Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)

The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)

Dydd Iau 14 Rhagfyr 2000
Thursday 14 December 2000

Cynnwys
Contents

3 Datganiad gan y Llywydd
Statement by the Presiding Officer

5 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ar Lywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau
Questions to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities on Local Government and Communities

13 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd
Questions to the Minister for Environment

22 Datganiad ar Hyfforddiant Ymwybyddiaeth Cydraddoldeb
Statement on Equality Awareness Training

29 Datganiad ar Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol 1998
Statement on the Human Rughts Act 1998

37 Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Cymru) 2000
The Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales) Regulations 2000

53 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Cymru) 2000
Approval of the Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales) Regulations 2000

55 Rhaglen Waith y Llywodraeth
The Programme for Government

99 Dadl Fer: Sgrinio Cyffredinol ar Glyw Babanod Newydd-anedig
Short Debate: Universal Neonatal Hearing Screening

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.

Datganiad gan y Llywydd
Statement by the Presiding Officer

Y Llywydd: Mae'n briodol imi hysbysu'r Cynulliad o farn y Pwyllgor Deddfau, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, bod sail dros wahodd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i roi sylw arbennig i Orchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Gwerth Gorau) (Adolygiadau a Chynlluniau Perfformiad) (Cymru) 2000, a wnaethpwyd o dan y weithdrefn frys ar 22 Mawrth 2000. Mae'r Pwyllgor Deddfau wedi cyflwyno adroddiad, a bydd Aelodau wedi ei dderbyn drwy e-bost.

The Presiding Officer: It is appropriate for me to inform the Assembly of the Legislation Committee's opinion, in accordance with Standing Order No. 11.5, that there are grounds for inviting the National Assembly to pay special attention to the Local Government (Best Value) (Reviews and Performance Plans) (Wales) Order 2000, which was made under the urgency procedure on 22 March 2000. The Legislation Committee has submitted a report, which Members will have received by e-mail.

Jocelyn Davies: Point of order. This Order was made under the urgency procedure in March. The Order is defective. The Legislation Committee did not consider it within the 40 days' time limit that would have enabled the Assembly to revoke the Order. Could we have an explanation for that? That cannot be allowed to happen again. It is important that Orders come before the Legislation Committee within 40 days so that they can be revoked if necessary. If we will be in recess for 12 weeks next year, I am concerned that it is possible that, if Orders are made under the urgency procedure, the 40 days will pass and we will miss the opportunity to revoke any defective Orders. Also, what is the impact of this defective Order?

Jocelyn Davies: Pwynt o drefn. Gwnaethpwyd y Gorchymyn hwn o dan y weithdrefn frys ym Mawrth. Mae'r Gorchymyn yn ddiffygiol. Ni chafodd ei ystyried gan y Pwyllgor Deddfau o fewn y terfyn amser o 40 diwrnod a fyddai wedi galluogi'r Cynulliad i ddirymu'r Gorchymyn. A gawn eglurhad am hynny? Ni ellir caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd eto. Mae'n bwysig y daw Gorchmynion gerbron y Pwyllgor Deddfau o fewn 40 diwrnod fel y gellir eu dirymu os bydd angen. Os bydd y toriad yn parhau am 12 wythnos y flwyddyn nesaf, yr wyf yn pryderu ei bod yn bosibl, os gwneir Gorchmynion o dan y weithdrefn frys, y bydd y 40 diwrnod yn mynd heibio ac y collwn y cyfle i ddirymu unrhyw Orchmynion diffygiol. Hefyd, beth yw effaith y Gorchymyn diffygiol hwn?

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I apologise—I missed the beginning of the session, so I am not sure to what this relates specifically. However, I know that members of the Legislation Committee have expressed concerns about one Order. We are considering that to find out what happened. I will report back to the Assembly and to the Chair of the Legislation Committee, Mick Bates, on the reasons for this.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Ymddiheuraf—collais ddechrau'r sesiwn, felly nid wyf yn siŵr beth yn union y cyfeiria hyn ato. Fodd bynnag, gwn fod aelodau'r Pwyllgor Deddfau wedi mynegi pryderon ynglŷn ag un Gorchymyn. Yr ydym yn ystyried hwnnw er mwyn darganfod beth a ddigwyddodd. Rhoddaf adroddiad i'r Cynulliad a Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Deddfau, Mick Bates, ar y rhesymau dros hyn.

Mick Bates: The two issues raised by Jocelyn are of great concern. There has been

Mike Bates: Mae'r ddau fater a gododd Jocelyn yn achosi cryn bryder. Bu cryn

much correspondence on the issue of Orders passed by the urgency procedure, which will be referred to as the executive procedure in future, I believe. That has been useful. I have a statement from the Office of the Counsel General, which states that it will take control to ensure that such Orders are pushed through effectively and that the process is transparent and democratic. That is important.

ohebiaeth ynglŷn â chyhoeddi Gorchmynion a basiswyd o dan y weithdrefn frys, y cyfeirir ati fel y weithdrefn weithredol yn y dyfodol, fe gredaf. Bu hynny'n ddefnyddiol. Mae gennyf ddatganiad gan Swyddfa'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol, sydd yn nodi y bydd yn cymryd yr awenau er mwyn sicrhau bod Gorchmynion o'r fath yn cael eu pasio'n effeithiol a bod y broses yn un dryloyw a democrataidd. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

On the second issue that Jocelyn raised, every day of the 12-week recess will be considered to be a working day. Therefore, we must keep in touch with information on legislation that has been laid. That is always provided on the intranet and the internet.

Ynglyn â'r ail fater a gododd Jocelyn, ystyrir pob diwrnod o'r toriad 12-wythnos yn ddiwrnod gwaith. Felly, rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym yr wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ddeddfwriaeth a gyflwynwyd. Fe'i darperir bob amser ar y fewnrwyd a'r rhyngrwyd.

Jocelyn Davies: Further to that point of order, if you look at Standing Orders, you will find that the procedure is called the urgency procedure. The Executive may choose to call it the executive procedure, but, according to the Standing Orders, it is the urgency procedure. Look on the Chamberweb.

Jocelyn Davies: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, os edrychwch ar y Rheolau Sefydlog, gwelwch mai'r enw ar y weithdrefn yw gweithdrefn frys. Efallai bod y Weithrediaeth yn dewis ei galw'n weithdrefn weithredol, ond, yn ôl y Rheolau Sefydlog y weithdrefn frys ydyw. Edrychwch ar we'r Siambr.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to Jocelyn for drawing our attention to that. I was about to draw Members' attention to Standing Order No. 22.28. My understanding of the situation, as conveyed to me by the Legislation Committee—and I am grateful to it for that, because it is clearly carrying out its function of scrutinising the legislation process in doing so—is that the Order was made under the urgency procedure. Therefore, in accordance with Standing Order No. 22.28, it should have been submitted to the Legislation Committee

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jocelyn am dynnu ein sylw at hynny. Yr oeddwn ar fin tynnu sylw'r Aelodau at Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.28. Yr wyf ar ddeall, yn ôl yr hyn a gyfleodd y Pwyllgor Deddfau imi—ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddo am hynny, am ei fod yn amlwg yn cyflawni ei swyddogaeth o archwilio'r broses ddeddfwriaethol wrth wneud hynny—i'r Gorchymyn gael ei wneud o dan y weithdrefn frys. Felly, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22.28, dylid bod wedi ei gyflwyno i'r Pwyllgor Deddfau

'as soon as possible after the Order has been made'.

'cyn gynted ag y bo modd ar ôl i'r Gorchymyn gael ei wneud'.

The Order was made on 22 March 2000. However, the Order was not formally submitted to the Legislation Committee until 4 October and my understanding is that that happened at the instigation of Committee officials. This is a case of a failure to comply with Assembly procedures, which puts Members at a disadvantage in debating and scrutinising this Order. That is why I have drawn the Assembly's attention to this

Gwnaethpwyd y Gorchymyn ar 22 Mawrth 2000. Fodd bynnag, ni chyflwynwyd y Gorchymyn yn ffurfiol i'r Pwyllgor Deddfau tan 4 Hydref ac yr wyf ar ddeall i hynny ddigwydd ar gais swyddogion y Pwyllgor. Mae hwn yn achos o fethu â chydymffurfio â gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad, sydd yn rhoi'r Aelodau o dan anfantais wrth drafod ac archwilio'r Gorchymyn hwn. Dyna pam fy mod wedi tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad at y mater

matter. I am grateful to the Minister for Assembly Business for indicating that he will instigate an inquiry into what happened. He will convey that information to Assembly Members.

hwn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Trefnydd am nodi y bydd yn cynnal ymchwiliad i'r hyn a ddigwyddodd. Bydd yn cyfleu'r wybodaeth honno i Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Andrew Davies: The inquiry has already begun.

Andrew Davies: Mae'r ymchwiliad wedi dechrau eisoes.

The Presiding Officer: Sorry, it has already begun.

Y Llywydd: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, mae wedi dechrau eisoes.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ar Lywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau
Questions to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities on Local Government and Communities

The Presiding Officer: Question 1 has been withdrawn.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 1 yn ôl.

Y Gyfundrefn Daliadaeth Brydles
The Leasehold System

C2 Owen John Thomas: A yw'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn ymwybodol o'r pryder a berir o hyd gan y gyfundrefn daliadaeth brydles? (OAQ8482)

Q2 Owen John Thomas: Is the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities aware of the concerns still caused by the leasehold system? (OAQ8482)

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): Yes, I am aware that the current leasehold system is flawed and I remain concerned about the shortcomings of the present system.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Ydwyf, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod y system daliadaeth brydles bresennol yn ddiffygiol ac yr wyf yn parhau i bryderu ynglŷn â diffygion y system bresennol.

Owen John Thomas: Yn ddiweddar, ymdriniais ag achos lle gofynnwyd am £14,000 am brydles tŷ teras yn Llanbradach. Ar ôl i mi ymyrryd ar ran y prydlesydd, gostyngodd y pris i £8,000. Yr oedd y prydlesydd yn fwy na pharod i'w dalu ond mynnais fynd â'r achos i'r tribiwnlys lleol ar ei rhan, lle derbyniwyd fy mhrisiad o £2,500. Tybed sawl un sydd yn talu crocbris am y tir o dan eu cartrefi? A ydych yn fodlon cynnal trafodaethau ar frys gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan i sicrhau bod modd addasu'r Mesur Cydradd-ddaliad a Diwygio Prydles arfaethedig drwy ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol?

Owen John Thomas: I dealt recently with a case where £14,000 was asked for the leasehold on a terraced house in Llanbradach. After I intervened on the leaseholder's behalf, the price was reduced to £8,000. The leaseholder was more than prepared to pay that price, but I insisted on taking the case to the local tribunal on her behalf, where my evaluation of £2,500 was accepted. I wonder how many people pay an extortionate price for the land on which their houses stand? Will you hold urgent discussions with the Government in Westminster to ensure that the proposed Commonhold and Leasehold Reform Bill can be adapted by means of secondary legislation in the National Assembly?

Edwina Hart: I share your concerns, as I am sure all Members do. We have all dealt with such problems on behalf of our constituents. As you know, the National Assembly is supporting a draft Bill, as we believe that the proposals will benefit leaseholders in Wales. The Bill contains measures to introduce a new form of tenure, commonhold, which allows flat owners to share the ownership and management of the common parts of the development in which they live. It should make life easier for leaseholders. I will take on board your points in discussions with any Ministers in the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions.

Edwina Hart: Rhannaf eich pryderon, fel y mae pob Aelod, mae'n siŵr. Yr ydym oll wedi ymdrin â phroblemau o'r fath ar ran ein hetholwyr. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cefnogi Mesur drafft, gan y credwn y bydd y cynigion o fudd i brydleswyr yng Nghymru. Mae'r Mesur yn cynnwys mesurau i gyflwyno math newydd o ddeiliadaeth, sef cydradd-ddaliad, sydd yn caniatáu perchnogion fflatiau i rannu perchenogaeth a rheolaeth y rhannau cyffredin o'r eiddo y maent yn byw ynddo. Dylai wneud pethau'n haws i brydleswyr. Byddaf yn ystyried eich pwyntiau mewn trafodaethau gydag unrhyw Weinidogion o fewn Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau.

Etholiadau'r Awdurdodau Lleol
Local Authority Elections

Q3 Glyn Davies: What discussions has Edwina Hart had with councils about the date on which the next local authority elections will take place? (OAQ8443)

Q3 Glyn Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae Edwina Hart wedi'u cynnal gyda chynghorau am ddyddiad etholiadau nesaf yr awdurdodau lleol? (OAQ8443)

Edwina Hart: I have written to, among others, all principal councils and community councils in Wales seeking their views on this matter. Consultees have until 16 February to respond. I thank the Welsh Conservative Party for its prompt response.

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at bob prif gyngor a chyngor cymuned yng Nghymru, ymhlith eraill, i geisio eu barn ar y mater hwn. Nid oes angen ymateb tan 16 Chwefror. Diolchaf i Blaid Geidwadol Cymru am ei hymateb prydlon.

Glyn Davies: I am sure that like me you realise that in future elections Labour councillors will be losing their seats by the bucketful. I just wonder whether—

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod chi fel finnau yn sylweddoli y bydd cynghorwyr Llafur yn colli pentyrrau o seddau mewn etholiadau yn y dyfodol. Tybio yr oeddwn a—

The Presiding Officer: Order. May we have a question please? That was a statement or, should I say, an assertion.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A gawn gwestiwn arall? Datganiad oedd hwnnw, neu honiad, efallai y dylwn ddweud.

Glyn Davies: I am sorry to have stated the obvious at the start of my question. However, do you agree that it would be entirely inappropriate to delay elections and allow these Labour councillors extra time in office before they are removed by the electorate?

Glyn Davies: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf imi nodi'r hyn sydd yn amlwg ar ddechrau fy nghwestiwn. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch y byddai'n gwbl amhriodol gohirio'r etholiadau a chaniatáu amser ychwanegol i'r cynghorwyr Llafur hyn yn eu swyddi cyn iddynt gael eu symud gan yr etholwyr?

Edwina Hart: As a democrat, I have gone out to consultation, Glyn. I will make my decision after I have seen the consultation

Edwina Hart: Fel democrat, yr wyf wedi ymgynghori, Glyn. Gwnaf benderfyniad ar hyn ar ôl imi weld atebion pob plaid

responses from all political parties and local authorities. I am sorry that your crystal ball is not up to speed this morning, because I am confident that in any local government elections, the Labour Party will romp home.

wleidyddol ac awdurdod lleol i'r ymgynghoriad. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad yw'ch pelen grisial yn gweithio y bore yma, am fy mod i'n ffyddiog y bydd y Blaid Lafur yn ennill yn rhwydd mewn unrhyw etholiadau llywodraeth leol.

Janet Davies: I declare an interest as Chair of Llanharry Community Council. If county borough council elections continue to be held on the same day as National Assembly elections, it would mean that town and community councils would have to have their elections on a separate day. That would lay the full cost on those councils and cause the local council taxpayers a great deal of expense. Have you had any discussions about assisting town and community council elections with those costs?

Janet Davies: Datganaf fuddiant fel Cadeirydd Cyngor Cymuned Llanhari. Os bydd etholiadau cynghorau bwrdeistref sirol yn parhau i gael eu cynnal ar yr un diwrnod ag etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, golygai y byddai'n rhaid i gynghorau tref a chymuned gynnal eu hetholiadau ar ddiwrnod arall. Golygai hynny y byddai'n rhaid i'r cynghorau hynny dalu'r holl gostau gan achosi cryn gost i drethdalwyr y cyngor lleol. A ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau ynglŷn â chynorthwyo cynghorau tref a chymuned o ran costau cynnal yr etholiadau?

Edwina Hart: Your points regarding cost were well made. I have not had specific discussions on this, but now that you have raised the issue, I will look into the matter. I will make the information about the costs involved available to Assembly Members.

Edwina Hart: Yr oedd eich pwyntiau ynglŷn â'r gost yn rhai da. Ni chefais unrhyw drafodaethau penodol am hyn, ond gan eich bod wedi codi'r mater, gwnaf ei ystyried. Sicrhaf y bydd yr wybodaeth ynglŷn â'r costau dan sylw ar gael i Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

9:15 a.m.

Yr Archwiliad Tai
The Housing Audit

Q4 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): A wnaiff Edwina Hart ddatganiad ar yr archwiliad tai? (OAQ8501)

Q4 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Will Edwina Hart make a statement on the housing audit? (OAQ8501)

Edwina Hart: The Welsh housing audit is well underway. We are supporting local authorities in carrying out assessments of their local housing needs and from January, we will support them to survey the condition of their own stock. Research projects to investigate the change in social housing demands will report soon and we have planned a major interview survey with householders and a linked stock condition survey in 2002. In addition, our Welsh housing audit advice services will report soon and the homelessness commission will begin its work shortly.

Edwina Hart: Mae'r archwiliad tai yng Nghymru wedi dechrau ers tro. Yr ydym yn helpu awdurdodau lleol i asesu eu hanghenion tai lleol ac, o fis Ionawr, byddwn yn eu helpu i arolygu cyflwr eu stoc eu hunain. Bydd prosiectau ymchwil ar y newid yng ngofynion tai cymdeithasol yn cyflwyno adroddiadau yn fuan a bwriadwn gynnal arolwg eang o gyfweliadau â deiliaid tai ac arolwg cysylltiedig o gyflwr y stoc yn 2002. Yn ogystal, bydd ein gwasanaethau cynghori ar yr archwiliad tai yng Nghymru yn cyflwyno adroddiad yn fuan a bydd comisiwn y digartref yn dechrau ei waith cyn bo hir.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): A yw Edwina'n derbyn ei bod yn

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Does Edwina accept that it is

bwysig i'r archwiliad hwn gynnwys arolwg o'r angen am dai mewn gwahanol ardaloedd yng Nghymru? A ydyw'n derbyn fod arnom angen strategaeth glir sydd yn seiliedig ar anghenion lleol ac, os ydym am ateb yr angen hwnnw, fod yr wybodaeth hon yn hanfodol? Mae'n siŵr gennyf y bydd Edwina'n cytuno â mi pan ddywedaf yr hoffwn weld tai ar gael i bobl ifanc mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

important that this audit contains a survey of the need for housing in different parts of Wales? Does she accept that we need a clear strategy based on local needs and, if we are to meet those needs, that this information is crucial? I am sure that Edwina will agree with me when I say that I would like to see houses available for young people in rural areas.

Edwina Hart: I agree with Ieuan that we need a clear strategy. I want to ensure that young people are not forced out of rural areas because of a lack of affordable housing. This is one of the issues that I am currently considering. I take on board Ieuan's points on examining housing issues, particularly within rural areas, but the all-Wales housing audit will give us an accurate picture of housing stock and housing needs. I will see what I can do to bring the two together.

Edwina Hart: Cytunaf â Ieuan fod angen strategaeth glir arnom. Yr wyf am sicrhau na orfodir pobl ifanc i symud o ardaloedd gwledig oherwydd diffyg tai fforddiadwy. Mae hwn yn un o'r materion yr wyf yn ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd. Derbyniaf bwyntiau Ieuan ynglŷn ag ystyried materion yn ymwneud â thai, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ond bydd yr archwiliad tai ar gyfer Cymru gyfan yn rhoi darlun cywir inni o'r stoc tai ac anghenion tai. Ystyriaf yr hyn y gallaf ei wneud i ddod â'r ddau ynghyd.

William Graham: Will the Minister confirm that schemes such as the home energy efficiency scheme are required because of the low quality of some houses in Wales and that a total picture of housing in Wales can only be realised by a national housing audit that should identify all properties adapted for disabled occupation?

William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau bod angen cynlluniau megis y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref oherwydd ansawdd gwael rhai tai yng Nghymru ac na ellir cael darlun cyfan o dai yng Nghymru ond drwy archwiliad tai cenedlaethol a ddylai nodi pob eiddo a addaswyd ar gyfer pobl anabl?

Edwina Hart: Yes. It is valid to consider disabled occupation because of the disabled statistics in Wales and the mobility problems. It is a key concern to us across parties and that was reflected in the short debate last week.

Edwina Hart: Gwnaf. Mae'n briodol ystyried preswyliaeth gan bobl anabl oherwydd yr ystadegau am bobl anabl yng Nghymru a'r problemau o ran symudedd. Mae'n bryder mawr i bob un o'r pleidiau ac adlewyrchwyd hynny yn y ddadl fer yr wythnos diwethaf.

Cynghorau Tref a Chymuned (Cynyddu'r Nifer)
Town and Community Councils (Increasing the Number)

Q5 Janet Ryder: Does Edwina Hart intend to ensure that the number of town and community councils is increased throughout Wales? (OAQ8496)

Q5 Janet Ryder: A yw Edwina Hart yn bwriadu sicrhau bod nifer y cynghorau tref a'r cynghorau cymuned yn cael eu cynyddu ledled Cymru? (OAQ8496)

I declare an interest.

Datganaf fuddiant.

Edwina Hart: Under the Local Government Act 1972, it is for individual towns and communities in Wales to decide by local referenda whether or not they want to have

Edwina Hart: O dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Leol 1972, rhaid i drefi a chymunedau unigol yng Nghymru benderfynu drwy refferenda lleol a ydynt am gael cyngor tref neu gyngor

town or community councils.

cymuned.

Janet Ryder: In the partnership agreement, you made a commitment to increase the coverage of town and community councils throughout Wales. How will you fulfil that promise?

Janet Ryder: Yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, gwnaethoch ymrwymiad i gynyddu nifer y cynghorau tref a chynghorau cymuned ledled Cymru. Sut y gwnewch gyflawni'r addewid hwnnw?

Edwina Hart: We will fulfil our promise by encouraging local democracy and recognising the valuable role of town and community councils. Local communities, using the democratic process, must make those decisions. We can lead the way by recognising the positive role of the community councils and town councils but it is up to the electorate to make the decision.

Edwina Hart: Cyflawnwn ein haddewid drwy annog democratiaeth leol a chydnabod rôl werthfawr cynghorau tref a chynghorau cymuned. Rhaid i gymunedau lleol, gan ddefnyddio'r broses ddemocrataidd, wneud y penderfyniadau hynny. Gallwn arwain y gad drwy gydnabod rôl adeiladol cynghorau tref a chynghorau cymuned ond yr etholwyr fydd yn gwneud y penderfyniad.

Rosemary Butler: Town councils, community councils and borough councils have an important job. Can the Minister help councils to work with the voluntary sector by examining ways to overcome the issue of voluntary groups having to pay for police checks?

Rosemary Butler: Mae gwaith pwysig gan gynghorau tref, cynghorau cymuned a chynghorau bwrdeistref. A all y Gweinidog helpu cynghorau i weithio gyda'r sector gwirfoddol drwy archwilio sut y gellir goresgyn y broblem o grwpiau gwirfoddol yn gorfod talu am wiriadau'r heddlu?

Edwina Hart: This issue has already been raised and there are concerns about it. I intend to take it forward and I will respond to the Assembly when I have further information. Voluntary organisations have been inundating Assembly Members with concerns on this issue and about the costs involved. I think it was William Graham who raised the issue of police checks in the Local Government and Housing Committee the other day.

Edwina Hart: Codwyd y mater hwn eisoes ac mae pryderon yn ei gylch. Bwriadaf weithredu arno a chynigiaf ateb i'r Cynulliad pan gaf ragor o wybodaeth. Mae sefydliadau gwirfoddol wedi bod yn cysylltu'n ddibaid ag Aelodau'r Cynulliad ynglŷn â'u pryderon ar y mater hwn a'r costau dan sylw. Credaf mai William Graham a gododd y mater o wiriadau'r heddlu yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai y diwrnod o'r blaen.

Tom Middlehurst: Do you agree that more does not necessarily mean better and that we must ensure that the existing network of town and community councils are effectively used and that we should examine some of the imaginative ways in which those councils are engaging with local authorities to ensure that we enhance the quality of the service it delivers for people in Wales?

Tom Middlehurst: A gytunwch nad yw mwy bob amser yn golygu gwell a bod rhaid inni sicrhau y defnyddir y rhwydwaith presennol o gynghorau tref a chynghorau cymuned yn effeithiol ac y dylem ystyried rhai o'r dulliau creadigol a ddefnyddir gan y cynghorau hynny i gysylltu ag awdurdodau lleol er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn gwella ansawdd y gwasanaeth a gyflwynir i bobl Cymru?

Edwina Hart: I agree with Tom that it is important that community councils are properly used and that their relationship with Welsh local government and their role and functions are clearly defined. Some

Edwina Hart: Cytunaf â Tom ei bod yn bwysig bod cynghorau cymuned yn cael eu defnyddio'n gywir a bod eu perthynas â llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru a'u rôl a'u swyddogaeth wedi eu diffinio'n glir. Mae

community councils are at a different stage of development to others; some perceive their role as more significant than others, some perceive it as very localised and others perceive it as being a more strategic role. It is important that the partnership council—when we have the documents from the town and community councils—starts to air some of the issues that are of concern to Members about the possible extension of community councils and their powers.

cynghorau cymuned ar gyfnodau gwahanol i'w gilydd yn eu datblygiad; mae rhai yn canfod bod ganddynt rôl fwy arwyddocaol nag eraill, mae rhai'n canfod mai rôl leol iawn sydd ganddynt tra bod eraill o'r farn mai rôl fwy strategol sydd ganddynt. Mae'n bwysig bod y cyngor partneriaeth—pan gawn y dogfennau gan y cynghorau tref a'r cynghorau cymuned—yn dechrau gwyntyllu rhai o'r materion sydd yn achosi pryder i'r Aelodau o ran y posibilrwydd o ymestyn cynghorau cymuned a'u pwerau.

Trethi Busnes i Fusnesau Gwledig
Business Rates for Rural Businesses

Q6 Mick Bates: What timetable has been allocated for the changes to business rates for rural businesses proposed in 'Putting Wales First'? (OAQ8446)

Q6 Mick Bates: Beth yw'r amserlen sydd wedi'i phennu ar gyfer cyflwyno'r newidiadau i'r trethi busnes ar fusnesau gwledig, fel yr argymhellir yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf'? (OAQ8446)

Edwina Hart: The rural rate relief scheme can play an important part in the partnership's commitment to rural life, rural communities and the rural economy. As part of our wider consultation on local government finance, we have said that we will consider extending the rural rate relief scheme to cover other types of businesses such as pubs and petrol stations. We are also consulting on a rate relief scheme to help farmers diversify into a wide range of non-agricultural activities. We are at the stage of considering some of the options realistically.

Edwina Hart: Gall y cynllun cymorth trethi gwledig chwarae rhan bwysig o ran ymrwymiad y bartneriaeth i fywyd gwledig, cymunedau gwledig a'r economi wledig. Fel rhan o'n hymgynghoriad ehangach ar gyllid llywodraeth leol, dywedasom y byddwn yn ystyried ymestyn y cynllun cymorth trethi gwledig i gwmpasu mathau eraill o fusnesau fel tafarndai a gorsafoedd petrol. Yr ydym hefyd yn ymgynghori ynglŷn â chynllun cymorth trethi i helpu ffermwyr i arallgyfeirio i ystod eang o weithgareddau nad ydynt yn ymwneud ag amaethyddiaeth. Yr ydym erbyn hyn yn ystyried rhai o'r opsiynau o ddifrif.

Mick Bates: It is a great relief to me that this scheme may be extended to rural garages, a great many of which, unfortunately, have been lost. Will you confirm that rural pharmacists will also be part of that review?

Mick Bates: Mae'n rhyddhad mawr imi fod posibilrwydd y caiff y cynllun hwn ei ymestyn i fodurdai gwledig, er y collwyd llawer ohonynt eisoes yn anffodus. A gadarnhewch y bydd fferyllwyr gwledig hefyd yn rhan o'r adolygiad hwnnw?

Edwina Hart: I would be happy to look at this issue for you, Mick. There are significant issues that we must consider, not only in rural areas but also in isolated urban areas. Keeping village infrastructures is an issue that is not confined to rural Wales; it is also relevant to villages in the Valleys.

Edwina Hart: Byddwn yn fodlon edrych ar y mater hwn ichi, Mick. Mae materion arwyddocaol y mae'n rhaid inni eu hystyried, nid yn unig mewn ardaloedd gwledig ond hefyd mewn ardaloedd trefol anghysbell. Mae cadw isadeileddau pentrefi yn fater nad yw'n ymwneud â Chymru wledig yn unig; mae hefyd yn berthnasol i bentrefi yn y Cymoedd.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Minister, as you know, the Welsh Conservative Party has been calling for some time for an extension of rural rate relief. It was, of course, introduced by William Hague and announced at Hundred House in Radnorshire. When can you announce the parameters of the scheme so that rural businesses—I am keen to hear about the possibility for pharmacists—are aware of the scheme? Businesses that are already closing—and they are closing by the bucketful, to use a phrase that has been used previously—need to be aware of the parameters and how they may be helped. It may stop the Labour Party and its Liberal Democrat allies losing quite as many council seats in the council elections.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru wedi bod yn galw am ymestyn cymorth trethi busnes ers tro. Cafodd ei gyflwyno gan William Hague a'i gyhoeddi yn y Hundred House yn Sir Faesyfed. Pryd y gallwch gyhoeddi terfynau'r cynllun fel y gall busnesau gwledig—yr wyf yn awyddus i glywed am y posibiliad ar gyfer fferyllwyr—gael gwybod am y cynllun? Mae angen i fusnesau sydd eisoes yn cau—ac mae pentyrrau ohonynt yn cau, gan ddefnyddio ymadrodd a ddefnyddiwyd yn gynharach—fod yn ymwybodol o'r terfynau a pha gymorth a gânt. Efallai y bydd yn atal y Blaid Lafur a'i chynghreiriaid ymysg y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol rhag colli cynifer o swyddi cynghorwyr mewn etholiadau cyngor.

Edwina Hart: It is a shame that you spoilt a valuable question with a cheap remark. Issues relating to post offices, petrol stations and small businesses are vital in Wales. Mandatory relief—50 per cent of the bill—is already available to post offices or general stores with a rateable value of £5,000 or less in the qualifying rules settlement. The population figure is less than 3,000. Councils have the discretion to top up mandatory relief up to 100 per cent; the pool meets 75 per cent of the cost and the council funds the remaining 25 per cent. These are relevant issues of which the Assembly should be aware. Councils also have discretion to grant relief to any other rural businesses with a rateable value of less than £10,000, provided the business provides a vital service for the local community. That is an issue that brings in a whole range of other aspects. Again, the pool meets 75 per cent of the cost, but only 11 of the 22 Welsh authorities give discretionary relief. That is also an issue.

Edwina Hart: Mae'n drueni ichi ddifetha cwestiwn gwerthfawr drwy wneud sylw diwerth. Mae materion sydd yn ymwneud â swyddfeydd post, gorsafoedd petrol a busnesau bach yn hanfodol yng Nghymru. Mae cymorth gorfodol—sef 50 y cant o'r bil—ar gael eisoes i swyddfeydd post neu siopau nwyddau cyffredinol sydd â gwerth trethiannol o £5,000 neu lai yn setliad y rheolau ymgymhwyso. Mae ffigur y boblogaeth yn llai na 3,000. Mae cynghorau yn rhydd i gynyddu'r cymorth gorfodol hyd at 100 y cant; mae'r gronfa yn talu 75 y cant o'r gost ac mae'r cyngor yn talu'r 25 y cant arall. Mae'r rhain yn faterion perthnasol y dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn ymwybodol ohonynt. Mae gan y Cynghorau ddisgresiwn hefyd i roi cymorth i unrhyw fusnesau gwledig sydd â gwerth trethiannol o dan £10,000, ar yr amod bod y busnes yn darparu gwasanaeth hanfodol i'r gymuned leol. Mae hwnnw'n fater sydd yn arwain at ystod eang o agweddau eraill. Unwaith eto, mae'r gronfa yn talu 75 y cant o'r gost, ond dim ond 11 o blith y 22 awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru a rydd gymorth dewisol. Mae hwnnw hefyd yn bwynt.

We wrote to councils and the Welsh Local Government Association on 8 November seeking their views as to how we might encourage greater use of the discretionary relief for small rural businesses. I hope that in the new year I will be able to bring all these

Ysgrifenasom at y cynghorau a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar 8 Tachwedd i geisio eu barn ynghylch sut y gallem annog mwy o ddefnydd o'r cymorth dewisol i fusnesau bach gwledig. Gobeithiaf y gallaf dynnu'r holl agweddau hyn ynghyd yn y

strands together and report to the Assembly on a way forward.

flwyddyn newydd a rhoi adroddiad i'r Cynulliad ar ffordd ymlaen.

Inswleiddio Cartrefi
Home Insulation

Q7 Jocelyn Davies: Will home insulation be used in the energy efficiency scheme? (OAQ8504)

Q7 Jocelyn Davies: A fydd inswleiddio cartrefi yn cael ei ddefnyddio yn y cynllun effeithiolrwydd ynni? (OAQ8504)

Edwina Hart: Yes. As both Peter Black and I have stated in Plenary, most recently on 21 November, and as is detailed on the Assembly intranet, the scheme includes a range of domestic insulation measures, which are available now, and central heating, which will be available from February 2001.

Edwina Hart: Bydd. Fel yr wyf fi a Peter Black wedi nodi mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn, yn fwyaf diweddar ar 21 Tachwedd, ac fel y nodwyd ar fewnrwyd y Cynulliad, mae'r cynllun hwn yn cynnwys ystod o fesurau inswleiddio cartrefi, sydd ar gael erbyn hyn, a gwres canolog, a fydd ar gael o Chwefror 2001.

Jocelyn Davies: Do you agree that installing central heating is not efficient if houses are not well insulated? Would not insulation not only benefit the householder but also go some small way towards addressing global warming?

Jocelyn Davies: A gytunwch nad yw gosod gwres canolog yn effeithlon os nad yw'r tai wedi eu hinswleiddio'n dda? Oni fyddai inswleiddio nid yn unig o fudd i ddeiliad y tŷ ond hefyd yn helpu rhywfaint i ddatrys cynhesu bydeang?

Edwina Hart: The issue of insulation is intrinsically linked to that of central heating. Global warming is very much on our minds with the flooding across Wales. It is something that we need to bear it in mind in the context of this scheme.

Edwina Hart: Mae mater inswleiddio yn annatod yn gysylltiedig â mater gwres canolog. Ni allwn anghofio cynhesu bydeang yn sgîl y llifogydd ar draws Cymru. Mae'n rhywbeth y mae angen inni ei gofio yng nghyd-destun y cynllun hwn.

David Davies: Will the Minister congratulate the previous Government, which brought in the home energy efficiency scheme? Does the Minister accept that homes that have been flooded are not energy efficient? Is she aware of the existence of artificial flood barriers that have been tested by the Environment Agency and found to be far more effective than sandbags? What will she do to ensure that there is adequate funding to enable these barriers to be distributed?

David Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog longyfarch y Llywodraeth flaenorol, a gyflwynodd y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref? A dderbynia'r Gweinidog nad yw cartrefi a ddioddefodd lifogydd yn gartrefi ynni effeithlon? A yw'n ymwybodol o fodolaeth y rhwystrau artiffisial rhag llifogydd a brofwyd gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a chanfyddwyd eu bod yn llawer llai effeithiol na bagiau tywod? Beth a wna er mwyn sicrhau bod digon o arian i alluogi dosbarthu'r rhwystrau hyn?

Edwina Hart: I will take your question as a supplementary because of your concerns about your Monmouth constituency. You raised grave concerns in the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee meeting yesterday about flooding and so on in that area. I am aware of the issue to which you referred because I have discussed the barriers

Edwina Hart: Cymeraf eich cwestiwn fel un atodol oherwydd eich pryderon ynghylch eich etholaeth, sef Sir Fynwy. Codasoch bryderon difrifol yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ddoe ynghylch llifogydd ac ati yn yr ardal honno. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r mater y cyfeiriasoch ato am fy mod wedi trafod y

with Sue Essex, and I will consider it.

rhwystrau â Sue Essex, ac fe'i hystyriaf.

The Presiding Officer: Edwina did not have to answer that question. It was slightly wide of the issue of home energy efficiency, but I will let that go for today.

Y Llywydd: Nid oedd rhaid i Edwina ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw. Yr oedd braidd yn bell o fater effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, ond gadawaf hynny am heddiw.

9:25 a.m.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd
Questions to the Minister for Environment

Cynlluniau Ynni Adnewyddadwy (Galw Ceisiadau Cynllunio i Mewn)
Renewable Energy Schemes (Calling in Planning Applications)

Q1 Glyn Davies: What is the Minister for Environment's policy on calling in planning applications for the development of schemes that produce renewable energy in Wales? (OAQ8463)

C1 Glyn Davies: Beth yw polisi'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ar alw ceisiadau cynllunio i mewn i ddatblygu cynlluniau sydd yn cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru? (OAQ8463)

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): The prime consideration on whether to call in a planning application is whether or not the proposed development is of more than local importance. The criteria used in reaching each decision were set out in an answer to a written Assembly question, WAQ1415, on 5 October 1999. The call-in procedures are being looked at afresh and I intend to keep policy in this area under regular review.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Y brif ystyriaeth wrth benderfynu a ddylid galw cais cynllunio i mewn yw a yw'r datblygiad arfaethedig o bwys y tu allan i'r ardal leol. Nodwyd y meini prawf a ddefnyddir wrth wneud penderfyniad mewn ateb i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig y Cynulliad, WAQ1415 ar 5 Hydref 1999. Mae'r gweithdrefnau galw cais i mewn yn cael eu hadolygu o'r newydd a bwriadaf adolygu'r polisi yn y maes hwn yn rheolaidd.

Glyn Davies: I am pleased that you are reviewing policy. However, all I want from you today is a guarantee that decisions to call in will be made on the basis of judgement, against your calling-in criteria, not on the basis of lobbying from organisations seeking to undermine the right of local planning authorities to take decisions locally on applications that should not be called in.

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich bod yn adolygu'r polisi. Fodd bynnag, y cyfan yr wyf am ei glywed gennych heddiw yw sicrwydd y caiff penderfyniadau i alw i mewn eu gwneud ar sail barn, yn ôl eich meini prawf ar gyfer galw i mewn, nid ar sail lobïo gan sefydliadau sydd yn ceisio tanseilio hawl awdurdodau cynllunio lleol i wneud penderfyniadau yn lleol ar geisiadau na ddylid eu galw i mewn.

Sue Essex: I assure you that all the decisions that I take to call in applications—and bear in mind that I get many requests for that—are looked at carefully and taken in terms of the criteria. I give you that assurance. The overwhelming majority of planning applications are still taken by the local authorities, which, as you say, is right and proper. They are the relevant local planning authorities.

Sue Essex: Fe'ch sicrhaf fod pob penderfyniad a wnaf i alw ceisiadau i mewn—a chofiwch imi gael llawer o geisiadau am hynny—yn cael eu hystyried yn ofalus a'u gwneud yn ôl y meini prawf. Rhoddaf y sicrwydd hwnnw ichi. Yr awdurdodau lleol sydd yn penderfynu ar y mwyafrif llethol o geisiadau cynllunio o hyd, a hynny'n gwbl briodol, fel y dywedwch. Hwy yw'r awdurdodau cynllunio lleol

perthnasol.

Cynog Dafis: Mae cynrychiolwyr o'r diwydiant ynni gwynt yn siomedig eich bod wedi canslo eich cyfarfod gyda hwy yn ddiweddar. Iddynt hwy, yr oedd hynny'n cadarnhau'r canfyddiad bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn elyniaethus neu, o leiaf, yn glaear, tuag at y diwydiant hwnnw. A ddatganwch yn glir eich bod yn derbyn bod ynni adnewyddadwy yn ddiwydiant sydd o'r pwys mwyaf, bod yn rhaid sicrhau twf deinamig yn y sector hwn, a'ch bod yn benderfynol o ddatrys y broblem gynllunio sydd yn bygwth parhad a llwyddiant rhai cwmnïau Cymreig ac sydd yn faen tramgwydd anferth i dwf economaidd? A ddywedwch sut a phryd y byddwch yn mynd datrys y broblem honno?

Cynog Dafis: Representatives of the wind power industry were disappointed that you cancelled your meeting with them recently. In their eyes, that confirmed the perception that the Government of Wales is hostile or, at least, lukewarm towards that industry. Will you state clearly that you accept that renewable energy is an industry of fundamental importance, that we must ensure dynamic growth in this sector, and that you are determined to solve the planning problem that threatens the existence and success of some Welsh companies and is a massive stumbling block to economic growth? Will you state how and when you will resolve that problem?

Sue Essex: During the recent debate on sustainable development, I mentioned the working group that I was establishing to see through planning guidance, and the technical advice note, in particular. Although that may take a couple of months, it will be the basis for speeding up decisions. I have been concerned that we have not had spatial guidance underpinning planning applications and decisions. That has not been put in place but it needs to be done speedily, not only for wind energy but also for other areas. It is on that basis that the working group was formed. It includes people who represent wind energy. The instruction is to get cracking on that. I think that invitations were sent out and a date has been set—I will check that after this meeting—and I hope that that will allow us to catch up on time that has been lost.

Sue Essex: Yn ystod y ddadl ddiweddar ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, soniais am y gweithgor yr oeddwn yn ei sefydlu er mwyn cwblhau'r arweiniad cynllunio, a'r nodyn cyngor technegol, yn arbennig. Er y cymer hynny ychydig fisoedd o bosibl, bydd yn rhoi'r sylfaen dros gyflymu'r broses gwneud penderfyniadau. Bûm yn pryderu nad oedd gennym arweiniad gofodol fel sail i'r ceisiadau a phenderfyniadau cynllunio. Ni fu hynny ar waith ond mae angen ei wneud yn fuan, nid yn unig o ran ynni gwynt ond ar gyfer meysydd eraill hefyd. Dyna paham y sefydlwyd y gweithgor. Mae'n cynnwys pobl sydd yn cynrychioli'r diwydiant ynni gwynt. Y gorchymyn yw bwrw iddi. Credaf fod gwahoddiadau wedi eu hanfon a bod dyddiad wedi ei bennu—cadarnhaf hynny ar ôl y cyfarfod hwn—a gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n caniatáu inni wneud yn iawn am yr amser a gollwyd.

Some applications have been approved. We now see many windfarms around the countryside. I would like to see wind energy being used in Cardiff Bay, on the coast and on the barrage. Let us make the barrage useful. There are many areas where we can consider using wind energy, which may not have been areas of prime consideration in the past. I hope that we will move on speedily.

Cymeradwywyd rhai ceisiadau. Erbyn hyn gwelwn lawer o ffermydd gwynt yng nghefn gwlad. Hoffwn weld ynni gwynt yn cael ei ddefnyddio ym Mae Caerdydd, ar yr arfordir ac ar y morglawdd. Gadewch inni wneud defnydd o'r morglawdd. Mae llawer o ardaloedd lle y gallwn ystyried defnyddio ynni gwynt, nad ydynt o bosibl yn ardaloedd a gafodd brif ystyriaeth yn y gorffennol. Gobeithiaf y symudwn ymlaen yn gyflym.

Fframwaith Trafnidiaeth Cenedlaethol i Gymru
National Transport Framework for Wales

Q2 Helen Mary Jones: Will Sue Essex report on the progress made towards developing a national transport framework for Wales? (OAQ8515)

C2 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff Sue Essex adrodd ar y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd tuag at ddatblygu fframwaith trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol i Gymru? (OAQ8515)

Sue Essex: The outline of the draft framework was endorsed by the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee meeting on 29 November in north Wales, and the draft will be subject to consultation and debate in the new year. I hope to finalise the framework before the summer.

Sue Essex: Cymeradwywyd amlinelliad y fframwaith drafft gan gyfarfod o Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ar 29 Tachwedd yn y gogledd, a bydd y drafft yn destun ymgynghoriad a dadl yn y flwyddyn newydd. Gobeithiaf y byddaf yn cwblhau'r fframwaith yn derfynol cyn yr haf.

Helen Mary Jones: Do you agree that it will be virtually impossible to fulfil the Assembly's long-term sustainable transport aims without further powers being transferred from Westminster and, particularly, that the responsibility for railways should be transferred as soon as possible?

Helen Mary Jones: A gytunwch y bydd yn amhosibl bron i gyflawni nodau tymor hir y Cynulliad o ran trafnidiaeth gynaliadwy heb i bwerau pellach gael eu trosglwyddo o San Steffan ac, yn arbennig, y dylid trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros y rheilffyrdd cyn gynted â phosibl?

Sue Essex: At the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee meeting yesterday, during the session on public transport, there was a discussion about the powers that are needed. We have some but we do not have others. Those of us who sat on the former Local Government and Environment Committee—myself, Brian, Owen and Janet—will remember that the report from that Committee, which I chaired, looked for more powers in the Transport Bill. I hope that, as a result of this present study, we will be able to put forward a view of what extra powers—if that is what the Committee wants—we will need in the future.

Sue Essex: Yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ddoe, yn ystod y sesiwn ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, bu trafodaeth ynghylch y pwerau sydd eu hangen. Mae rhai gennym ond nid oes rhai eraill gennym. Bydd y rhai ohonom a oedd yn aelodau o gyn-Bwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd—minnau, Brian, Owen a Janet—yn cofio bod adroddiad y Pwyllgor, a gadeiriais, yn gofyn am ragor o bwerau yn y Mesur Trafnidiaeth. Gobeithiaf, o ganlyniad i'r astudiaeth bresennol, y gallwn gyflwyno barn ynghylch pa bwerau ychwanegol—os mai hynny yw dymuniad y Pwyllgor—y bydd eu hangen arnom yn y dyfodol.

David Davies: Does the Minister accept that the introduction of proper speed restrictions on trunk roads that run through villages is an important part of any transport framework? Will she consider the villagers of Llanellen in Monmouthshire, who have been campaigning for years for a speed limit of 40 miles an hour through their village? Despite promises from the Government of Wales that such a limit would be introduced, they are still waiting. Will she consider this matter and find out why it has taken so long and ask one of her officials to contact me with a timetable for when that speed limit will be introduced?

David Davies: A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn bod cyflwyno cyfyngiadau cyflymder priodol ar gefnffyrdd drwy bentrefi yn rhan bwysig o unrhyw fframwaith trafnidiaeth? A wnaiff ystyried pentrefwyr Llanellen yn Sir Fynwy, a fu'n ymgyrchu am derfyn cyflymder o 40 milltir yr awr drwy eu pentref ers blynyddoedd? Er gwaethaf addewidion gan Lywodraeth Cymru y byddai'n cyflwyno terfyn o'r fath, maent yn aros o hyd. A wnaiff ystyried y mater hwn a darganfod pam y cymerodd cyhyd a gofyn i un o'i swyddogion gysylltu â mi gan ddweud pryd y caiff y terfyn cyflymder hwnnw ei gyflwyno?

Sue Essex: The letter is on its way, David. It concerns the programme for traffic calming that Peter Law introduced. As I explained, there are legal necessities to be completed before that can be imposed. That is the Llanellen situation. I would be happy to meet you on site if that would help because I know that you, the local residents and MPs are concerned. Speed restrictions are important. I have received letters from many Members who represent rural areas about the inconsistencies in speed restrictions on trunk roads. I am concerned about it. A study is underway which must be consistent. I am particularly concerned that if matters are unachievable, we do not reduce speed restrictions. We should start from the opposite direction of knowing what speed limits we want in terms of safety, and then ensure that we achieve those limits. That work is ongoing.

Sue Essex: Mae llythyr ar y ffordd, David. Mae'n ymwneud â'r rhaglen lleddfu traffig a gyflwynodd Peter Law. Fel y nodais, mae camau cyfreithiol y mae'n rhaid eu cymryd cyn y gellir ei sefydlu. Dyna sefyllfa Llanellen. Byddwn yn fodlon cyfarfod â chi ar y safle pe bai hynny o gymorth am fy mod yn gwybod eich bod chi, y trigolion lleol a'r ASau yn pryderu. Mae cyfyngiadau cyflymder yn bwysig. Cefais lythyrau gan lawer o'r Aelodau sydd yn cynrychioli ardaloedd gwledig am yr anghysondebau o ran cyfyngiadau cyflymder ar gefnffyrdd. Yr wyf yn pryderu am hynny. Mae astudiaeth ar y gweill ac mae'n rhaid ei bod yn gyson. Yr hyn sydd yn fy mhryderu'n arbennig yw nad ydym yn gostwng cyfyngiadau cyflymder os nad oes modd datrys materion. Dylem ddechrau o'r pen arall o wybod pa gyfyngiadau cyflymder yr ydym am eu cael ac yna sicrhau ein bod yn cyflwyno'r cyfyngiadau hynny. Mae'r gwaith hwn yn mynd rhagddo.

The Presiding Officer: That was another excellent Christmas supplementary, David.

Y Llywydd: Yr oedd hwnnw yn gwestiwn atodol Nadoligaidd rhagorol arall, David.

Sue Essex: The Labour Party always offers the spirit of good will to the Welsh Conservatives at Christmas.

Sue Essex: Mae'r Blaid Lafur bob amser yn cynnig ewyllys da i Geidwadwyr Cymru ar adeg y Nadolig.

Gweithredu Adroddiad Babtie
Implementing the Babtie Report

Q3 Kirsty Williams: Will the Minister give a brief statement on progress made in implementing the Babtie report? (OAQ8474)

C3 Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff Sue Essex ddatganiad byr ar y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd wrth weithredu adroddiad Babtie? (OAQ8474)

Sue Essex: The Babtie report on north-south links, to which you refer, was received by the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee on 16 June. The report helps to inform discussions on the need to improve transport communications in Wales. The study contributes to the transport framework already mentioned.

Sue Essex: Derbyniodd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth adroddiad Babtie, y cyfeiriwch ato, ar y cysylltiadau rhwng y gogledd a'r de ar 16 Mehefin. Mae'r adroddiad yn helpu i lywio'r trafodaethau am yr angen i wella cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'r astudiaeth yn cyfrannu at y fframwaith trafnidiaeth y cyfeiriwyd ato eisoes.

Kirsty Williams: Given the fact that we went to the trouble and expense of commissioning this report, do you not think that the time has now come to act upon it,

Kirsty Williams: O ystyried y ffaith inni fynd i'r drafferth a'r gost o gomisiynu'r adroddiad hwn, oni chredwch ei bod yn bryd inni weithredu arno bellach, ac wrth wneud

and in doing so, to improve the integration of public transport in rural areas? That would provide relief for those living in communities such as Newbridge on Wye, Rhayader and Builth Wells and improve the bypasses for those towns.

hynny, wella'r modd yr integreiddir trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus mewn ardaloedd gwledig? Byddai hynny o gymorth i'r rhai sydd yn byw mewn cymunedau fel y Bontnewydd ar Wy, Rhaeadr a Llanfair ym Muallt ac yn gwella'r ffyrdd osgoi i'r trefi hynny.

Sue Essex: It was an important report, but you only mention one aspect. There was considerable discussion in Committee. Not all Members agreed with the conclusions. Members' comments would inform this. As you heard in my previous answer, it will be part of the transport framework in the new year.

Sue Essex: Yr oedd yn adroddiad pwysig, ond dim ond un agwedd arno y cyfeiriwch ati. Bu cryn drafodaeth yn y Pwyllgor. Nid oedd pob Aelod yn cytuno ar y casgliadau. Bydd sylwadau'r Aelodau yn cadarnhau hynny. Fel y clywsoch yn fy ateb blaenorol, bydd yn rhan o'r fframwaith trafnidiaeth yn y flwyddyn newydd.

Nick Bourne: The Babtie report outlines the need to review, among other things, the Rhayader, Newtown and Llanrwst bypass schemes. Could you comment on any such review and reassure the people of those towns who are suffering without bypasses, and whose economy is also suffering?

Nick Bourne: Mae adroddiad Babtie, ymhlith pethau eraill, yn amlinellu'r angen i adolygu cynlluniau ffyrdd osgoi Rhaeadr, y Bontnewydd ar Wy a Llanrwst. A allwch gynnig sylwadau ar unrhyw adolygiad o'r fath a sicrhau pobl y trefi hynny sydd yn dioddef oherwydd diffyg ffyrdd osgoi, ac y mae eu heconomi yn dioddef hefyd?

Sue Essex: I appreciate that there are difficulties throughout mid Wales with communities in need of regeneration that have problems with traffic. However, it would be wrong if I concentrated on one or two communities in this debate. There are several communities across Wales that I need to consider thoroughly and rationally.

Sue Essex: Gwerthfawrogaf fod anawsterau ledled canolbarth Cymru o ran cymunedau y mae angen eu hadfywio sydd â phroblemau traffig. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai'n iawn imi ganolbwyntio ar un neu ddwy o gymunedau yn y ddadl hon. Mae sawl cymuned ledled Cymru y mae angen imi ei hystyried yn drylwyr ac yn rhesymegol.

Tom Middlehurst: You will be aware of the concerns expressed by the North Wales Economic Forum with regard to the validity of some of the findings in the Babtie report. Will you give an assurance that the Babtie report will not be used as a definitive document in arriving at the decisions that need to be taken to improve the transport links between north and south Wales, with particular regard to the future of rail transport?

Tom Middlehurst: Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon a fynegodd Fforwm Economaidd Gogledd Cymru ynghylch dilysrwydd rhai o ganfyddiadau adroddiad Babtie. A wnewch sicrhau na chaiff adroddiad Babtie ei ddefnyddio fel dogfen ddiffiniol wrth wneud y penderfyniadau y mae angen eu gwneud er mwyn gwella'r cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth rhwng y gogledd a'r de, gan ystyried yn arbennig ddyfodol trafnidiaeth ar y rheilffyrdd?

Sue Essex: I hinted at that in my answer to Kirsty. There were contrasting views about the conclusions of the Babtie report. There were also different views about the research that was undertaken. I know that that is particularly true of the North Wales Economic Forum. I hope to meet them in the new year to discuss that. It is important that

Sue Essex: Lledawgrymais hynny yn fy ateb i Kirsty. Cafwyd gwahaniaeth barn ynghylch casgliadau adroddiad Babtie. Cafwyd gwahaniaeth barn hefyd ynghylch yr ymchwil a wnaethpwyd. Gwn fod hynny'n arbennig o wir o safbwynt Fforwm Economaidd Gogledd Cymru. Gobeithiaf gyfarfod â hwy yn y flwyddyn newydd i

the framework has all that information and considers the balanced route. You cannot always please everybody in this game, but we need to listen and ensure that those views are considered.

drafod hynny. Mae'n bwysig i'r fframwaith gael yr holl wybodaeth honno ac ystyried y llwybr cytbwys. Ni allwch fodloni pawb bob amser yn y byd hwn, ond mae angen inni wrando a sicrhau y gwrandewir ar y safbwyntiau hynny.

Janet Ryder: Further to that reply, the north-south links are crucial to creating a Welsh nation. Can you assure us that there will be a move on this to improve the road and rail links, thereby creating greater coherence between north and south Wales?

Janet Ryder: Ymhellach i'r ateb hwnnw, mae'r cysylltiadau rhwng y gogledd a'r de yn hanfodol i greu cenedl Gymreig. A allwch ein sicrhau y bydd gweithredu ar hyn er mwyn gwella cysylltiadau'r ffyrdd a'r rheilffyrdd, a thrwy hynny greu gwell cydlyniad rhwng y gogledd a'r de?

9:35 a.m.

Sue Essex: I will focus on rail because Tom also mentioned that. In the franchise there is an additional north-south train service into which we invest a considerable amount of money. It is a successful service and I am looking forward to seeing the related figures. In the draft document that we hope will inform the franchise, we will outline an expansion of the north-south Wales links, which are becoming increasingly important. I hope that we all use the current service. Mike German told me that it was extremely useful for travelling back and forth. We are trying to remove perceptions that that route is not useable. It works well and is one of the most regular services. I hope that Dafydd Wigley agrees—he looked at me slightly askance. Feedback from people in the Wrexham area showed that it was a useful service and I hope that we can build on that.

Sue Essex: Canolbwyntiaf ar y rheilffyrdd gan fod Tom hefyd wedi cyfeirio atynt. Yn y fasnachfraint ceir gwasanaeth rheilffordd ychwanegol rhwng y gogledd a'r de y gallwn fuddsoddi cryn dipyn ynddo. Mae'n wasanaeth llwyddiannus ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld y ffigurau perthnasol. Yn y ddogfen ddrafft a fydd yn llywio'r fasnachfraint, gobeithio, byddwn yn nodi ymestyniad i'r cysylltiadau rhwng y de a'r gogledd, sydd yn dod yn fwyfwy pwysig. Gobeithiaf ein bod oll yn defnyddio'r gwasanaeth presennol. Dywedodd Mike German wrthyf ei fod yn hynod o ddefnyddiol wrth deithio yn ôl ac ymlaen. Yr ydym yn ceisio dileu'r canfyddiad nad oes modd defnyddio'r llwybr. Mae'n gweithio'n dda ac mae'n un o'r gwasanaethau mwyaf rheolaidd. Gobeithiaf fod Dafydd Wigley yn cytuno—edrychodd braidd yn amheus arnaf. Dengys adborth gan bobl ardal Wrecsam ei fod yn wasanaeth defnyddiol a gobeithiaf y gallwn adeiladu ar hynny.

Hybu Teithio mewn Bysiau yng Nghymru
Promoting Bus Travel in Wales

Q4 Richard Edwards: How will Sue Essex promote more bus travel in Wales? (OAQ8465)

C4 Richard Edwards: Sut y bydd Sue Essex yn hybu rhagor o deithio mewn bysiau yng Nghymru? (OAQ8465)

Sue Essex: We have a series of measures to do that. First, the bus subsidy grant, which was £5 million this year, is increased in the draft budget over the next three years. Bus fuel duty rebate is currently at a rate of 36 pence per litre. Therefore, £13 million was

Sue Essex: Mae gennym gyfres o fesurau i wneud hynny. Yn gyntaf, bydd cynnydd yn y cymhorthdal grant i fysiau, sef £5 miliwn eleni, yn y gyllideb ddrafft dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Rhoddir ad-daliad toll tanwydd ar hyn o bryd ar gyfradd o 36

allocated to bus operators this year. The transport grant is available to help fund public transport by using bus priority lanes and so on, as well as offering the information system—Passenger Transport Information, PTI Cymru, which provides information on bus availability.

ceiniog y litr. Felly, dyrannwyd £13 miliwn i'r cwmnïau bysiau eleni. Mae'r grant trafnidiaeth ar gael i helpu i ariannu trafnidiaeth drwy ddefnyddio lonydd blaenoriaeth i fysiau ac ati, yn ogystal â rhoi'r system wybodaeth—Gwybodaeth Drafnidiaeth i Deithwyr, PTI Cymru, sydd yn rhoi gwybodaeth am amseroedd bysiau.

Richard Edwards: I welcome the positive initiatives that you have taken, but as you know, in a largely rural area like Pembrokeshire, bus travel is a big problem, which worsened after the deregulation policy of the last, unlamented Conservative Government. Aside from availability and frequency of service, there is a problem of physical accessibility for disabled travellers, especially wheelchair users. For example, there is lack of low floor buses in Pembrokeshire. What can you do to encourage more accessible as well as more regular services?

Richard Edwards: Croesawaf y camau cadarnhaol a gymerasoch, ond fel y gwyddoch, mewn ardal sydd yn wledig gan mwyaf fel Sir Benfro, mae teithio ar y bws yn broblem fawr, sydd wedi gwaethygu yn sgîl polisi dadreoleiddio'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddi-alar-amdani ddiwethaf. Ar wahân i'r mater o ba mor hygyrch neu aml yw'r gwasanaeth, mae problem hygyrchedd corfforol i deithwyr anabl, yn enwedig rhai sydd yn defnyddio cadeiriau olwyn. Er enghraifft, mae diffyg bysiau â lloriau isel yn Sir Benfro. Beth allwch ei wneud i annog gwasanaethau mwy hygyrch yn ogystal â gwasanaethau mwy rheolaidd?

Sue Essex: I know that your concern stems from the points that you made in your very good short debate last week. We sometimes forget about financial accessibility. We have introduced concessionary fares and free bus passes for disabled people as well as pensioners. The cost of transport on commercial routes in rural areas is particularly worrying. On physical accessibility, the Act is looking to address requirements for new buses, but I know that you refer to the fact that old buses are used in many rural areas, and it is unlikely that new buses will be used for some time. We need to consider that in conjunction with the Committee's report on public transport. William Bee from the Disability Rights Commission gave a good presentation recently on staged response, which would consider bus stops and a range of things that need to be done. It would be helpful to incorporate those points into the transport framework following the Committee's report.

Sue Essex: Gwn fod eich pryderon yn deillio o'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch yn eich dadl fer ardderchog yr wythnos diwethaf. Anghofiwn weithiau am hygyrchedd ariannol. Cyflwynasom brisiau gostyngol a thocynnau teithio am ddim i bobl anabl yn ogystal â phensiynwyr. Mae cost trafnidiaeth ar lwybrau masnachol mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn achos pryder arbennig. O ran hygyrchedd corfforol, mae'r Ddeddf am ystyried sut i fynd i'r afael â'r gofynion ar gyfer bysiau newydd, ond gwn eich bod yn cyfeirio at y ffaith y defnyddir hen fysiau mewn llawer o ardaloedd gwledig, ac mae'n annhebygol y caiff bysiau newydd eu defnyddio am beth amser. Mae angen inni ystyried hynny ar y cyd ag adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Rhoddodd William Bee o Gomisiwn Hawliau'r Anabl gyflwyniad da yn ddiweddar ar ymateb fesul cam, a fyddai'n ystyried arosfannau bysiau ac ystod o bethau y mae angen eu gwneud. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol ymgorffori'r pwyntiau hynny yn y fframwaith trafnidiaeth yn dilyn adroddiad y Pwyllgor.

Peter Rogers: Any bus service needs passengers, which is dependent on people living and working in communities. Given that, do you agree that your decision to

Peter Rogers: Mae angen teithwyr ar unrhyw wasanaeth bws, sydd yn ddibynnol ar bobl yn byw ac yn gweithio mewn cymunedau. O ystyried hynny, a gytunwch y

continuously call in planning applications of businesses seeking to contribute to the local economy will mean that less people will be living and working in these areas, particularly in north Wales?

bydd eich penderfyniad i alw ceisiadau cynllunio i mewn drwy'r amser gan fusnesau sydd yn ceisio cyfrannu at yr economi leol yn golygu y bydd llai o bobl yn byw ac yn gweithio yn yr ardaloedd hyn, yn enwedig yn y gogledd?

Sue Essex: I do not continuously call in business applications. If you consider the list of applications and permissions granted in north Wales, it is clear that that does not happen. Many requests come to me, which Peter does not see, for quite significant schemes, which I do not call in. I have only called in some applications of national importance.

Sue Essex: Ni alwaf geisiadau busnes i mewn drwy'r amser. Os ystyriwch y rhestr o geisiadau a chaniatadau a roddwyd yng ngogledd Cymru, mae'n amlwg na ddigwydd hynny. Cyflwynir llawer o geisiadau imi, nad yw Peter yn eu gweld, am gynlluniau eithaf arwyddocaol, nad wyf yn eu galw i mewn. Dim ond ceisiadau o bwys cenedlaethol a alwn i mewn.

I pay tribute to the north Wales authorities that have conceived the bus quality partnership. In north-west Wales in particular, there are excellent schemes and a real attempt to get buses round the communities to provide accessibility for people in rural areas. I compliment that and hope that those schemes will continue. The other point, and I know that The Isle of Anglesey County Council has been working on this, is to consider future settlement policies so that public transport routes can be married to settlement development. That is the key to supporting commercially-run routes in rural and quasi-rural areas.

Talaf deyrnged i awdurdodau gogledd Cymru a luniodd y bartneriaeth ansawdd bysiau. Yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru yn arbennig, mae cynlluniau rhagorol ac ymgais wirioneddol i sicrhau bod bysiau yn mynd o amgylch y cymunedau gan roi cyfle i bobl mewn ardaloedd gwledig gael trafnidiaeth. Cymeradwyaf hynny a gobeithiaf y bydd y cynlluniau hynny'n parhau. Y pwynt arall yw, a gwn fod Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn wedi bod yn gweithio ar hyn, ystyried polisïau anheddau yn y dyfodol fel y gall llwybrau trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus weddu i ddatblygiad anheddau. Dyna'r allwedd i gefnogi llwybrau a weinyddir yn fasnachol mewn ardaloedd gwledig neu rannol-wledig.

The Presiding Officer: Supplementary questions today are going wide of the original question. I have been generous because of my Christmas spirit but I warn Members to be careful in future. The original question was about bus travel, not planning matters. However, those matters are, of course, related, as the Minister demonstrated.

Y Llywydd: Mae cwestiynau atodol yn mynd yn bell iawn o'r cwestiwn gwreiddiol heddiw. Bûm yn hael oherwydd ysbryd y Nadolig ond rhybuddiaf yr Aelodau i fod yn ofalus yn y dyfodol. Yr oedd y cwestiwn gwreiddiol ar deithio mewn bysiau, nid materion cynllunio. Fodd bynnag, mae'r materion hynny, wrth gwrs, yn gysylltiedig â'i gilydd, fel y dangosodd y Gweinidog.

Estyn y Drwydded Carthu Tywod (Môr Hafren)
Extending the Sand Dredging Licence (The Bristol Channel)

Q5 Peter Black: When will Sue Essex determine the application to extend the licence for sand dredging in the Bristol Channel? (OAQ8471)

C5 Peter Black: Pryd y bydd Sue Essex yn dyfarnu ar y cais i estyn y drwydded carthu tywod ym Môr Hafren? (OAQ8471)

Sue Essex: An application to allow additional sand to be dredged from Helwick Bank is under consideration. We are

Sue Essex: Ystyrir cais i ganiatáu carthu mwy o dywod o Fanc Helwick ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydym yn datblygu fframwaith polisi

developing a strategic policy framework for marine aggregates in the Bristol Channel, which will provide a context for my decision. I expect a draft framework to be in place by the end of March 2001. In these circumstances, the application will not be determined before then.

strategol ar gyfer cydgasgliadau morol ym Môr Hafren, a fydd yn rhoi cyd-destun i'm penderfyniad. Disgwyliaf i fframwaith drafft fod ar waith erbyn diwedd Mawrth 2001. O dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, ni wneir penderfyniad ar y cais cyn hynny.

Peter Black: Given the inconclusive nature of the recent study of the Bristol Channel, is not more important than ever that the precautionary principle should be applied to such applications? Will you make a further statement, once the strategy framework is brought forward on how it will be applied in this instance?

Peter Black: O ystyried natur amhendant yr astudiaeth ddiweddar ar Fôr Hafren, onid yw'n bwysicach nag erioed weithredu'n bwyllog mewn ceisiadau o'r fath? A wnewch ddatganiad pellach, unwaith y cyflwynir y fframwaith strategol ar sut y caiff ei gymhwyso yn yr achos hwn?

Sue Essex: I would not say that it was inconclusive. It may not have given us the definite information that we wanted, but it was part of building up a picture of where we want to go in future. The policy context is important for that and in looking at this for the long term so that the current licences and applications can be considered in the context of the direction that we want in the future. It will be more sustainable, I hope. During the course of this process, all sorts of people—elected Members, the dredgers and local campaigning groups—will be part of developing that policy context. From then on, I hope it will be easier to deal with the precautionary approach that you mentioned.

Sue Essex: Ni ddywedwn ei fod yn amhendant. Efallai nad oedd wedi rhoi'r wybodaeth benodol yr oeddem am ei chael, ond yr oedd yn rhan o'r broses o roi darlun inni o'r cyfeiriad ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'r cyd-destun polisi yn bwysig yn hynny o beth ac o ran ei ystyried ar gyfer y tymor hir fel y gellir ystyried y trwyddedau a cheisiadau presennol yng nghyd-destun y cyfeiriad yr ydym am ei ddilyn yn y dyfodol. Bydd yn fwy cynaliadwy, gobeithio. Yn ystod y broses hon, bydd pob math o bobl—Aelodau etholedig, y cwmnïau carthu tywod a grwpiau ymgyrchu lleol—yn rhan o'r gwaith o ddatblygu'r cyd-destun polisi hwnnw. O hynny ymlaen, gobeithiaf y bydd yn haws cymryd yr ymagwedd bwyllog y cyfeiriasoch ati.

David Lloyd: O ystyried natur rhewlifol ac anadnewyddol banciau tywod, pa mor hyderus yr ydych o ragdybiaeth Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru mai effaith fach yn unig fydd ar yr amgylchedd o garthu tywod yn gywir?

David Lloyd: When one considers the glacial and non-renewable natire of sand banks, how confident are you that the Countryside Council for Wales is correct in its assumption that the environmental impact of sand dredging will be minimal?

Sue Essex: The presentations have been interesting in that they have demonstrated a robustness in the banks that we might not perhaps have anticipated. They have also shown a volatility. The volatility in rainfall that we are seeing at the moment is also affecting sediment movement in the channel. A recent seminar considered all, or a fair amount of, the research. It was interesting. I know that not all Members could attend that seminar, so I offer to hold the same seminar in Swansea, where there is particular interest

Sue Essex: Bu'r cyflwyniadau'n ddiddorol oherwydd iddynt ddangos cryfder yn y banciau na fyddem wedi ei ragweld o bosibl. Maent hefyd wedi dangos anweddolrwydd. Mae anweddolrwydd o ran glaw a welwn ar hyn o bryd hefyd yn effeithio ar y gwaddodion yn symud yn y môr. Ystyriwyd pob agwedd ar yr ymchwil, neu gryn dipyn ohoni mewn seminar yn ddiweddar. Yr oedd yn ddiddorol. Gwn na allai pob Aelod fynychu'r seminar, felly cynigiaf gynnal yr un seminar yn Abertawe, lle mae diddordeb

in these issues. You will then be able to see that research for yourself. That would be instructive.

arbennig yn y materion hyn. Yna gallwch weld yr ymchwil honno eich hunain. Byddai hynny'n addysgol.

Alun Cairns: How does the Minister reconcile the difference between the view of those who walk the beaches daily, who see that sand is being eroded from the shoreline, and the scientific view that that sand is increasing?

Alun Cairns: Sut mae'r Gweinidog yn cysoni'r gwahaniaeth barn rhwng y rhai sydd yn cerdded ar y traethau bob dydd, sydd yn gweld tywod ymyl y traeth yn erydu, a'r gwyddonwyr sydd yn dweud bod y tywod yn cynyddu?

Sue Essex: I do not know if we can reconcile them. All we can do is try to be as informed as possible. What emerged at the last presentation for the first time—and you were there, Alun—was that it is now thought that there is perhaps a cyclical change in the 10 year pattern, which means that there are certain depletions and accretions. That pattern is perhaps changing more than we thought. We must be as informed as possible and approve a policy context within which we will take our decisions in the future. I am sure that, over time, we will find a more sustainable approach. I do not know whether that will keep sand on the beaches. I am not God. We must realise that there are forces that are much stronger than we are in the National Assembly.

Sue Essex: Ni wn a allwn eu cysoni. Y cyfan y gallwn ei wneud yw ceisio cael yr wybodaeth orau bosibl. Yr hyn a ddaeth i'r amlwg o'r cyflwyniad diwethaf am y tro cyntaf—a buoch yno, Alun—oedd y credir erbyn hyn fod newid cylchredol o bosibl yn y patrwm 10 mlynedd, a olyga fod rhai disbyddiadau a chroniannau. Efallai bod y patrwm hwnnw'n newid yn fwy nag y meddyliwn. Rhaid inni gael yr wybodaeth orau bosibl a chymeradwyo cyd-destun polisi y gallwn wneud ein penderfyniadau ynddo yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn siŵr, ymhen amser, y byddwn yn dod o hyd i ymagwedd fwy cynaliadwy. Ni wn a fydd hynny'n llwyddo i gadw'r tywod ar y traethau. Nid Duw ydwyf. Rhaid inni sylweddoli bod grymoedd sydd yn llawer cryfach na ni yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

9:45 a.m.**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Datganiad ar Hyfforddiant Ymwybyddiaeth Cydraddoldeb
Statement on Equality Awareness Training

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I have recently been in correspondence with the Presiding Officer on the issue of equality awareness training in the Assembly. We are both in agreement of its need and importance in assisting the Assembly to meet its moral, political and statutory obligations for equality that are implicit under the Government of Wales Act 1998. Therefore, this statement seeks to highlight the approach that it is proposed that the Assembly adopts in taking forward this matter, and also to seek your active participation in that process.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Bûm yn gohebu'n ddiweddar â'r Llywydd ar fater hyfforddiant ymwybyddiaeth cydraddoldeb yn y Cynulliad. Mae'r ddau ohonom yn cytuno bod angen yr hyfforddiant a pha mor bwysig ydyw i helpu'r Cynulliad i gyflawni ei ymrwymiadau moesol, gwleidyddol a statudol o ran cydraddoldeb sydd ymhlyg yn Neddf Llywodraeth Leol 1998. Felly nod y datganiad hwn yw nodi'r ymagwedd y bwriedir i'r Cynulliad ei mabwysiadu wrth weithredu ar y mater hwn, a hefyd gofyn ichi gymryd rhan weithgar yn y broses honno.

You will be aware that in the annual report on equality of opportunity presented in July,

Byddwch yn ymwybodol i'r adroddiad blynyddol ar gyfle cyfartal ym mis

the issue of public appointments was an identified priority. As a consequence, and as a matter of priority, I propose that particular importance should be placed upon training those Assembly Members making public appointments. It is hoped that this will assist in meeting the stated objective of the Assembly of a more diverse group of public appointees.

Gorffennaf nodi penodiadau cyhoeddus fel blaenoriaeth. O ganlyniad, ac fel mater o frys, cynigiaf y dylid rhoi pwyslais arbennig ar hyfforddiant i Aelodau'r Cynulliad sydd yn gwneud penodiadau cyhoeddus. Y gobaith yw y bydd hyn o gymorth i gyflawni amcan cyhoeddedig y Cynulliad i sicrhau grŵp mwy amrywiol o bobl mewn penodiadau cyhoeddus.

I propose to make a positive effort to provide equality awareness sessions for all Assembly Members involved in public appointments. Some Members will be aware that this process began with equality sessions that were held at the end of the summer term. We now need to build on that and further awareness sessions are planned to commence in the new year.

Bwriadaf wneud ymdrech i drefnu sesiynau ymwybyddiaeth cydraddoldeb i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad sydd yn ymwneud â phenodiadau cyhoeddus. Bydd rhai Aelodau'n ymwybodol i'r broses hon ddechrau gyda'r sesiynau ar gydraddoldeb a gynhaliwyd ar ddiwedd tymor yr haf. Bellach mae angen inni adeiladu ar hynny a bwriedir cynnal sesiynau ymwybyddiaeth pellach yn y flwyddyn newydd.

The sessions will not only provide another opportunity for those Members who may have missed the first round of training to further their knowledge, but will also provide a chance for those who attended the first sessions to update their skills, in what is a fast changing and ever developing environment.

Bydd y sesiynau nid yn unig yn rhoi cyfle arall i'r Aelodau hynny a gollodd y gyfres gyntaf o hyfforddiant wella eu gwybodaeth, ond hefyd yn rhoi cyfle i'r rhai a fynychodd y sesiynau cyntaf ddiweddaru eu sgiliau, mewn amgylchedd sydd yn newid yn gyflym ac yn datblygu o hyd.

In addition to providing equality awareness training opportunities for Members, a significant programme of awareness training is also to be put in place for Assembly staff. This has already commenced with disability training sessions for front-line staff. Further equality awareness training in all areas of equality is currently being researched and should be on stream early next year.

Yn ogystal â rhoi hyfforddiant ymwybyddiaeth cydraddoldeb i'r Aelodau, bwriedir trefnu rhaglen sylweddol o hyfforddiant ymwybyddiaeth i staff y Cynulliad. Mae hon eisoes wedi dechrau gyda sesiynau hyfforddiant anabledd i staff y rheng flaen. Ymchwilir i hyfforddiant ymwybyddiaeth cydraddoldeb pellach ymhob maes o gydraddoldeb ar hyn o bryd a dylai fod ar waith yn gynnar y flwyddyn nesaf.

I hope that you will share the Presiding Officer's and my view that equality awareness is an important issue for the National Assembly and cannot be ignored. There is no doubt that such training will assist in our efforts of mainstreaming equality. I hope that I can count on your active support and participation.

Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cytuno â'r Llywydd a minnau bod ymwybyddiaeth cydraddoldeb yn fater pwysig i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac ni ellir ei hanwybyddu. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth y bydd hyfforddiant o'r fath o gymorth inni ddod â chydraddoldeb i'r brif ffrwd. Gobeithiaf y gallaf ddibynnu ar eich cefnogaeth a'ch cyfranogiad gweithgar.

Helen Mary Jones: I thank the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities for her statement, which Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales enthusiastically endorses. As you are aware, this matter has

Helen Mary Jones: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau am ei datganiad y mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn ei gefnogi'n frwd. Fel y gwyddoch, codwyd y mater hwn

been raised on several occasions in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. My colleagues and I welcome the opportunity to develop our skills and understanding in this important area of the Assembly's work.

sawl gwaith yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Mae fy nghyd-Aelodau a minnau'n croesawu'r cyfle i ddatblygu ein sgiliau a'n dealltwriaeth yn y maes pwysig hwn ar waith y Cynulliad.

Will you consider holding discussions with the Minister for Assembly Business on making equality of opportunity training compulsory to Members who will undertake public appointments? It would be unfortunate if we were to fall below those standards. Perhaps we can ask the Business Committee to consider that matter. Will you consult the party spokespeople about the content and nature of those briefing sessions to ensure that they relevant to the Assembly's business and to Members' varying levels of understanding? Will you ensure that the sessions are available through the medium of Welsh? That is important. What percentage of Assembly staff have already received the equality training? I would be particularly interested to know what percentage of senior staff have undertaken briefing sessions. What is the time frame for all Assembly staff to receive full equality briefing to enable them to mainstream equality into their work? Finally, what plans do you have to ensure that quango board members and local government elected members follow the National Assembly's example in this?

A wnewch ystyried trafod â'r Trefnydd ynglŷn â'r posibilrwydd o wneud hyfforddiant cyfle cyfartal yn orfodol i'r Aelodau sydd yn gwneud penodiadau cyhoeddus? Byddai'n anffodus pe baem yn methu â chyrraedd y safonau hynny. Efallai y gallwn ofyn i'r Pwyllgor Busnes ystyried y mater. A ymgynghorwch â llefarwyr y pleidiau ynglŷn â chynnwys a natur y sesiynau briffio hynny er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn berthnasol i fusnes y Cynulliad a'r gwahanol lefelau o ddealltwriaeth ymhlith yr Aelodau? A sicrhewch fod y sesiynau ar gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? Mae hynny'n bwysig. Pa ganran o staff y Cynulliad a gafodd hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb eisoes? Byddai diddordeb gennyf i wybod pa ganran o uwch aelodau'r staff sydd wedi mynychu sesiynau briffio. Beth yw'r amserlen i bob aelod o staff y Cynulliad gael briff llawn ar gydraddoldeb er mwyn eu galluogi i brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb yn eu gwaith ? Yn olaf, sut y bwriadwch sicrhau bod aelodau o fyrddau cwangos ac aelodau etholedig llywodraeth leol yn dilyn esiampl y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar hyn?

Edwina Hart: If the Assembly wishes, I will raise the issue of compulsory training with the Minister for Assembly Business in the Business Committee. I will consult the party spokespeople about the nature of the equality training that will be provided, but it must be relevant to Assembly Members' needs. I will also try to ensure that it will be available through the medium of Welsh. I will come back to you on that. We have discussed in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity that training needs to be accessible through the Welsh language, because if Welsh is your mother tongue you will prefer to have certain things delivered in a certain way.

Edwina Hart: Os dymuna'r Cynulliad, codaf fater hyfforddiant gorfodol gyda'r Trefnydd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. Ymgynghoraf â llefarwyr y pleidiau ynglŷn â natur yr hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb a ddarperir, ond rhaid iddo fod yn berthnasol i anghenion Aelodau'r Cynulliad, Ceisiaf hefyd sicrhau y bydd ar gael yn Gymraeg. Rhoddaf ateb ichi ar hynny maes o law. Yr ydym wedi trafod yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal bod angen i'r hyfforddiant fod ar gael yn Gymraeg, gan y byddai'n well gennych gael rhai pethau wedi eu cyflwyno mewn modd arbennig os mai Cymraeg yw'ch mamiaith.

I would also like to know the percentage of senior Assembly staff that has been trained. I will collate the necessary information if it is available and report back on that to the Assembly, as well as on the time frame. Your point about quango board members is

Hoffwn wybod hefyd pa ganran o uwch aelodau staff y Cynulliad a gafodd hyfforddiant. Casglaf yr wybodaeth angenrheidiol os yw ar gael a rhoi adroddiad ar hynny i'r Cynulliad, ynghyd â'r amserlen. Mae eich pwynt ynglŷn ag aelodau byrddau

relevant, but it must be pursued by Ministers who are responsible for the bodies concerned. I will write to my Cabinet colleagues and Chairs of relevant Committees in light of the discussion in Plenary today on training. The Welsh Local Government Association and the Assembly are now entering new equality partnership arrangements in terms of the work that we intend to take forward. It is one of the issues that I will be more than happy to discuss with the WLGA.

cwangos yn berthnasol, ond rhaid iddo gael ei weithredu gan y Gweinidogion sydd yn gyfrifol am y cyrff dan sylw. Ysgrifennaf at fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet a Chadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau perthnasol yng ngoleuni'r drafodaeth ar hyfforddiant yn y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a'r Cynulliad bellach yn llunio trefniadau partneriaeth cydraddoldeb newydd o ran y gwaith y bwriadwn ei ddatblygu. Mae'n un o'r materion y byddaf yn fwy na pharod i'w drafod â CLlLC.

Val Feld: I welcome this statement, having recently been involved in public appointments. It is important that we move this work forward. I support—I think—everything that Helen has said. Will you consider making it compulsory for everybody who participates in public appointment interviews to have equality training? By that, I mean the independent assessors who, as I understand, have not necessarily received training, but whose role is significant, as well as anyone from a public body who participates in interviews. What they do for their internal appointments is one matter, but what they do when they participate in public appointments with us, is a matter for us. I also encourage you to consider extending the opportunity for equality training to all Assembly Members. There are one or two who might be delighted to have the opportunity to participate. If that were the case, I am sure that it would transform our deliberations in this Chamber.

Val Feld: Croesawaf y datganiad hwn, ar ôl bod yn rhan o'r broses penodiadau cyhoeddus yn ddiweddar. Mae'n bwysig inni symud y gwaith hwn ymlaen. Cefnogaf bob peth—fe gredaf—a ddywedodd Helen. A ystyriwch ei gwneud yn orfodol i bawb sydd yn cymryd rhan mewn cyfweliadau penodiadau cyhoeddus gael hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb? Hynny yw, yr aseswyr annibynnol nad ydynt, fe ddeallaf, wedi cael hyfforddiant o reidrwydd ond y mae eu rôl yn un arwyddocaol, yn ogystal ag unrhyw un o'r cyrff cyhoeddus sydd yn cymryd rhan mewn cyfweliadau. Mater iddynt hwy yw'r hyn a wnânt wrth benodi'n fewnol, ond mater inni yw'r hyn a wnânt wrth iddynt wneud penodiadau cyhoeddus. Fe'ch anogaf hefyd i ystyried estyn hyfforddiant cyfle cyfartal i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Mae un neu ddau a fyddai'n falch iawn o'r cyfle i gymryd rhan. Pe bai hynny'n wir, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n trawsnewid ein trafodaethau yn y Siambr hon.

Edwina Hart: We have been discussing independent assessment in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. We are considering ways of ensuring that the independent assessors are independent and well-trained. I will take up this issue. It seems only right that every person who participates in a public appointment board should be equally trained if they are to go through that appointment system. I will take those points up. Equality training is open to every Assembly Member, irrespective of whether they sit on public appointment boards. The training is handy. Even those of us with some background in this could do with being updated on the issues, because it is surprising what one forgets.

Edwina Hart: Buom yn trafod asesiad annibynnol yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Yr ydym yn ystyried ffyrdd o sicrhau bod yr aseswyr annibynnol yn annibynnol ac wedi eu hyfforddi'n dda. Gweithredaf ar y mater hwn. Ymddengys ei bod yn gwbl briodol i bob person sydd yn cymryd rhan ar fwrdd penodiadau cyhoeddus gael yr un hyfforddiant os ydynt yn mynd drwy'r system benodi. Gweithredaf ar y pwyntiau hynny. Mae hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb yn agored i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad pa un a ydynt yn aelod o fyrddau penodiadau cyhoeddus ai peidio. Mae'r hyfforddiant yn ddefnyddiol. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol i hyd yn oed y rheiny ohonom sydd â pheth profiad yn y maes hwn gael yr wybodaeth ddiweddaraf

ar y materion hyn, oherwydd ei bod yn rhyfeddod beth mae rhywun yn ei anghofio.

David Melding: Equality awareness training is important and is used extensively through the private sector, non-governmental organisations and now, fortunately, the public sector. I have learnt a lot throughout my career from the equality awareness training that I have received. It is important that we allow AMs to have access to this training so that they can improve their skills in this area. It is particularly important for those involved in public appointments. By negotiation, we can come to an agreement that all those involved in public appointments will undergo this training. I am not sure whether we need to make it compulsory and start entering battles; I am sure that we will do it by consensus and agreement.

David Melding: Mae hyfforddiant ymwybyddiaeth cydraddoldeb yn bwysig ac fe'i defnyddir yn helaeth yn y sector preifat, gan sefydliadau nad ydynt yn rhan o'r llywodraeth ac erbyn hyn, yn ffodus, yn y sector cyhoeddus. Dysgais lawer drwy gydol fy ngyrfa o'r hyfforddiant ymwybyddiaeth cydraddoldeb a gefais. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn rhoi cyfle i ACau gael yr hyfforddiant hwn fel y gallant wella eu sgiliau yn y maes hwn. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig i'r rhai sydd yn ymwneud â phenodiadau cyhoeddus. Drwy negodi, gallwn ddod i gytundeb y bydd pob un o'r rhai sydd yn ymwneud â phenodiadau cyhoeddus yn cael yr hyfforddiant hwn. Nid wyf yn siŵr a oes angen inni ei gwneud yn orfodol a dechrau brwydr; yr wyf yn siŵr y'i gwnawn drwy gonsensws a chytundeb.

The quality of the training is crucial. So far, the programme has been disappointing. I attended a training session with my colleague, Lorraine Barrett. I am not sure whether anyone else has attended that particular programme yet, and while I do not want to embarrass fellow Members, it must be acknowledged that the turnout so far has been depressing. We need to re-emphasise the importance of this training and ensure that it is pushed among all our colleagues in the various parties. The trainers that we use must come, as often as possible, from the sectors about which we are learning. If we are learning about disability, in particular, we must have trainers from disability groups and other interested parties. You are right that this must be ongoing. I first received training seven or eight years ago. Many of those lessons must be relearnt and reinterpreted in many ways because our understanding of these issues changes over time.

Mae ansawdd yr hyfforddiant yn holl bwysig. Hyd yn hyn, bu'r rhaglen yn siomedig. Mynychais sesiwn hyfforddi gyda'm cyd-Aelod, Lorraine Barrett. Nid wyf yn siŵr a oes unrhyw un arall wedi mynychu'r rhaglen benodol honno eto, ac er nad wyf am achosi embaras i'm cyd-Aelodau, rhaid cydnabod bod y nifer sy'n mynychu wedi bod yn dorcalonnus. Mae angen inni bwysleisio o'r newydd pa mor bwysig yw'r hyfforddiant hwn a sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei hyrwyddo ymhlith ein cyd-Aelodau yn y gwahanol bleidiau. Rhaid bod yr hyfforddwyr a ddefnyddiwn, yn dod, mor aml â phosibl, o'r sectorau yr ydym yn dysgu amdanynt. Os ydym yn dysgu am anabledd, yn arbennig, rhaid inni gael hyfforddwyr o grwpiau anabledd a phartïon eraill â diddordeb. Yr ydych yn gywir wrth ddweud bod yn rhaid i hyn fod yn barhaus. Cefais hyfforddiant am y tro cyntaf saith neu wyth mlynedd yn ôl. Rhaid ailddysgu ac ailddehongli llawer o'r gwersi hynny mewn sawl ffordd am fod ein dealltwriaeth o'r materion hyn yn newid gyda threigl amser.

Edwina Hart: You make a good point about the quality of the trainers, David. That follows on from Helen's suggestion that I meet with party spokespeople on equality issues when we prepare the training agenda, to consider the nature of the training, its

Edwina Hart: Gwnaethoch bwynt da ynglŷn ag ansawdd yr hyfforddwyr, David. Mae hynny'n dilyn awgrym Helen y dylwn gyfarfod â llefarwyr y pleidiau ar faterion cydraddoldeb pan baratoir yr agenda hyfforddiant, er mwyn ystyried natur yr

quality and who provides it. That would be a useful discussion across party boundaries. Equality of opportunity is not solely a matter for the administration: it is a matter for every Assembly Member, as you indicated, David. Assembly Members have a great deal on their plate in terms of meetings. It is essential that we recognise this as a rolling programme where people can attend for quick half-hour or hour sessions which might be provided continuously throughout the day. It will be useful because it will set a good example if we take this issue seriously.

hyfforddiant, yr ansawdd a phwy fydd yn ei ddarparu. Byddai honno'n drafodaeth ddefnyddiol ar draws ffiniau'r pleidiau. Nid mater i'r weinyddiaeth yn unig yw cyfle cyfartal; mae'n fater i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad, fel y dywedasoch, David. Mae baich trwm ar Aelodau'r Cynulliad o ran cyfarfodydd. Mae'n hanfodol inni wireddu hyn fel rhaglen dreigl lle y gall pobl fynychu sesiynau am hanner awr neu awr fach y gellir eu darparu'n barhaus drwy gydol y dydd. Bydd yn ddefnyddiol gan y bydd yn rhoi esiampl dda pe baem yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif.

9:55 a.m.

Kirsty Williams: Thank you for your statement. The Liberal Democrats use equality training sessions as part of their candidates' training and selection procedure. We therefore welcome this, and I am sure that my Liberal Democrat colleagues will be anxious to take part.

Kirsty Williams: Diolch ichi am eich datganiad. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn defnyddio sesiynau hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb fel rhan o'r weithdrefn o ddethol a hyfforddi eu hymgeiswyr. Croesawn hyn felly, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd fy nghyd-Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn awyddus i gymryd rhan.

I take your point about also training National Assembly staff, and I want to highlight one issue. When those of us who are involved in public appointments get to see the files, the shortlisting has already been done. We only see a small minority of the people who apply for positions. It is vital that staff who are involved in shortlisting the candidates who will be brought before panels and Ministers are given that training. They filter out many applicants.

Derbyniaf eich pwynt hefyd ynglŷn â hyfforddi staff y Cynulliad, a hoffwn dynnu sylw at un mater. Pan fydd y rhai ohonom sydd yn ymwneud â phenodiadau cyhoeddus yn cael gweld y ffeiliau, mae'r rhestrau byr eisoes wedi eu llunio. Dim ond lleiafrif o'r bobl sydd yn gwneud cais am y swyddi a welwn ni. Mae'n hanfodol bod y staff sydd yn ymwneud â llunio'r rhestrau byr o'r ymgeiswyr i'w cyflwyno gerbron y paneli a'r Gweinidogion yn cael yr hyfforddiant hwnnw. Gwrthodant lawer o ymgeiswyr.

Given the fact that the health service is responsible for the vast majority of public appointments in Wales, we should not only look at training members of the Health and Social Services Committee but members of trusts and people on the boards that make appointments in the health service. Efforts should be made to highlight their training needs also.

O gofio'r ffaith mai i'r gwasanaeth iechyd y gwnaethpwyd y mwyafrif llethol o benodiadau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, dylem nid yn unig ystyried rhoi hyfforddiant i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ond i aelodau'r ymddiriedolaethau a'r bobl ar y byrddau sydd yn penodi yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Dylid gwneud ymdrechion i nodi eu hanghenion hyfforddi hefyd.

Edwina Hart: Your points follow on nicely from Val's earlier points about training. We must look at this. I am anxious to put our own house in order before I go further afield, but must be taken be into the context of our

Edwina Hart: Mae eich pwyntiau'n ategu pwyntiau cynharach Val ynglŷn â hyfforddiant yn dda. Rhaid inni ystyried hyn. Yr wyf yn awyddus inni roi trefn arnom ein hunain cyn mynd ymhellach, ond rhaid

discussion.

ystyried hyn yng nghyd-destun ein trafodaeth.

You made a good point about what happens in shortlisting. That is a key area. We must ensure that everybody who is involved in this process, to the highest level, has had proper equality training. We will need to take this forward. You made that point when you were a member of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, Kirsty. Health is a sector that we are particularly concerned about, because it accounts for such a large percentage of public appointments.

Gwnaethoch bwynt da ynglŷn â'r hyn a ddigwydd wrth lunio rhestrau byr. Mae hwnnw'n faes allweddol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod pawb sydd yn ymwneud â'r broses hon, hyd at y lefel uchaf, wedi cael hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb priodol. Bydd angen inni weithredu ar hyn. Gwnaethoch y pwynt hwnnw pan oeddech yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, Kirsty. Mae iechyd yn sector sydd yn achos pryder arbennig inni, am ei fod yn cyfrif am ganran mor uchel o'r penodiadau cyhoeddus.

I will take these points on board and it might be useful, in the light of this discussion, for me to make a further, statement perhaps in February, to update the Assembly on progress in these areas, and perhaps to make a recommendation.

Ystyriaf y pwyntiau hyn ac efallai y bydd yn ddefnyddiol, yng ngoleuni'r drafodaeth hon, imi wneud datganiad pellach, efallai ym mis Chwefror, er mwyn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad ar y cynnydd a wneir yn y meysydd hyn, a gwneud argymhelliad o bosibl.

Rosemary Butler: I am pleased that you are taking this action. However, can I have your assurance that posts for all the Assembly sponsored public bodies will be advertised throughout Wales, particularly in the border regions? It strikes me that, unless people read *The Western Mail,* and there are not that many people who do, they will not know that these posts are available. The point that Kirsty made means that they have been disenfranchised, even before they get to the sifting stage. Can I have your reassurance that you will do that, and advertise in regional papers where necessary?

Rosemary Butler: Yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich bod yn cymryd y camau hyn. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch fy sicrhau y caiff swyddi ar gyfer pob corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad eu hysbysebu ledled Cymru, yn enwedig ar y ffin? Mae'n fy nharo na chaiff pobl wybod bod y swyddi hyn ar gael oni bai eu bod yn darllen *The Western Mail,* ac nid oes cymaint â hynny o bobl sydd yn ei ddarllen. Golyga'r pwynt a wnaeth Kirsty iddynt golli eu hawl, hyd yn oed cyn cyrraedd y cam dewis a dethol. A roddwch sicrwydd imi y gwnewch hynny, gan hysbysebu yn y papurau rhanbarthol lle bo angen hynny?

Edwina Hart: The Committee on Equality of Opportunity is coming to the final stage of its report on public appointments. Advertising is one issue that concerns us, as well as perhaps the inappropriateness of some our current advertising practices. The advertisements are placed in *The Western Mail* and hardly anywhere else. They are in the middle of the job pages. If you are looking for a public appointment, you are not necessarily looking for a job. That raises the whole issue of accessibility, and of people being aware of what is going on. We will take forward that issue. I will take this issue up for you, Rosemary, at this stage. I could

Edwina Hart: Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn cyrraedd y cam olaf o'i adroddiad ar benodiadau cyhoeddus. Mae hysbysebu yn un o'r materion sydd yn achos pryder inni, yn ogystal ag anaddasrwydd efallai rhai o'n harferion hysbysebu presennol. Hysbysebir yn *The Western Mail* ond prin mewn unman arall. Maent yng nghanol y tudalennau swyddi. Os ydych yn chwilio am benodiad cyhoeddus, nid ydych o reidrwydd yn chwilio am swydd. Cwyd hynny yr holl fater o fod yn hygyrch, ac o sicrhau bod pobl yn ymwybodol o'r hyn sydd yn digwydd. Gweithredwn ar y mater hwnnw. Codaf y mater hwn ar eich rhan, Rosemary, yn awr.

probably allude to that when I make my progress report to the Assembly in February. I hope that when the Committee on Equality of Opportunity's report is finally completed and it goes to the Executive—because it was the Cabinet that requested the Committee to look at the issue—the points raised today will be dealt with in that report.

Gallwn gyfeirio ato pan roddaf fy adroddiad cynnydd i'r Cynulliad ym mis Chwefror. Gobeithiaf yr ymdrinnir â'r pwyntiau a godwyd heddiw yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal pan gaiff ei gwblhau'n derfynol a'i gyflwyno gerbron y Weithrediaeth—oherwydd y Cynulliad a ofynnodd i'r Pwyllgor ystyried y mater.

David Davies: How much will all this cost?

David Davies: Faint fydd cost hyn oll?

Edwina Hart: I do not have specific costs regarding the public appointments system with me at the moment. Equality is mainstreamed through life and through all the National Assembly's programmes. It would be difficult for me to seperate out the costs. The importance of this discussion is that equality of opportunity concerns everybody in Wales. It is about their rights and accessibility. You cannot put a price on that, David. I can cost the public appointments system, but I cannot cost equality of opportunity as a whole. I am sorry that you have injected a sour note into a constructive discussion.

Edwina Hart: Nid yw'r costau penodol ynglŷn â'r system penodiadau cyhoeddus gyda mi ar hyn o bryd. Mae cydraddoldeb yn rhan o brif ffrwd bywyd ac o bob un o raglenni'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Byddai'n anodd imi nodi'r costau ar wahân. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig ynghylch y drafodaeth hon yw bod cyfle cyfartal yn berthnasol i bawb yng Nghymru. Mae'n berthnasol i'w hawliau a'u cyfleoedd. Ni ellir rhoi pris ar hynny, David. Gallaf roi cost y system penodiadau cyhoeddus, ond ni allaf roi cost cyfle cyfartal yn ei gyfanrwydd. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf eich bod wedi cyflwyno nodyn sur i drafodaeth adeiladol.

Brian Hancock: I ask you to discuss with those colleagues who are responsible for business and e-commerce the development of interactive methods—CD-ROM, or web-based methods—so that we can take advantage of good practice and guidance and develop our training according to need.

Brian Hancock: Gofynnaf ichi drafod â'r cyd-Aelodau hynny sydd yn gyfrifol am fusnes ac e-fasnach a datblygu dulliau rhyngweithiol—CD-ROM, neu ddulliau sy'n seiliedig ar y we—fel y gallwn elwa ar arfer ac arweiniad da a datblygu ein hyfforddiant yn ôl yr angen.

Edwina Hart: Using CD-ROM training is an attractive option because a great deal of work has been done on this. For example, during lectures on equality issues, some companies use CD-ROMs that can be stopped at certain points so that people can ask questions. I would be happy to consider this in terms of how we develop packages to encourage people into public appointments equality training. It is a subject, therefore, that I will take back for discussion in committee.

Edwina Hart: Mae defnyddio hyfforddiant CD-ROM yn opsiwn deniadol am fod cryn dipyn o waith wedi ei wneud ar hyn. Er enghraifft, yn ystod y darlithoedd ar faterion yn ymwneud â chydraddoldeb, mae rhai cwmnïau'n defnyddio CD-ROM y gellir eu hatal mewn mannau penodol fel y gall pobl ofyn cwestiynau. Yr wyf yn barod i ystyried hyn o ran sut y datblygwn becynnau i annog pobl i gael hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb penodiadau cyhoeddus. Mae'n bwnc, felly, a gyflwynaf eto i'r pwyllgor ei drafod.

Datganiad ar Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol 1998
Statement on the Human Rights Act 1998

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina

Y Gweinidog drog Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Daw'r

Hart): This statement comes as a result of a commitment I gave in response to a question by Jocelyn Davies on the Human Rights Act. This is the first in a series of statements on this issue, which I will be making at regular intervals during the year.

datganiad hwn o ganlyniad i ymrwymiad a roddais mewn ymateb i gwestiwn gan Jocelyn Davies ar y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol. Dyma'r datganiad cyntaf mewn cyfres o ddatganiadau a wnaf yn rheolaidd ar y mater hwn yn ystod y flwyddyn.

It is now over two months since the Human Rights Act came into effect as part of the Government's package of constitutional reform. Since 2 October, all public bodies have been required to act in accordance with the European Convention on Human Rights. The National Assembly for Wales has, since its inception, had a duty to act compatibly with the Convention rights, placed on it under the Government of Wales Act 1998. The rights and freedoms guaranteed under the European Convention on Human Rights are now incorporated into UK law, and the rights given in the Convention may be relied upon directly in our courts. The European Convention on Human Rights is not new, of course. It was first ratified by the United Kingdom in 1951. However it now has force of law, and the Assembly has led the way in giving it real substance and significance in the Government of Wales.

Aeth dros ddau fis heibio erbyn hyn ers i'r Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol ddod i rym fel rhan o becyn diwygio cyfansoddiadol y Llywodraeth. Ers 2 Hydref, bu'n ofynnol i bob corff cyhoeddus weithredu yn unol â'r Cytundeb Ewropeaidd ar Hawliau Dynol. Bu'n ddyletswydd ar Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, ers ei sefydlu, i weithredu'n gydnaws â hawliau'r Confensiwn, a osodwyd arno o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Ymgorfforir yr hawliau a'r rhyddid a warantir o dan y Cytundeb Ewropeaidd ar Hawliau Dynol yng nghyfraith y DU erbyn hyn, a gellir dibynnu ar yr hawliau a roddir yn y Cytundeb yn uniongyrchol yn ein llysoedd. Nid yw'r Cytundeb Ewropeaidd ar Hawliau Dynol yn newydd, wrth gwrs. Fe'i cadarnhawyd am y tro cyntaf gan y Deyrnas Unedig yn 1951. Fodd bynnag mae iddo rym y gyfraith erbyn hyn, ac arweiniodd y Cynulliad y ffordd drwy roi sylwedd ac arwyddocâd gwirioneddol iddo yn Llywodraeth Cymru.

The Human Rights Act will work in three main ways. First, it requires all legislation, as far as is possible, to be interpreted and given effect in a way that is compatible with the Convention rights. That means that all legislation may be subject to new interpretation and, importantly, that legislation made by the Assembly can be disapplied or quashed by the courts. In light of this, the Office of the Counsel General carried out an assessment of all legislation affecting the Assembly. Since that initial assessment was completed in January of this year, human rights issues are being identified regularly within the Office of the Counsel General. A substantial programme of staff training has been carried out to heighten policy divisions' awareness of the scope and potential effects of the Act, so that issues can be flagged up at the earliest possible stage. All new legislation put before the Assembly is systematically checked for compliance with the Convention rights, and procedures are in place to ensure that this will continue.

Bydd y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol yn gweithio mewn tair prif ffordd. Yn gyntaf, mae'n ofynnol dehongli pob deddfwriaeth, cyn belled â phosibl, a rhoi grym iddi mewn ffordd sydd yn gydnaws â hawliau'r Cytundeb. Golyga hynny y gall pob deddfwriaeth fod yn agored i'w dehongli o'r newydd ac, yn bwysig iawn, y gall y llysoedd ddadweithredu neu ddileu'r ddeddfwriaeth a wnaethpwyd gan y Cynulliad. Yng ngoleuni hyn, cynhaliodd Swyddfa'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol asesiad o'r holl ddeddfwriaeth sydd yn effeithio ar y Cynulliad. Ers cwblhau'r asesiad cychwynnol hwnnw yn Ionawr eleni, nodir materion hawliau dynol yn rheolaidd o fewn Swyddfa'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol. Cynhaliwyd rhaglen hyfforddiant staff sylweddol i godi ymwybyddiaeth rhaniadau polisïau o sgôp ac effeithiau posibl y Ddeddf, fel y gellir nodi materion mor fuan â phosibl. Caiff pob deddfwriaeth newydd a osodir gerbron y Cynulliad ei gwirio'n systematig i weld a yw'n cydymffurfio â hawliau'r Cytundeb, ac

mae gweithdrefnau yn eu lle i sicrhau bod hyn yn parhau.

Secondly, the Human Rights Act has made it unlawful for a public body to act incompatibly with the Convention rights. In this case, the term 'public body' includes not only the obvious institutions, such as local authorities, tribunals and, of course, the Assembly, but also some private or voluntary organisations that have public functions, such as Railtrack, and, in some cases, individuals. Here, the Assembly must look to itself and its administration to ensure that all those taking action on its behalf are fully aware of the implications of the Human Rights Act. A comprehensive programme of awareness raising and training is in place for our staff. However the Assembly's responsibility extends beyond this, and it also has a role in ensuring that other public bodies within Wales are aware of their own responsibilities under the Human Rights Act. We have issued guidance to public bodies and have held two major conferences, at Cardiff and Llandudno, aimed specifically at raising awareness among staff of public bodies.

Yn ail, fe'i gwnaethpwyd yn anghyfreithiol gan y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol i gorff cyhoeddus weithredu'n anghydnaws â hawliau'r Cytundeb. Yn yr achos hwn, mae'r term 'corff cyhoeddus' yn cynnwys nid yn unig y sefydliadau amlwg, megis awdurdodau lleol, tribiwnlysoedd ac, wrth gwrs, y Cynulliad, ond hefyd rhai sefydliadau preifat neu wirfoddol sydd â swyddogaethau cyhoeddus, megis Railtrack, ac, mewn rhai achosion, unigolion. Yma, rhaid i'r Cynulliad edrych tuag at ei hunan a'i weinyddiaeth i sicrhau bod pawb a weithreda ar ei ran yn llwyr ymwybodol o oblygiadau'r Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol. Mae rhaglen gynhwysfawr o godi ymwybyddiaeth a hyfforddiant yn eu lle ar gyfer ein staff. Fodd bynnag, ymestynna cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad y tu hwnt i hyn, ac mae ganddo rôl hefyd i sicrhau bod cyrff cyhoeddus eraill o fewn Cymru yn ymwybodol o'u cyfrifoldebau eu hunain o dan y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol. Cyhoeddwyd arweiniad i gyrff cyhoeddus a chynhaliwyd dwy gynhadledd fawr, yng Nghaerdydd a Llandudno, gyda'r nod yn benodol o godi ymwybyddiaeth ymhlith staff cyrff cyhoeddus.

Thirdly, people who believe that their rights have been violated by public authorities will be able to have their cases judged in UK courts, rather than having to take their case to Strasbourg. Courts and tribunals must take account of Convention rights in all cases that come before them. It is here that the Human Rights Act will begin to come to life, when we see the courts' response in challenging some of these issues, and progress will only become apparent when we have a history of case law. It is important to recognise that we must remain on top of this issue.

Yn drydydd, bydd pobl a gred yr ymyrrwyd â'u hawliau gan awdurdodau cyhoeddus yn gallu cael llysoedd y DU i farnu eu hachosion, yn hytrach na gorfod mynd â'u hachos i Strasbourg. Rhaid i lysoedd a thribiwnlysoedd ystyried hawliau Cytundeb ym mhob achos a ddaw ger eu bron. Dyma lle y dechreua'r Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol ddod yn fyw, pan welwn ymateb y llysoedd wrth herio rhai o'r materion hyn, a dim ond pan fydd gennym hanes o gyfraith achos y daw'r cynnydd yn amlwg. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod rhaid inni sicrhau bod y mater hwn dan reolaeth.

However, in the meantime, we are taking substantial steps to ensure that, in all its actions, the Assembly carries out its functions in a way that establishes it as a leader in making the principles of the Act a practical reality in the interest of the people of Wales.

Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfamser, cymerwn gamau sylweddol i sicrhau bod y Cynulliad, ym mhob un o'i weithredoedd, yn cyflawni ei swyddogaethau mewn ffordd sydd yn ei sefydlu fel arweinydd wrth wneud egwyddorion y Ddeddf yn realiti ymarferol er lles pobl Cymru.

As I indicated at the beginning of my

Fel y nodais ar ddechrau fy natganiad,

statement, I shall keep Members regularly informed of progress on matters of interest regarding the Human Rights Act.

hysbysaf Aelodau yn gyson am gynnydd ar faterion o ddiddordeb o safbwynt y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol.

10:05 a.m.

Jocelyn Davies: Do you agree that the Assembly has a strategic role in assisting local authorities to come to terms with the impact of the Human Rights Act? I am sure that you would share the Plaid Cymru group's concern that the Assembly Library recently informed Pauline Jarman that the Act is not likely to impact on educational services in Wales, despite the fact that one of the rights is a right to education. It would seem, therefore, that there is widespread ignorance about the rights that people have gained under the Act.

Jocelyn Davies: A gytunwch fod gan y Cynulliad rôl strategol i gynorthwyo awdurdodau lleol i ddod i delerau ag effaith y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol? Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn rhannu pryderon grŵp Plaid Cymru fod Llyfrgell y Cynulliad wedi hysbysu Pauline Jarman yn ddiweddar nad yw'r Ddeddf yn debygol o gael effaith ar wasanaethau addysgol yng Nghymru, er gwaethaf y ffaith mai'r hawl i addysg yw un o'r hawliau. Ymddengys, felly, fod anwybodaeth eang ynglŷn â'r hawliau a enillodd pobl o dan y Ddeddf.

Even though I welcome this statement, will Edwina go further, by arranging a debate on this important matter? Are there plans to consider establishing a human rights commission to enable a human rights culture to develop in Wales? Do you agree that the creation of such a commission would negate the need for applicants to use the courts to enforce these new rights? Finally, I note that the Labour-Liberal coalition agreement promises a citizens' rights Bill for Wales. Will Edwina tell us more about that and whether it will contain new rights, including social, economic and property rights and when are we likely to debate that issue?

Er fy mod yn croesawu'r datganiad hwn, a aiff Edwina ymhellach, drwy drefnu dadl ar y mater pwysig hwn? A oes cynlluniau i ystyried sefydlu comisiwn hawliau dynol i alluogi diwylliant hawliau dynol i ddatblygu yng Nghymru? A gytunwch y byddai creu comisiwn o'r fath yn negyddu'r angen i ymgeiswyr ddefnyddio'r llysoedd i fynnu'r hawliau newydd hyn? Yn olaf, sylwaf fod cytundeb clymblaid Llafur a'r Rhyddfrydwyr yn addo Mesur hawliau dinasyddion i Gymru. A ddywed Edwina ragor wrthym am hynny ac ynglŷn ag a fydd yn cynnwys hawliau newydd, gan gynnwys hawliau cymdeithasol, economaidd ac eiddo a pha bryd yr ydym yn debygol o ddadlau'r mater hwnnw?

Edwina Hart: Some of those questions are more pertinent for the Minister for Assembly Business than for me. However, I have no objection to looking at the business programme schedule to try to arrange a full debate on the Human Rights Act 1998.

Edwina Hart: Mae rhai o'r cwestiynau hynny yn fwy perthnasol i'r Trefnydd nac i mi. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gennyf wrthwynebiad i edrych ar amserlen y rhaglen fusnes i geisio trefnu dadl lawn ar Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol 1998.

In the context of the partnership agreement, we are discussing various issues concerning what legislation might be introduced. In the context of your comments today, it would be helpful if matters were debated prior to some of those discussions. The Assembly's strategic role is important and must be recognised. I was concerned to hear what happened in respect of Pauline's inquiry to the Library on this issue. I want to pursue

Yng nghyd-destun y cytundeb partneriaeth, trafodwn amrywiol faterion sydd yn ymwneud â pha ddeddfwriaeth y gellid ei chyflwyno. Yng nghyd-destun eich sylwadau heddiw, byddai'n ddefnyddiol trafod materion cyn rhai o'r trafodaethau hynny. Mae rôl strategol y Cynulliad yn bwysig a rhaid ei chydnabod. Yr oeddwn yn bryderus i glywed am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd mewn perthynas ag ymholiad Pauline i'r Llyfrgell ar

some of these areas in Plenary to ensure that every public body and those who come under its parameters adhere to the Human Rights Act in Wales and that everything is done properly and to the highest standard.

y mater hwn. Dymunaf fynd ar drywydd rhai o'r meysydd hyn yn y Cyfarfod Llawn er mwyn sicrhau bod pob corff cyhoeddus a'r rhai a ddaw o dan ei adain yn cadw at y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol yng Nghymru ac y gwneir popeth yn gywir ac i'r safon uchaf.

Alison Halford: As somebody who took a case to the European Court of Human Rights in Strasbourg, which took five long and expensive years, I welcome your statement. That people are denied their human rights is shocking. I commend this Government and what you are doing. I do not want to be political, but it was under a previous Conservative administration that my telephones were tapped, which was shocking. That led me to the Labour Party and into politics. Well done and congratulations.

Alison Halford: Fel rhywun a aeth ag achos i Lys Hawliau Dynol Ewrop yn Strasbourg, a gymerodd bum mlynedd hir a chostus, croesawaf eich datganiad. Mae'n warthus bod hawliau dynol pobl yn cael eu hanwybyddu. Cymeradwyaf y Llywodraeth hon a'r hyn a wnewch. Nid wyf am fod yn wleidyddol, ond o dan weinyddiaeth Geidwadol flaenorol y tapiwyd fy ffonau, a oedd yn warthus. Arweiniodd hynny fi at y Blaid Lafur ac i mewn i wleidyddiaeth. Da iawn a llongyfarchiadau.

Edwina Hart: I do not think that anybody can understand how difficult it is for people to take cases to Strasbourg unless they have seen how the process affects individuals. It is wonderful that that is enshrined within our law. It is important that Wales leads the way in getting these matters right.

Edwina Hart: Ni chredaf y gall unrhyw un ddeall pa mor anodd yw hi i bobl fynd ag achosion i Strasbourg oni welsant sut yr effeithia'r broses ar unigolion. Mae'n wych yr ymgorfforir hynny o fewn ein cyfraith o ran cael y materion hyn yn iawn.

Glyn Davies: May I ask a question?

Glyn Davies: A gaf ofyn cwestiwn?

The Presiding Officer: Order. Do you wish to be called? Is this on a point of order or a comment on a question?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A ydych am gael eich galw? A yw hwn yn bwynt o drefn neu'n sylw ar gwestiwn?

Glyn Davies: It was just a quick question, but I will recall it.

Glyn Davies: Cwestiwn cyflym ydoedd, ond fe'i galwaf yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: If it is related to the statement concerning the previous Conservative Government—I allowed this to pass today in the spirit of my new found generosity—I wish to make it clear that I will not allow references to Westminster Governments to cloud our debates as we approach the general election, if I can manage it.

Y Llywydd: Os yw'n ymwneud â'r datganiad am y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol—gadewais i hyn fod heddiw yn ysbryd fy haelioni newydd—dymunaf egluro na chaniatâf gyfeiriadau at Lywodraethau San Steffan i gymylu ein dadleuon wrth inni agosáu at yr etholiad cyffredinol, os gallaf lwyddo i wneud hynny.

Glyn Davies: So, may I ask a question?

Glyn Davies: Felly, a gaf ofyn cwestiwn?

The Presiding Officer: I have noted your name.

Y Llywydd: Nodais eich enw.

Peter Black: I welcome this statement. It is important that the Assembly adopts the principles set out in the Human Rights Act,

Peter Black: Croesawaf y datganiad hwn. Mae'n bwysig y mabwysiada'r Cynulliad yr egwyddorion a nodir yn y Ddeddf Hawliau

which I support. I hope that it will make a difference to how public bodies conduct themselves in Wales and in the UK in future. Given that the Human Rights Act is legislation, which is enforceable in the courts, there is concern that when people have a grievance under the Act their only recourse is expensive legal action. While that is inevitable in any legislation, it can help in such situations if the National Assembly monitors complaints and various actions taken by individuals against public bodies across Wales, whether ASPBs, local authorities or even the National Assembly itself, to get a feel for how the Human Rights Act is applied and of people's grievances under that Act. There are situations where individuals have complaints but are unable to proceed with expensive court action. Perhaps we can learn lessons from that and try to resolve it in discussion. Perhaps you will be willing to take that on board as part of the monitoring of the application of this Act across Wales.

Dynol, a gefnogaf. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff wahaniaeth i'r modd y mae cyrff cyhoeddus yn ymddwyn yng Nghymru ac yn y DU yn y dyfodol. O ystyried bod y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol yn ddeddfwriaeth, y gellir ei gweithredu yn y llysoedd, mae pryder mai camau cyfreithiol costus yw'r unig beth y gall pobl eu cymryd pan fydd ganddynt gwyn o dan y Ddeddf. Er bod hynny'n anochel mewn unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth, gall helpu mewn sefyllfaoedd o'r fath os monitra'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gwynion a'r camau amrywiol a gymerir gan unigolion yn erbyn cyrff cyhoeddus ledled Cymru, pa un a ydynt yn Gyrff Cyhoeddus a Noddir gan y Cynulliad, yn awdurdodau lleol neu hyd yn oed y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei hun, i ymgyfarwyddo â'r modd y cymhwysir y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol a chwynion pobl o dan y Ddeddf honno. Ceir sefyllfaoedd lle bydd gan unigolion gwynion ond ni allant fwrw ymlaen â chamau costus yn y llys. Efallai y gallwn ddysgu gwersi o hynny a cheisio ei ddatrys mewn trafodaeth. Efallai y byddwch yn barod i ystyried hynny fel rhan o fonitro'r gwaith o gymhwyso'r Ddeddf hon ledled Cymru.

Edwina Hart: Your first point regarding the expense of resorting to the court links to Jocelyn's earlier point about establishing a human rights commission in Wales and whether we should have an organisation to collate the information and provide advice for citizens while the courts allow them to go through the legal process. Some of these issues can sometimes be resolved without going through that. Now that yours and Jocelyn's points have been made, the administration should consider the matter. However, I do not want it to be a matter just for the administration. We should have consensus across the whole Assembly. I would be happy to have a small group from all four political parties to work with me and take some of these issues forward.

Edwina Hart: Cysyllta eich pwynt cyntaf ynglŷn â'r gost o droi at y llysoedd â phwynt cynharach Jocelyn ynglŷn â sefydlu comisiwn hawliau dynol yng Nghymru ac a ddylem gael sefydliad i gasglu'r wybodaeth a darparu cyngor i ddinasyddion tra bydd y llysoedd yn caniatáu iddynt fynd drwy'r broses gyfreithiol. Gellir datrys rhai o'r materion hyn weithiau heb orfod gwneud hynny. Gan y gwnaethpwyd eich pwynt chi a phwynt Jocelyn erbyn hyn, dylai'r weinyddiaeth ystyried y mater. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf am iddo fod yn fater i'r weinyddiaeth yn unig. Dylem gael cytundeb ar draws y Cynulliad cyfan. Byddwn yn fodlon cael grŵp bach o'r pedair plaid wleidyddol i weithio gyda mi a gweithredu rhai o'r materion hyn.

David Melding: It is important that there are robust structures to take account of the Act. Your statement was useful and informative. However, is it not the case that many of the consequences for public bodies cannot be anticipated and that they will depend on court rulings? It is alarming that we cannot anticipate policy developments and

David Melding: Mae'n bwysig bod strwythurau grymus yn bodoli i ystyried y Ddeddf. Yr oedd eich datganiad yn ddefnyddiol ac yn llawn gwybodaeth. Fodd bynnag, onid y ffaith yw na ellir rhagweld llawer o'r canlyniadau i gyrff cyhoeddus ac y byddant yn dibynnu ar ddyfarniadau llysoedd? Mae'n frawychus na allwn ragweld

consequences in sectors such as health and education because when people make claims on issues such as equal access to the health service, resources will have to follow. One does not have to be a genius to work out that this could have considerable implications for the Assembly and the public bodies that we sponsor.

datblygiadau a chanlyniadau polisïau mewn sectorau megis iechyd ac addysg oherwydd pan wnaiff pobl geisiadau ar faterion megis mynediad cyfartal i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, rhaid i adnoddau ddilyn hynny. Nid oes rhaid bod yn athrylith i ddeall y gallai hyn gael goblygiadau sylweddol i'r Cynulliad a'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gennym.

Edwina Hart: That is a valid point. The legislation is expensive and it will be interesting to monitor people's recourse to it. When the courts start to make decisions on this, perhaps we will have a clearer picture. The courts' decision could have a considerable impact on us. That is why it is important that we are regularly updated and that we consider a mechanism to keep Members up to date on what has already happened in the courts. A case on the calling in of planning applications went through the High Court yesterday and may go to appeal elsewhere. That could have an impact on issues in Wales. The Assembly should be cognisant that the full implications of this Act have not been seen yet.

Edwina Hart: Mae hwnnw'n bwynt teg. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth yn gostus a bydd yn ddiddorol monitro ymateb pobl iddi. Pan ddechreua'r llysoedd wneud penderfyniadau ar hyn, efallai y cawn ddarlun cliriach. Gallai penderfyniad y llysoedd gael effaith sylweddol arnom. Dyna pam ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn cael y newyddion diweddaraf yn rheolaidd a'n bod yn ystyried mecanwaith i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Aelodau am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd eisoes yn y llysoedd. Aeth achos am alw ceisiadau cynllunio i mewn drwy'r Uchel Lys ddoe a gall fynd i apêl mewn man arall. Gallai hynny gael dylanwad ar faterion yng Nghymru. Dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn ymwybodol na welwyd oblygiadau llawn y Ddeddf hon eto.

Pauline Jarman: People in Wales believe that the Westminster Government has violated their Convention rights through not including a Welsh tick box on the census form. If there were a public challenge in the UK courts as set out in your statement, would it not be a matter of national embarrassment? Do you agree that the legal expense to the UK Government in defending such court action would be better spent on conceding the matter and that it should make amends by ensuring a Welsh tick box on the census form in Wales?

Pauline Jarman: Cred pobl yng Nghymru fod Llywodraeth San Steffan wedi ymyrryd â hawliau'r Cytundeb drwy beidio â chynnwys blwch ticio Cymreig ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad. Pe bai her gyhoeddus yn llysoedd y DU fel y nodwyd yn eich datganiad, oni fyddai'n fater o embaras cenedlaethol? A gytunwch y byddai'r gost gyfreithiol i Lywodraeth y DU wrth amddiffyn gweithred llys o'r fath yn cael ei wario'n well ar ildio'r mater ac y dylai wneud iawn drwy sicrhau blwch ticio Cymreig ar ffurflen y cyfrifiad yng Nghymru?

The Presiding Officer: The Minister does not have to answer that question. This is a general statement on the human rights process. However, I recognise the ingenuity of the supplementary.

Y Llywydd: Nid oes rhaid i'r Gweinidog ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae hwn yn ddatganiad cyffredinol ar y broses hawliau dynol. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddaf ddyfeisgarwch y cwestiwn atodol.

Edwina Hart: I do not want to comment on the UK Government's legal bills.

Edwina Hart: Nid wyf am roi sylwadau ar filiau cyfreithiol Llywodraeth y DU.

Glyn Davies: I support your statement. I had not intended to speak, but during earlier questions on the statement there was a question from an Assembly Member, which

Glyn Davies: Cefnogaf eich datganiad. Nid oeddwn wedi bwriadu siarad, ond yn ystod cwestiynau cynharach ar y datganiad cafwyd cwestiwn gan Aelod o'r Cynulliad, a

implied that under a previous Conservative Government it was more likely for telephones to be tapped than under an alternative Government. I resent that implication. Can you guarantee that no similar incidents have occurred under a Labour Government? If you cannot give guarantees today, will you make inquiries and return to the Assembly with—[*Interruption.*]

awgrymai ei bod yn fwy tebygol i ffonau gael eu tapio o dan Lywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol nag o dan Lywodraeth arall. Mae'n gas gennyf yr ensyniad hwnnw. A allwch sicrhau na chafwyd digwyddiadau tebyg o dan Lywodraeth Lafur? Os na allwch roi sicrwydd heddiw, a allwch wneud ymholiadau a dychwelyd i'r Cynulliad gyda—*[Torri ar draws.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. One at a time please.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Un ar y tro os gwelwch yn dda.

Glyn Davies: I will leave this point as it stands.

Glyn Davies: Gadawaf y pwynt hwn fel ag y mae.

Edwina Hart: This is not a matter for me.

Edwina Hart: Nid mater i mi yw hyn.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is a general statement about human rights and their relevance to Wales and to this Assembly, in particular. It is not a general debate on human rights, however welcome that might be to many of us.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae hwn yn ddatganiad cyffredinol am hawliau dynol a'u perthnasedd i Gymru ac i'r Cynulliad hwn, yn benodol. Nid yw'n ddadl gyffredinol ar hawliau dynol, pa mor dderbyniol bynnag y byddai hynny i nifer ohonom.

Alison Halford: Further to that point of order.

Alison Halford: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn.

The Presiding Officer: It was a question.

Y Llywydd: Cwestiwn ydoedd.

Alison Halford: Then it is a correction to the question.

Alison Halford: Felly mae'n gywiriad i'r cwestiwn.

The Presiding Officer: You have asked your question. Let us do this tidily and thank Edwina for the statement. I shall now take your point of order.

Y Llywydd: Gofynasoch eich cwestiwn. Gadewch inni wneud hyn yn daclus a diolch i Edwina am y datganiad. Cymeraf eich pwynt o drefn yn awr.

Alison Halford: Point of order. Glyn might like to know that the Members of the Conservative Government who were party to tapping my telephones were honourable enough to admit that my telephones had been tapped. Therefore, I must give them some credit and thank them for that.

Alison Halford: Pwynt o drefn. Efallai yr hoffai Glyn wybod bod Aelodau'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol a oedd yn ymwneud â thapio fy ffonau yn ddigon anrhydeddus i gyfaddef fod fy ffonau wedi'u tapio. Felly, rhaid imi roi clod a diolch iddynt am hynny.

The Presiding Officer: That is not a matter for me.

Y Llywydd: Nid mater i mi yw hynny.

Alun Cairns: Further to that point of order, I must protest. I fail to see how this is of benefit to the statement or the debate in any way.

Alun Cairns: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, rhaid imi brotestio. Ni allaf weld sut y mae hyn o fudd i'r datganiad neu'r ddadl mewn unrhyw ffordd.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to Alun Cairns for acting as assistant deputy presiding

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Alun Cairns am weithredu fel dirprwy lywydd

officer and for giving that advice. We will now move on.

cynorthwyol ac am roi'r cyngor hwnnw. Symudwn ymlaen yn awr.

Rod Richards: Point of order. Alison Halford should have declared an interest in this matter. As a former assistant chief constable, she may have been involved in the authorising of telephone intercepts.

Rod Richards: Pwynt o drefn. Dylai Alison Halford fod wedi datgan buddiant yn y mater hwn. Fel cyn brif gwnstabl cynorthwyol, gallai fod wedi bod yn gysylltiedig ag awdurdodi clustfeinio ar alwadau ffôn.

Alison Halford: If I did, it was under the Official Secrets Act, which is not under discussion today.

Alison Halford: Os gwneuthum hynny, yr oedd o dan y Ddeddf Cyfrinachau Swyddogol, na chaiff ei thrafod heddiw.

10:15 a.m.

Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Cymru) 2000
The Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales) Regulations 2000

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales) Regulations 2000 laid in the Table Office on 9 November 2000.

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Cymru) 2000, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Tachwedd 2000.

The purpose of these modulation regulations is to enable the National Assembly to recycle a small proportion of the direct aid that is paid to farmers under the common agricultural policy for the wider benefit of the agriculture industry in Wales. Without this legislation, the National Assembly's ability to pursue its longer-term agenda to sustain farming and rural communities in Wales will be fundamentally compromised. It would also mean that we would turn down the opportunity to access the Treasury's match funding commitment. I will respond to Peter Rogers' and Jocelyn Davies' amendments later.

Diben y rheoliadau modwleiddio hyn yw galluogi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i ailgylchu cyfran fach o gymorth uniongyrchol a delir i ffermwyr o dan y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin er lles ehangach y diwydiant amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru. Heb y ddeddfwriaeth hon, peryglir gallu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i fynd ar drywydd ei agenda tymor hwy i gynnal ffermio a chymunedau gwledig yng Nghymru yn sylfaenol. Byddai hefyd yn golygu y byddem yn gwrthod y cyfle i gael mynediad i ymrwymiad y Trysorlys i arian cyfatebol. Ymatebaf i welliannau Peter Rogers a Jocelyn Davies yn ddiweddarach.

Last December, we voted to approve the rural development plan for Wales. The plan was finally agreed with the European Commission in October. It was the first plan by one of the four UK territories to be approved. The plan is vital to the wellbeing of our rural communities in Wales. Modulation is a necessary component for the

Fis Rhagfyr diwethaf pleidleisiwyd i gymeradwyo'r cynllun datblygu gwledig ar gyfer Cymru. Cytunwyd ar y cynllun yn derfynol â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ym mis Hydref. Hwn oedd y cynllun cyntaf i'w gymeradwyo gan un o bedair tiriogaeth y DU. Mae'r cynllun yn holl bwysig i les ein cymunedau gwledig yng Nghymru. Mae

delivery of the resources that are mentioned in the plan. The plan contains many measures that are critical to the future of farming in Wales, including support for the Welsh agri-food strategy, the organic farming scheme, the Tir Gofal agri-environmental scheme as well as training, information and advisory services for farmers through Farming Connect. The modulation process is estimated to redirect £39 million from the farm subsidies over the six-year period of the rural development plan. This money will be match funded pound for pound by the UK Treasury.

modwleiddio'n gydran angenrheidiol ar gyfer cyflwyno'r adnoddau a grybwyllir yn y cynllun. Cynhwysa'r cynllun lawer o fesurau sydd yn hanfodol i ddyfodol ffermio yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys cefnogaeth i strategaeth bwyd-amaeth Cymru, y cynllun ffermio organig, cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol Tir Gofal yn ogystal â gwasanaethau hyfforddiant, gwybodaeth ac ymgynghorol i ffermwyr drwy Farming Connect. Amcangyfrifir y bydd y broses modwleiddio yn ailgyfeirio £39 miliwn o'r cymorthdaliadau i ffermydd dros gyfnod chwe wythnos y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Bydd Trysorlys y DU yn rhoi arian cyfatebol punt wrth bunt at hyn.

I confirm that the National Assembly's funding settlement from the UK Government, as announced in the comprehensive spending review for this period, includes the necessary match funding. This has been built into the National Assembly's budget, which was formally agreed last week. In short, modulation will generate a £78 million package of investment to help rural development in Wales.

Cadarnhaf fod setliad cyllid y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gan Lywodraeth y DU, fel y cyhoeddwyd yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant am y cyfnod hwn, yn cynnwys yr arian cyfatebol angenrheidiol. Ymgorfforwyd hwn yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, y cytunwyd arno'n ffurfiol yr wythnos diwethaf. Yn fyr, bydd modwleiddio'n cynhyrchu pecyn buddsoddi o £78 miliwn i helpu datblygu gwledig yng Nghymru.

Modulation will apply at a flat rate to all farm businesses that receive direct CAP payments. It will not apply to the Tir Mynydd scheme, because that is not a direct subsidy scheme. Modulation will be introduced at a low level, starting at 2.5 per cent in 2001-02 and increasing gradually to 4.5 per cent by 2005-06. Identical legislation is being introduced in England, Scotland and Northern Ireland. It is intended that modulation will come into force on 1 January 2001 across the four countries within the UK.

Bydd modwleiddio'n gymwys ar gyfradd unffurf i bob busnes fferm sydd yn derbyn taliadau PAC uniongyrchol. Ni fydd yn gymwys i'r cynllun Tir Mynydd, am nad yw'n gynllun cymhorthdal uniongyrchol. Cyflwynir modwleiddio ar lefel isel, gan ddechrau ar 2.5 y cant yn 2001-02 a chodi yn raddol i 4.5 y cant erbyn 2005-06. Cyflwynir yr un ddeddfwriaeth yn union yn Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Bwriedir i fodwleiddio ddod i rym ar 1 Ionawr 2001 ar draws y pedair gwlad o fewn y DU.

Dafydd Wigley: A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau, er iddo ddisgrifio'r datblygiadau hyn fel rhai hanfodol ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru, nad ydynt, ynddynt eu hunain, yn ddigon i achub y diwydiant o'r argyfwng enbyd a wyneba ar hyn o bryd? A oes gan y Gweinidog weledigaeth bellach ar hyn er mwyn ceisio darganfod ateb yn y tymor byr?

Dafydd Wigley: Will the Minister confirm that, while he describes these developments as essential for agriculture in Wales, they are not, in themselves, sufficient to save the industry from the grave crisis that it currently faces? Does the Minister have a further vision in order to try to find a solution in the short term?

Carwyn Jones: Nid dim ond y £78 miliwn y soniaf amdano yn awr a roddir i gefn gwlad Cymru. Drwy gydol oes y cynllun, bydd tua

Carwyn Jones: Rural Wales will receive more than the £78 million that we are discussing now. The scheme will provide

£450 miliwn yn mynd i'r economi leol yn yr ardaloedd gwledig. Bydd llawer mwy o arian na £78 miliwn ar gael. O ystyried y cynlluniau eraill y soniais amdanynt, megis Tir Gofal, y cynllun organig a'r cynllun bwyd-amaeth, cymerir llawer o gamau er mwyn datblygu dyfodol disglair a sicr i gefn gwlad.

approximately £450 million for the local economy in rural areas. Much more than £78 million will be available. Considering the other schemes that I have mentioned, such as Tir Gofal, the organic scheme and the agri-food scheme, many steps will be taken to develop a prosperous and secure future for rural Wales.

It is an underlying principle of modulation that the resources that it frees up, supported by match funding, will be spent in the country where they are raised. All resources generated from modulating direct subsidy payments in Wales, together with the match funding, will be invested in Wales on measures to stimulate further rural development. None of that money will leak out of Wales.

Un o egwyddorion sylfaenol modwleiddio yw y gwerir yr adnoddau a ryddha, ac a gynhelir gan arian cyfatebol, yn y wlad lle y'u codir. Buddsoddir yr holl adnoddau a gynhyrchir o fodwleiddio taliadau cymhorthdal uniongyrchol yng Nghymru, ynghyd â'r arian cyfatebol, yng Nghymru ar fesurau i ysgogi datblygiad gwledig pellach. Ni fydd dim o'r arian hwnnw'n llifo allan o Gymru.

We issued a consultation document last February, which provided a full assessment of the impact of modulation on farm incomes. It recognised that there was concern that modulation would discriminate against small farms. The analysis that was published as part of the consultation document indicated that modulation would, in broad terms, have a similar relative impact on small and large farms. In preparing that assessment, economists considered the Agenda 2000 CAP reforms. When fully implemented they will have, on balance, a positive effect on farm incomes. The work carried out by isolating the effects of Agenda 2000 from other changes that might affect farm incomes over the coming years, but which are more difficult to predict, was also fully considered.

Cyhoeddasom ddogfen ymgynghorol fis Chwefror diwethaf, a ddarparodd asesiad llawn o effaith modwleiddio ar incymau ffermydd. Cydnabu fod pryder y byddai modwleiddio'n gwahaniaethu yn erbyn ffermydd bach. Dangosodd y dadansoddiad a gyhoeddwyd fel rhan o'r ddogfen ymgynghorol y câi modwleiddio, yn fras, effaith berthnasol debyg ar ffermydd bach a mawr. Wrth baratoi'r asesiad hwnnw, ystyriodd economegwyr ddiwygiadau PAC Agenda 2000. Pan gânt eu gweithredu'n llawn cânt effaith gadarnhaol ar incymau ffermydd at ei gilydd. Ystyriwyd yn llawn hefyd y gwaith a gynhaliwyd drwy ynysu effeithiau Agenda 2000 oddi wrth newidiadau eraill a allai effeithio ar incymau ffermydd yn ystod y blynyddoedd i ddod, ond sydd yn anos eu rhagweld.

Using the example of cattle and sheep farms in less favoured areas, net farm incomes were forecast to be £4,750 in 1998 and 1999. However, after incorporating the Agenda 2000 reforms, by 2006-07, the estimated income, based on the present figures that we have, will be £5,420. That includes the impact of modulation at the maximum 4.5 per cent rate. Therefore, if recycled payments were incorporated with benefits from Treasury match funding, farmers would be expected to be considerably better off. In sum, the overall effect of modulation on farm incomes will be off-set by the Agenda 2000 reforms.

Gan ddefnyddio ffermydd gwartheg a defaid mewn ardaloedd llai atyniadol fel enghraifft, rhagwelwyd y byddai incymau net ffermydd yn £4,750 yn 1998 a 1999. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl ymgorffori diwygiadau Agenda 2000, erbyn 2006-07, bydd yr incwm a amcangyfrifir, yn seiliedig ar y ffigurau presennol sydd gennym, yn £5,420. Mae hynny'n cynnwys effaith modwleiddio ar y raddfa uchaf bosibl o 4.5 y cant. Felly, os ymgorfforwyd taliadau a ailgylchwyd gan fanteision arian cyfatebol y Trysorlys, disgwylid y byddai ffermwyr gryn dipyn yn well eu byd. Yn fyr, gwrthbwysir effaith gyffredinol modwleiddio ar incymau

ffermydd gan ddiwygiadau Agenda 2000.

This money is not simply coming from farmers; it is being matched pound for pound by the Treasury. I re-emphasise that far more money is coming in to be spent in Wales as part of the rural development plan. The majority of those who responded to the consultation were in favour of modulation, and that issue was discussed fully in the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee last July, I think. It is a matter of public record that that Committee supported the proposal.

Ni ddaw'r arian hwn o'r ffermydd yn unig; bydd y Trysorlys yn ei gyfateb bunt wrth bunt. Ailbwysleisiaf fod llawer mwy o arian yn dod i mewn i'w wario yng Nghymru fel rhan o'r cynllun datblygu gwledig. Yr oedd y mwyafrif o'r rhai a ymatebodd i'r ymgynghoriad o blaid modwleiddio, a thrafodwyd y mater hwnnw yn llawn yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, fe gredaf. Mae'n fater o gofnod cyhoeddus fod y Pwyllgor hwnnw wedi cefnogi'r cynnig.

I turn to the amendments tabled by Peter Rogers and Jocelyn Davies. On Peter's amendment 1, I fully understand the difficulties in the farming sector and the pressures on the agriculture industry but, to coin a phrase used many times in years gone by, the status quo is not an option. We cannot sit back and do nothing while farming experiences such difficulties. It is extremely important that we move forward with plans to develop, in the medium to long term, a secure future for farming in Wales. That amendment also implies that, during the next few months or years, nothing will be done to increase the income of farmers in Wales. I cannot accept that, given the plans that we have in place to do that and to provide a sustainable and secure future for the farming industry.

Trof at y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan Peter Rogers a Jocelyn Davies. O ran gwelliant 1 Peter, deallaf yn llawn yr anawsterau yn y sector ffermio a'r pwysau ar y diwydiant amaethyddiaeth ond, os goddefir yr ymadrodd a ddefnyddiwyd lawer gwaith yn ystod y blynyddoedd a fu, nid yw'r statws quo yn opsiwn. Ni allwn eistedd yn ôl a gwneud dim tra bod ffermio'n profi anawsterau o'r fath. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig ein bod yn symud ymlaen â chynlluniau i ddatblygu dyfodol cadarn ar gyfer ffermio yng Nghymru yn y tymor canolig a hir. Mae'r gwelliant hwnnw hefyd yn awgrymu na chaiff unrhyw beth ei wneud yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd neu flynyddoedd nesaf, i godi incwm ffermwyr yng Nghymru. Ni allaf dderbyn hynny, o gofio'r cynlluniau sydd gennym i wneud hynny a darparu dyfodol cynaliadwy a chadarn i'r diwydiant ffermio.

On Jocelyn's amendment 2, the labour unit approach to modulation was considered by the Committee during this year. It may seem, superficially, to be an attractive socio-economic and environmental approach. However, the difficulties in identifying the number of labour units present on a farm are phenomenal because so much farm labour is informal and, therefore, extremely difficult to quantify. Likewise, it can be difficult to quantify whether somebody works full time or part time and, if they work part time, how much time they give to the farm and so on. That makes it impossible, when considering informal labour on farms, to determine what a labour unit is. It means that the only way of determining a labour unit accurately, for auditing purposes, is to look at labour units

O ran gwelliant 2 Jocelyn, ystyriodd y Pwyllgor ymagwedd yr uned lafur tuag at fodwleiddio yn ystod y flwyddyn hon. Gall ymddangos, ar yr wyneb, fel ymagwedd economaidd-gymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol ddeniadol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r anawsterau wrth nodi nifer yr unedau llafur sydd yn bresennol ar fferm yn aruthrol oherwydd mae cymaint o waith fferm yn anffurfiol ac, felly, yn eithriadol o anodd i'w feintioli. Yn yr un modd, gall fod yn anodd meintioli a fydd rhywun yn gweithio'n llawn amser neu'n rhan amser, ac, os gweithiant yn rhan amser, faint o amser a roddant i'r fferm ac yn y blaen. Gwna hynny hi'n amhosibl pennu beth yw uned lafur, o ystyried gwaith anffurfiol ar ffermydd. Golyga mai'r unig ffordd i bennu uned lafur yn gywir, at ddibenion archwilio,

where people are formally contracted to work on farms—people whose hours are easily documented and verifiable. Inevitably, that means that it is the larger farms, in the main, that offer formal employment and contracts. Therefore, instead of helping family farms, which is at the heart of what we seek to do in the National Assembly, it would discriminate against them by making it easier for larger farms, in terms of considering how labour units operate. For those reasons, I cannot accept amendment 2 because it would inevitably mean that smaller farms would be discriminated against unfairly. I know that that is not the intention behind the amendment, but, realistically, that would happen.

yw edrych ar unedau llafur lle'r ymrwymir pobl i weithio'n ffurfiol ar ffermydd—pobl y dogfennir ac y profir eu horiau yn hawdd. Yn anochel, golyga hynny mai'r ffermydd mwyaf, yn bennaf, sydd yn cynnig cyflogaeth a chontractau ffurfiol. Felly, yn lle helpu ffermydd teuluol, sydd wrth wraidd yr hyn y ceisiwn ei wneud yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, byddai'n gwahaniaethu yn eu herbyn drwy ei gwneud yn haws i ffermydd mwy o faint, o ran ystyried sut y gweithreda unedau llafur. Am y rhesymau hynny, ni allaf dderbyn gwelliant 2 am y golygai'n anochel y gwahaniaethir yn annheg yn erbyn ffermydd llai o faint. Gwn nad dyna'r bwriad y tu ôl i'r gwelliant, ond, yn realistig, byddai hynny'n digwydd.

I remind Members that modulation must be applied consistently across the UK. The current proposals offer the basis for agreement that has been made between the four agriculture departments in the UK. This money will be reinvested in rural areas together with the match funding from the Treasury. In my view, modulation would provide the basis for sound investment to create a healthier long-term future for our rural communities and a sound basis upon which the rural development plan for Wales can be delivered. I ask Members to support the motion for approval of the regulations and not to support amendments 1 and 2.

Atgoffaf Aelodau fod yn rhaid cymhwyso modwleiddio'n gyson ar draws y DU. Cynigia'r cynigion cyfredol y sail ar gyfer y cytundeb a wnaethpwyd rhwng y pedair adran amaethyddiaeth yn y DU. Caiff yr arian hwn ei ailfuddsoddi mewn ardaloedd gwledig ynghyd â'r arian cyfatebol o'r Trysorlys. Yn fy marn i, byddai modwleiddio'n darparu'r sylfaen i fuddsoddi'n gadarn er mwyn creu dyfodol tymor hir mwy iach i'n cymunedau gwledig a sylfaen gadarn ar gyfer cyflwyno'r cynllun datblygu gwledig i Gymru. Gofynnaf i Aelodau gefnogi'r cynnig i gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau ac nid i gefnogi gwelliannau 1 a 2.

10:25 a.m.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Peter Rogers and amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Llywydd: Dewisiais welliant 1 yn enw Peter Rogers a gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Peter Rogers: I propose amendment 1. Add as a new clause:

Peter Rogers: Cynigiaf welliant 1. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd:

and requests the Minister for Rural Affairs to bring forward proposals to ensure that any reduction in direct farm subsidies does not detrimentally effect net farm incomes.

ac yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig gyflwyno cynigion i sicrhau na fydd unrhyw ostyngiad mewn cymorthdaliadau uniongyrchol i ffermydd yn effeithio'n andwyol ar incymau net ffermydd.

I declare an interest as an Anglesey farmer. The proposals before us raise particular issues of concern for the farming industry. That is why I have tabled amendment 1. These concerns also mean that the Welsh Conservative Party will vote against the

Datganaf fuddiant fel ffermwr o Ynys Môn. Cwyd y cynigion ger ein bron faterion penodol o bryder i'r diwydiant ffermio. Dyna paham y cyflwynais welliant 1. Golyga'r pryderon hyn hefyd y pleidleisia Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn erbyn cymeradwyo'r

approval of the regulations. We will do that for particular reasons, which I will explain. We know—and I was grateful for Dafydd's intervention—that the industry is suffering its worst crisis for a generation. I am not convinced that modulation offers a solution. That is the crucial point. Modulation might increase the total amount of money available for long-term schemes, but by the same token, it reduces the amount of money paid in direct subsidies to farmers. The point is simple and powerful. The timing of modulation is wrong. It will cut subsidies at a time when the industry cannot afford to shoulder that burden. We would all like to see less reliance on direct subsidies. The industry is overdependent on them and that is the problem. We do not have an industry that can survive at present without subsidies. That is the reality of the situation. Things will not change for several years. I remain to be convinced that the best way of tackling the industry's reliance on subsidies is by removing them. However, that is the effect of the proposals before us. The lesson is clear. Subsidy cuts will punish an already struggling industry. The first point is that the timing of modulation is wrong and will punish this already struggling industry.

rheoliadau. Gwnawn hynny am resymau penodol, y ceisiaf eu hesbonio. Gwyddom—ac yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar am ymyriad Dafydd—fod y diwydiant yn dioddef ei argyfwng gwaethaf ers cenhedlaeth. Nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig fod modwleiddio'n cynnig ateb. Dyna'r pwynt tyngedfennol. Efallai bod modwleiddio'n cynyddu cyfanswm yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer cynlluniau tymor hir, ond yn yr un modd, mae'n gostwng y swm o arian a delir mewn cymorthdaliadau uniongyrchol i ffermwyr. Mae'n bwynt syml a grymus. Mae amseru modwleiddio'n anghywir. Bydd yn torri cymorthdaliadau ar adeg pan na all y diwydiant fforddio i ysgwyddo'r baich hwnnw. Hoffem i gyd weld llai o ddibyniaeth ar gymorthdaliadau uniongyrchol. Mae'r diwydiant yn orddibynnol arnynt ac mae hynny'n broblem. Nid oes gennym ddiwydiant a all oroesi ar hyn o bryd heb gymorthdaliadau. Dyna realiti'r sefyllfa. Ni fydd pethau'n newid am nifer o flynyddoedd. Arhosaf i gael fy narbwyllo mai'r ffordd orau o fynd i'r afael â dibyniaeth y diwydiant ar gymorthdaliadau yw drwy gael gwared arnynt. Fodd bynnag, dyna effaith y cynigion ger ein bron. Mae'r wers yn glir. Cosba toriadau mewn cymorthdaliadau ddiwydiant sydd eisoes mewn trafferthion. Y pwynt cyntaf yw fod amseriad modwleiddio'n anghywir a chosba'r diwydiant hwn sydd eisoes mewn trafferthion.

Second, the consequences of policy on the ground. We must take a pragmatic line and adopt a common sense measure. I am not sure that modulation is either of those things. The answer to the industry's plight is not to pour vast amounts of money into a bottomless pit. We must ensure that that money is spent prudently and, more importantly, we must ensure that money is spent effectively. It is clear that all farmers do not benefit from Assembly schemes. Yet, these farmers are being asked to accept a cut in their subsidies, only to see money redistributed elsewhere. Those farmers will lose out, and modulation for them represents robbing Peter to pay Paul.

Yn ail, canlyniadau polisïau ar lawr gwlad. Rhaid inni fod yn ymarferol a mabwysiadu mesur synnwyr cyffredin. Nid wyf yn siŵr fod modwleiddio yn naill beth neu'r llall. Yr ateb i drafferthion y diwydiant yw peidio ag arllwys symiau anferthol o arian i bwll diwaelod. Rhaid inni sicrhau y gwerir yr arian hwnnw yn ddoeth ac, yn bwysicach, rhaid inni sicrhau y gwerir arian yn effeithiol. Mae'n glir nad yw pob ffermwr yn elwa ar gynlluniau'r Cynulliad. Eto i gyd, gofynnir i'r ffermwyr hyn dderbyn gostyngiad yn eu cymorthdaliadau, dim ond i weld yr arian yn cael ei ailddosbarthu i rywle arall. Bydd y ffermwyr hynny'n colli allan, ac iddynt hwy cynrychiola modwleiddio gwerthu'r fuwch i brynu tarw.

With net farm incomes continuing to slide, a cut in subsidies will only worsen this situation.

Wrth i incymau net ffermydd barhau i ostwng, dim ond gwaethygu'r sefyllfa hon fyddai torri cymorthdaliadau.

Janet Davies: Could you define 'net farm incomes'? I previously asked what they were, and was told that they are a financial construct relating to the conceptual rental value of a farm.

Janet Davies: A allech ddiffinio 'incymau net ffermydd'? Gofynnais beth oeddynt o'r blaen, a dywedwyd wrthyf mai ymadrodd ariannol ydyw sydd yn ymwneud â gwerth rhentu cysyniadol ffermydd.

Peter Rogers: Some figures have recently been published. The figure for the average annual income that sticks in my mind is around £4,000. We must remember that the majority of family farms in Wales are subsidised by off-farm work. The wife, husband, son or daughter are contributing to the farms.

Peter Rogers: Cyhoeddwyd rhai ffigurau yn ddiweddar. Y ffigur sydd yn aros yn fy nghof ar gyfer cyfartaledd yr incwm blynyddol yw tua £4,000. Rhaid inni gofio bod gwaith oddi ar y fferm yn cynnal y mwyafrif o ffermydd teuluol yng Nghymru. Cyfranna'r wraig, y gwr, y mab neu'r ferch i'r ffermydd.

The Assembly must work in the interests of all farmers. There must be a level playing field in Wales. Farmers are rightly troubled by the fact that this coalition's warm words of encouragement are not met by delivery. For example, the coalition's failure to act on the Welsh Conservatives' call for the Assembly to use devolved powers to protect the public from the BSE crisis in Europe, which has already led to a disastrous fall in beef cattle prices. Why should we allow other countries' failure—after our experiences—to hit our farmers?

Rhaid i'r Cynulliad weithio er lles pob ffermwr. Rhaid bod cae chwarae gwastad yng Nghymru. Mae gan ffermwyr achos I bryderu am y ffaith na chyflawnir y geiriau caredig o anogaeth gan y glymblaid. Er enghraifft, methiant y glymblaid i weithredu ar alwad Ceidwadwyr Cymru i'r Cynulliad ddefnyddio pwerau datganoledig i ddiogelu'r cyhoedd rhag argyfwng BSE yn Ewrop, a arweiniodd eisoes at gwymp trychinebus ym mhrisiau gwartheg bîff. Pam y dylem ganiatáu i fethiant gwledydd eraill—ar ôl ein profiadau ni—daro ein ffermwyr ni?

Peter Black: It would be useful if you could outline how we could use devolved powers to protect the public from the BSE crisis in Europe, given that this is normally a matter for nation states?

Peter Black: Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe gallech amlinellu sut y gallem ddefnyddio pwerau datganoledig i ddiogelu'r cyhoedd rhag argyfwng BSE yn Ewrop, o gofio bod hwn yn fater i wladwriaethau'r cenhedloedd fel rheol?

Peter Rogers: The answer has been there since about 1990, when legislation was brought in that all meat over 30 months old should not be allowed into this country without full traceability. We have failed to enforce these rules. This is the downfall of British farming. Ministers have the powers, under section 16 of the Food Safety Act 1990. The coalition's dithering over the issue is another example of how this Government is letting the farming industry down. Modulation is an investment gamble, but the timing and application is wrong, making modulation a form of Russian roulette. For these reasons, the Welsh Conservatives cannot approve modulation as it stands. We need assurance and measures that will guarantee the safety of farmers' livelihoods.

Peter Rogers: Bu'r ateb yno ers tua 1990, pan gyflwynwyd deddfwriaeth na ddylid caniatáu i gig dros 30 mis oed ddod i mewn i'r wlad hon heb iddo gael ei olrhain yn llawn. Methasom â gorfodi'r rheolau hyn. Dyma gwymp ffermio ym Mhrydain. Mae gan Weinidogion y pwerau, o dan adran 16 Deddf Diogelwch Bwyd 1990. Mae diffyg pendantrwydd y glymblaid ynglŷn â'r mater yn enghraifft arall o sut y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn siomi'r y diwydiant ffermio. Mae modwleiddio yn fenter buddsoddi, ond mae'r amseriad a'r cymhwyso yn anghywir, gan wneud modwleiddio yn rhyw fath o gêm beryglus. Am y rhesymau hyn, ni all Ceidwadwyr Cymru gymeradwyo modwleiddio fel ag y mae. Mae angen sicrwydd a mesurau arnom a fydd yn sicrhau

Until that time, the debate cannot move forward.

diogelwch bywoliaeth ffermwyr. Tan hynny, ni all y ddadl symud yn ei blaen.

I turn to Jocelyn's amendment 2. I am surprised that the Party of Wales wants to discriminate against family farms. It is dangerous to bring in labour units and it would not help the Welsh family farms.

Trof at welliant 2 Jocelyn. Synnaf fod Plaid Cymru yn dymuno gwahaniaethu yn erbyn ffermydd teuluol. Mae'n beryglus cyflwyno unedau llafur ac ni fyddai'n helpu'r ffermydd teuluol yng Nghymru.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf Elin Jones i gynnig gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

The Presiding Officer: I call Elin Jones to propose amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Elin Jones: Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd:

Elin Jones: I propose amendment 2. Add as a new clause:

ac yn cynnal ymchwiliad i'r posibilrwydd o gyflwyno cyfrif uned lafur wrth adolygu'r cynllun yn y dyfodol er mwyn rhoi mwy o gymorth i fusnesau fferm sydd yn cynnig cyflogaeth.

and undertakes to investigate the possibility if introducing a labour unit calculation in any future review of the scheme in order to increase the assistance to farm businesses that offer employment.

Croesawaf weithredu'r egwyddor o fodwleiddio a'r ffaith bod y Trysorlys wedi darparu cyllid cyfatebol i'w wario ar y mesurau ychwanegol yn y cynllun datblygu gwledig.

I welcome the implementation of the principle of modulation and the fact that the Treasury has provided match funding for the additional measures in the rural development plan.

Mynegaf eto'r siom nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn barod i weithredu'r cynllun newydd-ddyfodiaid fel un o'r mesurau ychwanegol.

I express again our disappointment that the Government of Wales is not prepared to implement the new entrants scheme as one of the additional measures.

Dylai nifer o egwyddorion fod yn ganolog i gynllun datblygu gwledig: cynhyrchu a phrosesu bwyd o ansawdd, gwarchod yr amgylchedd a sicrhau bioamrywiaeth. Rhaid inni gyd ymelwa o fodwleiddio.

A number of principles should be central to a rural development plan: producing and processing quality food, protecting the environment and ensuring biodiversity. We must all benefit from modulation.

Yr egwyddor holl bwysig arall a ddylai fod yn greiddiol i'r cynllun yw'r angen i sicrhau a hyrwyddo cyflogaeth yng nghefn gwlad. Dylai modwleiddio ddigwydd ar sail rhyw fath o gyfrif o unedau llafur. Dylai hynny fod yn gyfraniad pwysig i gydnabod yr angen i hyrwyddo cyflogaeth. Yn benodol, byddai'n targedu adnoddau at ffermydd o faint canolig, sydd yn aml yn cyflogi, neu angen cyflogi, unedau llafur ychwanegol. Gwrthodaf rai o'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd y bore yma yn dweud bod hyn yn gwahaniaethu yn erbyn y ffermydd hynny.

The other key principle that should be central to the scheme is the need to secure and promote employment in rural areas. Modulation should happen on the basis of some sort of calculation of labour units. That should be an important contribution to acknowledging the need to promote employment. Specifically, it would target resources towards medium-sized farms, which often employ, or need to employ, additional labour units. I reject some of the comments made this morning stating that this discriminates against those farms.

10:35**Error! Bookmark not defined.** a.m.

Mae swyddogion yr Adran Amaethyddiaeth yn dueddol o ddweud bod modwleiddio ar sail unedau llafur yn rhy gymhleth. Yr wyf wedi eu clywed yn dweud hynny. Yr wyf hefyd wedi clywed y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig yn cytuno â hynny y bore yma.

Agriculture Department officials tend to say that modulation on the basis of labour units is too complex. I have heard them say so. I have also heard the Minister for Rural Affairs agreeing with that this morning.

Anghytunaf â'r Gweinidog fod y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig wedi trafod modwleiddio ar sail unedau llafur yn fanwl. Nid ydym wedi trafod hynny yn fanwl. Nid oes papur wedi dod i'r Pwyllgor ar yr egwyddor hon. Efallai bod modwleiddio ar sail unedau llafur yn rhy gymhleth, ond nid yw'r achos wedi ei brofi. Mae system fodwleiddio ar sail unedau llafur eisoes yn weithredol yn Ffrainc, felly mae enghraifft yn bodoli y gallem ei dilyn. Y cyfan y mae gwelliant 2 Jocelyn Davies yn gofyn amdano yw ein bod yn cynnal ymchwiliad manwl i'r posiblilrwydd o gynnwys unedau llafur mewn fformwla modwleiddio er mwyn inni gael dadl iawn ar y mater hwn. Yr wyf yn siomedig fod y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Phlaid Geidwadol Cymru yn gwrthod yr egwyddor a'r syniad o gael trafodaeth fanwl ac ymchwiliad i'r posibilrwydd o gynnwys unedau llafur mewn modwleiddio.

I disagree with the Minister that the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee has discussed modulation on the basis of labour units in detail. We have not discussed that in detail. No paper has been submitted to the Committee on this principle. Modulation on the basis of labour units may well be too complex, but the case has not been proven. A modulation system on the basis of labour units is already operating in France, so there is an example that we could follow. All Jocelyn Davies asks for in amendment 2 is that we hold a detailed inquiry into the possibility of including labour units in a modulation formula so that we can have a proper debate on this matter. I am disappointed that the Minister for Rural Affairs and the Welsh Conservative Party reject the principle and the idea of having a detailed discussion and an inquiry into the possibility of including labour units in modulation.

Pe bai argymhellion cadarnhaol yn deillio o'r fath waith, gallem weithio gyda gwledydd eraill o fewn y Deyrnas Gyfunol i gytuno ar yr argymhellion. Mae'n debyg bod yn rhaid cael cytundeb drwy'r DG ar hyn. Gallem fod yn arwain ar y mater pwysig hwn. Cynhelir adolygiad o'r cynllun datblygu gwledig, ac felly mae cyfle o ddifrif i roi ystyriaeth fanwl i'r egwyddor o ddefnyddio unedau llafur. O gefnogi gwelliant 2 Jocelyn Davies heddiw, byddwn yn gobeithio y gallem ddechrau ar gyfraniad cadarnhaol i gefnogi'r egwyddor o sicrhau a hyrwyddo cyflogaeth mewn cymunedau gwledig. Gofynnaf eto i'r Gweinidog ailystyried gwelliant 2 Jocelyn Davies a chytuno i gael trafodaeth lawn ar y pwnc pwysig hwn.

If positive recommendations were to come out of such work, we could work with other countries within the United Kingdom to agree the recommendations. It appears that it is necessary to have a UK-wide agreement on this. We could be leading the way on this important matter. A review of the rural development plan will be held and therefore there is a real opportunity to give detailed consideration to the principle of using labour units. In supporting Jocelyn Davies's amendment 2 today, I would hope that we could start to make a positive contribution to supporting the principle of ensuring and promoting employment in rural communities. I again ask the Minister to reconsider Jocelyn Davies's amendment 2 and to agree to hold a full debate on this important issue.

Mick Bates: I declare an interest as a partner in a farming business. This legislation about modulation has been discussed for many years in the farming industry. Unfortunately, the term modulation means many things. In

Mick Bates: Datganaf fuddiant fel partner mewn busnes ffermio. Trafodwyd y ddeddfwriaeth hon am fodwleiddio ers blynyddoedd lawer yn y diwydiant ffermio. Yn anffodus, golyga'r gair modwleiddio

the context of this particular regulation, which has already been accepted throughout the rest of the UK and throughout Europe, to a greater or lesser extent, the term is not as it was previously understood, which was purely social engineering. This is intended to achieve a policy development. As we have already heard, there is agreement that the extra funding that would be brought in for the development of our rural policies is welcome. It amounts at the end of the programme to £78 million. All parties in this Assembly have agreed that the rural development plan and the agri-environment schemes embodied in it are to be welcomed. This money will increase them and is also welcome.

lawer o bethau. Yng nghyd-destun y rheoliad penodol hwn, a dderbyniwyd eisoes ledled gweddill y DU a ledled Ewrop, i raddau mwy neu lai, nid yw'n golygu'r un peth ag yr arferai wneud, sef peirianneg gymdeithasol yn unig. Fe'i bwriedir i gyflawni datblygiad polisi. Fel y clywsom eisoes, mae cytundeb fod croeso i'r cyllid ychwanegol a gyflwynid i ddatblygu ein polisïau gwledig. Ar ddiwedd y rhaglen daw i gyfanswm o £78 miliwn. Cytunodd pob plaid yn y Cynulliad hwn fod croeso i'r cynllun datblygu gwledig a'r cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol a ymgorfforwyd ynddo. Bydd yr arian hwn yn eu cynyddu ac fe'i croesewir hefyd.

I do not doubt that the changes implicit in this regulation will affect the way of thinking in the agriculture industry. As Europe enlarges, the amount of support to Wales will fall. That is part of a process—which is difficult at times—to rebuild an industry that is prepared to meet the challenges of the future. I was greatly heartened recently that the representatives of the farming industry in Wales are now taking a practical and realistic view of how we can rebuild the industry and get out of the agricultural crisis in which we have been for some years. In response to Peter Rogers, when you are in a crisis and are in a deep hole, for goodness sake, throw the shovel away and try to climb out of that crisis. This offers a way to do that. This mechanism is basically a top slicing of European support moneys. No one can ensure that individual businesses are unaffected in any business. Your amendment, Peter, is impossible to implement. It is like asking the Minister for Environment to stop the rain—you just cannot do it.

Nid amheuaf y bydd y newidiadau sydd yn ymhlyg yn y rheoliad hwn yn effeithio ar y ffordd o feddwl yn y diwydiant amaethyddiaeth. Wrth i Ewrop ehangu, bydd y gefnogaeth i Gymru yn gostwng. Mae hynny yn rhan o broses—sydd yn anodd ar brydiau—i ailadeiladu diwydiant sydd yn barod i ateb heriau'r dyfodol. Fe'm calonogwyd yn fawr yn ddiweddar fod cynrychiolwyr o'r diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru yn awr yn cymryd golwg ymarferol a realistig o sut y gallwn ailadeiladu'r diwydiant a dod allan o'r argyfwng amaethyddol y buom ynddo ers rhai blynyddoedd. Mewn ymateb i Peter Rogers, pan fyddwch mewn argyfwng ac mewn twll dwfn, er mwyn popeth, taflwch y rhaw a cheisiwch ddringo allan o'r argyfwng hwnnw. Cynigia hyn ffordd o wneud hynny. Yn sylfaenol mae'r dull hwn yn frigdoriad o arian cefnogaeth Ewrop. Ni all unrhyw un sicrhau nad effeithir ar fusnesau unigol mewn unrhyw fusnes. Mae'n amhosibl gweithredu eich gwelliant, Peter. Mae fel gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd atal y glaw—ni ellir gwneud hynny.

I make another plea, that when we talk about our industry, we accept that the export of lambs from Wales could be greatly threatened by raising the temperature over banning French beef. I make a plea to you not to start a trade war because of your irresponsible attitude. Our lamb trade is currently effective and of great importance.

Gwnaf apêl arall, sef pan siaradwn am ein diwydiant, y derbyniwn y gall mynd yn benboeth dros wahardd cig eidion o Ffrainc fod yn fygythiad mawr i allforio wyn o Gymru. Apeliaf arnoch i beidio â chychwyn rhyfel masnach oherwydd eich agwedd anghyfrifol. Mae ein masnach wyn yn effeithiol ar hyn o bryd ac o gryn bwys.

Peter Rogers: To clarify my point, I did not mention France. I mentioned Europe in general where BSE is present. I deliberately did not mention France.

Peter Rogers: I egluro fy mhwynt, ni soniais am Ffrainc. Soniais am Ewrop yn gyffredinol lle mae BSE yn bresennol. Ni soniais am Ffrainc yn fwriadol.

Mick Bates: If that is the case, I apologise. In the context of Europe, the situation is even worse. As you know, our heavy lambs go to the French market and our light ones go to southern Europe. The concept of labour units in amendment 2 is a complex one that was used years ago. It is also related to production. The labour units were formulated, and still would be, on the grounds of the number of hours one would tend a cow or a sheep and the number of acres used for harvest. That is all related to production. One of the main elements, the third pillar of the common agricultural policy reforms, is that we are now moving away from the concept of increased production and adding value to what we produce. I support Peter on this because the terms offered would work against many family businesses where people in partnership would not be able to pick up any improvements under amendment 2.

Mick Bates: Os yw hynny'n wir, ymddiheuraf. Yng nghyd-destun Ewrop, mae'r sefyllfa hyd yn oed yn waeth. Fel y gwyddoch, â ein hwyn trymion i farchnad Ffrainc a'r rhai ysgafn i dde Ewrop. Mae'r cysyniad o unedau llafur yng ngwelliant 2 yn un cymhleth a ddefnyddiwyd flynyddoedd yn ôl. Mae'n gysylltiedig hefyd â chynhyrchu. Ffurfiwyd yr unedau llafur, ac felly y byddent o hyd, ar sail y nifer o oriau y byddai buwch neu ddafad yn cael gofal a nifer yr erwau a ddefnyddid i fedi. Mae'r cyfan yn gysylltiedig â chynhyrchu. Un o'r prif elfennau, trydydd piler y diwygiadau polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, yw ein bod erbyn hyn yn symud oddi wrth y cysyniad o gynyddu cynhyrchiant ac yn ychwanegu gwerth i'r hyn a gynhyrchwn. Cefnogaf Peter ar hyn am y byddai'r telerau a gynigir yn gweithio yn erbyn llawer o fusnesau teuluol lle na fyddai pobl mewn partneriaeth yn gallu dod o hyd i unrhyw welliannau o dan welliant 2.

Elin Jones: Eich plaid chi yw'r drydedd blaid i ymateb i welliant 2 yn y cyd-destun ei fod yn gofyn am unedau llafur. Mae'n gofyn am ymchwiliad manwl i'r posibilrwydd o gynnwys unedau llafur mewn modwleiddio. Hoffwn glywed cyfraniadau ar yr ymchwiliad ac nid ar yr egwyddor o unedau llafur.

Elin Jones: Yours is the third party to respond to amendment 2 with the assumption that it asks for labour units. It asks for a detailed investigation into the possibility of including labour units in modulation. I would like to hear contributions on the investigation and not on the principle of labour units.

Mick Bates: When this was discussed at the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee, it was understood that labour units were directly related to production and, as such, would be an ineffective and unacceptable means of transferring sums. The concept has been accepted by the Committee and throughout the UK and it will benefit policy development.

Mick Bates: Pan drafodwyd hyn yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, deallwyd bod unedau llafur yn berthnasol yn uniongyrchol i gynhyrchu ac y byddent, fel y cyfryw, yn ffordd aneffeithiol ac annerbyniol o drosglwyddo symiau. Derbyniwyd y cysyniad gan y Pwyllgor a ledled y DU a bydd o fudd i ddatblygu polisi.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Do you share my disappointment that there is no emphasis on the need to encourage young people to enter the industry? Do you share my enthusiasm for a young entrants scheme that would at least encourage and help them to enter the industry?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A rannwch fy siom na phwysleisir yr angen i annog pobl ifanc i fynd i mewn i'r diwydiant? A rannwch fy mrwdfrydedd dros gynllun newydd-ddyfodiaid ifanc a fyddai o leiaf yn eu hannog a'u helpu i fynd i mewn i'r diwydiant?

Mick Bates: As Rhodri knows, I share his enthusiasm for that, so much so that there is a commitment in the partnership agreement to ensure the provision of a new entrants scheme. Yesterday, I discussed how that could be developed with Finance Wales. I am sure that every effort will be made in the months ahead to implement such a scheme and it will receive the support of all parties in this Chamber.

Mick Bates: Fel y gwyr Rhodri, rhannaf ei frwdfrydedd dros hynny, cymaint nes bod ymrwymiad yn y cytundeb partneriaeth i sicrhau'r ddarpariaeth o gynllun newydd-ddyfodiaid. Ddoe, trafodais sut y gellid datblygu hynny gyda Chyllid Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwneir pob ymdrech yn y misoedd i ddod i weithredu cynllun o'r fath a bydd yn derbyn cefnogaeth pob plaid yn y Siambr hon.

Kirsty Williams: I declare an interest in a farm business.

Kirsty Williams: Datganaf fuddiant mewn busnes fferm.

Glyn Davies: I also declare an interest in a farm business.

Glyn Davies: Datganaf innau hefyd fuddiant mewn busnes fferm.

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): On Peter's points, the idea behind modulation is to increase the amount of money available for medium to long-term schemes. To use Peter's words, 'farming is overdependent on subsidies'. We need to build for the future of farming. Things will not turn around overnight, but farming will have a secure and bright future provided that we get the policy correct now. I emphasise the fact that much of the money coming in is new and will be invested in rural Wales as part of the rural development plan.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Ar bwyntiau Peter, y syniad y tu ôl i fodwleiddio yw cynyddu swm yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer cynlluniau tymor hir a chanolig. I ddefnyddio geiriau Peter, 'mae ffermio yn orddibynnol ar gymorthdaliadau'. Rhaid inni adeiladu ar gyfer dyfodol ffermio. Ni fydd pethau'n newid dros nos, ond bydd gan ffermio ddyfodol sicr a llewyrchus ar yr amod ein bod yn cael y polisi'n gywir yn awr. Pwysleisiaf y ffaith fod llawer o'r arian sydd yn dod i mewn yn newydd a chaiff ei fuddsoddi yng Nghymru wledig fel rhan o'r cynllun datblygu gwledig.

On policy, the idea behind all of the schemes set out in the rural development plan is that all farmers will be able to access them, particularly Farming Connect. No farmers will be excluded from the measures offered by the rural development plan. Many farmers will be eligible for assistance under schemes such as Tir Gofal, the organic farming scheme and Farming Connect. Therefore, all farmers have the capacity to benefit from modulation.

O ran polisi, y syniad y tu ôl i'r holl gynlluniau a nodir yn y cynllun datblygu gwledig yw y gall yr holl ffermwyr gael mynediad iddynt, yn arbennig Farming Connect. Ni chaiff unrhyw ffermwyr eu hepgor o'r mesurau a gynigir gan y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Bydd llawer o ffermwyr yn gymwys i gael cymorth o dan gynlluniau megis Tir Gofal, y cynllun ffermio organig a Farming Connect. Felly, mae gan bob ffermwr y gallu i elwa o fodwleiddio.

Janet referred to net farm income and it is a financial construct. The cash income of farms is much higher than that. However, net farm income, for example, takes into account farmers who own their farms and pay a nominal rental fee. Therefore, the cash income is higher than that.

Cyfeiriodd Janet at incwm net ffermydd ac mae'n ymadrodd ariannol. Mae incwm arian parod ffermydd yn uwch o lawer na hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae incwm net ffermydd, er enghraifft, yn ystyried ffermwyr sydd yn berchen ar eu ffermydd eu hunain ac yn talu ffi enwol am rentu. Felly, mae'r incwm arian parod yn uwch na hynny.

Peter also mentioned the BSE crisis. There is

Cyfeiriodd Peter hefyd at yr argyfwng BSE.

no dithering over this issue, Peter. I have said many times that we will be guided by the Foods Standards Agency. If the FSA gives us certain guidelines, we will follow those guidelines. The whole point of having an independent Food Standards Agency is to ensure that you have people who provide independent advice.

Nid oes oedi dros y mater hwn, Peter. Dywedais droeon y bydd yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn ein harwain. Os rhydd yr Asiantaeth rai canllawiau penodol inni, dilynwn y canllawiau hynny. Holl bwynt cael Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd annibynnol yw sicrhau bod gennych bobl sydd yn darparu cyngor annibynnol.

10:45 a.m.

Peter Rogers: There is one important point about the advice that we had in the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee last week. We were advised that no meat from cattle over 30 months slips in from Britain. I thought that it was disgraceful for the Food Standards Agency to cast aspersions on our industry at this terrible time. You must be careful of what research and understanding that they have regarding what is going on on the continent. It is illegal to bring meat into this country over 30 months of age and you are going to tell me what has happened to all those dairy cows for years and years on the continent. You must remember how many calves we have exported from this country to Europe in the last 10 years. Europe has the same problem with BSE and we have taken no controls in this country. That was the answer to the whole issue.

Peter Rogers: Mae un pwynt pwysig ynglŷn â'r cyngor a gawsom yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yr wythnos diwethaf. Fe'n cynghorwyd na ddylai cig gwartheg dros 30 mis oed lithro i mewn o Brydain. Credais ei bod yn warthus fod yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn lladd ar ein diwydiant ar yr adeg drychinebus hon. Rhaid ichi fod yn ofalus o'r ymchwil a'r ddealltwriaeth sydd ganddynt o safbwynt yr hyn sydd yn digwydd ar y cyfandir. Mae'n anghyfreithlon dod â chig dros 30 mis oed i mewn i'r wlad hon ac yr ydych yn mynd i ddweud wrthyf beth a ddigwyddodd i'r holl wartheg godro hynny am flynyddoedd a blynyddoedd ar y cyfandir. Rhaid eich bod yn cofio faint o loi a allforiwyd o'r wlad hon i Ewrop yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae gan Ewrop yr un broblem gyda BSE ac ni chymerwyd rheolaethau gennym yn y wlad hon. Dyna oedd yr ateb i'r holl broblem.

Carwyn Jones: It is no answer whatsoever. I return to my original point; that is why the Food Standards Agency exists. BSE is an European problem. It is not something that has been concocted by Europeans to damage the beef industry in Britain. They now have the same problem in Europe. On 1 January 2001, the over 30 months rule will be introduced throughout Europe. We can say that our controls are the best in Europe. People can see what we do in this country and we can say to Europeans that our rules ensure that our beef is the safest in Europe, if not the world, and they must now follow us now that they have identified the difficulties with BSE in Europe. That is why we had the Agricultural and Rural Development Committee meeting last week.

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw'n ateb o gwbl. Dychwelaf i'm pwynt gwreiddiol; dyna pam y bodola'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd. Mae BSE yn broblem Ewropeaidd. Nid yw'n rhywbeth a fathwyd gan Ewropeaid er mwyn dinistrio'r diwydiant cig eidion ym Mhrydain. Mae ganddynt yr un broblem yn Ewrop erbyn hyn. Ar 1 Ionawr 2001, cyflwynir y rheol dros 30 mis oed ledled Ewrop. Gallwn ddweud mai ein rheolaethau ni yw'r gorau yn Ewrop. Gall pobl weld yr hyn a wnawn yn y wlad hon a gallwn ddweud wrth yr Ewropeaid bod ein rheolau yn sicrhau mai ein cig eidion ni yw'r mwyaf diogel yn Ewrop, os nad y byd, a rhaid iddynt ein dilyn ni yn awr eu bod wedi nodi'r anawsterau gyda BSE yn Ewrop. Dyna paham y cawsom gyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yr wythnos diwethaf.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A yw Carwyn yn cytuno mai un ateb i'r broblem hon o sicrhau

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Does Carwyn agree that one answer to this problem of ensuring

safon gyfartal ledled Ewrop fyddai cael asiantaeth safonau bwyd Ewropeaidd yn hytrach nag un i bob gwlad? Byddai hynny yn sicrhau cysondeb ledled Ewrop. Yn ogystal, a wnaiff Carwyn dalu sylw i'r hyn a ddywedodd Mick Bates ynglŷn â'r ffaith y bydd y weinyddiaeth yn cyflwyno mesurau i sicrhau cynllun i ganiatáu i bobl ifanc ddod i mewn i'r diwydiant amaethyddol?

equal standards throughout Europe is to establish a European food standards agency rather than having one agency in each country? That would ensure consistency throughout Europe. In addition, will Carwyn comment on what Mick Bates said about the fact that the administration will introduce measures to ensure a scheme to allow young people to come into the agricultural sector?

Carwyn Jones: Gwelais y datganiad i'r wasg yn *The Western Mail* ddoe ynglŷn â'r asiantaeth safonau bwyd Ewropeaidd. Trafodwyd hynny eisoes yn Ewrop. Felly, mae cynlluniau yn cael eu cyflwyno i edrych ar y posibilrwydd o wneud hynny. Ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Mick ynglŷn â chynllun i'r rhai sydd yn dod i'r mewn i'r diwydiant amaethyddol, mae sawl ffordd o wneud hynny. Yr wyf wedi dweud sawl gwaith ein bod wedi cael adroddiad gan ADAS. Pwysleisiai'r adroddiad na fyddai'r cynllun hwnnw yn cael llawer o effaith ar ddod â phobl newydd i mewn i ffermio. Fodd bynnag, mae ffyrdd eraill o gael i ddenu pobl i'r diwydiant. Yr wyf yn barod i edrych ar ffyrdd o wneud hynny.

Carwyn Jones: I saw the press statement in *The Western Mail* yesterday regarding an European foods standards agency. That has already been discussed in Europe. Therefore, plans are being put forward to look at the possibility of doing that. On what Mick said about a scheme for those coming into the agricultural industry, there are many ways of doing that. I have mentioned on many occasions that we have received a report from ADAS. The report emphasised that that scheme would not have much effect on bringing new people into farming. However, there are other ways to entice people into the industry. I am prepared to look at ways of doing that.

Nick Bourne: You indicated, Carwyn, that action will be taken on 1 January. However, I am sure that you agree that there is an urgent problem that must be addressed now. There is an interim between the time that this problem arose and the action being taken. In addition, do you not agree that what we have pressing for some time, clear labelling on the true country of origin, is something that is long overdue and would assist in dealing with this problem?

Nick Bourne: Nodwyd gennych, Carwyn, y cymerir camau ar 1 Ionawr. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod problem daer sydd angen rhoi sylw iddi yn awr. Mae bwlch rhwng yr amser y cododd y broblem hon a'r gweithredu. Yn ogystal, oni chytunwch fod yr hyn sydd yn broblem daer i ni ers peth amser, sef labelu clir ynglŷn â'r wlad sydd yn wir darddle, yn rhywbeth y dylid fod wedi'i wneud ers tro ac y byddai'n cynorthwyo i ymdrin â'r broblem hon?

Carwyn Jones: That is a different and interesting point. It is right to say that, in the interests of consumer choice, there should be clear labelling. Matters are proceeding with regard to that, particularly labelling food as Welsh. That is important. However, it is a different matter to introduce a ban on importing a product when your own independent agency does not provide evidence or support such a ban. That is why the Foods Standards Agency exists. If the Foods Standards Agency changes its mind, that is something that the Assembly must consider.

Carwyn Jones: Mae hwnnw'n bwynt gwahanol a diddorol. Mae'n wir i ddweud, er lles dewis y defnyddiwr, y dylid cael labelu clir. Mae pethau'n mynd yn eu blaen o safbwynt hynny, yn arbennig labelu bwyd fel bwyd o Gymru. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Fodd bynnag, mater gwahanol yw cyflwyno gwaharddiad ar fewnforio cynnyrch pan nad yw eich asiantaeth annibynnol eich hunan yn darparu tystiolaeth nac yn cefnogi gwaharddiad o'r fath. Dyna paham y bodola'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd. Os newidia'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd ei meddwl, mae hynny yn rhywbeth y bydd rhaid i'r Cynulliad ei ystyried.

Trof yn awr at yr hyn a ddywedodd Elin. Yr oeddech yn gywir i ddweud bod y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, ar 29 Medi 1999, wedi trafod y cwestiwn a godasoch ynglŷn ag unedau llafur. Cyfeiriodd swyddogion at yr anawsterau ynglŷn ag unedau llafur ac yr oedd pawb yn derbyn hynny. Os oedd problem, dylid bod wedi nodi hynny ar y pryd, nid yn awr. Mae pethau wedi symud ymlaen yn sylweddol ers Medi 1999.

I now turn to what Elin said. You were right to say that the Agricultural and Rural Development Committee, on 29 September 1999, discussed the question that you raised regarding labour units. Officials referred to the difficulties regarding labour units and everybody accepted that. If there was a problem, you should have said so at the time. Matters have progressed a great deal since September 1999

Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym gynllun pendant. Nid wyf am ddweud wrth ffermwyr fod gennym gynllun sydd yn mynd i ddechrau, y bydd mewn bodolaeth am chwe blynedd ond efallai y bydd yn newid yn ddiweddarach. Nid yw ffermwyr eisiau hynny. Maent eisiau cynllun sicr. Cafodd y Pwyllgor gyfle i ystyried hynny y llynedd ac nid oedd neb eisiau trafod unedau llafur. Derbyniodd pawb fod unedau llafur yn gymhleth wrth ystyried modwleiddio. Felly, y llynedd oedd yr amser i godi'r mater hwnnw.

We must ensure that we have a clear-cut scheme. I do not want to say to farmers that we have a scheme that will start, will exist for six years, but will perhaps change later. Farmers do not want that. They want a clear-cut scheme. The Committee had an opportunity to consider that last year and nobody wanted to discuss labour units. Everybody accepted that labour units were complex when considering modulation. Therefore, last year was the time to raise that issue.

Credaf fy mod wedi ateb y cwestiynau a godwyd gan yr Aelodau y bore yma. Felly, gofynnaf i Aelodau bleidleisio yn erbyn y ddau welliant a gynigiwyd.

I think that I have answered the questions raised by Members this morning. Therefore, I ask Members to vote against the two amendments proposed.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 25.
Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 25.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 11, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.
Amendment 2: For 11, Abstain 0, Against 33.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Cynnig: O blaid 44, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 44, Abstain 2, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog

Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Davies, David

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Cymru) 2000
Approval of the Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales) Regulations 2000

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly

(a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Common Agricultural Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales) Regulations

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

(a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw wedi darganfod unrhyw faterion sydd yn peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modiwleiddio)

2000, laid in the Table Office on 14 November 2000;

(b) approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 9 November 2000.

(Cymru) 2000, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2000;

(b) yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Tachwedd 2000.

Cynnig: O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 8.
Motion: For 38, Abstain 0, Against 8.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.

Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 10.55 a.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 10.55 a.m.

Rhaglen Waith y Llywodraeth
Programme for Government

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 9 and 10 in the name of David Melding.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 ac 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 9 a 10 yn enw David Melding.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly welcomes the annual Government business programme reflecting the partnership agreement, 'Putting Wales First'; which was made publicly available on 20 November and is now on the intranet at http://assembly/aegis/AssemblyStaffArea/Cabinet/statements/2000/index.htm.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn croesawu rhaglen waith flynyddol y Llywodraeth sydd yn adlewyrchu'r cytundeb partneriaeth, 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf'; a gyhoeddwyd ar 20 Tachwedd ac sydd bellach ar gael ar y fewnrwyd yn htttp://assembly/aegis/AssemblyStaffArea/Cabinet/statements/2000/index.htm.

On 21 November, the partnership Government published the first annual Government business programme, a new landmark on the political calendar of Wales. The programme is about fulfilling the commitments made to the people of Wales in our partnership agreement. It sets out the new policies and regulations that the partnership Government will bring to the Assembly before July 2001. This is a major step in the maturing of the National Assembly for Wales. It reflects the benefits of the partnership agreement in bringing firm and stable Government to Wales.

Ar 21 Tachwedd, cyhoeddodd y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth raglen fusnes flynyddol gyntaf y Llywodraeth, digwyddiad newydd o bwys ar galendr gwleidyddol Cymru. Mae'r rhaglen yn ymwneud â chyflawni'r ymrwymiadau a wnaethpwyd i bobl Cymru yn ein cytundeb partneriaeth. Noda'r polisïau a'r rheoliadau newydd a ddaw'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i'r Cynulliad cyn Gorffennaf 2001. Mae hwn yn gam pwysig wrth i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru aeddfedu. Adlewyrcha fuddiannau'r cytundeb partneriaeth wrth greu Llywodraeth gadarn a sefydlog i Gymru.

The programme shows that this partnership means business. It is a clear commitment to action against which we expect and want to be measured. This is about delivering what we have promised. It is not about pulling rabbits out of hats. This is the solid practical work of Government. It is about exposing important issues for debate, bringing forward legislation, setting spending priorities, and giving directions to our agents and partners to deliver locally. The people of Wales want the Assembly to deliver practical steps that make a difference locally and regionally. This is what we are offering.

Dengys y rhaglen fod y bartneriaeth hon o ddifrif. Mae'n ymrwymiad clir i weithredu yn erbyn yr hyn y disgwyliwn ac y dymunwn iddo gael ei fesur. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â chyflwyno'r hyn a addawsom. Nid yw'n ymwneud â thynnu cwningod allan o hetiau. Dyma waith cadarn ymarferol y Llywodraeth. Mae'n ymwneud ag amlygu materion pwysig i'w trafod, gan gynnig deddfwriaeth, gosod blaenoriaethau gwario, a rhoi cyfarwyddiadau i'n hasiantau a'n partneriaid i gyflawni'n lleol. Mae pobl Cymru am i'r Cynulliad gymryd camau ymarferol i wneud gwahaniaeth yn lleol ac

yn rhanbarthol. Dyna'r hyn a gynigiwn.

Jocelyn Davies has tabled several amendments that relate mainly to the nature of the programme. I recommend that we reject these amendments, because they fundamentally miss the point of the programme that we, as a coalition Government, are proposing.

Cyflwynodd Jocelyn Davies sawl gwelliant sydd yn ymwneud yn bennaf â natur y rhaglen. Argymhellaf ein bod yn gwrthod y gwelliannau hyn, gan eu bod, yn y bôn, yn camddeall y rhaglen a gynigiwn ni, fel Llywodraeth glymblaid.

First of all, Jocelyn, this is a radical new agenda for Wales. We do not need to develop one. It is one of the biggest, most distinctive legislative programmes that Wales has ever seen. Secondly, I am not interested in whether these actions are new or whether we debated them previously. These actions make sense for Wales and we are demonstrating that they can be delivered effectively under the partnership Government.

Yn gyntaf, Jocelyn, mae hon yn agenda newydd radical i Gymru. Nid oes angen inni ddatblygu un. Mae'n un o'r rhaglenni deddfwriaethol mwyaf, a'r mwyaf neilltuol, a welodd Cymru erioed. Yn ail, nid oes diddordeb gennyf a yw'r gweithrediadau hyn yn newydd neu a gawsom ddadl arnynt o'r blaen. Gwna'r camau hyn synnwyr i Gymru a dangoswn y gellir eu cyflawni'n effeithiol o dan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth.

Pauline Jarman: We have noticed that, apart from yourself and your two Liberal Democrat colleagues in the Cabinet, no other Cabinet Ministers are present. Will the three of you be carrying out this programme on your own?

Pauline Jarman: Sylwasom nad oes unrhyw un o Weinidogion eraill y Cabinet yn bresennol, ar wahân i chi a'ch dau gyd-Aelod o blaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Cabinet. A fydd y tri ohonoch yn ymgymryd â'r rhaglen hon ar eich pen eich hun?

Andrew Davies: I think it says something that Plaid Cymru can only make these specious points when we are discussing delivering a programme for government. Thirdly—

Andrew Davies: Credaf ei bod yn arwyddocaol mai dim ond pan fyddwn yn trafod cyflwyno rhaglen lywodraethu y gall Plaid Cymru wneud y pwyntiau coegwych hyn. Yn drydydd—

Ieuan Wyn Jones *rose—*

Ieuan Wyn Jones *a gododd—*

Andrew Davies: Sorry, I will not give way.

Andrew Davies: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ni ildiaf.

Thirdly, this is an annual programme. We will draw up a programme every year until the next Assembly election. The next announcement will be in autumn 2001.

Yn drydydd, mae hon yn rhaglen flynyddol. Byddwn yn llunio rhaglen bob blwyddyn tan etholiad nesaf y Cynulliad. Bydd y cyhoeddiad nesaf yn ystod hydref 2001.

David Davies: Will this be a long-term arrangement with the Liberal Democrats? Will your colleagues in the Labour Party continue sending out literature to Labour AMs urging them to attend conferences where they can find out about the dangers of Liberal Democrat polices? Will you continue sending out Labour *Voice* newspapers to Welsh Labour Assembly Members telling them not to trust the Liberal Democrats, as

David Davies: A fydd hyn yn drefniant tymor hir gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? A fydd eich cyd-aelodau yn y Blaid Lafur yn parhau i anfon deunydd at aelodau Llafur o'r Cynulliad yn eu hannog i fynychu cynadleddau lle y cânt wybod am beryglon polisïau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? A fyddwch yn parhau i anfon papur newydd y Blaid Lafur, *Voice*, at Aelodau Llafur Cymru o'r Cynulliad, yn

the last edition did?

dweud wrthynt am beidio ag ymddiried yn y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, fel y gwnaeth y rhifyn diwethaf?

Andrew Davies: Deputy Presiding Officer, I do not mind giving way if Members have substantive points to make about the programme. However, I will not take irrelevant points like that.

Andrew Davies: Ddirprwy Lywydd, nid oes gwahaniaeth gennyf ildio os oes gan yr Aelodau bwyntiau sylweddol i'w gwneud ynglŷn â'r rhaglen. Fodd bynnag, ni chymeraf unrhyw bwyntiau amherthnasol fel yr un hwnnw.

Dafydd Wigley: Will you take an intervention?

Dafydd Wigley: A gymerwch ymyriad?

Andrew Davies: When I have made my point, I will give you an opportunity to speak.

Andrew Davies: Pan fyddaf wedi gwneud fy mhwynt, rhoddaf gyfle ichi siarad.

Not everything is included in this first programme, because the partnership agreement is for the term of this Assembly. We will honour all our commitments.

Ni chynhwysir popeth yn y rhaglen waith gyntaf hon, oherwydd mae'r cytundeb partneriaeth ar gyfer tymor y Cynulliad hwn. Anrhydeddwn ein hymrwymiadau i gyd.

Dafydd Wigley: On the specific commitments that you gave to rural Wales, are you aware of Richard Livsey's comments in the Welsh Grand Committee in London on Monday? He said that the present policies being pursued by the Labour Government were a disaster for rural Wales.

Dafydd Wigley: O ran yr ymrwymiadau penodol a roddasoch i Gymru wledig, a ydych yn ymwybodol o sylwadau Richard Livsey yn Uwch Bwyllgor Cymru yn Llundain ddydd Llun? Dywedodd fod y polisïau presennol a ddilynir gan Lywodraeth Lafur yn drychineb i Gymru wledig.

Andrew Davies: I cannot comment on statements that are made in another place. As a partnership Government, we will bring forward proposals on freedom of information. There is no doubt about our commitment to this. Rhodri Morgan, the First Minister, has already demonstrated his personal commitment and that of the Cabinet by publishing the minutes of Cabinet meetings.

Andrew Davies: Ni allaf roi sylwadau ar ddatganiadau a wneir mewn lle arall. Fel Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, cyflwynwn gynigion ar ryddid gwybodaeth. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth ynglŷn â'n hymrwymiad i hyn. Mae Rhodri Morgan, Prif Weinidog Cymru, eisoes wedi dangos ei ymrwymiad personol ef ac un y Cabinet drwy gyhoeddi cofnodion cyfarfodydd y Cabinet.

Jocelyn Davies: Did the Cabinet discuss the partnership agreement before it was signed, because there is a distinct lack of mention of it in the Cabinet minutes?

Jocelyn Davies: A drafododd y Cabinet y cytundeb partneriaeth cyn ei lofnodi, oherwydd yn bendant nid oes sôn amdano yng nghofnodion y Cabinet?

Andrew Davies: Yes, the Cabinet discussed the matter. On freedom of information, we are committed—[*Interruption.*]

Andrew Davies: Do, trafododd y Cabinet y mater. O ran rhyddid gwybodaeth, yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i—[*Torri ar draws.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn.

Andrew Davies: On freedom of information, we are committed to taking this forward and,

Andrew Davies: O ran rhyddid gwybodaeth, yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i

in conjunction with the Freedom of Information Act, we will produce a detailed protocol, on which there will be extensive consultation.

weithredu ar hyn ac, mewn cysylltiad â Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth, cynhyrchwn brotocol manwl, ac ymgynghorir arno yn helaeth.

We will develop the work on an employment strategy as part of the national economic development strategy. We will propose a citizenship Bill of rights. Our Bill of rights will be the Assembly's declaration of the rights that the citizens of Wales can expect to exercise. It is not intended that these rights will require new primary legislation, as Jocelyn requests. It will draw together a range of actions, which the partnership has already embarked upon, and signal others that we intend to bring forward.

Byddwn yn datblygu gwaith strategaeth gyflogaeth fel rhan o'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Byddwn yn cynnig mesur iawnderau dinasyddiaeth. Ein Mesur iawnderau fydd datganiad y Cynulliad o'r iawnderau y gall dinasyddion Cymru ddisgwyl eu ymarfer. Ni fwriedir i'r hawliau hyn fynnu deddfwriaeth sylfaenol, newydd, fel y gofynna Jocelyn. Bydd yn tynnu amrywiaeth o weithrediadau ynghyd, y mae'r bartneriaeth eisoes wedi ymgymryd â hwy, ac yn dynodi eraill y bwriadwn eu cyflwyno.

Brian Hancock: On employment, today's papers contained grave news about the steel industry. It is projected that two steelworks may close, including Llanwern. I want to push you further on that to ensure that the programme is not a wish list or a think list, but an action list.

Brian Hancock: O ran cyflogaeth, yr oedd y papurau heddiw yn cynnwys newyddion dybryd am y diwydiant dur. Rhagwelir y gall dau waith dur gau, gan gynnwys Llanwern. Yr wyf am eich gwthio ymhellach ar hynny er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'r rhaglen yn rhestr o ddymuniadau neu feddyliau, ond yn rhestr o weithrediadau.

Andrew Davies: The future of the steel industry throughout the UK, particularly in south Wales and the rest of Wales, is extremely important. I cannot comment on any news or speculation. I have not seen anything. However, I have no doubt that Mike German, the Minister for Economic Development, or the First Minister will respond to any news, as is always the case in this Chamber.

Andrew Davies: Mae dyfodol y diwydiant dur ledled y DU, yn arbennig yn ne Cymru a gweddill Cymru, yn holl bwysig. Ni allaf roi sylwadau ar unrhyw newyddion neu ddyfaliad. Nid wyf wedi gweld unrhyw beth. Fodd bynnag, nid oes amheuaeth gennyf na fydd Mike German, y Gweinidog Datblygu Economaidd, neu Brif Weinidog Cymru yn ymateb i unrhyw newyddion, fel sydd yn wir bob tro yn y Siambr hon.

Last week, we agreed the new Assembly budget. This was the first step to putting in place our commitments on the ground, showing how we can make a real difference to the quality of public services across Wales. In that budget, we announced an increase of £669 million by 2003-04 in the health budget, an extra £86 million for school buildings and a substantial increase to the local government revenue support grant. Again, these are moneys aimed at meeting the needs of the people of Wales. Indeed, the budget proposals meet 54 out of the 55 Committee priorities, as Edwina Hart, my Cabinet colleague for finance stated.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, cytunasom ar gyllideb newydd y Cynulliad. Dyma oedd y cam cyntaf tuag at roi ein hymrwymiadau ar lawr gwlad ar waith, gan ddangos sut y gallwn wneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i ansawdd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ledled Cymru. Yn y gyllideb honno, cyhoeddasom gynnydd o £669 miliwn erbyn 2003-04 yn y gyllideb iechyd, £86 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion a chynnydd sylweddol i grant cynnal refeniw llywodraeth leol. Unwaith eto, anelir yr arian hwn at ddiwallu anghenion pobl Cymru. Yn wir, mae cynigion y gyllideb yn diwallu 54 o'r 55 o flaenoriaethau'r Pwyllgor, fel y nododd Edwina Hart, fy

nghyd-Aelod o'r Cabinet dros Gyllid.

Last week, I published our detailed legislative priorities up until next summer. By publishing the legislative programme, we provide a firm basis for the Assembly and its partners to consider future legislation. This is a substantial programme of legislation. In fact, it is one of the biggest programmes ever of Welsh-only legislation. It will deliver major commitments, including the renewal of local government.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddais ein blaenoriaethau deddfwriaethol manwl hyd at yr haf nesaf. Drwy gyhoeddi'r rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol, darparwn sail gadarn i'r Cynulliad a'i bartneriaid i ystyried deddfwriaeth yn y dyfodol. Mae hon yn rhaglen sylweddol o ddeddfwriaeth. Yn wir, dyma un o'r rhaglenni mwyaf erioed o ddeddfwriaeth sydd yn ymwneud â Chymru yn unig. Bydd yn cyflwyno ymrwymiadau o bwys, gan gynnwys adnewyddu llywodraeth leol.

The partnership agreement introduced the concept of a Welsh Local Government Bill. This is a package of secondary legislation and guidance using the powers given to the Assembly by the Local Government Act 2000. The new Bill will cover the areas of political structures and ethical standards. We will also bring forward guidance on community planning and orders creating a distinctive best value regime for Wales.

Cyflwynodd y cytundeb partneriaeth gysyniad o Fesur Llywodraeth Leol i Gymru. Mae hwn yn becyn o ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd ac arweiniad gan ddefnyddio'r pwerau a roddir i'r Cynulliad gan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000. Bydd y Mesur newydd yn cwmpasu meysydd strwythurau gwleidyddol a safonau moesegol. Byddwn hefyd yn cynnig arweiniad ar gynllunio cymunedau a gorchmynion gan greu cyfundrefn gwerth gorau unigryw i Gymru.

Secondly, there will be the creation of a radical new approach to education and training. The Assembly is well on the way to implementing its agenda for reforming the provision of education and training in Wales. We are on course for the new National Council for Education and Training for Wales to assume its full duties by April next year.

Yn ail, cyflwynir ymagwedd newydd radical tuag at addysg a hyfforddiant. Mae'r Cynulliad yn prysur gyrraedd y nod o weithredu ei agenda ar gyfer diwygio'r ddarpariaeth o ran addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru. Yr ydym ar y trywydd iawn i Gyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant ymgymryd â'i ddyletswyddau'n llawn erbyn Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf.

Thirdly, there will be a new system of care services. There will be a programme of secondary legislation that will allow the Assembly to establish a care standards inspectorate for Wales to regulate social and health care services. In addition, it will provide for the Assembly to establish a care council for Wales to regulate the training, conduct and practice of social care staff. It will also allow the Assembly to reform the regulation of early years services. Last week, we also appointed the Children's Commissioner for Wales. This is a first for Wales and a first for the United Kingdom.

Yn drydydd, bydd system newydd o wasanaethau gofal. Bydd rhaglen o is-ddeddfwriaeth a fydd yn caniatáu i'r Cynulliad sefydlu arolygiaeth safonau gofal i Gymru er mwyn rheoleiddio gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gofal iechyd. Yn ogystal, bydd yn sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn sefydlu cyngor gofal i Gymru er mwyn rheoleiddio hyfforddiant, ymddygiad ac arfer staff gofal cymdeithasol. Bydd hefyd yn caniatáu i'r Cynulliad ddiwygio'r gwaith o reoleiddio'r gwasanaethau blynyddoedd cynnar. Yr wythnos diwethaf, penodasom Gomisiynydd Plant i Gymru hefyd. Mae hyn yn arloesol i Gymru ac yn arloesol i'r Deyrnas Unedig.

Last Tuesday, Paul Murphy, the Secretary of State for Wales, presented the Queen's Speech to this Assembly. This shows how we work in partnership with Whitehall to fulfil our commitments. The speech offers us our own Bill to provide the additional powers for the Children's Commissioner that the Assembly has sought. It is the first Wales-only Bill in the House of Commons in seven years. That legislative programme also provides the basis for us to carry forward our commitments to transform the NHS in Wales and to improve housing.

Ddydd Mawrth diwethaf, cyflwynodd Paul Murphy, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Araith y Frenhines i'r Cynulliad. Dengys hyn sut y gweithiwn mewn partneriaeth â Whitehall i gyflawni ein hymrwymiadau. Cynigia'r araith ein Mesur ein hunain inni er mwyn darparu'r pwerau ychwanegol ar gyfer y Comisiynydd Plant y mae'r Cynulliad wedi eu ceisio. Hwn yw'r Mesur cyntaf erioed ar gyfer Cymru'n unig yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin mewn saith mlynedd. Darpara'r rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol honno y sail hefyd inni ddatblygu ein hymrwymiadau i drawsffurfio'r NHS yng Nghymru a gwella tai.

Jocelyn Davies's amendment 6 suggests that subordinate legislation is inadequate as a means of implementing policy. On the contrary, this substantial programme of legislation—

Awgryma gwelliant 6 Jocelyn Davies fod yr is-ddeddfwriaeth yn annigonol fel ffordd o weithredu polisi. I'r gwrthwyneb, mae'r rhaglen sylweddol hon o ddeddfwriaeth—

11:05 a.m.

Jocelyn Davies: It says extending the Assembly's powers. There is nothing about primary legislation. You have misinterpreted that.

Jocelyn Davies: Sonia am ymestyn pwerau'r Cynulliad. Ni ddywed unrhyw beth am ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Yr ydych wedi camddehongli hynny.

Andrew Davies: I do not think that I have.

Andrew Davies: Ni chredaf i mi wneud hynny.

Jocelyn Davies: I think you have.

Jocelyn Davies: Credaf eich bod wedi.

Andrew Davies: You and others have consistently made the point that our powers are inadequate. We are demonstrating that we have substantial powers under the Government of Wales Act 1998 and this coalition Government is showing—

Andrew Davies: Gwnaethoch chi ac eraill y pwynt yn gyson fod ein pwerau yn annigonol. Yr ydym yn dangos bod gennym bwerau sylweddol o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 ac mae'r Llywodraeth glymblaid hon yn dangos—

Helen Mary Jones: Will you take an intervention?

Helen Mary Jones: A gymerwch ymyriad?

Andrew Davies: I am sorry, Helen. I have been given 10 minutes and I am running out of time.

Andrew Davies: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Helen. Cefais 10 munud ac mae'r amser bron ar ben.

On the contrary, this substantial programme of legislation demonstrates admirably that the Assembly can achieve fundamental changes within its existing powers. We can consider changes to our powers when the review proposed by the partnership agreement has

I'r gwrthwyneb, arddangosa'r rhaglen sylweddol hon o ddeddfwriaeth yn dda dros ben y gall y Cynulliad gyflawni newidiadau sylfaenol o fewn ei bwerau presennol. Gallwn ystyried newidiadau i'n pwerau pan fydd yr adolygiad a gynigir gan y cytundeb

been completed.

partneriaeth wedi ei gwblhau.

On Jocelyn's amendment 4, we recognise the strength of feeling in Wales about making St David's Day a bank holiday. The partnership Government has, therefore, made a commitment to press the UK Government to designate it as a bank holiday in Wales. The First Minister has already written to the Secretary of State for Wales asking him to seek the views of Cabinet colleagues. Jocelyn's amendment 4 fails to recognise that this is one area where we do not have the powers to act alone.

O ran gwelliant 4 Jocelyn, cydnabyddwn gryfder y teimlad yng Nghymru ynglŷn â gwneud Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn ŵyl y banc. Felly, mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi ymrwymo i bwyso ar Lywodraeth y DU i'w bennu yn wyl y banc yng Nghymru. Ysgrifennodd y Prif Weinidog eisoes at Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn gofyn iddo geisio barn ei gyd-aelodau yn y Cabinet. Metha gwelliant 4 Jocelyn â chydnabod fod hwn yn un maes lle nad oes gennym y pwerau i weithredu ar ein pen ein hunain.

On David Melding's amendments 9 and 10, we must be mindful of what we undertake to achieve. David Melding's amendment 9 refers to the Minister for Health and Social Services's commitment to reduce the in-patient waiting list to 65,000 by the end of March 2001. I accept that, and I can confirm that commitment. However, the responsibility for delivering services lies ultimately with health authorities and trusts. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

O ran gwelliannau 9 a 10 David Melding, rhaid inni fod yn ystyriol o'r hyn yr ymrwymwn i'w gyflawni. Cyfeiria gwelliant 9 David Melding at ymrwymiad y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i leihau rhestr aros cleifion mewnol i 65,000 erbyn diwedd Mawrth 2001. Derbyniaf hynny, a gallaf gadarnhau'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdodau a'r ymddiriedolaethau iechyd yw cyflwyno gwasanaethau yn y pen draw. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

David Melding: I thought that there would be a let out in the speech.

David Melding: Credais y byddai ymgais i osgoi cyfrifoldeb yn yr araith.

Andrew Davies: Performance against these targets will be monitored closely by officials and action will be agreed where it is off track. In order to support these efforts, we have established the 'Innovation in Care' programme to modernise patient access to hospital treatment in Wales. The programme will act as a catalyst to drive the change and innovation needed in the NHS to achieve reduced waiting lists and times. NHS chairs and the Minister for Health and Social Services are committed to achieving the targets that have been agreed.

Andrew Davies: Caiff perfformiad yn erbyn y targedau hyn ei fonitro'n agos gan swyddogion a chytunir ar gamau i'w cymryd pan na fydd ar y trywydd iawn. Er mwyn cefnogi'r ymdrechion hyn, sefydlasom y rhaglen 'Arloesedd mewn Gofal' i foderneiddio mynediad cleifion i driniaeth mewn ysbyty yng Nghymru. Bydd y rhaglen yn gweithredu fel catalydd i hybu'r newid a'r dyfeisgarwch sydd eu hangen yn yr NHS i gael rhestrau ac amserau aros byrrach. Mae cadeiryddion yr NHS a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ymrwymedig i gyflawni'r targedau y cytunwyd arnynt.

We take seriously the need to consult with our partners and the public. David Melding's amendment 10 calls upon the administration

Cymerwn yr angen i ymgynghori â'n partneriaid â'r cyhoedd o ddifrif. Geilw gwelliant 10 David Melding ar y weinyddiaeth

‘to identify the potential role for primary care trusts as advocated by the British Medical Association.’

‘i nodi swyddogaeth bosibl yr ymddiriedolaethau gofal sylfaenol sydd yn cael ei argymell gan Gymdeithas Feddygol Prydain.’

I reject that. The future development of local health groups and whether they progress to trust status, as in England, must be determined in the context of the developing primary care and NHS Wales strategies. To suggest that a decision has already been made on such an important element would reduce the credibility of the strategies and negate the considerable consultation exercise that was undertaken and continues to be undertaken.

Gwrthodaf hynny. Rhaid penderfynu ar ddatblygiad grwpiau iechyd lleol yn y dyfodol ac a ydynt yn datblygu statws ymddiriedolaeth, fel yn Lloegr, yng nghyd-destun y strategaethau gofal sylfaenol ac NHS Cymru sydd yn cael eu datblygu. Byddai awgrymu bod penderfyniad eisoes wedi ei wneud ar elfen mor bwysig yn lleihau hygrededd y strategaethau ac yn nacáu’r ymarfer ymgynghori sylweddol a gynhaliwyd ac sydd yn parhau i gael ei gynnal.

We have presented a programme with brand new, made-in-Wales initiatives to give improved local services, health, housing, education and training, and care. Let us not forget how these proposals have been drawn up. Assembly Committees have been involved. There have been discussions with partners and extensive consultation to achieve made-in-Wales solutions.

Cyflwynasom raglen gyda mentrau hollol newydd, wedi eu gwneud yng Nghymru i roi gwell gwasanaethau lleol, iechyd, tai, addysg a hyfforddiant, a gofal. Ni ddylem anghofio sut y lluniwyd y cynigion hyn. Bu Pwyllgorau’r Cynulliad yn gysylltiedig â hyn. Bu trafodaethau â phartneriaid ac ymgynghori helaeth i gyflawni atebion a wnaethpwyd yng Nghymru.

This is a massive programme of change after only a year of the Assembly’s existence. It has been achieved through a new way of working in partnership. The partnership Government came into being two months ago. It has a programme for the next three years, but it has already spelt out a full programme of business and legislation for the next six months.

Mae hon yn rhaglen enfawr o newid ar ôl dim ond blwyddyn o fodolaeth y Cynulliad. Fe’i cyflawnwyd drwy ffordd newydd o weithio mewn partneriaeth. Daeth y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i fodolaeth ddeufis yn ôl. Mae ganddi raglen ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf, ond eisoes cyhoeddodd raglen lawn o fusnes a deddfwriaeth am y chwe mis nesaf.

Within weeks of establishing a partnership, we have delivered on the Children’s Commissioner for Wales, a distinctive and groundbreaking step for Wales. By the spring, the new National Council for Education and Training for Wales will be in place, and by the summer, we will have achieved our own legislation on local government.

O fewn wythnosau i sefydlu partneriaeth, darparasom Gomisiynydd Plant i Gymru, cam penodol i Gymru a oedd yn torri tir newydd. Erbyn y gwanwyn, bydd Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant mewn grym, ac erbyn yr haf, byddwn wedi cyflawni ein deddfwriaeth ein hunain ar lywodraeth leol.

Wales has never enjoyed such a programme of radical change, devised and developed in Wales, for the people of Wales. This is a programme that shows the difference the devolution settlement has already made to the governance of Wales. It is only a start. We

Nid yw Cymru erioed wedi mwynhau’r fath raglen o newid radical, a ddyfeisiwyd ac a ddatblygwyd yng Nghymru, ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Mae hon yn rhaglen sydd yn dangos y gwahaniaeth y mae’r setliad datganoli eisoes wedi ei wneud i lywodraeth Cymru.

are showing that the Assembly can make a difference, and I challenge the opposition to prove and say otherwise.

Megis dechrau yw hyn. Yr ydym yn dangos y gall y Cynulliad wneud gwahaniaeth, a heriaf y gwrthbleidiau i brofi a dweud fel arall.

The Deputy Preisiding Officer: Andrew will be pleased to know that it is mostly opposition Members who have indicated that they wish to contribute to this debate. I urge those Members to be brief. I call on Ieuan Wyn Jones to propose amendments 1 to 8 tabled in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Bydd Andrew yn falch o wybod mai Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau yn bennaf sydd wedi nodi eu bod yn dymuno cyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Anogaf yr aelodau hynny i fod yn fyr. Galwaf ar Ieuan Wyn Jones i gynnig gwelliannau 1 i 8 a gyflwynwyd yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Cynigiaf welliant 1. Dileer *'rhaglen waith flynyddol y Llywodraeth'* a rhoi yn ei le:

I propose amendment 1. Delete '*annual government business programme*' and replace with:

rhaglen waith y Llywodraeth ar gyfer y cyfnod hyd Gorffennaf 2001.

government business programme for the period to July 2001.

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 2. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd:

I also propose amendment 2. Add as a new clause:

yn nodi bod y Cynulliad wedi cytuno ar rai o fentrau'r rhaglen, megis cyflwyno cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy; llunio strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol; rhoi polisi GM cyfyngol ar waith; cynnal cynllun peilot ar gyfer y fagloriaeth Gymreig; ymchwilio i galedi myfyrwyr; ymestyn yr hawl i gael profion llygaid rhad ac am ddim; datblygu strategaeth gwastraff ar gyfer Cymru; ac ymestyn categorïau digartrefedd, ymhlith eraill, cyn ffurfio clymblaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/Llafur;

notes that some of the initiatives in the programme, such as bringing forward a sustainable development scheme; drawing up a national economic development strategy; implementing a restrictive GM policy; piloting a Welsh baccaulaureate scheme; investigating student hardship; extending entitlement to free eye examinations; developing a waste strategy for Wales; and extending the categories of homelessness, amongst others, were agreed by the Assembly prior to the formation of the Liberal Democrat/Labour coalition;

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 3. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd:

I also propose amendment 3. Add as new clause:

yn gresynu nad yw mentrau eraill y cytunwyd arnynt gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, megis paratoi strategaeth gyflogaeth gynhwysfawr erbyn Rhagfyr 2000 ('Gwell Cymru', tudalen 2), wedi'u cynnwys yn y rhaglen hon;

regrets that other initiatives agreed by the National Assembly, such as the preparation by December 2000 of a comprehensive employment strategy ('Better Wales', page 2), are not included in this programme.

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 4. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd:

I also propose amendment 4. Add as a new clause:

yn gresynu nad oes ymrwymiad i wneud Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn ddydd gŵyl cyhoeddus wedi'i gynnwys.

regrets that a commitment to make St David's Day a public holiday is not included.

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 5. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd:

I also propose amendment 5. Add as a new clause:

yn gofyn i'r Weithrediaeth ddatblygu agenda sosialaidd radicalaidd ar gyfer Cymru sydd yn seiliedig ar gyfle cyfartal ac egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy eraill;

requests the Executive to develop a radical socialist agenda for Wales based on equality of opportunity and other sustainable development principles.

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 6. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd:

I also propose amendment 6. Add as a new clause:

yn sylweddoli pa mor annigonol yw is-ddeddfwriaeth fel ffordd o roi polisïau ar waith er lles pobl Cymru ac yn galw ar i Brif Weinidog Cymru gyflwyno sylwadau i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch ymestyn pwerau deddfu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

*recognises the inadequacy of subordinate legislation as a means of implementing policies for the benefit of the people of Wales and calls on the First Secretary to make representations to the Secretary of State for Wales about extending the National Assembl*y's *legislative power.*

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 7. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd.

I also propose amendment 7. Add as a new clause:

gofyn i Brif Weinidog Cymru gyflwyno sylwadau i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch cyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol angenrheidiol i ddwyn ymlaen yn ddiymdroi fesur hawliau dinasyddion yng Nghymru (adran 9.10), a fydd yn cynnwys hawliau cymdeithasol, hawliau economaidd a hawliau eiddo newydd i bobl Cymru.

asks the First Minister to make representations to the Secretary of State for Wales about the introduction of the necessary primary legislation to bring forward forthwith a Bill of citizenship rights in Wales (section 9.10), to include new social, economic and property rights for the people of Wales.

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 8. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd:

I also propose amendment 8. Add as a new clause:

yn nodi bod pact partneriaeth y glymblaid wedi ymrwymo i gyflwyno protocol ar ryddid gwybodaeth erbyn diwedd 2000 (adran 9.4) ac yn gofyn i'r Weithrediaeth wneud hynny'n ddiymdroi.

notes that the coalition's partnership pact made a commitment to introducing a protocol on freedom of information by the end of 2000 (section 9.4) and requests the Executive to do so forthwith.

Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig gan mai dyma'r tro cyntaf inni gael cyfle i drafod rhaglen waith y Llywodraeth yn y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi gofyn sawl tro am ddadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar gytundeb y glymblaid ond, am ryw reswm, ni chawsom hynny. Byddwn, felly, yn defnyddio'r ddadl hon i ystyried ambell agwedd ar y cytundeb, ynghyd â'r agweddau eraill nas cynhwyswyd yn y rhaglen waith.

This is an important debate since it is the first opportunity that we have had to discuss the Assembly Government's programme of business. We have asked many times for a Plenary debate on the coalition agreement but, for some reason, our calls have been rejected. We will, therefore, use this debate to consider some aspects of the agreement, along with the other aspects that have not been included in the business programme.

Cawsom y cyfle ddydd Mawrth i wrando ar Paul Murphy yn trafod rhaglen waith Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol am y

We had the opportunity on Tuesday to listen to Paul Murphy discuss the United Kingdom Government's business

flwyddyn nesaf, neu, a bod yn fanwl gywir, am yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf. Heddiw, rhaglen waith Llywodraeth Cymru sydd dan sylw. Un peth sydd yn gyffredin rhwng y ddwy raglen yw eu bod yn denau o ran cynnwys a bwriad. Er inni feirniadu rhaglen waith Llywodraeth San Steffan, o leiaf gall hi ddefnyddio etholiad cyffredinol arfaethedig fel esgus. Fodd bynnag, ni all Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyfiawnhau ei hun yn yr un modd. Bydd sesiwn bresennol y Cynulliad yn parhau tan ganol yr haf, ac ni chynhelir etholiadau'r Cynulliad tan 2003. O gofio hynny, ac o gofio bod gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad fwyafrif am y tro cyntaf ers ei hethol, yr oeddem wedi disgwyl rhaglen waith fwy uchelgeisiol o lawer.

programme for the coming year, or, to be precise, for the next few months. Today, we are focusing our attention on the Government of Wales's business programme. One thing that those programmes have in common is that both are thin in terms of content and intention. Despite our criticism of the Westminster Government's business programme, at least it can cite an imminent general election as an excuse. However, the Assembly Government has no such excuse. The Assembly's current session will continue until mid summer, and Assembly elections will not be held until 2003. In light of this, and given that the Assembly Government has a majority for the first time since its election, we had expected a far more ambitious business programme.

Ceir 70 o fesurau yn y rhaglen, a thros 40 ohonynt yn ymrwymiadau i adrodd ar gynnydd—beth bynnag a olyga hynny—i gynnal dadleuon neu i barhau â gwaith a ddechreuwyd eisoes. Mae mwyafrif y cynigion deddfwriaethol yn ymwneud â gweinyddu rhaglen San Steffan yng Nghymru, neu â materion a gytunwyd gan y Cynulliad eisoes. Yr oedd gennym ddiddordeb, felly, i weld cynlluniau newydd y glymblaid ar gyfer Cymru, a chroesawn yr ychydig fesurau hynny: diddymu rhai taliadau presgripsiwn, ehangu darpariaeth profion llygaid am ddim a llaeth am ddim i blant ysgol. Byddwn yn falch o gefnogi'r cynlluniau hynny.

The programme contains 70 measures, of which more than 40 are commitments to report on progress—whatever that means—to hold debates or to proceed with work already underway. The majority of the legislative proposals deal with administering the Westminster programme in Wales, or with matters already agreed by the Assembly. We were interested, therefore, to see the coalition's new proposals for Wales, and we welcome those few measures: the abolition of some prescription charges, extending the provision of free eye tests and free school milk. We will be glad to support those measures.

Fodd bynnag, ni allwn, fel plaid, dderbyn bod hynny'n gyfystyr â rhaglen waith flwyddyn lawn yn y Cynulliad. Dywedodd Plaid Cymru y dymunai lunio rhaglen waith y byddai'n ei gweithredu pe bai'n llywodraethu'r Cynulliad. Nid ydym yn gwrthwynebu dim ond er mwyn gwrthwynebu. Nod Plaid Cymru yw dangos yr hyn y byddem yn ei wneud pe byddem ni mewn grym yn y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi dangos pam fod angen mwy o bwerau ar y Cynulliad, a sut y mae diffyg eglurder ynghylch y pwerau sydd gennym yn creu dryswch llwyr yn aml. Yn yr un modd, dangoswyd bod angen diwygio fformwla Barnett yn helaeth er mwyn inni gael system gyllido sydd yn adlewyrchu anghenion pobl Cymru yn decach. Gwnaethom ymrwymiad i ddefnyddio

However, we cannot, as a party, accept that this constitutes a full year's business programme in the Assembly. Plaid Cymru said that it wished to draw up a business programme that it would implement were it governing the Assembly. We are not in the business of opposing for the sake of opposing. Plaid Cymru's aim is to show what we would do if we were the Assembly government. We have shown why the Assembly needs more powers, and how lack of clarity about our existing powers can often lead to complete confusion. In the same way, we have shown that the Barnett formula needs to be revised extensively so that we have a funding system that better reflects the needs of the people of Wales. We have committed ourselves to using the

pwerau'r Cynulliad i'r eithaf ym mhob agwedd ar ei waith. Yr ydym yn bryderus, felly, nad yw'r rhaglen waith hon hyd yn oed yn gwneud hynny.

Assembly's powers to their full extent in every aspect of its work. We are concerned, therefore, that this business programme does not even do that.

Derbyniwn hefyd y bydd yn rhaid gweithio o fewn cyfyngiadau'r setliad presennol hyd at etholiad 2003, er y byddwn yn pwyso'n galed am ragor o bwerau yn ystod cyfnod etholiad San Steffan. Derbyniwn hefyd fod modd gwella'r system bresennol. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dweud droeon bod yn rhaid canolbwyntio ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud. Y gwir yw bod y glymblaid prin yn defnyddio'r pwerau sydd gennym yn barod. Nid oes rhwystrau cyfreithiol na chyfansoddiadol—fel y mae gwelliant 6 Jocelyn yn nodi—i gael mwy o reolaeth ar ddeddfu eilaidd y Cynulliad. Diffyg ewyllys wleidyddol sydd yn gyfrifol am hynny, nid diffyg pwerau. Yr ydym yn pwyso am sefydlu mecanwaith addas gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain er mwyn cael gwell dealltwriaeth ar hynny.

We also accept that we will have to work within the present settlement's restrictions until the 2003 election, although we will be pressing hard for more powers in the period leading up to the Westminster election. We also accept that the present system can be improved. The Government has said many times that we must concentrate on what we can do. The truth is that the coalition barely uses the powers that we already have. There are no legal or constitutional barriers—as Jocelyn's amendment 6 states—to taking more control over the Assembly's secondary legislation. That is down to lack of political will, not lack of powers. We are pressing for the establishment up of a suitable mechanism with the Secretary of State for Wales and the Government in London to achieve a better understanding on that.

11:15 a.m.

Whenever we look at any of this Government's policy programmes, we feel that we have been there before. First, we had 'Betterwales.com'. Following that was 'Putting Wales First'. We were then presented with another interesting document, which was the partnership agreement, and the Labour Party manifesto, which is presumably for internal Labour consumption. 'Putting Wales First', on the one hand, stressed the extent to which the Liberal Democrats' policies have been taken on board. On the partnership agreement, Labour reassures its members that their junior coalition partners are little more than lobby fodder.

Pan edrychwn ar unrhyw un o raglenni polisi'r Llywodraeth hon, teimlwn ein bod wedi bod yno o'r blaen. Yn gyntaf, cawsom 'Gwellcymru.com'. Yn dilyn hynny yr oedd 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf'. Yna fe'n cyflwynwyd â dogfen ddiddorol arall, sef y cytundeb partneriaeth, a maniffesto'r Blaid Lafur, sydd, fe dybiwn, at ddefnydd y Blaid Lafur yn fewnol. Pwysleisiodd 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf', ar y naill law, i ba raddau yr ystyriwyd polisïau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. O ran y cytundeb partneriaeth, sicrha'r Blaid Lafur ei haelodau nad yw eu partneriaid clymblaid iau yn ddim mwy na phorthiant lobïo.

Today, we were presented with the Government's annual programme. I was surprised that the Minister for Assembly Business moved the motion. We were told that, in the absence of the First Minister, the Deputy First Minister would replace him. It is interesting that the first time the First Minister is absent for a major debate since the formation of the coalition Government, the person who leads is not the Deputy First Minister, who was specifically given that

Heddiw, cyflwynwyd rhaglen flynyddol y Llywodraeth inni. Synnais mai'r Trefnydd a gynigiodd y cynnig. Dywedwyd wrthym, pe bai'r Prif Weinidog yn absennol, y byddai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn cymryd ei le. Mae'n ddiddorol, y tro cyntaf i'r Prif Weinidog fod yn absennol o ddadl o bwys ers ffurfio'r Llywodraeth glymblaid, nad y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, sef y person y rhoddwyd y teitl hwnnw iddo yn benodol, yw'r person sydd yn arwain, ond yn hytrach

title, but the Minister for Assembly Business. There was no explanation on that. Let us presume that it would have been a difficult pill for Labour Members to swallow if Mike German opened this debate on behalf of the Government. However, let us allow that to pass.

y Trefnydd. Ni chafwyd unrhyw eglurhad am hynny. Gadewch inni gymryd yn ganiataol y byddai wedi bod yn bilsen anodd i Aelodau Llafur ei llyncu pe bai Mike German wedi agor y ddadl hon ar ran y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni anwybyddu hynny heddiw.

The main thrust of today's debate is that it is a threadbare programme. Nearly all of our criticisms are on what the document does not include rather than what it does. We have launched our alternative programme for government this week. We have no gimmicks, no fancy titles and no conflicting messages to our right or left wing. We have a real alternative. We have shown in that document that it is possible to be bold, imaginative and radical, even in the confines of the present constitutional settlement. We must be ambitious for Wales. The coalition parties say that they want high ambitions for Wales. Where is that ambition in this threadbare and lacklustre programme for government? Have they taken the opportunity to be bold and to use the existing powers of the Assembly? What is their vision for Wales? Our vision for Wales is clear. We want to spread prosperity throughout Wales on the one hand and tackle the inequalities in income and in the health service and education on the other. This programme tinkers around the edges. It bears the stamp of a Government bereft of vision that drifted into power and whose approach to governing is to let events take their course.

Prif bwyslais y ddadl heddiw yw mai rhaglen denau ydyw. Mae bron pob un o'n beirniadaethau yn ymwneud â'r hyn nad yw'r ddogfen yn ei gynnwys yn hytrach na'r hyn y mae yn ei gynnwys. Yr wythnos hon lansiwyd ein rhaglen waith amgen ar gyfer llywodraethu. Nid oes gennym gimics, teitlau ffansi na negeseuon gwrthgyferbyniol ar gyfer ein hadain dde neu'n hadain chwith. Mae gennym ddewis amgen gwirioneddol. Dangosasom yn y ddogfen honno ei bod yn bosibl bod yn fentrus, yn llawn dychymyg ac yn radical, hyd yn oed o fewn terfynau'r setliad cyfansoddiadol presennol. Rhaid inni fod yn uchelgeisiol ar gyfer Cymru. Dywed pleidiau'r glymblaid eu bod am gael dyheadau uchel i Gymru. Ble mae'r uchelgais honno yn y rhaglen lywodraethu denau a di-fflach hon? A fanteisiwyd ar y cyfle i fod yn fentrus a defnyddio pwerau presennol y Cynulliad? Beth yw eu gweledigaeth ar gyfer Cymru? Mae ein gweledigaeth ni ar gyfer Cymru yn glir. Yr ydym am ledaenu ffyniant ledled Cymru ar y naill law a mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau mewn incwm ac yn y gwasanaeth iechyd ac addysg ar y llaw arall. Mae'r rhaglen hon yn chwarae o amgylch yr ymylon. Mae arni ôl Llywodraeth sydd yn amddifad o weledigaeth a lithrodd i rym ac mai ei hymagwedd at lywodraethu yw gadael i bethau ddilyn eu hynt.

On the economy, much of our success as an Assembly will depend on how we handle the economy—

O ran yr economi, bydd llawer o'n llwyddiant fel Cynulliad yn dibynnu ar sut yr ymdriniwn â'r economi—

Huw Lewis: Is it not the case, Ieuan, that the 100 point wish list that you have published for a Plaid Cymru government depends entirely on redistribution of wealth and resources in the British state and that, without the continued existence of the British state, your fantasy programme falls apart?

Huw Lewis: Onid yw'n wir, Ieuan, fod y rhestr dymuniadau 100 o bwyntiau a gyhoeddasoch ar gyfer llywodraeth Plaid Cymru yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar ailddosbarthu cyfoeth ac adnoddau yn y wladwriaeth Brydeinig ac, heb fodolaeth parhaol y wladwriaeth Brydeinig, fod eich rhaglen ffantasi yn disgyn yn ddarnau?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Our programme considers the need for the redistribution of wealth and resources in the United Kingdom, but it also recognises that, even within the limited powers of the Assembly, it is possible to begin that process in Wales. I did not detect in Huw's intervention any acknowledgement of the fact that Labour now believes in the redistribution of wealth. I will allow him to intervene again, if he so wishes. Do you really believe in the redistribution of wealth, Huw? I see that you do not wish to intervene. Is not that amazing?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Ystyria ein rhaglen yr angen am ailddosbarthu cyfoeth ac adnoddau yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ond mae'n cydnabod hefyd, hyd yn oed o fewn pwerau cyfyngedig y Cynulliad, ei bod yn bosibl dechrau'r broses honno yng Nghymru. Ni chanfyddais yn ymyriad Huw unrhyw gydnabyddiaeth o'r ffaith fod Llafur bellach yn credu mewn ailddosbarthu cyfoeth. Caniataf iddo ymyrryd eto, os dymuna. A ydych o ddifrif yn credu mewn ailddosbarthu cyfoeth, Huw? Gwelaf nad ydych yn dymuno ymyrryd. Onid yw hynny'n rhyfeddol?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I am sorry to break up this interchange, but you have had nine minutes and many Members wish to speak. Some people will not be able to contribute today. The longer the speeches, the fewer the people who will be able to contribute. Huw has now risen; do you want him to intervene?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf chwalu'r cyfnewid hwn, ond cawsoch naw munud ac mae sawl Aelod yn dymuno siarad. Ni fydd rhai pobl yn gallu cyfrannu heddiw. Po hwyaf fo'r areithiau, y lleiaf fydd nifer y bobl a fydd yn gallu cyfrannu. Mae Huw wedi codi erbyn hyn; a ydych am iddo ymyrryd?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yes.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Ydw.

Huw Lewis: I appreciate being asked to intervene. That is bold of you. Labour does believe in redistributing wealth, and is doing so. It has provided the greatest redistribution of wealth and opportunity this century in the NHS alone. That is one example. How could you possibly hope to match that in a self-governing Wales in a European superstate?

Huw Lewis: Gwerthfawrogaf gael cais i ymyrryd. Yr ydych yn eofn yn gwneud hynny. Cred Llafur mewn ailddosbarthu cyfoeth, a gwna hynny. Darparodd yr ailddosbarthiad mwyaf o gyfoeth a chyfle y ganrif hon yn yr NHS yn unig. Dyna un enghraifft. Sut y gallech obeithio gwneud cystal â hynny mewn Cymru hunanlywodraethol mewn uwchwladwriaeth Ewropeaidd?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: That is an interesting comment, but I will not follow that path. It is interesting that we are discussing the Government's programme for Wales but that there is not a scintilla of evidence that it believes in redistributing wealth in Wales within the Assembly's existing powers. We need a radical programme, using the Assembly's powers to great effect. We also want, and we believe—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae hynny'n sylw diddorol, ond ni ddilynaf y trywydd hwnnw. Mae'n ddiddorol ein bod yn trafod rhaglen y Llywodraeth ar gyfer Cymru ond nad oes mymryn o dystiolaeth ei bod yn credu mewn ailddosbarthu cyfoeth yng Nghymru o fewn pwerau presennol y Cynulliad. Mae arnom angen rhaglen radical, sydd yn defnyddio pwerau'r Cynulliad yn effeithiol iawn. Yr ydym hefyd eisiau, a chredwn—

Lynne Neagle: I am interested in that talk of radicalism, particularly in the light of Jocelyn's call for a radical socialist agenda. I have read your alternative proposals and they contain no measures that will lead to the redistribution of wealth for the poorest areas

Lynne Neagle: Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn y sôn hwnnw am radicaliaeth, yn arbennig yng ngoleuni galwad Jocelyn am agenda sosialaidd radical. Darllenais eich cynigion amgen ac nid ydynt yn cynnwys unrhyw fesurau a fydd yn arwain at ailddosbarthu

of Wales. There is no mention of social justice either, so how dare you mention socialism in your amendments?

cyfoeth i ardaloedd tlotaf Cymru. Nid oes unrhyw sôn am gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ychwaith, felly sut y beiddiwch sôn am sosialaeth yn eich gwelliannau?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I invite you to vote for that amendment. We will be interested to see how many Labour back benchers will have the guts to vote for an amendment that calls for a radical socialist agenda for Wales.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Fe'ch gwahoddaf i bleidleisio dros y gwelliant hwnnw. Bydd diddordeb gennym weld faint o Aelodau meinciau cefn Llafur a fydd yn ddigon dewr i bleidleisio dros welliant sydd yn galw am agenda sosialaidd radical i Gymru.

We will demand a radically different approach to education, and Cynog will have an opportunity to discuss that. However, to reject our series of amendments is a wasted opportunity by the administration. It is now clear that the only bold, imaginative, forward-looking and practical party is Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales.

Byddwn yn galw am ymagwedd hanfodol wahanol tuag at addysg, a chaiff Cynog gyfle i drafod hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae gwrthod ein cyfres o welliannau yn gyfle a gollwyd gan y weinyddiaeth. Mae'n glir erbyn hyn mai'r unig blaid fentrus, llawn dychymyg, blaengar ac ymarferol yw Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales.

David Melding: I propose amendment 9. Add at the end of the motion:

David Melding: Cynigiaf welliant 9. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig:

and notes the commitment by the Minister for Health and Social Services on 7 June 2000 to reduce the in-patient waiting list to 65,000 by the end of March 2001.

ac yn nodi ymrwymiad y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar 7 Mehefin 2000 i gwtogi rhestr aros cleifion mewnol i 65,000 erbyn diwedd Mawrth 2001.

I also propose amendment 10. Add at the end of the motion:

Cynigiaf hefyd welliant 10. Ychwaneger at ddiwedd y cynnig:

and calls upon the administration to identify the potential role for primary care trusts as advocated by the British Medical Association.

ac yn galw ar y weinyddiaeth i nodi swyddogaeth bosibl yr ymddiriedolaethau gofal sylfaenol sydd yn cael ei argymell gan Gymdeithas Feddygol Prydain.

The Welsh Conservative Party will support Plaid Cymru's amendments, unless otherwise stated. I will discuss the ones to which we object. We will not support amendment 3, which hints at some form of five-year plan. It is not specific enough to give us grounds for judgement. We will abstain on amendment 4. Although we agree that there should be a St David's Day public holiday, we do not believe that our current powers allow us to make that commitment. We still have to lobby Westminster on that. On amendment 5, we applaud Plaid Cymru's commitment to socialism, as it is a party of the left. We wish that other parties of the left would be as candid as Plaid Cymru. As a party of the right, we just vigorously oppose your

Bydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn cefnogi gwelliannau Plaid Cymru, oni nodir fel arall. Trafodaf y rhai a wrthwynebwn. Ni chefnogwn welliant 3, sydd yn lledawgrymu rhyw fath o gynllun pum mlynedd. Nid yw'n ddigon penodol i roi inni resymau dros farnu. Ymataliwn ein pleidlais ar welliant 4. Er y cytunwn y dylid cael gŵyl gyhoeddus ar Ddydd Gŵyl Dewi, ni chredwn y bydd ein pwerau cyfredol yn caniatáu inni wneud yr ymrwymiad hwnnw. Rhaid inni lobïo San Steffan ar hynny o hyd. O ran gwelliant 5, cymeradwywn ymrwymiad Plaid Cymru i sosialaeth, gan mai plaid yr adain chwith ydyw. Trueni na allai pleidiau eraill yr adain chwith fod mor agored â Phlaid

political views. We will also vote against amendment 6, because it attempts to extend the Assembly's powers prematurely. We will also oppose amendment 7 as we feel that it will undermine existing legislation that needs time to work, for instance the Human Rights Act 1998, which we have already discussed. That amendment would not add much to citizens' rights.

Cymru. Fel un o bleidiau'r adain dde, yr ydym, yn syml, yn gwrthwynebu eich safbwyntiau gwleidyddol yn chwyrn. Pleidleisiwn yn erbyn gwelliant 6 hefyd, gan ei fod yn ceisio ymestyn pwerau'r Cynulliad cyn pryd. Gwrthwynebwn welliant 7 hefyd gan y teimlwn y bydd yn tanseilio deddfwriaeth bresennol y mae angen amser arni i weithio, er enghraifft Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998, a drafodasom eisoes. Ni fyddai'r gwelliant hwnnw yn ychwanegu llawer at hawliau dinasyddion.

On our amendments, it was refreshing to hear that the Minister for Assembly Business—convolutedly, I admit—seemed to accept my amendment 9. However, I will wait for the voting record to demonstrate that categorically. It is important that the commitment to reduce in-patient waiting lists to 65,000 is met, and it should be written into your programme of government for the next six to eight months. Therefore, I welcome your admission that that should be included and that you will, if I understood you, support that amendment.

O ran ein gwelliannau, yr oedd yn braf clywed bod y Trefnydd—yn ddryslyd, rhaid cyfaddef—yn ymddangos fel pe bai yn derbyn fy ngwelliant 9. Fodd bynnag, arhosaf am y cofnod pleidleisio i ddangos hynny'n ddiamod. Mae'n bwysig cyflawni'r ymrwymiad i leihau rhestrau aros cleifion mewnol i 65,000, a dylid ei gynnwys yn eich rhaglen lywodraethu ar gyfer y chwech i'r wyth mis nesaf. Felly, croesawaf eich cyfaddefiad y dylid cynnwys hynny ac y cefnogwch y gwelliant hwnnw, os deellais chi.

I regret that you will not even support the exploration of the issues outlined in amendment 10 because its wording is taken from the British Medical Association's latest briefing paper, which calls for strategic leadership on local health groups. At the moment, we do not know where those health groups are going. It is as if they are just circling in the air stacked up above Cardiff International Airport, waiting for a slot. What is going to happen to them? We need a strategy. The Audit Commission has already identified that at least four local health groups in Wales would wish to seek trust status, if they were given that power. We are not saying that it should be compulsory, as it will be in England, but that they should have the option, and the BMA agrees.

Mae'n edifar gennyf na chefnogwch hyd yn oed ymchwilio i'r materion a amlinellwyd yng ngwelliant 10 oherwydd cymerwyd ei eiriad o bapur briffio diweddaraf Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain, sydd yn galw am arweinyddiaeth strategol ar grwpiau iechyd lleol. Ar hyn o bryd, ni wyddom i ble y mae'r grwpiau iechyd hynny'n mynd. Mae fel pe baent yn hedfan mewn cylch fry uwchben Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd, yn aros eu tro. Beth a ddigwydd iddynt? Mae angen strategaeth arnom. Nododd y Comisiwn Archwilio eisoes y byddai o leiaf pedwar grŵp iechyd lleol yng Nghymru yn dymuno ceisio cael statws ymddiriedolaeth, pe rhoddwyd y pwer hwnnw iddynt. Ni ddywedwn y dylai fod yn orfodol, fel y bydd yn Lloegr, ond y dylent gael yr opsiwn, a chytuna Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain â hyn.

11:25 a.m.

Kirsty Williams: On the potential development of local health groups into primary care trusts, do you accept that when the local health groups attended a meeting of

Kirsty Williams: Ar ddatblygiad posibl grwpiau iechyd lleol yn ymddiriedolaethau gofal sylfaenol, a dderbyniwch, pan fynychodd y grwpiau iechyd lleol gyfarfod

the Health and Social Services Committee, they were not as enthusiastic about developing into primary care trusts as you stated? More structural reforms in the NHS on the back of the newly-established local health groups and the painful reconfiguration process that applies on the trust, would cause further instability when the NHS needs stability, as well as a strategy, more than ever.

o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, nad oeddent mor frwdfrydig ynglŷn â datblygu yn ymddiriedolaethau gofal sylfaenol ag y dywedasoch? Byddai cael rhagor o ddiwygiadau strwythurol yn yr NHS ar draul grwpiau iechyd lleol sydd newydd eu sefydlu a'r broses ailgyflunio boenus sydd yn gymwys o ran yr ymddiriedolaeth, yn achosi rhagor o ansefydlogrwydd pan mae angen sefydlogrwydd yn ogystal â strategaeth ar yr NHS yn fwy nag erioed o'r blaen.

David Melding: I noticed that in Committee, when the supreme ruler of the health service—I refer to the Minister—is present, there is a lack of candour, but when I speak to members of local health groups and chief executives in private, there is an enthusiastic backing for my views. Perhaps that is my subjective interpretation. I will not embarrass them by listing those supporters, as the Audit Committee did not embarrass those local health groups that want to seek trust status. However, I am pleased that Kirsty has intervened because I will now consider the Liberal Democrats' position in this coalition Government and on its programme.

David Melding: Sylwais yn y Pwyllgor, pan fydd uwch reolwr y gwasanaeth iechyd—cyfeiriaf at y Gweinidog—yn bresennol, bod diffyg didwylledd, ond pan siaradaf ag aelodau o grwpiau iechyd lleol a phrif weithredwyr yn breifat, mae cefnogaeth frwdfrydig i'm safbwyntiau. Efallai mai fy nehongliad goddrychol i yw hynny. Ni chodaf gywilydd arnynt drwy restru'r cefnogwyr hynny, gan na chododd y Pwyllgor Archwilio gywilydd ar y grwpiau iechyd lleol hynny sydd am geisio statws ymddiriedolaeth. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch bod Kirsty wedi ymyrryd oherwydd ystyriaf yn awr safbwynt y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Llywodraeth glymblaid hon a'i safbwynt ar ei rhaglen.

On Tuesday, Members will recall that we witnessed the most undignified sight of our titular Bishop being temporarily unfrocked so that he could go about the profane business of offering a Liberal Democrat critique of the Queen's Speech. It was the most unseemly spectacle and I noticed that, while he caused amusement to the opposition parties, the Labour Members were distraught and made several interventions later in the debate to record their disgust at his double-dealing. I must tell the Labour Members what a heavy price they are paying for this coalition. I will be succinct, although I could list all the dreadful prices that they have to pay. They are faced with two unsackable Cabinet members from the Liberal Democrat Party. There is nothing that they can do about them as long as this coalition has to live its miserable life.

Ar ddydd Mawrth, bydd yr Aelodau yn cofio inni fod yn dyst i'r olygfa fwyaf anurddasol o'n Hesgob teitlog yn cael ei ddiurddo dros dro fel y gallai fynd ynglŷn â'r busnes anghysegredig o gynnig beirniadaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar Araith y Frenhines. Yr oedd yn olygfa anweddaidd iawn a sylwais, er y bu'n destun difyrrwch i'r gwrthbleidiau, fod Aelodau Llafur mewn trallod a gwnaethant sawl ymyriad yn ddiweddarach yn y ddadl i gofnodi eu diflastod ynglŷn â'i ffordd ddauwynebog. Rhaid imi ddweud wrth Aelodau Llafur bris mor uchel y maent yn ei dalu am y glymblaid hon. Byddaf yn gryno, er y gallwn restru'r holl brisiau ofnadwy y mae'n rhaid iddynt eu talu. Wynebant ddau aelod o'r Cabinet o Blaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol na ellir eu diswyddo. Ni allant wneud unrhyw beth yn eu cylch cyhyd â bod y glymblaid hon yn gorfod byw ei bywyd diflas.

Val Feld: Do you agree that the real price to pay would be not having this coalition? Our experience of the past 18 months of trying to reach agreement with other parties meant that, at the end of the day, you could run away and not have to face the responsibility of making decisions for Wales. That is why Labour, as a responsible party with the most Members here, sought to reach an agreement so that it could deliver real change instead of playing the kind of games that the opposition parties play with the future of the people of Wales. [CONSERVATIVE and PLAID CYMRU ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh'.]

Val Feld: A gytunwch mai'r pris gwirioneddol i'w dalu fyddai peidio â chael y glymblaid hon? Golygodd ein profiad dros y 18 mis diwethaf o geisio dod i gytundeb â phleidiau eraill y gallech, ar ddiwedd y dydd, redeg i ffwrdd heb orfod wynebu'r cyfrifoldeb o wneud penderfyniadau i Gymru. Dyna pam bod Llafur, fel plaid gyfrifol â'r nifer fwyaf o'r Aelodau yma, wedi ceisio dod i gytundeb fel y gallai gyflawni newid gwirioneddol yn lle chwarae'r math o gemau y mae'r gwrthbleidiau yn eu chwarae gyda dyfodol pobl Cymru. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL A PHLAID CYMRU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'.]

David Melding: Verbose interventions do not help debate much. In those 18 months, we were faced by some irreconcilable Liberal principles that were clearly expressed in this Chamber. When the Deputy First Minister was offered that position, he got over many of his commitments very quickly. I hope that his conscience is fully reconciled. The other ridiculous spectacle that we have witnessed is that of Liberal Democrat Assembly Members behaving like political magpies, pinching the credit for all policy initiatives and spending commitments that this Labour administration offers. We all know why this unhappy situation exists. It comes from the sort of Liberal Democrat manifesto that is like a cyber squatter's website—a long wish list of every conceivable policy development, listed in the vague hope that in the future some real government will come along with resources and implement those policies. They then claim the credit for coming up with the idea in the first place. That virtual reality world is needed to reach a situation where a Liberal Democrat says that her colleague, Peter Black, was responsible for negotiating the budget and all its presumed successes.

David Melding: Nid yw ymyriadau amleiriog yn helpu'r ddadl rhyw lawer. Yn y 18 mis hynny, wynebasom rai egwyddorion Llafur anghyson a fynegwyd yn glir yn y Siambr hon. Pan gynigiwyd ei swydd i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, cwblhaodd lawer o'i ymrwymiadau yn gyflym iawn. Gobeithiaf ei fod wedi rhoi trefn ar ei gydwybod. Yr olygfa wirion arall y buom yn dyst iddi oedd yr olygfa o Aelodau Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o'r Cynulliad yn ymddwyn fel pïod gwleidyddol, yn dwyn y clod am yr holl fentrau polisi a'r ymrwymiadau gwario y mae'r weinyddiaeth Lafur hon yn eu cynnig. Gŵyr pob un ohonom pam bod y sefyllfa anhapus hon yn bodoli. Deillia o'r math o faniffesto'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sydd fel gwefan seibersgwatiwr—rhestr hir o ddymuniadau o bob datblygiad polisi posibl, wedi'u rhestru yn y gobaith amhendant y daw rhyw lywodraeth go iawn heibio yn y dyfodol gydag adnoddau a gweithredu'r polisïau hynny. Yna cymerant y clod am feddwl am y syniad yn y lle cyntaf. Mae angen y byd rhithwir hwnnw er mwyn cyrraedd sefyllfa lle y dywed Democrat Rhyddfrydol mai ei chyd-Aelod, Peter Black, a oedd yn gyfrifol am negodi'r gyllideb a'i holl lwyddiannau tybiedig.

Andrew Davies: I note David's reference to political magpies. Would he like to comment on his party's leader, who never seems to let a bandwagon go by without jumping on it? Does he agree with his party leader's attacking the Macpherson report, which all other parties in this Chamber have supported?

Andrew Davies: Nodaf gyfeiriad David at bïod gwleidyddol. A hoffai roi ei sylwadau ar arweinydd ei blaid, nad yw byth, mae'n ymddangos, yn gadael i gyfle i ddilyn y dorf er mwyn ymelwa fynd heibio? A gytuna ag ymosodiad arweinydd ei blaid ar adroddiad Macpherson, y mae pob plaid

arall yn y Siambr hon wedi ei gefnogi?

David Melding: I am grateful for that intervention, because it leads me on to the topic of the Labour Party's position in the coalition. The majority—

David Melding: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ymyriad hwnnw, oherwydd fe'm harwain at fater sefyllfa'r Blaid Lafur yn y glymblaid. Mae'r mwyafrif—

Andrew Davies: Answer the question.

Andrew Davies: Atebwch y cwestiwn.

David Melding: I will refer to it, but I will not interrupt the flow of my speech just because you have made an irrelevant intervention. An air of the most appalling gloom has descended upon the Welsh Labour Party. Opposition Members cannot go into the Members' tea room without being accosted by a distraught Labour AM in desperate need of counselling. They are infuriated by the Liberal Democrats' cheek and boasting. We hear all this in private. I advise the Minister for Assembly Business that the great underspend—

David Melding: Cyfeiriaf ato, ond ni thorraf ar draws llif fy araith dim ond am eich bod wedi gwneud ymyriad amherthnasol. Mae rhyw ddigalondid ofnadwy wedi disgyn ar Blaid Lafur Cymru. Ni all Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau fynd i mewn i ystafell de'r Aelodau heb gael eu cyfarch gan Aelod Llafur trallodus y Cynulliad mewn angen dybryd am gyngor. Fe'u cynddeiriogir gan hyfrdra ac ymffrostio'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Clywn hyn i gyd yn breifat. Cynghoraf y Trefnydd fod y tanwario mawr—

Pauline Jarman *rose—*

Pauline Jarman *a gododd—*

David Melding: I do not think that I can take another intervention. The great underspend that we supposedly have in this year's budget could perhaps be used to establish a freephone helpline for Labour AMs who are appalled by the consequences of the coalition. If the coalition continues, that service will be necessary.

David Melding: Ni chredaf y gallaf gymryd ymyriad arall. Gallai'r tanwario mawr sydd gennym, yn ôl pob sôn, yng nghyllideb eleni gael ei ddefnyddio efallai i sefydlu llinell gymorth rhadffon i Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad a frawychwyd gan ganlyniadau'r glymblaid. Os bydd y glymblaid yn parhau, bydd y gwasanaeth hwnnw'n angenrheidiol.

This coalition programme is called, rather amusingly, 'Putting Wales First'. Let us face it, it is actually a case of putting the Liberals first. Your Labour colleagues cannot understand it and nor will the people of Wales.

Gelwir y rhaglen glymblaid hon, yn ddifyr, yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf'. Gadewch inni wynebu hyn, mae'n golygu rhoi'r Rhyddfrydwyr yn gyntaf. Ni all eich cyd-Aelodau Llafur ei deall ac ni fydd pobl Cymru yn ei deall ychwaith.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There are seven Members to speak, in addition to the Minister. If we are to get through this, speakers will have to restrict themselves to three and a half minutes. I hope that Members realise that if they go over three and half minutes, even by a second, I will call them to order and ask them to stop speaking.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae saith Aelod eisiau siarad, yn ogystal â'r Gweinidog. Er mwyn mynd trwy hyn, bydd yn rhaid i lefarwyr gyfyngu eu hunain i dair munud a hanner. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau yn sylweddoli os ânt heibio i dair munud a hanner, hyd yn oed eiliad drosodd, byddaf yn eu galw i drefn ac yn gofyn iddynt orffen siarad.

Peter Black: Having listened to the last two speakers, and I think that they took up about

Peter Black: Ar ôl gwrando ar y ddau lefarydd diwethaf, a chredaf iddynt gymryd

20 minutes between them, what struck me is that they did not present one alternative, concrete proposal to what is contained in this programme. That is significant. Plaid Cymru may have published its list of 100 demands, but they are only relevant if we have full, primary legislative powers.

tuag 20 munud rhyngddynt, yr hyn a'm trawodd yw na chyflwynwyd un cynnig amgen, concrit ganddynt i'r hyn a gynhwysir yn y rhaglen hon. Mae hynny'n arwyddocaol. Efallai bod Plaid Cymru wedi cyhoeddi ei rhestr o 100 o ofynion, ond dim ond os oes gennym bwerau deddfwriaethol sylfaenol llawn y maent yn berthnasol.

Jocelyn Davies *rose—*

Jocelyn Davies *a gododd—*

Peter Black: I am not taking interventions as I only have three and a half minutes to speak. Those demands are only applicable if we have full legislative powers. Clearly, that is not the case. We are working within the existing devolution settlement and must deliver within it. When the next Plaid Cymru or Conservative speaker is called, I would like them to tell us what they will do, given the existing settlement, that would be different from what is proposed in the document before us today. What would they do that is practical and deliverable? Despite all the moaning from the Conservatives on my right about this being a long Liberal Democrat wish list, this is in fact a practical document for government, which can and will be delivered within the timescales set out.

Peter Black: Ni chymeraf ymyriadau gan mai dim ond tair munud a hanner sydd gennyf i siarad. Dim ond os oes gennym bwerau deddfwriaethol llawn y mae'r gofynion hynny yn gymwys. Yn amlwg, nid felly y mae. Gweithiwn o fewn y setliad datganoli presennol a rhaid inni gyflawni o'i fewn. Pan elwir ar lefarydd nesaf Plaid Cymru neu'r Blaid Geidwadol, hoffwn pe baent yn dweud wrthym beth y byddent yn ei wneud, o gofio'r setliad presennol, a fyddai'n wahanol i'r hyn a gynigir yn y ddogfen ger ein bron heddiw. Beth fyddent yn ei wneud a fyddai'n ymarferol ac y gellir ei gyflawni? Er yr holl gwyno gan y Ceidwadwyr ar y dde bod hon yn rhestr ddymuniadau hir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, y mae mewn gwirionedd yn ddogfen ymarferol ar gyfer llywodraeth, y gellir ei chyflwyno ac a gaiff ei chyflwyno o fewn yr amserlenni a bennwyd.

I will briefly highlight several issues and make it clear that we have a partnership Government here. It is a partnership between two proud, independent parties that have put aside their differences for the benefit of Wales. That is an important distinction. We are talking about a partnership, not a merger or a pact, despite the reference in amendment 8 to a pact. This is a partnership Government for Wales. That clearly leaves us free to talk on separate wavelengths, as it were, on the UK Government or even on local government, where we are not in partnership and have our own distinct views and policies.

Amlygaf, yn fras, nifer o faterion gan dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod gennym Lywodraeth bartneriaeth yma. Mae'n bartneriaeth rhwng dwy blaid falch, annibynnol a roddodd eu gwahaniaethau o'r neilltu er budd Cymru. Mae hynny'n wahaniaeth pwysig. Soniwn yma am bartneriaeth, nid uniad neu gytundeb, er gwaetha'r cyfeiriad yng ngwelliant 8 at gytundeb. Mae hon yn Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i Gymru. Yn amlwg, mae hynny yn ein gadael yn rhydd i siarad ar donfeddi ar wahân, fel petai, ar Lywodraeth y DU neu hyd yn oed ar lywodraeth leol, lle nad ydym mewn partneriaeth a lle mae gennym ein safbwyntiau a'n polisïau gwahanol.

What is contained in this agreement that is distinctive and where have the Liberal Democrats made a particularly valuable contribution? We have the commitment to free dental checks and to the extension of free

Beth a gynhwysir yn y cytundeb hwn sydd yn wahanol a ble y gwnaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol gyfraniad arbennig o werthfawr? Mae gennym yr ymrwymiad i archwiliadau deintyddol am ddim ac i

prescriptions and the freezing of free prescriptions. We have the commitment to free school milk and to the homeless legislation that I had the privilege to propose a few months ago in this Chamber. There is also the Local Government Bill and the changes it brought about, as a result of the Liberal Democrats and the negotiations that took place as a part of this partnership agreement. That is another important point. This was a negotiation on the agreement and the budget, not one party imposing its view on another. Part of that negotiation process is that each party had elements that they put into that budget and that agreement. There were also elements that each party wanted to put in but could not, because that is the process of negotiation. People need to understand that.

ymestyn presgripsiynau am ddim a rhewi presgripsiynau am ddim. Mae gennym yr ymrwymiad i laeth ysgol am ddim ac i'r ddeddfwriaeth digartrefedd y bu'n fraint gennyf ei chynnig ychydig fisoedd yn ôl yn y Siambr hon. Hefyd, mae'r Mesur Llywodraeth Leol a'r newidiadau a ddaeth yn ei sgîl, o ganlyniad i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r negodi a fu fel rhan o'r cytundeb partneriaeth hwn. Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig arall. Yr oedd hyn yn negodi ar y cytundeb a'r gyllideb, nid un blaid yn gorfodi ei barn ar un arall. Rhan o'r broses negodi honno yw bod gan bob plaid elfennau a roddant i mewn i'r gyllideb honno a'r cytundeb hwnnw. Yr oedd elfennau hefyd yr oedd pob plaid am eu cynnwys ond ni allent, oherwydd dyna yw'r broses negodi. Mae angen i bobl ddeall hynny.

I conclude by saying that we are starting to push the Assembly's current powers to their limits. I believe that we have here a programme for government that can be delivered and is to the credit of both the parties involved.

Gorffennaf drwy ddweud ein bod yn dechrau gwthio pwerau cyfredol y Cynulliad i'r eithaf. Credaf fod gennym raglen waith y llywodraeth yma y gellir ei chyflawni ac sydd er clod i'r ddwy blaid dan sylw.

11:35 a.m.

Cynog Dafis: Yr ydym yn siomedig bod y glymblaid hon wedi colli cyfle euraidd i wneud unrhyw beth arwyddocaol a phwysig ym myd addysg yng Nghymru. Ni allai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hyd yn oed sicrhau setliad ariannol teilwng i addysg. Bydd ysgolion yn dioddef; yn sicr mae hynny'n wir ym Mhowys. Caiff addysg uwch amser caled dros ben hefyd yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae'n drawiadol clywed bod Peter Black wedi bod yn rhan o negodi'r gyllideb. Bydd eisiau i Kirsty Williams esbonio hynny i bobl Powys.

Cynog Dafis: We are disappointed that this coalition has missed a golden opportunity to do anything significant and important in the field of education in Wales. The Liberal Democrats were not even able to ensure an adequate financial settlement for education. Schools will suffer; that is certainly the case in Powys. Higher education will also have an exceptionally hard time during the next year. It is significant that Peter Black has been part of the budget negotiations. Kirsty Williams will need to explain that to the people of Powys.

Yr wyf yn croesawu rhai pethau. Mae'r ymrwymiad i'r fagloriaeth Gymreig i'w groesawu, yn ogystal â'r ymchwiliad i gyni ariannol ymysg myfyrwyr. Fodd bynnag, ar wahân i'r ddau beth hynny, nid oes dim byd gwreiddiol nac arloesol.

I welcome some elements. The commitment to the Welsh baccalaureate is to be welcomed, as is the investigation into financial hardship among students. However, apart from those two elements, there is nothing original or pioneering.

Lynne Neagle *a gododd—*

Lynne Neagle *rose—*

Cynog Dafis: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, nid oes

Cynog Dafis: I am sorry, I have no time to

amser imi dderbyn ymyriad; dim ond tair munud a hanner sydd gennyf.

take an intervention; I only have three and a half minutes.

Yn benodol, o ran addysg, nid oes dim byd i herio agenda Llafur Newydd yn San Steffan. Parhad yw hynny o'r agenda Thatcheraidd. Nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Hanfod y diwygiadau Thatcheraidd oedd y dylai ysgolion weithredu fel busnesau ymreolus, yn cystadlu â'i gilydd am gwsmeriaid, yn cael eu gwobrwyo'n ariannol am lwyddo a'u cosbi'n ariannol am fethu. Rhan o baraffernalia'r farchnad gystadleuol honno yw tablau cynghrair, enwi a chywilyddio ysgolion, y system o arolygiadau chweblynyddol, cyhoeddi adroddiadau yn y wasg, ac yn y blaen. Ni chafodd y diwygiadau hynny ddim cefnogaeth wleidyddol yng Nghymru pan ddaethant i rym. Maent yn achosi mawr ddrwg yn nhermau sefydlogrwydd darpariaeth, ac yn arbennig o ran cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Maent yn cosbi cymunedau tlawd yn arbennig. Maent yn agor drws y cefn i ddethol disgyblion ar sail gallu: os ydych yn amau hyn, gofynnwch i rieni ysgol Pen-lan yn Abertawe, neu ysgol Tre-lai yng Nghaerdydd, ac mae eraill sydd yn dioddef yn yr un modd.

Specifically, in terms of education, there is nothing to challenge the New Labour agenda in Westminster. That is an extension of the Thatcherite agenda. Of that there is no doubt. The essence of the Thatcherite reforms was that schools should operate as autonomous businesses, competing against each other for customers, being rewarded financially for success and punished financially for failure. The league tables, the naming and shaming of schools, the system of sexennial inspections, the publishing of reports in the press, and so on, are part of the paraphernalia of that competitive market. Those reforms received no political support in Wales when they were enacted. They cause great harm in terms of the stability of provision, and particularly in terms of social justice. They punish poor communities especially. They open the back door to pupil selection on the basis of ability: if you doubt that, ask the parents of Penlan school in Swansea, or Glan Ely High School in Cardiff, and there are others who are suffering in the same way.

Eto, nid yw Llafur Newydd wedi dangos dim awydd i newid y drefn niweidiol hon; os rhywbeth, mae wedi'i gyrru ymhellach. Nid oes sôn yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' am y materion hyn. Hyd yn hyn, nid ydym wedi clywed dim sôn am gyflwyno dethol ar sail gallu yn ffurfiol yng Nghymru, ond pwy a ŵyr beth a ddaw nesaf? Mae Araith y Frenhines yn sôn am sefydlu mwy o ysgolion arbenigol sydd â'r hawl i ddethol 10 y cant o'u disgyblion ar sail gallu. Bydd yn ddiddorol clywed beth fydd gennym i'w ddweud am y mesur hwnnw pan ddaw gerbron San Steffan.

Yet, New Labour has shown no desire to change this detrimental regime; if anything, it has driven it further. There is no mention of these matters in 'Putting Wales First'. So far we have heard no mention of formally introducing selection on the grounds of ability in Wales, but who knows what will be next? The Queen's Speech mentions establishing more specialist schools that have the right to select 10 per cent of their pupils on the basis of ability. It will be interesting to hear what we will have to say about that measure when it comes before Westminster.

Byddai llywodraeth Plaid Cymru yn y lle hwn yn creu system gyllido newydd i ysgolion a fyddai'n dileu'r farchnad gystadleuol ac yn rhoi'r ysgol yn ei phriod le, yn wasanaeth ac yn adnodd i'r gymuned. Byddai ysgolion yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â'i gilydd i ddarparu addysg o safon ragorol er lles pawb—i'r lliaws, nid i'r lleiafrif. Byddem yn diddymu cyhoeddi tablau cynghrair, tra'n gofalu bod gan yr ysgolion wybodaeth lawn am berfformiad y

A Plaid Cymru government in this place would create a new funding system for schools that would eliminate the competitive market and place schools in their rightful position, as a service and a resource for the community. Schools would work in partnership with each other to provide education of an excellent standard for the benefit of all—for the many, not the few. We would abolish the publishing of league tables, while ensuring that schools

disgyblion. Byddem yn disodli dulliau megis mesurau arbennig ac enwi a chywilyddio, â phroses o gynhaliaeth a disgwyliadau uchel. Byddem yn arolygu swyddogaethau'r cyrff cenedlaethol—CBAC, ACCAC, Estyn, ac yn y blaen—ac yn dyfeisio system gost-effeithiol a fyddai'n addas at anghenion gwlad fechan megis Cymru. Byddem yn creu gwasanaeth cynghori a hyfforddiant-mewn-swydd effeithiol i athrawon, rhywbeth a danseiliwyd gan greu 22 sir a dirprwyo cyllidebau'n ormodol i ysgolion.

had comprehensive information about pupil performance. We would replace methods such as special measures and naming and shaming with a process of support and high expectations. We would review the roles of the public bodies—the WJEC, ACCAC, Estyn and so on—and devise a cost-effective method that would be suitable for a small country such as Wales. We would create an effective advisory and inset training service for teachers, something that was undermined by the creation of 22 counties and the excessive delegating of budgets to schools.

Byddem yn cydweithio â'r Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol, Cyngor y Prifysgolion ar gyfer Addysgu Athrawon (Cymru) ac undebau athrawon i greu strategaeth recriwtio athrawon a system effeithiol o hyfforddiant cychwynnol.

We would co-operate with the General Teaching Council, the Universities Council for the Education of Teachers (Wales) and teachers' unions to create a strategy for recruiting teachers and an effective system of initial training.

Dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf, bydd Plaid Cymru yn annog gweithredu'r polisïau hyn. Yna, yn 2003, byddwn yn dechrau eu gweithredu. Bryd hynny, gwarantaf y bydd llawer o Aelodau Llafur—rhai sydd yma heddiw a rhai a fydd, efallai, yma ar ôl 2003—yn dweud 'amen' pan wnawn hynny.

Over the next two years, Plaid Cymru will press for the implementation of these policies. Then, in 2003, we will begin to implement them. When we do that, I guarantee that many Labour Members—some who are here today and some who will, perhaps, still be here after 2003—will say 'amen'.

Christine Chapman: I echo comments made by Val Feld and Peter Black. This programme for government is about delivering for the people of Wales. It involves practical solutions to deal with the here and now. That is important. The people of Wales would not take kindly to the Assembly merely being a talking shop. This programme will deliver here and now for the people of Wales.

Christine Chapman: Adleisiaf y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan Val Feld a Peter Black. Mae'r rhaglen hon o lywodraeth yn ymwneud â chyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Mae'n ymwneud ag atebion ymarferol i ddelio â'r presennol. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Ni fyddai pobl Cymru yn croesawu'r ffaith mai siop siarad yn unig yw'r Cynulliad. Bydd y rhaglen hon yn cyflawni yn y fan a'r lle ar gyfer pobl Cymru.

I will briefly discuss the careers education aspect of the programme. I register an interest as a member of the Institute of Careers Guidance. Some time ago, Brian Hancock introduced his secondary legislation to the Assembly. I was pleased to speak in support of it. The programme for government will extend careers education programmes to all 16 to 19-year-olds in further education institutions and school sixth forms. That involves changing the current ad hoc system to a system that is more firmed up and much more structured.

Trafodaf, yn fras, yr agwedd yn ymwneud ag addysg gyrfaoedd yn y rhaglen. Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o'r Sefydliad Cyfarwyddyd Gyrfaoedd. Beth amser yn ôl, cyflwynodd Brian Hancock ei ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd i'r Cynulliad. Yr oeddwn yn falch o siarad o'i phlaid. Bydd y rhaglen lywodraethu yn ymestyn rhaglenni addysg gyrfaoedd i bob person 16 i 19 mlwydd oed mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach a dosbarthiadau chweched dosbarth. Mae hynny'n golygu newid y system ad hoc gyfredol yn system sydd yn fwy cadarn ac

yn llawer mwy strwythuredig.

Given the changes to the economy and to working patterns in Wales in the twenty-first century, it is a must for all 16 to 19-year-olds to have quality careers education advice. We have almost lost the concept of a job for life, and patterns of work for young people today are different to when most of us entered the labour market some years ago. Career planning has now become vitally important to young people, as opportunities widen and as employers look to fill skill gaps in their workforces.

O gofio'r newidiadau i'r economi ac i batrymau gwaith yng Nghymru yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, rhaid i bob person 16 i 19 mlwydd oed gael cyngor o ansawdd uchel ar addysg gyrfaoedd. Yr ydym bron wedi colli'r cysyniad o swydd am oes, ac mae patrymau gwaith i bobl ifanc heddiw yn wahanol i'r hyn a oeddent pan ymunodd y rhan fwyaf ohonom â'r farchnad lafur rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Daeth cynllunio gyrfa erbyn hyn yn holl bwysig i bobl ifanc, wrth i gyfleoedd ehangu ac wrth i gyflogwyr geisio llenwi'r bylchau o ran sgiliau yn eu gweithluoedd.

In this extended service, there is a role for careers services in Wales. I pay tribute to the excellent work of careers service companies throughout Wales. This extension will allow them to continue that work and to move forward towards the all-age guidance service that was envisaged in the education and training action plan report. I take Cynog's comments on board. I was disappointed by his comments on what has happened in education. He will be aware of the ETAP report, which was a made-in-Wales solution. I am surprised that he made those comments. We can all be proud of what we have achieved in Wales.

Yn y gwasanaeth estynedig hwn, mae rôl ar gyfer y gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru. Talaf deyrnged i waith rhagorol y cwmnïau gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd ledled Cymru. Bydd yr estyniad hwn yn caniatáu iddynt barhau â'r gwaith hwnnw a symud ymlaen tuag at y gwasanaeth arweiniad ar gyfer pob oedran a ragwelwyd yn yr adroddiad ar y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant. Ystyriaf sylwadau Cynog. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig i glywed ei sylwadau ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd mewn addysg. Bydd yn ymwybodol o'r adroddiad ar y Cynllun Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant, a oedd yn ateb a luniwyd yng Nghymru. Synnaf ei fod wedi gwneud y sylwadau hynny. Gall pob un ohonom ymfalchïo yn yr hyn a gyflawnasom yng Nghymru.

I know from my dealings with careers service companies that quality is a priority. Estyn has done much work on those companies and it is monitoring the situation. All the careers companies in Wales have been awarded Investor in People status, and several companies, including Mid Glamorgan Careers Limited, have been awarded a charter mark award.

Gwn o'm hymwneud â'r cwmnïau gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd fod ansawdd yn flaenoriaeth. Gwnaeth Estyn lawer o waith ar y cwmnïau hynny ac mae'n monitro'r sefyllfa. Dyfarnwyd statws Buddsoddwr mewn Pobl i bob cwmni gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru, a dyfarnwyd gwobr nod siarter i sawl cwmni, gan gynnwys Mid Glamorgan Careers Limited.

It is clear that the infrastructure to set up the extension of careers advice is extremely

Mae'n amlwg bod yr isadeiledd i ymestyn cyngor gyrfaoedd yn eithriadol o gryf. Mae

strong. Careers companies are key players in our efforts to combat disaffection and exclusion among young people. This is important to all Members. Extending the careers education programme will assist greatly in that role.

cwmnïau gyrfaoedd yn chwaraewyr allweddol yn ein hymdrechion i wrthsefyll anfodlonrwydd ac allgáu ymhlith pobl ifanc. Mae hyn yn bwysig i bob Aelod. Bydd ymestyn y rhaglen addysg gyrfaoedd o gymorth mawr yn y rôl honno.

I will talk briefly about gender inequality in Wales—

Soniaf yn fyr am anghydraddoldeb rhyw yng Nghymru—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Only for approximately 15 seconds.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Dim ond am tua 15 eiliad.

Christine Chapman: Despite tremendous advances in schools over the last 20 years, there is still a huge gap between girls and boys. The careers service wants to play a vital role in narrowing that gap.

Christine Chapman: Er gwaethaf datblygiadau aruthrol mewn ysgolion dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf, mae bwlch mawr o hyd rhwng merched a bechgyn. Mae'r gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd am chwarae rôl hanfodol wrth gau'r bwlch hwnnw.

It is important that we highlight these issues if we want young people and adults to fully participate in life chances in modern Wales, in order to reinvigorate and revitalise the Welsh economy. Careers services in Wales have a pivotal role in that.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn amlygu'r materion hyn os ydym am i bobl ifanc ac oedolion gyfranogi'n llawn mewn cyfleoedd bywyd yn y Gymru fodern, er mwyn ailfywiogi ac adfywio economi Cymru. Mae gan y gwasanaethau gyrfaoedd yng Nghymru rôl ganolog yn hynny o beth.

11:45 a.m.

David Lloyd: Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu a chynghorydd sir yn Abertawe. Fe ganolbwyntiaf yn benodol ar adran iechyd dogfen y glymblaid. Mae nifer o gwestiynau yn codi ohoni.

David Lloyd: I declare an interest as a general practitioner and as a county councillor in Swansea. I will concentrate specifically on the health section of the coalition's document. Several questions arise from it.

Noda'r ddogfen y crëir corff statudol newydd o'r enw Cyngor Gofal Cymru i reoleiddio'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol a chodi safonau hyfforddiant. Soniodd Andrew am hynny yn gynharach. Yr ydym oll yn cytuno â hynny, ond a gytunwch, Weinidog, fod sialens anferth yn y maes hwn o ran recriwtio a chadw gweithwyr cymdeithasol? Byddai Jane Hutt, pe bai yma, yn cofio'r papur a oedd gerbron y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos diwethaf ar weithredu'r argymhellion yn adroddiad tribiwnlys ymchwilio gogledd Cymru i gam-drin plant, 'Ar Goll Mewn Gofal'. Yr oedd y papur yn amlinellu'r pryder am lefel staffio ein gwasanaeth gofal. Sut y bydd y glymblaid yn ymateb i hyn yn y tymor byr?

The document notes that a new statutory body called the Care Council for Wales will be created to regulate the social care workforce and raise training standards. Andrew mentioned that earlier. We all agree with that, but do you agree, Minister, that there is a huge challenge in this field in terms of recruiting and retaining social workers? Jane Hutt, if she were here, would remember the paper submitted to the Health and Social Services Committee last week on the implementation of the recommendations in the report of the north Wales tribunal of inquiry into child abuse, 'Lost in Care'. The paper outlined the concerns about the staffing levels of our care service. How will the coalition respond to this in the short term?

Ar yr henoed, noda'r ddogfen y bydd y Llywodraeth yn trafod anghenion iechyd yr henoed ac yn rhoi argymhellion gerbron. Nid yw hynny'n swnio'n ysgytwol nac yn drydanol o bell ffordd. Fel clymblaid, a fyddwch yn dilyn argymhellion y Comisiwn Brenhinol ar ofal tymor hir yr henoed, sydd, fel y cofiwch, yn galw ar i ofal personol olygu gofal nyrsio ac yn argymell y dylai fod yn rhad ac am ddim? Byddwch eisoes yn ymwybodol bod yr Alban wedi ymateb yn greadigol yn hyn o beth. Mae pob nyrs y siaradaf ag ef neu hi eisiau gwneud gofal personol yn rhan annatod o nyrsio, oherwydd ei fod yn ychwanegu at lawnder yr wybodaeth am y claf, ac yn gyfle i hybu iechyd. Cofiwn i gyd safbwynt Llafur a'r Rhyddfrydwyr ar y Comisiwn Brenhinol hwn cyn y glymblaid. Beth yw safbwynt y glymblaid ar hyn?

On the elderly, the document states that the Government will debate the health needs of the elderly andpresent its recommendations. That does not sound ground-breaking or electrifying at all. As a coalition, will you follow the recommendations of the Royal Commission on long-term care for the elderly, which, as you will remember, calls for personal care to mean nursing care and recommends that it should be free? You will already be aware that Scotland has responded creatively to this. Every nurse with whom I speak wants to make personal care an integral part of nursing, because it adds to the completeness of the information about the patient, and is an opportunity to promote health. We all remember the viewpoint of Labour and the Liberals on this Royal Commission before the coalition. What is the coalition's viewpoint on this?

Ar Strategaeth NHS Cymru, a gytunwch fod yr oedi cyn cyhoeddi'r strategaeth hon wedi gwneud pethau yn niwlog ac yn ansicr? Sut y mae'r glymblaid wedi newid y strategaeth hon? A fydd arian ychwanegol ar gael i gynnal y cynnydd mewn cyfrifoldebau a disgwyliadau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru a arweinir gan ofal cynradd? Hynny yw, beth yw'r cyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer gofal cynradd? Ar y strategaeth iechyd meddwl, beth yn union yw'r cyllid ar gyfer hyn, ac a wnewch chi amlinellu'r strategaeth tymor hir i recriwtio a chadw staff yn y gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl? Yn olaf, ar hybu iechyd, a oes unrhyw fwriad i ariannu'n ddigonol y strategaeth iechyd rhyw i Gymru?

On the NHS Wales Strategy, do you agree that the delay in publishing this strategy has clouded issues and created uncertainty? How has the coalition changed this strategy? Will additional money be available to support these increased responsibilities and expectations in a health service in Wales that is led by primary care? That is, what is the additional funding for primary care? On the mental health strategy, what exactly is the budget available for this, and will you outline the long-term strategy for recruiting and retaining staff in the mental health service? Finally, on health promotion, is there any intention to adequately fund the sexual health strategy for Wales?

Mae sialens gref gerbron y glymblaid. Gyda'r ystadegau iechyd gwaethaf ym Mhrydain, mae pobl Cymru yn edrych am weithredu, am welliannau ac am newid gwirioneddol yn safon y gwasanaeth i'r claf. Amser a ddengys.

There is a huge challenge facing the coalition. With the worst health statistics in Britain, the people of Wales are looking for action, for improvements and for a real change in the standard of service to patients. Time will tell.

Richard Edwards: May I say how much I enjoyed David Melding's contribution. It was amusing, but I suppose that he needs a finely honed sense of humour, given the company that he keeps.

Richard Edwards: Mwynheais gyfraniad David Melding yn fawr. Yr oedd yn ddifyr, ond tybiaf fod angen synnwyr digrifwch craff iawn arno, o gofio'r cwmni a geidw.

This legislative programme presents the best news for Wales in a long time. It is clear

Cyflwyna'r rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol hon y newyddion gorau i Gymru ers peth amser.

evidence that the partnership agreement between the forces of light and progress in this Chamber is delivering a forward-looking, radical agenda for the people of Wales, in the teeth of opposition from the forces of conservatism arrayed against us, which are backward-looking and introverted. In that context—

Mae'n dystiolaeth glir bod y cytundeb partneriaeth rhwng grymoedd golau a chynnydd yn y Siambr hon yn cyflwyno agenda flaengar, radical i bobl Cymru, yn nannedd gwrthwynebiad gan rymoedd ceidwadol a daflwyd tuag atom, sydd yn adweithiol ac yn fewnblyg. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw—

Jonathan Morgan *rose—*

Jonathan Morgan *a gododd—*

Richard Edwards: I would love to take interventions, but I do not have time, I am sorry. Several people will be far more agitated in a minute, so hold your horses. In that context I must express my surprise at the language of Jocelyn Davies's amendment 5, specifically the reference to 'a radical socialist agenda'. I did not know that they cared. Did you? This attempt by Welsh nationalism to re-invent itself as Welsh socialism—forget about independence, we are all radical socialists—is fascinating. However, it is entirely bogus. You can just imagine them on the campaign trail brandishing their socialist manifestos at Marxist landowners and farmers in Môn, Caernarfon, Ceredigion and rural Carmarthen. Fair play, they have a dilemma. They aspire to be the party of Government, which requires majority support. In Wales, they must position themselves on the left of the political spectrum.

Richard Edwards: Hoffwn gymryd ymyriadau, ond nid oes amser, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Bydd sawl person wedi corddi llawer mwy mewn munud, felly arhoswch am ennyd. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw rhaid imi fynegi fy syndod at iaith gwelliant 5 Jocelyn Davies, yn arbennig y cyfeiriad at 'agenda sosialaidd radicalaidd'. Ni wyddwn eu bod yn hidio. Wyddech chi? Mae ymdrech cenedlaetholdeb Cymru i ailgreu ei hun fel sosialaeth Cymru—anghofiwch am annibyniaeth, mae pob un ohonom yn sosialwyr radical—yn ddiddorol iawn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hollol ffug. Gallwch eu dychmygu yn ymgyrchu gan chwifio eu maniffestos sosialaidd at berchnogion tir Marcsaidd a ffermwyr ym Môn, Caernarfon, Ceredigion a Chaerfyrddin wledig. Chwarae teg, maent mewn cyfyng-gyngor. Dyheant am fod yn blaid sydd yn llywodraethu, sydd yn golygu derbyn mwyafrif y gefnogaeth. Yng Nghymru, rhaid iddynt osod eu hunain ar ochr chwith y sbectrwm gwleidyddol.

Helen Mary Jones: You have managed not to.

Helen Mary Jones: Llwyddasoch chi i beidio â gwneud hynny.

Richard Edwards: They can dish it out but they cannot take it. I am reminded of the words of Corporal Jones, 'they don't like it up 'em'. They do not like the fact that their professions of socialism are nothing but a sham. Traditionally, the self-proclaimed 'party of Wales' has in reality been the party of hidebound, reactionary Wales: pro-authoritarian and right wing, which, mercifully has not represented much of Wales. It has been the alternative repository in the rural heartlands of Conservative voters determined to vote tactically to ensure that no one who even remotely smacks of socialism should be elected. Those voters have always felt safe with Plaid despite all those socialist

Richard Edwards: Gallant feirniadu ond ni allant gael eu beirniadu. Fe'm hatgoffir o eiriau'r Corporal Jones, '*they don't like it up 'em*'. Nid ydynt yn hoffi'r ffaith bod eu datganiadau o sosialaeth yn ddim ond twyll. Yn draddodiadol, bu'r blaid a eilw ei hun yn 'plaid Cymru' mewn gwirionedd yn blaid ragfarnllyd, adweithiol Cymru: o blaid awdurdodyddiaeth ac yn adain dde, nad yw, drwy drugaredd, wedi cynrychioli llawer o Gymru. Bu'n geidwad amgen ym mroydd gwledig y pleidleiswyr Ceidwadol a oedd yn benderfynol o bleidleisio'n dactegol er mwyn sicrhau na chaiff unrhyw un sydd hyd yn oed ag arlliw o sosialaeth yn ei gyfansoddiad ei ethol. Mae'r pleidleiswyr

manifestos. I have plenty of experience of combating nationalists in the rural heartlands. I know the nature of the beast. Some of its supporters—

hyn wedi teimlo'n ddiogel gyda Phlaid Cymru erioed er gwaethaf yr holl faniffestos sosialaidd hynny. Mae gennyf ddigon o brofiad o wrthsefyll cenedlaetholwyr yn y broydd gwledig. Gwn beth yw natur yr anifail. Mae rhai o'i gefnogwyr—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Richard, the title of this debate is the 'Programme for Government'.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Richard, teitl y ddadl hon yw 'Rhaglen Waith y Llywodraeth'.

Richard Edwards: My comments relate to the amendments and the debate and Plaid's socialist pretensions, Dirprwy Lywydd. Some of its supporters would make David Davies—no offence meant, David—look like a Maoist. I do not doubt that some of its members, here and elsewhere, genuinely believe the new fangled propaganda about their party's damascene conversion to socialism. Even some of them might entertain the odd doubt after Plaid's Christmas bash which was, if you please, a medieval banquet in Cardiff Castle—backwards to the future eh? That's just what Wales needs: black knights and feudal barons. Apparently, they did sing *caneuon gwerin*, and that is about as close as Plaid will ever get to representing the *gwerin*. Plaid's roots, base and traditional support are all right wing and reactionary. Who are its role models? To whom does it look for inspiration? Nye Bevan? I think not. Jim Griffiths? I think not.

Richard Edwards: Cyfeiria fy sylwadau at y gwelliannau a'r ddadl a honiadau sosialaidd y Blaid, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Byddai rhai o'i chefnogwyr yn gwneud i David Davies—peidiwch â digio, David—edrych fel Maöydd. Nid amheuaf fod rhai o'i aelodau, yma ac mewn mannau eraill, yn wirioneddol gredu'r propaganda ffasiwn newydd am droedigaeth ddamasîn eu plaid i sosialaeth. Gallai rhai ohonynt hyd yn oed goleddu ambell i amheuaeth ar ôl parti Nadolig y blaid a oedd, os gwelwch chi'n dda, yn wledd ganoloesol yng Nghastell Caerdydd—cam yn ôl i'r dyfodol yntê? Dyna'r union beth sydd ei angen ar Gymru: marchogion du a barwniaid ffiwdal. Canasant ganeuon gwerin, mae'n debyg, a dyna'r agosaf y daw Plaid i gynrychioli'r werin. Mae gwreiddiau, sail a chefnogaeth draddodiadol Plaid Cymru yn adain dde ac yn adweithiol. Pwy yw ei modelau rôl? Ar bwy y mae'n dibynnu am ysbrydoliaeth? Nye Bevan? Chredaf fi byth. Jim Griffiths? Chredaf fi byth.

Phil Williams: Jim Griffiths, yes.

Phil Williams: Jim Griffiths, ie.

Richard Edwards: No. It is Saunders Lewis, a Mussolini fancier. He is Plaid's role model. There were not too many nationalists out with the International Brigade during the Spanish Civil War. Their journal was officially supporting Franco. Let us nail on the head this fiction that you can be conservative in the country areas and socialist in the Valleys at the same time. You can see the mess Plaid is in over the Hunting Bill. It is all over the shop. There are more faults running through it than through San Francisco. You can fool some of the people all of the time and you can fool all of the people some of the time, but you cannot fool all of rural Wales and all of the Valley

Richard Edwards: Nage. Saunders Lewis, edmygydd Mussolini. Ef yw model rôl Plaid. Nid oedd llawer o genedlaetholwyr allan gyda'r Frigâd Ryngwladol yn ystod Rhyfel Cartref Sbaen. Cefnogai eu cyfnodolyn Franco'n swyddogol. Gadewch inni chwalu'r ffuglen y gallwch fod yn geidwadol yn yr ardaloedd cefn gwlad ac yn sosialaidd yn y Cymoedd yr un pryd. Gallwch weld yr helynt y mae Plaid ynddo o ran y Mesur Hela. Mae'n blith draphlith. Mae mwy o dyllau ynddo na chaws y Swistir. Gallwch dwyllo rhai pobl drwy'r amser a gallwch dwyllo'r holl bobl beth o'r amser ond ni allwch dwyllo Cymru wledig gyfan a holl gymunedau Cymoedd Cymru

communities of Wales all of the time.

yr holl amser.

Helen Mary Jones: I echo Richard's comments on David Melding's speech. Richard, you must need a sense of humour given the company that you keep. I was fascinated by some of the comments by Government parties in this debate. What the Minister said about the adequate nature of the Assembly's powers particularly interested me. Surely that flies in the face of what his colleague, Sue Essex, said only two hours ago about the need for greater powers over rail. Does this Government know what it thinks about anything? I have also been interested in the response from several quarters to Plaid Cymru's amendment 5. The Minister, more careful than some of his colleagues, described the programme that we are debating today as radical and did not—Richard—use the word 'socialist'. Many traditional Labour supporters all over Wales will be interested in his decision not to use that word. Given what Lynne, Huw and Richard have said, I look forward warmly to their supporting amendment 5.

Helen Mary Jones: Adleisiaf sylwadau Richard ar araith David Melding. Richard, mae angen synnwyr digrifwch arnoch o gofio'r cwmni a gadwch. Yr oedd diddordeb gennyf glywed rhai o'r sylwadau gan bleidiau'r Llywodraeth yn y ddadl hon. Yr oedd yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog am natur annigonol pwerau'r Cynulliad o ddiddordeb arbennig imi. Siawns nad yw hynny'n mynd yn groes i'r hyn a ddywedodd ei gyd-Aelod, Sut Essex, prin dwy awr yn ôl ynglŷn â'r angen am fwy o bwerau dros y rheilffyrdd. A ŵyr y Llywodraeth hon beth yw ei barn am unrhyw beth? Bu diddordeb gennyf hefyd yn yr ymateb a ddaeth o sawl ochr i welliant 5 Plaid Cymru. Disgrifiodd y Gweinidog, yn fwy gofalus na rhai o'i gyd-Aelodau, y rhaglen a drafodwn heddiw fel un radical a—Richard—ni ddefnyddiodd y gair 'sosialaidd'. Bydd gan lawer o gefnogwyr Llafur traddodiadol ledled Cymru ddiddordeb yn ei benderfyniad i beidio â defnyddio'r gair hwnnw. O gofio beth a ddywedodd Lynne, Huw a Richard, edrychaf ymlaen yn frwd atynt yn cefnogi gwelliant 5.

I am sorry that Val Feld feels that the first 18 months of this National Assembly have been so useless. I thought, for example, that establishing the Children's Commissioner for Wales was a piece of work well done, achieved by cross-party working.

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf bod Val Feld yn teimlo bod 18 mis cyntaf y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn wedi bod mor ddiwerth. Credais, er enghraifft, fod sefydlu Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn ddarn da iawn o waith, a gyflawnwyd drwy gydweithio ar draws bob plaid.

Val Feld: Will you give way?

Val Feld: A wnewch chi ildio?

Helen Mary Jones: I am sorry, Val, I have no time. Otherwise, I would have been delighted to give way. Christine referred to the report on the education and training action plan. Again, we did not need a coalition to deliver that. If Peter Black wants to know what we think, he should read our programme for government. Our programme is all deliverable within current powers, given energy, courage and commitment: qualities this administration sadly lacks.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Val, nid oes amser gennyf. Fel arall, byddai wedi bod yn bleser gennyf ildio. Cyfeiriodd Christine at yr adroddiad ar y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant. Unwaith eto, nid oedd angen clymblaid arnom i gyflawni hynny. Os yw Peter Black am wybod beth yw ein barn, dylai ddarllen ein rhaglen waith y llywodraeth. Gallwn gyflawni ein rhaglen o fewn y pwerau cyfredol, o gael yr egni, y dewrder a'r ymrwymiad: rhinweddau nad oes gan y weinyddiaeth hon yn anffodus.

11:55 a.m.

It is not the principle of coalition that Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales minds. If you support proportional representation, coalition can be an honourable position. We object to the dismal lack of proposed action by this coalition Government. What has happened, for example, to the employment strategy that was promised by December 2000—we have another 14 days to go—by the pre-mutilation Government of Wales in 'Betterwales.com'? The Minister says that it has gone into the national economic development strategy. Good, but if that is so, will that strategy contain employment targets for each region, when will it be implemented and what on earth has happened to the original target date? The thousands that have been thrown out of work because of the Westminster Government's economic policies in Wales would like a little action from this Government and not just reports, taskforces and reviews.

Nid hidio am yr egwyddor o glymblaid a wna Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales. Os cefnogwch gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, gall clymblaid fod yn sefyllfa anrhydeddus. Gwrthwynebwn y diffyg truenus o weithredu arfaethedig gan y Llywodraeth glymblaid hon. Beth sydd wedi digwydd, er enghraifft, i'r strategaeth gyflogaeth a addawyd erbyn Rhagfyr 2000—mae gennym 14 o ddyddiau i fynd—gan Lywodraeth Cymru cyn y llurgunio yn 'Gwellcymru.com'? Dywed y Gweinidog ei bod wedi ei chynnwys yn y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Da iawn, ond os felly, a fydd y strategaeth honno yn cynnwys targedau cyflogaeth ar gyfer pob rhanbarth, pryd y caiff ei gweithredu a beth ar wyneb daear sydd wedi digwydd i'r dyddiad targed gwreiddiol? Byddai'r miloedd a gollodd eu swyddi oherwydd polisïau economaidd Llywodraeth San Steffan yng Nghymru yn hoffi gweld ychydig o weithredu ar ran y Llywodraeth hon ac nid adroddiadau, tasgluoedd ac adolygiadau'n unig.

Several Assembly Members *rose—*

Sawl Aelod o'r Cynulliad *a gododd—*

Helen Mary Jones: I cannot take interventions because I do not have time.

Helen Mary Jones: Ni allaf gymryd ymyriadau gan nad oes amser gennyf.

We were told, when this Lib-Lab pact was formed, that it would free the administration's hands. We were promised decisive government. If this document is this pact's idea of decisive government, heaven help us and heaven help the people of Wales. For goodness' sake, spare us the reviews, reports, taskforces and committees and do some real governing.

Dywedwyd wrthym, pan luniwyd y cytundeb hwn rhwng y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur, y byddai'n rhyddhau dwylo'r weinyddiaeth. Addawyd llywodraeth benderfynol inni. Os mai'r ddogfen hon yw syniad y glymblaid hon o lywodraeth benderfynol, duw a'n helpo ni a phobl Cymru. Er mwyn popeth, peidiwch â rhoi adolygiadau, adroddiadau, tasgluoedd a phwyllgorau inni a gwnewch rhywfaint o lywodraethu gwirioneddol.

Janet Ryder: I will talk about the reinvigorating local government aspect of this. The measures laid out in the programme for government to reinvigorate local government are merely those needed to introduce the Local Government Act 2000. To date, the only made-in-Wales aspect of it is the 'wonderful' fourth option. There was much expectation about that, as it was to allow councils to adopt a modernised committee structure in place of a cabinet

Janet Ryder: Soniaf am ailfywiogi'r agwedd llywodraeth leol ar hyn. Y mesurau a nodwyd yn rhaglen waith y llywodraeth i ailfywiogi llywodraeth leol yw'r rhai sydd eu hangen i gyflwyno Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000. Hyd yn hyn, yr unig agwedd arni sydd yn unigryw i Gymru yw'r pedwerydd opsiwn 'gwych'. Bu llawer o ddisgwyl amdano, gan ei fod yn caniatáu i gynghorau fabwysiadu strwythur pwyllgora wedi ei foderneiddio yn lle strwythur

structure. I discussed this option with a councillor the other day who, after reading the outline, said, ‘I could have written that. That is how we work’. ‘But you work to a clear cabinet structure’, I said. He replied, ‘Is that not what this is? It is a cabinet by any other name.’ That is the long-awaited fourth option.

cabinet. Trafodais yr opsiwn hwn â chynghorydd y diwrnod o’r blaen a ddywedodd, ar ôl ei ddarllen, ‘Gallwn fod wedi ysgrifennu hynny. Dyna sut y gweithiwn’. ‘Ond gweithiwch yn ôl strwythur cabinet eglur’, dywedais. Atebodd, ‘Onid dyna beth yw hyn? Cabinet ydyw.’ Dyna’r pedwerydd opsiwn y bu hir ddisgwyl amdano.

Forthcoming secondary legislation to require that local government cabinets meet in public has also been mentioned. Many in local government have already asked when the Assembly Cabinet will start to hold its meetings in public. Is this a case of sauce for the goose but poison for the gander?

Soniwyd hefyd am y ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd a ddaw i rym i sicrhau y bydd cabinetau llywodraeth leol yn cyfarfod yn gyhoeddus. Mae llawer ym maes llywodraeth leol eisoes wedi gofyn pryd y bydd Cabinet y Cynulliad yn dechrau cynnal ei gyfarfodydd yn gyhoeddus. A yw’r hyn sydd yn amheuthun i’r ŵydd yn wenwyn i’r ceiliagwydd?

The partnership agreement states that the coalition is committed to greater decentralisation of decision-making by promoting the establishment of town and community councils—I should have declared an interest on this point; I do so now—and encouraging unitary authorities to delegate powers to them. It is also committed to developing a role for town and community councils in Best Value reviews for local authority services. Today we have heard two conflicting views on this: the Minister for Assembly Business said that the coalition Government will deliver what it promised in this document and the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities virtually threw those commitments away. Where is the strategy that is needed to underpin the development to increase the number of town and community councils? Where is that strategy following the answer that the Minister gave this morning to my question? What else has she ditched?

Noda’r cytundeb partneriaeth fod y glymblaid yn ymrwymedig i ddatganoli gwneud penderfyniadau yn fwy drwy hyrwyddo’r gwaith o sefydlu cynghorau tref a chymuned—dylwn fod wedi datgan buddiant ar y pwynt hwn; gwnaf hynny yn awr—ac annog awdurdodau unedol i ddirprwyo pwerau iddynt. Mae hefyd yn ymrwymedig i ddatblygu rôl ar gyfer cynghorau tref a chymuned mewn arolygon Gwerth Gorau ar gyfer gwasanaethau awdurdod lleol. Heddiw, clywsom ddwy farn groes ar hyn: dywedodd y Trefnydd y bydd y Llywodraeth glymblaid yn cyflawni’r hyn a addawodd yn y ddogfen hon ac i bob diben taflodd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a’r Cymunedau yr ymrwymiadau hynny ymaith. Ble mae’r strategaeth sydd ei hangen i ategu’r datblygiad i gynyddu nifer y cynghorau tref a chymuned? Ble mae’r strategaeth honno yn dilyn yr ateb a roddodd y Gweinidog y bore yma i’m cwestiwn? Beth arall y mae wedi ei waredu?

We must have a clear commitment and timescale for the commission into proportional representation and alternative voting systems. Edwina Hart has failed to give any commitment to this aspect of the partnership agreement. When questioned, her commitment to that seemed even less than her commitment to developing town and

Rhaid inni gael ymrwymiad ac amserlen glir ar gyfer y comisiwn i gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol a systemau pleidleisio amgen. Mae Edwina Hart wedi methu â rhoi unrhyw ymrwymiad i’r agwedd hon ar eich cytundeb partneriaeth. Pan gafodd ei holi, ymddangosai ei hymrwymiad i hynny hyd yn oed yn llai na’i hymrwymiad i ddatblygu

community councils. It begs the question whether all the Executive were signed up to this partnership agreement. Will we now see the Labour group picking the bits that it thinks its members will accept and ditching the rest? That is important because this document has superceded 'Betterwales.com' and is forming the programme for the government of this administration. Which bits will you cherry pick and which bits will you throw away? Have you ditched your commitments on town and community councils and will you guarantee to bring forward a commission into proportional representation and alternative voting systems in next year's programme?

cynghorau tref a chymuned. Rhaid holi a oedd yr holl Weithrediaeth wedi cytuno i'r cytundeb partneriaeth hwn. A welwn y grŵp Llafur yn awr yn dewis y darnau y cred y bydd ei aelodau yn eu derbyn ac yn gwaredu'r gweddill? Mae hynny'n bwysig oherwydd cymerodd y ddogfen hon le 'Gwellcymru.com' ac mae'n ffurfio rhaglen waith ar gyfer llywodraeth y weinyddiaeth hon. Pa ddarnau a ddetholwch a pha ddarnau a waredwch? A ydych wedi cefnu ar eich ymrwymiadau o ran cynghorau tref a chymuned ac a sicrhewch y cyflwynir comisiwn i gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol a systemau pleidleisio amgen yn rhaglen y flwyddyn nesaf?

William Graham: Two tests are about to come upon us in the Assembly. I wrote on behalf of my constituents, as did other AMs, to the Minister for Economic Development and to the First Minister about the future of Llanwern. I will quote from an article that appears in *The Financial Times* today:

William Graham: Yr ydym ar fin wynebu dau brawf yn y Cynulliad. Ysgrifennais ar ran fy etholwyr, fel y gwnaeth ACau eraill, at y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ac at y Prif Weinidog ynglŷn â dyfodol Llanwern. Dyfynnaf o erthygl sydd yn ymddangos yn *The Financial Times* heddiw:

'Officials of both the Welsh Office and the Department of Trade and Industry say that they are now preparing for the worst, and expect an announcement from Corus in mid-January…One government official said: 'The only question seems to be whether Llanwern or Redcar is first in the firing line. At the moment it looks very much like Llanwern…Union leaders also expect closure plans to follow shortly after a board meeting in the second week of January but say no job losses are likely'

—surprise, surprise—

—credwch neu beidio—

'before the expected election in May.'

Can one imagine a more cynical manipulation of people's lives and of the industrial future of south-east Wales? We pay tribute to the optimum efficiency of the workforce at Llanwern and this is its reward. There will now be a substantial test on the Executive. We ask for an early representation on behalf of the Executive to Corus, to end speculation or to prepare us for what must be done to secure the future of south-east Wales.

A all unrhyw un ddychmygu camddefnydd mwy sinigaidd o fywydau pobl a dyfodol diwydiannol de-ddwyrain Cymru? Talwn deyrnged i effeithlonrwydd optimwm y gweithlu yn Llanwern a dyma yw ei wobr. Bydd prawf sylweddol yn awr ar y Weithrediaeth. Gofynnwn am gynrychiolaeth gynnar ar ran y Weithrediaeth i Corus, er mwyn dod â'r damcaniaethu i ben neu er mwyn ein paratoi ar gyfer yr hyn y mae'n rhaid ei wneud i sicrhau dyfodol de-ddwyrain Cymru.

Alun Cairns: I confess that, on hearing about the Lib-Lab pact arrangement, I was unsure as to whether it would help the decision-making process in the National Assembly for

Alun Cairns: Cyfaddefaf, wrth glywed am drefniant y cytundeb rhwng y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur, y bûm yn ansicr a fyddai'n helpu'r broses gwneud

Wales. I appreciate the frustration of ambitious Labour Assembly Members knocking on the Cabinet's door, only to find two Liberal Democrat Members sitting in their seats in the front rows. They are frustrated about that, but they have to close ranks and try to build around the First Minister and the Deputy First Minister, who, we understand, will soon be called the Right Honourable Michael German. We await an announcement on that.

penderfyniadau yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Gwerthfawrogaf rwystredigaeth Aelodau Llafur uchelgeisiol o'r Cynulliad yn cnocio ar ddrws y Cabinet, dim ond i ganfod dau Aelod o'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn eistedd ar eu seddau yn y rhesi blaen. Maent yn rhwystredig ynglŷn â hynny, ond rhaid iddynt gau'r rhengoedd a cheisio adeiladu o amgylch y Prif Weinidog a'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a elwir cyn bo hir, fel y deallwn, y Gwir Anrhydeddus Michael German. Arhoswn am gyhoeddiad ar hynny.

I read reports in the annual government business programme on steps to take forward a business birth rate strategy and on progress on developing operating aids. There was a report on this and a report on that. I was not convinced. However, having seen the first of those reports come to fruition—the task and finish group's report on the implementation of Objective 1 structural funds—and having analysed it during this morning's proceedings in the Chamber, I was delighted to read the verdicts on that:

Darllenais adroddiadau yn rhaglen busnes flynyddol y llywodraeth ar gamau i weithredu ar strategaeth cyfradd eni busnesau ac ar gynnydd wrth ddatblygu cymhorthion gweithredol. Bu adroddiad ar yr hyn a'r llall. Nid oeddwn yn argyhoeddedig. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl gweld y cyntaf o'r adroddiadau hynny yn dwyn ffrwyth—adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar weithredu cronfeydd strwythurol Amcan 1—ac ar ôl ei ddadansoddi yn ystod y trafodion yn y Siambr y bore yma, yr oeddwn yn falch o ddarllen y dyfarniadau ar hynny:

'We identified a very significant 'Leadership' gap for the Programme to which there are two distinct but interrelated elements.'

It then states:

Yna noda:

'One of the overarching issues surrounding the Programme has been a Policy and Strategy vacuum.'

That is what the First Minister has offered us. Will Labour Assembly Members now confess that they are looking to Mike German to offer the leadership that Rhodri Morgan has failed to offer?

Dyna beth a gynigiodd y Prif Weinidog i ni. A wnaiff Aelodau Llafur o'r Cynulliad gyfaddef yn awr eu bod yn dibynnu ar Mike German i gynnig yr arweinyddiaeth y methodd Rhodri Morgan â'i chynnig?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am grateful to colleagues who have withdrawn their requests to speak. Deputy First Minister, I would be grateful if you could restrict your comments to three or four minutes.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'm cyd-Aelodau a dynnodd eu ceisiadau i siarad yn ôl. Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn cyfyngu eich sylwadau i dair neu bedair munud.

The Deputy First Minister (Michael German): If I am to try to address all the points that have been raised, I will not be able to do so in three or four minutes, so I will just have to—

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog (Michael German): Os wyf am geisio ymdrin â'r holl bwyntiau a godwyd, ni allaf wneud hynny mewn tair neu bedair munud, felly bydd yn rhaid imi—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I would be grateful if you could keep to three or four minutes, if possible.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech gadw at dair neu bedair munud, os yw'n bosibl.

Michael German: If I am to be restricted to that time limit, I will not be able to take interventions. I must address the politics and not the main substance of what Members have said. However, there is one issue of great substance that I want to discuss, namely the matter raised by William Graham, which is of serious consequence and import to Wales. We are taking that matter seriously and I will make a statement on it as soon as possible. However, you must remember that Corus is a private company that is operating in a free market. Intervention from the Conservatives in the free market, which now seems to be their policy, is to be welcomed.

Michael German: Os caf fy nghyfyngu i'r terfyn amser hwnnw, ni allaf gymryd ymyriadau. Rhaid imi ymdrin â'r wleidyddiaeth ac nid prif sylwedd yr hyn a ddywedodd yr Aelodau. Fodd bynnag, mae un mater o sylwedd yr wyf am ei drafod, sef y mater a godwyd gan William Graham, sydd o bwysigrwydd difrifol i Gymru. Cymerwn y mater hwnnw o ddifrif a gwnaf ddatganiad arno cyn gynted â phosibl. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi gofio bod Corus yn gwmni preifat sydd yn gweithredu mewn marchnad rydd. Mae croeso i'r ymyrraeth gan y Ceidwadwyr yn y farchnad rydd, sydd yn bolisi ganddynt yn ôl pob tebyg yn awr.

The splendid posturing that we have seen this morning is part of the great entertainment scheme of politics and I am glad that this has occurred near Christmas. This programme is about Wales. It is not about Westminster or anything else; it is about delivering for the people of Wales. It takes forward the partnership agreement, realising the 100 or so commitments made to the people of Wales in that agreement.

Mae'r ystumiau gwych a welsom y bore yma yn rhan o gynllun adloniant mawr gwleidyddiaeth ac yr wyf yn falch bod hyn wedi digwydd yn agos i'r Nadolig. Mae'r rhaglen hon yn ymwneud â Chymru ac nid â San Steffan nac unman arall; mae'n ymwneud â chyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Mae'n datblygu'r cytundeb partneriaeth, gan wireddu'r oddeutu 100 o ymrwymiadau a wnaethpwyd i bobl Cymru yn y cytundeb hwnnw.

Before the Assembly partnership was agreed, there is no doubt—and if anybody can put their hand on their heart and tell me otherwise, I would be grateful to hear from them, but not now in an intervention because I do not have enough time—that the Assembly's instability was crippling our reputation and denying us a vision for the future of Wales. We now have a three-year action programme that is represented by this agreement, a three-year budget to deliver a programme of better school and health services, and a programme for the Assembly that manages our business so that Members can contribute to the development of Government action.

Cyn y cytunwyd ar bartneriaeth y Cynulliad, nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth—ac os gall unrhyw un roi eu llaw ar eu calon a dweud fel arall, byddwn yn ddiolchgar i glywed ganddynt, ond nid yn awr mewn ymyriad oherwydd nid oes digon o amser gennyf—nad oedd ansefydlogrwydd y Cynulliad yn niweidio ein henw da ac yn gwadu gweledigaeth inni ar gyfer dyfodol Cymru. Mae gennym raglen weithredu tair blynedd a gynrychiolir gan y cytundeb hwn, cyllideb tair blynedd i gyflwyno rhaglen o wasanaethau ysgolion ac iechyd gwell, a rhaglen ar gyfer y Cynulliad sydd yn rheoli ein busnes fel y gall yr Aelodau gyfrannu at y gwaith o ddatblygu rhaglen weithredu'r Llywodraeth.

The speech by the leader of Plaid Cymru this morning was a whinge about the fact of partnership. It was the response of a spoilt

Yr oedd yr araith gan arweinydd Plaid Cymru y bore yma yn swnian am bartneriaeth. Ymateb plentyn wedi ei

child whose toy has been taken away. The truth is that Plaid Cymru has no idea how to behave as an opposition. The respect that I had for that party has decreased today because we are sending conflicting messages to the people of Wales. One of its amendments is on democratic socialism. I read its manifesto. Can you believe that there is no reference to socialism in it? So much for these words. We should judge people by their amendments and not by what they say. We have before us today a real programme, not a whinge programme. This new Government will use the powers it has to their full extent. That is being done and will continue.

ddifetha y cymerwyd ei degan oddi wrtho ydoedd. Y gwir yw nad oes gan Blaid Cymru unrhyw syniad sut i ymddwyn fel gwrthblaid. Mae'r parch a oedd gennyf tuag at y blaid wedi lleihau heddiw gan ein bod yn anfon negeseuon croes i bobl Cymru. Mae un o'i gwelliannau yn ymwneud â sosialaeth ddemocrataidd. Darllenais ei maniffesto. A allwch gredu nad oes unrhyw gyfeiriad at sosialaeth ynddo? Dyna werth y geiriau hynny. Dylem farnu pobl yn ôl eu gwelliannau ac nid yn ôl yr hyn a ddywedant. Rhaglen wirioneddol sydd ger ein bron heddiw, nid rhaglen o swnian. Bydd y llywodraeth newydd hon yn defnyddio'r pwerau sydd ganddi i'r eithaf. Gwneir hynny a bydd yn parhau i gael ei wneud.

12:05 p.m.

This debate serves as a reminder to the Conservatives—if one were needed—of the 18 years when they ran Wales down. In their time, there was no accountability to the people of Wales, no government action designed with Wales at its heart and, for much of the time, a Secretary of State who did not even come near Wales. The Conservatives' input into today's debate shows that most of them—three years later—have no ideas for Wales and no idea about Wales.

Mae'r ddadl hon yn atgoffa'r Ceidwadwyr—os oes angen eu hatgoffa—o'r 18 mlynedd pan ddirywiodd Cymru yn eu sgîl. Yn eu cyfnod hwy, nid oedd unrhyw atebolrwydd i bobl Cymru, ni fu unrhyw weithredu ar ran y Llywodraeth a roddodd ystyriaeth ganolog i Gymru, ac am y rhan fwyaf o'r amser hwnnw, ni ddaeth yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn agos i Gymru hyd yn oed. Dengys mewnbwn y Ceidwadwyr i ddadl heddiw nad oes gan y rhan fwyaf ohonynt—dair blynedd yn ddiweddarach—unrhyw syniadau ar gyfer Cymru nac unrhyw syniad am Gymru.

David Melding *rose—*

David Melding *a gododd—*

Michael German: I cannot give way because I have not been given time to do so. It is not my fault. I was told—

Michael German: Ni allaf ildio gan na roddwyd amser imi wneud hynny. Nid fy mai i yw hynny. Dywedwyd wrthyf—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. He is not giving way.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'n ildio.

Michael German: I cannot give way. The Deputy Presiding Officer has given me about 36 seconds more.

Michael German: Ni allaf ildio. Mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi rhoi tua 36 o eiliadau yn rhagor imi.

The Conservatives' amendments 9 and 10 only refer to one aspect of Welsh Government. Do they have nothing more to say about the rest of the programme, or can they find nothing in it with which they disagree?

Cyfeiria gwelliannau 9 a 10 y Ceidwadwyr at un agwedd ar Lywodraeth Cymru yn unig. Onid oes ganddynt unrhyw beth arall i'w ddweud am weddill y rhaglen, neu oni allant ddod o hyd i unrhyw beth arall ynddi y maent yn anghytuno ag ef?

I know that this debate focuses on a horrible problem for Plaid Cymru. What is Plaid Cymru for? It does not oppose anything in this partnership agreement, yet it so badly wants to oppose it. All it can do is complain about the timing of issues. In Plaid Cymru's fantasy world it wanted everything done before July. It could complain therefore that nothing was done before July or even after July. All of Plaid Cymru's amendments struggle to find a point of disagreement and every one fails because it is based on factual error or a fantasy timetable. Plaid Cymru fails to define how its radical, socialist agenda would be. This Assembly does not have the power or the money to nationalise Wales. Plaid Cymru is vague about its own commitment to a radical, socialist agenda. It does not even mention it once in its Assembly manifesto. It is not public either. We talk about opening up to the public, but Plaid Cymru does not even open up its conference for the public to see. It is left clinging to its only purpose, a purpose it does not dare mention: an independent Wales. The problem, as Richard said, is that Plaid Cymru likes dishing it out but does not like hearing it—[*Interruption*]

Gwn fod y ddadl hon yn canolbwyntio ar broblem erchyll i Blaid Cymru. Beth yw diben Plaid Cymru? Nid yw'n gwrthwynebu unrhyw beth yn y cytundeb partneriaeth hwn, ac eto mae'n ysu am ei wrthwynebu. Y cyfan y gall ei wneud yw cwyno am amseriad y materion. Ym myd ffantasi Plaid Cymru yr oedd am i bopeth gael ei wneud cyn Gorffennaf. Gallai gwyno felly na wnaethpwyd unrhyw beth cyn Gorffennaf neu hyd yn oed ar ôl Gorffennaf. Mae pob un o welliannau Plaid Cymru yn brwydro i ddod o hyd i bwynt o anghytundeb ac mae pob un yn methu gan eu bod yn seiliedig ar wallau ffeithiol neu amserlen ffantasi. Metha Plaid Cymru â diffinio sut agenda radical, sosialaidd fyddai ganddi. Nid oes gan y Cynulliad hwn y pŵer na'r arian i wladoli Cymru. Mae Plaid Cymru yn aneglur ynglŷn â'i hymrwymiad ei hun i agenda radical, sosialaidd. Nid yw hyd yn oed yn sôn amdani unwaith yn ei maniffesto i'r Cynulliad. Nid yw ar gael i'r cyhoedd ychwaith. Soniwn am fod ar agor i'r cyhoedd, ond nid yw Plaid Cymru yn agor ei chynhadledd i'r cyhoedd hyd yn oed. Fe'i gadewir yn glynu wrth ei hunig ddiben, diben nad yw'n meiddio sôn amdano: Cymru annibynnol. Y broblem, fel y dywedodd Richard, yw bod Plaid Cymru yn hoffi beirniadu ond nid yw'n hoffi cael ei beirniadu—[*Torri ar draws*]

David Lloyd *rose—*

David Lloyd *a gododd—*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I have pressed the red button. None of you will be recorded and you will not be heard. Michael German is not giving way, Dai, so you must sit down.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf wedi gwasgu'r botwm coch. Ni chaiff yr un ohonoch eich recordio ac ni chewch eich clywed. Nid yw Michael German yn ildio Dai, felly rhaid ichi eistedd.

David Lloyd: I want to make a specific point—

David Lloyd: Yr wyf am wneud pwynt penodol—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You have no right—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid oes hawl gennych—

David Lloyd: The whole idea for the person answering is to answer that point.

David Lloyd: Y syniad cyffredinol yw bod y person sydd yn ateb yn ateb y pwynt hwnnw.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You have no right. Please sit down. I am speaking. I am protecting half an hour for an important debate by Karen Sinclair. I hope that Michael German will finish in 15 seconds sharp so that we can get on with the

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid oes hawl gennych. Eisteddwch i lawr os gwelwch yn dda. Yr wyf fi yn siarad. Cadwaf hanner awr ar gyfer dadl bwysig gan Karen Sinclair. Gobeithiaf y bydd Michael German yn gorffen mewn 15 eiliad yn union fel y gallwn

votes.

David Melding: Point of order.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: If you wish to make a point of order, I must take it.

David Melding: Point of order. Those of us who have entered into a vituperative debate—and many of us have this morning—have had the courtesy to give way when we have been saying things about other Members of this Assembly. The Deputy Presiding Officer has not given those—[*Interruption*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Mike German is under time pressure. It is his prerogative not to give way.

Michael German: I am tired of this Assembly being dismissed for doing nothing by people outside. This budget and this programme show that we have the opportunity to make a difference and to make the changes that matter to the people of Wales—changes that are made in Wales, for Wales. Before October, the Government of Wales lacked a working majority and was not able to show fully what the Assembly could achieve. We now have a majority and we are determined to deliver a programme that will make the whole of Wales proud of this new institution.

fynd ymlaen i bleidleisio.

David Melding: Pwynt o drefn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Os dymunwch wneud pwynt o drefn, rhaid imi ei gymryd.

David Melding: Pwynt o drefn. Mae'r rheini ohonom sydd wedi cyfranogi mewn dadl sarhaus heddiw—ac mae llawer ohonom wedi y bore yma—wedi cael y cwrteisi i ildio pan fuom yn dweud pethau am Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad hwn. Nid yw'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi rhoi—[*Torri ar draws*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae Mike German o dan bwysau amser. Mae ganddo'r hawl i beidio ag ildio.

Michael German: Yr wyf wedi blino ar y Cynulliad hwn yn cael ei feirniadu am beidio â gwneud unrhyw beth gan bobl o'r tu allan. Dengys y gyllideb hon a'r rhaglen hon fod y cyfle gennym i wneud gwahaniaeth ac i wneud y gwahaniaethau sydd o bwys i bobl Cymru—newidiadau a wneir yng Nghymru, i Gymru. Cyn mis Hydref, nid oedd gan Lywodraeth Cymru fwyafrif digonol ac ni allai ddangos yn llawn beth y gallai'r Cynulliad ei gyflawni. Mae gennym fwyafrif yn awr ac yr ydym yn benderfynol o gyflwyno rhaglen a fydd yn gwneud Cymru gyfan yn falch o'r sefydliad newydd hwn.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Ryder, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina

Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 2: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 27.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Jane Davidson
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 3: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.
Amendment 3: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 35.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Jane Davidson

Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant
Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 4: O blaid 13, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 4: For 13, Abstain 8, Against 27.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Jane Davidson
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 5: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.
Amendment 5: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 35.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Jane Davidson
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 6: O blaid 11, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.
Amendment 6: For 11, Abstain 0, Against 35.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Williams, Phil

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Jane Davidson
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 7: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.
Amendment 7: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 35.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison

Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 8: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 8: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 27.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 9: O blaid 45, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 9: For 45, Abstain 2, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick

Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol.
The following Members abstained.

Davies, Ron
Law, Peter

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment adopted.

Gwelliant 10: O blaid 8, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 40.
Amendment 10: For 8, Abstain 0, Against 40.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog

Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter

Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Amended motion:

the National Assembly welcomes the annual Government business programme reflecting the partnership agreement, 'Putting Wales First'; which was made publicly available on 20 November and is now on the intranet at http://assembly/aegis/AssemblyStaffArea/Cabinet/statements/2000/index.htm.

and notes the commitment by the Minister for Health and Social Services on 7 June 2000 to reduce the inpatient waiting list to 65,000 by the end of March 2001.

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn croesawu rhaglen waith flynyddol y Llywodraeth sydd yn adlewyrchu'r cytundeb partneriaeth, 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf'; a gyhoeddwyd ar 20 Tachwedd ac sydd bellach ar gael ar y fewnrwyd yn htttp://assembly/aegis/AssemblyStaffArea/Cabinet/statements/2000/index.htm.

ac yn nodi ymrwymiad y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar 7 Mehefin 2000 i gwtogi rhestr aros cleifion mewnol i 65,000 erbyn diwedd Mawrth 2001.

Cynnig: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.
Motion: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 21.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog

Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas,Owen John,
Thomas Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
Amended motion adopted.

12:15 p.m.

Dadl Fer
Short Debate

Sgrinio Cyffredinol ar Glyw Babanod Newydd-anedig
Universal Neonatal Hearing Screening

Karen Sinclair: David Melding, Janice Gregory, Kirsty Williams and Dai Lloyd have indicated that they wish to contribute to this debate.

Karen Sinclair: Nododd David Melding, Janice Gregory, Kirsty Williams a Dai Lloyd y dymunant gyfrannu at y ddadl hon.

I make no apology for raising issues surrounding deafness in this Chamber yet again. As Members will remember, in September 1999, I raised some important issues on British Sign Language and the problems encountered by profoundly deaf people in their everyday lives. We have now formed a cross-party group in the Assembly to work in a non-partisan way to ensure that our decisions always take on board the needs of deaf people.

Ni ymddiheuraf am godi materion sydd yn ymwneud â byddardod yn y Siambr hon eto. Fel y cofia'r Aelodau, ym Medi 1999, codais rai materion pwysig ynghylch Iaith Arwyddion Brydeinig a'r problemau a wynebir gan bobl hollol fyddar yn eu bywydau bob dydd. Erbyn hyn lluniwyd grŵp trawsbleidiol yn y Cynulliad i weithio mewn ffordd amhleidiol i sicrhau bod ein penderfyniadau bob amser yn ystyried anghenion bobl fyddar.

On 10 November, I tabled a statement of opinion, with the full support of Dai Lloyd and Kirsty Williams, calling for a taskgroup to look at the benefits of universal neonatal hearing screening. It has been well supported

Ar 10 Tachwedd, cyflwynais ddatganiad barn, â chefnogaeth lawn Dai Lloyd a Kirsty Williams, gan alw am grŵp gorchwyl i edrych ar fanteision sgrinio cyffredinol ar glyw babanod newydd-anedig. Cafodd

and, to date, we have 34 subscribers. Helen Mary returned her form today, therefore, the total number, with the three people who gave their support initially, has increased to 38. That proves that a majority in this Chamber wishes to pursue this issue. In light of what happened earlier, it is nice to have consensus in the Chamber.

gefnogaeth frwd ac, erbyn hyn, mae gennym 34 o danysgrifwyr. Dychwelodd Helen Mary ei ffurflen heddiw, felly, mae'r cyfanswm, gan gynnwys y tri pherson a roddodd eu cefnogaeth ar y dechrau, wedi cynyddu i 38. Profa hynny y dymuna mwyafrif yn y Siambr hon drafod y mater hwn ymhellach. Yn sgîl yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn gynharach, mae'n braf cael cydsyniad yn y Siambr.

I will take this opportunity to explain why it is worth pursuing neonatal hearing screening. I want the Assembly to take a lead on this in the UK. I also want the Assembly to grasp the chance of setting an example that others will follow. We have the opportunity to do this and, if we have the will, I am sure that we can succeed.

Bachaf ar y cyfle hwn i egluro pam ei bod yn werth trafod sgrinio ar glyw babanod newydd-anedig ymhellach. Dymunaf i'r Cynulliad achub y blaen ar y DU ynglŷn â hyn. Dymunaf i'r Cynulliad hefyd gydio yn y cyfle i osod enghraifft a ddilynir gan eraill. Mae'r cyfle gennym i wneud hyn ac, os yw'r ewyllys gennym, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallem lwyddo.

What are the options open to us as an Assembly? The first is to continue with the health visitor distraction tests or HVDT. This test is used to screen most babies for deafness between the age of seven and eight months. It is self-explanatory; a health visitor makes noises behind a baby's back, which is by no means a science. By that time, deaf babies have often devised methods to circumvent any problem, such as recognising different odours that surround them. Therefore, it really is not a science.

Beth yw'r dewisiadau sydd yn ar gael inni fel Cynulliad? Parhau profion sylw'r ymwelwyr iechyd neu'r HVDT yw'r dewis cyntaf. Defnyddir y prawf hwn i sgrinio'r rhan fwyaf o fabanod am fyddardod rhwng saith ac wyth mis oed. Mae'n hunanesboniadol; gwna ymwelydd iechyd synau y tu ôl i gefn baban, nad yw'n wyddoniaeth o gwbl. Erbyn yr amser hwnnw, mae babanod byddar wedi dyfeisio dulliau yn aml i osgoi unrhyw broblem, megis cydnabod yr aroglau gwahanol sydd o'u cwmpas. Felly, nid gwyddoniaeth ydyw mewn gwirionedd.

Of all the babies born each year in the UK with a significant hearing problem, the HVDT will fail to identify approximately 50 per cent of cases up to the age of 18 months. By the time these children are three and a half years old, another 25 per cent will still not have been identified. Those are telling statistics. These wasted months or years, can make a significant difference to a child's development. For instance, parents need to know that eye contact is imperative for meaningful interaction with a profoundly deaf baby. If undiagnosed, the chance of early intervention and support is lost and the child is disadvantaged.

Ymysg yr holl fabanod a enir bob blwyddyn yn y DU â phroblem clyw ddifrifol, bydd yr HVDT yn methu â nodi tua 50 y cant o'r achosion hyd at 18 mis oed. Erbyn bod y plant hyn yn dair a hanner, bydd 15 y cant arall heb gael ei nodi. Mae'r rheini yn ystadegau trawiadol. Gall y misoedd neu'r blynyddoedd hyn a wastreffir wneud gwahaniaeth sylweddol i ddatblygiad plentyn. Er enghraifft, mae angen i rieni wybod bod cyswllt llygaid yn hanfodol i gyfathrebu'n ystyrlon â baban hollol fyddar. Os na cheir diagnosis, collir cyfle i ymyrryd yn gynnar ac i gael cymorth cynnar ac mae'r plentyn o dan anfantais.

Another option is to offer targeted neonatal hearing screening. I will explain what that screening involves. The most common method used to screen babies is the otoacoustic emissions test, or OAE. Nurses

Dewis arall yw cynnig sgrinio wedi'i dargedu ar glyw babanod newydd-anedig. Egluraf broses y sgrinio hwnnw. Y dull mwyaf cyffredin a ddefnyddir i sgrinio babanod yw'r prawf allyriannau otoacwstig, neu'r OAE.

and midwives can be trained to carry out this test. It involves inserting a small probe into the ear and introducing a series of clicks. The echoes that are produced are measured. These echoes are small sounds caused by the motion of the eardrum in response to vibrations from deep within the cochlea. Healthy cochleae create internal vibrations and emission-damaged cochleae usually do not. This non-intrusive test can even be done when a baby is asleep. It has been available since the early 1990s and research has shown it to be extremely effective. One in every 1,000 babies is born with a significant hearing loss. In areas where the screening is in operation, a similar percentage has been detected. That proves that it works and picks up problems early.

Gellir hyfforddi nysrys a bydwragedd i gyflawni'r prawf hwn. Mae'n cynnwys rhoi stiliwr bach yn y glust a chyflwyno cyfres o gliciau. Mesurir yr atseiniau a gynhyrchir. Synau bach yw'r adleisiau hyn a achosir pan symuda drwm y glust mewn ymateb i'r cryndodau o ddwfn yn y cochlea. Creir cryndodau mewnol gan gochleâu iach ac fel arfer ni chreir hwy gan gochleâu a niweidiwyd. Gellir gwneud y prawf anymwythiol hwn pan fydd baban yn cysgu hyd yn oed. Bu ar gael ers y 1990au cynnar a dangosodd ymchwil ei fod yn effeithiol iawn. Caiff un ym mhob 1,000 o fabanod ei eni â phroblemau clyw difrifol. Yn yr ardaloedd lle gweithredir y sgrinio, canfyddwyd canran debyg. Profa hynny ei fod yn gweithio a'i fod yn darganfod problemau yn gynnar.

A recent poll conducted by Mori concluded that

Daeth arolwg barn diweddar a gynhaliwyd gan Mori i'r casgliad

'it is clear that widespread support for screening for deafness at birth exists, with women particularly likely to support the test. Moreover, overall support is seen through all sectors of society in the United Kingdom. Reinforcing this finding, almost all of those with children in their household would want to know if the child was deaf at birth, rather than when the child was older.'

Parents who know that they have a deaf child in the household can then decide on the best way forward.

Gall rhieni sydd yn gwybod bod ganddynt blentyn byddar yn y cartref benderfynu ar y ffordd orau ymlaen.

This piecemeal option only uses the test for children born to families with a history of deafness. This type of strategy would not address the problems of deafness occurring in families with no history of deafness, who are the very people who would be least likely to recognise the problems and least likely to know how important it is to address them.

Mae'r dewis fesul dipyn hwn ond yn defnyddio'r prawf ar gyfer plant a enir i deuluoedd sydd â hanes o fyddardod. Ni fyddai'r math hwn o strategaeth yn ymdrin â phroblemau byddardod a ddigwydd o fewn teuluoedd nad oes hanes o fyddardod ganddynt, sef yr union bobl a fyddai'n lleiaf tebygol o gydnabod y problemau ac yn lleiaf tebygol o wybod pa mor bwysig ydyw i ymdrin â hwy.

Children learn to communicate from their earliest days. If deafness is not detected as soon as possible, they can fall behind in their linguistic and educational development. This can have a profound negative impact on their life and employment chances. Targeted neonatal hearing screening would not be satisfactory.

Dysga plant i gyfathrebu o'u dyddiau cynharaf. Os na ddarganfyddir byddardod cyn gynted â phosibl, gall eu datblygiad ieithyddol ac addysgol ddioddef. Gall hyn gael effaith negyddol iawn ar eu bywyd a'u cyfleoedd o gael gwaith. Ni fyddai sgrinio wedi'i dargedu ar glyw babanod newydd-anedig yn foddhaol.

The third option is to offer neonatal hearing screening universally. I ask the Minister for Health and Social Services to consider this

Y trydydd dewis yw cynnig sgrinio cyffredinol ar glyw babanod newydd-anedig. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a

option carefully. Some hospitals are already submitting applications for funding universal neonatal hearing screening, such as Glan Clwyd Hospital in north Wales. Other hospitals will follow suit. However, this kind of ad hoc, unregulated approach will inevitably produce an inequitable service. We cannot allow access to this vital testing to depend on postcodes, as that has caused terrible problems with other medical problems.

Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ystyried y dewis hwn yn ofalus. Mae rhai ysbytai eisoes yn cyflwyno ceisiadau i ariannu sgrinio cyffredinol ar glyw babanod newydd-anedig, megis Ysbyty Glan Clwyd yng ngogledd Cymru. Bydd ysbytai eraill yn dilyn yr enghraifft hon. Fodd bynnag, cynhyrcha'r math hwn o ymagwedd ad hoc nas rheoleiddir wasanaeth annheg yn y pen draw. Ni allwn ganiatáu i'r mynediad i'r prawf hanfodol hwn ddibynnu ar godau post, gan yr achosodd hynny broblemau ofnadwy o ran problemau meddygol eraill.

The hearing problems of a dear friend of mine from Llangollen were not diagnosed until he was seven years old. That caused a whole raft of problems for him. This should not happen. Tackling the needs of deaf children from their earliest months and years can make all the difference to their lives. It enables them to play a full part in the family, at work and at play. In order to tackle the needs, we need a scientific method of diagnosis. Universal neonatal hearing screening provides this.

Ni chafodd problemau clyw cyfaill annwyl o Langollen eu canfod nes ei fod yn saith mlwydd oed. Achosodd hynny lawer iawn o broblemau iddo. Ni ddylai hyn ddigwydd. Gall mynd i'r afael ag anghenion plant byddar o'u misoedd a'u blynyddoedd cynharaf wneud gwahaniaeth mawr i'w bywydau. Mae'n eu galluogi i chwarae rhan lawn yn y teulu, yn y gwaith ac yn eu hamser hamdden. Er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r anghenion, mae angen dull gwyddonol o wneud diagnosis arnom. Bydd sgrinio cyffredinol ar glyw babanod newydd-anedig yn gwneud hyn.

I ask for a taskforce to be formed to allow the Assembly to take universal neonatal hearing screening forward as a strategy, which would allow equal access. This week, the Assembly has honoured the laudable efforts of a Welsh woman in the Paralympic games and welcomed the appointment of a children's commissioner for Wales. Let us cement those two ideals in this project to provide practical and universal help to prevent disadvantage to our Welsh youth.

Gofynnaf inni greu dasglu i ganiatáu'r Cynulliad i ddatblygu'r sgrinio cyffredinol ar glyw babanod newydd-anedig fel strategaeth, a fyddai'n caniatáu mynediad cyfartal. Yr wythnos hon, anrhydeddodd y Cynulliad ymdrechion canmoladwy Cymraes yn y gemau Paralympaidd a chroesawodd benodiad comisiynydd plant Cymru. Gadewch inni atgyfnerthu'r ddwy ddelfryd honno yn y prosiect hwn i ddarparu cymorth ymarferol a chyffredinol i atal pobl ifanc Cymru rhag dioddef anfantais.

Our fledgling Assembly has the opportunity to make a difference to new, fledgling lives. We should grasp that opportunity with both hands and move forward immediately.

Mae cyfle gan ein Cynulliad ifanc i wneud gwahaniaeth i fywydau newydd, ifanc. Dylem gydio yn y cyfle hwnnw a symud ymlaen ar unwaith.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Have you given Dai Lloyd permission to take part as well?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A roddasoch ganiatâd i Dai Lloyd gymryd rhan hefyd?

Karen Sinclair: Yes.

Karen Sinclair: Do.

12:25 p.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There are four speakers. They will have seven minutes between them.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Pedwar llefarydd sydd. Bydd saith munud ganddynt rhyngddynt.

David Melding: I congratulate Karen on choosing the subject of universal neonatal hearing screening and for her initiative in forming the all-party group on deaf issues. It is important that that group exists. I was pleased to attend yesterday's meeting, which was well attended by Assembly Members from all parties, and across the range of Committees.

David Melding: Llongyfarchaf Karen ar ddewis y pwnc o sgrinio cyffredinol ar glyw babanod newydd-anedig ac am ei harloesedd wrth lunio'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar faterion byddardod. Mae'n bwysig bod grŵp o'r fath yn bodoli. Yr oeddwn yn falch o fynychu'r cyfarfod ddoe, a fynychwyd gan nifer dda o Aelodau'r Cynulliad o bob plaid, ac o amryw o Bwyllgorau.

The importance of such a screening measure is that it allows us to diagnose deafness or hearing impairment early. A diagnosis early in the development of babies and young children gives immense scope for excellent interventions to improve their life chances. On that basis, a taskforce ought to be formed to consider how we could take these issues forward in Wales.

Mae mesur sgrinio o'r fath yn bwysig gan ei fod yn caniatáu inni ganfod byddardod neu nam ar y clyw yn gynnar. Rhydd diagnosis cynnar yn natblygiad babanod a phlant ifanc gwmpas enfawr am ymyriadau ardderchog i wella eu cyfleoedd mewn bywyd. Ar y sail honno, dylid llunio tasglu i ystyried sut gallem ddatblygu'r materion hyn yng Nghymru.

Janice Gregory: I thank Karen for raising this issue. I have a loose tooth, so I will not even attempt to say the full title of the debate, as David did.

Janice Gregory: Diolch i Karen am godi'r mater hwn. Mae dant rhydd gennyf, felly ni cheisiaf hyd yn oed ddweud teitl llawn y ddadl, fel y gwnaeth David.

I also congratulate Karen on the formation of the all-party group. I attended its meeting yesterday. I am pleased that you raised this issue. There is deafness in my family, but luckily, it was detected early enough for intervention to be successful. However, that is not always the case. I ask you to allay the fears of people who feel that if this disability is detected early on it may cause parents to take decisions that would be detrimental to the child. I would like you to address that issue.

Llongyfarchaf Karen hefyd ar lunio'r grŵp trawsbleidiol. Mynychais ei gyfarfod ddoe. Yr wyf yn falch ichi godi'r mater hwn. Mae byddardod yn fy nheulu, ond yn ffodus, fe'i darganfuwyd yn ddigon cynnar fel bod ymyriad yn llwyddiannus. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny bob amser yn wir. Gofynnaf ichi leddfu ofnau pob sydd yn teimlo y gallai darganfod yr anabledd hwn yn gynnar achosi i'r rhieni wneud penderfyniadau a fyddai'n niweidiol i'r plentyn. Hoffwn ichi ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw.

Kirsty Williams: I thank Karen for bringing this important issue before the Assembly today. She made several salient points. I agree that if we are to move forward as a nation in developing and implementing these hearing tests it must be done nationally. It would not be acceptable for there to be some children in Wales who would have access to these tests and others who would not. I also point out how little expenditure is needed to implement this screening process. It would cost in the region of £500,000 and £750,000. That is not a great deal of money in the whole

Kirsty Williams: Diolch i Karen am ddod â'r mater pwysig hwn gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw. Gwnaeth nifer o bwyntiau trawiadol. Cytunaf, os dymunwn symud ymlaen fel cenedl o ran datblygu a gweithredu'r profion clyw hyn, fod rhaid gwneud hynny ledled y wlad. Ni fyddai'n dderbyniol pe câi rhai plant yng Nghymru fynediad i'r profion hyn ac eraill na chaent fynediad iddynt. Nodaf hefyd cyn lleied o wariant sydd ei angen i weithredu'r broses sgrinio. Byddai'n costio rhwng £500,000 a £750,000. Nid yw hynny'n arian mawr yn y darlun ehangach. Pan

of scheme of things. When that is offset against the cost, perhaps, of intervening later in children's lives, because of later detection, it is money well spent. It is an early investment to ensure that we do not have to spend extra money later on.

gymherir hynny â'r gost bosibl o ymyrryd yn hwyrach ym mywydau plant, oherwydd y'i canfuwyd yn ddiweddarach, gwerir yr arian yn dda. Buddsoddiad cynnar ydyw i sicrhau na fydd rhaid inni wario arian ychwanegol yn ddiweddarach.

The test that is currently available is not adequate. The daughter of my colleague, Jenny Randerson, passed that detection test only to be diagnosed many years later as having a hearing difficulty. Luckily, in Jenny's case, her daughter's chances have not been too severely affected and she has gone from strength to strength. However, an early intervention might have made her early childhood more fulfilling. As Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, I support the setting up of a taskforce. I have had discussions with Jane Hutt about funding issues and I know discussions have also taken place with Edwina Hart. I am sure that a taskforce would be well placed to take this issue forward.

Nid yw'r prawf sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd yn ddigonol. Pasiodd merch fy nghyd-Aelod, Jenny Randerson, y prawf darganfod hwnnw dim ond i broblem clyw gael ei chanfod nifer o flynyddoedd yn ddiweddarach. Yn ffodus, yn achos Jenny, nid effeithiwyd ar gyfleoedd ei merch yn rhy ddifrifol ac mae wedi mynd o nerth i nerth. Fodd bynnag, gallai ymyriad cynnar fod wedi gwneud ei phlentyndod cynnar yn fwy boddhaus. Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yr wyf o blaid sefydlu tasglu. Cefais drafodaethau â Jane Hutt am faterion ariannu a gwn y cafwyd trafodaethau ag Edwina Hart. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai tasglu mewn sefyllfa dda i fynd â'r mater hwn yn ei flaen.

David Lloyd: Yr wyf hefyd yn diolch i Karen am godi'r pwnc hwn ac, fel arfer, datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu.

David Lloyd: I also thank Karen for raising this issue and, as usual, I declare an interest as a general practitioner.

Talaf deyrnged i waith dygn Karen yn y maes hwn, sef byddardod a phroblemau clyw. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch o gefnogi'r alwad am sgrinio clyw pob baban newydd-anedig. Yr ydym yn sôn am wella eu hiechyd. Mae'n rhaid inni, felly, symud gyda'r oes ac ystyried defnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf. Mae'n rhaid inni ystyried y posibilrwydd hwn o ddifrif er budd ein plant i gyd.

I pay tribute to Karen's tireless work in this field, namely deafness and hearing difficulties. I am also pleased to support the call to screen the hearing of all new-born babies. We are talking about improving their health. We must, therefore, move with the times and consider using the latest technology. We must seriously consider this possibility for the benefit of all our children.

The Deputy Minister for Health (Brian Gibbons): On behalf of the administration, I thank Karen for raising this matter and drawing neonatal screening to our attention. We all know of Karen's interest in this area and Members have already paid tribute to it. She is also chair of the all-party committee on deafness. We had a good meeting of that Committee yesterday.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Iechyd (Brian Gibbons): Ar ran y weinyddiaeth, diolch i Karen am godi'r mater hwn ac am dynnu sgrinio babanod newydd-anedig at ein sylw. Mae pob un ohonom yn gwybod am ddiddordeb Karen yn y maes hwn a thalwyd teyrnged iddo eisoes gan yr Aelodau. Mae hefyd yn gadeirydd y pwyllgor trawsbleidiol ar fyddardod. Cafodd y Pwyllgor hwnnw gyfarfod da ddoe.

I do not think that there is any conflict about this matter in the administration. We must consider this issue in an evidence-based way, we must come to conclusions and decide on a course of action in the light of that evidence.

Ni chredaf fod unrhyw wrthdaro ynghylch y mater hwn yn y weinyddiaeth. Rhaid inni ystyried y mater hwn ar sail tystiolaeth, rhaid inni ddod i gasgliadau a phenderfynu ar y camau i'w cymryd yn sgîl y dystiolaeth

You mentioned a taskforce, Karen. Work is already going on on neonatal screening. In June, John Hutton, MP, a Minister of State in the Department of Health in Westminster, announced that the Government in Westminster would be piloting a neonatal screening programme at 20 sites in England. The decision was based on recommendations from the national screening committee that very much guides the health service's response to screening issues in general. It has been suggested that the screening programme will be managed by an executive group, whose remit will include financial accountability and good governance as far as the screening programme is concerned. There will also be an external group to scrutinise the committee, and an evaluation panel will be established to monitor how the pilots across England are implemented.

honno. Crybwyllasoch dasglu, Karen. Gwneir gwaith eisoes ynglŷn â sgrinio babanod newydd-anedig. Ym Mehefin, cyhoeddodd John Hutton, AS, Gweinidog Gwladol yn yr Adran Iechyd yn San Steffan, y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn cynnal peilot o raglen sgrinio babanod newydd-anedig mewn 20 lleoliad yn Lloegr. Yr oedd y penderfyniad yn seiliedig ar argymhellion gan y pwyllgor sgrinio cenedlaethol sydd yn tywys i raddau helaeth ymateb y gwasanaeth iechyd i faterion sgrinio yn gyffredinol. Awgrymwyd y rheolir y rhaglen sgrinio gan grŵp gweithredol, y bydd ei gylch gwaith yn cynnwys atebolrwydd ariannol a rheoli da o ran y rhaglen sgrinio. Bydd grŵp allanol hefyd i archwilio'r pwyllgor, a sefydlir panel gwerthuso i fonitro sut y gweithredir y prosiectau peilot ledled Lloegr.

Karen Sinclair: The main thrust of my argument today is that we should not have to wait for these pilots in England. We should be driving this forward as a Welsh agenda for Welsh babies now.

Karen Sinclair: Prif bwyslais fy nadl heddiw yw na ddylem orfod aros am y prosiectau peilot hyn yn Lloegr. Dylem fod yn gyrru hyn ymlaen fel agenda Gymreig ar gyfer babanod Cymru yn awr.

Brian Gibbons: I will come to that. We need to investigate the practicalities of it. You mentioned a taskforce, which implies an investigation. An investigation is already going on in the 20 pilot sites in England. It would be rather ill-advised to set up another series of pilot sites and investigations when this work is ongoing. I will come back to that in a minute.

Brian Gibbons: Dof at hynny. Mae angen inni ymchwilio i'r ymarferoldeb o'i wneud. Crybwyllasoch dasglu, sydd yn awgrymu ymchwiliad. Cynhelir ymchwiliad eisoes yn yr 20 lleoliad peilot yn Lloegr. Byddai braidd yn annoeth sefydlu cyfres arall o leoliadau peilot ac ymchwiliadau pan fo'r gwaith hwn yn cael ei wneud yn awr. Dychwelaf at hynny mewn munud.

The pilots are due to begin in January 2001, and will run for 12 months. This will be part of a three to five-year roll-out programme of neonatal screening in the light of the evidence that we gather. In the meantime, it is important that the other services continue with the existing screening procedures. There are also conventional treatments, and screening is provided. We know that, even without the benefits of this, there is a group who is at a high-risk from deafness in the neonatal period, from certain infectious diseases such as rubella. It does not mean that we stop thinking. We must continue with the existing practices to identify people who are at a high risk and ensure that they are screened outwith the present pilot schemes.

Bwriedir cychwyn y prosiectau peilot yn Ionawr 2001, am 12 mis. Bydd hyn yn rhan o raglen o sgrinio babanod newydd-anedig a gyflwynir dros dair i bum mlynedd yn sgîl y dystiolaeth a gasglwn. Yn y cyfamser, mae'n bwysig y parha'r gwasanaethau eraill â'r gweithdrefnau sgrinio presennol. Mae triniaethau confensiynol hefyd, a darperir sgrinio. Hyd yn oed heb fanteision hyn, gwyddom fod grŵp o bobl sydd yn wynebu risg uchel o fod yn fyddar yn y cyfnod newydd-anedig, oherwydd rhai clefydau heintus megis rwbela. Ni olyga hynny ein bod yn rhoi'r gorau i feddwl. Rhaid inni barhau â'r arferion presennol er mwyn nodi'r bobl sydd yn wynebu risg uchel ac er mwyn sicrhau y cânt eu sgrinio gyda'r cynlluniau

peilot presennol.

There are 160 potential sites in England but 20 were chosen. Those 20 were picked to give the widest range of practical information on how the screening programme would be implemented if the evidence showed that this was the best way to go. Several issues arise from this. The screening test, as it is envisaged, will be undertaken early after a baby is born, possibly even before the baby leaves hospital. Many people leave hospital early after a baby is born and there are clear logistic problems in trying to ensure that the screening test is administered. It is possible, for example, that some people will not have the screening test before they leave hospital if they leave within a couple of hours of the baby being born.

Mae 160 o leoliadau posibl yn Lloegr ond dewiswyd 20 ohonynt. Dewiswyd yr 20 lleoliad hynny i roi'r amrywiaeth ehangach o wybodaeth ymarferol ar sut y câi'r rhaglen sgrinio ei gweithredu pe dangosai'r dystiolaeth mai hon oedd y ffordd orau. Deillia nifer o faterion yn sgîl hyn. Cyflawnir y prawf sgrinio, fel y'i rhagwelir, yn gynnar ar ôl genedigaeth plentyn, hyd yn oed cyn i'r baban adael yr ysbyty o bosibl. Mae llawer o bobl yn gadael yr ysbyty yn gynnar ar ôl genedigaeth baban ac mae problemau logistaidd clir wrth geisio sicrhau y gweinyddir y prawf sgrinio. Mae'n bosibl, er enghraifft, na chaiff rhai pobl y prawf sgrinio cyn iddynt adael yr ysbyty os gadawant o fewn ychydig oriau ar ôl genedigaeth y baban.

We need to have a system in place to ensure that the people who do not have the screening test will be followed up to ensure that they have it. We need to know that compliance with the screening test will be high, having allowed this to take place. We are aware of many useful screening tests and initiatives. However, even for those tests that are self-evidently beneficial, the uptake rate remains low. For example, the uptake of breast screening tests is only 75 per cent. We would not, therefore, want to establish a screening system without first piloting it, because we could find that 20 or 30 per cent of the target population failed to comply. Compliance is an important aspect, which must be investigated by means of pilot studies.

Mae angen inni sefydlu system i sicrhau yr eir ar drywydd y bobl na chânt y prawf sgrinio er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn ei gael. Mae angen inni wybod y bydd cyfran uchel o bobl yn cymryd rhan yn y prawf sgrinio, ar ôl caniatáu i hyn ddigwydd. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o lawer o brofion a mentrau sgrinio defnyddiol iawn. Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed ar gyfer y profion hynny sydd yn amlwg yn fanteisiol, parha'r gyfradd derbyn i fod yn isel. Er enghraifft, dim ond 75 y cant o bobl sydd yn derbyn profion sgrinio'r fron. Ni ddymunem, felly, sefydlu system sgrinio heb gynnal prosiect peilot yn gyntaf, oherwydd y gallem ddarganfod y methodd 20 neu 30 y cant o'r boblogaeth darged â chydymffurfio. Mae cydymffurfio yn agwedd bwysig, y mae'n rhaid ymchwilio iddo drwy astudiaethau peilot.

12:35 p.m.

We also need trained experts in audiology to ensure that this service can be delivered on a universal basis. It should also be a sufficiently flexible basis to comply with people's wishes, for example, for mothers who are discharged from hospital at various times after children are born. We must also ensure that the assessment process is subject to quality checks and standardisation, because a badly monitored test that provides misleading information can be worse than no test at all. Janice referred to the important

Mae angen arbenigwyr sydd wedi'u hyfforddi mewn clywedeg er mwyn sicrhau y gellir cyflwyno'r gwasanaeth hwn yn gyffredinol. Dylid ei gyflwyno hefyd yn ddigon hyblyg i gydymffurfio â dymuniadau pobl, er enghraifft, ar gyfer mamau a ryddheir o'r ysbyty ar amserau gwahanol ar ôl i'w plant gael eu geni. Rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd bod y broses asesu yn destun gwiriadau ansawdd a safoni, oherwydd y gall prawf a fonitrir yn wael ac a rydd wybodaeth gamarweiniol fod yn waeth na dim prawf o

point about people who are concerned about the implications of a positive result and its effect on the bonding relationship.

gwbl. Cyfeiriodd Janice at y pwynt pwysig am bobl sydd yn poeni am oblygiadau canlyniad cadarnhaol a'i effaith ar y berthynas rwymo.

Karen Sinclair: It would be fair to say that all tests for any disability should be carried out in a supportive atmosphere. Tests would not be set up without thorough consideration of that aspect.

Karen Sinclair: Byddai'n deg dweud y dylid cynnal pob prawf am unrhyw anabledd mewn amgylchedd cefnogol. Ni fyddai profion yn cael eu trefnu heb ystyried yr agwedd honno yn drylwyr.

Brian Gibbons: That is why it is important that we use pilot studies to gather the necessary experience, rather than introducing tests at the drop of a hat. We must work it through, in terms of gathering experience on such issues. False positive tests is another issue. I know, from personal experience, of the trauma that thinking your child may be seriously deaf can cause. Follow-up tests are necessary to confirm initial screening findings and, as a result, the interim period adds to the trauma of parents.

Brian Gibbons: Dyna'r rheswm pam ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn defnyddio astudiaethau peilot i gasglu'r profiad angenrheidiol, yn hytrach na chyflwyno profion ar amrantiad. Rhaid inni wneud hyn, o ran casglu profiad ar faterion o'r fath. Mae profion cadarnhaol anghywir yn fater arall. Gwn, o brofiad personol, am y trawma y gall meddwl bod eich plentyn yn ddifrifol fyddar ei achosi. Mae angen profion dilynol i gadarnhau'r canfyddiadau sgrinio cychwynnol ac, o ganlyniad, ychwanega'r cyfnod yn y cyfamser at drawma'r rhieni.

Even though neonatal deafness is a major cause of deafness, there are many other, post-natal causes. Therefore, we must consider where the neonatal screening test will fit into the broader picture of screening for deafness, from the neonatal period up to the age of three, particularly in relation to distraction tests.

Er bod byddardod newydd-anedig yn un o brif achosion byddardod, mae llawer o achosion ôl-enedigol eraill. Felly, rhaid inni ystyried lle y bydd y prawf sgrinio babanod newydd-anedig yn cyd-fynd â'r sefyllfa ehangach o ran sgrinio am fyddardod, o'r cyfnod newydd-anedig hyd at dair blwydd oed, yn enwedig o ran profion sylw.

We must look at the pilot study in England and scrutinise its evidence. As a result of that evidence, we must then identify the implications of the screening tests' problems for Wales. We are not speaking against universal neaonatal hearing screening. We are merely saying that it should be evaluated, by means, as Karen said, of a taskforce. I suggest that we wait for the outcomes of the pilot study in England.

Rhaid inni ystyried yr astudiaeth beilot yn Lloegr ac archwilio ei thystiolaeth. O ganlyniad i'r dystiolaeth honno, rhaid inni nodi goblygiadau problemau'r profion sgrinio ar gyfer Cymru. Ni siaradwn yn erbyn sgrinio ar glyw babanod newydd-anedig. Nid ydym ond yn dweud y dylem ei werthuso, drwy dasglu, fel y dywedodd Karen. Awgrymaf y dylem aros am ganlyniadau'r astudiaeth beilot yn Lloegr.

Karen Sinclair: What is the timescale for that study?

Karen Sinclair: Beth yw amserlen yr astudiaeth honno?

Brian Gibbons: The initial pilot study has a timescale of 12 months.

Brian Gibbons: Mae amserlen 12 mis i'r astudiaeth beilot gychwynnol.

Karen Sinclair: When is it due to start?

Karen Sinclair: Pryd y dylai ddechrau?

Brian Gibbons: In January 2001.

Brian Gibbons: Yn Ionawr 2001.

When the results become available, they should be studied by the Health and Social Services Committee and by the Assembly as a whole. If there is an evidence base, and if there are no operational difficulties, we may be in a position to recommend that these screening tests should be universally available. It is important that we do not give ourselves false reassurance or introduce a second-class service or a service that has many quality and implementation issues unaddressed. All these matters must be in place before we implement this particular screening programme.

Pan fydd y canlyniadau ar gael, dylai'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Cynulliad cyfan eu hastudio. Os oes sail tystiolaeth, ac os nad oes anawsterau gweithredol, gallem fod mewn sefyllfa i argymell y dylai'r profion sgrinio hyn fod ar gael yn gyffredinol. Mae'n bwysig na roddwn sicrwydd anghywir i ni ein hunain na chyflwyno gwasanaeth eilradd neu wasanaeth nad yw wedi ymdrin â llawer o'r materion ansawdd a gweithredu. Rhaid sefydlu pob un o'r materion hyn cyn inni weithredu'r rhaglen sgrinio benodol hon.

Karen Sinclair: The whole thrust of the taskforce will be to analyse all these matters.

Karen Sinclair: Prif bwyslais y tasglu fydd dadansoddi pob un o'r materion hyn.

Brian Gibbons: Yes, but the taskforce will look at the evidence. The purpose of the pilots is to provide us with that evidence. We need the evidence in order to make the decision. I understand that no operation or implementation programme on universal screening has been introduced, so the taskforce—if we decide to do that—will have to look at the evidence from the pilot. We do not have the evidence base in an operational sense.

Brian Gibbons: Ie, ond edrycha'r tasglu ar y dystiolaeth. Nod y prosiectau peilot yw rhoi'r dystiolaeth honno inni. Mae angen y dystiolaeth arnom er mwyn gwneud penderfyniad. Deallaf na chyflwynwyd rhaglen waith neu weithredol o ran sgrinio cyffredinol, felly bydd yn rhaid i'r tasglu—os penderfynwn wneud hynny—edrych ar y dystiolaeth o'r prosiect peilot hwnnw. Nid yw'r dystiolaeth gennym o ran gweithredu.

David Lloyd: Do you agree that the present situation is unacceptable? The current hearing tests are not quality controlled. When we have new technology, it behoves us to look at it urgently for the benefit of all children.

David Lloyd: A gytunwch nad yw'r sefyllfa bresennol yn dderbyniol? Ni reolir ansawdd y profion clyw presennol. Pan fo technoleg newydd gennym, dylem edrych arni ar frys er budd pob plentyn.

Brian Gibbons: Yes. This is why the project is starting in January 2001, in two and a half weeks' time. In the scale of things, you cannot ask for a more rapid response to your point than two and a half weeks.

Brian Gibbons: Gwnaf. Dyma'r rheswm pam bod y prosiect yn dechrau yn Ionawr 2001, ymhen pythefnos a hanner. Yn y cyd-destun, ni allwch ddisgwyl ateb cyflymach i'ch pwynt na phythefnos a hanner.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.41 p.m.
The session ended at 12.41 p.m.