac Ucheldiroedd ac Ynysoedd yr Alban unrhyw arian yn ystod eu blwyddyn gyntaf. Yr ydym wedi dysgu rhai gwersi ganddynt hwy.

Much work has already been done on implementing the programme. A monitoring committee has been set up. Bodies such as the Welsh Development Agency, the Wales Tourist Board, many local authorities and others have worked to develop strategies for implementing the programme. The Welsh European Funding Office is up and running and preparing for the beginning of the programme. Assembly staff, the Welsh European Funding Office staff and other partners are working on detailed guidance for action plans. We are confident that we will be ready to open the programme in July with a special fast-track bidding round to get Objective 1 up and running in Wales. It is difficult to put into words how much I am looking forward to the Assembly signing the first cheque. We look at the Irish example. If

Mae llawer o waith wedi'i wneud eisoes ar weithredu'r rhaglen. Sefydlwyd corff monitro. Mae cyrff fel Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, llawer o awdurdodau lleol ac eraill wedi gweithio i ddatblygu strategaethau ar gyfer gweithredu'r rhaglen. Mae Swyddfa Ariannu Ewropeaidd Cymru ar ei thraed ac yn paratoi ar gyfer dechrau'r rhaglen. Mae staff y Cynulliad, staff Swyddfa Ariannu Ewropeaidd Cymru a phartneriaid eraill yn gweithio ar ganllawiau manwl ar gyfer cynlluniau gweithredu. Yr ydym yn hyderus y byddwn yn barod i agor y rhaglen ym mis Gorffennaf gyda chylch ceisiadau cyflym i gael Amcan 1 ar ei draed ac ar waith yng Nghymru. Mae'n anodd cyfleu mewn geiriau gymaint yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen i weld y Cynulliad yn llofnodi'r siec gyntaf. Edrychwn ar esiampl

we can achieve in the next seven years half of what Ireland has achieved in the past 10 in transforming its economy with the benefit of Objective 1 funding—and many other advantages that we do not have—I would regard that as a great achievement for this Assembly.

Iwerddon. Os gallwn gyflawni yn y saith mlynedd nesaf hanner yr hyn a gyflawnodd Iwerddon yn y 10 mlynedd diwethaf i drawsnewid ei heconomi gyda mantais arian Amcan 1—a llawer o fanteision eraill nad ydynt gennym ni—byddwn yn gweld hynny fel camp fawr i'r Cynulliad hwn.

4:20 p.m.

I will briefly run through my response to the amendments as we are short of time. I have no problem with amendment 1 and am happy to support it. Amendments 2 and 3 would, if adopted, do much to neuter the effects of the debate this afternoon. Their effect is to signify that the Assembly is lukewarm about the programme. They do not suggest to the Commission, the partnership, or above all, the residents of west Wales and the Valleys—whom we have to energise to put their efforts into this programme—that this is a programme that we strongly support and to which we are committed. An essentially ambiguous message would be conveyed were those amendments adopted. That would send out the wrong message and could well mean further discussions and delay before the Commission felt able to agree the programme. I hope that the proposer of those amendments will think about that.

Af drwy fy ymateb i'r gwelliannau yn gryno gan ein bod yn brin o amser. Nid oes gennyf broblem gyda gwelliant 1 ac yr wyf yn fodlon ei gefnogi. Byddai gwelliannau 2 a 3, pe'u derbynnid, yn gwneud llawer i negyddu effeithiau'r ddadl y prynhawn yma. Eu heffaith yw rhoi'r argraff fod y Cynulliad yn llugoer ynglŷn â'r rhaglen. Nid ydynt yn awgrymu i'r Comisiwn, y bartneriaeth, nac uwchlaw pawb, drigolion y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd—y mae'n rhaid inni eu symbylu i roi eu hymdrechion i'r rhaglen hon—fod hon yn rhaglen yr ydym yn ei chefnogi'n gryf ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo iddi. Cyflëid neges amwys yn ei hanfod pe derbynnid y gwelliannau hynny. Byddai hynny'n anfon y neges anghywir a gallai'n hawdd olygu mwy o drafod ac oedi cyn y teimlai'r Comisiwn y gallai gytuno â'r rhaglen. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff cynigydd y gwelliannau hynny feddwl am hynny.

I support amendment 4. The sentiments expressed in the amendment are those that all Members would endorse as of great importance to the programme's success. The Assembly will, of course, appreciate that we are in negotiations. I cannot determine what those negotiations will produce but achieving the desired outcome is a top priority.

Cefnogaf welliant 4. Mae'r teimladau a fynegir yn y gwelliant yn rhai y byddai pob Aelod yn eu hategu fel rhai holl bwysig i lwyddiant y rhaglen. Bydd y Cynulliad yn sylweddoli, wrth gwrs, ein bod yn negodi. Ni allaf ddweud beth fydd cynnyrch y negodi hwnnw ond mae sicrhau'r canlyniad a ddymunir yn flaenoriaeth uchaf.

I cannot support amendment 5. This Objective 1 programme will be implemented from the moment that it is formally approved by the European Commission. We are working to the same timescale as the other UK Objective 1 regions. The Welsh European Funding Office has been established three months before the first project bids are likely to be submitted. There is no evidence to suggest that the first year has not been exploited fully because of funding difficulties. I would recommend that that amendment be rejected.

Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 5. Gweithredir y rhaglen Amcan 1 hon o'r eiliad y'i cymeradwyir yn ffurfiol gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Yr ydym yn gweithio ar yr un amserlen â'r rhanbarthau Amcan 1 eraill yn y DU. Sefydlwyd Swyddfa Ariannu Ewropeaidd Cymru dri mis cyn dyddiad tebygol cyflwyno'r ceisiadau prosiect cyntaf. Nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth i awgrymu na fanteisiwyd yn llawn ar y flwyddyn gyntaf oherwydd anawsterau ariannu. Argymhellaf wrthod y gwelliant hwnnw.

Amendment 6 causes me no problem in principle, because it will be for the programme monitoring committee to deliver on that commitment. I chair that body and Phil Williams is a member of it. There is an important element of implementation and I am happy for the Assembly to support that amendment.

Nid yw gwelliant 6 yn codi problem o gwbl imi mewn egwyddor, oherwydd mater i'r pwyllgor monitro rhaglenni fydd gwireddu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Fi yw cadeirydd y corff hwnnw ac mae Phil Williams yn aelod ohono. Mae elfen bwysig o weithredu ac yr wyf yn hapus i'r Cynulliad gefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw.

I do not believe that amendment 7 can be supported. The programme cannot begin until the Commission has given its formal approval of the single programming document and the monitoring committee has then agreed the programme complement. Much work can take place in parallel, but the programme complement cannot be agreed until late June at the earliest. The amendment is therefore unworkable in asking for spending in May when the programme complement cannot be agreed until late June. I urge the proposer of that amendment to withdraw it. If he does not, I must recommend that the Assembly reject it. We hope to make the first spending commitments before the end of July.

Nid wyf yn credu y gellir cefnogi gwelliant 7. Ni all y rhaglen ddechrau nes bydd y Comisiwn wedi rhoi ei gymeradwyaeth ffurfiol i'r ddogfen raglennu sengl a bod y pwyllgor monitro wedyn wedi cytuno ar y pecyn rhaglenni. Gall llawer o waith ddigwydd ochr yn ochr, ond ni ellir cytuno ar y pecyn rhaglenni ddim cynt na diwedd Mehefin. Felly mae'r gwelliant yn anymarferol yn gofyn am wariant ym mis Mai pan na ellir cytuno ar y pecyn rhaglenni tan ddiwedd Mehefin. Anogaf gynigydd y gwelliant i'w dynnu'n ôl. Os na wnaiff, rhaid imi argymell fod y Cynulliad yn ei wrthod. Gobeithiwn wneud yr ymrwymiadau gwario cyntaf cyn diwedd mis Gorffennaf.

The proposal in amendment 8 is in line with the work already undertaken by the Welsh European Funding Office's staff and other Assembly officials. I am happy to support that amendment.

Mae'r cynnig yng ngwelliant 8 yn unol â'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd eisoes gan staff Swyddfa Ariannu Ewropeaidd Cymru a swyddogion eraill yn y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn hapus i gefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw.

Let us hope and pray that what is enormously good news for Wales is not turned into bad news for Wales by a tug of war between west Wales and the Valleys, between one part of Wales and another or between north and south this afternoon. Wales would not find it acceptable should this great opportunity, the best in a generation, fall flat this afternoon because of a failure to get our shoulders behind the wheel.

Gadewch inni obeithio a gweddïo na chaiff yr hyn sydd yn newyddion hynod o dda i Gymru ei droi'n newyddion drwg i Gymru oherwydd ymrafael rhwng y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd, rhwng un rhan o Gymru ac un arall neu rhwng gogledd a de y prynhawn yma. Ni fyddai Cymru'n ei gweld yn dderbyniol petai'r cyfle gwych hwn, y gorau ers cenhedlaeth, yn cwympo'n fflat y prynhawn yma oherwydd methiant i roi'n hysgwyddau y tu ôl i'r olwyn.

Gadewch inni ein hatgoffa ein hunain mai'r llinell yn ein hanthem genedlaethol yw 'pleidiol wyf i'm gwlad' ac nid 'pleidiol wyf i'm plwyf'. Nid yw'r ddogfen hon yn berffaith. Nid yw perffeithrwydd yn bosibl yn y byd hwn. Byddai cwyno am y ddogfen a'i chynnwys bron â bod fel cywiro safon gramadeg Lladin Llythyr Pennal. Felly, gobeithiaf y gallwn ni i gyd gefnogi'r ddogfen a sicrhau bod y neges gywir yn

Let us remind ourselves that the line in our national anthem is 'I am partisan to my country' and not 'I am partisan to my parish'. This document is not perfect. Perfection is not possible in this world. Complaining about the document and its content would almost be like correcting the Latin grammar in the Pennal Letter. Therefore, I hope that we can all support the document and ensure that the correct message goes to Brussels, that is, that

mynd i Frwsel, sef bod Cymru yn disgwyl iddynt roi eu cefnogaeth i'r ddogfen, yr un gefnogaeth ag yr ydym ni yn ei rhoi y prynhawn yma.

Wales looks to them to give their support to the document, the same support that we give this afternoon.

Y Llywydd: Cyn imi alw Phil Williams, gofynnaf i Aelodau gyfyngu eu hareithiau i'r pum munud safonol arferol.

The Presiding Officer: Before I call Phil Williams, I ask Members to restrict their speeches to the customary standard five minutes.

Phil Williams: I propose amendment 1. In clause 1, delete '*will*' and replace with '*should*'.

Phil Williams: Cynigiaf welliant 1. Yng nghymal 1, dileer '*y bydd y*' a rhoi '*y dylai'r*' yn ei le.

I also propose amendment 2. In clause 2 delete '*endorses*' and replace with '*notes*'.

Cynigiaf welliant 2 hefyd. Yng nghymal 2, dileer '*cymeradwyo*' a rhoi '*nodi*' yn ei le.

I also propose amendment 3. In clause 3 delete '*adopts*' and replace with '*notes*'.

Cynigiaf welliant 3 hefyd. Yng nghymal 3, dileer '*mabwysiadu*' a rhoi '*nodi*' yn ei le.

I also propose amendment 6. In clause 5 add after '*partnership*' ', *including full arrangements for implementation at local level,*'

Cynigiaf welliant 6 hefyd. Yng nghymal 5 ychwaneger ar ôl **'***bartneriaeth*' ', *gan gynnwys trefniadau llawn ar gyfer eu rhoi ar waith yn lleol*'.

I also propose amendment 7. In clause 5 delete '*July*' and replace with '*May*'.

Cynigiaf welliant 7 hefyd. Yng nghymal 5 dileer '*Gorffennaf*' a rhoi '*Mai*' yn ei le.

I take no pleasure in proposing these amendments. The success of Objective 1 is so important that I would prefer to endorse the document with enthusiasm, my normal style. However, when I read this draft I have to say that this is not our document. It is not the document that we hoped would be the blueprint for economic regeneration. We wanted a programme with clear and inspiring themes and we thought that we had achieved unanimous agreement on the themes of equal opportunity, social inclusion and sustainable development—development that was economically, socially and environmentally sustainable. We saw renewable, non-polluting energy as an economic sector of growing importance that would bring prosperity to all parts and contribute to the global environment. It would be economic, social and environmental sustainability.

Nid wyf yn ymfoddhau o gwbl wrth gyflwyno'r gwelliannau hyn. Mae llwyddiant Amcan 1 mor bwysig fel y byddai'n well gennyf gymeradwyo'r ddogfen yn frwd, yn fy ffordd arferol. Fodd bynnag, wrth ddarllen y drafft hwn rhaid imi ddweud nad ein dogfen ni yw hon. Nid dyma'r ddogfen yr oeddem wedi gobeithio y byddai'n lasbrint ar gyfer adfywiad economaidd. Yr oedd arnom eisiau rhaglen â themâu clir ac ysbrydolgar ac yr oeddem yn meddwl ein bod wedi sicrhau cytundeb unfrydol ar themâu cyfle cyfartal, cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a datblygiad cynaliadwy—datblygiad a fyddai'n gynaliadwy yn economaidd, yn gymdeithasol ac yn amgylcheddol. Gwelsom ynni adnewyddadwy, dilygredd, fel sector economaidd o bwysigrwydd cynyddol a fyddai'n dod â ffyniant i bob rhan ac yn cyfrannu at yr amgylchedd byd-eang. Dyma fyddai cynaliadwyedd economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol.

We saw the combination of integrated public transport and a rapid expansion of information technology as a strategy that would remove the barriers of peripherality

Gwelem y cyfuniad o drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig a chynnydd cyflym mewn technoleg gwybodaeth fel strategaeth a fyddai'n dileu rhwystrau bod ar yr ymylon ac

and reduce our dependence on the car. Sustainable development was an integrating theme that also achieved the objectives of widespread growth in gross domestic product and long-term employment. In the rewrite of the document since October the theme that we endorsed with enthusiasm has been significantly marginalised. This is not a question of wording. In Welsh there is a saying, '*diwedd y gân yw'r geiniog*', which loosely translates as 'money talks'.

yn lleihau'n dibyniaeth ar y car. Yr oedd datblygu cynaliadwy yn thema integreiddiol a oedd hefyd yn cyflawni amcanion twf cyffredinol mewn cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth a chyflogaeth tymor hir. Wrth ailysgrifennu'r ddogfen ers mis Hydref mae'r thema a gymeradwywyd gennym mor frwd wedi'i gwthio i'r ymylon yn sylweddol. Nid cwestiwn o eiriad yw hwn. Mae gennym ddywediad yn y Gymraeg, 'diwedd y gân yw'r geiniog'.

At the end of the document are financial tables. I will show that the priorities there have changed. In October, financial tables that indicated the division of Objective 1 funds between different priorities and measures were tabled during an Economic Development Committee meeting. We were unhappy about endorsing financial allocations that came without justification or guidelines of principle and which we had had no time to study. However, we were told that it was essential to endorse those figures at that meeting or we would delay the start of the programme. We were also told that the figures were provisional and that they could be changed during the five months of negotiation with the Commission. We assumed that we would be involved in that.

Ar ddiwedd y ddogfen ceir tablau ariannol. Dangosaf fod y blaenoriaethau yn y fan honno wedi newid. Ym mis Hydref, cyflwynwyd tablau ariannol yn dangos rhaniad arian Amcan 1 rhwng gwahanol flaenoriaethau a mesurau yn ystod cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Yr oeddem yn anhapus ynghylch cymeradwyo dyraniadau ariannol a ddeuai heb gyfiawnhad na chanllawiau egwyddor ac nad oeddem wedi cael amser i'w hastudio. Fodd bynnag, dywedwyd wrthym ei bod yn hanfodol cymeradwyo'r ffigurau hynny yn y cyfarfod hwnnw neu y byddem yn oedi dechrau'r rhaglen. Dywedwyd wrthym hefyd fod y ffigurau'n rhai darpariaethol ac y gellid eu newid yn ystod y pum mis o negodi gyda'r Comisiwn. Tybiasom y byddai gennym lais yn hynny.

We had other reservations, which we expressed strongly. We recognised the importance of spatial targeting, with targets for the sub-regions of west Wales and the Valleys and we stressed the importance of separate policies for the rural areas and the former industrial areas. Another reservation was the absence of guidelines for the local implementation of the programme. We accepted the idea of strategic packages on the sole condition that they were complemented by local action plans based on geographic counties but not dominated by county councils. We were assured that implementation proposals would be ready by the end of 1999. Our final reservation was the absence of adequate funding.

Yr oedd gennym amheuon eraill, a fynegwyd yn groyw gennym. Cydnabuom bwysigrwydd targedu gofodol, gyda thargedau ar gyfer is-ranbarthau gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, a phwysleisiasom bwysigrwydd polisïau ar wahân ar gyfer yr ardaloedd gwledig a'r hen ardaloedd diwydiannol. Amheuaeth arall oedd absenoldeb canllawiau ar gyfer gweithredu'r rhaglen yn lleol. Derbyniasom y syniad o becynnau strategol ar yr amod yn unig y byddai cynlluniau gweithredu lleol yn cyd-fynd â hwy ar sail siroedd daearyddol ond heb fod yn ddibynnol ar gynghorau sir. Fe'n sicrhawyd y byddai cynigion gweithredu yn barod erbyn diwedd 1999. Ein hamheuaeth olaf oedd absenoldeb ariannu digonol.

Despite our reservations, in the spirit of inclusivity we gave our endorsement to the draft single programming document in October. We assumed that the Government shared our commitment to inclusivity and

Er gwaethaf ein hamheuon, yn ysbryd cynhwysiant fe roesom ein sêl bendith i'r ddogfen raglennu sengl ddrafft ym mis Hydref. Yr oeddem yn tybio bod y Llywodraeth yn rhannu'n hymrwymiad i

that we would have a role in the negotiations with the Commission. I think that we were innocent. You will all remember the concern that we felt when we were at first unable to get a copy of the Commission's formal response. That document was critical of the SPD and vindicated our reservations. The absence of spatial targeting, the need for separate rural and urban policies and the lack of a clear link between strategic packages and local implementation and, of course, the huge funding gap, were mentioned. One irony partly explains why we are now unwilling to endorse this programme. When we referred to the Commission's criticisms in February, we were told 'but you endorsed the programme'.

gynhwysiant ac y byddai gennym rôl yn y negodi gyda'r Comisiwn. Yr wyf yn meddwl mai diniwed oeddem. Fe gofia bawb ohonoch am y pryder a deimlasom pan oeddem yn methu cael copi ar y dechrau o ymateb ffurfiol y Comisiwn. Yr oedd y ddogfen honno'n feirniadol o'r ddogfen raglennu sengl ac yn cadarnhau'n hamheuon. Soniwyd am absenoldeb targedu gofodol, yr angen am bolisïau gwledig a threfol ar wahân a'r diffyg cysylltiad clir rhwng pecynnau strategol a gweithredu lleol ac, wrth gwrs, y bwlch ariannu enfawr. Mae un eironi'n esbonio'n rhannol pam yr ydym bellach yn anfodlon cymeradwyo'r rhaglen hon. Pan gyfeiriasom at feirniadaethau'r Comisiwn ym mis Chwefror, dywedwyd wrthym 'ond fe wnaethoch chi gymeradwyo'r rhaglen'.

After February, we still did not have access to the latest versions of the working document that were passing back and forth between here and Brussels. Neither were we told of important changes that were occurring to the SPD. You will therefore understand my disappointment when I saw the revised document two days before the Economic Development Committee meeting. I start by saying—

Ar ôl Chwefror, yr oeddem yn dal heb gael mynediad at fersiynau diweddaraf y ddogfen waith a oedd yn pasio'n ôl a blaen rhwng y fan yma a Brwsel. Ni ddywedwyd wrthym ychwaith am newidiadau pwysig a oedd yn digwydd i'r ddogfen raglennu sengl. Byddwch yn deall fy siom felly pan welais y ddogfen ddiwygiedig ddau ddiwrnod cyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Dechreuaf drwy ddweud—

Cynog Dafis: Fy siom fawr yn y ddogfen yw nad oes cyfeiriad o werth ynddi at un o brif broblemau rhanbarth Amcan 1 a'r prif ddangosydd o fethiant Cymru yn yr ugeinfed ganrif, sef allfudiad aruthrol o'r ardal o bobl ifanc sydd yn waedlif o adnoddau dynol. Edrychais drwy'r ddogfen a methais ddod o hyd i unrhyw gyfeiriad at hyn yn yr adrannau ar boblogaeth a chymdeithas, yr iaith Gymraeg, cyflogaeth a datblygiad adnoddau dynol neu yn y crynodeb o'r prif broblemau a'r tri phrif darged. Deuthum o hyd i un cyfeiriad byr ym mlaenoriaeth 4, datblygu pobl. Yr wyf wedi sôn am hyn bob tro yr wyf wedi siarad ar Amcan 1, ond nid oes cyfeiriad ato. A wnaiff Rhodri esbonio pam fod hyn wedi'i hepgor? A oes rhywbeth yn llechu y tu ôl i'r gwrthodiad hwnnw? A oes unrhyw obaith o gael cyfeiriad at y mater allweddol hwn yn y ddogfen derfynol?

Cynog Dafis: My greatest disappointment in the document is that there is hardly any mention in it of one of the major problems of the Objective 1 region and the major indicator of Wales's failure in the twentieth century, namely the massive out-migration from the area of young people that is a haemorrhage of human resources. I looked through the document and failed to find any reference to this in the sections on population and society, the Welsh language, employment and development of human resources or in the summary of the major problems and the three major targets. I found one brief reference in priority 4, developing people. I have mentioned this every time I have spoken on Objective 1, but there is no reference to it. Will Rhodri explain why this has been omitted? Is there any sinister aspect to that refusal? Is there any chance of having a reference to this key matter in the final document?

4:30 p.m.

Phil Williams: We need a full economic development strategy, which still has to be developed. However, we have to make the most of this opportunity in the time available.

Phil Williams: Mae arnom angen strategaeth datblygu economaidd lawn, sydd angen ei datblygu o hyd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfle hwn yn yr amser sydd ar gael.

The section on rural areas is, I think, far stronger. However, there are other changes. Once again, the substance is in the financial allocations. It is not easy to spot the changes.

Mae'r adran ar ardaloedd gwledig, yn fy marn i, yn llawer cryfach. Fodd bynnag, y mae newidiadau eraill. Unwaith eto, mae'r sylwedd yn y dyraniadau ariannol. Nid yw'n hawdd gweld y newidiadau.

The funding is divided between six main priorities. Once the document is accepted, the budget for each priority is fixed until the half term review in three years' time. However, there are several measures within each priority, and money can be transferred between the different measures. If you compare the document that we approved in October with the present document, most of the measures remain. However, sometimes they have a different name, sometimes they are within a different priority and sometimes they are combined with another measure or divided. That makes it complicated, but it is possible to map how the October allocations have been changed. Every measure that we regarded as central to the strategy has been cut and less important measures have increased.

Mae'r arian wedi'i rannu rhwng chwe phrif flaenoriaeth. Unwaith y derbynnir y ddogfen, bydd y gyllideb ar gyfer pob blaenoriaeth wedi'i gosod tan yr adolygiad hanner tymor ymhen tair blynedd. Fodd bynnag, mae sawl mesur o fewn pob blaenoriaeth, a gellir trosglwyddo arian rhwng y gwahanol fesurau. Os cymharwch y ddogfen a gymeradwywyd gennym ym mis Hydref â'r ddogfen bresennol, mae'r rhan fwyaf o fesurau'n aros. Fodd bynnag, weithiau mae ganddynt enw gwahanol, weithiau maent o fewn blaenoriaeth wahanol ac weithiau maent wedi'u cyfuno â mesur arall neu wedi'u rhannu. Mae hynny'n ei gwneud yn gymhleth, ond mae'n bosibl mapio'r modd y newidiwyd dyraniadau mis Hydref. Mae pob mesur yr oeddem ni'n ei weld yn ganolog i'r strategaeth wedi'i dorri ac mae mesurau llai pwysig wedi'u cynyddu.

We regard renewable energy as central to sustainable development. However, the total budget for energy, including renewable energy, which was small in the original document, has been cut by a third. We placed a high priority on integrated public transport and a rapid increase in information technology. The Assembly supported those proposals, yet in the revised budget they have been cut—accessibility by 15 per cent and information and communication technology infrastructure by two thirds. I will omit the other examples in the interests of time. However, if you look carefully, you will find that community development, which appears to be on level funding because an extra measure has been transferred to it from elsewhere, has also been cut.

I ni mae ynni adnewyddadwy yn ganolog i ddatblygiad cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, mae cyfanswm y gyllideb ar gyfer ynni, gan gynnwys ynni adnewyddadwy, a oedd yn fach yn y lle cyntaf, wedi'i dorri o draean. Rhoesom flaenoriaeth uchel i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig a chynnydd cyflym mewn technoleg gwybodaeth. Cefnogodd y Cynulliad y cynigion hynny, ond eto yn y gyllideb ddiwygiedig fe'u torrwyd—hygyrchedd o 15 y cant ac isadeiledd technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu o ddau draean. Ni soniaf am yr enghreifftiau eraill er mwyn arbed amser. Fodd bynnag, os craffwch yn ofalus, fe welwch fod datblygu cymunedol, sydd yn ymddangos fel pe bai ar yr un lefel o arian am fod mesur ychwanegol wedi'i drosglwyddo iddo, hefyd wedi'i gwtogi.

There are increases. We support the new measures to support the rural economy, and

Ceir cynnydd mewn ambell le. Cefnogwn y mesurau newydd i gefnogi'r economi wledig,

the increase in money for research and development. There have to be cuts, but why were they directed at renewable energy, ICT, accessibility and community regeneration? Rhodri's official answer was that the Commission is unhappy about funding infrastructure. Graham Meadows confirmed that when he attended the Economic Development Committee. However, he added that such projects could be supported if there was a case for them and if they would not proceed without assistance. I believe that the case could be made on those grounds for ICT. It can certainly be made for renewable energy and for improved public transport linking deprived communities with areas where employment is available.

a'r cynnydd yn yr arian ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu. Rhaid cael toriadau, ond pam y'u cyfeiriwyd at ynni adnewyddadwy, TGCh, hygyrchedd ac adfywiad cymunedol? Ateb swyddogol Rhodri oedd fod y Comisiwn yn anhapus ynghylch ariannu isadeiledd. Cadarnhaodd Graham Meadows hynny pan fynychodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Fodd bynnag, ychwanegodd y gellid cefnogi prosiectau o'r fath pe bai achos drostynt a phe na fyddent yn mynd yn eu blaen heb gymorth. Credaf y gellid gwneud yr achos ar y sail honno dros TGCh. Yn sicr gellir ei wneud dros ynni adnewyddadwy a thros well trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus i gysylltu cymunedau difreintiedig ag ardaloedd lle mae gwaith ar gael.

Was the case made strongly enough? The document does not help. For example, the measure for energy infrastructure combines grid connections for renewable projects, which the Commission may have viewed favourably, with the Transco gas main. The measure for accessibility combined integrated travel-to-work public transport, which could have been placed under community economic regeneration, with an enhancement in the core road network. We knew that the Commission would not approve that. However, there is no time for detail. The principle is that we had no say in determining the priorities and the allocation of money, or in the negotiations. If we had been involved and had lost our case, we would have known that our policies had been fairly considered. As it is, this document is the document of the Government and the partnership. It has many good points, but it has serious weaknesses. We cannot accept responsibility for the strengths or weaknesses.

A wnaethpwyd yr achos yn ddigon cryf? Nid yw'r ddogfen yn helpu. Er enghraifft, mae'r mesur ar gyfer isadeiledd ynni'n cyfuno cysylltiadau grid ar gyfer prosiectau adnewyddadwy, a allai fod wedi ennill cymeradwyaeth y Comisiwn, â phrif bibell nwy Transco. Yr oedd y mesur dros hygyrchedd yn cyfuno trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig ar gyfer teithio i'r gwaith, y gellid bod wedi ei osod dan adfywiad economaidd cymunedol, gyda gwella'r rhwydwaith ffyrdd craidd. Gwyddem na fyddai'r Comisiwn yn cymeradwyo hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid oes amser i fanylu. Yr egwyddor yw na chawsom unrhyw lais mewn penderfynu ar flaenoriaethau a dyraniad yr arian, nac yn y negodi. Pe baem wedi cael cyfrannu ac wedi colli'r achos, buasem yn gwybod fod ein polisïau wedi cael ystyriaeth deg. Fel y mae, dogfen y Llywodraeth a'r bartneriaeth yw'r ddogfen hon. Mae ganddi lawer o bwyntiau da, ond mae ganddi wendidau difrifol. Ni allwn dderbyn cyfrifoldeb am y cryfderau na'r gwendidau.

To conclude, I will refer to the amendments. Rhodri has accepted the first. Without adequate funding and effective implementation there is no guarantee. Replacing 'will' with 'should' reminds us that much work remains to be done. I have explained why we regard the document as essentially belonging to the Government and its chosen partnership. We note it and wish it well. We do not reject or deplore it. Therefore, we will abstain on Alun Cairns's

I gloi, cyfeiriaf at y gwelliannau. Mae Rhodri wedi derbyn y cyntaf. Heb arian digonol a gweithredu effeithiol nid oes gwarant. Mae rhoi 'dylai' yn lle 'bydd' yn ein hatgoffa bod llawer o waith eto i'w wneud. Yr wyf wedi egluro pam y teimlwn mai dogfen y Llywodraeth a'i phartneriaeth ddewisedig yw'r ddogfen yn ei hanfod i ni. Nodwn hi a dymunwn yn dda iddi. Nid ydym yn ei gwrthod nac yn gresynu ati. Felly byddwn yn ymatal ar welliant Alun Cairns. Fodd bynnag,

amendment. However, until we have been involved in finalising the proposal, we will not feel like a partner in the process. Therefore, without interfering in the normal approval process, we ask the Assembly to replace 'endorses' and 'adopts' with 'notes'. We welcome the recognition that a favourable outcome from the spending review is essential. The amendment, which has been accepted, stresses the three components of the problem, one of which is the overhang, which, perhaps, we have underestimated in the past. We insist that the best hope for a favourable outcome from Objective 1 lies in—

hyd nes y byddwn wedi cael rhan yn y gwaith o lunio'r cynnig terfynol, ni fyddwn yn teimlo fel partner yn y broses. Felly, heb ymyrryd â'r broses gymeradwyo arferol, gofynnwn i'r Cynulliad roi 'nodi' yn lle 'cymeradwyo' a 'mabwysiadu'. Croesawn y gydnabyddiaeth fod canlyniad ffafriol i'r adolygiad o wariant yn hanfodol. Mae'r gwelliant a dderbyniwyd yn pwysleisio tair cydran y broblem: un ohonynt yw'r gwariant a gariwyd drosodd yr ydym, efallai, wedi'i danbrisio yn y gorffennol. Mynnwn mai'r gobaith gorau am ganlyniad ffafriol i Amcan 1 yw—

Jane Davidson: Do you accept that, irrespective of whether you endorse it or note it, this document will go to the Commission? If so, do you not think that is important for the Assembly to endorse it? We have had many problems telling the people of Wales that opportunities are available under Objective 1. In the area in which I live, and which I represent, which has a Plaid Cymru-controlled council and a Labour Member, people are confused as to whether or not it presents opportunities. This is a one-off opportunity in terms of sending this document to Europe. It is important for the people of Wales that we endorse this document, submit it and then argue about the priorities under the different headings.

Jane Davidson: A ydych yn derbyn y bydd y ddogfen hon, ni waeth pa un ai ei chymeradwyo ynteu ei nodi a wnewch chi, yn mynd i'r Comisiwn? Os felly, onid ydych yn meddwl ei bod yn bwysig i'r Cynulliad ei chymeradwyo? Cawsom lawer o broblemau wrth geisio dweud wrth bobl Cymru fod cyfleoedd ar gael dan Amcan 1. Yn yr ardal lle'r wyf fi'n byw, ac yr wyf yn ei chynrychioli, sydd â chyngor dan reolaeth Plaid Cymru ac Aelod Llafur, nid yw pobl yn siŵr a ydyw'n cynnig cyfleoedd ai peidio. Cyfle unwaith-ac-am-byth yw hwn yn nhermau anfon y ddogfen hon i Ewrop. Mae'n bwysig i bobl Cymru ein bod yn cymeradwyo'r ddogfen hon, ei chyflwyno ac wedyn yn dadlau am y blaenoriaethau dan y gwahanol benawdau.

Phil Williams: I can wish it well and hope it succeeds, but I cannot endorse it because serious points have not yet been addressed. We read in the motion that there is still work to be done. I hope that, even at this stage, we can be involved and that our reservations will be addressed. We hope to play an active part in ensuring its success. I find it hard to believe that all the points that we have emphasised and stressed seem to have had no effect.

Phil Williams: Gallaf ddymuno'n dda iddi a gobeithio y llwydda, ond ni allaf ei chymeradwyo oherwydd mae pwyntiau difrifol yn dal heb eu hateb. Darllenwn yn y cynnig fod gwaith i'w wneud o hyd. Gobeithio, hyd yn oed mor ddiweddar â hyn, y gallwn gael llais ac yr atebir ein hamheuon. Gobeithiwn chwarae rhan weithredol i sicrhau ei llwyddiant. Yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd credu yr ymddengys fod yr holl bwyntiau a bwysleisiwyd gennym heb gael unrhyw effaith.

I would like to mention the implementation. We have a document—

Hoffwn sôn am y gweithredu. Mae gennym ddogfen—

The Presiding Officer: Could you please wind up? We have three other Members who wish to move amendments.

Y Llywydd: A allech chi ddirwyn i ben os gwelwch yn dda? Mae gennym dri Aelod arall sydd eisiau cyflwyno gwelliannau.

Phil Williams: The best hope is substantial local ownership. We will not be content or fully endorse this document until we know the full arrangements for implementation at local level, including access to independent finance and the ability to combine several regional packages. The aim of our amendment 7 is to ensure that we get a reliable statement on the exact timetable. We deplore the delay and false expectations. We want to know exactly when we can tell people the funding will start.

Phil Williams: Perchnogaeth leol sylweddol yw'r gobaith gorau. Ni fyddwn yn fodlon nac yn cymeradwyo'r ddogfen hon yn llawn hyd nes y gwyddom y trefniadau llawn ar gyfer gweithredu ar lefel leol, gan gynnwys mynediad at gyllid annibynnol a'r gallu i gyfuno sawl pecyn rhanbarthol. Nod ein gwelliant 7 yw sicrhau y cawn ddatganiad dibynadwy ar yr union amserlen. Gresynwn at yr oedi a'r disgwyliadau ffals. Mae arnom eisiau gwybod yn union pa bryd y gallwn ddweud wrth bobl y bydd yr arian yn dechrau.

Michael German: I propose amendment 4 in the names of Phil Williams, Alun Cairns and myself. Replace clause 4 with:

Michael German: Cynigiaf welliant 4 yn enwau Phil Williams, Alun Cairns a mi fy hun. Yn lle cymal 4 rhodder:

Requires the First Secretary to secure an outcome from the UK spending review which ensures the provision of necessary public expenditure survey cover and match funding over and above the Barnett block grant that will enable the Assembly to meet its commitments under the Objective 1 programme and the overhang of previous European structural programmes without detriment to its non-European budgetary provisions and calls for the principle of additionality to be demonstrated at a Welsh level;

Gofyn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd sicrhau y bydd arolwg gwariant y Deyrnas Unedig yn esgor ar ganlyniad sydd yn sicrhau y ceir arian yr arolwg gwariant cyhoeddus ac arian cyfatebol angenrheidiol sydd uwchlaw grant bloc Barnett a fydd yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i ysgwyddo'i ymrwymiadau o dan raglen Amcan 1 a'r hyn sydd yn weddill o'r rhaglenni strwythurol Ewropeaidd blaenorol heb amharu ar y darpariaethau cyllidol na ddônt o Ewrop ac yn galw bod yr egwyddor o ychwanegedd yn cael ei gweithredu ar lefel Gymreig;

I also propose amendment 8 in the names of Phil Williams, Alun Cairns and myself. Add at the end of the motion:

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 8 yn enwau Phil Williams, Alun Cairns a mi fy hun. Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

6. Requires the First Secretary to provide proactive support to those organisations that wish to draft, or are currently drafting action plans for the programme so that execution can begin immediately upon the European Commission's acceptance of the SPD.

6. Gofyn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd roi cefnogaeth broactif i'r cyrff hynny sydd am ddrafftio, neu sydd wrthi'n drafftio cynlluniau gweithredu ar gyfer y rhaglen er mwyn iddynt allu dechrau eu rhoi ar waith cyn gynted ag y bydd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn derbyn y ddogfen raglennu sengl.

The problem we face is managing a document of about 600 pages and trying to ensure that we agree with every word against the urgency of ensuring that the programme is implemented as rapidly as possible. The Members of the Assembly must grasp that cleft stick. We must look at this in terms of whether we want to achieve or whether we want to achieve for the people of Wales. It was spelt out to us by Graham Meadows in

Y broblem a wynebwn yw rheoli dogfen o ryw 600 o dudalennau a cheisio sicrhau ein bod yn cytuno â phob gair yn erbyn y brys i sicrhau y gweithredir y rhaglen cyn gyflymed ag y bo modd. Rhaid i Aelodau'r Cynulliad gydio yn y ffon ddwybig honno. Rhaid inni edrych ar hyn yn nhermau a ydym eisiau cyflawni ynteu a ydym eisiau cyflawni dros bobl Cymru. Fe'i tanlinellwyd inni gan Graham Meadows yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu

the Economic Development Committee on 29 March. The minutes record it. He said that it was important that we had an efficient start to the programme. If the programme does not get off to a good start and money is clawed back by the Commission in 2002, there is a danger that this will become an annual event. If a year's money could not be spent in three years then we would have great difficulty in spending a year's committed money in a year. We were worried about the concern that if this is not managed properly, we would be rushing to spend the money and experiencing difficulties because we had not started promptly.

Economaidd ar 29 Mawrth. Mae'r cofnodion yn dyst. Dywedodd ei bod yn bwysig inni gael cychwyn effeithlon i'r rhaglen. Os na chaiff y rhaglen gychwyn da a bod y Comisiwn yn adfachu arian yn 2002, mae perygl yr aiff hyn yn ddigwyddiad blynyddol. Os na ellid gwario arian blwyddyn mewn tair blynedd yna fe gaem anhawster mawr yn gwario arian rhwymedig blwyddyn mewn blwyddyn. Yr oeddem yn poeni am y pryder os na chaiff hyn ei reoli'n iawn, y byddem yn rhuthro i wario'r arian ac yn cael anawsterau am nad oeddem wedi dechrau'n brydlon.

I accept that this programme has suffered delays, that it should have happened earlier and that this document will never be to everyone's satisfaction. I am concerned about the delay and that is why I asked the officials for their view on this. They said that if this Assembly noted this document rather than welcoming and endorsing it, it would be taken by the Commission to mean that the Assembly failed to support the SPD and was not committing itself to its contents. Therefore, you could forget fast-tracking or an early start and the Commission would not begin to move on this until the document had received the Assembly's endorsement. We would be delaying it further for this year and for the whole of the six-year process and failing the people of Wales because we had missed the opportunity.

Derbyniaf fod y rhaglen hon wedi dioddef oedi, y dylai fod wedi digwydd ynghynt ac na fydd y ddogfen hon byth yn bodloni pawb. Yr wyf yn bryderus ynglŷn â'r oedi a dyna pam y gofynnais i'r swyddogion am eu barn hwy ar hyn. Dywedasant petai'r Cynulliad hwn yn nodi'r ddogfen hon yn hytrach na'i chroesawu a'i chymeradwyo, y byddai'r Comisiwn yn cymryd hynny fel arwydd fod y Cynulliad wedi methu cefnogi'r ddogfen raglennu sengl ac nad oedd yn ymrwymo i'w chynnwys. Felly, gallech anghofio am gymryd y lôn gyflym na dechrau'n gynnar ac ni fyddai'r Comisiwn yn dechrau symud ar hyn nes byddai'r ddogfen wedi cael cymeradwyaeth y Cynulliad. Byddem yn ei ohirio ymhellach am y flwyddyn hon ac am y cyfan o'r broses chwe blynedd ac yn gadael pobl Cymru i lawr am ein bod wedi colli'r cyfle.

The Liberal Democrats are prepared to endorse the programme. We have reservations, as always about match funding, PES cover and the implications of European spending on the Barnett block. Those issues are still before us. We are concerned about delays in agreeing the programme, in establishing a robust implementation strategy and support mechanisms for small business and the voluntary and private sector. These are addressed in turn by the cross-party amendments, which are before us today.

Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn barod i gymeradwyo'r rhaglen. Mae gennym amheuon, fel bob amser ynghylch arian cyfatebol, darpariaeth gwariant cyhoeddus a goblygiadau gwariant Ewropeaidd ar y bloc Barnett. Mae'r materion hynny'n dal i fod o'n blaen. Yr ydym yn bryderus ynglŷn ag oedi wrth gytuno ar y rhaglen, sefydlu strategaeth weithredu gref a mecanweithiau cefnogaeth i fusnesau bach a'r sector gwirfoddol a phreifat. Ymdrinnir â'r rhain yn eu tro gan y gwelliannau traws-bleidiol, sydd ger ein bron heddiw.

We will only agree to this document with these conditions. We are not prepared to take the easy option in this case or wash our hands by only noting the programme that aims to

Dim ond gyda'r amodau hyn y cytunwn â'r ddogfen hon. Nid ydym yn barod i gymryd y dewis hawdd yn yr achos hwn na golchi'n dwylo drwy ddim ond nodi'r rhaglen sydd yn

deliver a new economic start for Wales. We must either agree or disagree with it wholeheartedly. In this case, the momentum is such that we must agree with it. We cannot, Plaid Cymru, turn around and opt out. There is no scope for a re-draft. There is no other way forward but to agree it and move on. It is going back to making what we say in this place count. We cannot stall this programme. We must tell the Commission that we are not ambivalent about it, otherwise it will not be able to start.

anelu at gyflwyno cychwyn economaidd newydd i Gymru. Rhaid inni un ai gytuno neu anghytuno â hi â'n holl galon. Yn yr achos hwn, dywed y momentwm wrthym fod yn rhaid inni gytuno â hi. Ni allwn, Blaid Cymru, droi'n cefn ac optio allan. Nid oes lle i ailddrafftio. Nid oes unrhyw ffordd arall ymlaen ond cytuno â hi a symud ymlaen. Mater ydyw eto o wneud i'r hyn a ddywedwn yn y lle hwn gyfrif. Ni allwn ddal y rhaglen hon yn ôl. Rhaid inni ddweud wrth y Comisiwn nad ydym yn llugoer ynglŷn â hi, neu fel arall ni fydd yn gallu cychwyn.

4:40 p.m.

The debate has moved on from the issues of PES cover and additional funding. Rhodri knows full well that he is on test, that the Assembly has put him on test and is on record as doing so. There are other issues to which we wish to move on. On implementation, there is no doubt that there is consensus in Wales about the lack of knowledge. People will start this programme slowly unless information is distributed rapidly. I know of the reticence of officials who say that we do not have the certainty yet, therefore they will not tell people exactly where we are. That has resulted in hand-picked groups to run the early start programmes. We were told this morning that the groups working on the programmes were those who had read the documents or were self-selected by the documents. Perhaps I am old fashioned on this, but we need a process that is available, open and understandable to all. We have so far failed to provide the support that is necessary to ensure that that happens.

Mae'r ddadl wedi symud ymlaen o faterion darpariaeth gwariant cyhoeddus ac arian ychwanegol. Mae Rhodri'n gwybod yn iawn ei fod ar brawf, fod y Cynulliad wedi'i roi ar brawf a bod hynny ar gof a chadw. Mae materion eraill y dymunwn symud ymlaen atynt. Ar weithredu, nid oes amheuaeth fod consensws yng Nghymru ynghylch y diffyg gwybodaeth. Bydd pobl yn dechrau'r rhaglen hon yn araf oni ddosberthir gwybodaeth yn gyflym. Gwn am amharodrwydd swyddogion sydd yn dweud nad oes gennym y sicrwydd eto, ac felly na wnânt ddweud wrth bobl yn union ble'r ydym ni. Canlyniad hynny fu dethol grwpiau â llaw i redeg y rhaglenni cychwyn cynnar. Dywedwyd wrthym y bore yma mai'r grwpiau a oedd yn gweithio ar y rhaglenni oedd y rhai a oedd wedi darllen y dogfennau neu a hunan-ddewiswyd gan y dogfennau. Efallai fy mod yn hen-ffasiwn yn hyn o beth, ond mae angen proses sydd ar gael, yn agored ac yn ddealladwy i bawb. Hyd yma yr ydym wedi methu â darparu'r gefnogaeth sydd yn angenrheidiol i sicrhau y digwydd hynny.

The debate must also move on to the issue of state aids and operating aids. Those words may be strange to many people, but the economic miracle of Ireland was more to do with the state and operating aids than with European money. The gross domestic product, gross national product and employment growth in Ireland were more the result of operating aids than European Objective 1 money. There are two key issues at the heart of this; tax breaks and reductions in social security contributions. We must be prepared, with other Objective 1 regions in

Rhaid i'r ddadl symud ymlaen hefyd at fater cymhorthion y wladwriaeth a chymhorthion gweithredu. Efallai fod y geiriau hynny'n ddieithr i lawer o bobl, ond yr oedd a wnelo gwyrth economaidd Iwerddon fwy â'r wladwriaeth a chymhorthion gweithredu nag ag arian Ewropeaidd. Yr oedd y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth, y cynnyrch gwladol crynswth a thwf cyflogaeth yn Iwerddon o fwy o ganlyniad i gymhorthion gweithredu nag arian Amcan 1 Ewrop. Mae dau fater allweddol wrth galon hyn; gostyngiadau treth a lleihau cyfraniadau nawdd cymdeithasol.

the UK, to take on the Treasury on this matter because its approval is crucial. We can secure change with the European Commission, provided that we have the support of the Treasury. I welcome Rhodri's agreement this morning to invite officials from the Treasury to hold discussions with us. I am sure that we will be polite and put our points across rigorously. I warn all members of the Economic Development Committee to be prepared for that so that we can put our case to them properly. However, it remains that we must face that issue strongly if we are to reap the full benefit of the Objective 1 programme.

Rhaid inni fod yn barod, gyda rhanbarthau Amcan 1 eraill yn y DU, i herio'r Trysorlys ar y mater hwn gan fod ei gymeradwyaeth yn holl bwysig. Gallwn sicrhau newid gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd dim ond inni gael cefnogaeth y Trysorlys. Croesawaf gytundeb Rhodri y bore yma i wahodd swyddogion o'r Trysorlys i gynnal trafodaethau gyda ni. Yr wyf yn siwr y byddwn yn gwrtais ac y cyflwynwn ein pwyntiau yn gryf. Rhybuddiaf holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i fod yn barod ar gyfer hynny fel y gallwn gyflwyno'n hachos iddynt yn iawn. Fodd bynnag, erys fod yn rhaid inni wynebu'r mater hwnnw'n gadarn os am elwa'n llawn ar y rhaglen Amcan 1.

We are not prepared to stall the programme. We have reservations. We cannot expect the European Commission to back a programme that is not endorsed by a majority. We will not vote in support of Phil Williams's amendments 2 and 3. We are not in the business of tying our own hands or pricing ourselves out and risking what we already have. We have a single programming document before us that has been drafted by Committees that represent the views of a vast number of partnerships in Wales. The SPD has been amended, criticised, defended and undefended for many months. The views on it are so diverse that we could happily continue to tear it apart. The simple, political fact is that it is not perfect, and even Rhodri would not be so bold as to claim that it is. It is important that we have an SPD that is substantially better than the sketchy, flawed original drafts. What matters to us now is an early start so that we can spend the money this year and for the whole of the programme. I urge you not to support those two amendments, which would put the process in jeopardy.

Nid ydym yn barod i ddal y rhaglen yn ôl. Mae gennym amheuon. Ni allwn ddisgwyl i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd gefnogi rhaglen nad yw wedi'i chymeradwyo gan fwyafrif. Ni phleidleisiwn o blaid gwelliannau 2 a 3 Phil Williams. Nid ydym yn y busnes o glymu'n dwylo ein hunain na phrisio'n hunain allan a pheryglu'r hyn sydd gennym yn barod. Mae gennym ddogfen raglennu sengl o'n blaenau a ddrafftiwyd gan Bwyllgorau sydd yn cynrychioli barn nifer helaeth o bartneriaethau yng Nghymru. Cafodd y ddogfen raglennu sengl ei diwygio, ei beirniadu, ei hamddiffyn a'i gadael yn ddiamddiffyn am fisoedd lawer. Mae'r farn arni yn amrywio cymaint fel y gallem yn hawdd ddal i'w rhwygo'n ddarnau. Y ffaith syml, wleidyddol yw nad ydyw'n berffaith, ac ni fyddai hyd yn oed Rhodri'n ddigon hyf â honni ei bod. Mae'n bwysig inni gael dogfen raglennu sengl sydd yn sylweddol well na'r drafftiau gwreiddiol niwlog, gwallus. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig inni yn awr yw cychwyn cynnar fel y gallwn wario'r arian eleni ac ar gyfer y rhaglen gyfan. Anogaf chi i beidio â chefnogi'r ddau welliant hyn, a fyddai'n peryglu'r broses.

Alun Cairns: I propose amendment 5. In clause 5 replace '*invites*' with:

Alun Cairns: Cynigiaf welliant 5. Yng nghymal 5, rhodder yn lle '*gwahodd*':

Deplores the delay in establishing an implementing agency and expresses regret that the first year of the Objective 1 programme will not be exploited to the full for the benefit of west Wales and the Valleys due to a lack of support from the National Assembly for Wales Executive and a shortfall

Gresynu'r oedi wrth sefydlu asiantaeth weithredu ac yn mynegi gofid na ellir manteisio'n llawn ar flwyddyn gyntaf y rhaglen Amcan 1 er lles y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd oherwydd diffyg cefnogaeth Gweithrediaeth Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a'r diffyg arian cyfatebol, a geilw ar

in match funding and calls on

It seems that it has taken forever for this debate to arrive and I regret that it has been squeezed into such a short time. I hope that we can look to amend Standing Orders in the future to give due consideration in Plenary to documents such as this. This has been a long time coming but I hope that we are at the imminent acceptance of the single programming document. Since the establishment of the Assembly, my agenda, and I am sure the agenda of most Members, has been dominated in one way or another by Objective 1 structural funds. I reiterate some of the First Secretary's comments in recognising the efforts and work that has gone into this, but also underline comments by Mike German and Phil Williams on the lack of involvement of the other political parties in the process.

Ymddengys ei bod wedi cymryd oesoedd i'r ddadl hon gyrraedd a gresynaf iddi gael ei gwasgu i mewn i amser mor fyr. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ystyried diwygio'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn y dyfodol i roi ystyriaeth ddyledus mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn i ddogfennau fel hon. Bu'n rhaid aros yn hir am hon, ond gobeithiaf ein bod ar drothwy derbyn y ddogfen raglennu sengl. Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, arweiniwyd fy agenda i, ac agenda'r rhan fwyaf o Aelodau, yr wyf yn siwr, mewn un ffordd neu'i gilydd gan arian strwythurol Amcan 1. Ailadroddaf rai o sylwadau'r Prif Ysgrifennydd wrth gydnabod yr ymdrechion a'r gwaith a aeth i mewn i hyn, ond tanlinellaf hefyd sylwadau gan Mike German a Phil Williams am ddiffyg cyfranogiad y pleidiau gwleidyddol eraill yn y broses.

Opposition Members took this matter so seriously, and rightly so, that it resulted in a change of First Secretary. I hope that the strong action that this Chamber took a few months ago was not in vain. We all await the outcome of the comprehensive spending review with anticipation. I will not spend too much time on match funding as these arguments have been well aired within and outside this Chamber. During the recent budget announcement in the House of Commons, the Chancellor of the Exchequer was keen to announce much needed spending on health and education; why could he not make a similar announcement on match funding? They are at least equally important as the announcements on health and education, and I hope that they appreciate that. It appears that we are no further forward on the vital issue of match funding than we were with the former First Secretary. Only time will tell whether the severe action that was taken will be worth it for Wales.

Cymerodd Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau y mater hwn gymaint o ddifrif, a iawn hynny, nes inni gael newid Prif Ysgrifennydd. Gobeithiaf nad ofer fu'r weithred gref a gyflawnodd y Siambr hon ychydig fisoedd yn ôl. Yr ydym i gyd yn disgwyl canlyniad yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn awchus. Ni threuliaf ormod o amser ar arian cyfatebol gan fod y dadleuon hyn wedi cael eu gwyntyllu'n dda o fewn y Siambr hon ac oddi allan. Yn ystod cyhoeddiad diweddar y gyllideb yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, yr oedd Canghellor y Trysorlys yn eiddgar i gyhoeddi gwariant yr oedd mawr ei angen ar iechyd ac addysg; pam na allai wneud cyhoeddiad tebyg ar arian cyfatebol? Mae hyn o leiaf cyn bwysiced â'r cyhoeddiadau ar iechyd ac addysg, a gobeithiaf eu bod yn sylweddoli hynny. Mae'n ymddangos nad ydym gam ymhellach ymlaen ar fater allweddol arian cyfatebol nag yr oeddem gyda'r Prif Ysgrifennydd blaenorol. Dim ond amser a ddengys a fydd y modd difrifol y gweithredwyd yn dwyn ffrwyth i Gymru.

The document has developed considerably from its first draft. I regret how the European Commission's concerns were communicated in leaked documents and media reports. I am extremely critical of how we have arrived here, but I do not want to repeat those well rehearsed political debates. I want to highlight my concerns for the future, in the

Mae'r ddogfen wedi datblygu'n sylweddol ers ei drafft cyntaf. Gresynaf y modd y cyflëwyd pryderon y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd drwy ddogfennau ac adroddiadau yn y cyfryngau. Yr wyf yn eithriadol o feirniadol o'r modd y cyraeddasom y fan hon, ond nid oes arnaf eisiau ailadrodd yr hen ddadleuon gwleidyddol rheini. Mae arnaf eisiau amlygu

hope that our concerns will be heeded on this occasion. I hope that a full and constructive interaction will take place between the Executive and the other parties. Priority 6 in the single programming document, strategic infrastructure development, is one example. The First Secretary has already announced the differences of opinion between the Executive, supported by other parties in the Assembly, and the European Commission. We will support the First Secretary in his efforts. I hope that this example will be continued throughout the remaining negotiations.

fy mhryderon am y dyfodol, gan obeithio y clywir ein pryderon y tro hwn. Gobeithiaf y ceir rhyngweithio llawn ac adeiladol rhwng y Weithrediaeth a'r pleidiau eraill. Mae blaenoriaeth 6 yn y ddogfen raglennu sengl, datblygiad isadeiledd strategol, yn un enghraifft. Mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd eisoes wedi cyhoeddi'r gwahaniaethau barn rhwng y Weithrediaeth, gyda chefnogaeth pleidiau eraill yn y Cynulliad, a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Cefnogwn y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn ei ymdrechion. Gobeithio y parheir â'r esiampl hon drwy gydol y negodi sydd i ddod.

The Welsh Conservative Party has raised a number of questions over many months, expressing concern and calling for action on implementation. There must be straightforward information and advertising, or appropriate publicity, to encourage applications. We must involve small and medium-sized enterprises and operate an efficient hotline. At an early stage, we must establish a proactive implementing agency to harness the enthusiasm of all sectors of the Welsh economy. Finally, we must ensure ownership throughout the implementation programme, with the small and medium sized enterprise sector and the voluntary and public sectors accepting their responsibility to achieve the set targets.

Cododd y Blaid Geidwadol Gymreig nifer o gwestiynau dros sawl mis, gan fynegi pryder a galw am wneud rhywbeth ynghylch gweithredu. Rhaid wrth wybodaeth a hysbysebu diamwys, neu gyhoeddusrwydd priodol, i annog ceisiadau. Rhaid inni roi cyfle i fusnesau bach a chanolig a gweithredu llinell boeth effeithlon. Yn gynnar yn y broses, rhaid inni sefydlu asiantaeth weithredu ragweithiol i harneisio brwdfrydedd holl sectorau economi Cymru. Yn olaf, rhaid inni sicrhau perchnogaeth drwy gydol y rhaglen weithredu, gyda'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig a'r sectorau gwirfoddol a chyhoeddus yn derbyn eu cyfrifoldeb i gyflawni'r targedau a bennir.

Therefore, we were not surprised to hear similar concerns expressed by Ronald Hall, the Head of Cabinet at Commissioner Michel Barnier's office in the European Commission, during a visit to Brussels a few weeks ago. He repeated the concerns about the animation of the programme. He had concerns over Wales's ability to deliver the objectives of the single programming document. Match funding and public expenditure survey cover are critical but, unless we have an effective implementing agency canvassing business to bring forward applications, there will not be a need for match funding as we cannot draw down European funds.

Felly, ni chawsom ein synnu o glywed Ronald Hall, Pennaeth y Cabinet, yn mynegi pryderon tebyg yn swyddfa'r Comisiynydd Michel Barnier yn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, yn ystod ymweliad â Brwsel ychydig wythnosau yn ôl. Ailadroddodd y pryderon ynghylch symudiad y rhaglen. Yr oedd ganddo bryderon ynghylch gallu Cymru i gyflawni amcanion y ddogfen raglennu sengl. Mae arian cyfatebol a darpariaeth arolwg gwariant cyhoeddus yn allweddol ond, oni cheir asiantaeth weithredu effeithiol yn canfasio busnesau i gyflwyno ceisiadau, ni fydd angen arian cyfatebol gan na fyddwn yn gallu tynnu arian Ewropeaidd i lawr.

I was alarmed to hear Ronald Hall say that, of all the European Objective 1 regions, he was only extremely concerned about the implementation in Wales and our ability to fulfil the objectives. I am extremely

Dychrynais o glywed Ronald Hall yn dweud, o holl ranbarthau Amcan 1 Ewrop, mai dim ond yng Nghymru yr oedd yn bryderus eithriadol am y gweithredu a'n gallu i gyflawni'r amcanion. Yr wyf yn hynod o

concerned about that and I hope that the First Secretary will note my comments and those of other Members and move forward proactively and constructively. Ronald Hall's concerns were the same as those that the Welsh Conservative Party has been highlighting for some time. We were informed that applications for grants could have been received based on previous submissions of the Objective 1 plan. We do not have to wait for the single programming document to be finally agreed. Applications could have been received on the basis of the first plan, submitted in November, subject to amendments to the priorities and the measures in the final agreed document. We could be much further down the road than we are now. I greatly regret that, hence the purpose of my amendment 5. However, it was only on 23 March that the chief executive of the Welsh European Funding Office was appointed and that was only on a part-time basis due to his commitments to work on the economic development bank.

bryderus ynghylch hynny a gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd nodi fy sylwadau a sylwadau Aelodau eraill a symud ymlaen yn rhagweithiol ac yn adeiladol. Yr un oedd pryderon Ronald Hall â'r rhai a amlygwyd gan y Blaid Geidwadol Gymreig ers cryn amser. Hysbyswyd ni y gallesid bod wedi derbyn ceisiadau am grantiau ar sail cyflwyniadau'r cynllun Amcan 1 yn y gorffennol. Nid oes rhaid inni aros i'r ddogfen raglennu sengl gael ei chytuno'n derfynol. Gallesid bod wedi derbyn ceisiadau ar sail y cynllun cyntaf, a gyflwynwyd ym mis Tachwedd, yn amodol ar addasiadau i'r blaenoriaethau a'r mesurau yn y ddogfen derfynol y cytunid arni. Gallem fod yn llawer pellach i lawr y ffordd nag yr ydym yn awr. Mae hynny'n destun gofid mawr imi, a dyna bwrpas fy ngwelliant 5. Fodd bynnag, dim ond ar 23 Mawrth y penodwyd prif weithredwr Swyddfa Ariannu Ewropeaidd Cymru, a dim ond ar sail ran-amser yr oedd hynny oherwydd ei ymrwymiadau i waith ar y banc datblygu economaidd.

4:50 p.m.

The only purpose of repeating this argument is that we must act immediately to facilitate and support proactive applicants. I want to see an efficient, well-publicised hotline and examples of successful applications from other structural programmes that would meet the criteria of the proposed single programming document, both from within the United Kingdom and outside. I want to see examples of projects, from those who received grants of £500 or £1,000 up to multi million pound schemes. I also want to see application forms that fit on one or two sides of an A4 sheet, rather than the reams of documents that we are used to receiving from the benefits agency to make a simple, straightforward application on behalf of our constituents.

Unig bwrpas ailadrodd y ddadl hon yw fod yn rhaid inni weithredu ar fyrder i hwyluso a chefnogi ymgeiswyr rhagweithiol. Hoffwn weld llinell boeth effeithlon, gyda chyhoeddusrwydd da, ac enghreifftiau o geisiadau llwyddiannus o raglenni strwythurol eraill a fyddai'n cwrdd â meini prawf y ddogfen raglennu sengl arfaethedig, o ranbarthau yn y Deyrnas Unedig ac o'r tu allan. Hoffwn weld enghreifftiau o brosiectau, o'r rhai a dderbyniodd grantiau o £500 neu £1,000 hyd at gynlluniau a gostiodd filiynau o bunnoedd. Hoffwn weld ffurflenni cais hefyd sydd yn ffitio ar un neu ddwy ochr i ddalen A4, yn hytrach na'r myrdd o bapurach yr ydym wedi arfer eu derbyn oddi wrth yr asiantaeth fudd-daliadau i wneud cais syml ar ran ein hetholwyr.

This morning, the Economic Development Committee briefly considered operating aids or state aids. These provide the potential to re-enthuse the SME sector, which has been waning because of the delays that I have already mentioned. Several schemes in that document were commendable, but without doubt, the ones that could have had the greatest impact on redeveloping our economy

Y bore yma, ystyriodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn fyr gymhorthion gweithredu neu gymhorthion y wladwriaeth. Mae'r rhain yn cynnig y potensial i ail-ysgogi'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig, a fu ar drai oherwydd yr oedi a grybwyllais eisoes. Yr oedd sawl cynllun yn y ddogfen honno yn gymeradwy, ond heb os, yr oedd yn ymddangos fod y rhai a allasai gael yr effaith

seemed to have been ruled out by the Treasury.

fwyaf ar ailddatblygu'n heconomi wedi'u gwrthod gan y Trysorlys.

In his briefing to the Economic Development Committee this morning, the First Secretary reported on Aeroquip, which has moved its operation to Kent, because its research and development operation is based in that part of the country. This has resulted in job losses for Wales.

Wrth annerch y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd y bore yma, soniodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd am Aeroquip, sydd wedi symud ei waith i Gaint, am fod ei waith ymchwil a datblygu wedi'i leoli yn y rhan honno o'r wlad. Arweiniodd hyn at golli swyddi yng Nghymru.

We all agree on the need to foster and develop added value knowledge-based industries and this would seem like an ideal practical method of realising our objectives and building on our existing base, if the Treasury allows us.

Mae pawb ohonom yn cytuno ar yr angen i feithrin a datblygu diwydiannau yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth sydd yn rhoi gwerth ychwanegol, ac mae'n debyg y byddai hyn yn ddull ymarferol delfrydol i wireddu'n hamcanion ac adeiladu ar ein sylfaen bresennol, os caniatâ'r Trysorlys inni wneud hynny.

It seems that the Treasury presents every hurdle. I hope that we will have an open and frank discussion when representatives from the Treasury attend the Economic Development Committee on the First Secretary's proposal.

Mae'n ymddangos fod y Trysorlys yn codi pob rhwystr. Gobeithiaf y cawn drafodaeth agored a di-flewyn-ar-dafod pan ddaw cynrychiolwyr o'r Trysorlys i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar gais y Prif Ysgrifennydd.

In the Committee meeting this morning, Ron Davies and Phil Williams spoke of developing connectivity. Ron Davies then suggested supplying a computer to every SME in west Wales and the Valleys that does not own one, but could make use of one. These are further simple, practical, straightforward measures that could enthuse the SME sector and make a difference in Wales, ensuring that Objective 1 is a success.

Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor y bore yma, siaradodd Ron Davies a Phil Williams am ddatblygu cysylltedd. Wedyn awgrymodd Ron Davies ddarparu cyfrifiadur i bob menter fach a chanolig yn y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd sydd heb un, ond a allai ddefnyddio un. Dyma fesurau syml, ymarferol, diffwdan a allai danio'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig a gwneud gwahaniaeth yng Nghymru, gan sicrhau fod Amcan 1 yn llwyddiant.

Clearly, much political capital could be made out of the issues that I have highlighted, but I have sought to be practical and positive in the way that we expect the First Secretary to be in moving forward with the implementing agency.

Yn amlwg, gellid bod wedi gwneud llawer o gyfalaf gwleidyddol o'r materion a amlygais, ond yr wyf wedi ceisio bod yn ymarferol ac yn gadarnhaol yn y ffordd y disgwyliwn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd symud ymlaen gyda'r asiantaeth weithredu.

It is, however, important to express our regret at how we arrived at this point. That is much of the purpose of amendment 5 that I have highlighted. We will be happy to support amendments 1 and 2, because of the reasons underlined by Phil Williams. We want to note this document rather than endorse it, because of the accusations that were previously thrown back at us.

Y mae, fodd bynnag, yn bwysig mynegi'n gofid ynghylch y modd y daethom at y pwynt hwn. Dyna lawer o bwrpas gwelliant 5 a danlinellais. Byddwn yn hapus i gefnogi gwelliannau 1 a 2, oherwydd y rhesymau a danlinellwyd gan Phil Williams. Yr ydym eisiau nodi'r ddogfen hon yn hytrach na'i chymeradwyo, oherwydd y cyhuddiadau a daflwyd yn ôl atom o'r blaen.

We will obviously support amendments 4 and 8, which I jointly proposed with Phil Williams and Mike German, and the other amendments in the name of Plaid Cymru.

Yn amlwg, cefnogwn welliannau 4 ac 8, a gynigiais ar y cyd gyda Phil Williams a Mike German, a'r gwelliannau eraill yn enw Plaid Cymru.

The First Secretary: As I am speaking twice in this debate, I must express my sympathy for those who wanted to speak at least once. Unfortunately, time pressure has allowed only an hour and five minutes for this debate. I am sorry about that. I will respond to the points made by opposition front bench spokespeople on behalf of their parties.

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Gan fy mod yn siarad ddwywaith yn y ddadl hon, rhaid imi fynegi fy nghydymdeimlad â'r rheini a oedd eisiau siarad o leiaf unwaith. Yn anffodus, dim ond awr a phum munud a ganiatawyd ar gyfer y ddadl hon oherwydd pwysau amser. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf am hynny. Ymatebaf i'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan lefarwyr meinciau blaen y gwrthbleidiau ar ran eu pleidiau.

I fundamentally disagree with Phil Williams's amendments 2 and 3 about merely noting the single programming document, because he feels that neither his party nor, perhaps, other parties were sufficiently involved in the process. He says that renewable energy, information and communications technology and accessibility were cut too much. Cynog said in an intervention that there had not been sufficient mention of human development capital. He referred to the particular problem in the Cardigan Bay area, namely that highly qualified people have left over the past few decades, a trend that needs to be reversed. Education per se cannot be funded by—

Yr wyf yn anghytuno'n sylfaenol â gwelliannau 2 a 3 Phil Williams parthed dim ond nodi'r ddogfen raglennu sengl, am ei fod yn teimlo na chafodd ei blaid ef, nac, efallai, bleidiau eraill ran ddigonol yn y broses. Dywed y cwtogwyd gormod ar ynni adnewyddadwy, technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu a hygyrchedd. Dywedodd Cynog mewn ymyriad na soniwyd ddigon am gyfalaf datblygu dynol. Cyfeiriodd at y broblem arbennig yn ardal Bae Ceredigion, sef fod pobl â chymwysterau uchel iawn wedi gadael dros y degawdau diwethaf, tuedd y mae angen ei gwrthdroi. Ni all addysg per se gael ei hariannu drwy—

Helen Mary Jones: We want to clarify our position on this. It is not that we were not consulted. We were consulted and then ignored and the consultation stopped. That is the difference between noting—which is not to say that we do not want the programme to proceed—and endorsing the document, which is to give it our blessing and agreement. We feel that we cannot do that.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae arnom eisiau egluro'n sefyllfa ar hyn. Nid nad ymgynghorwyd â ni yw'r broblem. Fe ymgynghorwyd â ni ac wedyn fe'n hanwybyddwyd a daeth yr ymgynghori i ben. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth rhwng nodi—nad yw'n golygu nad oes arnom eisiau i'r rhaglen fynd yn ei blaen—a chymeradwyo'r ddogfen, sef rhoi sêl ein bendith arni a'n cytundeb. Teimlwn na allwn wneud hynny.

The First Secretary: I am not saying that Plaid Cymru is not entitled to its opinion but Phil, Cynog and perhaps Helen Mary know in their hearts that this is the only show in town. This is the only document that we have. It is always possible to chip away at one programme and to spend less in one sector and more in another about which we have a bee in our bonnets. Phil feels strongly about renewable energy and information and communications technology. The problem is

Y Prif Ysgrifennydd: Nid wyf yn dweud nad oes gan Blaid Cymru hawl i'w barn ond mae Phil, Cynog ac efallai Helen Mary'n gwybod yn eu calonnau mai dyma'r unig sioe yn y dref. Dyma'r unig ddogfen sydd gennym. Mae bob amser yn bosibl tynnu tameidiau oddi ar un rhaglen a gwario llai mewn un sector a mwy mewn sector arall sydd o ddiddordeb arbennig i ni. Mae Phil yn teimlo'n gryf ynglŷn ag ynni adnewyddadwy a thechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Y

getting somebody else to accept that the sector in which they are interested must take a cut in order to allow a funding increase in the area that another person represents or the sector about which he or she has a bee in his or her bonnet. We could have an unseemly tug of war that destroys the essential unity that was created by making west Wales and the Valleys an Objective 1 area.

broblem yw cael rhywun arall i dderbyn fod yn rhaid i'r sector sydd o ddiddordeb iddynt gymryd toriad er mwyn caniatáu cynyddu cyllid yn y maes y mae rhywun arall yn ei gynrychioli neu'r sector sydd o ddiddordeb arbennig iddo ef neu hi. Gallem gael ymrafael diurddas a fyddai'n dinistrio'r undod hanfodol a grëwyd drwy wneud y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd yn ardal Amcan 1.

It is not a homogeneous area. We accept that it is less homogeneous than the English Objective 1 areas of Cornwall, Merseyside and south Yorkshire. Ron Davies, as Secretary of State for Wales, made west Wales and the Valleys an Objective 1 area. It is an unusual area but it is important that we support it. It may not be homogeneous but if we can support it, the whole deprived area can catch up with the rest of Wales, Britain and Europe in its economic growth.

Nid ardal unffurf mohoni. Derbyniwn ei bod yn llai unffurf nag ardaloedd Amcan 1 yn Lloegr, sef Cernyw, Glannau Mersi a de Swydd Efrog. Ron Davies, fel Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, a wnaeth y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd yn ardal Amcan 1. Mae'n ardal anarferol ond mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ei chefnogi. Efallai nad yw'n unffurf ond os gallwn ei chefnogi, gall y cyfan o'r ardal ddifreintiedig hon ddal i fyny â gweddill Cymru, Prydain ac Ewrop yn ei thwf economaidd.

I am grateful for Mike German's comments about voting with us against Phil's amendments. He will vote in favour of endorsement rather than merely noting. That is how we will develop the momentum that is essential to the full exploitation of the Objective 1 single programming document. This is a once in a generation opportunity to proceed with this catch-up and begin a fast-track programme this July, which we will implement between now and then, if all goes well and we can sort out the infrastructure programme and get the right result—as we are confident that we will—in the comprehensive spending review.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am sylwadau Mike German ynghylch pleidleisio gyda ni yn erbyn gwelliannau Phil. Bydd yn pleidleisio o blaid cymeradwyo yn hytrach na nodi yn unig. Dyna sut y datblygwn y momentwm sydd yn hanfodol i ymelwa'n llawn ar ddogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 1. Cyfle a geir unwaith mewn cenhedlaeth yw hwn i fynd ymlaen â'r dal i fyny hwn a dechrau rhaglen lôn gyflym y Gorffennaf hwn, a weithredwn o hyn tan hynny, os aiff popeth yn iawn a gallwn gael trefn ar y rhaglen isadeiledd a chael y canlyniad iawn—fel yr ydym yn hyderus y gallwn—yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant.

Alun Cairns asked why the comprehensive spending review could not make an exception for this as it did on health. He is wrong about education. The expenditure for education that Gordon Brown announced was for one year only, which is not covered by the new comprehensive spending review. Education is in the same boat as us. An exception has been made for health only.

Gofynnodd Alun Cairns pam na allai'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant wneud eithriad ar gyfer hyn fel y gwnaeth ar iechyd. Mae'n anghywir ynglŷn ag addysg. Dim ond am flwyddyn yr oedd y gwariant ar addysg a gyhoeddodd Gordon Brown, nad yw'n dod o dan yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant newydd. Mae addysg yn yr un cwch â ni. Mae eithriad wedi'i wneud ar gyfer iechyd yn unig.

We have not heard Ronald Hall's comments to the effect that he was less confident about implementation in Wales. If there are particular points, officials will check them. I agree with him that, in the end, it is about

Nid ydym wedi clywed sylwadau Ronald Hall i'r perwyl ei fod yn llai hyderus ynglŷn â gweithredu yng Nghymru. Os oes pwyntiau penodol, bydd y swyddogion yn edrych arnynt. Cytunaf ag ef mai cwestiwn o

implementation and communication, because these people live in deprived communities and do not necessarily have lawyers, accountants and consultants at their behest. It is about keeping the application forms simple for small and medium-sized enterprises or voluntary organisations that do not perhaps have the professional support that is available to people in Cardiff or London. I share those views. I also agree about the importance of research and development and the technological enrichment of the Welsh economy. That has been a huge problem for us. We have been technologically top-sliced for all sorts of reasons over the past 50 years, and we have never given this issue sufficient attention in our regional development proposals. This is our opportunity to put that right.

The opportunity to endorse and support this plan this afternoon is an opportunity to get the show on the road as early as July, if all goes well. I have not been persuaded by any of the points made, and I repeat my recommendations on voting with respect to the Labour Members present and, hopefully, other Members also. I am grateful for the support of the Liberal Democrats, Mike German.

weithredu a chyfathrebu ydyw yn y pen draw, oherwydd mae'r bobl hyn yn byw mewn cymunedau difreintiedig ac nid oes ganddynt gyfreithwyr, cyfrifwyr ac ymgynghorwyr wrth eu gwasanaeth o reidrwydd. Cwestiwn ydyw o gadw'r ffurflenni cais yn syml ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig neu sefydliadau gwirfoddol sydd efallai heb y gefnogaeth broffesiynol sydd ar gael i bobl yng Nghaerdydd neu Lundain. Rhannaf rai o'r safbwyntiau hynny. Cytunaf hefyd ynghylch pwysigrwydd ymchwil a datblygu, a chyfoethogi technegol economi Cymru. Bu hynny'n broblem enfawr inni. Cawsom ein brig-dorri yn dechnolegol am bob math o resymau dros yr 50 mlynedd diwethaf, ac nid ydym erioed wedi rhoi sylw digonol i'r mater hwn yn ein cynigion datblygu rhanbarthol. Dyma'n cyfle i gywiro hynny.

Mae'r cyfle i gymeradwyo a chefnogi'r cynllun hwn y prynhawn yma yn gyfle i roi'r sioe ar y ffordd cyn gynted â mis Gorffennaf, os aiff popeth yn dda. Ni'm perswadiwyd gan unrhyw un o'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd, ac ailddatganaf fy argymhellion ar bleidleisio gyda pharch i'r Aelodau Llafur sydd yn bresennol a, gobeithio, Aelodau eraill hefyd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gefnogaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, Mike German.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.
Amendment 1: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 1.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick

Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Amendment adopted.

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 2: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 31.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Amendment rejected. *Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

5:00 p.m.

Gwelliant 3: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 3: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 31.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Amendment rejected. *Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

Gwelliant 4: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 4: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew

Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Amendment adopted. *Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

Gwelliant 5: O blaid 14, Ymatal 15, Yn erbyn 25.
Amendment 5: For 14, Abstain 15, Against 25.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
German, Michael
Graham, William
Humphreys, Christine
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison

Rogers, Peter
Williams, Kirsty

Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Amendment rejected. *Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

Gwelliant 6: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 6: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian

Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Amendment adopted. *Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

Gwelliant 7: O blaid 23, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 25.
Amendment 7: For 23, Abstain 6, Against 25.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
German, Michael
Humphreys, Christine
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Amendment rejected. *Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

Gwelliant 8: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.
Amendment 8: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 1.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Davies, Ron

Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Amendment adopted.

Amended motion:

that the Assembly

1. Welcomes the important contribution that the Objective 1 programme should make to the economic, social and environmental regeneration of west Wales and the Valleys;

2. Endorses the Welsh European Partnership's proposals for the strategy, priorities and indicative measures for Objective 1 contained in the draft single programming document laid in the Table Office on 5 April 2000;

3. Adopts the draft single programming document and requests the First Secretary, consulting as necessary with other political parties, to finalise the text in discussion with the European Commission and ensure a favourable Commission decision as soon as possible;

4. Requires the First Secretary to secure an outcome from the UK spending review which ensures the provision of necessary public expenditure survey cover and match funding over and above the Barnett block grant that will enable the Assembly to meet its commitments under the Objective 1 programme and the overhang of previous European structural programmes without detriment to its non-European budgetary provisions and calls for the principle of additionality to be demonstrated at a Welsh level;

5. Invites the First Secretary to agree the necessary arrangements with the partnership, including full arrangements for implementation at local level, so that launch of the Objective 1 programme can take place before the end of July 2000;

6. Requires the First Secretary to provide proactive support to those organisations who wish to draft, or are currently drafting action plans for the programme so that execution can begin immediately upon the European

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

fod y Cynulliad yn

1. Croesawu'r cyfraniad pwysig y dylai'r rhaglen Amcan 1 ei wneud i adfywiad economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd;

2. Cymeradwyo cynigion Partneriaeth Cymru ac Ewrop ar gyfer y strategaeth, y blaenoriaethau a'r mesurau dangosol ar gyfer Amcan 1 a geir yn y ddogfen raglennu sengl ddrafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Ebrill 2000;

3. Mabwysiadu'r ddogfen raglennu sengl ddrafft a gofyn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd, gan ymgynghori â phleidiau gwleidyddol eraill yn ôl y gofyn, derfynoli'r testun ar y cyd â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a sicrhau penderfyniad ffafriol o du'r Comisiwn cyn gynted â phosibl;

4. Gofyn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd sicrhau y bydd arolwg gwariant y Deyrnas Unedig yn esgor ar ganlyniad sydd yn sicrhau y ceir arian yr arolwg gwariant cyhoeddus ac arian cyfatebol angenrheidiol sydd uwchlaw'r grant bloc Barnett a fydd yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i ysgwyddo'I ymrwymiadau o dan raglen Amcan 1 a'r hyn sydd yn weddill o'r rhaglenni strwythurol Ewropeaidd blaenorol heb amharu ar y darpariaethau cyllidol na ddônt o Ewrop ac yn galw am i'r egwyddor o ychwanegedd gael ei gweithredu ar lefel Gymreig;

5. Gwahodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd i gytuno ar y trefniadau angenrheidiol gyda'r bartneriaeth, gan gynnwys trefniadau llawn ar gyfer eu rhoi ar waith yn lleol, er mwyn i raglen Amcan 1 allu cael ei lansio cyn diwedd Gorffennaf 2000;

6. Gofyn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd roi cefnogaeth broactif i'r cyrff hynny sydd am ddrafftio, neu sydd wrthi'n drafftio cynlluniau gweithredu ar gyfer y rhaglen er mwyn iddynt allu dechrau eu rhoi ar waith cyn gynted ag y

Commission's acceptance of the SPD.	*bydd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn derbyn y ddogfen raglennu sengl.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 32, Ymatal 22, Yn erbyn 0.
Amended motion: For 32, Abstain 22, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Humphreys, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Michael, Alun
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr aelodau canlynol:
The following members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Amended motion adopted.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.

Dadl Fer
Short Debate

Swyddogaeth Marchnadoedd Ffermwyr mewn Cymunedau Ffyniannus
The Role of Farmers' Markets in Thriving Communities

Glyn Davies: If it were not for the matter of precedent I would have withdrawn the short debate that I am proposing, in order to allow more time for the debate on Objective 1.

Although I am now a full-time politician, committed to doing my best to make a success of the Assembly, I have retained my interest in farming, even though it is limited to weekends and recesses. When I was lucky enough to be drawn out of the hat to propose today's short debate, I decided to speak about an issue that related to what I still think of as my industry. It is an industry that has been and will always be a fundamental part of my life. I also wanted to choose a subject that exemplified the way in which the farming community is taking positive action to improve its lot.

During the 12 months since the Assembly was established, we have discussed and returned on many occasions to issues relating to agriculture, and rightly so, because the industry is facing a serious financial crisis. However, I think—and perhaps there are those who would criticise me for saying so—that it has been frustrating that many of our discussions about agriculture have revolved around the degree of public support that should be given to the industry.

I wanted to select an issue that was not about financial help from the public purse but about farmers rolling up their sleeves to help themselves. A short debate about the role and value of farmers' markets seemed to fit the bill. It is also appropriate that, as the last item of business before the recess, we should discuss an issue on which we as Assembly Members from different parties with different perspectives are likely to agree and where there is optimism in the industry that

Glyn Davies: Oni bai am fater cynsail buaswn wedi tynnu'n ôl y ddadl fer a gynigiaf yn awr, er mwyn caniatáu mwy o amser i drafod Amcan 1.

Er fy mod bellach yn wleidydd amser llawn, wedi ymrwymo i wneud fy ngorau i sicrhau llwyddiant y Cynulliad, yr wyf wedi cadw fy niddordeb mewn ffermio, er ei fod yn gyfyngedig i'r penwythnosau a'r gwyliau. Pan oeddwn yn ddigon ffodus i gael fy nhynnu allan o'r het i gynnig dadl fer heddiw, penderfynais siarad am fater perthnasol i'r hyn yr wyf yn dal i'w ystyried fel fy niwydiant i. Mae'n ddiwydiant a fu ac a fydd byth yn rhan sylfaenol o'm bywyd. Yr oedd arnaf eisiau dewis pwnc hefyd a ddarluniai'r ffordd y mae'r gymuned ffermio'n gweithredu'n bositif i wella'i stad.

Yn ystod y 12 mis ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi trafod ac wedi dychwelyd sawl gwaith at faterion yn ymwneud ag amaethyddiaeth, a digon teg hynny, gan fod y diwydiant yn wynebu argyfwng ariannol difrifol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn meddwl—ac efallai fod rhai a'm beirniadai am ddweud hyn—ei bod wedi bod yn rhwystredig fod llawer o'n trafodaethau ynghylch amaethyddiaeth wedi troi o amgylch faint o gefnogaeth gyhoeddus y dylid ei rhoi i'r diwydiant.

Yr oeddwn am ddewis mater nad oedd a wnelo â chymorth ariannol o'r pwrs cyhoeddus ond â ffermwyr yn torchi'u llewys i helpu'u hunain. Roedd dadl fer am rôl a gwerth marchnadoedd ffermwyr i'w gweld yn bwnc addas. Mae'n briodol hefyd, yn yr eitem olaf cyn y gwyliau, ein bod yn trafod mater yr ydym ni fel Aelodau Cynulliad o wahanol bleidiau gyda gwahanol safbwyntiau yn debygol o gytuno arno, a lle ceir gobaith yn y diwydiant a roddodd fywyd

has given me and my family a good life.

da i mi a'm teulu.

Farmers' markets are not a new phenomenon. In some parts of the world, particularly in the United States, they are hugely successful. I am told that a large farmers' market is held regularly in New York. In addition, there is a long-standing tradition of farmers' markets in France and several other countries. The farmers' market movement is still relatively new in Britain. However, it has grown rapidly in England and Wales and is beginning to expand in Scotland where the Conservative Party has a particular interest, in that John Scott, our successful candidate in the recent by-election in Ayr, set up and runs the farmers' market in the town.

Nid ffenomen newydd yw marchnadoedd ffermwyr. Mewn rhai rhannau o'r byd, yn enwedig yn yr Unol Daleithiau, maent yn llwyddiannus tu hwnt. Dywedir wrthyf y cynhelir marchnad ffermwyr fawr yn rheolaidd yn Efrog Newydd. Ar ben hynny, ceir traddodiad hir o farchnadoedd ffermwyr yn Ffrainc a sawl gwlad arall. Mae mudiad y marchnadoedd ffermwyr yn dal yn gymharol newydd ym Mhrydain. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi tyfu'n gyflym yn Lloegr a Chymru ac mae'n dechrau ehangu yn yr Alban lle mae gan y Blaid Geidwadol ddiddordeb arbennig, gan i John Scott, ein hymgeisydd llwyddiannus yn yr is-etholiad diweddar yn Ayr, sefydlu a rhedeg y farchnad ffermwyr yn y dref.

All of us who care about the wellbeing of the countryside and the rural economy should be prepared to support farmers' markets at every possible opportunity. Let us consider some of the benefits. First, there is the issue of farmers taking the initiative to help themselves. Because of the way the agricultural industry is structured throughout Europe, there is an unhealthy dependency in most sectors of farming on subsidy and Government support. In that situation, it is extremely difficult to focus attention on the market place. I agree with much of the rhetoric coming from the Government, at Westminster and in Cardiff, on the importance of moving the industry nearer to the market place. The farmers' market movement has the potential to be one effective way of achieving that objective.

Dylai pawb ohonom sydd yn poeni am les cefn gwlad a'r economi wledig fod yn barod i gefnogi marchnadoedd ffermwyr ar bob cyfle posibl. Dewch inni ystyried rhai o'r manteision. Yn gyntaf, dyna gwestiwn ffermwyr yn mentro er mwyn helpu'u hunain. Oherwydd y ffordd y mae'r diwydiant amaethyddol wedi'i strwythuro drwy Ewrop, mae dibyniaeth afiach yn y rhan fwyaf o sectorau ffermio ar nawdd a chymorth y Llywodraeth. Yn y sefyllfa honno, mae'n eithriadol o anodd canolbwyntio sylw ar y farchnad. Cytunaf â llawer o'r rhethreg a ddaw oddi wrth y Llywodraeth, yn San Steffan ac yng Nghaerdydd, ynghylch pwysigrwydd symud y diwydiant yn nes at y farchnad. Mae gan fudiad y marchnadoedd ffermwyr y potensial i fod yn un ffordd effeithiol o gyflawni'r nod honno.

Farmers' markets create an opportunity for farmers to meet and socialise. In the most rural parts of Britain, farming has become a lonely job. While some of us enjoy this solitude for a few days, it is not so enjoyable when solitude becomes a way of life.

Mae marchnadoedd ffermwyr yn creu cyfle i ffermwyr gyfarfod a chymdeithasu. Yn rhannau mwyaf gwledig Prydain, aeth ffermio'n waith unig. Tra bo rhai ohonom yn mwynhau'r unigedd am ychydig ddyddiau, nid yw'n gymaint o fwynhad pan dry unigedd yn ffordd o fyw.

Farmers' markets provide an opportunity to give significant added value to Welsh produce by cutting out the middleman. By maintaining a commitment to quality, there is no reason why the full retail value, or at least nearly so, cannot be achieved. Consumers

Mae marchnadoedd ffermwyr yn rhoi cyfle i ychwanegu gwerth sylweddol at gynnyrch Cymreig drwy dorri allan y rhyngfasnachwr. Drwy gynnal ymrwymiad i ansawdd, nid oes rheswm pam na ellir cael y gwerth adwerthu llawn, neu o leiaf rywbeth agos iawn at

have become used to buying their food neatly presented on supermarket shelves. The price of this convenience is often high because the overheads of supermarkets and the profit levels demanded by institutional investors are high. Farmers' markets are a way of getting around that.

hynny. Mae defnyddwyr wedi arfer prynu eu bwyd wedi'i gyflwyno'n daclus ar silffoedd archfarchnad. Mae pris y cyfleuster hwn yn aml yn uchel oherwydd mae gorbenion yr archfarchnadoedd a'r lefelau elw a fynnir gan fuddsoddwyr sefydliadol yn uchel. Mae marchnadoedd ffermwyr yn ffordd o fynd o amgylch hynny.

Farmers' markets greatly enhance the image of British food or Welsh food. Nothing instils greater confidence in those contemplating buying produce than to see the producer standing alongside his or her product with obvious pride in its quality. Today, more and more people are concerned about where food comes from and how it is produced, as well as the price that they pay for it. It is vital for the success of farmers' markets that they sell on quality rather than price. Farmers' markets provide a level of assurance about food products that cannot be matched by any supermarket, due to the presence of the producer.

Mae marchnadoedd ffermwyr yn gwneud y byd o les i ddelwedd bwyd Prydain neu fwyd Cymreig. Nid oes dim yn rhoi mwy o hyder i rai sydd yn ystyried prynu cynnyrch na gweld y cynhyrchydd yn sefyll nesaf at ei gynnyrch neu ei chynnyrch gyda balchder amlwg yn ei ansawdd. Heddiw, mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn poeni am ffynonellau bwyd a sut y'i cynhyrchir, yn ogystal â'r pris a dalant amdano. Mae'n holl bwysig i lwyddiant marchnadoedd ffermwyr eu bod yn gwerthu ar sail ansawdd yn hytrach na phris. Mae marchnadoedd ffermwyr yn rhoi lefel o sicrwydd ynghylch cynhyrchion bwyd na all unrhyw archfarchnad gystadlu â hi, oherwydd presenoldeb y cynhyrchydd.

Farmers' markets encourage diversification in the rural economy. For example, John Scott, to whom I referred earlier, began three businesses that have grown to become substantial. These were the farmers' market, a business renting out market stalls that were bought from Wales and a consultancy business advising others on setting up other farmers' markets. There are many examples of market stalls growing to become substantial businesses, selling by mail order and, increasingly, on the internet.

Mae marchnadoedd ffermwyr yn hwb i arallgyfeirio yn yr economi wledig. Er enghraifft, cychwynnodd John Scott, y cyfeiriais ato'n gynharach, dri busnes a dyfodd nes eu bod yn sylweddol, sef y farchnad ffermwyr, busnes yn rhentu stondinau marchnad a brynwyd o Gymru, a busnes cynghori yn rhoi cyngor i eraill ar sefydlu marchnadoedd ffermwyr eraill. Mae llawer o enghreifftiau o stondinau marchnad yn tyfu i fod yn fusnesau sylweddol, gan werthu drwy'r post ac, yn gynyddol, ar y rhyngrwyd.

Finally, and perhaps most importantly, farmers' markets can play a role in creating greater understanding between town and country. An immediate concern of mine, as a politician concerned with countryside issues, is the gulf between the way things are seen by genuine country people, with their roots deeply established in the countryside, and by those who live in towns or have moved into the countryside. We sometimes see this in the Assembly, where there is a gulf of understanding on issues such as country sports or the right to roam. I find it almost impossible to understand the deeply held views of other Assembly Members. At

Yn olaf, ac efallai'n bwysicaf, gall marchnadoedd ffermwyr chwarae rôl i greu mwy o ddealltwriaeth rhwng gwlad a thref. Un peth sydd yn fy mhoeni'n uniongyrchol, fel gwleidydd sydd yn ymwneud â materion cefn gwlad, yw'r gagendor rhwng y ffordd y gwelir pethau gan bobl go iawn y wlad, gyda'u gwreiddiau'n ddwfn yng nghefn gwlad, a chan y rheini sydd yn byw yn y trefi neu a symudodd i fyw yn y wlad. Gwelwn hyn weithiau yn y Cynulliad, lle ceir gagendor o ddealltwriaeth ar faterion fel hela neu'r hawl i grwydro. Yr wyf yn ei chael hi bron yn amhosibl deall y syniadau a goleddir yn ddwfn gan Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad.

farmers' markets, producers and consumers meet and discuss methods of production. This inter-relationship bridges the gulf between town and country, which has grown over recent years and continues to do so.

Mewn marchnadoedd ffermwyr, mae cynhyrchwyr a defnyddwyr yn cyfarfod ac yn trafod dulliau cynhyrchu. Mae'r rhyng-berthynas hon yn pontio'r gagendor rhwng gwlad a thref, sydd wedi tyfu yn y blynyddoedd diweddar ac sydd yn dal i wneud.

Yr wyf eisiau tynnu sylw at farchnadoedd ffermwyr. Mae'r rhain yn ffordd newydd i ffermwyr wneud arian, cael pris teg am ein cynnyrch a dod â chefn gwlad a threfi at ei gilydd. Nid oes llawer o bobl yn gwybod am farchnadoedd ffermwyr a gobeithiaf helpu drwy godi'r mater yn y Cynulliad. Gall marchnadoedd ffermwyr helpu rhai ffermwyr. Os ydynt mor llwyddiannus â'r rhai yn Ffrainc ac Efrog Newydd, mae'n bosibl gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr. Ar hyn o bryd, mae unrhyw gymorth yn gymorth mawr.

I want to draw attention to farmers' markets. These are a new way for farmers to make money, have a fair price for our produce and bring the countryside and towns together. Not many people know of farmers' markets and I hope to help by raising the issue in the Assembly. Farmers' markets can help some farmers. If they are as successful as those in France and New York, it is possible to make a great difference. At the moment, any help is a great help.

Y Llywydd: Nododd Glyn wrthyf ymlaen llaw ei fod yn rhoi amser byr i Rhodri Glyn Thomas a Mick Bates siarad.

The Presiding Officer: Glyn notified me beforehand that he is giving Rhodri Glyn Thomas and Mick Bates a short time to speak.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolch i Glyn am godi'r mater hwn ac am drafod amaethyddiaeth a'r economi gwledig mor gadarnhaol a chreadigol. Gobeithiaf fod y grŵp Ceidwadol yn bwriadu dilyn arweiniad Glyn ar y mater hwn yn y dyfodol. Mae'n fater hynod o bwysig gan ei fod yn rhoi cyfle i'r cynhyrchydd gael gwerth ychwanegol i'w gynnyrch. Mewn arolwg a gynhaliwyd gan Undeb Cenedlaethol y Ffermwyr yn gymharol ddiweddar, dywedodd naw o bob 10 ffermwr y byddent yn falch o gymryd rhan mewn marchnad o'r fath pe bai un wrth law. Mae cynifer â 70 o farchnadoedd ffermwyr wedi eu sefydlu ym Mhrydain o fewn blwyddyn, a dengys hyn pa mor llwyddiannus a deniadol ydynt i ffermwyr. Mae cyfle gwirioneddol i gael gwerth ychwanegol i gynnyrch—hyd at 200 y cant ar gig, ffrwythau a llaeth a hyd at 400 y cant ar wyau.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I thank Glyn for raising this issue and for discussing agriculture and the rural economy so positively and creatively. I hope that the Conservative group intends to follow Glyn's lead on this issue in future. It is an extremely important issue as it gives the producer an opportunity to have added value for his product. In a fairly recent survey by the National Farmers Union, nine out of 10 farmers said that they would be pleased to take part in such a market if one was available. As many as 70 markets have been set up in Britain within a year, and this shows how successful and attractive they are to farmers. There is a real opportunity to have added value for produce—up to 200 per cent on meat, fruit and milk and up to 400 per cent on eggs.

Dylem hefyd ystyried hyn yng nghyd-destun y *co-op* cenedlaethol. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o bryderon yr arwerthwyr a'r marchnadoedd anifeiliaid byw. Mae rôl yn y fan hon i farchnadoedd anifeiliaid byw. Gallent sefydlu'r marchnadoedd ffermwyr

We should also consider this in the context of the national co-op. We are aware of the concerns of the auctioneers and the live animal markets. There is a role here for live animal markets. They could establish these farmers' markets and provide an opportunity

hyn a rhoi cyfle i ffermwyr werthu eu cynnyrch yn uniongyrchol yn y man traddodiadol—yn y mart, lle y mae ffermwyr wedi arfer â dod ynghyd—a denu'r cyhoedd i mewn i brynu'r cynnyrch. Cefnogaf Glyn yn llwyr ar y mater hwn a llongyfarchaf ef ar ddod â'r mater i'n sylw. Mae'n fater y gallwn uno i'w gefnogi ac mae hynny'n hynod o bwysig ar gyfer yr economi a'r cymunedau gwledig.

for farmers to sell their produce directly in the traditional place—in the mart, where farmers usually come together—and attract the public in to buy the produce. I fully support Glyn on this issue and congratulate him for bringing the issue to our attention. It is an issue that we can join to support and that is extremely important for the rural economy and communities

5:10 p.m.

Mick Bates: I also endorse the concept that Glyn has brought to us. I express a personal interest, as I am chair of a national co-op on behalf of farmers. I have also been heavily involved in promoting farmers' co-operation through many bids, in particular a bid from Montgomery Farm Enterprises, which is running a £1.3 million project. Furthermore, our party is also involved in terms of farmers' marts, because a farmers' mart has just been launched in Brecon, the chair of which is my colleague, Kirsty Williams. Therefore, I congratulate her on chairing that local farmers' mart.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf innau hefyd yn ategu'r cysyniad a gyflwynodd Glyn inni. Mynegaf ddiddordeb personol, gan fy mod yn gadeirydd *co-op* cenedlaethol ar ran ffermwyr. Yr wyf hefyd wedi bod yn gwneud llawer i hyrwyddo cydweithrediad ffermwyr drwy nifer o geisiadau, yn enwedig gais gan Fentrau Fferm Maldwyn, sydd yn rhedeg prosiect £1.3 miliwn. Ar ben hynny, mae'n plaid ni'n brysur hefyd o ran marchnadoedd ffermwyr, gan fod marchnad ffermwyr newydd ei lansio yn Aberhonddu, dan gadeiryddiaeth fy nghyd-Aelod, Kirsty Williams. Felly, fe'i llongyfarchaf ar gadeirio'r farchnad ffermwyr leol honno.

We fully endorse this, because it is a range of developments in line with our principle of promoting a sustainable rural economy. The most important concept is that it is local food for local people and the potential markets beyond them—the schools and institutions in our communities. It is a great process that started with Local Agenda 21, aimed at reducing food miles. Farmers market this process through their direct selling, which adds value to the producer. There is a lot of advice available. Although nobody has mentioned it, there is a guide for farmers' markets produced by the Farming and Rural Conservation Agency, which is of great use if anybody here wants to start up a farmer's market. I am sure that Glyn and I could give you some produce to sell.

Yr ydym yn cefnogi hyn yn llawn, gan ei fod yn amrediad o ddatblygiadau sydd yn gydnaws â'n hegwyddor o hyrwyddo economi gwledig gynaliadwy. Y cysyniad pwysicaf yw mai bwyd lleol i bobl leol ydyw, ac i'r marchnadoedd posibl y tu cefn iddynt—yr ysgolion a'r sefydliadau yn ein cymunedau. Mae'n broses wych a ddechreuodd gydag Agenda Leol 21, a anelai at leihau milltiroedd bwyd. Bydd ffermwyr yn marchnata'r broses hon drwy eu gwerthu uniongyrchol, sydd yn ychwanegu gwerth i'r cynhyrchydd. Y mae llawer o gyngor ar gael. Er nad oes unrhywun wedi sôn amdano, mae arweinlyfr i farchnadoedd ffermwyr wedi'i gyhoeddi gan yr Asiantaeth Ffermio a Chadwraeth Wledig, sydd yn ddefnyddiol dros ben os oes ar unrhyw un yma eisiau cychwyn marchnad ffermwyr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai Glyn a mi roi cynnyrch ichi ei werthu.

The concept of adding value is one that, in Powys, is immensely important through Powys Food Futures. Partnership and establishing a link is what Glyn talked

Mae cysyniad ychwanegu gwerth yn un sydd yn hynod bwysig ym Mhowys, drwy Powys Food Futures. Soniodd Glyn am bartneriaeth a sefydlu cysylltiad—ailintegreiddio

about—reintegrating agriculture into the rural economy and establishing the link between the producer and the consumer. Only good can come out of this process. I look forward to the day the middle man is removed—the day that Mr Sainsbury says to farmers, 'it is all yours'.

amaethyddiaeth yn yr economi wledig a sefydlu'r cysylltiad rhwng y cynhyrchydd a'r defnyddiwr. Ni all dim ond daioni ddod o'r broses hon. Edrychaf ymlaen at y dydd y bydd y rhyngfasnachwr wedi diflannu—y dydd pan y dywed Mr Sainsbury wrth y ffermwyr, 'chi biau'r cyfan'.

Brian Gibbons: I admit that when I saw the subject of the short debate, I did not know what farmers' markets were. I was brought up in the countryside and when Glyn began talking about farmers' markets, I understood exactly what he meant. When I was a youngster in the west of Ireland, many farmers' markets existed and they were an important aspect of social life in the rural community. I had the benefit of living in a big village of 100 people. It was exciting for us when farmers came in on market days to sell their products. As Glyn said, it was a useful forum for people who lived in the village to build links with the farmers who produced in the surrounding farms. I am sure that there are many people in towns who would welcome the establishment of such markets and would like the opportunity to buy products in the way that Glyn said and make personal acquaintance with the people who produce the food. I am sure that friendships and relationships could be built if the farming community could achieve this. I wish the farming community and Glyn's motion well—hopefully its sentiments will see greater expansion in the future.

Brian Gibbons: Cyfaddefaf pan welais destun y ddadl fer, nad oeddwn yn gwybod beth oedd marchnadoedd ffermwyr. Fe'm magwyd yng nghefn gwlad a phan ddechreuodd Glyn sôn am farchnadoedd ffermwyr, deallais yn union beth yr oedd yn ei feddwl. Pan oeddwn yn grwt yng ngorllewin Iwerddon, yr oedd llawer o farchnadoedd ffermwyr yn bodoli ac yr oeddent yn agwedd bwysig ar fywyd cymdeithasol yn y gymuned wledig. Cefais y fantais o fyw mewn pentref mawr o 100 o bobl. Yr oedd yn gyffrous i ni pan ddeuai ffermwyr i mewn ar ddiwrnod marchnad i werthu'u cynnyrch. Fel y dywedodd Glyn, yr oedd yn fforwm defnyddiol i drigolion y pentref greu cysylltiadau â'r ffermwyr a gynhyrchai yn y ffermydd o gwmpas y pentref. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod llawer o bobl mewn trefi a fyddai'n croesawu sefydlu marchnadoedd o'r fath ac a hoffai'r cyfle i brynu cynnyrch yn y modd y disgrifiodd Glyn a chael dod i adnabod y bobl sydd yn cynhyrchu'r bwyd yn bersonol. Yr wyf yn siwr y gellid adeiladu cyfeillgarwch a pherthynas pe gallai'r gymuned ffermio gyflawni hyn. Dymunaf bob hwyl i'r gymuned ffermio ac i gynnig Glyn—gobeithio y gwelir ehangu'r syniadau hyn ymhellach yn y dyfodol.

The Secretary for Agriculture and Rural Development (Christine Gwyther): I welcome this debate on the role that farmers' markets can play in helping rural communities to thrive. I congratulate Glyn, not only on choosing this subject for debate, but for doing so openly and positively, which is a marked contrast to the sad and sorry debate that came from the Welsh Conservative group yesterday. However, I do not want to revisit that unpleasantness because I hope that we will end this term positively.

Yr Ysgrifennydd Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig (Christine Gwyther): Croesawaf y ddadl hon ar y rôl y gall marchnadoedd ffermwyr ei chwarae i helpu cymunedau gwledig i ffynnu. Hoffwn longyfarch Glyn, nid yn unig am ddewis y pwnc hwn ar gyfer dadl, ond am wneud hynny'n agored ac yn gadarnhaol, yn wahanol iawn i'r ddadl drist a thruenus a gafwyd gan y grŵp Ceidwadol Cymreig ddoe. Fodd bynnag, nid oes arnaf eisiau mynd yn ôl at yr annifyrrwch hwnnw oherwydd yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwn yn cloi'r tymor hwn yn bositif.

Farmers' markets can offer farmers valuable

Gall marchnadoedd ffermwyr gynnig mannau

outlets for their products, particularly in tourist or high-density population areas. Sue Essex reminded me that she asked the first question on farmers' markets in the Assembly. That proves that urban as well as rural people care about farmers. I mentioned that to continue your theme of togetherness, Glyn.

gwerthfawr i ffermwyr werthu'u cynnyrch, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd twristaidd neu boblog. Atgoffodd Sue Essex fi mai hi a ofynnodd y cwestiwn cyntaf ar farchnadoedd ffermwyr yn y Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n profi fod pobl y dref yn ogystal â phobl y wlad yn poeni am ffermwyr. Soniais am hynny i barhau â'ch thema o undod, Glyn.

Glyn was also right to mention successful American and European markets. When I used to go on holiday to France, I would go to the markets there and I hope that when they lift the beef ban I can do so again. These markets are additional, specialist outlets, particularly for niche products, as Glyn clearly expressed, and as such they are important to specialists, especially local producers. They are a useful contribution to farmers' incomes, but that is not everything. I support the development of farmers' markets as an additional form of help for farmers to market their produce. Again, the importance of quality, sustainability and freshness should be emphasised. For those of us who use farmers' markets, it is a pleasant way to shop and it is a nice change if you find ordinary shopping a bit of a chore.

Yr oedd Glyn yn gywir hefyd pan soniodd am farchnadoedd llwyddiannus yn America ac Ewrop. Pan arferwn fynd ar wyliau i Ffrainc, byddwn yn mynd i'r marchnadoedd yno a gobeithiaf allu mynd yno eto pan godant y gwaharddiad ar gig eidion. Mae'r marchnadoedd hyn yn fannau gwerthu ychwanegol, arbenigol, yn enwedig ar gyfer cynnyrch arbenigol, fel y mynegodd Glyn yn glir, ac yn hynny o beth maent yn bwysig i arbenigwyr, yn enwedig cynhyrchwyr lleol. Maent yn gyfraniad defnyddiol i incwm ffermwyr, ond nid dyna'r cyfan. Yr wyf yn cefnogi datblygiad marchnadoedd ffermwyr fel ffurf ychwanegol o gymorth i ffermwyr farchnata'u cynnyrch. Eto, dylid pwysleisio pwysigrwydd ansawdd, cynaliadwyedd a ffresni. I'r rheini ohonom sydd yn defnyddio marchnadoedd ffermwyr, mae'n ddull braf o siopa ac yn newid difyr os yw siopa cyffredin wedi mynd yn dipyn o fwrn.

5:20 p.m.

Local authorities are important in setting up farmers' markets not only in terms of financial help but also because they licence them and it is important that that licensing is done properly. Carmarthenshire County Council was one of the first in Britain to set up a farmers' market and they are doing nicely. I am surprised that Rhodri Glyn did not mention that. Some councils, and I am sure that there are many more throughout Wales, are accepting the idea of farmers' markets. Pembrokeshire county council was converted recently. It was against the concept initially but political pressure was brought to bear and it has now taken up the opportunity. Last summer, Richard Edwards and I launched its market and it has now gone from strength to strength. It is no longer held once a month but every fortnight and it is expected to get even bigger. Success is based mainly on the diversity of products, which keeps people coming fortnight after fortnight.

Mae awdurdodau lleol yn bwysig ar gyfer sefydlu marchnadoedd ffermwyr nid yn unig yn nhermau cymorth ariannol ond hefyd am eu bod yn eu trwyddedu ac mae'n bwysig y gwneir y trwyddedu'n iawn. Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin oedd un o'r cyntaf ym Mhrydain i sefydlu marchnad ffermwyr ac maent yn ffynnu. Yr wyf yn synnu na soniodd Rhodri Glyn am hynny. Mae rhai cynghorau, ac yr wyf yn siwr fod llawer mwy ar hyd a lled Cymru, yn derbyn y syniad o farchnadoedd ffermwyr. Cafodd Cyngor Sir Benfro dröedigaeth yn ddiweddar. Yr oedd yn erbyn y cysyniad ar y dechrau ond bu pwysau gwleidyddol a bellach mae wedi cydio yn y cyfle. Yr haf diwethaf, lansiodd Richard Edwards a mi farchnad y sir honno ac erbyn hyn aeth o nerth i nerth. Nid unwaith y mis y'i cynhelir bellach ond unwaith bob pythefnos a disgwylir iddi dyfu'n fwy fyth. Mae ei llwyddiant yn seiliedig yn bennaf ar amrywiaeth ei chynhyrchion, sydd yn dal i

ddenu pobl yn ôl bob pythefnos.

The Assembly will consider helping farmers' markets where possible. Glyn Davies said that it was not just a question of money, but money can help. The Assembly can provide financial help under the marketing development scheme. For example, the Assembly could support a feasibility study into establishing a market if it was approached by a group of farmers or a market group. I have issued that challenge in this Chamber before, but I have not yet received an application and I am still looking forward to that. The Assembly cannot provide financial assistance for purchasing market facilities because that is a retail activity and it cannot provide grants to local authorities under the marketing development scheme. However, it can help by encouraging local authorities to work with people who are developing farmers' markets to ensure that all the necessary factors, such as the correct type of licensing, are in place to allow them to set up, operate successfully and keep going, which is the main consideration.

Bydd y Cynulliad yn ystyried helpu marchnadoedd ffermwyr lle bo modd. Dywedodd Glyn Davies nad cwestiwn o arian yn unig ydoedd, ond gall arian fod o gymorth. Gall y Cynulliad ddarparu cymorth ariannol dan y cynllun datblygu marchnata. Er enghraifft, gallai'r Cynulliad gefnogi astudiaeth ddichonoldeb i sefydlu marchnad petai grŵp o ffermwyr neu grŵp marchnad yn gofyn am hynny. Yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi'r her honno yn y Siambr hon o'r blaen, ond nid oes cais wedi dod i law eto ac yr wyf yn dal i edrych ymlaen at hynny. Ni all y Cynulliad gynnig cymorth ariannol i brynu cyfleusterau marchnad gan mai gweithgaredd adwerthu yw hwnnw ac ni all roi grantiau i awdurdodau lleol dan y cynllun datblygu marchnata. Fodd bynnag, gall helpu drwy annog awdurdodau lleol i weithio gyda phobl sydd yn datblygu marchnadoedd ffermwyr er mwyn sicrhau bod yr holl ffactorau angenrheidiol, fel y math cywir o drwydded, yn eu lle i'w caniatáu i ymsefydlu, gweithredu'n llwyddiannus a dal i fynd, sef y brif ystyriaeth.

More generally, we are working hard to diversify the economic base of our land-based businesses in Wales. I agree wholeheartedly with Glyn that the development of farmers' markets complements this activity. They are a welcome additional source of business for farmers and other food producers. They prove popular with local people and visitors and they attract a fair amount of media attention. It is welcome that not all media attention on farming activity is negative. We must boost the activity that will get us good media attention as much as we can. Farmers' markets are considered a source of good food and the Soil Association is active in this area, helping to promote the sale of organic produce, which is an important area of opportunity for Welsh farmers given that they get a premium for producing organic food.

Yn fwy cyffredinol, yr ydym yn gweithio'n galed i amrywio sail economaidd ein busnesau sydd yn gweithio ar y tir yng Nghymru. Cytunaf yn llwyr â Glyn fod datblygiad marchnadoedd ffermwyr yn ategu'r gweithgaredd hwn. Maent yn ffynhonnell busnes ychwanegol werthfawr i ffermwyr ac eraill sydd yn cynhyrchu bwyd. Maent yn boblogaidd gan bobl leol ac ymwelwyr ac yn denu cryn dipyn o sylw yn y cyfryngau. Mae'n beth da nad yw holl sylw'r cyfryngau ar ffermio yn sylw negyddol. Rhaid inni hybu'r gweithgaredd a fydd yn sicrhau sylw da inni yn y cyfryngau gymaint ag y medrwn. Ystyrir fod marchnadoedd ffermwyr yn ffynhonnell fwyd da ac mae'r Gymdeithas Bridd yn weithredol yn y maes hwn, gan helpu i hyrwyddo gwerthiant cynnyrch organig, sef maes sydd yn cynnig cyfle pwysig i ffermwyr Cymru gan eu bod yn cael premiwm am gynhyrchu bwyd organig.

This has been a good and positive debate. The Assembly will continue to do what it can to support farmers' markets. Officials from the Assembly's agriculture department are

Bu hon yn ddadl dda a chadarnhaol. Bydd y Cynulliad yn parhau i wneud yr hyn a all i gefnogi marchnadoedd ffermwyr. Mae swyddogion o adran amaethyddiaeth y

ready to help local authorities and other partners by offering financial assistance or advice because that is also important to develop these important outlets where we can show off the best that Wales has to offer.

Cynulliad yn barod i helpu awdurdodau lleol a phartneriaid eraill drwy gynnig cymorth ariannol neu gyngor oherwydd mae hynny hefyd yn bwysig er mwyn datblygu'r canolfannau pwysig hyn lle gallwn arddangos y gorau sydd gan Gymru i'w gynnig.

Y Llywydd: Hoffwn anfon ein dymuniadau gorau i Val Feld. Pasg dedwydd i bawb a mwynhewch y toriad.

The Presiding Officer: I would like to send our best wishes to Val Feld. Happy Easter to everybody and enjoy the recess.

Edwina Hart: Point of order. I would like to make a correction to the record. I indicated in my speech that Rosemary Butler, as Secretary for Education and Children, might have been aware of DfEE's statement on teachers' recruitment packages before I was. However, she was also informed by *The Guardian*.

Edwina Hart: Pwynt o drefn. Hoffwn wneud cywiriad i'r cofnod. Nodais yn fy araith y gallasai Rosemary Butler, fel Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant, fod yn ymwybodol o ddatganiad yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth ar becynnau recriwtio athrawon cyn i mi glywed amdano. Fodd bynnag, yn *The Guardian* y cafodd hithau'r wybodaeth.

The Presiding Officer: I will not comment on that except to say that we are grateful to *The Guardian.*

Y Llywydd: Ni wnaf unrhyw sylw ar hynny ac eithrio dweud ein bod yn ddiolchgar i *The Guardian*.

That is the end of today's proceedings. Happy Easter to you all.

Dyna ddiwedd trafodion heddiw. Pasg dedwydd ichi i gyd.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.27 p.m.
The session ended at 5.27 p.m.