



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Iau 29 Tachwedd 2001

Thursday 29 November 2001

Cynnwys Contents

- | | |
|-----|---|
| 3 | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol
<i>Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services</i> |
| 15 | Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ
<i>Questions to the House Committee</i> |
| 15 | Datganiad ar Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ar
Arallgyfeirio'r Economi Gwledig
<i>Statement on the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee's Report on the
Diversification of the Rural Economy</i> |
| 36 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Uchafswm y Lefelau o Waddod mewn
Cnydau, Bwydydd a Phorthiant) (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) (Rhif 3) 2001
<i>Approval of the Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding
Stuffs) (England and Wales) (Amendment) (No. 3) Regulations 2001</i> |
| 37 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Diogelu Planhigion (Diwygio) (Rhif 3) 2001
<i>Approval of the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) (No.3) Regulations 2001</i> |
| 38 | Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio
<i>The Audit Committee's Annual Report</i> |
| 49 | Adolygiad Pum Mlynedd o Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru
<i>Quinquennial Review of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales</i> |
| 68 | Cynnig Trefniadol
<i>Procedural Motion</i> |
| 69 | Adroddiad y Grŵp Gorchwyl a Gorffen ar Faterion y Gweithlu mewn Gofal
Cymdeithasol
<i>The Report of the Task and Finish Group on Workforce Issues in Social Care</i> |
| 87 | Dadl Fer: Angen Cymru am Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd Llawn Amser
<i>Short Debate: Wales's Need for a Full-time Economic Development Minister</i> |
| 102 | Pwynt o Drefn
<i>Point of Order</i> |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services

Fframwaith Gwasanaeth Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Clefyd Siwgr Diabetes National Service Framework

Q1 Mick Bates: Does the Minister have a timetable for the implementation of the diabetes national service framework for Wales? (OAQ14310)

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): We are working closely with the Department of Health in England on the development of this framework. In Wales, we have set up an implementation planning group, which has held a number of meetings. Membership is drawn from all relevant professions, including the voluntary sector and service users. The Department of Health has announced a staged publication of the national service framework. Standards will be published this autumn, with the delivery strategy to be finalised and published by next summer.

Mick Bates: I am sure you realise that many people with diabetes have been waiting a long time for this national service framework. Will you undertake to ensure that all steps are communicated to the relevant people in Wales, so that they too can look forward to a better service?

Jane Hutt: We recognise that the number of people affected by diabetes is rising. In Wales, over 150,000 people, young and old, may be affected by it by 2010. The national service framework is a 10-year plan, and we intend to introduce its standards in Wales. I will meet shortly with Diabetes UK Cymru to discuss how we can ensure that people are fully engaged in it.

David Lloyd: A oes cyllid ychwanegol ar gael i weithredu'r fframwaith hwn?

C1 Mick Bates: A oes gan y Gweinidog amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer clefyd siwgr yng Nghymru? (OAQ14310)

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r Adran Iechyd yn Lloegr ar ddatblygu'r fframwaith newydd hwn. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi sefydlu grŵp cynllunio gweithredu, sydd wedi cynnal nifer o gyfarfodydd. Daw'r aelodaeth o bob maes proffesiynol perthnasol, gan gynnwys y sector gwirfoddol a defnyddwyr gwasanaethau. Cyhoeddodd yr Adran Iechyd ei bod yn cyhoeddi'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol fesul cam. Cyhoeddir y safonau yr hydref hwn, a chaiff y strategaeth ar gyfer cyflwyno'r fframwaith ei gorffen a'i chyhoeddi erbyn yr haf nesaf.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn siŵr y sylweddolwch fod llawer o bobl â chlefyd siwgr wedi bod yn aros ers amser maith am y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol hwn. A ymrwymwch i sicrhau y caiff yr holl gamau eu cyfleu i'r bobl berthnasol yng Nghymru, fel y gallant edrych ymlaen at well gwasanaeth?

Jane Hutt: Cydnabyddwn fod y nifer o bobl yr effeithir arnynt gan glefyd siwgr yn cynyddu. Yng Nghymru, mae'n bosibl y bydd y clefyd yn effeithio ar 150,000 o bobl, ifanc a hen, erbyn 2010. Mae'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol yn gynllun 10 mlynedd, a bwriadwn gyflwyno ei safonau yng Nghymru. Byddaf yn cyfarfod â Diabetes UK Cymru yn fuan i drafod sut y gallwn sicrhau bod pobl wedi llawn ymrwymo iddo.

David Lloyd: Is there additional funding to implement this framework?

Jane Hutt: You may recall, Dai, that I announced £1 million earlier this year to help implement the first stages of preparation for the national service framework. That £1 million was for health authorities, to ensure that they can prepare baseline assessments of what is needed to deliver services. You will also recall that associated initiatives such as the all-Wales diabetic retinopathy screening programme, which is on the way, received funding of £500,000. When the national service framework and standards are in place, we will then have to budget for the long term.

Alun Pugh: A quarter of the Welsh population has a body mass index of 30 or above—in other words, they are obese. As obesity is clearly linked to diabetes, what steps are you taking to combat the growing incidence of obesity in Wales so that Wales tomorrow does not look like the USA today?

Jane Hutt: A good presentation was given yesterday about the worrying increase in obesity in Wales. We heard about an excellent project in Blaenau Gwent, funded by the health inequalities fund, to tackle the increase in that area. Unfortunately, obesity is often linked to deprivation. This issue relates to health promotion and disease prevention. As well as diabetes, obesity can give rise to heart disease, which the Assembly must also tackle.

David Melding: Will the new strategy emphasise the importance of podiatry services—what we used to call chiropody—which, when delivered effectively, can reduce the rate of amputation by up to 50 per cent?

Jane Hutt: This is a key part of the strategy and we are taking strides in Wales to address it. Recently, I launched a podiatry scheme at the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff, which will make a difference in ensuring that people can be protected in terms of the impact of diabetes on their feet. I hope that it will be a key part of the standards that will be set.

Jane Hutt: Efallai y cofiwch, Dai, imi gyhoeddi £1 filiwn yn gynharach eleni i helpu i weithredu'r camau cyntaf i baratoi ar gyfer y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol. Darparwyd yr £1 filiwn hynny ar gyfer awdurdodau iechyd, i sicrhau y gallant baratoi asesiadau gwaelodlin o'r hyn sydd ei angen i ddarparu gwasanaethau. Fe gofiwch hefyd fod mentrau cysylltiedig arfaethedig megis y rhaglen sgrinio retinopathi clefyd siwgr i Gymru gyfan wedi derbyn cyllid o £500,000. Pan fydd y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol a'r safonau ar waith, bydd angen inni wedyn gyllidebu ar gyfer yr hirdymor.

Alun Pugh: Mae gan chwarter poblogaeth Cymru fynegai crynswth corfforol o 30 neu fwy—hynny yw, maent yn ordew. Gan fod gordewdra yn amlwg yn gysylltiedig â chlefyd siwgr, pa gamau a gymerwch i frwydro yn erbyn y cynnydd mewn gordewdra yng Nghymru fel nad yw Cymru yfory yn edrych fel yr Unol Daleithiau heddiw?

Jane Hutt: Rhoddwyd cyflwyniad da ddoe ynglŷn â'r cynnydd mewn gordewdra yng Nghymru sy'n achos pryder. Clywsom am brosiect ardderchog ym Mlaenau Gwent, wedi ei ariannu gan y gronfa anghydraddoldeb iechyd, i fynd i'r afael â'r cynnydd yn yr ardal honno. Yn anffodus, mae gordewdra yn aml yn gysylltiedig ag amddifadedd. Mae'r mater hwn yn ymwneud â hyrwyddo iechyd ac atal afiechyd. Yn ogystal â chlefyd siwgr, gall gordewdra achosi clefyd y galon, sy'n afiechyd arall y mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad fynd i'r afael ag ef.

David Melding: A wnaiff y strategaeth newydd bwysleisio pwysigrwydd gwasanaethau podiatreg—yr hyn a arferai gael ei alw'n drin traed—sydd, pan gaiff ei ddarparu'n effeithiol, yn gallu gostwng y raddfa trychu hyd at 50 y cant?

Jane Hutt: Mae hyn yn rhan allweddol o'r strategaeth ac yr ydym yn cymryd camau i fynd i'r afael ag ef yng Nghymru. Yn ddiweddar, lansiâs gynllun podiatreg yn Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd, a fydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth wrth sicrhau y gellir diogelu pobl o ran effaith clefyd siwgr ar eu traed. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn rhan allweddol o'r safonau a gaiff eu gosod.

**Partneriaethau Cyhoeddus-Preifat (Darparu Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus)
Public-Private Partnerships (Delivery of Social Services)**

C2 Elin Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad byr ar rôl partneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat yn y gwaith o ddarparu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? (OAQ14332)

Jane Hutt: Local authority social services departments have been involved in partnerships with the private and independent sectors for many years through commissioning of domiciliary and residential care for those with long-term health and social care needs. Commissioners and providers are equal partners in delivering services, and effective partnerships are essential in responding to the changes taking place in the delivery of social services.

Elin Jones: Mae llawer o weithwyr yn y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gofal, yn y sector cyhoeddus a phreifat, yn gweithio o dan amgylchiadau bygythiol. A ydych yn credu eu bod yn haeddu gwell na chael dyn a gafwyd yn euog o ymddygiad bygythiol yn arwain undeb llafur gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? A wnewch chi wrthod rhannu llwyfan â Derek Gregory yng nghynhadledd Sefydliad Bevan yr wythnos nesaf?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid cwestiwn am undebau llafur yw hwn.

The Minister may choose to answer the part of the supplementary question that did not relate to trade unions.

Jane Hutt: Later this morning there will be an important debate on the social care workforce, which consists of 70,000 people in Wales. We must ensure that we support those people in their duties.

Peter Black: The Government's borrowing rules mean that we have to rely on private finance to build some stages of hospitals. We are now trying to build hospitals using our own money without resorting to the private sector. Do you agree that, in any future private finance schemes, the welfare and working conditions of staff should be paramount, and that we should seek to protect

Q2 Elin Jones: Will the Minister make a brief statement on the role of public-private partnerships in the delivery of social services? (OAQ14332)

Jane Hutt: Bu adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol awdurdodau lleol mewn partneriaethau â'r sectorau preifat ac annibynnol am flynyddoedd lawer wrth gomisiynu gofal cartref a phreswyl ar gyfer y rhai sydd ag anghenion gofal iechyd a chymdeithasol hirdymor. Mae comisiynwyr a darparwyr yn bartneriaid cyfartal wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau, ac mae partneriaethau effeithiol yn hanfodol wrth ymateb i'r newidiadau sy'n digwydd ym maes darparu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.

Elin Jones: Many private and public sector workers in social services and care services work under threatening circumstances. Do you believe that they deserve better than to see their public service trade union led by a man found guilty of threatening behaviour? Will you refuse to share a platform with Derek Gregory at the Bevan Foundation conference next week?

The Presiding Officer: Order. This question is not about trade unions.

Gall y Gweinidog ddewis ateb y rhan o'r cwestiwn atodol nad oedd yn ymwneud ag undebau llafur.

Jane Hutt: Yn ddiweddarach y bore yma, cynhelir dadl bwysig ar y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, sy'n cynnwys 70,000 o bobl yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cynnal y bobl hynny yn eu dyletswyddau.

Peter Black: Mae rheolau benthyca'r Llywodraeth yn golygu bod rhaid inni ddibynnu ar gyllid preifat i adeiladu rhai rhannau o ysbytai. Yr ydym bellach yn ceisio adeiladu ysbytai gan ddefnyddio ein harian ein hunain heb orfod troi at y sector preifat. A gytunwch mai lles ac amodau gwaith y staff ddylai ddod yn gyntaf mewn cynlluniau cyllido preifat yn y dyfodol ac y dylem geisio

them and ensure that they get the best possible deal from private finance initiatives?

eu hamddiffyn a sicrhau y cânt yr amodau gorau posibl gan fentrau cyllid preifat?

Jane Hutt: I agree with all of those points, Peter.

Jane Hutt: Cytunaf â phob un o'r pwyntiau hynny, Peter.

Gwasanaethau Iechyd Gwledydd Ewrop Health Services of European Countries

C3 Cynog Dafis: Pa waith ymchwil neu fathau eraill o ryngweithio sy'n digwydd rhwng y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru a gwasanaethau iechyd gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop? (OAQ14322)

Q3 Cynog Dafis: What research or other interaction exists between the national health service in Wales and health services of other European countries? (OAQ14322)

9:15 a.m.

Jane Hutt: The national health service throughout Wales collaborates in much research and development with colleagues in Europe to ensure that Wales is learning from, and contributing to, European models of care and examples of best practice. The health service in Wales has many similarities with health services in other European countries and the Assembly is keen to encourage that important collaboration.

Jane Hutt: Mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru yn cydweithio mewn llawer o waith ymchwil a datblygu gyda chydweithwyr yn Ewrop i sicrhau bod Cymru yn dysgu o fodelau gofal ac enghreifftiau o arfer gorau yn Ewrop ac yn cyfrannu atynt. Mae gan y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru lawer sy'n debyg i wasanaethau iechyd mewn gwledydd Ewropeaidd eraill ac mae'r Cynulliad yn awyddus i annog y cydweithio pwysig hwnnw.

Cynog Dafis: Mae'n deg dweud, efallai, y gallai Cymru fod yn ganolfan arbenigedd mewn rhai meysydd ymchwil iechyd, er enghraifft, iechyd gwledig, dulliau electronig o ddarpariaeth iechyd, a chydlynu iechyd amgylcheddol. A oes gennych strategaeth ar gyfer datblygu'r meysydd hyn a meysydd arbenigol eraill fel bod modd i ni fanteisio ar y cyfle i allforio ein heiddo deallusol fel gweithgaredd economaidd yn ogystal ag fel gweithgaredd gofal iechyd?

Cynog Dafis: It is perhaps fair to say that Wales could be a centre of excellence in some aspects of health research, for example, rural health, electronic means of providing healthcare, and co-ordinating environmental health. Do you have a strategy for the development of these and other areas of expertise so that we can make the most of the opportunity to export our intellectual property as an economic activity, as well as a healthcare activity?

Jane Hutt: That is important and we are bringing this together strategically. The Assembly is an active partner in the World Health Organisation Europe regions for health network, which covers many of the aspects that you mentioned. The telemedicine initiatives that we are taking forward in Wales featured in a recent European conference. Andrew Davies led on that. We are also at the forefront of developing health impact assessments and I recently spoke at a conference in Austria about how we are trying to include that in the development of our Objective 1 projects. There are many

Jane Hutt: Mae hynny'n bwysig ac yr ydym yn dod a hyn at ei gilydd yn strategol. Mae'r Cynulliad yn bartner gweithgar yn y rhwydwaith rhanbarthau Ewrop o Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd ar gyfer iechyd, sy'n cwmparu nifer o'r agweddau a grybwyllwyd gennych. Yr oedd y mentrau telefeddygaeth a ddatblygwn yng Nghymru yn rhan o gynhadledd Ewropeaidd ddiweddar. Arweiniodd Andrew Davies y ffordd ar hynny. Yr ydym yn flaenllaw hefyd ym maes datblygu asesiadau o'r effaith ar iechyd a siaradais mewn cynhadledd yn Awstria yn ddiweddar am ffordd y ceisiwn gynnwys

issues on which we are leading the way and on which we are also learning from Europe.

David Melding: You know from WHO studies that our primary care services are consistently rated among the best in the world. However, our hospital services are regarded by western European standards as mediocre or sometimes poor. Will you be considering European models of secondary care?

Jane Hutt: We are working closely with Europe on primary care and are leading the way in terms of our projects and partnerships. We also have good practice in the secondary and acute sectors and a leading edge in our research and delivery. However, we are considering, along with the Department of Health, how we could pilot, for example, the possibility of sending some NHS patients to other EU countries for treatment. That would be confined to low risk procedures. We need to learn, as I said in reply to Cynog, from health provision across Europe and the world.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I am sure that you are aware that the biggest difference between the national health service in Wales and services in most European countries is the amount of gross domestic product allocated to health spending. You will be aware of the current debate in the UK and Wales on how the NHS should be funded in future. Some prefer a private-public mix of future investment, while others prefer to increase taxes to raise funds for the NHS. As a Minister representing the Government of Wales, which option do you prefer?

Jane Hutt: I made it clear in our lively debate on Tuesday that taxation-based funding of the health service is the way forward. Earlier this week, Tony Blair and Gordon Brown also made that same point clearly. That has been supported by the important research published this week. I look forward to a lively debate on how we take health growth forward, through the

hynny wrth ddatblygu ein prosiectau Amcan 1. Mae sawl mater lle yr ydym yn arwain y ffordd a lle yr ydym hefyd yn dysgu gan Ewrop.

David Melding: Gwyddoch o astudiaethau'r Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd (WHO) y caiff ein gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol eu hystyried yn gyson ymysg y gorau yn y byd. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl safonau gorllewin Ewrop, gweddol neu weithiau gwael yw ein gwasanaethau ysbytai. A fyddwch yn ystyried modelau Ewropeaidd o ofal eilaidd?

Jane Hutt: Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos ag Ewrop ar ofal sylfaenol ac yn arwain y blaen o ran ein prosiectau a phartneriaethau. Mae gennym arfer da hefyd yn y sectorau eilaidd ac aciwt ac yr ydym yn arwain y ffordd o ran gwaith ymchwil a darpariaeth. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ystyried, ynghyd â'r Adran Iechyd, sut y gallasem arbrofi, er enghraifft, gydag anfon rhai o gleifion yr NHS i wledydd eraill yr UE i gael triniaeth. Byddai hynny yn cael ei gyfyngu i driniaethau risg isel. Mae angen inni ddysgu, fel y dywedais wrth Cynog, o ddarpariaethau iechyd ledled Ewrop a'r byd.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gwybod mai'r gwahaniaeth mwyaf rhwng y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru a'r gwasanaethau yn y rhan fwyaf o wledydd Ewrop yw swm y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth a neilltuir ar gyfer gwariant iechyd. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r ddadl bresennol yn y DU a Chymru ar sut y dylid ariannu'r NHS yn y dyfodol. Mae rhai yn ffafrio cymysgedd o fuddsoddiad preifat-cyhoeddus yn y dyfodol, tra byddai'n well gan eraill gynyddu trethi er mwyn codi arian ar gyfer yr NHS. Fel Gweinidog sy'n cynrychioli Llywodraeth Cymru, pa ddewis yw'r gorau gennych chi?

Jane Hutt: Gwneuthum yn glir yn ein dadl fywiog ddydd Mawrth mai'r ffordd ymlaen ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd yw ariannu ar sail trethi. Yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, gwnaeth Tony Blair a Gordon Brown y pwynt hwnnw'n glir. Ategwyd hynny gan ymchwil bwysig a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos hon. Edrychaf ymlaen at ddadl fywiog ar sut y byddwn yn datblygu'r gwasanaeth iechyd,

Assembly budget and the money coming through from Westminster.

drwy gyllideb y Cynulliad a'r arian a ddaw o San Steffan.

Strategaeth Iechyd Rhywiol Sexual Health Strategy

Q4 Jocelyn Davies: Will the Minister make a brief statement on the sexual health strategy? (OAQ14301)

C4 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad byr ar y strategaeth iechyd rhywiol? (OAQ14301)

Jane Hutt: Implementation of the sexual health strategy continues to make good progress. I recently made £545,000 available to health authorities to support investment in sexual health in line with their local strategies. Central initiatives are being undertaken, including a national campaign to raise awareness of sexually transmitted infection prevention among 16 to 30-year-olds, which will be launched early next week.

Jane Hutt: Mae gweithredu'r strategaeth iechyd rhywiol yn parhau i ddatblygu'n dda. Rhoddais £545,000 yn ddiweddar i awdurdodau iechyd i gynnal buddsoddiad mewn iechyd rhywiol yn unol â'u strategaethau lleol. Caiff mentrau canolog eu cynnal, gan gynnwys ymgyrch genedlaethol a gaiff ei lansio yn gynnar yr wythnos nesaf i godi ymwybyddiaeth ymysg pobl ifanc 16 i 30 oed o sut i atal heintiau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol.

Jocelyn Davies: Are you aware that a recent UK survey found that a significant percentage of school children had never heard of HIV or AIDS? In fact, fewer school children are aware of these dangers now than five years ago. Is it not a massive failure of Government that young people are ignorant of this deadly disease? What will you do to reverse that trend?

Jocelyn Davies: A wyddoch fod arolwg diweddar yn y DU wedi canfod nad yw nifer sylweddol o blant ysgol erioed wedi clywed am HIV nac AIDS? Mewn gwirionedd, mae llai o blant ysgol yn awr yn ymwybodol o'r peryglon nag oedd bum mlynedd yn ôl. Onid yw'n fethiant aruthrol ar ran y Llywodraeth nad yw pobl ifanc yn gwybod am yr afiechyd marwol hwn? Beth a wnewch chi i wyrddroi'r duedd honno?

Jane Hutt: It is clear that there has been a drop in awareness, not only among young people—although I appreciate the recently published research—but among the whole population. That has led to risk taking. We must ensure that our sexual health strategy tackles that; I believe it will. A sexual health strategy sub-group is developing an HIV action plan and we are also investing money in raising awareness through our antenatal screening programme.

Jane Hutt: Mae'n amlwg bod llai o ymwybyddiaeth, nid yn unig ymysg pobl ifanc—er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi'r ymchwil a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar—ond ymysg y boblogaeth gyfan. Arweiniodd hynny at gymryd risgiau. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein strategaeth iechyd rhywiol yn mynd i'r afael â hynny; credaf y bydd. Mae is-grŵp strategaeth iechyd rhywiol yn datblygu cynllun gweithredu HIV ar hyn o bryd ac yr ydym hefyd yn buddsoddi arian mewn codi ymwybyddiaeth drwy ein rhaglen sgrinio cyn genedigaeth.

John Griffiths: Do you believe that the widespread availability of condoms is important for sexual health and to reduce unwanted pregnancies and associated health and socio-economic problems? In that context, do you also believe that the provision of free condoms at general practitioners' surgeries would be an

John Griffiths: A gredwch fod sicrhau bod condomau ar gael yn eang yn bwysig i iechyd rhywiol ac yn bwysig er mwyn rhwystro beichiogrwydd diangen a phroblemau iechyd a chymdeithasol-economaidd sy'n deillio o hynny? Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, a gredwch hefyd y byddai cynnig condomau am ddim mewn meddygfeydd yn gam pwysig ymlaen?

important way forward?

Jane Hutt: We are promoting a condom distribution scheme and considering a grant scheme for it. There was a conference in early July on developing a national campaign on safe sex and the use of condoms with regard to sexually transmitted infections, including HIV infection. We are considering free condom schemes to enable this to happen.

Peter Rogers: About 4 per cent of HIV transmissions are from mother to child. What have you done to increase screening for HIV during pregnancy?

Jane Hutt: In terms of the incidence of infection, in one health authority in Wales, for example, four babies this year have been diagnosed with HIV which was transmitted from mothers who were unaware that they were infected. That is extremely worrying. We have now developed guidance on antenatal screening to reduce mother-to-baby transmission. We have also held a conference for midwives and have invested £250,000 to train midwives in the counselling skills needed for this important programme.

Eleanor Burnham: In view of our high rates of teenage pregnancies and the rising number of AIDS cases, can you assure us that sufficient financial resources are being made available, particularly for the education of young people?

Jane Hutt: As I said, I have made £545,000 available to health authorities to support the sexual health campaign. Over the past year, the lead given by last year's Welshwoman of the year, Dr Olwen Williams—who has done much work on this in north Wales and Wrexham—has been important. We are also investing funds to ensure that we update education guidelines. We must ensure that this issue remains on the agenda, and is not just considered once a year on world AIDS day, which is this Saturday.

Jane Hutt: Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo cynllun dosbarthu condomau ac yn ystyried cynllun grant ar ei gyfer. Bu cynhadledd ddechrau mis Gorffennaf ar ddatblygu ymgyrch genedlaethol rhyw diogel a defnyddio condomau mewn cysylltiad â heintiau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol, gan gynnwys HIV. Yr ydym yn ystyried cynlluniau lle y bydd condomau ar gael am ddim fel y gall hyn ddigwydd.

Peter Rogers: Mae tua 4 y cant o'r achosion o drosglwyddo HIV yn digwydd o ganlyniad i'r fam yn trosglwyddo'r haint i'w phlentyn. Beth a wnaethoch i gynyddu sgrinio am HIV yn ystod beichiogrwydd?

Jane Hutt: O ran amllder yr haint, mewn un awdurdod iechyd yng Nghymru, er enghraifft, cafodd pedwar baban eu geni gyda HIV eleni a drosglwyddwyd gan famau nad oeddynt yn gwybod eu bod wedi eu heintio. Mae hynny yn achos pryder mawr. Yr ydym bellach wedi creu arweiniad ar sgrinio cyn genedigaeth er mwyn lleihau'r achosion o drosglwyddo HIV o'r fam i'r baban. Yr ydym hefyd wedi cynnal cynhadledd i fydwragedd ac wedi buddsoddi £250,000 i hyfforddi bydwagedd yn y sgiliau cynghori sydd eu hangen arnynt ar gyfer y rhaglen bwysig hon.

Eleanor Burnham: O ystyried y niferoedd uchel sydd gennym o feichiogrwydd ymhlith merched yn eu harddegau a'r nifer cynyddol o achosion o AIDS, a allwch ein sicrhau bod adnoddau ariannol digonol ar gael, yn arbennig ar gyfer addysgu pobl ifanc?

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedais, rhoddais £545,000 i awdurdodau lleol i gefnogi'r ymgyrch iechyd rhywiol. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, bu'r arweiniad a roddwyd gan Gymraes y flwyddyn y llynedd, Dr Olwen Williams—sydd wedi gwneud llawer o waith ar hyn yng ngogledd Cymru a Wrecsam—yn bwysig. Yr ydym hefyd yn buddsoddi arian i sicrhau ein bod yn diweddarau canllawiau addysgol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y mater hwn yn aros ar yr agenda, ac nad unwaith y flwyddyn yn unig ar ddiwrnod rhyngwladol AIDS, sef y dydd Sadwrn hwn, y caiff ei ystyried.

Byrddau Iechyd Lleol Local Health Boards

Q5 Ann Jones: Will the Minister make a statement about the role of local health boards in addressing inequalities in health? (OAQ14360)

Jane Hutt: Local health boards will play a major role in addressing the issues that cause or contribute to inequalities in health, including inequities in access to health services. With partnership at their heart, they will help people in their communities to take positive steps to protect and improve their health and that of their families.

Ann Jones: Can you assure the people in my constituency that their new local health board will have adequate resources to be able to address the inequalities there?

Jane Hutt: They will have the resources located in the health authorities across north Wales, and the whole of Wales, when the boards assume their full functions in April 2003. However, we must also remember the health inequalities fund, which has awarded funding to 100 projects this year and tackles health inequalities directly. Several important projects have been initiated by the local health groups through your local health board to tackle health inequalities.

David Davies: Minister, I recently wrote to you about a Mrs Luce from Portskewett who has been told that she will have to wait 18 months for an operation, despite the fact that her knee bones are crumbling. Will these changes help her or any of the many constituents about whom I have written to you?

Jane Hutt: You know that we have a target to reduce orthopaedic waiting times. By next July, the health service must deliver on that target so that no-one has to wait more than 18 months for orthopaedic or joint replacement operations of the sort you mentioned. The health service is committed to that and that is why we invested an extra £12 million into

C5 Ann Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar rôl y byrddau iechyd lleol yn y gwaith o fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd? (OAQ14360)

Jane Hutt: Bydd byrddau iechyd lleol yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn y gwaith o fynd i'r afael â'r materion sy'n achosi neu sy'n cyfrannu at anghydraddoldebau iechyd, gan gynnwys annhegwch yn y gwasanaethau iechyd sydd ar gael. Gyda phartneriaeth yn ganolog iddynt, byddant yn helpu pobl yn eu cymunedau i gymryd camau cadarnhaol i ddiogelu a gwella eu hiechyd ac iechyd eu teuluoedd.

Ann Jones: A allwch sicrhau'r bobl yn fy etholaeth y bydd gan eu bwrdd iechyd lleol newydd adnoddau digonol i fynd i'r afael â'r anghydraddoldebau sydd yno?

Jane Hutt: Bydd ganddynt yr adnoddau sydd ar gael yn yr awdurdodau iechyd ledled gogledd Cymru, a Chymru gyfan, pan fydd y byrddau yn dechrau ar y gwaith yn llawn ym mis Ebrill 2003. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd gofio'r gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd, sydd wedi pennu cyllid ar gyfer 100 o brosiectau eleni ac sy'n mynd i'r afael yn uniongyrchol ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Dechreuwyd nifer o brosiectau pwysig gan grwpiau iechyd lleol drwy eich bwrdd iechyd lleol i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd.

David Davies: Weinidog, ysgrifennais atoch yn ddiweddar ynglŷn â Mrs Luce o Borth Sgiwed a gafodd ei hysbysu y bydd rhaid iddi aros 18 mis am lawdriniaeth, er bod esgyrn ei phen-gliniau yn fregus. A fydd y newidiadau hyn yn ei helpu hi neu unrhyw rai o'r etholwyr niferus yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â hwy?

Jane Hutt: Gwyddoch fod gennym darged i leihau amseroedd aros am driniaethau orthopedeg. Erbyn mis Gorffennaf nesaf, rhaid i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gyrraedd y targed hwnnw fel na fydd neb yn gorfod aros mwy na 18 mis am lawdriniaethau orthopedeg neu lawdriniaethau i osod cymal newydd o'r math a grybwyllwyd gennych. Mae'r gwasanaeth

tackling orthopaedic waiting times as well as the other areas where people are waiting for operations. We are investing more to tackle those issues.

iechyd yn ymroddedig i hynny a dyna pam ein bod wedi buddsoddi £12 miliwn yn ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael ag amseroedd aros orthopedeg yn ogystal â meysydd eraill lle y mae pobl yn gorfod aros am lawdriniaethau. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi mwy i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny.

Geraint Davies: I am sure that you are aware that Valleys doctors are over-worked. As a consequence, they propose to stop holding Saturday morning surgeries. There is a desperate need for more doctors. What powers will local health boards have to recruit more doctors in order to address the health divide?

Geraint Davies: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gwybod bod meddygon y Cymoedd yn gorweithio. O ganlyniad, maent yn bwriadu peidio â chynnal meddygfeydd ar fore Sadwrn. Mae angen dybryd am fwy o feddygon. Pa bwerau fydd gan fyrddau iechyd lleol i recriwtio mwy o feddygon er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r rhwyg ym maes iechyd?

9:25 a.m.

Jane Hutt: I am not aware of any GPs who are stopping Saturday surgeries. You will have to bring that to my attention. Clearly, we need robust out of hours services throughout the week, and over the weekend, in order to deal with the health needs of our communities. You know that we have a fully developed and positive primary care strategy—which we will debate in the new year—and we have recently opened a clinical school in Swansea, to double the number of medical students being trained. We are investing in training GPs so that they can be encouraged to join the service, and we are also consulting on a contract for GPs which will radically change the way in which we support and reward our general practitioners. It is clear that local health groups—as they are at present—are making a difference. In your constituency, you know that they are bringing in salaried GPs and strengthening the role of practice nurses. That will be the way forward in the future.

Jane Hutt: Ni wn am unrhyw feddygon teulu sy'n rhoi'r gorau i feddygfeydd bore Sadwrn. Bydd yn rhaid ichi dynnu fy sylw at hynny. Yn amlwg, mae angen gwasanaethau cadarn arnom y tu hwnt i oriau arferol yn ystod yr wythnos ac ar benwythnosau, er mwyn ymdrin ag anghenion iechyd ein cymunedau. Gwyddoch fod gennym strategaeth gofâl sylfaenol datblygedig a chadarnhaol—y byddwn yn cynnal dadl arni yn y flwyddyn newydd—ac agorwyd ysgol glinigol gennym yn Abertawe yn ddiweddar, er mwyn dyblu nifer y myfyrwyr meddygol a gaiff eu hyfforddi. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi mewn hyfforddi meddygon teulu er mwyn eu hannog i ymuno â'r gwasanaeth, ac yr ydym hefyd yn ymgynghori ar gcontract i feddygon teulu a fydd yn newid y ffordd yr ydym yn cynnal a gwobrwyo ein meddygon teulu yn radical. Mae'n amlwg bod grwpiau iechyd lleol—fel y maent ar hyn o bryd—yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Yn eich etholaeth chi, gwyddoch eu bod yn cyflwyno meddygon teulu cyflogedig ac yn cryfhau rôl y nyrsys practis. Dyna'r ffordd ymlaen ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Ysbyty Plant yng Nghymru A Children's Hospital in Wales

C6 Owen John Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar hynt y gwaith o sefydlu ysbyty plant yng Nghymru? (OAQ14313)

Q6 Owen John Thomas: Will the Minister make a statement on the progress in establishing a children's hospital in Wales? (OAQ14313)

Jane Hutt: The Assembly is committed to providing sustainable quality services for children in Wales. In August, I announced funding of up to £4.5 million for the next stage of the development of a children's hospital based in Cardiff.

Owen John Thomas: Can you confirm that the new children's hospital will develop specialised children's services in addition to—and not to the detriment of—existing provision?

Jane Hutt: The initial development will provide purpose-built accommodation for children's services, which are currently based in unsatisfactory accommodation at the University Hospital of Wales. That will be funded from charitable donations. We are now developing the business case for the next stage. It is important to note that the Specialised Health Services Commission is currently reviewing paediatric services in Wales. Its report is due next year. We must ensure that we take on board the needs of all children's services throughout Wales.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will you, and the Government of Wales—I am sorry, the WAG—please consider—*[Interruption.]* We are not allowed to use the title WAG. I apologise.

Will you, and the Government of Wales, give urgent consideration to the need for—

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): The brains of the man.

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Nick Bourne: 'Two jobs' has obviously been overdoing it. Calm down, Rhodri *[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives is invited to ask a question.

Nick Bourne: The chief wag has obviously been overdoing it. *[Laughter.]* Twenty one million pounds is urgently needed, Minister, for this new hospital. Will you, and the

Jane Hutt: Mae'r Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i ddarparu gwasanaethau cynaliadwy o ansawdd i blant yng Nghymru. Ym mis Awst, cyhoeddais y bydd hyd at £4.5 miliwn ar gael ar gyfer cam nesaf datblygu ysbyty plant yng Nghaerdydd.

Owen John Thomas: A allwch gadarnhau y bydd yr ysbyty plant newydd yn datblygu gwasanaethau arbennig i blant yn ogystal â—ac nid ar draul—y ddarpariaeth bresennol?

Jane Hutt: Bydd y datblygiad cyntaf yn darparu adeiladau pwrpasol ar gyfer gwasanaethau plant, a leolir ar hyn o bryd mewn adeilad anfoddhaol yn Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru. Caiff hwnnw ei ariannu o roddion elusennol. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn datblygu'r achos busnes ar gyfer y cam nesaf. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod y Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol yn adolygu gwasanaethau pediatriig yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Disgwyliwn ei adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cymryd i ystyriaeth anghenion gwasanaethau plant ledled Cymru.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnewch chi, a Llywodraeth Cymru—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, y WAG—ystyried—*[Torri ar draws.]* Ni chawn ddefnyddio'r teitl WAG. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf.

A wnewch chi a Llywodraeth Cymru, ystyried ar fyrder yr angen am—

Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan): Dyna ŵr doeth!

Y Llywydd: Trefn

Nick Bourne: Mae 'dwy swydd' yn amlwg wedi bod yn gorweithio. Pwyllwch, Rhodri. *[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gwahoddir Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru i ofyn cwestiwn.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n amlwg bod y prif wag wedi bod yn gorweithio. *[Chwerthin.]* Mae angen £21 miliwn ar fyrder, Weinidog, ar gyfer yr ysbyty newydd hwn. A wnewch chi,

Government of Wales, pledge that assistance and scrap the unnecessary Assembly building in order to put the money where it is really needed—into building a children's hospital?

Jane Hutt: I was pleased to hear that the Noah's Ark Appeal received its highest single donation last week, a sum of £500,000 from GlaxoSmithKline. I work closely with the Noah's Ark Appeal. You know that Ian Botham will be walking the length and breadth of Wales to raise funds. Across Wales, people are engaged in supporting the development of the children's hospital. Our £4.5 million was a key demonstration of our commitment to getting the children's hospital on its way. We know that it will move from strength to strength, and that the hospital will be built.

Tom Middlehurst: While I welcome your commitment to a children's hospital in south Wales, do you share with me the concern of people in north Wales that we should continue to enjoy the excellent services provided by children's hospitals across the border? This scheme should in no way diminish that service.

Jane Hutt: Absolutely. The people of north Wales who have used Alder Hey in Liverpool dearly love that hospital. They will continue to use it. We must look at the review of paediatric services undertaken by the Specialised Health Services Commission to ensure that children across the whole of Wales benefit from improved services.

a Llywodraeth Cymru, addo'r cymorth hwnnw, ac anghofio am adeilad diangen y Cynulliad er mwyn gwario'r arian ar yr hyn sydd ei angen fwyaf—sef adeiladu ysbyty plant?

Jane Hutt: Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed bod Apêl Arch Noa wedi derbyn ei rhodd unigol uchaf yr wythnos diwethaf, swm o £500,000 gan GlaxoSmithKline. Yr wyf yn cydweithio'n agos ag Apêl Arch Noa. Gwyddoch y bydd Ian Botham yn cerdded Cymru benbaladr i godi arian. Ledled Cymru, mae pobl yn ymroddi i gefnogi datblygu'r ysbyty plant. Yr oedd ein £4.5 miliwn yn enghraifft allweddol o'n hymrwymiad i roi dechreuad da i'r ysbyty plant. Gwyddom y bydd yn mynd o nerth i nerth, ac y caiff yr ysbyty ei adeiladu.

Tom Middlehurst: Er fy mod yn croesawu eich ymrwymiad i ysbyty plant yn ne Cymru, a rannwch gyda mi bryderon pobl y Gogledd y dylem barhau i fanteisio ar y gwasanaethau ardderchog a ddarperir gan ysbytai plant dros y ffin? Ni ddylai'r cynllun hwn leihau'r gwasanaeth hwnnw mewn unrhyw fodd.

Jane Hutt: Yn hollol. Mae pobl y Gogledd sydd wedi defnyddio Ysbyty Alder Hey yn Lerpwl yn meddwl y byd o'r ysbyty hwnnw. Byddant yn parhau i'w ddefnyddio. Rhaid inni edrych ar yr adolygiad o wasanaethau pediatrig a gynhaliwyd gan y Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol er mwyn sicrhau bod plant ledled Cymru gyfan yn manteisio ar wasanaethau gwell.

Amseroedd Aros yn y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol NHS Waiting Times

Q7 Jonathan Morgan: Will the Minister make a statement on what measures she is considering to reduce NHS waiting times? (OAQ14314)

Jane Hutt: In July, I launched the waiting times strategy, the aim of which is to focus on waiting times, to improve the experience of patients, and to ensure sustainable balance between supply and demand. My Deputy Minister, Dr Brian Gibbons, is heading a small working group to oversee the

C7 Jonathan Morgan: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ba fesurau y mae'n eu hystyried ar gyfer lleihau amseroedd aros yn yr NHS? (OAQ14314)

Jane Hutt: Ym mis Gorffennaf, lansiais y strategaeth amseroedd aros, a'i hamcan yw canolbwyntio ar amseroedd aros, gwella profiad cleifion, a sicrhau cydbwysedd cynaliadwy rhwng cyflenwad a galw. Mae fy Nirprwy Weinidog, Dr Brian Gibbons, yn arwain gweithgor bychan i oruchwylio'r

implementation of waiting times, care and treatment in Wales.

Jonathan Morgan: Minister, your week started badly with the NHS debate and it will end poorly with another increase in outpatient waiting lists. Are you proud of your record as Minister for Health and Social Services? Is your party proud of its record given that outpatient waiting lists have increased by a staggering 900 per cent?

Jane Hutt: Jonathan, your week started badly with your failure to get your arguments through in the debate on NHS restructuring, where a comfortable majority voted in favour of our plan. So, as far as I am concerned, it was your week that started badly. Yesterday, the latest monthly figures showed an encouraging fall in the number of people facing long waits for cardiac and orthopaedic treatment. We are all committed to achieving that. As you know, by Tuesday of this week, the NHS had had 13,000 emergency admissions in just two days. You know the pressure that is on the health service and our staff. We must back them in what they do.

Dafydd Wigley: A ydych yn derbyn mai'r maes yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol â'r rhestrau aros a chyfnodau aros gwaethaf yw'r gwasanaeth deintyddol? Mae llawer o ardaloedd yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys fy etholaeth i, yn wynebu'r posibilrwydd na fydd yr un deintydd gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ar gael. Mae hynny'n wir am ardal eang. A ydych yn derbyn bod rhai deintyddion wedi derbyn arian i roi gwasanaeth cyhoeddus o dan y cynllun a gyflwynwyd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, ond y maent yn tynnu allan o'r cynllun yn awr, ar ôl i'r cyfnod penodedig ddod i ben? Beth ydych am ei wneud i sicrhau y bydd gwasanaeth deintyddol ar gael i bawb ym mhob rhan o Gymru?

Jane Hutt: That is important. It is a feature of our primary care strategy, which is not just about doctors, but dentists also. Dentists will play a major role in our local health groups as they become strengthened into local health

gwaith o weithredu cynllun amseroedd aros, gofal a thriniaeth yng Nghymru.

Jonathan Morgan: Weinidog, dechreuodd eich wythnos yn wael gyda dadl yr NHS a daw i ben yn wael gyda chynnydd arall yn rhestrau aros cleifion allanol. A ydych yn falch o'ch record fel Gweinidog dros iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol? A yw eich plaid yn falch o'i record o gofio bod cynnydd aruthrol o 900 y cant wedi bod yn rhestrau aros cleifion allanol?

Jane Hutt: Jonathan, dechreuodd eich wythnos yn wael pan wnaethoch fethu â chyflwyno eich dadleuon yn y ddadl ar ailstrwythuro'r NHS, lle y pleidleisiodd y mwyafrif sylweddol o blaid ein cynllun. Felly, o'm rhan i, eich wythnos chi a ddechreuodd yn wael. Ddoe, dangosodd y ffigurau misol diweddaraf ostyngiad calonogol yn nifer y bobl sy'n wynebu cyfnodau hir o aros am driniaethau cardiaidd ac orthopedig. Mae pob un ohonom yn ymrwymedig i gyflawni hynny. Fel y gwyddoch, erbyn dydd Mawrth yr wythnos hon, yr oedd yr NHS wedi derbyn 13,000 o gleifion brys mewn deuddydd yn unig. Gwyddoch beth yw'r pwysau sydd ar y gwasanaeth iechyd a'n staff. Rhaid inni eu cefnogi yn eu gwaith.

Dafydd Wigley: Do you accept that national health service waiting lists and times are at their worst in the dental service? Many areas of Wales, including my constituency, face the possibility of not having a single national health service dentist. That is true of an extensive area. Do you accept that some dentists accepted money for providing a public service under the scheme introduced some years ago, but are pulling out of the scheme now that the prescribed period has come to an end? What will you do to ensure that a dental service is available to everyone in every part of Wales?

Jane Hutt: Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae'n rhan o'n strategaeth gofal sylfaenol, sy'n ymwneud â deintyddion, ac nid meddygon yn unig. Bydd deintyddion yn chwarae rôl bwysig yn ein grwpiau iechyd lleol wrth iddynt

boards. There are grants to attract NHS dentists into Wales, which we have increased. We are now considering ways of keeping them in those practices and of plugging the gaps where there are no NHS dentists. I am committed to doing that.

Rod Richards: Is the Minister for Health and Social Services—or should I say ‘Calamity WAG’—aware of what patients in Wales must put up with? Is she aware that a gentleman, who waited two and a half years for cardiac surgery, was phoned at 7.00 a.m. today, without prior notice, and told to be at the University Hospital of Wales by 8.00 a.m.? What will she do about it?

Jane Hutt: Clearly the service is committed to ensure that people have the operations that they need, and that waiting times are reduced. We already have targets for that in relation to cardiac operations. You know that people are being treated and that many people are willing and pleased to accept treatment at short notice if there is a cancellation. Clearly, if it is not convenient, it must be rearranged. However, that is the nature of a health service under pressure. We must ensure that people are given every opportunity to have their operation.

ddatblygu yn fyrddau iechyd lleol. Mae grantiau ar gael i ddenu deintyddion yr NHS i Gymru ac yr ydym wedi eu cynyddu. Yr ydym bellach yn ystyried ffyrdd o'u cadw yn y deintyddfeydd hynny a llenwi'r bylchau lle nad oes deintyddion yr NHS. Yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i wneud hynny.

Rod Richards: A yw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol—neu a ddylwn ddweud 'Calamity WAG'—yn ymwybodol o'r hyn y mae'n rhaid i gleifion Cymru ymdopi ag ef? A yw hi'n ymwybodol bod dyn a oedd wedi aros dwy flynedd a hanner am lawdriniaeth gardiaidd wedi cael galwad ffôn am 7.00 a.m. heddiw, heb unrhyw rybudd blaenorol, yn ei alw i Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru erbyn 8.00 a.m.? Beth a wnaiff hi am hynny?

Jane Hutt: Mae'n glir bod y gwasanaeth yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau y caiff pobl y llawdriniaethau sydd eu hangen arnynt, ac y gostyngir amseroedd aros. Mae gennym dargedau eisoes ar gyfer hynny mewn perthynas â llawdriniaethau cardiaidd. Gwyddoch fod pobl yn cael triniaeth a bod llawer o bobl yn fodlon ac yn falch o dderbyn triniaeth ar fyr rybudd os bydd rhywun wedi canslo. Yn amlwg, os nad yw'n gyfleus, rhaid ei haildrefnu. Fodd bynnag, dyna yw natur gwasanaeth iechyd sydd o dan bwysau. Rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff pobl bob cyfle i gael eu llawdriniaeth.

Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiynau 1 (OAQ14372), 2 (OAQ14371) a 3 (OAQ14370) ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig. Tynnwyd cwestiwn 4 (OAQ14373) yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Questions 1 (OAQ14372), 2 (OAQ14371) and 3 (OAQ14370) have been transferred for written answer. Question 4 (OAQ14373) is withdrawn.

Datganiad ar Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ar Arallgyfeirio'r Economi Wledig Statement on the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee's Report on Diversification of the Rural Economy

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I am grateful for the opportunity to make this short statement, on behalf of Cabinet colleagues and myself, to the Assembly on the Agriculture and Rural

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i wneud y datganiad byr hwn, ar ran fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet a minnau, i'r Cynulliad ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor

Development Committee's report 'Diversifying the Rural Economy'. When we discussed it in Plenary in July, I welcomed the report and the Committee's vital contribution to promoting the future of our farming and rural communities. At that time, the industry was not only facing underlying structural problems, but also working hard to recover from problems such as BSE and struggling with the foot and mouth disease outbreak. Now we are again in a period of recovery. There have been positive developments in re-establishing our markets for Welsh lamb, although we must remain vigilant so that we do not face a resurgence of foot and mouth disease.

Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig 'Arallgyfeirio'r Economi Wledig'. Pan drafodwyd hyn yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Gorffennaf, croesewais yr adroddiad a chyfraniad allweddol y Pwyllgor tuag at hyrwyddo dyfodol ein cymunedau ffermio a gwledig. Ar yr adeg honno, nid yn unig yr oedd y diwydiant yn wynebu problemau strwythurol sylfaenol ond yr oedd hefyd yn gweithio'n galed i adfer pethau yn dilyn problemau fel BSE ac yn ymdopi â'r achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau. Unwaith eto, yr ydym yn wynebu cyfnod o adfer. Gwelwyd datblygiadau cadarnhaol wrth inni geisio adsefydlu ein marchnadoedd ar gyfer cig oen Cymreig, er y dylem barhau i fod yn wyliadwrus er mwyn sicrhau na fyddwn yn wynebu ail-achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau.

The Assembly Government recognises the issues that the Committee's report raises. Wales's rural economy is under threat and, as a result, so are our rural communities. The rural economy is changing and, as was pointed out by the Welsh Development Agency in its evidence to the Committee, it must be viewed as an integral part of Wales's wider economy.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod y materion a godir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor. Mae economi wledig Cymru o dan fygythiad a'n cymunedau gwledig, o ganlyniad i hynny. Mae'r economi wledig yn newid ac, fel y nodwyd gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn ei dystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor, rhaid ystyried hyn fel rhan hanfodol o economi ehangach Cymru.

9:35 a.m.

In July, I described some of the work in hand. In September, Farming Connect was launched successfully, and last week I launched 'Farming for the Future' which shows our commitment to the industry and sets out our vision for the future of agriculture in Wales.

Ym mis Gorffennaf, disgrifiais rywfaint o'r gwaith a oedd ar y gweill. Ym mis Medi, lansiwyd Cyswllt Ffermio yn llwyddiannus, a'r wythnos diwethaf, lansiiais 'Ffermio ar gyfer y Dyfodol' sy'n dangos ein hymrwymiad i'r diwydiant ac sy'n nodi ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru.

We also launched a rural recovery plan in the wake of the foot and mouth disease crisis with additional funding of £60 million to aid farming and the recovery of the wider rural economy. It includes further support to help farmers diversify through targeted agri-food programmes under the agri-food strategy managed by the Welsh Development Agency. We are working closely with the Wales Rural Partnership to develop policies for rural Wales that will identify and tackle the problems that our rural communities are facing.

Lansiwyd hefyd ein cynllun adfer gwledig yn sgîl clwy'r traed a'r genau gyda chyllid ychwanegol o £60 miliwn i gynorthwyo ffermio ac adferiad yr economi wledig ehangach. Mae'n cynnwys cymorth pellach i helpu ffermwyr i arallgyfeirio drwy raglenni bwyd-amaeth wedi'u targedu o dan y strategaeth bwyd-amaeth a reolir gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â Phartneriaeth Gwledig Cymru i ddatblygu polisiau ar gyfer Cymru wledig a fydd yn nodi'r problemau y mae ein cymunedau gwledig yn eu hwynebu a mynd i'r afael â hwy.

I will now discuss the Committee's nine principal recommendations. First, that the Assembly and its agencies should have a stronger and clearer focus on rural Wales. I agree that there is a need for concerted and coherent policies for rural economic development. A great deal is being done, and the Welsh Assembly Government will continue to give a clear strategic lead on developing rural policy. We will do this in conjunction with our partners in local government, Assembly sponsored public bodies, the voluntary sector and the communities themselves. Our policies will continue to embrace the principles of sustainability, which as Members will know, we have already endorsed and they are part of the Assembly's statutory obligations.

The WDA's corporate plan recognises the importance of rural Wales. One of its key themes is to support a sustainable agriculture and forestry industry in Wales. The agency operates a dedicated rural policy unit as part of its strategy development division and, with others, provides a joint secretariat for the Wales Rural Partnership. Through its regional divisions, agri-food division and its strategy development division the agency is actively helping support the needs of rural Wales, including forestry, environmental goods and services, energy, infrastructure and marketing, community regeneration and business support.

Education and Learning Wales and its predecessors have always included an element of rural focus, and the National Council for Education and Training, which was established on 1 April, is planning to develop a clearer policy approach towards rural issues. ELWa has also agreed with the WDA on the development of a co-ordinated approach towards rural issues, which recognises the common ground and integrated nature of rural needs. Our national economic development strategy, 'A Winning Wales', which will be published shortly, will set out more clearly the increased priority we now give to the rural economy.

We established a Rural Policy Division in the

Trafodaf yn awr naw prif argymhelliad y Pwyllgor. Yn gyntaf, y dylai bod gan y Cynulliad a'i asiantaethau ffocws cryfach ac amlycach ar Gymru wledig. Cytunaf fod angen polisiau pendant a chyson ar gyfer datblygu'r economi wledig. Mae llawer yn cael ei wneud eisoes, a bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn parhau i roi arweinyddiaeth strategol glir ar ddatblygu'r polisi gwledig. Gwnawn hynny ar y cyd â'n partneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol, cyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad, y sector gwirfoddol a'r cymunedau eu hunain. Bydd ein polisiau yn parhau i arddel egwyddorion cynaliadwyedd, a gymeradwywyd eisoes gennym fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, ac maent yn rhan o rwymedigaethau statudol y Cynulliad.

Mae cynllun corfforaethol y WDA yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd Cymru wledig. Un o'i themâu allweddol yw cefnogi diwydiant amaethyddiaeth a choedwigaeth cynaliadwy yng Nghymru. Mae'r awdurdod yn gweithredu uned polisi gwledig benodol fel rhan o'i is-adran datblygu strategol a, chydag eraill, darpara ysgrifenyddiaeth ar y cyd ar gyfer Partneriaeth Cymru Wledig. Drwy ei is-adrannau rhanbarthol, ei is-adran bwyd-amaeth a'i is-adran datblygu strategol, mae'r awdurdod yn helpu i gefnogi anghenion Cymru wledig mewn modd gweithredol, gan gynnwys coedwigoedd, nwyddau a gwasanaethau amgylcheddol, ynni, seilwaith a marchnata, adfywio cymunedol a chymorth busnes.

Mae Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru a'i ragflaenwyr bob amser wedi cynnwys elfen wledig, ac mae'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant, a sefydlwyd ar 1 Ebrill, yn bwriadu datblygu ymagwedd bolisi gliriach tuag at faterion gwledig. Mae ELWa hefyd wedi cytuno â'r WDA ar ddatblygiad ymagwedd gydlynus tuag at faterion gwledig, sy'n cydnabod elfennau cyffredin a natur integredig anghenion gwledig. Bydd ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, 'Cymru ar ei Hennill', a gaiff ei chyhoeddi yn y man, yn nodi'n gliriach y flaenoriaeth gynyddol a roddir erbyn hyn i'r economi wledig.

Sefydlwyd Is-Adran Polisi Gwledig yn y

Assembly earlier this year to co-ordinate the development of rural policy and to ensure that the Assembly and its sponsored bodies address rural needs. This work is in progress. I reconvened the Wales Rural Partnership and I have chaired three meetings to help take this forward. I am pleased to pay tribute to the partnership's work, especially because of the additional burden of the foot and mouth disease outbreak. I am working with the partnership specifically to establish a cross-cutting policy approach to help young people remain in or return to our rural communities if that is what they want to do.

Secondly, that there should be a single gateway for business support. In July, the Assembly endorsed the recommendation of the Economic Development Committee that the WDA should be responsible for the management of a single gateway for all such public sector business support and advice services. The agency is currently working to identify overlaps and gaps in provision, and wants to ensure provision of a comprehensive service via a range of public agencies, including ELWa, Finance Wales, local authorities and private suppliers. The report also suggests that we should introduce tier 3 grants. An enterprise support task and finish group has reported to the Minister for Economic Development on the type of assistance that should be provided to new business start ups and small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales. It is hoped, subject to further detailed discussions with partners such as the Welsh Local Government Association, that a scheme will be introduced in April 2002.

Thirdly, that we should improve the evaluation of the Assembly's and its agencies' policies and performance. My response is that as part of our work to develop rural policy, we are considering ways to improve evaluation and monitoring.

Fourth, that we should improve the development of our skills and links with education and business. In addition to the work of the WDA, the ELWa national council is fully committed to ensuring that

Cynulliad yn gynharach eleni i gydlynu'r broses o ddatblygu polisi gwledig a sicrhau bod y Cynulliad a'r cyrff a noddor ganddo yn mynd i'r afael ag anghenion gwledig. Mae'r gwaith hwn ar droed ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf wedi ailymgynnull Partneriaeth Cymru Wledig gan gynnal tri chyfarfod fel cadeirydd i helpu i ddwyn y maen i'r wal. Hoffwn dalu teyrnged i waith y bartneriaeth, yn arbennig oherwydd baich ychwanegol yr achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau. Yr wyf yn gweithio gyda'r bartneriaeth yn benodol i sefydlu ymagwedd polisi draws-bynciol i helpu pobl ifanc i barhau i fyw yn ein cymunedau gwledig neu ddychwelyd iddynt os dyna y maent yn dymuno ei wneud.

Yn ail, dylid cael un porth tuag at gymorth busnes. Ym mis Gorffennaf, cymeradwyodd y Cynulliad argymhelliad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd y dylai'r WDA fod yn gyfrifol am reoli un porth ar gyfer pob math cyffelyb o wasanaethau cyngor a chymorth busnes i'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae'r awdurdod wrthi'n gweithio i nodi unrhyw orgyffwrdd a bylchau yn y ddarpariaeth, ac mae am sicrhau y darperir gwasanaeth cynhwysfawr drwy gyfrwng amrywiaeth o asiantaethau cyhoeddus yn cynnwys ELWa, Cyllid Cymru, awdurdodau lleol a chyflenwyr preifat. Awgryma'r adroddiad hefyd y dylem gyflwyno grantiau haen 3. Mae grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar gyfer cefnogi mentrau wedi cyflwyno adroddiad i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ar y math o gymorth y dylid ei ddarparu i fusnesau newydd ac i fentrau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru. Y gobaith yw, yn amodol ar drafodaethau manwl pellach gyda phartneriaid fel Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, y cyflwynir cynllun o'r fath ym mis Ebrill 2002.

Yn drydydd, dylem wella'r gwerthusiad o bolisiau a pherfformiad y Cynulliad a'i asiantaethau. Fy ymateb i yw ein bod yn ystyried ffyrdd i wella'r broses werthuso a monitro, fel rhan o'n gwaith i ddatblygu polisi gwledig.

Yn bedwerydd, dylem wella datblygiad ein sgiliau a'n cysylltiadau ag addysg a busnes. Yn ychwanegol at waith y WDA, mae cyngor cenedlaethol ELWa yn hollol ymrwymedig i sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth addysg a

the provision of education and training across Wales is based on evidence of need and demand. ELWa intends to consult widely on its corporate strategy, which should be available from mid December. However, the specific issues raised by the Committee will be considered by the national council in the context of developing its research programme for the forthcoming year. This will include a review of education and training provided to the agriculture industry. In February, ELWa will be launching a Wales-wide information and communications technology management development programme for farmers, which will be integrated with Farming Connect.

The recommendations of the fifth point, that we should nurture local enterprises and improve the dissemination of best practice, are based on the many examples provided, including the experience of the agri-food partnership, Wales Tourist Board initiatives, enterprise agencies and local authorities. The recommendations are noted and supported as they exemplify the good practice which is already in place and which can be developed.

On the sixth point, that we should improve the provision of workplace and business development, I support the cluster approach where appropriate. There are already a number of good examples of this, such as the development of bio-fibre production and processing in north Wales. The strategy is a major feature in the national economic development strategy document 'A Winning Wales', based on the Technium concept, which the Welsh Development Agency is establishing with great success. The idea of rural incubators is well established and the WDA is highly effective in providing a range of workspace options, where there is a good business case for doing so, including advance or bespoke units, joint ventures and property development grants.

The seventh point states that we should improve our marketing and add value to our rural produce—and so say all of us. That must be right. Marketing and added value are major elements of promoting Welsh foods and other key sectors such as tourism. The agri-food strategy has already achieved

hyfforddiant ar draws Cymru yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth o angen a galw. Mae ELWa'n bwriadu ymgynghori'n helaeth ar ei strategaeth gorfforaethol, a ddylai fod ar gael o ganol Rhagfyr. Fodd bynnag, bydd y cyngor cenedlaethol yn ystyried y materion penodol a godwyd gan y Pwyllgor yng nghyd-destun datblygu ei raglen ymchwil ar gyfer y flwyddyn i ddod. Bydd hyn yn cynnwys adolygiad o addysg a hyfforddiant a ddarperir i'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth. Yn Chwefror, bydd ELWa yn lansio rhaglen rheoli datblygiad technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu Cymru gyfan ar gyfer ffermwyr, a fydd yn cael ei hintegreiddio gyda Chyswllt Ffermio.

Mae argymhellion y pumed pwynt, y dylem feithrin mentrau lleol a gwella'r broses o ddosbarthu arfer gorau, yn seiliedig ar yr enghreifftiau niferus a ddarparwyd, yn cynnwys profiad y bartneriaeth bwyd-amaeth, mentrau Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, asiantaethau menter ac awdurdodau lleol. Nodwyd a chefnogwyd yr argymhellion am eu bod yn enghraifft o'r arfer da sydd eisoes mewn grym ac y gellir ei ddatblygu.

O ran y chweched pwynt, y dylem wella'r ddarpariaeth o ddatblygiad yn y gweithle ac mewn busnesau, cefnogaf yr ymagwedd glwstwr lle y bo hynny'n briodol. Ceir nifer o enghreifftiau da o hyn eisoes, fel datblygu system gynhyrchu a phrosesu bio-ffeibr yng ngogledd Cymru. Mae'r strategaeth yn un o nodweddion amlwg y ddogfen strategaeth economaidd genedlaethol 'Cymru ar ei Hennill', yn seiliedig ar y cysyniad Technium, y mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn ei ddatblygu'n llwyddiannus iawn. Mae'r syniad o ganolfannau deori gwledig wedi'i hen sefydlu ac mae'r WDA yn hynod effeithiol o ran darparu amrywiaeth o opsiynau gweithle, lle ceir achos busnes da dros wneud hynny, yn cynnwys unedau ymlaen llaw neu wedi'u teilwra'n arbennig, mentrau ar y cyd a grantiau datblygu eiddo.

Mae'r seithfed pwynt yn nodi y dylem wella ein dulliau marchnata ac ychwanegu gwerth i'n cynnyrch gwledig—a dyna'n barn ni oll. Rhaid i hynny fod yn iawn. Mae marchnata a gwerth ychwanegol yn elfennau amlwg yn y broses o hybu bwydydd Cymreig a sectorau allweddol eraill fel twristiaeth. Mae'r

considerable success since it was set up in 1998. The Assembly Deputy Minister for Rural Affairs, Delyth Evans, recently launched the WDA's latest marketing initiative, 'The True Taste', which will help to further develop the branding of Welsh food. This is a food fair based in the Old Library in the centre of Cardiff, which will run until Christmas. If you visit it, you will see what this initiative is all about. 'The True Taste' is also a major part of our strategy for the investment of European structural fund moneys to help develop and diversify our farming and food industries.

We also set out in 'Farming for the Future' our vision for agriculture, where Welsh producers will compete on quality rather than price, in an integrated Welsh agri-food industry, with farmers and food processors working together to develop and deliver food products for which consumers will pay premium prices. Built into this is the consideration that environmental and food safety matters should become crucial parts of animal and land management. My commitment is that the Assembly will work towards creating conditions that will help the industry adapt and raise the incomes—and this is the bottom line—of farming families. This will include securing the correct trading and subsidy framework, and providing advice through organisations such as the Farming Connect network.

On the eighth point, that we should ensure that any economic development is community-based, I support the recommendation that the Assembly should be committed to sustaining the provision of rural services. We are already doing a great deal, which is recognised in the report. We have extended the WDA's toolkit approach to community development, and have given it additional money to do this via the rural recovery plan. We have also commissioned a report from the Wales Co-operative Centre to consider ways of helping to retain rural retail services. The Wales Co-operative Centre gave a presentation to the last rural partnership meeting.

strategaeth bwyd-amaeth eisoes wedi profi cryn lwyddiant ers ei sefydlu ym 1998. Lansiodd Dirprwy Weinidog y Cynulliad dros Faterion Gwledig, Delyth Evans, fenter farchnata ddiweddaraf y WDA, 'Y Gwir Flas', a fydd yn helpu i ddatblygu ymhellach y broses o frandio bwydydd Cymreig. Ffair fwyd yw hon yn yr Hen Lyfrgell yng nghanol Caerdydd, a fydd yn rhedeg hyd at y Nadolig. Os ewch yno, fel welwch beth y mae'r fenter hon yn ei olygu. Mae 'Y Gwir Flas' yn rhan amlwg hefyd o'n strategaeth ar gyfer buddsoddi arian strwythrol Ewropeaidd i helpu i ddatblygu ac arallgyfeirio ein diwydiannau ffermio a bwyd.

Nodwyd hefyd ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth yn 'Ffermio ar gyfer y Dyfodol', lle bydd cynhyrchwyr o Gymru'n cystadlu ar sail ansawdd yn hytrach na phris, mewn diwydiant bwyd-amaeth Cymreig integredig, gyda ffermwyr a phroseswyr bwyd yn cydweithio i ddatblygu a chyflwyno cynnyrch bwyd y bydd defnyddwyr yn talu prisiau premiwm amdanynt. Wedi'i hymgorffori yn hyn fydd yr ystyriaeth y dylai materion diogelwch amgylcheddol a bwyd ddod yn rhannau hollbwysig o reoli anifeiliaid a thir. Fy ymrwymiad i yw y bydd y Cynulliad yn gweithio tuag at greu amodau a fydd yn helpu'r diwydiant i addasu a chodi incymau—a dyma yw'r mater sylfaenol—teuluoedd sy'n ffermio. Bydd hyn yn cynnwys sicrhau'r fframwaith cywir ar gyfer masnachu a chymorthdaliadau, a darparu cyngor drwy sefydliadau fel rhwydwaith Cyswllt Ffermio.

Ar yr wythfed pwynt, y dylem sicrhau bod unrhyw waith datblygu economaidd yn seiliedig ar y gymuned, cefnogaf yr argymhelliad y dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn ymrwymedig i gynnal darpariaeth y gwasanaethau gwledig. Yr ydym yn gwneud llawer eisoes, a chydnabyddir hynny yn yr adroddiad. Yr ydym wedi ymestyn ymagwedd pecyn offer y WDA tuag at ddatblygu cymunedol, ac wedi rhoi arian ychwanegol i wneud hynny drwy'r cynllun adfer gwledig. Yr ydym hefyd wedi comisiynu adroddiad gan Ganolfan Gydweithredol Cymru i ystyried ffyrdd o helpu i gadw gwasanaethau manwerthu gwledig. Rhoddodd Canolfan Gydweithredol Cymru gyflwyniad i gyfarfod diwethaf y

bartneriaeth wledig.

I also agree with the point on the crucial role of local authorities in delivering on their community support obligations, arising from the Local Government Act 2000. The Assembly Communities Directorate will be considering the progress made and reporting to Edwina Hart on this regularly. Local community enterprise groups are also vital and I announced the seven groups in July that will take forward the LEADER+ project in Wales to identify innovative measures which could have wider application to other rural areas.

On the final point, that we should improve and become more proactive in our land planning as an integral part of rural regeneration, Sue Essex and I have discussed in detail the possibilities of encouraging more flexibility for rural Wales in the planning system. Members will be aware of the progress on 'Planning Policy Wales', the final draft of which was discussed yesterday in the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee. This is a key document setting out the Assembly's land use planning policy, and is to be taken into account by local planning authorities, and others, in their decision-making on individual development proposals. The document fully accords with the Assembly's sustainable development approach. It encourages local planning authorities to ensure that their unitary development plans include policies to encourage farm diversification and rural development, and recommends a criteria-based approach for new economic development in remote or small rural areas.

Current Assembly research into the planning system suggests that planning is not a major barrier to farm diversification, and that there is no case for a fundamental overhaul of the system. However, further research has begun on a number of issues, including the effects of the planning system on the rural economy, and low impact development.

9:45 a.m.

Cytunaf hefyd â'r pwynt ar rôl hanfodol awdurdodau lleol wrth iddynt gyflawni eu rhwymedigaethau cymorth cymunedol, a ddeilliodd o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000. Bydd Cyfarwyddiaeth Cymunedau'r Cynulliad yn ystyried y cynnydd a wnaed ac yn adrodd yn ôl i Edwina Hart yn rheolaidd ar hyn. Mae grwpiau menter cymunedol lleol hefyd yn hollbwysig a chyhoeddais y saith grŵp yn Gorffennaf a fydd yn datblygu'r prosiect LEADER+ yng Nghymru i nodi mesurau arloesol y gellid eu hehangu i ardaloedd gwledig eraill.

O ran y pwynt olaf, y dylem wella a chymryd agwedd fwy gweithredol wrth gynllunio ein tir fel rhan hanfodol o'r gwaith adfywio gwledig, bu Sue Essex a minnau'n trafod yn fanwl y posibilïadau o annog mwy o hyblygrwydd ar gyfer Cymru wledig yn y system gynllunio. Bydd Aelodau'n ymwybodol o'r cynnydd a wnaed ar 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru', y trafodwyd y drafft olaf ohono ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ddoe. Mae hon yn ddogfen allweddol sy'n nodi polisi cynllunio defnydd tir y Cynulliad, a bydd awdurdodau cynllunio lleol, ac eraill, yn ei hystyried wrth iddynt wneud penderfyniadau ar gynigion datblygu unigol. Mae'r ddogfen yn cydymffurfio'n llwyr ag ymagwedd datblygiad cynaliadwy'r Cynulliad. Mae'n annog awdurdodau cynllunio lleol i sicrhau bod eu cynlluniau datblygu unedol yn cynnwys polisiâu i annog arallgyfeirio ar ffermydd a datblygu gwledig, ac mae'n argymhell ymagwedd sy'n seiliedig ar feini prawf ar gyfer datblygiad economaidd newydd mewn ardaloedd anghysbell neu ardaloedd gwledig bach.

Mae ymchwil cyfredol y Cynulliad i'r system gynllunio yn awgrymu nad yw cynllunio'n rhwystr mawr i arallgyfeirio ar ffermydd, ac nad oes cyfiawnhad dros gyflwyno newidiadau sylfaenol i'r system. Fodd bynnag, cynhaliwyd ymchwil pellach ar nifer o faterion, yn cynnwys effeithiau'r system gynllunio ar yr economi wledig, a datblygiad effaith isel.

In conclusion, in the limited time available this morning I have set out some key points in response to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee's important diversification report. In addition to dealing with some of the specific measures, I want to reiterate the Assembly Government's commitment to help our agricultural industry and, of course, other industries in the rural economy to ensure that our rural communities secure a prosperous future. I am sure that we will discuss this report in more detail in Committee.

Elin Jones: Ysgrifennwyd yr adroddiad hwn cyn i argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau fwrw ein gwlad, er bod yr ymateb heddiw yn dilyn yr argyfwng hwnnw. Dywedodd Canghellor y Trysorlys ddydd Mawrth y byddai adfywio economi wledig y Deyrnas Gyfunol, yn dilyn argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, yn costio tua £2.7 biliwn. Mae'n debygol bod y Canghellor wedi rhoi amcan ceidwadol, ond byddai hynny yn costio o leiaf £150 miliwn yng Nghymru, er bod y Llywodraeth wedi rhyddhau £60 miliwn yn y pecyn adfywio gwledig. Mae gagendor sylweddol rhwng hynny a'r gwir gost. A allwch gadarnhau, felly, a oes gan y Llywodraeth unrhyw fwriad i leihau'r gagendor hwnnw drwy ryddhau mwy o gyllid ar gyfer adfywio'r economi wledig ar adeg mor sigledig? Pan fo arian yn brin, mae angen targedu. Mae bron yn amhosibl gweld targedu cyllid ar gyfer ardaloedd gwledig, tra bo perfformiad y sector cyhoeddus yn cael ei fonitro.

Pan ddaeth y WDA o flaen y Pwyllgor, nid oedd data penodol ar gael iddo ynghylch ei wariant ar greu swyddi a darparu cymorth mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Nid oedd modd gwahaniaethu, er enghraifft, rhwng gwario ar greu swyddi yn Nyfrdwy neu'r Fenai. A allwch gadarnhau, pan ddaw'r WDA o flaen y Pwyllgor nesaf y byddwn yn holi'r un cwestiwn ynglŷn â faint o'i arian sydd yn cael ei wario ar ddatblygu economaidd mewn ardaloedd gwledig? A allwch gadarnhau y bydd yn gallu rhoi ateb cadarnhaol, oherwydd bod eich ymateb chi heddiw yn annelwig ynglŷn â'r cyfarwyddiadau yr ydych wedi'u rhoi i'r WDA ar y pwyntiau hynny? Mae'r gallu i gael gafael ar gyllid ar gyfer buddsoddi a datblygu yn hanfodol i

I gloi, yn yr amser prin sydd ar gael y bore yma, nodais ychydig bwyntiau allweddol mewn ymateb i adroddiad arallgyfeirio pwysig y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Yn ogystal â delio â rhai o'r mesurau penodol, hoffwn ailadrodd ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i helpu ein diwydiant amaethyddol ac, wrth gwrs, diwydiannau eraill yn yr economi wledig er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol ffyniannus i'n cymunedau gwledig. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddwn yn trafod yr adroddiad hwnnw yn fanylach yn y Pwyllgor.

Elin Jones: This report was written before the foot and mouth disease crisis hit our country, although today's response comes after the crisis. The Chancellor of the Exchequer stated on Tuesday that the regeneration of the United Kingdom's rural economy, following the foot and mouth disease crisis, would cost about £2.7 billion. The Chancellor is likely to have given a conservative estimate, but that would cost at least £150 million in Wales, even though the Government has released £60 million in the rural regeneration package. There is a yawning gap between that and the true cost. Can you tell us, therefore, whether the Government has any intention of narrowing that gap by releasing more funding for the regeneration of the rural economy during a period of such uncertainty? When funding is scarce, targeting is necessary. It is almost impossible to envisage funding being targeted at rural areas, while the performance of the public sector is monitored.

When the WDA appeared before the Committee, there was no specific data available to it regarding its expenditure on job creation and the provision of assistance in rural areas. There was no way to differentiate, for example, between expenditure on creating jobs in Deeside or on the banks of the Menai Straits. Can you confirm that, when the WDA next appears before the Committee, we will ask the same question regarding how much of its money is spent on economic development in rural areas? Can you confirm that it will be able to give a positive response, because your response today is rather vague on the guidance that you have given the WDA on these points? Access to funding for

fusnesau mewn ardaloedd gwledig a diwydiannol.

investment and development is essential to businesses in rural and industrial areas.

Yr oedd dau argymhelliad penodol yn yr adroddiad ynglŷn â rôl Cyllid Cymru mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Nid ydych wedi ymateb i hynny yn eich datganiad. Felly, o ran Cyllid Cymru, a oes unrhyw gymorth ar gael, megis grantiau neu fenthyciadau penodol ar gyfer busnesau mewn ardaloedd gwledig fel yr awgrymwyd yn yr adroddiad? Yr oedd tipyn o ffwdan ynglŷn â rôl Cyllid Cymru, yn benodol, fel modd o gefnogi ffermwyr ifanc yn y diwydiant amaeth. Nid oes unrhyw beth yn eich datganiad sydd yn awgrymu eich bod wedi dilyn yr argymhellion hynny a hyrwyddo mwy o ymwneud gan Gyllid Cymru o ran cefnogi ffermwyr ifanc sydd yn dechrau yn y diwydiant. Hoffwn glywed eich ymateb i hynny.

There were two specific recommendations in the report on the role of Finance Wales in rural areas. You made no reference to that in your statement. Therefore, as regards Finance Wales, is there any assistance available, such as grants or specific loans for businesses in rural areas, as suggested in the report? The role of Finance Wales, specifically, as a means of supporting young farmers in the agricultural industry was much trumpeted. There is nothing in your statement to suggest that you have adopted those recommendations and encouraged the greater involvement of Finance Wales in supporting young entrants to the farming profession. I would like to hear your response to that.

Mae tipyn yn eich ymateb ynglŷn â'r angen am bolisi integredig a chlir mewn ardaloedd gwledig. A ydych yn credu bod cyhoeddiad y Canghellor echdoe ynghylch gwaredu treth stamp ar fusnesau a thai mewn rhai wardiau mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac nid eraill yn mynd i arwain at dipyn o gymhlethdod ar lefel leol? Er enghraifft, yn fy etholaeth i, ni fydd unrhyw dreth stamp yng Nghribyn, ond bydd treth stamp ym mhentref Cwrtnewydd sydd ddwy filltir i ffwrdd. A ydych yn credu y gall hyn arwain at gymhlethdod ar lefel leol?

There were numerous references in your response to the need for a clear and integrated policy in rural areas. Do you believe that the Chancellor's statement the day before yesterday, regarding abolishing stamp duty on businesses and houses in some wards in rural areas but not in others, will lead to confusion at a local level? For example, in my constituency, stamp duty will be abolished in Cribyn, but not in the village of Cwrtnewydd, which is two miles away. Do you believe that this could lead to confusion at a local level?

A gytunwch yn sgîl cyhoeddiad y Canghellor ddydd Mawrth fod cyfle wedi'i gollu i gyflwyno cymhorthion gweithredu a mesurau cyllidol eraill mewn ardaloedd Amcan 1 a fyddai wedi rhoi hwb sywleddol i adfywio'r economi wledig a diwydiannol? Ni chafodd eich datganiad y bore yma fawr o argraff, ond byddai'r math hwn o gyhoeddiad gan y Canghellor ddydd Mawrth wedi gwneud argraff fawr.

Do you agree, following the Chancellor's statement on Tuesday, that an opportunity has been missed to introduce operating aids and other financial measures in Objective 1 areas, which would have provided a significant boost to the regeneration of the rural and industrial economies? Your statement this morning made little impact, but the impact of such an announcement by the Chancellor on Tuesday would have been significant.

Carwyn Jones: Gwnaethoch bum pwynt. Yn gyntaf, a ddylwn roi rhagor o arian, ac os felly, o le y daw'r arian? Nid ydym yn gallu estyn ein cyllideb. Mae'n rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffordd o gyllido ardaloedd gwledig gyda'r arian hwnnw. Pe bawn yn gofyn am fwy o arian, byddai'n gorfod dod o'r gyllideb iechyd neu addysg neu ran arall o'r gyllideb.

Carwyn Jones: You made five points. First, should we give more money and if so, where will that money come from? We cannot add to our budget. We must find a way to fund rural areas with that money. If we requested more funding, it would have to come out of the health or education budgets or another part of the budget. Those are the facts.

Dyna'r gwirionedd.

Rhaid inni gofio bod y cynllun a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Gorffennaf yn cymharu'n dda â'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Nid yw'n iawn bod Llywodraeth yn gorfod talu iawndal i bob busnes sydd ar ei golled beth bynnag sydd yn digwydd. Os yw busnes ar ei golled o achos clwy'r traed a'r genau, a ddylai gael iawndal os yw'r tymor yn wael, os yw wedi bwrw glaw drwy'r tymor, neu am fod y tymor wedi bod yn waeth nag arfer? Ni all unrhyw Lywodraeth wneud hynny.

Yr hyn y ceisiwn ei wneud yw sicrhau bod gan bobl ddigon o arian i barhau drwy'r gaeaf, a sicrhau drwy roi arian iddynt nad ydynt yn cael problemau ariannol. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn dalu iawndal iddynt am yr elw y byddent wedi ei wneud pe bai pethau wedi bod yn normal. Ni all neb wneud hynny—dyna yw natur busnes.

O ran yr ail bwynt ynglŷn â monitro perfformiad datblygu gwledig yn yr ardaloedd gwledig, ni fu hynny'n digwydd yn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru hyd yn hyn. Byddaf yn sicrhau bod mwy o fanylion ar gael i aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn y dyfodol er mwyn iddynt allu monitro perfformiad, a siaradaf gyda'r WDA er mwyn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd yn y dyfodol.

Mae Cyllid Cymru wedi ymddangos o flaen y Pwyllgor. Mae problemau ynglŷn â defnyddio Cyllid Cymru i helpu ffermwyr ifanc. Yr ydym yn dal i siarad â Cyllid Cymru er mwyn gweld a oes ffordd ymlaen. O ran grantiau i ardaloedd gwledig yn unig, nod Cyllid Cymru yw helpu pawb yng Nghymru. Mae dadl ynglŷn â pha mor bell y dylem fynd o ran '*rural proofing*' ar bolisiau yn y Cynulliad. Byddaf yn siarad â Cyllid Cymru am hyn yn y dyfodol i weld a oes modd ystyried yr hyn y gellir ei wneud i ardaloedd gwledig yn ychwanegol at yr hyn a wna i ardaloedd eraill.

Mae eich pedwerydd pwynt yn ymwneud â wardiau. Nod datganiad y Canghellor oedd helpu pobl sydd yn byw mewn wardiau difreintiedig. Diben targedu yw sicrhau eich bod yn helpu'r bobl ag arnynt angen help. Dyna beth oedd y Canghellor yn ceisio'i

We must remember that the scheme announced in July compares favourably with what happened in England and Scotland. A Government should not have to compensate every loss-making business whatever the circumstances. If a business loses out because of foot and mouth disease, should it be compensated if the season does not go well, if it rains throughout the season, or it has been worse than usual? No Government can do that.

We are trying to ensure that people have enough money to make it through the winter without financial problems. However, we cannot compensate them for the profit that they would have made had things been normal. Nobody can do that—that is the nature of business.

On the second point regarding monitoring development in rural areas, the Welsh Development Agency has not been doing that to date. I will ensure that more details are available to Committee members in the future so that they can monitor performance, and I will speak to the WDA to ensure that that happens in the future.

Finance Wales has appeared before the Committee. There are problems with using Finance Wales to assist young farmers. We are still talking to Finance Wales to see if there is a way forward. With regard to grants exclusively for rural areas, Finance Wales aims to help everyone in Wales. There is an argument as to how far we should go with regard to a rural proofing of policies in the Assembly. I will talk to Finance Wales about that in the future to see if more could be done for rural areas in addition to what is done in other areas.

Your fourth point deals with wards. The aim of the Chancellor's statement was to assist people who live in deprived wards. The point of targeting is to ensure that you help people who need help. That is what the Chancellor was trying to do the day before yesterday.

wneud echdoe. Mae rhai ardaloedd gwledig a threfol yn y wardiau hyn na fydd yn talu tollau stamp. Yr wyf yn gwbl gefnogol i'r ffaith fod y Canghellor yn ceisio targedu yn y ffordd hon, yn hytrach na chymryd ymagwedd gyffredinol.

There are some rural areas and some urban areas included in these wards that will be exempt from paying stamp duty. I am entirely supportive of the fact that the Chancellor is trying to target in this way rather than adopting a blanket approach.

Mae'ch pumed pwynt, Elin, yn sôn am gymhorthion gweithredol a mesurau eraill. Beth yn union yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud? Mae gennym Amcan 1 ar hyn o bryd. Os bydd unrhyw beth o les i amaeth yng Nghymru, awn â'r mater hwnnw i Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yn Llundain, a fydd yn ei drafod gyda'r Trysorlys wedyn. Byddaf yn parhau i wneud hynny yn y dyfodol.

Your fifth point, Elin, mentions operating aids and other measures. What exactly do you intend doing? We have Objective 1 at the moment. If anything will be of benefit to agriculture in Wales, we will take it up with the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs in London, which will then discuss it with the Treasury. I will continue to do that in the future.

John Griffiths: You rightly state that it should be recognised that the rural economy is an integral part of the wider economy. If I walk around Newport, I see many impressive examples of diversification by farmers, and not just those that are commonly thought of such as golf courses, fishing lakes, garden centres, pony trekking, and so on, but a host of small businesses. Do you agree that that should be recognised more widely, and events such as the commitment to innovation awards in Llandudno at the end of last week, organised by the WDA and the Department of Trade and Industry, should grow and develop further in terms of involving rural businesses? For example, one local farmer was recognised for his commitment to innovation. Among all high-tech businesses, he was talking about how he had diversified into a flax crop as an alternative to fibreglass for loft insulation, a seabass farm, pony trekking, tourist accommodation and so on. That is impressive, but we must recognise this best practice more and spread information about the opportunities and rightly recognise farming businesses as examples of good practice and achievement.

John Griffiths: Dywedasoeh y dylid cydnabod bod yr economi wledig yn rhan hanfodol o'r economi ehangach. Os cerddaf o amgylch Casnewydd, gwelaf enghreifftiau trawiadol o arallgyfeirio gan ffermwyr, ac nid dim ond y rhai sy'n dod i'r meddwl yn syth fel cyrsiau golff, llynnoedd pysgota, canolfannau garddio, merlota, ac ati, ond amrywiaeth eang o fusnesau bach. A gytunwch y dylid cydnabod hynny'n amlach, ac y dylai digwyddiadau fel y gwobrau ymrwymiad i arloesedd a gynhaliwyd yn Llandudno yr wythnos diwethaf, a drefnwyd gan y WDA a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, dyfu a datblygu ymhellach yn nhermau cynnwys busnesau gwledig? Er enghraifft, cydnabwyd un ffermwr lleol am ei ymrwymiad i arloesedd. Ymhlith yr holl fusnesau technegol fodern, bu'n trafod sut yr arallgyfeiriodd ei fferm a thyfu cnwd llin fel deunydd amgen i ffeibr gwydr ar gyfer inswleiddio lloffttydd, fferm draenogiaid y môr, merlota, llety i dwristiaid ac ati. Mae hynny'n aruthrol, ond rhaid inni gydnabod yr arfer gorau hyn yn amlach a lledaenu gwybodaeth ynglŷn â'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael a chydabod busnesau ffermio fel enghreifftiau o arfer da a chyflawniad.

9:55 a.m.

Carwyn Jones: Some people say to me—and I disagree—that farming and farmers are inherently resistant to change and are unable to diversify. I know that that is not the case. There are good examples of diversification, but farmers often want to see such examples

Carwyn Jones: Dywed rhai pobl wrthyf—ac anghytunaf â hwy—bod ffermio a ffermwyr yn amharod iawn i newid ac ni allant arallgyfeirio. Gwn nad yw hynny'n wir. Ceir enghreifftiau da o arallgyfeirio, ond mae ffermwyr yn aml am weld enghreifftiau o'r

before they take the plunge. We are trying to offer such a service in two ways. First, we are doing it through Farming Connect, which aims to provide information and business support and show what practices can be used as good examples of what can be done on farms. That is a great help. Secondly, farmers will shortly receive a monthly newspaper from the Assembly Government informing them of what is happening in agriculture in Wales. During the foot and mouth disease outbreak, one of the issues that we picked up on was that people wanted to know more. There were many information points across Wales and when we asked farmers whether they would like to be kept informed after the disease had been eradicated, they answered with an overwhelming 'yes'. That will also be used to promote best practice and to show what can be done to encourage people. Ultimately, that is what it is all about. It is not an inherent stubbornness, it is simply a matter of people wanting to see how things work before they feel that they can take the plunge.

Peter Rogers: I have listened carefully to your statement on diversification, but it follows on from the press release that you issued yesterday after you met with the auctioneers. Looking at your nine principal recommendations, there is no mention of what is probably the most important aspect of Welsh agriculture, namely livestock auctions. There is no place for those among your recommendations. Livestock auctioneering controls agriculture marketing. Ninety per cent of store stock is marketed through livestock auctions, as is probably more than 60 per cent of finished stock. However, your press release yesterday stated that it was up to them to compete for their share of sales of finished stock. I understand that you need farmers to have stakeholds in processing and added value in all forms of marketing for their produce. However, livestock auctioneers across Wales include more stakeholders than any initiative that you have set up. The Welsh Meat Co-operative received a limited response, as you know. There were not enough members to launch it—less than 400.

Four months ago, two livestock auctions closed in Caernarfonshire and Llanrwst in

fath cyn iddynt hwythau wneud yr un peth. Yr ydym yn ceisio cynnig gwasanaeth o'r fath mewn dwy ffordd. Yn gyntaf, gwnawn hyn drwy Gyswllt Ffermio, sy'n anelu at ddarparu gwybodaeth a chymorth busnes a dangos pa arferion y gellir eu defnyddio fel enghreifftiau da o'r hyn y gellir ei wneud ar ffermydd. Mae hynny'n ddefnyddiol iawn. Yn ail, bydd ffermwyr yn derbyn papur newydd misol yn y man gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu hysbysu o'r hyn sy'n digwydd ym myd amaeth yng Nghymru. Yn ystod clwy'r traed a'r genau, un o'r materion a nodwyd gennym oedd bod pobl am wybod mwy. Cafwyd sawl pwynt gwybodaeth ar draws Cymru a phan ofynnwyd i'r ffermwyr a fyddent yn hoffi parhau i dderbyn gwybodaeth ar ôl dileu'r clwy, yr ateb unfrydol oedd 'oes'. Defnyddir hyn hefyd i hybu arfer gorau a dangos beth y gellir ei wneud i annog pobl. Dyna sy'n bwysig yn y pen draw. Nid ystyfnigrwydd cynhenid yw hynny, ond mater lle y mae pobl am weld sut y mae pethau'n gweithio cyn y gallant deimlo eu bod yn barod i fynd amdani.

Peter Rogers: Gwrandewais yn astud ar eich datganiad ar arallgyfeirio, ond dilyna ymlaen o'r datganiad i'r wasg a gyhoeddasoch ddod ar ôl ichi gwrdd â'r arwerthwyr. O edrych ar eich naw prif argymhelliad, nid ydych yn sôn o gwbl am agwedd bwysicaf amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru mae'n debyg, sef arwerthiannau da byw. Nid oes lle i'r rhain ymysg eich argymhellion. Arwerthiannau da byw sy'n rheoli marchnata amaethyddiaeth. Caiff nawdeg y cant o'r stoc stôr ei farchnata drwy arwerthiannau da byw, yn yr un modd mae mwy na 60 y cant o'r stoc terfynol. Fodd bynnag, yn eich datganiad i'r wasg ddod dywedasoch mai eu cyfrifoldeb hwy oedd cystadlu am eu cyfran o'r stoc terfynol a werthir. Deallaf fod angen i ffermwyr fod yn randdeiliaid yn y broses brosesu a gwerth ychwanegol ym mhob agwedd ar farchnata eu cynnyrch. Fodd bynnag, mae arwerthwyr da byw ledled Cymru yn cynnwys mwy o randdeiliaid nag unrhyw fenter a sefydlwyd gennych chi. Ni dderbyniodd Cydweithrediaeth Cig Cymru lawer o ymateb, fel y gwyddoch. Nid oedd digon o aelodau i'w lansio—llai na 400.

Bedwar mis yn ôl, caewyd dau arwerthiant da byw yn Sir Gaernarfon ac yn Llanrwst ym

Meirionydd. In Bryncir—a small area of hill farms, which has less favoured area status—the same amount of money was poured into its livestock auction company by farmers as stakeholders. They foresaw that the best way of marketing stock was through auctions and made a commitment to that. You saw the tremendous response to this matter in this Chamber three weeks ago after we received over 6,000 letters of support for livestock auctions from farmers across Wales. You say that you are listening to the industry to take matters forward, which is right, but in fact you have ignored—

The Presiding Officer: Order. Peter, the Minister is making a statement, and you are making a speech. I have called you as the Conservative lead speaker. I now expect you to ask questions rather than make a speech.

Peter Rogers: I am trying to get to a question.

The Presiding Officer: It is taking rather a long time.

Peter Rogers: One of the key issues is the development of added value, particularly regarding land marketing. On yesterday's press release and directing auctioneers to bring forward business proposals for investment in the added value of processing lambs, again, you do not understand what the auctioneers—

The Presiding Officer: Order. You have had your questions now.

Carwyn Jones: On yesterday's meeting with the auctioneers, I did not direct them to come forward with proposals to add value—I challenged them. I told them to come forward with sensible proposals, and we will support them financially and morally. I emphasised that three times. I said that I did not want to lose their expertise, but that they were in the same situation as many farmers, and I did not expect to see as many of them in the room in ten years' time. A situation is developing, which has nothing to do with the dead-weight sector of the Welsh meat company. I fear that

Meirionnydd. Ym Mryncir—ardal fechan o ffermydd mynydd, sydd â statws ardal llai ffafriol—cyfranwyd yr un swm o arian i mewn i'w gwmni arwerthu da byw gan ffermwyr fel rhanddeiliaid. Rhagwelasant mai'r ffordd orau o farchnata stoc fyddai drwy arwerthiannau a gwnaethant ymrwymiad i hynny. Gwelsoch yr ymateb aruthrol i hyn yn y Siambr dair wythnos yn ôl ar ôl inni dderbyn dros 6,000 o lythyrau o gefnogaeth i arwerthiannau da byw gan ffermwyr o bob cwr o Gymru. Dywedasoeh eich bod yn gwrando ar y diwydiant er mwyn mynd â materion rhagddynt, sy'n briodol, ond mewn gwirionedd, yr ydych wedi anwybyddu—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Peter, mae'r Gweinidog yn gwneud datganiad, ac yr ydych chi'n gwneud araith. Gelwais arnoch fel prif siaradwr y Ceidwadwyr. Disgwyliaf yn awr ichi ofyn cwestiynau yn hytrach na gwneud araith.

Peter Rogers: Yr wyf yn ceisio cyrraedd y cwestiwn.

Y Llywydd: Mae'n cymryd cryn amser.

Peter Rogers: Un o'r materion allweddol yw datblygu gwerth ychwanegol, yn arbennig mewn cysylltiad â marchnata tir. Yn y datganiad i'r wasg ddoe a chyfeirio arwerthwyr i gyflwyno cynigion busnes ar gyfer buddsoddi yn y gwerth ychwanegol sy'n gysylltiedig â phrosesu ŵyn, nid ydych yn deall yr hyn y mae'r arwerthwyr—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael eich cwestiynau yn awr.

Carwyn Jones: O ran y cyfarfod ddoe gyda'r arwerthwyr, ni wnes eu cyfeirio i gyflwyno'r cynigion ar gyfer gwerth ychwanegol—cyflwynais her iddynt. Dywedais wrthynt i gyflwyno cynigion synhwyrol, ac y byddwn yn eu cefnogi'n ariannol ac yn foesol. Pwysleisiais hynny deirgwaith. Dywedais nad oeddwn am golli eu harbenigedd, ond eu bod hwythau yn yr un sefyllfa â llawer o ffermwyr, ac nad oeddwn yn disgwyl gweld cynifer ohonynt yn yr ystafell ymhen deng mlynedd. Mae sefyllfa'n datblygu, nad oes ganddi unrhyw gysylltiad â sector pwysau

buyers will bypass the mart, and there is nothing that the marts can do about it unless they consider how they operate. I do not want them to go, I want them to change. I want them to see what can be done in future.

I heard two comments yesterday that I want to share with you. Yesterday's meeting was a reasonable one. The first comment was, 'we have been doing it this way for centuries, why should we change?' That is the worst possible thing that you could say in agriculture or in any industry—it has been a tradition and it will always be there. Mining was a tradition and it has gone. Tradition counts for nothing when it comes to the market. The other comment that surprised me was, 'we do not want different labelling of Welsh lamb, because it confuses the housewife'. That was said to me yesterday by one of the younger members present. That comment is unfortunate and shows that there is a great deal of work to be done to inform people of the nature of the food market. We need to label and distinguish. People like choice. That is why supermarkets stock such huge ranges of produce. People do not want to go into a local butcher's shop and buy any chunk of meat anymore. They did at one time, but that is no longer the case.

You mentioned Dolgellau and Bryncir, Peter. I offered to help with Bryncir. I offered to act as an honest broker regarding how the mart might be restarted. I was reminded of that yesterday in terms of selling finished stock in Dolgellau. My understanding is that, in terms of finished stock, it acts as a procurement sector and not as a traditional livestock mart. You were not there, Peter. There is no mention of livestock auctioneers, but neither is there a mention of the dead-weight sector in particular. There are many ways in which people can sell their animals. Some farmers will want to sell through livestock auctions, and they are entitled to do so. However, they are also entitled to have a choice as to whether they want to sell live-weight or dead-weight. That is what competition is about.

marw'r cwmni cig Cymreig. Ofnaf y bydd prynwyr yn anwybyddu'r farchnad, ac ni all y marchnadoedd wneud dim am hyn oni bai yr ystyriant sut maent yn gweithredu. Nid wyf am eu gweld yn mynd, yr wyf am iddynt newid. Yr wyf am iddynt weld beth y gellir ei wneud yn y dyfodol.

Clywais ddau sylw ddoe yr wyf am eu rhannu gyda chi. Yr oedd y cyfarfod ddoe yn un rhesymol. Y sylw cyntaf oedd, 'yr ydym wedi bod yn gwneud hyn ers canrifoedd, pam ddylem ni newid?' Dyna yw'r peth gwaethaf y gallech ddweud am amaethyddiaeth neu unrhyw ddiwydiant arall—mae wedi bod yn draddodiad a bydd yma am byth. Bu'r pyllau glo yn draddodiad, ac maent wedi diflannu. Nid yw traddodiad yn golygu unrhyw beth yn y farchnad. Y sylw arall a'm synais oedd, 'nid ydym am weld labelau gwahanol ar gig oen Cymreig, am fod hynny'n drysu'r wraig tŷ'. Dywedwyd hynny wrthyf ddoe gan un o'r aelodau ieuengaf a oedd yn bresennol. Yr oedd y sylw hwn yn anffodus ac mae'n dangos bod cryn waith i'w wneud i hysbysu pobl am natur y farchnad bwyd. Mae angen inni labelu a gwahaniaethu. Mae pobl yn hoffi cael dewis. Dyna pam fod archfarchnadoedd yn stocio cymaint o wahanol fathau o gynnyrch. Nid yw pobl am fynd at y cigydd lleol a prynu darn mawr o gig y dyddiau yma. Gwnaethant hynny yn y gorffennol, ond nid yw hynny'n wir erbyn hyn.

Soniasoch am Ddolgellau a Bryncir, Peter. Cynigiais help i Fryncir. Cynigiais i weithredu fel cyfryngwr gonest o ran sut y gellid ail-agor y farchnad. Cefais fy atgoffa ddoe yn nhermau gwerthu stoc terfynol yn Nolgellau. Fy nealltwriaeth yw, yn nhermau stoc terfynol, ei fod yn gweithredu fel sector pwrcasu ac nid fel marchnad da byw draddodiadol. Nid oeddech chi yno, Peter. Ni soniwyd am yr arwerthwyr da byw, ond ni soniwyd ychwaith am y sector pwysau marw yn benodol. Gall pobl werthu eu hanifeiliaid mewn sawl ffordd. Bydd rhai ffermwyr am werthu drwy arwerthiannau da byw, ac mae ganddynt hawl i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae ganddynt hawl hefyd i gael dewis o ran a ydynt am werthu pwysau byw neu bwysau marw. Dyna yw ystyr cystadleuaeth.

Finally, as I said yesterday, and as I have said many times in this Chamber, yes, money has been put into the dead-weight sector, but money is also available for the live-weight sector. Some £25,000 is available now for the quality price reporting system and, if proposals come forward, which will assist farming and auctioneering, the door is open. I have said that before, and I said it three or four times yesterday. Simply saying 'no change', and 'once the mart has opened everything will be fine', cannot be right. I was told yesterday that once the marts are open the price will be fine and that would be the end of it—the implication being that before foot and mouth disease the price was also fine. I cannot believe that people think that.

Mick Bates: I welcome this statement. Good work was done in organising this, by officials and by the Chair of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee. As you rightly point out, it was undertaken at a time when the industry had not been afflicted by foot and mouth disease. The essential part of the document is the theme of the sustainability of rural communities. That is the whole reason behind undertaking the study into the diversification of the rural economy. The key factor is the delivery of these aspirations. I have four questions on that.

First, I welcome the further integration between planning policy units in the Assembly and its sponsored bodies, such as the WDA. However, I am still concerned that the Committee is entitled Agriculture and Rural Development. It is amazing that we have not followed, for example, the Scottish model, and produced a document that encompasses all aspects of rural regeneration, from housing to transport, tourism and education. We still need that type of document to show a deep commitment to the future of rural Wales, not only for the sake of retaining people, but also a culture. That is fundamental to the future of rural Wales. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Ask a question.']

I thought you were going to intervene, Nick.

The Presiding Officer: Order. There can be

Yn olaf, fel y dywedais ddoe, ac fel y dywedais sawl gwaith yn y Siambr hon, do, rhoddwyd arian i mewn i'r sector pwysau marw, ond mae arian ar gael hefyd ar gyfer y sector pwysau byw. Mae tua £25,000 ar gael erbyn hyn ar gyfer y system nodi prisiau safonol ac, os daw cynigion i law, a fydd yn cynorthwyo'r meysydd ffermio ac arwerthu, mae'r drws ar agor. Dywedais o'r blaen, a dywedais hynny deirgwaith neu bedair gwaith ddoe. Nid yw dweud 'dim newid', ac 'unwaith y bydd y farchnad wedi agor bydd popeth yn iawn', yn addas. Dywedwyd wrthyf ddoe y byddai'r prisiau'n iawn ar ôl i'r marchnadoedd agor a dyna fyddai diwedd y stori—sy'n awgrymu bod y prisiau wedi bod yn iawn cyn clwy'r traed a'r genau hefyd. Ni chredaf mai dyma yw barn pobl.

Mick Bates: Croesawaf y datganiad hwn. Gwnaed gwaith da i drefnu hynny, gan swyddogion a chan Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Fel y dywedaso, gwnaed y gwaith hwn ar adeg pan nad oedd clwy'r traed a'r genau wedi effeithio ar y diwydiant. Rhan hanfodol y ddogfen yw thema cynaliadwyedd y cymunedau gwledig. Dyna yw'r prif reswm dros gynnal yr astudiaeth i arallgyfeirio yn yr economi wledig. Y ffactor allweddol yw cyflawni'r dyheadau hyn. Mae gennyf bedwar cwestiwn ar hyn.

Yn gyntaf, croesawaf yr integreiddio pellach rhwng yr unedau polisi cynllunio yn y Cynulliad a'i gyrff nodedig, fel y WDA. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn bryderus o hyd mai Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yw teitl y Pwyllgor. Mae'n rhyfeddol nad ydym wedi dilyn, er enghraifft, model yr Alban, a chynhyrchu dogfen sy'n cwmpasu pob agwedd ar adfywio gwledig, o dai i drafnidiaeth, twristiaeth ac addysg. Mae angen y math hwn o ddogfen arnom i ddangos ymrwymiad cadarn tuag at ddyfodol Cymru wledig, nid yn unig er lles cadw bobl, ond cadw diwylliant hefyd. Mae hyn wrth wraidd dyfodol Cymru wledig. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Gofynnwch gwestiwn.']

Yr oeddwn yn credu eich bod am ymyrryd, Nick.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni allwn gael unrhyw

no interventions. This is a statement. Mick Bates is about to ask his final question—I can hear it coming.

Mick Bates: That was my first question. *[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. We are out of time for this statement. Thirty minutes have passed. I could close the debate now, and am almost minded to do so. We are out of time.

10:05 a.m.

Mick Bates: Moving on swiftly, I welcome the announcement about tier 3 grants. Will you ensure that businesses can access them with ease? For example, will all the partners present a menu, which means that they can deliver? On planning—

Dafydd Wigley: Make him a Minister.

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Mick Bates: I welcome the opportunity for people to develop their businesses. However, there is no mention of how renewable energy projects could be used to assist the future prosperity of rural areas. Finally, on monitoring and evaluation, does the Minister agree that we have a great opportunity to use the programme monitoring committees' information to measure the nine recommendations' effectiveness in future?

Carwyn Jones: We have discussed the issue of a rural vision document many times. I have suggested it to the rural partnership and I asked it whether it wanted to carry out that work. It said 'no', because it wanted to concentrate on specific issues. It is currently concentrating on how to achieve an age balance in rural communities. As you know, I am an agnostic on this. I presented the idea to the partnership neutrally. It did not want such a document to be produced because it did not see the worth of it at the time. I did not express an opinion one way or another. If the Committee wants to investigate this, that is a matter for the Committee and its Chair. I have no difficulty with that.

ymyriadau. Datganiad yw hwn. Mae Mick Bates ar fin gofyn ei gwestiwn olaf—gallaf ei glywed yn dod.

Mick Bates: Dyna oedd fy nghwestiwn cyntaf. *[Torri ar draws]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae ein hamser ar gyfer y datganiad hwn ar ben. Mae deg munud ar hugain wedi mynd heibio. Gallwn gloi'r ddadl hon yn awr, ac yr wyf bron â gwneud hynny. Nid oes amser gennym.

Mick Bates: Gan symud ymlaen yn gyflym, croesawaf y cyhoeddiad ynglŷn â'r grantiau 3 haen. A wnewch chi sicrhau eu bod ar gael yn rhwydd i fusnesau? Er enghraifft, a wnaiff pob partner gyflwyno dewislen, sy'n golygu y gallant gyflwyno? O ran cynllunio—

Dafydd Wigley: Gwnewch ef yn Weinidog.

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Mick Bates: Croesawaf y cyfle i bobl ddatblygu eu busnesau. Fodd bynnag, ni soniwyd am sut y gellid defnyddio prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy i gynorthwyo gyda ffyniant ardaloedd gwledig yn y dyfodol. Yn olaf, o ran monitro a gwerthuso, a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod gennym gyfle gwych i ddefnyddio gwybodaeth pwyllgorau monitro'r rhaglenni i fesur effeithiolrwydd y naw argymhelliad yn y dyfodol?

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydym wedi trafod mater dogfen gweledigaeth wledig droeon. Awgrymais hynny i'r bartneriaeth wledig a gofynnais a oedd am gynnal y gwaith. Dywedodd 'na', am ei bod am ganolbwyntio ar faterion penodol. Ar hyn o bryd mae'n canolbwyntio ar sut i gyflawni cydbwysedd oedran mewn cymunedau gwledig. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf yn amheuw'r ar y mater hwn. Cyflwynais y syniad i'r bartneriaeth mewn modd niwtral. Nid oedd am weld dogfen o'r fath yn cael ei chynhyrchu am nad oedd yn gweld gwerth hynny ar y pryd. Ni fynegais farn y naill ffordd neu'r llall. Os yw'r Pwyllgor am ymchwilio i hynny, mater i'r Pwyllgor a'i Gadeirydd yw hynny. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw broblem â hynny.

On Mick's second point, the measure of the success of any aid is how easy it is to access. That will be important. I will keep an eye on it and, if there are reports of difficulties in accessing tier 3 grants, I will seek to redress that.

Mick made an important point about renewable energy projects. He is right; we need to do more to promote renewable energy. Although good work is already being done, I accept that this may need to be emphasised further in future.

I will investigate whether there is a way of using the programme monitoring committees to monitor and evaluate the recommendations. However, we may need to consider another way of monitoring and evaluating them effectively. Perhaps I will report on that in the next Committee meeting.

The Presiding Officer: I have only received one request by a Member to contribute to the next item on the agenda. I will, therefore, allow a brief extension of the time allowed for this statement. However, Members can only ask one question each, because the main party spokespersons have already spoken.

Jocelyn Davies: Is the Minister aware that one of the Committee's recommendations is that major public bodies should encourage local, quality-based procurement policies? What will you do to ensure that that happens?

Carwyn Jones: That work can start here in the Assembly. The catering sub-committee is encouraging stronger promotion of Welsh produce in the canteen, although Welsh food is already promoted there to an extent. Much of the work of promoting Welsh food—to public bodies and to private individuals—is being done via the agri-food partnership. At the launch of the Celtic Pride logo—a brand of the Welsh Meat Company—on Wednesday, I announced that the Ministry of Defence has ordered a further 20 tonnes of Welsh lamb. That is good news for Welsh farmers, and the army will have the finest possible produce.

The promotion work will continue, and I will

Ar ail bwynt Mick, mesur llwyddiant unrhyw gymorth yw pa mor hawdd yw hi i gael gafael arno. Bydd hyn yn bwysig. Cadwaf lygad ar hyn ac, os nodir unrhyw anawsterau o ran cael gafael ar y grantiau 3 haen, ceisiaf unioni'r sefyllfa.

Gwnaeth Mick bwynt pwysig ynglŷn â phrosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae'n iawn; mae angen i ni wneud mwy i hybu ynni adnewyddadwy. Er bod gwaith da'n cael ei wneud eisoes, derbynïaf y bydd angen pwysleisio hynny ymhellach efallai yn y dyfodol.

Byddaf yn ymchwilio i weld a oes ffordd o ddefnyddio'r pwyllgorau monitro'r rhaglen i fonitro a gwerthuso'r argymhellion. Fodd bynnag, efallai y bydd angen i ni ystyried ffyrdd eraill o'u monitro a'u gwerthuso yn effeithiol. Efallai y cyflwynaf adroddiad ar hyn yng nghyfarfod nesaf y Pwyllgor.

Y Llywydd: Dim ond un cais a dderbynïais gan Aelod i gyfrannu i'r eitem nesaf ar yr agenda. Felly, byddaf ond yn caniatáu estyniad byr i'r amser a ganiateir ar gyfer y datganiad hwn. Fodd bynnag, dim ond un cwestiwn y gall Aelodau ei ofyn, am fod prif lefarwyr y pleidiau eisoes wedi siarad.

Jocelyn Davies: A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol mai un o argymhellion y Pwyllgor yw y dylai cyrff cyhoeddus amlwg annog polisiau pwrcasu lleol, sy'n seiliedig ar ansawdd? Beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd?

Carwyn Jones: Gall y gwaith hwn ddechrau yn y Cynulliad. Mae'r is-bwyllgor arlwygo yn annog ymgyrch gadarnach i hybu cynnyrch Cymreig yn y ffreutur, er y caiff bwydydd Cymreig eu hybu yno eisoes i raddau. Gwneir y rhan fwyaf o'r gwaith o hybu bwydydd Cymreig—i gyrff cyhoeddus ac i unigolion preifat—drwy'r bartneriaeth bwyd-amaeth. Yn achlysur lansio logo'r Celtic Pride—brand Cwmni Cig Cymru—ddydd Mercher, cyhoeddais fod y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn wedi archebu 20 tonnall ychwanegol o gig oen Cymreig. Mae hynny'n newyddion da i ffermwyr Cymru, a bydd gan y lluoedd arfog y cynnyrch gorau posibl.

Bydd y gwaith hybu yn parhau, a byddaf yn

continue to encourage local authorities and others to buy local as much as possible. The difficulty is that, for many years, local authorities had a compulsory competitive tendering mentality. Even though those harsh and unrealistic days have gone, we still need to tell people that they must no longer only consider the cost, as they did when they were buying Columbian coal dug out by 12-year-old children. They can now consider the effects on the local economy, which is only right.

Delyth Evans: Nid oes amheuaeth fod y sector amaeth wedi dioddef ergyd drom dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf hynny, wrth siarad â phobl ar draws y diwydiant, caf yr argraff fod cydnabyddiaeth o'r gwaith da y mae'r Cynulliad a'r asiantaethau yn ei wneud i osod sylfaen gref i'r sector ar gyfer y dyfodol. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cael yr argraff honno? Sut y gallwn gynnal y momentwm, fel y bydd y sector yn gryfach ac yn fwy effeithiol wedi'r ergyd a ddioddefodd yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf?

Carwyn Jones: Mae pobl yn sylweddoli bod pethau'n gorfod newid, ac y gallant newid er gwell. Gall fod ar bobl ofn gweld pethau'n newid gan eu bod yn credu y bydd y sefyllfa yn gwaethygu. Dylem adeiladu ar sylfaen gadarn y ddogfen yr oeddwn yn gyfrifol am ei lansio yr wythnos diwethaf, ac a gafodd gefnogaeth undebau ffermwyr, cyrff sy'n cynrychioli pobl â diddordeb amgylcheddol a chynrychiolwyr cwsmeriaid ac ati. Am y tro cyntaf, mae gennym sylfaen i adeiladu arni. Er bod pwyntiau pwysig yn y ddogfen, rhaid inni gofio mai dim ond sylfaen ydyw. Nid yw'n rhoi achos inni ddathlu; rhaid inni sicrhau canlyniadau. Am y tro cyntaf hefyd, mae gan ffermwyr ddogfen a fydd yn dangos iddynt pa drywydd y mae'r Cynulliad yn bwriadu ei ddilyn, a beth y dylent hwy ei ddisgwyl gan Cynulliad, a beth y mae pobl yn ei ddisgwyl ganddynt hwy. Mae hynny'n glir bellach ac mae pobl yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa. Yr oedd yn rhaid inni wneud hynny ar y dechrau gan fod angen gweledigaeth arnom i adeiladu ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Janet Ryder: You said that you do not think that planning regulations need to be reconsidered. However, the report asks

parhau i annog awdurdodau lleol ac eraill i brynu cymaint o gynnyrch lleol â phosibl. Y broblem yw, bod awdurdodau lleol wedi bod yn meddwl yn nhermau tendro cystadleuol gorfodol, ers blynyddoedd lawer. Er bod y dyddiau caled ac afrealistig hynny wedi diflannu, mae angen i ni hysbysu pobl o hyd na ddylent ond ystyried y gost, fel y gwnaethant wrth brynu glo o Columbia wedi'i gloddio gan blant 12 oed. Yn awr gallant ystyried yr effeithiau ar yr economi leol, ac mae hynny'n briodol.

Delyth Evans: There is no doubt that the agriculture sector has been dealt a heavy blow over the past year. In spite of that, when I talk to people from across the industry, I get the impression that they acknowledge the good work being done by the Assembly and the agencies to set a strong foundation for the sector for the future. Does the Minister get the same impression? How can we maintain the momentum, so that the sector will emerge stronger and more effective after the blow that it has suffered during the past year?

Carwyn Jones: People realise that things must change, and that they can change for the better. People can be fearful of change because they think that the situation will deteriorate further. The firm foundation on which to build is the document launched last week, which was signed up to by farming unions, organisations representing environmental interests and customer representatives and so on. For the first time we have a foundation on which to build. Even though there are important points in the document, we must remember that it is only a foundation. It does not give us cause to celebrate; we must ensure results. For the first time also, farmers have a document that will tell them which direction the Assembly intends to follow, and what they should expect of the Assembly, and what people are aware of the situation. We had to do that at the outset because we needed a vision in order to build for the future.

Janet Ryder: Dywedasoeh nad ydych yn credu bod angen ailystyried y rheoliadau cynllunio. Fodd bynnag, mae'r adroddiad yn

people to diversify off the farm. If a farmer's son or daughter wanted to build a dwelling on their farm, they would have to prove that that piece of land would provide full-time employment. How can they diversify off the farm and continue to build on the farm when planning regulations do not allow them to do so? Do you agree that we must reconsider planning regulations to allow farmers' sons and daughters to stay on the farm, get some employment from farming and diversify off the farm?

Carwyn Jones: At the end of my statement I said that further research has been started in a number of areas, including the rural economy, the planning system and low-impact development. It is not a case therefore of the door being shut. We must investigate further what can be done to target development properly. I can understand why local authorities are concerned. If I were a member of Gwynedd Council I would be concerned that allowing the development of numerous dwelling houses could ultimately lead to them being sold to people from outside the area. That is an important issue in Gwynedd. We must ensure that local authorities have a choice and do not feel under pressure to give planning permission for residential homes where they feel that it would not be in a community's interest. That is a matter for Gwynedd, and I would not wish to take it away from the council.

Lorraine Barrett: I declare an interest as a vegetarian.

What has been done to provide opportunities for farmers to diversify into non-meat food production and will you do all you can to promote, and to be seen to be eating, non-meat Welsh produced food at the Taste of Wales food fair? Will you tell the farmer whose produce you consume that my husband buys his own meat and that the housewife went out with the ark?

Carwyn Jones: He was not a farmer, but he shall remain nameless. On Wednesday, I was photographed and filmed eating Glamorgan sausages, which are, of course, vegetarian but not vegan. I have been filmed many times eating lamb, which, by now, I have proved

gofyn i bobl arallgyfeirio oddi ar y fferm. Os yw mab neu ferch ffermwr am adeiladu anhedd ar eu fferm, byddai'n rhaid iddynt brofi y byddai'r darn o dir yn darparu cyflogaeth llawn amser. Sut y gallant arallgyfeirio oddi ar y fferm a pharhau i adeiladu ar y fferm pan nad yw rheoliadau cynllunio yn caniatáu iddynt wneud hynny? A gytunwch fod angen inni ailystyried y rheoliadau cynllunio er mwyn galluogi meibion a merched ffermwyr i aros ar y fferm, sicrhau cyflogaeth o ffermio ac arallgyfeirio oddi ar y fferm?

Carwyn Jones: Ar ddiwedd fy natganiad dywedais bod ymchwiliad wedi dechrau mewn nifer o feysydd, yn cynnwys yr economi wledig, y system gynllunio a datblygiad effaith isel. Felly, nid yw'n fater o'r drws wedi cau. Rhaid inni ymchwilio ymhellach i'r hyn y gellir ei wneud i dargedu datblygiad yn briodol. Deallaf pam fod awdurdodau lleol yn bryderus. Petawn yn aelod o Gyngor Gwynedd byddwn yn poeni y byddai caniatáu i nifer o anhedd-dai gael eu datblygu arwain at bobl o'r tu allan i'r ardal yn eu prynu. Mae hynny'n fater pwysig yng Ngwynedd. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gan awdurdodau lleol ddewis ac nad ydynt yn teimlo o dan bwysau i roi caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer anhedd-dai pan fyddant o'r farn na fyddai hynny o fudd i'r gymuned. Mater i Wynedd yw hynny, ac nid wyf am dynnu hynny oddi ar y cyngor.

Lorraine Barrett: Datganaf fuddiant fel llysieuwraig.

Beth a wnaed i ddarparu cyfleoedd i ffermwyr arallgyfeirio i gynhyrchu bwydydd nad ydynt yn gig ac a wnewch bopeth y gallwch i hybu, a chael eich gweld yn bwyta, cynnyrch bwyd Cymreig nad yw'n gig yn ffair fwyd Blas ar Gymru? A wnewch chi ddweud wrth y ffermwr y buoch yn bwyta ei gynnyrch bod fy ngŵr yn prynu ei gig ei hun a diflannodd y wraig tŷ gyda'r arch?

Carwyn Jones: Nid ffermwr ydoedd, ac ni ddatgelaf ei enw. Ddydd Mercher, tynnwyd fy llun, a chefais fy ffilmio yn bwyta selsig Morgannwg sydd, wrth gwrs, yn selsig llysieuol ond nid yn rhai fegan. Cefais fy ffilmio sawl tro yn bwyta cig oen ac yr wyf,

that I enjoy. It also proves that I am not a vegetarian. You raised an important point. Wales produces excellent non-meat products. When the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee considered diversification, the most promising area in terms of agricultural production was organic vegetables. These are imported, even though they can be grown in Wales, with the exception of some varieties. We are talking about root vegetables, mushrooms—which are not technically vegetables—and other produce, which could be grown profitably by farmers in Wales. However, because of the way in which the system sometimes operates, it is not an area to which they have given much consideration. It is something that we must encourage, because the broader the base, the better the industry.

David Melding: As I fear that I drink more than the average consumer, I declare an interest.

Do you believe that it would be a good development to establish a Welsh wine co-operative? It is sadly the case that Wales does not have a winery, and all Welsh vines are usually taken to Gloucestershire for processing. Are we not missing a vital marketing opportunity in not processing Welsh wine in Wales?

Carwyn Jones: You are absolutely right. I was saddened by the news that Cariad might stop producing wine. It is the most well-known Welsh wine brand. I do not know whether it is still the case, but there was a suggestion that the company might stop producing wine. However, the point made to me at that time was that Wales needs a winery. The Assembly cannot set this up of its own accord, but there are now enough wine producers in Wales to join together and—as I said to the auctioneers—come forward with sensible proposals, and the door will be open in terms of support. We sometimes forget that I am also the Minister responsible for alcoholic drink, and I have occasionally tried to promote that.

erbyn hyn, wedi profi fy mod yn ei fwynhau. Mae hefyd yn profi nad wyf yn llysieuwr. Codwyd pwynt pwysig gennych. Mae Cymru yn cynhyrchu cynnyrch gwych nad yw'n gig. Pan fu'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn ystyried arallgyfeirio, y maes mwyaf addawol yn nhermau cynnyrch amaethyddol oedd llysiau organig. Caiff y rhain eu mewnforio, er y gellir eu tyfu yng Nghymru, ac eithrio rhai mathau. Yr ydym yn sôn am llysiau gwraidd, madarch—er nad ydynt yn llysiau mewn gwirionedd—a chynnyrch arall, y gellid eu tyfu er elw gan ffermwyr yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd y ffordd y mae'r system yn gweithredu weithiau, nid yw'n faes y rhoddwyd llawer o ystyriaeth iddo. Mae'n rhywbeth y dylem ei annog, oherwydd po fwyaf eang yw'r sylfaen, po fwyaf llewyrchus fydd y diwylliant.

David Melding: Am fy mod yn ofni fy mod yn yfed mwy na'r defnyddiwr arferol, datganaf fuddiant.

A gredwch y byddai'n ddatblygiad da sefydlu cydweithrediaeth gwin Cymreig? Yn anffodus nid oes gan Gymru winllan i brosesu gwin, ac fel arfer cludir gwinwydd o Gymru i Swydd Gaerloyw i'w prosesu. A ydym yn anwybyddu cyfle marchnata allweddol am nad ydym yn prosesu gwin Cymreig yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle. Fe'm tristhawyd gan y newyddion y gallai Cariad roi'r gorau i gynhyrchu gwin. Dyma'r brand gwin Cymreig mwyaf adnabyddus. Ni wn a yw hyn yn dal i fod yn wir, ond bu awgrym y gallai'r cwmni roi'r gorau i gynhyrchu gwin. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt a wnaed imi ar y pryd oedd bod angen gwinllan ar Gymru. Ni all y Cynulliad sefydlu hyn ei hun, ond erbyn hyn mae digon o gynhyrchwyr gwin yng Nghymru i ddod at ei gilydd a—fel y dywedais wrth yr arwerthwyr—chyflwyno cynigion synhwyrol, a bydd y drws ar agor yn nhermau cymorth. Yr ydym weithiau yn anghofio fy mod hefyd yn Weinidog sy'n gyfrifol am ddiod alcoholig, ac yr wyf wedi ceisio hybu hynny yn achlysurol.

10:15 a.m.

Alun Pugh: The people of Llanddulas are grateful for your personal contribution to the disposal of light lambs.

In areas of Wales, such as Snowdon and the Glyders, we have world-class landscapes, but as you know Carwyn, it is desperately hard to make a living from agriculture. Given the number of jobs supported by tourism, would you accept that these areas are best viewed as areas for recreation and tourism, and that agricultural effort should be channelled into schemes of the Tir Gofal kind to support this primary purpose?

Carwyn Jones: I did not personally dispose of the lambs in Llanddulas, even though it may appear that I have tried over the last few months. On the landscape, I do not see a contradiction between farming and tourism. For too long people have lived in bunkers in terms of these two parts of the rural economy. People still say to me that the two cannot co-exist, which is utter nonsense. Foot and mouth disease emphasised the rural economy's inter-dependence on its different factors. Tourism is valuable to the Welsh rural and urban economy. We should be establishing a farming system where people can make a living, but which also encourages tourism. We also need to tell people that they can get involved in both. We have fine examples in Wales of people who farm, while also being involved in the tourism industry, and that should be encouraged.

Glyn Davies: Your statement today is another stepping stone in the process of diversifying the rural economy. Do you agree that successful diversification of the rural economy is more than diversification of the agricultural economy? It includes manufacturing jobs in small market towns, expansion of the University of Wales, Aberystwyth, improvement in the transport system, and a great investment in the information technology network. We must look at everything if we are ever to achieve successful diversification in the rural economy.

Carwyn Jones: I agree. The Agriculture and

Alun Pugh: Mae pobl Llanddulas yn ddiolchgar am eich cyfraniad personol i'r broses o waredu ŵyn ysgafn.

Mewn rhai ardaloedd o Gymru, fel Eryri a'r Glyderau, mae gennym dirluniau heb eu hail, ond fel y gwyddoch Carwyn, mae'n eithriadol o anodd gwneud bywoliaeth o amaethyddiaeth. O ystyried nifer y swyddi a gefnogir gan dwristiaeth, a dderbyniwch y dylid ystyried yr ardaloedd hynny ar gyfer hamdden a thwristiaeth, ac y dylid sianelu'r ymdrech amaethyddol i gynlluniau fel Tir Gofal er mwyn cefnogi'r pwrpas sylfaenol hwn?

Carwyn Jones: Nid oeddwn yn bersonol gyfrifol am waredu'r ŵyn yn Llanddulas, er y gallai ymddangos fel fy mod wedi ceisio gwneud hynny dros yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf. O ran y tirlun, ni welaf wrthgyferbyniad rhwng ffermio a thwristiaeth. Ers yn rhy hir, mae safbwyntau pobl wedi'u pegynnu yn nhermau'r ddwy ran hon o'r economi wledig. Mae pobl yn dwued wrthyf o hyd na all y ddau gyd-fodoli, sy'n nonsens llwyr. Pwysleisiodd clwy'r traed a'r genau ddibyniaeth yr economi wledig ar ei ffactorau gwahanol. Mae twristiaeth yn werthfawr i economi wledig a threfol Cymru. Dylem fod yn sefydlu system ffermio lle gall pobl wneud bywoliaeth, ond sydd hefyd yn annog twristiaeth. Mae angen inni hefyd ddweud wrth bobl y gallant ymgymryd â'r naill a'r llall. Mae gennym enghreifftiau gwych yng Nghymru o bobl sy'n ffermio, sydd hefyd yn cyfrannu i'r diwydiant twristiaeth, a dylid annog hynny.

Glyn Davies: Mae eich datganiad heddiw yn gam arall ymlaen yn y broses o arallgyfeirio yn yr economi wledig. A gytunwch fod arallgyfeirio'r economi wledig yn llwyddiannus yn fwy nag arallgyfeirio'r economi amaethyddol? Mae'n cynnwys swyddi gweithgynhyrchu mewn trefi marchnad bach, ehangu Prifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth, gwella'r system drafndiaeth, a buddsoddiad sylweddol yn y rhwydwaith technoleg gwybodaeth. Rhaid inni edrych ar bopeth os ydym fyth am sicrhau arallgyfeirio llwyddiannus yn yr economi wledig.

Carwyn Jones: Cytunaf â chi. Mae'r

Rural Development Committee has discussed agriculture to a great extent for good reason, as you know Glyn, particularly in the last year. However, we must remember that other parts of the Committee's remit, such as fisheries, forestry, food development, and retaining an overview of the general rural economy, perhaps need more consideration. You and I probably agree on that. Although farming is an important and integral part of the rural economy it is not the only factor to be considered. We must remember that many other jobs in the rural economy are sustained by tourism, and therefore we must ensure that we have an integrated approach. Fortunately, we have the advantage not enjoyed by Whitehall, for example, of our departments being able to communicate across a corridor rather than across London. This is the same for Ministers, and the challenge for us in the future will be to ensure that we view the rural economy as a whole, rather than taking out the different constituent parts, and concentrating on them at the exclusion of other parts.

Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig wedi trafod amaethyddiaeth yn helaeth a hynny'n haeddiannol, fel y gwyddoch Glyn, yn arbennig yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio y dylid rhoi mwy o ystyriaeth efallai i rannau eraill o gylch gwaith y Pwyllgor, fel y pysgodfeydd, coedwigaeth, datblygu bwyd a chynnal trosolwg o'r economi wledig yn gyffredinol. Mae'n debyg eich bod chi a minnau'n cytuno ar hynny. Er bod ffermio'n rhan bwysig a hanfodol o'r economi wledig nid dyma yw'r unig ffactor i'w ystyried. Rhaid inni gofio bod twristiaeth yn cynnal llawer o swyddi eraill yn yr economi wledig, ac felly rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym ymagwedd integreiddiedig. Yn ffodus, mae gennym fantais dros Whitehall, er enghraifft, gan fod ein hadrannau yn gallu cyfathrebu ar draws coridor yn hytrach nag ar draws Llundain. Mae hynny'n wir am y Gweinidogion hefyd, a'r her inni yn y dyfodol fydd sicrhau ein bod yn ystyried yr economi wledig yn ei chyfanrwydd, yn hytrach na thrafod gwahanol rannau'n unigol, a chanolbwyntio arnynt tra'n eithrio rhannau eraill.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Uchafswm y Lefelau o Waddod mewn Cnydau, Bwydydd a Phorthiant) (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) (Rhif 3) 2001
Approval of the Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuffs) (England and Wales) (Amendment) (No. 3) Regulations 2001

Y Llywydd: Nid oes yr un siaradwr ar y rheoliadau hyn, felly, galwaf ar y Gweinidog i gynnig y cynnig.

The Presiding Officer: There are no speakers on these regulations, therefore, I call on the Minister to propose the motion.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Cynigaf fod

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23.10, yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Uchafswm y lefelau o waddod mewn Cnydau, Bwydydd a Phorthiant) (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) (Rhif 3) 2001, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM869)

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 23.10, approves the Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuffs) (England and Wales) (Amendment) (No. 3) Regulations 2001, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001. (NDM869)

*Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
 Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Hancock, Brian
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Diogelu Planhigion (Diwygio) (Rhif 3)
2001**

**Approval of the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) (No. 3) Regulations
2001**

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order Nos. 22.25, 23.10 and 23.1, approves the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) (No.3) Regulations 2001, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001. (NDM870)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 22.25, 23.10 a 23.11, yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Diogelu Planhigion (Diwygio) (Rhif 3) 2001, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM870)

Y Llywydd: Cynigir y cynnig hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ac felly nid yw'n

The Presiding Officer: This motion is proposed under Standing Order No. 22.25,

destun dadl.

and is therefore not subject to debate.

Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Hancock, Brian
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 10.16 a.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 10.16 a.m.

Adroddiad Blynnyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio **The Audit Committee's Annual Report**

Janet Davies: I propose that

Janet Davies: Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly notes the annual y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi adroddiad

report of the Audit Committee, which was laid in the Table Office on 19 November 2001. (NDM871)

It gives me great pleasure to introduce the annual report of the National Assembly's Audit Committee. The Audit Committee fulfils an important role as the public's financial watchdog in regard to the Assembly and its sponsored bodies, assuring the people of Wales that their money has been spent properly and effectively in providing public services and with a view to securing value for money for the taxpayer. I hope that you will agree that the annual report demonstrates that we have made a significant impact in this respect.

I am proud to have chaired such an important Committee for the past two years and I thank a number of people for their contribution to its work. First, I acknowledge the commitment and enthusiasm demonstrated by Assembly Members from all parties who have played a part in the Committee during this year. Their hard work, attention to detail, and focus on improving financial accountability in Wales rather than furthering party political considerations, has helped to ensure that our evidence-taking sessions with officials have been productive, and our reports have carried full weight, with a united and purposeful Committee behind them.

I also pay tribute to the high standard of service provided by the Auditor General for Wales, Sir John Bourn, and the National Audit Office. Their work has proved invaluable in enabling us to carry out our role effectively and to identify the important issues that need addressing. I also take this opportunity to thank Jon Shortridge and the other officials who have appeared before the Committee. Without exception, they have been co-operative and constructive, and have accepted our comments in the spirit in which they were intended. We are grateful for their positive approach.

This year has been productive for the Audit Committee, with a wide-ranging work programme covering a number of important areas of public expenditure in Wales. We

blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM871)

Rhydd bleser mawr imi gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol Pwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Cyflawna'r Pwyllgor Archwilio rôl bwysig fel pwyllgor gwarchod ariannol y cyhoedd o ran y Cynulliad a'i gyrrff nodedig, gan sicrhau pobl Cymru y gwariwyd eu harian yn briodol ac yn effeithiol wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau i'r cyhoedd a chyda'r nod o sicrhau gwerth am arian i'r trethdalwr. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cytuno bod yr adroddiad blynyddol yn dangos inni gael effaith fawr yn hyn o beth.

Yr wyf yn falch o gadeirio Pwyllgor mor bwysig ers dwy flynedd a hoffwn ddiolch i nifer o bobl am eu cyfarniad i'w waith. Yn gyntaf, cydnabyddaf yr ymrwymiad a'r brwdfrydedd a ddangoswyd gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad o bob plaid a chwaraeodd ran yn y Pwyllgor eleni. Mae eu gwaith caled, eu sylw i fanylion, a'r modd y maent wedi canolbwyntio ar wella atebolrwydd ariannol yng Nghymru yn hytrach na hyrwyddo ystyriaethau pleidiau gwleidyddol, wedi helpu i sicrhau y bu ein sesiynau cymryd tystiolaeth gyda swyddogion yn gynhyrchiol, ac y bu ein hadroddiadau o bwys, gyda Phwyllgor unedig a phenderfynol y tu ôl iddynt.

Talaf deyrnged hefyd i safon uchel y gwasanaeth a ddarparwyd gan Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, Syr John Bourn, a'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol. Bu eu gwaith yn amhrisiadwy gan ein galluogi i gyflawni ein rôl yn effeithiol ac i nodi'r materion pwysig y mae angen ymdrin â hwy. Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn hefyd i ddiolch i Jon Shortridge a'r swyddogion eraill a ymddangosodd ger bron y Pwyllgor. Yn ddieithriad, buont yn gydweithredol ac yn adeiladol, a derbyniwyd ein sylwadau yn yr ysbryd y'u bwriadwyd. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar iddynt am eu hymagwedd gadarnhaol.

Bu'n flwyddyn gynhyrchiol i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio, gyda rhaglen waith eang yn cwmpasu nifer o feysydd pwysig o wariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Ymgwymerwyd ag

have undertaken eight formal examinations since September 2000 and have produced seven reports to date. Those reports have led to 74 separate recommendations for improving procedures to the Assembly Cabinet, thereby saving millions of pounds of the Assembly's and taxpayers' money. The Cabinet has welcomed all the Committee's reports, and has responded positively to all of its recommendations except one; its response to that recommendation was neither totally negative nor totally positive.

I am particularly pleased that many of our recommendations are applicable far more widely than simply for the body under examination at the time. We have been able to identify many issues relevant to the Assembly and its associated bodies.

On value for money, we took evidence from the Welsh Development Agency on the Auditor General's report on the creation of the enlarged agency, and the agency's support for indigenous businesses in Wales. A merger created an enlarged agency that provides economic development services throughout Wales. However, we were disappointed with the delays in designing and commissioning research into the small and medium-sized enterprise sector in Wales.

We also considered financial management and governance at Coleg Gwent. We made several recommendations in our report, and were pleased to see the Cabinet ensuring that the lessons learned from the Coleg Gwent experience were shared with the whole sector.

We have reported on the accommodation arrangements for the National Assembly. The Assembly Cabinet has accepted our recommendations for future projects, such as sensitivity analysis for economic appraisal work, setting firm budgets for capital projects and monitoring costs. The Cabinet also noted that an Assembly construction forum would be established to examine future design competitions, incentives to contain costs, the inclusion of fee bids, whole life costing and value engineering. The Committee will be following up on that report and has asked the

wyth archwiliad ffurfiol ers Medi 2000 a chynhyrchwyd saith adroddiad hyd yn hyn. Arweiniodd yr adroddiadau hyn at 74 o argymhellion ar wahân ar gyfer gwella gweithdrefnau i Gabinet y Cynulliad, gan arbed miliynau o bunnoedd o arian y Cynulliad ac arian y trethdalwyr. Croesawodd y Cabinet bob un o adroddiadau'r Pwyllgor gan ymateb yn gadarnhaol i bob un o'i argymhellion heblaw un; nid oedd ei ymateb i'r argymhelliad hwnnw yn hollol negyddol nac yn hollol gadarnhaol.

Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch bod llawer o'n hargymhellion yn berthnasol i lawer mwy o bobl na'r corff a archwilir ar y pryd. Llwyddasom i nodi sawl mater a oedd yn berthnasol i'r Cynulliad a'i gyrff cysylltiedig.

O ran gwerth am arian, cymerasom dystiolaeth oddi wrth Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ar adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol ar greu asiantaeth fwy o faint, a chefnogaeth yr asiantaeth i fusnesau cynhenid yng Nghymru. Drwy uno, crëwyd asiantaeth fwy o faint sy'n darparu gwasanaethau datblygu economaidd ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, cawsom ein siomi gan yr oedi wrth gynllunio a chomisiynu ymchwil i'r sector mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru.

Ystyriwyd hefyd reolaeth ariannol a llywodraeth yng Ngholeg Gwent. Gwnaethom sawl argymhelliad yn ein hadroddiad, ac yr oeddem yn falch o weld y Cabinet yn sicrhau bod y gwersi a ddysgwyd o ganlynaid i brofiad Coleg Gwent wedi eu rhannu gyda'r sector cyfan.

Cyflwynasom adroddiad ar drefniadau swyddfeydd ac adeiladau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Derbyniodd Cabinet y Cynulliad ein hargymhellion ar gyfer prosiectau yn y dyfodol, fel dadansoddiad sensitifrwydd ar gyfer gwaith arfarnu economaidd, pennu cyllidebau cadarn ar gyfer prosiectau cyfalaf a chostau monitro. Nododd y Cabinet hefyd y câi fforwm adeiladu'r Cynulliad ei sefydlu i archwilio cystadlaethau cynllunio yn y dyfodol, cymhellion i gynnwys costau, cynnwys cynigion ffioedd, costio ar hyd oes y cynllun

Auditor General to provide a second report for the Committee on the latest arrangements for the new building's construction.

a gwerth peirianeg. Bydd y Pwyllgor yn dilyn yr adroddiad hwnnw a gofynnodd i'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol ddarparu ail adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor ar y trefniadau diweddaraf ar gyfer gwaith adeiladu'r adeilad newydd.

10:25 a.m.

The Committee has taken evidence on the construction of the Cardiff Bay barrage, acknowledging that while it has been a memorable achievement, its impact on several issues has yet to be assessed. The Auditor General is currently finalising a report into the operation of the successor arrangements for Cardiff Bay, which the Committee hopes to consider in 2002.

Cymerodd y Pwyllgor dystiolaeth ar waith adeiladu morglawdd Bae Caerdydd, gan gydnabod bod ei effaith ar nifer o faterion heb gael ei asesu eto, er iddo fod yn gyflawniad bythgofiadwy. Mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn cwblhau adroddiad ar weithredu'r trefniadau olynol ar gyfer Bae Caerdydd ar hyn o bryd, ac mae'r Pwyllgor yn gobeithio eu hystyried yn 2002.

The Committee also reported on the Auditor General's access to records and information, concluding that there is a strong case for increasing his powers in line with those of the Comptroller and Auditor General for the United Kingdom.

Cyflwynodd y Pwyllgor adroddiad hefyd ar hawl yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol i weld cofnodion a gwybodaeth, gan ddod i'r casgliad bod achos cryf o blaid cynyddu ei bwerau yn unol â rhai'r Rheolwr a'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol ar gyfer y Deyrnas Unedig.

We held two evidence-taking sessions on clinical negligence in the NHS in Wales, and it is unacceptable that Welsh citizens face the risk of unnecessary pain and suffering, often with serious long-term consequences. The costs of clinical negligence claims are spiralling, which reduces the resources available for improving people's health. We trust that our report's scrutiny will ensure that that situation is remedied.

Cynhaliwyd dwy sesiwn cymryd tystiolaeth gennym ar esgeulustod clinigol yn yr NHS yng Nghymru, ac mae'n annerbyniol bod dinasyddion Cymru yn wynebu'r risg o boen a dioddefaint diangen, yn aml â chanlyniadau hirdymor difrifol. Mae costau esgeulustod clinigol yn codi'n gyflym, sy'n lleihau'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i wella iechyd pobl. Hyderwn y bydd ein hadroddiad craffu yn sicrhau y caiff y sefyllfa ei hunioni.

On financial audit, we have taken evidence and reported on the Assembly's resource accounts 1999-2000, and the Auditor General's financial audit of the 1999-2000 accounts. We viewed the unqualified audit opinion on the 1999-2000 resource accounts as a considerable achievement by Assembly staff, but were deeply concerned that the finance group had failed to keep the monthly bank reconciliations current. We have taken evidence on the NHS Wales summarised accounts 1999-2000, and will produce a report in the coming weeks.

O ran archwiliad ariannol, cymerasom dystiolaeth a chyflwynwyd adroddiad ar gyfrifon adnoddau'r Cynulliad ar gyfer 1999-2000, ac archwiliad ariannol yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol o gyfrifon 1999-2000. Ystyriwyd y farn archwilio ddiamod ar gyfrifon adnoddau 1999-2000 yn gyflawniad sylweddol gan staff y Cynulliad, ond yr oeddem yn pryderu llawer bod y grŵp cyllid wedi methu â diweddarau'r cysoniadau banc misol yn rheolaidd. Cymerasom dystiolaeth ar gyfrifon cryno NHS Cymru 1999-2000 a byddwn yn cynhyrchu adroddiad yn ystod yr wythnosau i ddod.

Turning to the next 12 months, the Committee will take evidence on many areas

Gan droi at y 12 mis nesaf, bydd y Pwyllgor yn cymryd tystiolaeth ar sawl maes

of the Assembly's operation, as well as following up on examinations conducted this year.

The Committee has today published its report into maximising income from prescription charges, and has begun to take evidence on the closure of the Centre for Visual Arts. We will undertake follow-up work on the successor arrangements for Cardiff Bay, and have taken evidence on procurement in the further education sector.

Over the coming year, we expect to consider the management of the NHS estate, NHS estate renewal and disposals, management of the further education estate, a review of publicly-funded support for the LG project, administration of European Union structural funding, hospital cleaning and catering services, procurement of the Assembly's information technology systems, management of the collections of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales, and trunk road maintenance.

The Committee places great importance on ensuring that its recommendations are followed so that projected savings and increased value for money are realised. With the assistance of the Auditor General, the Committee will continue to monitor the outcomes of its reports and conduct follow-up investigations, where necessary.

I am particularly proud to be involved in the Assembly's Audit Committee because of the tangible benefits that can be seen to result from its work. From only three of the Auditor General's reports over the past year that the Committee is following up, potential savings of nearly £19 million have been identified. With continued vigilance, this work will accrue over the years to provide substantial savings for the people of Wales.

Eleanor Burnham: I welcome this opportunity to speak as I am substituting for Kirsty, who is on maternity leave.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the second annual report of the Audit Committee, as it is essential in ensuring that the people of Wales get value for money from the

gweithredu yn y Cynulliad, yn ogystal â dilyn archwiliadau a gynhaliwyd eleni.

Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi cyhoeddi ei adroddiad heddiw ar sicrhau'r incwm mwyaf o daliadau presgripsiwn, ac wedi dechrau cymryd tystiolaeth ar gau'r Ganolfan ar gyfer y Celfyddydau Gweledol. Byddwn yn cynnal gwaith dilynol ar y trefniadau olynol ar gyfer Bae Caerdydd, a chymerasom dystiolaeth ar gaffael yn y sector addysg bellach.

Yn ystod y flwyddyn i ddod, yr ydym yn disgwyl ystyried y ffordd y reolir ystad yr NHS, adnewyddu a gwarediadau ystad yr NHS, rheoli'r ystad addysg bellach, ac adolygu'r cymorth a ariennir yn gyhoeddus i brosiect LG, gweinyddu cronfeydd strwythurol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, gwasanaethau glanhau ysbytai ac arlwyio, caffael systemau technoleg gwybodaeth y Cynulliad, rheoli casgliadau Amgueddfeydd ar Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru a gwaith cynnal a chadw cefnffyrdd.

Rhydd y Pwyllgor bwys mawr ar sicrhau y dilynir ei argymhellion fel y cyflawnir arbedion arfaethedig ac y cynyddir gwerth am arian. Gyda chymorth yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, bydd y Pwyllgor yn parhau i fonitro canlyniadau ei adroddiadau ac yn cynnal ymchwiliadau dilynol, lle bo angen.

Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o fod yn gysylltiedig â Phwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad oherwydd y manteision gwirioneddol sy'n amlwg yn deillio o'i waith. O ddim ond tri o adroddiadau'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol eleni y mae'r Pwyllgor yn eu dilyn, nodwyd arbedion posibl o bron £19 miliwn. Drwy barhau i fod yn wylidwrs, bydd y gwaith hwn yn cronni dros y blynyddoedd i ddarparu arbedion sylweddol i bobl Cymru.

Eleanor Burnham: Croesawaf y cyfle hwn i siarad gan fy mod yn cymryd lle Kirsty, sydd ar gyfnod mamolaeth.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu ail adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio, gan ei fod yn hanfodol i sicrhau bod pobl Cymru yn cael gwerth am arian gan

Assembly and other public bodies. It is vital that the Assembly and other public bodies operate the highest standards of financial management. The Committee should be congratulated on the broad range of issues that it has tackled over the last year.

In consideration of the Assembly's resource accounts for 1999-2000, the Committee viewed the unqualified audit opinion as a considerable achievement by Assembly staff, who coped with the introduction of resource accounting and the advent of devolution. We highlight that achievement. However, we agree with, and support the Committee's view that the finance group could have done more to foresee and manage some of the problems experienced in the 1999-2000 accounts. In light of this, we echo the Committee's welcome of the assurance given by the Permanent Secretary that arrangements and sufficient qualified staff are now in place to prepare the 2000-01 accounts to a high standard and on time.

Dafydd Wigley: Croesawaf yr adroddiad a diolchaf ar ran aelodau'r Pwyllgor i Janet Davies am ei gwaith fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor drwy'r flwyddyn. Mae'r gwaith yn cynnwys llawer o amser y tu allan i gyfarfodydd ffurfiol y Pwyllgor yn ystyried materion y gellir eu cyflwyno. Yr ydym yn falch, o fewn y Pwyllgor, ein bod yn llwyddo hyd yma i fynd ar ôl materion o bwys i'r Cynulliad fel corff ac i bobl Cymru, ac nad ydym yn rhannu ar sail pleidiol-wleidyddol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn parhau ar hyd y llinellau hynny.

Mae Janet wedi amlinellu'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd yn ystod y flwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am danlinellu rhai pethau ac efallai ychwanegu atynt. Yn gyntaf, mae Janet yn llygad ei lle wrth gyfeirio at bwysigrwydd sicrhau nad ydym yn caniatáu i adroddiadau fynd yn angof. Y peth pwysig, sydd yn gyfrifoldeb ar y Llywodraeth, y Gweinidogion a'r gweision sifil o fewn yr adrannau perthnasol, yw fod gwaith pwrpasol a phenderfynol i sicrhau'r arbedion ariannol posibl yn cael ei wneud. Mae rhai o'r arbedion hyn yn sylweddol. Er enghraifft, cyfeiriodd Janet at £18.9 miliwn y flwyddyn—hynny yw, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn—y gellid ei arbed o ddim ond rhai

y Cynulliad a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill. Mae'n holl bwysig bod y Cynulliad a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill yn gweithredu i'r safonau uchaf o reolaeth ariannol. Dylid llongyfarch y Pwyllgor ar yr ystod eang o faterion yr aeth i'r afael â hwy dros y misoedd diwethaf.

Wrth ystyried cyfrifon adnoddau'r Cynulliad ar gyfer 1999-2000, yr oedd y farn archwilio ddiamod yn dipyn o gyflawniad gan staff y Cynulliad, ym marn y Pwyllgor, a lwyddodd i ymdopi â chyflwyno cyfrifon adnoddau a dyfodiad datganoli. Pwysleisiwn y cyflawniad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, cefnogwn a chytunwn â barn y Pwyllgor y gallai'r grŵp cyllid fod wedi gwneud mwy i ragweld a rheoli rhai o'r problemau a gafwyd gyda chyfrifon 1999-2000. Yng ngoleuni hyn, adlesiwn y croeso a roddodd y Pwyllgor i'r sicrwydd a roddwyd gan yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol fod trefniadau ar waith a digon o staff cymwys ar gael erbyn hyn i baratoi cyfrifon 2000-01 i safon uchel ac ar amser.

Dafydd Wigley: I welcome the report and thank Janet Davies on behalf of Committee members for her work as Committee Chair throughout the year. The work includes much time spent outside the Committee's formal sittings giving consideration to matters that may arise. We are pleased, within the Committee, that we have thus far succeeded in pursuing issues of importance to the Assembly as an organisation and to the people of Wales, and that we have not divided along party political lines. It is important that we continue along those lines.

Janet has outlined the work done during the year. However, I will underline and perhaps add to some points. First, Janet is absolutely correct in referring to the importance of ensuring that we do not allow reports to be forgotten. The important thing, which is a responsibility for the Government, the Ministers and the civil servants in the relevant departments, is that purposeful and decisive work is carried out to achieve the potential financial savings. Some of these savings are substantial ones. For example, Janet mentioned the £18.9 million per year—that is, year upon year—that could be saved from just a few of the reports that come before the Committee this year. The report on

o'r adroddiadau sydd wedi dod gerbron y Pwyllgor eleni. Mae'r adroddiad ar incwm presgripsiynau yn unig yn enghraifft o arbedion posibl o £15 miliwn y flwyddyn. Ni fydd hynny'n lleihau'r gwasanaeth sydd yn cael ei roi i bobl, nac ar eu hawlau i gael presgripsiwn ond bydd yn sicrhau bod yr arian sydd i fod i ddod i'r coffrau cyhoeddus yn cyrraedd. Mae cyfeiriad eto at y potensial aruthrol i arbed arian o safbwynt esgeulustod. Mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau—er lles y cleifion gymaint ag er lles pwr y wlad—nad yw'r esgeulustod eto yn digwydd. Mae'n bwysig ceisio ffordd i osgoi hynny.

Un mater a fu ar ein agenda hirdymor sydd heb ddod gerbron eto—a gwn fod arbedion sylweddol i'w cael ohono—yw'r modd yr ydym yn sicrhau a phwrcasu cyffuriau ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Nid yw'r mater ar ein rhestr waith ar gyfer eleni na'r flwyddyn nesaf, ond gobeithiaf y bydd symud ymlaen arno yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf oherwydd yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig bod miliynau lawer o bunnoedd o arbedion ar gael o'r cyfeiriad hwnnw.

Pan benodwyd Syr John Bourn a'i dîm, addawodd y byddai'n sicrhau arbedion i'r pwr cyhoeddus o saith gwaith cost rhedeg ei adran. Dengys y dystiolaeth sydd gennym hyd yma fod hynny, a mwy, yn bosibl. Mae'n tanlinellu pwysigrwydd y gwaith. Er enghraifft, yr ydym wedi trafod pwrcasu a chaffael o fewn y sector addysg bellach, ac wedi cael gwrandawriad ar hynny. Yr oedd yn ddifyr gwrandawriad ar Steve Martin yn cyfeirio at y ffaith bod posibilrwydd o arbed 3 y cant y flwyddyn o'r cyllidebau hyn. Mae hynny'n dangos potensial aruthrol i sicrhau arbedion. O wneud hynny, fe fydd yr arian yn aros o fewn yr adran i'w ddefnyddio mewn ffordd mwy effeithiol er lles y bobl sydd i fod i fanteisio ohono.

10:35 a.m.

One matter that I would like to refer to, Janet—I do not know if she will be winding-up this debate—is the ongoing consideration regarding the Ferry Road site previously owned by the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation, which did not, as I understand it, want to sell it to Cardiff City and County Council. This is a matter of ongoing concern,

income from prescriptions alone is an example of possible savings of £15 million per annum. That will not diminish the service provided to people, nor their right to prescriptions, but it will ensure that funding meant for the public coffers reaches its target. There is another reference to the enormous potential for saving money with regard to clinical negligence. We must ensure—for the benefit of the patients as much as the public purse—that that negligence does not reoccur. It is important to seek a means of avoiding that.

One matter that has been on our long-term agenda but has not yet arisen—and I know that there are substantial savings to be made from it—is the means by which we obtain and purchase drugs for the national health service. The matter is not on our work schedule for this year nor the next, but I hope that progress will be made on it during the coming year as I am convinced that there are millions of pounds of savings to be made in this area.

When we appointed Sir John Bourn and his team, he promised to ensure savings to the public purse of seven times the cost of running his department. The evidence that we have so far shows that that, and more, is possible. It underlines the importance of the work. For example, we have discussed purchasing and procurement in the further education sector, and we held a hearing on that. It was interesting to listen to Steve Martin refer to the fact that it is possible to save 3 per cent per annum from those budgets. That shows the enormous potential to make savings. By doing so, the money will remain within the department to be used in a more effective way for the benefit of the people who should benefit from it.

Un mater yr hoffwn gyfeirio ato, Janet—ni wn ai hi fydd yn dirwyn y ddadl hon i ben—yw'r ystyriaeth barhaus o ran safle Ferry Road yr oedd Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd yn berchen arno cyn hynny, nad oedd, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallais, am ei werthu i Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd. Mae hwn yn fater sy'n achosi pryder parhaus, ac yr wyf yn

and I am aware that it has arisen in other Committees, not just the Audit Committee. However, it is obviously important to the Audit Committee. It was originally valued at £16.5 million but, by a series of decisions, it became a cashless transaction. The final figure of £5 million was foregone to give Cardiff council the asset, on the basis that it was to provide community facilities. There is no evidence that those community facilities are forthcoming. That decision was taken by the previous First Secretary and there is a possible conflict of interests, because it was in his constituency. However, that is always difficult for any government minister.

ymwybodol ei fod wedi codi mewn Pwyllgorau eraill, nid y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn unig. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg yn bwysig i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. Fe'i prisiwyd yn wreiddiol ar £16.5 miliwn ond, drwy gyfres o benderfyniadau, daeth yn drafodyn anariannol. Rhagwelwyd y ffigur terfynol o £5 miliwn i roi'r ased i gyngor Caerdydd, ar y sail bod yn rhaid iddo ddarparu cyfleusterau cymunedol. Nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth bod y cyfleusterau cymunedol hynny ar y gweill. Cymerwyd y penderfyniad hwnnw gan y cyn Brif Ysgrifenydd, ac mae gwrthdaro buddiannau o bosibl, gan ei fod yn ei etholaeth ef. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n anodd bob tro i unrhyw weinidog yn y llywodraeth.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You need to wind up now.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben yn awr.

Dafydd Wigley: I know that a question about this matter was put to Jon Shortridge in an earlier hearing this year. It is a matter of concern, to which we will no doubt return in the coming year.

Dafydd Wigley: Gwn y gofynnwyd cwestiwn ynglŷn â'r mater hwn i Jon Shortridge mewn gwrandawriad cynharach eleni. Mae'n fater sy'n achosi pryder, ac yn ddiau byddwn yn dychwelyd ato yn y flwyddyn i ddod.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Peter Law.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Peter Law.

Peter Law: I do not want to speak in this debate, Deputy Presiding Officer.

Peter Law: Nid wyf am siarad yn y ddadl hon, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Alun Cairns.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Alun Cairns.

Alun Cairns: It is easy to mix us up, Dirprwy Lywydd. [*Laughter.*]

Alun Cairns: Mae'n hawdd drysu rhwng y ddau ohonom, Ddirprwy Lywydd. [*Chwerthin.*]

I thank and congratulate Janet Davies for her chairing of the Audit Committee. It is one of the more successful National Assembly Committees. People ask me what benefits devolution has brought: the role of the Audit Committee and the manner in which it conducts its business under Janet's leadership is tangible evidence of a benefit. Mention has already been made of £19 million in savings this year, which will be compounded next year and thereafter. Another benefit is the great responsibility of scrutinising the financial position of many of the Assembly's quangos. I also pay tribute to the clerks who have supported Janet and to Sir John Bourn, the Auditor General for Wales. He told us, in

Hoffwn ddiolch i Janet Davies am gadeirio'r Pwyllgor Archwilio a'i llongyfarch ar ei gwaith. Mae'n un o Bwyllgorau mwyaf llwyddiannus y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae pobl yn gofyn imi pa fuddiannau a ddaeth yn sgîl datganoli: mae rôl y Pwyllgor Archwilio a'r ffordd y mae'n cynnal ei fusnes o dan arweinyddiaeth Janet yn dystiolaeth wirioneddol o fudd o'r fath. Soniwyd eisoes am y £19 miliwn mewn arbedion eleni, yr ychwanegir atynt y flwyddyn nesaf a'r flwyddyn ganlynol. Un budd arall yw'r cyfrifoldeb mawr o graffu ar sefyllfa ariannol llawer o gwangos y Cynulliad. Talaf deyrnged hefyd i'r clerod sydd wedi cefnogi Janet ac i Syr John Bourn, Archwilydd

one of the first meetings of the Audit Committee, that the ratio of savings from efficiency and financial gains in public services against our investment in his services is 7:1. I raised that with him at the last meeting a week ago and he confidently predicted that those figures are being achieved. That £19 million is a tangible demonstration of the large sums that the Audit Committee can save the Welsh taxpayer, which could be diverted to essential services.

I have a concern about how the Audit Committee has been forced to handle its business in relation to the witnesses who come before us. We do not have the powers of the Westminster Public Accounts Committee to summon witnesses, which has been regrettable on many occasions. Until now it has not hampered the Audit Committee's work because we have usually had the co-operation of the witnesses that we need to call. One example of that is the Cardiff bay investigation, where Michael Boyce, the former chief executive of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation, was under no obligation to come to the Committee. However, he was happy to come to help the Committee with its deliberations. Last week, we found ourselves in a similar position, when we questioned an Assembly quango chief executive who had been in post for only six weeks and we could not question him on the activities and decisions taken in the previous five or six years. I hope that the Assembly's review of procedure will consider the powers of the Audit Committee. There is a view that the Audit Committee can ask the Westminster Public Accounts Committee to summon witnesses on its behalf and bring them before the Audit Committee. That needs clarifying because it may mean that we will need to explore the use of those powers.

We covered a range of issues this year. I was grateful to Dafydd Wigley for mentioning the Cardiff bay development, where there were questionable arrangements. I am sure that recommendations are being taken on board by the Assembly's administration. The successor arrangements for the Cardiff bay

Cyffredinol Cymru. Dywedodd wrthym, yn un o gyfarfodydd cyntaf y Pwyllgor Archwilio, fod cymhareb yr arbedion o effeithlonrwydd ac enillion ariannol mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o'i chymharu â'n buddsoddiad yn ei wasanaethau yn 7:1. Codais y mater hwnnw gydag ef yn y cyfarfod diwethaf wythnos yn ôl ac yr oedd yn hyderus y câi'r ffigurau hynny eu cyflawni. Mae'r £19 miliwn hynny yn enghraifft wirioneddol o'r symiau mawr y gall y Pwyllgor Archwilio eu harbed i drethdalwyr Cymru, y gellid eu dargyfeirio i wasanaethau hanfodol.

Mae gennyf bryder ynglŷn â'r ffordd y gorfodwyd y Pwyllgor Archwilio i drafod ei fusnes mewn perthynas â'r tystion a ddaw ger ein bron. Ni feddwn ar bwerau Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus San Steffan i alw tystion, a bu hyn yn drueni ar sawl achlysur. Hyd yn hyn nid yw wedi rhwystro gwaith y Pwyllgor Archwilio gan ein bod fel arfer wedi cael cydweithrediad y tystion y bu'n rhaid inni eu galw. Un enghraifft o hynny yw'r ymchwiliad i Fae Caerdydd, lle nad oedd unrhyw rwymedigaeth i Michael Boyce, cyn brif weithredwr Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, ddod ger bron y Pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yn fodlon dod i helpu'r Pwyllgor gyda'i benderfyniadau. Yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddem mewn sefyllfa debyg, pan holwyd prif weithredwr un o gwangos y Cynulliad a oedd wedi bod yn ei swydd am chwe wythnos yn unig ac ni allem ei holi ar y gweithgareddau a'r penderfyniadau a gymerwyd yn y pum neu'r chwe blynedd blaenorol. Gobeithiaf y bydd adolygiad y Cynulliad o weithdrefn yn ystyried pwerau'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. Arddelir barn y gall y Pwyllgor Archwilio ofyn i Bwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus San Steffan wysio tystion ar ei ran a'u dwyn gerbron y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Mae angen egluro hynny oherwydd gall olygu y bydd angen inni ymchwilio i'r defnydd o'r pwerau hynny.

Cwmpaswyd ystod o faterion eleni. Yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar i Dafydd Wigley am sôn am ddatblygiad Bae Caerdydd, lle yr oedd trefniadau dadleuol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff yr argymhellion eu hystyried gan weinyddiaeth y Cynulliad. Bydd y trefniadau olynol ar gyfer datblygu Bae Caerdydd yn

development will be interesting. Many Members will recall that I made some serious allegations, or raised some serious questions, some time ago on Cardiff bay. The Audit Committee will give me the opportunity to vindicate my points. The Economic Development Committee yesterday also discussed many of those points, but I do not want to prejudice the hearing of those successor arrangements. I am sure that we will return to that in next year's annual report.

During the debate on last year's annual report, I mentioned the tendency of some witnesses to give rambling answers. I provoked the point that perhaps these rambling answers were given to talk out the Committee's time. I am pleased to say that that has not happened to the same extent this year. I congratulate the witnesses who give evidence to the Committee regularly and those who are more familiar with the system than others. I thank them for their support.

There is no need for any witness who comes before the Committee to be defensive. We all have the same aim: we all want the most efficient services and propriety in our financial arrangements. That is the purpose of the Audit Committee. The way in which the Chair manages the Committee demonstrates that. The Committee is not run on a political basis. Politics has not come into our discussions, even those on contentious issues such as the Assembly building, which we have discussed on brief occasions, and other topics that I have mentioned. I commend the report.

Janet Davies: I will be fairly brief. I thank Eleanor for her comments. I understand that the monthly bank reconciliations are now kept up to date, so there is no longer a problem with them. I was pleased that Dafydd mentioned the NHS savings and clinical negligence. That money comes out of the health service and, given its current state, it is important that there is less of a drain. I will note your comments on the purchase of drugs. I think we will have a session on that in the future. However, we only have so many evidence-taking sessions in a year and if we decide to include one topic, another

ddiddorol. Bydd llawer o'r Aelodau yn cofio imi wneud rhai honiadau difrifol, neu godi rhai cwestiynau difrifol, beth amser yn ôl ar Fae Caerdydd. Bydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn rhoi'r cyfle imi gyfiawnhau fy mhwyntiau. Trafododd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ddoe hefyd lawer o'r pwyntiau hynny, ond nid wyf am ragfarnu gwrandawriad y trefniadau olynol hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr y dychwelwn at hynny yn adroddiad blynyddol y flwyddyn nesaf.

Yn ystod y ddadl ar adroddiad blynyddol y llynedd, soniais am duedd rhai tystion i roi atebion hir. Pwysleisiais y pwynt fod yr atebion hir hyn yn cael eu rhoi i fynd ag amser y Pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud nad yw hyn wedi digwydd i'r un graddau eleni. Hoffwn longyfarch y tystion sy'n rhoi tystiolaeth yn rheolaidd i'r Pwyllgor a'r rheini sy'n fwy cyfarwydd â'r system nag eraill. Diolchaf iddynt am eu cefnogaeth.

Nid oes angen i unrhyw dyst a ddaw ger bron y Pwyllgor ymddwyn yn amddiffynnol. Yr un nod sydd gan bob un ohonom: yr ydym eisiau'r gwasanaethau mwyaf effeithlon a chywirdeb yn ein trefniadau ariannol. Dyna bwrpas y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Mae'r ffordd y rheola'r Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn enghraifft o hynny. Ni chaiff y Pwyllgor ei redeg ar sail wleidyddol. Nid yw gwleidyddiaeth wedi bod yn rhan o'n trafodaethau, hyd yn oed ar faterion dadleuol fel adeilad y Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi ei drafod ar adegau, a phynciau eraill a grybwyllais. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad.

Janet Davies: Byddaf yn weddol fyr. Hoffwn ddiolch i Eleanor am ei sylwadau. Deallaf fod y cysoniadau banc misol bellach yn cael eu diweddarau'n gyson, felly nid yw hyn yn broblem mwyach. Yr oeddwn yn falch bod Dafydd wedi sôn am arbedion yr NHS ac esgeulustod clinigol. Daw'r arian hwnnw o'r gwasanaeth iechyd ac, o gofio ei gyflwr presennol, mae'n bwysig bod llai o dreth ar yr arian. Nodaf eich sylwadau ar brynu cyffuriau. Credaf y cawn sesiwn ar hynny yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, dim ond rhywfaint o sesiynau cymryd tystiolaeth a gawn mewn blwyddyn ac os penderfynwn

must be left out.

The details of what happened regarding the Ferry Road site are in the public domain. It is for Subject Committees to follow up this issue. The way in which the site was transferred was a policy decision, and the Audit Committee cannot comment on that. I understand that it was a decision by the full Cabinet. The Committee can only oversee how decisions are made.

I am grateful for Alun's comments, and particularly for reminding me to thank the clerks. Andrew George was the Committee's clerk until a year ago, when Russell Keith took over. They have both served the Committee admirably. I thank them for that. As some Members know, Russell came here from Australia and he is returning there in a few days. We wish him well.

On witnesses, we can only invite some kinds of witnesses. We can only summon those who have direct responsibility and are still in post. I am meeting the Permanent Secretary in the next few days to discuss this, at his request. It would be helpful to have clarification on this issue.

gynnwys un pwnc, rhaid hepgor un arall.

Mae manylion yr hyn a ddigwyddodd o ran safle Ferry Road yn eiddo i'r cyhoedd. Y Pwyllgorau Pwnc fydd yn penderfynu a ddylid dilyn y mater hwn ai peidio. Yr oedd y ffordd y trosglwyddwyd y safle yn benderfyniad polisi, ac ni all y Pwyllgor Archwilio roi ei sylwadau ar hynny. Deallaf mai penderfyniad gan y Cabinet llawn ydoedd. Dim ond goruchwyllo'r ffordd y caiff penderfyniadau eu gwneud y gall y Pwyllgor ei wneud.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am sylwadau Alun, ac yn arbennig am fy atgoffa i ddiolch i'r clerod. Andrew George oedd clerc y Pwyllgor tan flwyddyn yn ôl pan benodwyd Russell Keith yn ei le. Mae'r ddau wedi gwasanaethu'r Pwyllgor yn dda dros ben. Diolchaf iddynt am hynny. Fel y gŵyr rhai o'r Aelodau, daeth Russell yma o Awstralia ac mae'n dychwelyd yno ymhen ychydig ddyddiau. Dymunwn yn dda iddo.

O ran tystion, dim ond rhai mathau o dystion y gallwn eu gwahodd. Dim ond y rheini sydd â chyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol ac sydd yn eu swyddi o hyd y gallwn eu galw. Yr wyf yn cyfarfod â'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yn yr ychydig ddyddiau nesaf i drafod hyn, ar ei gais ef. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol cael eglurhad ar y mater hwn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian

Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Adolygiad Pum Mlynedd o Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru Quinquennial Review of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly welcomes the completion of the quinquennial review of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales and the Government of the National Assembly for Wales's response to the review's recommendations. (NDM872)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn croesawu'r ffaith fod yr adolygiad pum mlynedd o Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru wedi ei gwblhau, a sylwadau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar argymhellion yr adolygiad. (NDM872)

I am pleased to present this quinquennial review report to my Assembly colleagues. The review of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales was conducted by a team led by Dr Peter Watt from the School of Public Policy at the University of Birmingham. I thank him and his colleagues for their thoroughness and hard work. I also thank the president of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales, members of its court and council, the director and her staff, and all who contributed and commented on the report. As I said in my comments on the

Yr wyf yn falch i gyflwyno yr adroddiad adolygiad pum mlynedd hwn i'm cyd-Aelodau. Cynhaliwyd yr adolygiad ar Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru gan dîm o dan arweiniad Dr Peter Watt o Ysgol Polisi Cyhoeddus Prifysgol Birmingham. Diolchaf iddo a'i gydweithwyr am ei gwaith caled a thrwyadl. Hefyd diolchaf i lywydd Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru, aelodau ei lys a'i gyngor, y cyfarwyddwr a'i staff, a phawb a gyfrannodd ac a wnaeth sylwadau ar yr adroddiad. Fel y dywedais yn fy sylwadau ar

Welsh Language Board's quinquennial review last week, these reviews are not easy for staff. However, there has been a positive response to the process in both cases.

adolygiad pum mlynedd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yr wythnos diwethaf, nid yw'r adolygiadau hyn yn hawdd i'r staff. Er hyn, cafwyd ymateb cadarnhaol i'r broses yn y ddau achos.

Attached to today's motion is a paper that lists the review team's recommendations and the Cabinet's response to them. The main messages of the review are positive and I am happy to endorse them. However, we must look forward, and in that spirit, there remains scope for improvement. In total, the reviewers have made 24 recommendations. I do not intend to comment on all of these now, but to concentrate on the key issues that need to be addressed to ensure that the museum can operate effectively and make the best use of its considerable resources.

Atodir papur wrth gynnig heddiw sy'n rhestru argymhellion y tîm adolygu ac ymateb y Cabinet iddynt. Mae prif negeseuon yr adolygiad yn rhai cadarnhaol ac yr wyf yn hapus i'w cefnogi. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i ni edrych ymlaen, ac yn yr ysbryd hwnnw, erys lle i wella. Yn gyfan gwbl, mae'r adolygwyr wedi gwneud 24 argymhelliad. Nid yw'n fwrriad gennyf i wneud sylw ar bob un o'r rhain yn awr, ond i ganolbwyntio yn hytrach ar y pynciau allweddol sydd angen mynd i'r afael â hwy i sicrhau y gall yr amgueddfa weithredu'n effeithiol a gwneud y defnydd gorau o'i hadnoddau sylweddol.

10:45 a.m.

Those issues include: the need to reorganise the system of governance; addressing the need for improving internal resource allocation; considering appointment procedures; the need for a strategy for updating exhibitions, displays and interpretation facilities, and improvements in efficiency; and the need to diversify income generation. Several of these recommendations have already been recognised by the museum, and work is already under way on their implementation. My officials are in the final stages of preparing an action plan in consultation with the museum, and we shall monitor its implementation carefully. When complete, the action plan will be published.

Mae'r pynciau hynny'n cynnwys: yr angen i ad-drefnu'r system lywodraethu; wynebu'r angen i wella dosraniad adnoddau mewnol; ystyried gweithdrefnau penodi; yr angen am strategaeth i ddiweddarau arddangosfeydd, dangosiadau a chyfleusterau dehongli, a gwelliannau mewn effeithlonrwydd, a'r angen i amrywio cynhyrchu incwm. Cafodd llawer o'r argymhellion hyn eu cydnabod yn barod gan yr amgueddfa ac mae gwaith yn digwydd yn barod ar eu gweithredu. Mae fy swyddogion yn cynnal camau olaf paratoi cynllun gweithredu mewn ymgynghoriad â'r amgueddfa a byddwn yn monitro ei weithrediad yn ofalus. Pan fydd wedi ei gwblhau, bydd y cynllun gweithredu yn cael ei gyhoeddi.

One of the report's key recommendations relates to the need to review the system of governance at the museum and, in particular, the role of the court of governors. I fully endorse the reviewers' recommendation that the museum should consider the role of the court of governors. The museum has set up a working party to bring forward proposals for change. The issues under consideration are: the future governance arrangements in the absence of the court, and ensuring that all future appointments to museum committees follow Nolan principles. I am taking a close, personal interest in this work, and one of my

Mae un o argymhellion allweddol yr adroddiad yn ymwneud â'r angen i adolygu'r y drefn lywodraethu yn yr amgueddfa ac, yn arbennig, rôl llys y llywodraethwyr. Cefnogaf argymhellion yr adolygwyr y dylai'r amgueddfa ystyried rôl llys y llywodraethwyr yn llwyr. Sefydlodd yr amgueddfa weithgor i baratoi cynigion ar gyfer newid. Y pynciau o dan ystyriaeth yw: trefniadau llywodraeth at y dyfodol yn absenoldeb y llys, a sicrhau bod penodiadau yn y dyfodol i bwyllgorau'r amgueddfa yn dilyn egwyddorion Nolan. Yr wyf yn cymryd diddordeb personol yn y gwaith hwn, a bydd un o'm uwch

senior officials will be an observer on the working party. I look forward to seeing proposals early next year, and changes being made as soon as practically possible thereafter.

The report also highlights the continuing need for the museum to improve its efficiency. I agree with that. It is recommended that the museum should set up a comprehensive efficiency plan as a priority. It is incumbent on all public bodies to ensure that they work as effectively and efficiently as possible, and that they make the best use of the funds provided by the Assembly. There can be no room to relax in the pursuit of increased efficiencies and better ways of working. First, I want to be assured that the museum is pursuing this aim. Secondly, I intend that the critical examination regarding efficiency improvements becomes a central part of the museum's planning cycle, and that I can be certain that all efforts are being made in this area. I am already working closely with the museum to ensure that it holds a full public consultation on its policy for the display of art.

Finally, since the advent of free entry to the museum, one issue has taken on a much greater significance, namely income generation. The report recommends that the museum should seek to diversify its income as a key priority. It can no longer rely on admission charges from visitors. Now is the time for it to explore the variety of other means of raising income so that it can offer the people of Wales and beyond a better service. While I am pleased that profits from the museum's shops have risen substantially since April, these improvements must be sustained, and other avenues must also be examined. Consequently, I have already asked the museum to draw up a comprehensive strategy for raising income through shop sales, franchising, image licensing, and sponsorship through electronic and other means. Again, that strategy will become an ongoing part of the museum's planning process. Its monitoring will be done through the ongoing scrutiny process.

swyddogion yn sylwedydd ar y gweithgor. Edrychaf ymlaen i weld eich argymhellion yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd a bod newidiadau yn digwydd mor gynnar â phosibl ar ôl hynny.

Tanlinella'r adroddiad hefyd yr angen parhaus i'r amgueddfa wella'i heffeithlonrwydd. Cytunaf â hynny. Argymhellir fod yr amgueddfa yn sefydlu cynllun effeithlonrwydd cyflawn fel blaenoriaeth. Mae'n ofynnol i bob corff cyhoeddus sicrhau ei fod yn gweithio mor effeithiol ac effeithlon â phosibl, a'u bod yn gwneud y defnydd gorau o'r arian a ddarperir gan y Cynulliad. Nid oes lle i ymatal yn yr ymdrech i geisio effeithlonrwydd cynyddol a gwell ffyrdd o weithio. Yn gyntaf, yr wyf am gael fy modloni bod yr amgueddfa yn dilyn yr amcan hwn. Yn ail, bwriadaf i'r archwiliad manwl ynghylch gwelliannau effeithlonrwydd ddod yn rhan ganolog o gylch cynllunio'r amgueddfa ac y gallaf i fod yn sicr fod pob ymdrech yn cael ei gwneud yn y maes hwn. Yr wyf eisoes yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r amgueddfa i sicrhau ei bod yn cynnal ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus llawn ar ei pholisi ar gyfer arddangos celf.

Yn olaf, ers cyflwyno mynediad am ddim i'r amgueddfa, mae un pwnc wedi dod yn bwysicach, hynny yw creu incwm. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell y dylai'r amgueddfa geisio amrywio ei hincwm fel blaenoriaeth allweddol. Ni all ddibynnu bellach ar dâl mynediad gan ymwelwyr. Nawr yw'r amser iddi ymchwilio'r amrywiol ffyrdd eraill o godi incwm er mwyn cynnig gwell gwasanaeth i bobl Cymru a'r tu hwnt. Tra fy mod yn falch fod yr elw o siopau'r amgueddfa wedi codi'n sylweddol ers mis Ebrill, rhaid i'r cynnydd hwn gael ei gynnal a dylid archwilio ffynonellau eraill yn ogystal. O ganlyniad, yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r amgueddfa'n barod i baratoi strategaeth gynhwysfawr ar gyfer codi incwm drwy werthiannau siop, hawliau gwerthu, trwyddedu delwedd a nawdd trwy ffyrdd electronig a dulliau eraill. Eto, bydd y strategaeth honno yn dod yn rhan barhaus o broses gynllunio'r amgueddfa. Bydd ei fonitro yn digwydd trwy'r broses archwilio barhaus.

The introduction of the Government's policy

Bu cyflwyno polisi'r Llywodraeth ar

on free entry to the museum's sites has been hugely successful in opening up our national treasures to a wider audience, and demonstrates the Team Wales approach to working for the benefit of Wales.

Helen Mary Jones: Will you give way?

Jenny Randerson: No, I am not giving way, I am sorry. Such a policy, however, brings with it several challenges. I look to the museum to exploit the new opportunities to the full over the coming years.

I turn to amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. I cannot support this amendment. It is superfluous as the work is already underway. It is my policy to ensure that the national art collection is seen by as many people as possible throughout Wales. To this end, I asked the national museum and the Council of Museums in Wales earlier this year to come up with proposals on how to do this, initially on a pilot basis at three or four venues. The two bodies have met to deal with this issue and I await their report.

The national museum is also half way through a major consultation exercise on its policy to display works of art. This is referred to positively in recommendation 11 of the report. It is suggested that this general approach should be repeated with other topics. The whole range of possibilities for the display of public art is covered by the consultation exercise, and my policy will be further informed by its findings. It is a pity that so few Assembly Members attended the consultation held here in July.

I turn to amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies on the creation of a museum diploma course in Wales. All higher education institutions in the UK are independent, self-governing bodies. They have sole responsibility for their own internal and academic affairs, including which courses they offer. Consequently, the provision of a museum diploma course is a matter for ELWa and the higher education sector to consider in the light of demand. The

fynediad am ddim i safleoedd yr amgueddfa yn eithriadol o lwyddiannus i wneud ein trysorau cenedlaethol yn fwy hygyrch i gynulleidfa ehangach, ac i arddangos dull Tîm Cymru o weithio er budd Cymru.

Helen Mary Jones: A wnewch chi ildio?

Jenny Randerson: Na, nid ildiaf, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Mae polisi o'r fath, fodd bynnag yn dwyn llawer o sialensiau yn ei sgîl. Disgwyliaf i'r amgueddfa fanteisio ar gyfleoedd newydd i'r eithaf dros y blynyddoedd nesaf.

Trof yn awr at welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn. Mae'n ddiangen gan fod y gwaith eisoes wedi dechrau. Mae'n bolisi gennyf i sicrhau bod y casgliad celf cenedlaethol yn cael ei weld gan gynifer o bobl â phosibl ar draws Cymru. I'r diben hwn, gofynnais i'r Amgueddfa Genedlaethol a Chyngor Amgueddfeydd Cymru yn gynharach eleni i gynhyrchu cynigion ar sut i wneud hyn, a hynny ar sail beilot mewn tri neu bedwar safle i ddechrau. Cyfarfu'r ddau gorff i ddelio â'r pwnc hwn a disgwyliaf eu hadroddiad.

Mae'r Amgueddfa Genedlaethol hefyd hanner y ffordd drwy ymarferiad ymgynghori o bwys ar ei pholisi arddangos gweithiau celf. Cyfeirir at hyn yn gadarnhaol yn argymhelliad 11 yr adroddiad. Awgrymir y dylid ailadrodd yr ymagwedd gyffredinol hon gyda phynciau eraill. Ymdrinnir â holl amrediad y posibiliadau ar gyfer arddangos celf gyhoeddus gan yr ymarferiad ymgynghorol, a bydd fy mholisi i yn cael ei fwydo ymhellach gan ei ganfyddiadau. Mae'n drueni bod cyn lleied o Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi mynychu'r ymgynghoriad a gynhaliwyd yma ym mis Gorffennaf.

Trof at welliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies ar greu cwrs diploma amgueddfeydd yng Nghymru. Mae pob sefydliad addysg uwch yn y DU yn gyrff annibynnol, hunan lywodraethol. Mae ganddynt gyfrifoldeb llwyr dros eu materion mewnol ac academiaidd eu hunain, yn cynnwys y cyrsiau a gynigir ganddynt. O ganlyniad mater i ELWa a'r sector addysg uwch i'w ystyried yn wyneb y galw yw darparu cwrs diploma amgueddfeydd. Nid oes gan y Cynulliad

Assembly has no powers to intervene in their decisions on these matters. Therefore I cannot support this amendment. However, personally, I would hope to see such a course established in the future. With the major growth in museum activity in Wales, I hope that there will be a demand for it. I commend this review to the Assembly.

Owen John Thomas: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ychwaneger y cymal canlynol ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn rhoi cyfarwyddyd i Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru drefnu bod y lluniau a'r gweithiau celfyddyd eraill sy'n cael eu storio ar hyn o bryd yn cael eu harddangos mewn lleoedd priodol ledled Cymru.

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwaneger y cymal canlynol ar ddiwedd y gwelliant:

yn sgîl argymhelliaid yr adolygiad o ran darparu hyfforddiant, yn galw am gwrs diploma amgueddfeydd i gael ei ddarparu yng Nghymru er mwyn hybu datblygiad gyrfaedd graddedigion Cymru ym mhroffesiwn yr amgueddfeydd.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn a'r argymhellion. Yn hytrach nag ailadrodd sylwadau'r Gweinidog, canolbwyntiaf ar y gwelliannau. Derbyniaf fod cyfeiriad yn yr adroddiad at ddiben gwelliant 1. Serch hynny, mae'r cyfeiriad yn amhendiant, ac yr wyf am weld rhywbeth pendant. Un o brif argymhellion 'Diwylliant Cytûn' oedd yr angen i gryfhau adnoddau canolfannau diwylliannol ledled Cymru. Dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf mae nifer o ddatblygiadau wedi tanlinellu'r angen am hyn. Yn gyntaf, daeth yr arfer o fenthg eitemau'r amgueddfa genedlaethol i ysgolion Cymru i ben, a threfnwyd i grwpiau o ddisgyblion ymweld â'r amgueddfa i weld eitemau ac i gael cyfle i'w cyffwrdd. Er bod hyn i raddau yn ddatblygiad cyffrous, nid yw o fudd i ysgolion sydd yn bell o'r brifddinas. Yn ail, bu i'r Cyngor Amgueddfeydd yng Nghymru gael gwared ar ei swyddog arddangosfeydd, a daeth yr arfer o fynd ag arddangosfeydd o gwmpas Cymru i ben yn

unrhyw bwerau i ymyrryd yn eu penderfyniadau ar y materion hyn. Felly ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn. Fodd bynnag, yn bersonol, carwn weld cwrs o'r fath yn cael ei sefydlu yn y dyfodol. Gyda'r twf mawr mewn gweithgaredd amgueddfaol yng Nghymru, gobeithiaf y bydd galw amdano. Cymeradwyaf yr adolygiad hwn i'r Cynulliad.

Owen John Thomas: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: add as a new clause at the end of the motion:

instructs the National Museums and Galleries of Wales to arrange for paintings and other works of art currently held in storage to be exhibited at appropriate venues across Wales.

I propose amendment 2. Add as a new clause at end of motion:

further to the recommendation contained in the review relating to the provision of training, calls for the provision of a museum diploma course within Wales in order to promote career development for Welsh graduates within the museum profession.

I welcome this report and its recommendations. Rather than repeating the Minister's comments, I will concentrate on the amendments. I accept that reference is made in the report to the purpose of amendment 1. However, the reference is inconclusive, and I want to see something conclusive. A main recommendation of 'A Culture in Common' was the need to enhance the resources of cultural centres throughout Wales. In recent years a number of developments have highlighted the need to do this. First, the practice of lending national museum pieces to schools in Wales came to an end, and arrangements were made for groups of pupils to visit the museum to look at and touch exhibits. Though this is, to a certain extent, an exciting development, it does not benefit schools based a long way from the capital. Secondly, the Council of Museums in Wales got rid of its exhibitions officer, which meant that the practice of taking exhibitions around Wales came to an

sgîl hynny. Unwaith eto felly, yr oedd rhanbarthau'r wlad ar eu colled. Mae dros ddwy flynedd ers imi alw ar yr amgueddfa genedlaethol i ryddhau gweithiau celf ac eitemau eraill o'i storfeydd er mwyn iddynt gael eu harddangos mewn amgueddfeydd ac orielau ym mhob rhan o'r wlad. Gallai creu arddangosfeydd newydd yn rheolaidd ddenu ymwelwyr ychwanegol i ganolfannau lleol—trigolion lleol yn ogystal â thwristiaid—gan ddod â budd ariannol o ganlyniad.

Yr wyf wedi clywed Aelodau eraill, gan gynnwys y Gweinidog, yn galw ar i hyn ddigwydd, neu yn mynegi eu cefnogaeth i'r alwad ar i drysorau cuddiedig gael eu defnyddio yn y modd hwn. Mae'n hen bryd inni weld hyn yn cael ei wireddu. Galwaf arnoch felly i gefnogi gwelliant 1 er mwyn gwireddu ein dymuniad.

10:55 a.m.

Trof yn awr at welliant 2. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n rhaid i raddedigion a astudiodd yng Nghymru fynd i Loegr i ddilyn y cwrs diploma amgueddfeydd sy'n eu galluogi i ennill y cymwysterau angenrheidiol i fod yn guraduron amgueddfa. Nid yw'r cwrs ar gael yng Nghymru. Felly, ar ôl gwneud cwrs gradd yng Nghymru, mewn meysydd megis hanes, archaeoleg, daeareg a chelf o safbwynt Cymreig, rhaid i raddedigion fynd i Loegr i wneud y cwrs diploma amgueddfeydd. Mae holl bwyslais y cwrs hwnnw ar y safbwynt Seisnig. Mae hynny'n sicrhau dilyniant i fyfyrwyr o Loegr rhwng eu gwaith gradd a'r diploma. Nid oes dilyniant i fyfyrwyr o Gymru. Er mwyn creu dilyniant yn y maes hwn yng Nghymru, darparu cyfleoedd cyfartal a hyrwyddo datblygiad gyrfa graddedigion o Gymru yn y proffesiwn amgueddfeydd, mae angen dybryd sefydlu cwrs diploma perthnasol yn y wlad hon. Byddai hynny'n creu cymwysterau proffesiynol cydnabyddedig ar gyfer amgueddfeydd ac orielau cenedlaethol, lleol a phreifat a hefyd yn sefydlu strwythur gyrfa clir i'r staff. Gwn nad allwn wneud hynny drwy bleidleisio o blaid y gwelliant yn unig, ond mae dyletswydd arnom i lywio gwaith ELWa a'r prifysgolion i sicrhau y gwneir hyn.

Mae amgueddfeydd a sefydliadau tebyg yn

end. Once again therefore the country's regions were losing out. It is more than two years since I called for the national museum to release works of art and other items from storage so that they may be exhibited in museums and galleries throughout the country. Creating new exhibitions on a regular basis could attract more visitors to local centres—local residents as well as tourists—bringing financial benefit in their wake.

I have heard other Members, including the Minister, calling for this to happen, or expressing their support for the call for hidden treasures to be used in this way. It is high time that this is done. I ask you therefore to support amendment 1 in order to realise our aspiration.

I now turn to amendment 2. At the moment, graduates who have studied in Wales must go to England to follow the museum diploma course, which enables them to gain the necessary qualifications to be museum curators. The course is not available in Wales. Therefore, after studying for a degree course in Wales, in subjects such as history, archaeology, geology and art based on a Welsh context, graduates must go to England to study for the museum diploma course. The emphasis of that course is entirely on the English context. That ensures continuity for students from England between their degree work and the diploma. There is no continuity for students from Wales. In order to create continuity in this area in Wales, and to provide equal opportunities and promote the career development of graduates from Wales in the museum profession, there is a desperate need to establish a relevant diploma course in this country. That would create recognised professional qualifications for national, local and private museums and galleries and would also establish a clear career structure for the staff. I know that we cannot achieve that just by voting for the amendment, but it is incumbent upon us to give a steer to ELWa and the universities to ensure that this is done.

Museums and similar institutions are

bwysig i Gymru ac mae'n bwysig bod graddedigion hanes Cymru ac ati yn cael yr hawl i barhau â'u hastudiaethau. Byddai sefydlu cwrs diploma amgueddfeydd yng Nghymru yn galluogi iddynt wneud hynny. Ar hyn o bryd, mae ein graddedigion dan anfantais ac nid yw'n ddigon da inni ddweud nad oes dim y gallwn ei wneud am y peth. Ni allwch gefnogi rhywbeth a'i wrthwynebu ar yr un pryd, Weinidog, er bod hynny'n rhan o athroniaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol y dyddiau hyn. Galwaf arnoch felly i gefnogi gwelliant 2.

Rosemary Butler: This debate on the review of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales is fascinating. I declare an interest, as I am the Chair of the board responsible for establishing the new national waterfront museum in Swansea.

This is an excellent and detailed report. Several points arise from it. However, the report did not convey how exciting and wonderful museums are. Perhaps that was not its purpose. You can visit museums in Cardiff and all over Wales and see dinosaurs, volcanoes, paintings or whatever you wish to see. It can be a life changing experience. As a result of seeing dinosaurs in museums young children want to be geologists or archaeologists when they grow up.

I agree with many points made in the report, such as that on the system of governance. We must consider the court of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales. Having been a member of the court, I speak from experience. I reported to the Culture Committee that the court's meetings provided for an edifying afternoon. There was a room full of people, and I was not sure what all the questions were. However, the afternoon tea is always nice, including cream cakes and strawberries. That was one advantage of being a member of the court. We should consider the court and I hope that this is done soon.

People passionately feel that everyone should be able to see all the works of art. The difficulty is that they need conserving. Often,

important to Wales and it is important that graduates in Welsh history and so on have the right to continue their studies. Establishing a museum diploma course in Wales would enable them to do that. At the moment, our graduates are at a disadvantage and it is not good enough for us to say that we can do nothing about it. You cannot support something and oppose it at the same time, Minister, although that is part of the Liberal Democrat philosophy these days. I therefore call on you to support amendment 2.

Rosemary Butler: Mae'r ddadl hon ar adolygiad Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru yn drawiadol. Datganaf fuddiant gan fy mod yn Gadeirydd y bwrdd sy'n gyfrifol am sefydlu yr Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Glannau newydd yn Abertawe.

Mae hwn yn adroddiad ardderchog a manwl. Cyfyd nifer o bwyntiau ohono. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaeth yr adroddiad gyfleu pa mor gyffrous a hyfryd yw amgueddfeydd. Hwyrach nad hynny oedd ei fwriad. Gallwch ymweld ag amgueddfeydd yng Nghaerdydd a thros Gymru a gweld deinosoriaid, llosgfynyddoedd, darluniau neu beth bynnag garech chi ei weld. Gall fod yn brofiad a fydd yn newid cwrs bywyd. O ganlyniad i weld deinosoriaid mewn amgueddfeydd y mae plant bach am fod yn ddaeargwyr neu archaeolegwyr pan fyddant yn hŷn.

Cytunaf â llawer o'r pwyntiau a wneir yn yr adroddiad, megis yr un ar y system lywodraethu. Rhaid inni roi ystyriaeth i lys Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru. Gan i mi fod yn aelod o'r llys, siaradaf o brofiad. Adroddais yn ôl i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant fod cyfarfodydd y llys yn darparu prynhawn addysgol. Roedd yno ystafell lawn o bobl, ac nid oeddwn yn siŵr beth oedd y cwestiynau i gyd. Er hyn, mae'r te prynhawn bob amser yn flasus, yn cynnwys cacennau hufen a mefus. Dyna oedd un fantais o fod yn aelod o'r llys. Dylasem ystyried y llys a gobeithiaf y gwneir hyn yn fuan.

Teimla pobl yn gryf y dylai pawb fod yn gallu gweld yr holl weithiau celf. Y trafferth yw eu bod angen eu cadw. Yn aml, ni

paintings are not conserved in a good enough condition to allow them to be transported around Wales. More importantly, there are not many places where you can display works of art in the best possible conditions. You need climatic control and security. If we are serious about touring works of art throughout Wales, we must ensure that we fund galleries, community halls or public libraries so that these works of art can be properly displayed.

On schools' museum service, there was once such an all-Wales service to which all authorities in Wales contributed money. That does not happen any more. However, the national museums themselves provide a good school's museum service. I was recently in the museum for a meeting, and when walking through the galleries, we literally had to step over and around children because there were so many schools visiting at the time. My concern is for the children who do not live near the museums and galleries, whose schools may not be able to afford transport to get them there. Perhaps the Culture Committee could consider providing help to those schools not within easy travelling distance of national galleries, so that they can afford to hire coaches to visit the museums.

I am fortunate in having a branch of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales, the Roman Legionary Museum, in my village of Caerleon. The way they encourage people to return to the museum is wonderful. They hold many special events which attract queues of families, usually dressed up as Romans, witches, or whatever the theme may be at that time. Therefore, the national museum and its branches are actively trying to get more income into the museums.

There seems to be confusion about the diploma course that Owen John has just suggested we implement. The thought of having a diploma in museums that relates to Wales only horrifies me. There are museums all over the world, and we need people with museum degrees to move back and forth

chedwir darluniau mewn cyflwr digon da iddynt gael eu cludo o amgylch Cymru. Yn bwysicach, nid oes llawer o fannau lle y gallwch arddangos gweithiau celf yn yr amgylchiadau gorau posibl. Y mae angen rheolaeth hinsawdd a diogelwch. Os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â chludo celf i'w arddangos ar draws Cymru, rhaid i ni sicrhau ein bod yn ariannu orielau, neuaddau cymuned neu lyfrgelloedd fel y gall gweithiau celf gael eu harddangos yn briodol.

Ar wasanaeth ysgolion yr amgueddfa, roedd unwaith wasanaeth Cymru gyfan o'r fath y byddai yr holl awdurdodau yng Nghymru yn cyfrannu arian tuag ato. Nid yw hyn yn digwydd bellach. Fodd bynnag, darparar amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol wasanaeth amgueddfeydd da i ysgolion eu hunain. Yn ddiweddar yr oeddwn yn yr amgueddfa ar gyfer cyfarfod ac, wrth gerdded trwy'r orielau, yr oeddem yn llythrennol yn gorfod camu dros ac o amgylch plant gan fod cynifer o ysgolion yn ymweld ar y pryd. Mae fy mhryder i dros y plant nad ydynt yn byw yn agos at amgueddfeydd ac orielau, y mae eu hysgolion efallai yn methu fforddio cludiant i fynd â nhw yno. Efallai y gallai'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant ystyried darparu cymorth i'r ysgolion hynny nad ydynt o fewn cyrraedd hwylus i orielau cenedlaethol, er mwyn iddynt allu fforddio hurio bysys i ymweld â'r amgueddfeydd.

Yr wyf yn ffodus gan fod cangen o Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru, sef Amgueddfa'r Llangatwg, yn fy mhentref yng Nghaerllion. Mae eu dull o annog pobl i ddychwelyd i'r amgueddfa yn ardderchog. Cynhaliant lawer o ddigwyddiadau arbennig, sy'n denu llu o deuluoedd, yn aml mewn gwisgoedd Rhufeinig, gwrachod, neu pa thema bynnag sy'n digwydd bod ar y pryd. Felly mae'r amgueddfa genedlaethol a'i changhennau yn ceisio'u gorau i gael rhagor o incwm i'r amgueddfeydd.

Mae'n ymddangos bod dryswch ynglŷn â'r cwrs diploma y mae Owen John newydd awgrymu ein bod yn ei weithredu. Mae'r syniad o gael diploma amgueddfeydd sy'n ymwneud â Chymru'n unig yn peri braw i mi. Ceir amgueddfeydd ar draws y byd ac y mae angen pobl arnom sydd â graddau mewn

across Offa's Dyke, and into Europe, America, or Australia, to ensure that they have a wide breadth of knowledge. However, although I would not want any course in Wales to be specifically on Wales, I would support the development at some time of a course linked with the new maritime museum in Swansea, but as Jenny said, that is for the universities to decide.

I congratulate the museum staff who have coped—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Your five minutes are coming to an end.

Rosemary Butler: Since the introduction of free access to museums, the visitor numbers have increased dramatically, and I congratulate the staff on how they have coped with this huge influx. Hopefully, we will ensure that increasing numbers of our young school children can take advantage of visiting our national museums. I endorse what Jenny has said, and hope that there will be more money for museums in the future.

David Lloyd: Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe. Un o brif argymhellion yr adroddiad interim oedd creu sefydliad i gymryd lle cyn-Amgueddfa Diwydiant a Môr Cymru. Croesawn y ffaith fod y Cabinet wedi cytuno â'r argymhelliad mewn egwyddor, ac mae'n braf fod Cronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri wedi cytuno i ddarparu'r swm penodol i barhau gyda cham nesaf y cynllun yn Abertawe.

Mae hefyd yn braf allu dweud mai Plaid Cymru oedd y grŵp cyntaf i argymhell symud yr amgueddfa arforol o'r brifddinas i Abertawe. Fodd bynnag, gwaith tîm sydd wedi sicrhau bod y cynllun wedi symud ymlaen yn llwyddiannus, a rhaid canmol Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe am hyn.

Wedi dweud hynny, mae'n hollbwysig bod yr amgueddfa yn genedlaethol yn ei hagwedd, ac nid yn canolbwytio ar hanes Abertawe yn unig, ond yn cynrychioli hanes arforol Cymru gyfan. Serch hynny, bydd yn atyniad

astudiaethau amgueddfeydd i symud yn ôl a blaen ar draws Clawdd Offa, ac i Ewrop, America, neu Awstralia, i sicrhau bod ganddynt ystod eang o wybodaeth. Fodd bynnag, er na fuaswn am gael unrhyw gwrs yng Nghymru sy'n benodol ar Gymru, buaswn rywbyrd yn cefnogi datblygiad cwrs yn gysylltiedig â'r amgueddfa arforol newydd yn Abertawe, ond fel y dywedodd Jenny, mae hynny yn rhywbeth i'r prifysgolion ei benderfynu.

Llongyfarchaf staff yr amgueddfa sydd wedi ymdopi—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae eich pum munud yn dod i ben.

Rosemary Butler: Ers cyflwyno mynediad am ddim i'r amgueddfeydd, mae niferoedd yr ymwelwyr wedi cynyddu'n ddramatig, a llongyfarchaf y staff ar sut y maent wedi ymdopi gyda'r cynnydd aruthrol hwn. Y gobaith yw y byddwn yn sicrhau bod nifer cynyddol o'n plant ysgol yn gallu manteisio ar ymweld â'n hamgueddfeydd cenedlaethol. Cefnogaf yr hyn ddywedodd Jenny a gobeithiaf y bydd mwy o arian ar gyfer amgueddfeydd yn y dyfodol.

David Lloyd: I declare an interest as a member of Swansea City and County Council. One of the interim report's main recommendations was the establishment of an institution to take the place of the former Welsh Industrial and Maritime Museum. We welcome the fact that the Cabinet has agreed to this in principle, and it is good news that the Heritage Lottery Fund has agreed to provide a specific sum to continue with the next stage of the project in Swansea.

I am pleased to say that it was Plaid Cymru who first recommended moving the maritime museum from the capital city to Swansea. However, it is teamwork that has ensured that the project has developed successfully, and Swansea City and County Council must be praised for this.

Having said that, it is essential that the museum is national in its outlook, and does not only concentrate on the history of Swansea, but reflects the maritime history of Wales as a whole. Despite that, it will be an

twristiaid pwysig i Abertawe er mwyn denu ymwelwyr o Gymru, Ewrop a thu hwnt. Mae'n bwysig bod y cyngor, y Cynulliad a'r Bwrdd Croeso yn cydweithio i fanteisio'n llawn ar botensial yr amgueddfa er mwyn sicrhau lle Abertawe ar lwybr y twristiaid.

Gan gydnabod rôl Rosemary Butler, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog a oes ganddi wybodaeth bellach ynglŷn ag amserlen datblygu'r Amgueddfa Diwydiant a Môr yn Abertawe?

important landmark for Swansea in attracting tourists from Wales, Europe and beyond. It is important that the council, the Assembly and the Tourist Board work together to take full advantage of the museum's potential to ensure Swansea's place on the tourist trail.

While acknowledging Rosemary Butler's role, I ask the Minister if she has further information on the timetable for developing the Industrial and Maritime Museum in Swansea?

11:05 a.m.

Tom Middlehurst: I welcome the report, and note the initiatives that the Minister intends to pursue in matters such as accessibility, efficiency, and improved governance. I pay tribute to the work of the service's staff in dealing with the increase in visitor numbers, especially those at sites outside Cardiff, and in particular, the Welsh Slate Museum in Llanberis which is well-served by the people in that area and has had a massive number of visitors during the last few months. I visited the museum recently in a private capacity and was enormously impressed with ongoing work there. Given that there is a substantial treasure-trove of paintings and artefacts in the National Library of Wales in Aberystwyth, will the Minister encourage the National Museums and Galleries of Wales to co-operate with the national library, and vice versa, to ensure that those works of art are made available and put on display throughout Wales? I noticed her commitment to ensure that the national museum takes its work to other parts of Wales, but it is important to recognise that having a bank of artefacts and paintings in the national library in Aberystwyth that are only seen by visitors to Aberystwyth is of little value to most people. I encourage that level of co-operation between the two organisations.

Glyn Davies: I was not a member of the Culture Committee when the interim and final reports of the quinquennial review were presented to it. However, after reading the conclusions and recommendations of the School of Public Policy at the University of Birmingham, I welcome the principal conclusion, namely that the National

Tom Middlehurst: Croesawaf yr adroddiad a nodaf y camau y bwriada'r Gweinidog eu dilyn mewn materion megis hygrychedd, effeithlonrwydd a gwell llywodraeth. Talaf deyrnged i waith staff y gwasanaeth wrth ddelio â'r cynnydd yn niferoedd yr ymwelwyr, yn enwedig y rheini ar safleoedd y tu allan i Gaerdydd, ac yn arbennig yn Amgueddfa Lechi Cymru yn Llanberis a wasanaethir yn dda gan bobl o'r ardal honno ac a gafodd nifer aruthrol o ymwelwyr yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf. Ymwelais yn breifat â'r amgueddfa'n ddiweddar a chafodd y gwaith parhaus yno argraff gref arnaf. O gofio bod casgliad sylweddol o drysorau o ddarluniau a gwrthrychau yn Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru yn Aberystwyth, a wnaiff y Gweinidog annog Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru i gydweithio gyda'r Llyfrgell Genedlaethol, ac i'r gwrthwyneb, i sicrhau bod y gweithiau celf hynny ar gael i'w gweld ar draws Cymru? Nodais ei hymroddiad i sicrhau bod yr amgueddfa genedlaethol yn mynd â'i gwaith i rannau eraill o Gymru, ond y mae'n bwysig cydnabod nad yw'n fawr o werth i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl gael casgliad o wrthrychau a darluniau yn y Llyfrgell Genedlaethol yn Aberystwyth, a welir gan ymwelwyr ag Aberystwyth yn unig. Anogaf y radd hon o gydweithrediad rhwng y ddau gorff.

Glyn Davies: Nid oeddwn yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant pan gyflwynwyd adroddiadau interim a therfynol yr adolygiad pum mlynedd iddo. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl darllen casgliadau ac argymhellion Ysgol Polisi Cyhoeddus Prifysgol Birmingham, croesawaf y prif gasgliad, sef y dylid cadw Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol

Museums and Galleries of Wales should be retained substantially in their present form. This report and the Government's response to it indicate that the museum's management is undertaking a good and valued job. This is also an appropriate opportunity for me to commend the Government of Wales on its policy of free access to museums, and pay tribute to Tom Middlehurst whose name will be forever linked to this enlightened policy. Tom, who sits in the heart of the Labour benches, sometimes looks grumpy and snarls at the Conservatives. Although, I must admit that recently he has been looking grumpier and is snarling even more at the Liberal Democrats. In the spirit of seasonal good will and consensus we, on the Conservative wing of the Assembly, want to acknowledge the important contribution that Tom made on this.

I also express my concern about the future of the visual arts in Wales. Those of us who are concerned are appalled by the saga of the catastrophe that befell the visual arts centre in Cardiff's old library. I will not rehearse any of the goings-on in this debate, but I hope that the Cardiff City and County Council and the Arts Council of Wales will recognise that a large gap must be filled and that the current position cannot be allowed to continue. Unless there is an early decision on how visual arts in the capital are to be presented and promoted, much harm will be caused to Cardiff's bid to become the European City of Culture in 2008.

Finally, we believe that there is a great need for a national art gallery for Wales. I have heard my predecessor as spokesperson on culture, Jonathan Morgan, on many occasions call for the city hall in Cardiff to become a base for a national art gallery with a Welsh theme, housing an international collection. That idea would give Welsh art the status that it deserves. I hope that the Minister, the Government of Wales, the Arts Council of Wales and Cardiff City and County Council will take this exciting suggestion forward for Cardiff and Wales.

We support the principle of improving access to our arts, which is why we will vote for

Cymru yn sylweddol yn eu ffurf presennol. Dengys yr adroddiad hwn ac ymateb y Llywodraeth iddo fod tîm rheoli'r amgueddfa yn gwneud gwaith da a werthfawrogrir. Rhydd hyn hefyd gyfle priodol i mi ganmol Llywodraeth Cymru ar ei pholisi mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd, a thalu teyrnged i Tom Middlehurst, y bydd ei enw yn gysylltiedig am byth â'r polisi goleuedig hwn. Mae Tom, sy'n eistedd yng nghanol y meinciau Llafur, weithiau'n ymddangos ei fod yn bwdlyd ac yn cyfarth ar y Toriaid. Er hynny, rhaid i mi gyfaddef ei fod yn ddiweddar wedi ymddangos yn fwy surbwchaid ac yn cyfarth hyd yn oed yn fwy ar y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Yn ysbryd ewyllys da y tymor a chonsensws, yr ydym ni ar adain Geidwadol y Cynulliad yn dymuno cydnabod y cyfraniad pwysig a wnaeth Tom ar y mater hwn.

Hefyd, mynegaf fy mhryder ynglŷn â dyfodol y celfyddydau gweledol yng Nghymru. Arswyda'r rheini ohonom sy'n gofidio am saga'r trychineb a ddigwyddodd i ganolfan y celfyddydau gweledol yn hen lyfrgell Caerdydd. Ni wnaaf ailadrodd yr holl drafod a fu yn y ddadl hon, ond gobeithiaf y bydd Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn cydnabod bod angen llanw bwlch mawr ac na ellir caniatáu i'r sefyllfa gyfredol barhau. Oni cheir penderfyniad cynnar ar sut y caiff y celfyddydau gweledol cyflwyno a'u hyrwyddo yn y brifddinas, gwneir drwg mawr i gais Caerdydd i fod yn Ddinas Diwylliant Ewrop yn 2008.

I gloi, credwn fod angen dybryd am oriel gelf genedlaethol i Gymru. Clywais Jonathan Morgan, fy rhagflaenydd fel llefarydd ar ddiwylliant, yn galw ar sawl achlysur am wneud neuadd y ddinas Caerdydd yn lleoliad i oriel gelf genedlaethol gyda thema Gymreig, i fod yn gartref i gasgliad rhwyngwladol. Byddai'r syniad hwnnw yn rhoi'r statws haeddiannol i gelf Gymreig. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog, Llywodraeth Cymru, Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru a Chyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd yn datblygu'r awgrym cyffrous hwn ar ran Caerdydd a Chymru.

Cefnogwn egwyddor gwella mynediad i'n celfyddydau, a dyna pahan y byddwn yn

amendment 1. I noted the Minister's and Rosemary Butler's points, but we believe that amendment 2 is also worthy of support.

John Griffiths: I will concentrate on access, as many others have for obvious reasons because it is important to get as many people as possible in Wales into their national museums and galleries so that they can benefit from the experience and get a better idea of the art and culture of Wales and the world. In that context, I welcome the free entry scheme, as others have, which has been a fantastic success. Many local people in Newport have told me that they consider it to be one of the Assembly's finest achievements. Therefore, it has resonated with the people of Wales. There is no doubt that the charges previously applied in many instances deterred a family of four on a modest income, for example, from visiting the National Museums and Galleries of Wales. I welcome that scheme; it has been an outstanding success.

Will Jenny comment on the efforts to spread best practice, especially with regards to schools and their interaction with the National Museums and Galleries of Wales and how local education authorities and schools can be encouraged to make full use of existing possibilities and opportunities? Will she also comment on how the museums and galleries themselves can undertake imaginative programmes to link with schools and provide opportunities that would fit in with their educational strategies? I am sure that there is much that takes place that is imaginative and effective, however, I sometimes wonder how consistent that imaginative and impressive approach is across Wales and how we could improve that.

We should also be flexible and imaginative with regards to exhibiting paintings and works of art around Wales. We have already discussed that and much could be achieved with a flexible and imaginative approach. Although many activities are taking place, there is much more that could be done. We need to be open minded about the possibilities and the venues that could exhibit those works of art and paintings across Wales.

pleidleisio dros welliant 1. Nodais bwyntiau'r Gweinidog a Rosemary Butler, ond teimlwn fod gwelliant 2 hefyd yn teilyngu cefnogaeth.

John Griffiths: Canolbwytiaf ar fynediad, fel y gwnaeth llawer eraill am resymau amlwg oherwydd mae'n bwysig cael cynifer â phosibl o bobl yng Nghymru i mewn i'w Hamgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol i elwa o'r profiad a chael gwell syniad am gelf a diwylliant Cymru a'r byd. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, croesawaf y cynllun mynediad am ddim, fel y gwnaeth eraill, sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiant aruthrol. Dywedodd llawer o bobl leol yng Nghasnewydd wrthyf eu bod yn ei ystyried yn un o orchestion gorau'r Cynulliad. Felly y mae wedi canu cloch gyda phobl Cymru. Yn ddiau, roedd y taliadau mynediad a osodwyd yn flaenorol mewn sawl achos wedi atal teulu o bedwar ar incwm cymedrol, er enghraifft, rhag ymweld ag Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru. Croesawaf y cynllun; bu'n llwyddiant nodedig.

A wnaiff Jenny sylw ar yr ymdrechion i ledaenu arfer gorau, yn arbennig mewn perthynas ag ysgolion a'u rhyngweithio gydag Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru a sut y gellir annog ysgolion ac awdurdodau addysg lleol i wneud defnydd llawn o'r posibilïadau a'r cyfleoedd sy'n bodoli? A wnaiff hi hefyd sylw ar sut y gall yr amgueddfeydd a'r oriolau eu hunain ymgymryd â rhaglenni dyfeisgar i gysylltu ag ysgolion a darparu cyfleoedd a fyddai'n cydweddu â'u strategaethau addysgol? Yr wyf yn siŵr bod llawer sy'n digwydd yn ddyfeisgar ac yn effeithiol, ond, er hyn, yr wyf yn amau weithiau pa mor gyson yw'r ymagwedd ddyfeisgar a sylweddol hon ar draws Cymru a sut y gallem wella hynny.

Dylem hefyd fod yn hyblyg a dyfeisgar gyda golwg ar arddangos darluniau a gweithiau celf ar draws Cymru. Yr ydym wedi trafod hynny'n barod a gallai llawer gael ei gyflawni gydag ymagwedd hyblyg a dyfeisgar. Er bod llawer o weithgareddau yn digwydd, mae llawer mwy y gellid ei wneud. Mae angen i ni fod yn eangfrydig ynglŷn â'r posibilïadau a'r lleoliadau a allai arddangos y gweithiau celf a'r darluniau hynny ar draws Cymru.

Finally, Wales, especially the Valleys in the south, has a fantastic industrial heritage. There is great potential in the Valleys for tourism, but also for national museums' and galleries' activities. It is fantastic that Big Pit in Blaenavon is now part of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales. Linking it further with other industrial heritage sites in the Valleys would be an encouraging development. There is a wonderful story to tell about their unique contribution to the industrial revolution, probably the most impressive in the world. We could make much more of that and I would like Jenny to comment on it.

Delyth Evans: Mae mynediad am ddim i'r amgueddfeydd, un o bolisiâu canolog y Llywodraeth Lafur, wedi dod â llwyddiant aruthrol i'r amgueddfa genedlaethol. Mae hefyd wedi dod â phwysau ychwanegol, wrth gwrs, ac mae hi'n bwysig bod yr amgueddfa yn gweld hynny fel cyfle ac nid fel baich neu rwystr i'w gwaith. Yr wyf hefyd, fel Aelodau eraill, yn canmol gwaith caled y staff i ymateb i'r pwysau ychwanegol. Mae'n bwysig bod rheolwyr yr amgueddfa yn ymateb yn bositif a chreadigol i'r sialens newydd hon o gynnydd yn nifer yr ymwelwyr.

Euthum â'm plant i ffair galan gaeaf yn Amgueddfa Werin Cymru yn Sain Ffagan y mis diwethaf. Oherwydd i gymaint o bobl ei mynychu, yr oedd yn rhaid i ni aros am tua awr i fynd i mewn. Yr oedd llawer gormod o bobl yno ac nid oedd yn brofiad pleserus i nifer fawr ohonynt a wnaeth yr ymdrech i fynd yno. Gobeithio y bydd yr amgueddfa yn dysgu gwers o hynny ac yn gosod strategaeth glir fel y gall ddelio yn effeithiol gyda'r cynnydd yn nifer yr ymwelwyr.

Hoffwn gyfeiro at y rhan o'r adroddiad sy'n argymhell bod yr amgueddfa yn ailystyried ei pholisi tuag at arddangosfeydd. Awgrymaf y dylai ddatblygu strategaeth i newid ac adnewyddu'r arddangosfeydd. Mae hyn yn bwysig, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun y cynnydd mewn ymwelwyr. Wrth i ni ymestyn allan i gynulleidfa newydd o ymwelwyr i ddod i'r amgueddfa, mae'n hollbwysig eu bod yn cael profiad positif ac arbennig yn ystod eu hymweliad a'u bod am

Yn olaf, mae gan Gymru, yn enwedig yng Nghymoedd y De, dreftadaeth ddiwydiannol aruthrol. Mae potensial mawr yn y Cymoedd i dwristiaeth, ond hefyd i weithgareddau'r amgueddfeydd ac orielau cenedlaethol. Mae'n wych bod Pwll Mawr Blaenafon yn awr yn rhan o Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru. Byddai ei gysylltu ymhellach â safleoedd treftadaeth ddiwydiannol eraill yn y Cymoedd yn ddatblygiad calonogol. Mae stori ardderchog i'w hadrodd am eu cyfraniad unigryw i'r chwyldro diwydiannol, yr un mwyaf trawiadol yn y byd, fwy na thebyg. Gallem wneud llawer mwy o hynny a carwn i Jenny wneud sylw arno.

Delyth Evans: Free access to museums, one of the Labour Government's central policies, has brought great success to the national museum. It has also brought additional pressure, of course, and it is important that the museum views that as an opportunity rather than a burden or an obstacle to their work. I, like other Members, also congratulate the staff's hard work in responding to the additional pressure. It is important that the museum's managers react positively and creatively to the new challenge of an increase in visitor numbers.

I took my children to a winter fair at the Museum of Welsh Life in St Fagans last month. As so many people attended it, we had to queue for about an hour to go in. There were far too many people there and it was an unpleasant experience for many who made the effort to attend. I hope that the museum learns a lesson from that and will develop a clear strategy so that it can deal effectively with increase in visitors.

I would like to refer to the report's recommendation that the museum reconsiders its policy on exhibitions. I suggest that it should develop a strategy to change and update the exhibitions. That is important, especially in the context of the visitor number increase. As we reach out to a new audience of visitors to the museum, it is extremely important that they have a special and positive experience during their visit and that they return to enjoy the same experience

ddychwelyd i fwynhau'r un profiad eto. Mae hynny'n berthnasol iawn wrth ystyried plant fel eu bod yn datblygu'r hyder i fwynhau'r gwerth y gallant ei gael o'r amgueddfa. Mae datblygu polisi arddangosfeydd yn bwysig i'r amgueddfa yn y dyfodol.

11:15 a.m.

Mae'r adolygiad, fel y cyfeiriodd nifer o Aelodau, yn codi cwestiynau ynglŷn â threfn lywodraethol yr amgueddfa. Croesawaf y sylw y mae hynny'n ei gael. Mae disgwyl yn awr, yng nghyd-destun y Cynulliad, i'n cyrff cyhoeddus wneud eu gweinyddiaeth yn fwy effeithiol, agored ac ystwyth. Yr wyf yn hoffi'r term Saesneg '*lean and mean*'. Nid oes lle yng Nghymru heddiw ar gyfer gweinyddiaethau trwm, hen-ffasiwn sy'n cymryd amser hir i ymateb. Mae'n rhaid datblygu ffyrdd o redeg cyrff cyhoeddus sy'n ymateb i'r awyrgylch newydd yng Nghymru lle y rhoddir pwyslais ar wariant a lle yr ydym yn disgwyl gwerth da am arian cyhoeddus. Felly, byddwn yn disgwyl i'r amgueddfa ddatblygu system lywodraethol sy'n gwbl agored o ran apwyntiadau, ac sy'n gweithio'n effeithiol.

I gloi, cymeradwyaf gynlluniau'r amgueddfa i ddatblygu ac ymestyn Amgueddfa Diwydiant Gwlân Cymru yn Dre-fach, Felindre. Mae hwnnw'n gynllun cyffrous i ddatblygu'r amgueddfa gwlân sy'n gwneud cyfraniad gwerthfawr i economi Dyffryn Teifi, yn enwedig yn sgîl clwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae hefyd yn rhoi gwerth addysgol gwerthfawr o ran hanes y diwydiant gwlân yng Nghymru, ac mae'n cynnig gwasanaeth i'r diwydiant gwlân presennol, sydd yn fodern o ran sgiliau a datblygu ffyrdd o ddefnyddio gwlân.

Helen Mary Jones: Hoffwn gyfeirio at lwyddiant caniatáu mynediad am ddim i'n hamgueddfeydd. Fel teulu, yr ydym yn defnyddio'r amgueddfa yng Nghaerdydd lawer mwy nag yr oeddem ac mae hynny wedi bod o fudd i addysg fy mhleintyn. Mae'n hyfryd gweld cymaint o blant ifanc, yn enwedig, yn yr amgueddfa. Ond, os yr ydym am ddefnyddio Castell Cydweli yn fy etholaeth i yn yr un modd, mae'n rhaid inni dalu ffi fynediad eithaf drud, sy'n golygu nad yw llawer o bobl leol yn gallu gwneud

again. That is especially true for children so that they develop the confidence to enjoy the value that they can gain from the museum. It is important for the museum to develop an exhibitions policy in the future.

The review, as was mentioned by many Members, raises questions about the museum's governance. I welcome the focus on that. There is an expectation now, in the Assembly context, that our public bodies make their administration more effective, open and flexible. I like the English term '*lean and mean*'. There is no room in Wales today for heavy, old-fashioned administrations that take a long time to respond. We must develop ways of running public bodies that respond to the new environment in Wales where emphasis is placed on spending and where we expect good value for public money. Therefore, I would expect the museum to develop a governing system that is entirely open in terms of appointments, and which operates effectively.

Finally, I welcome the museum's plans to develop and extend the Museum of the Welsh Woollen Industry at Dre-fach, Felindre. That is an exciting development for the museum of wool, which will make an important contribution to the economy of the Teifi Valley, especially in the wake of foot and mouth disease. It also has a high educational value with regards to the history of the woollen industry in Wales, and offers a service to the current woollen industry, which is modern in terms of skills and developing ways to use wool.

Helen Mary Jones: I would like to refer to the success of allowing free entry into our museums. As a family, we use the museum in Cardiff far more than we used to and that has benefited my child's education. It is wonderful to see so many young children, in particular, in the museum. However, if we want to use Kidwelly Castle in my constituency in the same way, we must pay quite an expensive admission fee, which means that many local people cannot visit. Does the Minister for Culture, Sport and the

hynny. A yw'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg yn credu y dylai'r Llywodraeth ystyried cynnwys CADW, efallai, mewn cynllun tebyg? Gwnaeth y Llywodraeth y peth iawn gyda'r amgueddfeydd a hoffwn weld yr un math o gynllun yn ymestyn i gynnwys CADW yn y dyfodol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gynnal trafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd i sicrhau hynny?

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): I would like to thank everyone for their contributions and I will discuss them as quickly as possible.

First, I can assure Owen John Thomas that my direction on the museum of art is certainly not confused. You are confused; it is not and neither am I. The culture strategy is also clear on that issue. There are many ways in which it is considering expanding the display of art as a result of my instruction. Pilot schemes are due to come on stream soon and we are considering, in particular, those areas of Wales where a branch of the national museum does not already exist because we are anxious to have an inclusive approach. Mid Wales, north-east Wales and part of south-west Wales are the type of areas where we are looking for suitable sites for pilot schemes.

Owen John, you admitted that you were unable to make a decision with regards to the diploma. I remind you that we are not a sixth form debating chamber. Plaid Cymru likes to discuss topics over which we have no control, however, I prefer to get on with doing something about what we can change and what we can affect. If the diploma is developed in Wales, I will make a statement on it. It must be something that could apply to people coming to Wales for their higher education. It cannot be something that would only have currency in Wales. We must provide qualifications that would be accepted elsewhere, although there could be a strong Welsh slant.

Rosemary referred quite rightly to the importance of modernising governance and

Welsh Language believe that the Government should consider including CADW in a similar scheme? The Government did the right thing with the museums and I would like a similar scheme to be extended to include CADW in future. Will the Minister hold discussions with the Minister for Environment to ensure that that happens?

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Carwn ddiolch i bawb am eu cyfraniadau. Fe'u trafodaf cyn gynted â phosibl.

Yn gyntaf, gallaf sicrhau Owen John Thomas nad yw fy nhrywydd ar yr amgueddfa gelf yn ddryslyd o gwbl. Chi sydd wedi drysu; nid yw hwnnw'n ddryslyd ac nid wyf innau chwaith. Mae'r strategaeth ddiwylliant yn glir ar y pwnc hwnnw hefyd. Mae'n ystyried ymestyn arddangosfeydd celf o ganlyniad i'm gorchymyn mewn sawl ffordd. Mae cynlluniau peilot i ddigwydd yn fuan ac yr ydym yn ystyried, yn arbennig, y rhannau hynny o Gymru lle nad oes cangen o'r amgueddfa genedlaethol eisoes yn bodoli gan ein bod yn awyddus i gael ymagwedd gynhwysol. Y canolbarth, y gogledd-ddwyrain a rhannau o'r de-orllewin yw'r mathau o ardaloedd lle yr ydym yn chwilio am safleoedd addas ar gyfer cynlluniau peilot.

Cyfaddefoch chi, Owen John, nad oeddech yn gallu penderfynu ar y syniad o ddiploma. Fe'ch atgoffaf nad siambr ddadlau chweched dosbarth mohonom. Hoffa Plaid Cymru drafod pynciau nad oes gennym reolaeth drostynt, fodd bynnag, mae'n well gennyf fwrw ymlaen â phethau y gallwn ni eu newid ac y gallwn ni effeithio arnynt. Os caiff y diploma ei ddatblygu yng Nghymru rhoddaf ddatganiad arno. Rhaid iddo fod yn rhywbeth a allai fod yn berthnasol i bobl a ddaw i Gymru i dderbyn eu haddysg uwch. Ni all fod yn rhywbeth perthnasol i Gymru'n unig. Rhaid i ni ddarparu cymwysterau a gânt eu derbyn mewn mannau eraill, er y byddai gogwydd Gymreig gref.

Cyfeiriodd Rosemary yn gyfiawn at bwysigrwydd moderneiddio llywodraeth ac at

to the importance of the schools' museums service. Every branch of the national museum has an education officer, but their role is far more important and demanding now in many ways, because of the big increase in visitor numbers. Overall, there has been a 90 per cent increase this year in the number of visitors to the museum. There are special challenges involved with that. School trips also raise special challenges, such as the question of transport. I am grateful that, through free entry to the museum's sites, we are able to reduce the overall cost for schools.

Dai Lloyd mentioned the proposed maritime museum in Swansea. I was pleased that we were able to put £6 million in the budget for next year to ensure the viability of that project. I applaud the teamwork involved between the museum and the local council. It is important that we use this teamwork, and perhaps copy it for similar projects. You asked about the timetable, Dai. The stage 2 bid is due to go to the Heritage Lottery Fund in June, and if all goes well with Objective 1 funding, and all the other variables, they are targeting an opening date in 2005.

Tom, I join you in paying tribute to museum staff. There has had to be a change of mindset as well as harder work as a result of increased visitor numbers. The Welsh Slate Museum in Llanberis is the star in the museum's firmament. It has had a 170 per cent increase in visitor numbers this year. Co-operation between the national library and the National Museums and Galleries of Wales is already going ahead. The exhibition of Will Roberts's paintings and drawings owned by the national library is currently on display in the national museum. The question of the overlap was considered in this review, and when the national library has its quinquennial review, it will be considered again.

Glyn, the key issue on free entry is timing. It is good in its own way, but the key issue that no-one has dealt with this morning is timing. We were able to move so quickly that we introduced it eight months ahead of England.

bwysigrwydd gwasanaeth ysgolion yr amgueddfa. Mae gan bob cangen o'r amgueddfa genedlaethol swyddog addysg, ond mae eu rôl yn awr yn llawer mwy dwys a phwysig na chynt mewn sawl ffordd, oherwydd y cynnydd mawr mewn niferoedd ymwelwyr. Yn gyffredinol, bu 90 y cant o gynnydd eleni yn nifer yr ymwelwyr â'r amgueddfa. Mae sialensau arbennig ynghlwm wrth hyn. Codir sialensau arbennig hefyd gan deithiau ysgolion megis cludiant. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ein bod, trwy fynediad am ddim i safleoedd yr amgueddfa, yn gallu gostwng y gost gyfan i ysgolion.

Soniodd Dai Lloyd am yr amgueddfa arforol arfaethedig yn Abertawe. Yr oeddwn yn falch inni allu rhoi £6 miliwn yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf i sicrhau ymarferoldeb y cynllun hwnnw. Canmolaf y gwaith tîm a fu rhwng yr amgueddfa a'r cyngor lleol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn defnyddio'r gwaith tîm hwn ac yn ei efelychu mewn prosiectau tebyg. Dai, gwnaethoch ofyn ynglŷn â'r amserlen. Disgwylir i'r cais cymal 2 gael ei gyflwyno i Gronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri ym mis Mehefin, ac os aiff popeth yn iawn gydag arian Amcan 1 a'r elfennau amrywiol eraill i gyd, y maent am ei hagor yn 2005.

Tom, ymunaf â chi i dalu teyrnged i staff yr amgueddfeydd. Bu'n rhaid newid meddylfryd yn ogystal â gweithio caletach o ganlyniad i gynnydd yn y niferoedd ymwelwyr. Amgueddfa Lechi Cymru yn Llanberis yw'r seren yn ffurfafen yr amgueddfa. Cafodd gynnydd o 170 y cant yn nifer ymwelwyr eleni. Mae cydweithio rhwng y llyfrgell genedlaethol ac Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru yn mynd rhagddo'n barod. Mae arddangosfa o ddarluniau a lluniau Will Roberts sy'n eiddo i'r llyfrgell genedlaethol yn cael ei dangos yn yr amgueddfa genedlaethol ar hyn o bryd. Mae cwestiwn y gorgyffwrdd wedi cael ei ystyried yn yr adolygiad hwn a phan gaiff y llyfrgell genedlaethol ei hadolygiad pum mlynedd caiff ei ystyried eto.

Glyn, y pwnc allweddol gyda mynediad am ddim yw amseru. Mae'n dda yn ei ffordd ei hun, ond y pwnc allweddol nad oes neb wedi delio ag ef y bore yma yw amseru. Yr oeddem yn symud mor gyflym fel inni allu ei

That means that it has given us a key tourism advantage, during hard times for the Welsh tourist industry, particularly in rural areas where several of the museum's sites are located. The museum is currently in discussion with the national library about art. As I have said, the issue of a national art gallery and the display of art is well under way in consultation. There is no point in having consultation and then not listening to the answers. That irritates people. You mentioned the bid for European Capital of Culture status. The museum is talking to Cardiff council about the display of art as part of that bid. There are ongoing discussions on that. I was delighted that we were able to re-ignite the museum-going habit as a result of free entry. Museum fees, which were introduced in the 1970s, did much harm.

John mentioned free entry. It is worth pointing out that there are 41 local authority museums, 22 of which have free entry, including the Newport Museum. We need to work on that issue. The museum already loans many works of art throughout Wales, but I agree that it needs to do more. However, there is an associated cost. Often, hidden works of art need much work to be carried out on them and they cannot always be loaned. They need a secure location and, sometimes, the right climatic conditions.

The current policy of the national museum is to develop industrial heritage strongly. The National Mining Museum of Wales, Big Pit, became a part of the national museum this year and free entry has meant that many new visitors have been attracted to Blaenafon. That is important. There is also the planned maritime museum in Swansea.

Regarding Delyth's comments about free access, it is an opportunity, but also a challenge. It is about more than dealing with more visitors, it is a whole revolution in the way of thinking. I know that the national museum is aware of pinch points at certain

gyflwyno wyth mis yn gynt na Lloegr. Golyga hyn ei fod wedi rhoi mantais dwristiaeth allweddol i ni, yn ystod cyfnod caled i ddiwydiant twristiaeth Cymru, yn enwedig yn yr ardaloedd gwledig lle y ceir llawer o safleoedd yr amgueddfa. Ar hyn o bryd mae'r amgueddfa yn cynnal trafodaeth gyda'r llyfrgell genedlaethol ynglŷn â chelf. Fel y dywedais, ymgynghorir ar bwnc oriel gelf genedlaethol ac arddangos celf ers tro. Nid oes unrhyw ddiben mewn ymgynghori ac yna wrthod gwranddo ar yr atebion. Mae hynny'n codi gwrychyn pobl. Sonioch am y cynnig am statws Prifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop. Mae'r amgueddfa yn trafod arddangos celf gyda chyngor Caerdydd fel rhan o'r cynnig hwnnw. Mae trafodaethau'n parhau ar hynny. Yr oeddwn wrth fy modd inni allu ail-gynneu'r arfer o fynychu amgueddfeydd drwy gynnig mynediad am ddim. Gwnaeth taliadau mynediad i amgueddfeydd, a gyflwynwyd yn y 1970au, lawer o ddrwg.

Soniodd John am fynediad am ddim. Mae'n werth nodi bod 41 o amgueddfeydd awdurdodau lleol, 22 â mynediad am ddim, gan gynnwys Amgueddfa Casnewydd. Rhaid i ni weithio ar y pwnc hwnnw. Eisoes mae'r amgueddfa yn rhoi llawer o weithiau celf ar fenthyg ar draws Cymru, ond cytunaf fod angen iddi wneud rhagor. Fodd bynnag, y mae cost cysylltiedig. Yn aml, mae angen gwneud gwaith cadwraeth mawr ar weithiau celf a guddiwyd, ac ni ellir eu rhoi ar fenthyg bob tro. Mae angen lleoliad diogel arnynt, ac weithiau yr amodau hinsoddol cywir.

Polisi cyfredol yr amgueddfa genedlaethol yw datblygu treftadaeth ddiwydiannol yn gadarn. Daeth Pwll Mawr, Amgueddfa Lofaol Genedlaethol Cymru yn rhan o'r amgueddfa genedlaethol eleni ac mae mynediad am ddim wedi golygu bod llawer o ymwelwyr newydd wedi cael eu denu i Flaenafon. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Hefyd mae'r amgueddfa forol arfaethedig yn Abertawe.

Ynglŷn â sylwadau Delyth ynghylch mynediad am ddim, y mae'n gyfle ond hefyd yn sialens. Mae'n ymwneud â mwy na delio â rhagor o ymwelwyr, mae'n chwyldroi'r meddylfryd. Gwn fod yr amgueddfa genedlaethol yn ymwybodol o dagfannau

popular events, such as the winter fair, and they are working to deal with that as effectively and swiftly as possible.

mewn rhai digwyddiadau poblogaidd, megis y ffair calan gaeaf a'u bod yn gweithio ar ddelio â hynny mor effeithiol a chyflym â phosibl.

In conclusion, I commend this excellent review to Members.

I gloi, cymeradwyaf yr adolygiad ardderchog hwn i'r Aelodau.

11:25 a.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 1: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 2: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael

Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigïaf fod

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 6.16, brings forward the debate on the report of the task and finish group on workforce issues in social care which was deferred from 27 November. *y Cynulliad, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn dwyn ymlaen y ddadl ar adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar faterion y gweithlu mewn gofal cymdeithasol a ohiriwyd o 27 Tachwedd.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Adroddiad y Grŵp Gorchwyl a Gorffen ar Faterion y Gweithlu mewn Gofal Cymdeithasol

The Report of the Task and Finish Group on Workforce Issues in Social Care

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. notes that the delivery of quality social care services is dependent on there being a quality workforce in place and recognises that staff must be at the centre of our agenda to raise standards and improve protection for those who use those services;

1. yn nodi bod darparu gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol o ansawdd yn dibynnu ar fod gweithlu o ansawdd ar gael ac yn cydnabod bod yn rhaid i'r holl staff fod yn ganolog i'n hagenda i godi safonau a gwella diogelwch y sawl sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau hyn;

2. notes that there are complex, long-term recruitment and retention difficulties in the social care workforce which are affecting the ability to deliver quality services to all who need them;

2. yn nodi bod anawsterau cymhleth a hirdymor o ran recriwtio a chadw staff yn y maes gofal cymdeithasol sy'n effeithio ar y gallu i ddarparu gwasanaethau o ansawdd i bob un sydd eu hangen;

3. notes that the recommendations of the task and finish group on workforce issues provide the framework for long-term strategies to tackle these issues through sustainable, long-term action which must be taken in partnership with all employers, planners, commissioners, regulators, trainers and with the staff themselves. (NDM861)

3. yn nodi bod argymhellion y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar faterion gweithlu yn rhoi'r fframwaith ar gyfer strategaethau hir-dymor i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn trwy weithredu cynaliadwy, hir-dymor y mae'n rhaid ei wneud mewn partneriaeth â'r holl gyflogwyr, cynllunwyr, comisiynwyr, rheoleiddwyr, hyfforddwyr a'r staff eu hunain. (NDM861)

Social care is one of the most important service areas in Wales today. A complex range of services is provided for the most vulnerable people in our society to live as independently and safely as possible. We need flexible and responsive social care services that are properly integrated with other local services to ensure that individuals and families receive the support that they need.

There are now over 100,000 people in Wales at any one time who receive support from social services in their own homes, in day settings and in residential and nursing homes. If such services are to be available, we must have a sustainable, quality workforce in place across the sector, with the skills and experience to deliver them. The social care workforce is large and continues to grow. There are currently over 70,000 staff in the sector, 53 per cent of whom work for private and voluntary employers. It is predicted that at least 2,000 new staff will be needed in the sector per year for the next five years, as service provision grows and diversifies. From an economic perspective, social care is a major employer in Wales, making up over 5 per cent of the total workforce and making a tangible contribution to the economy and the quality of life of many people in Wales. Our social care staff carry out difficult and demanding work in challenging circumstances, which demands special skills and qualities. We must recognise the value of those staff and their work. They must be at the centre of our agenda to raise standards and improve protection.

I will support amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan on the important role of social workers. Improving the image and profile of staff and their work is essential, and work on this has begun. Over time, there has been increasing concern about recruitment and retention in the workforce and about how these difficulties are impacting on the ability to deliver services. While initially being highlighted in respect of social workers in children's and family services, it is clear that these concerns relate

Gofal cymdeithasol yw un o'r meysydd gwasanaeth pwysicaf yng Nghymru heddiw. Darperir ystod gymhleth o wasanaethau i'r bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn yn ein cymdeithas er mwyn iddynt allu byw mor annibynnol a diogel â phosibl. Mae angen gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol hyblyg ac ymatebol a gaiff eu hintegreiddio'n iawn â gwasanaethau lleol eraill i sicrhau bod unigolion a theuluoedd yn derbyn y gefnogaeth sydd ei hangen arnynt.

Bellach, ar unrhyw adeg, mae dros 100,000 o bobl yng Nghymru sy'n derbyn cymorth gan y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn eu cartrefi, mewn lleoliadau dydd ac mewn cartrefi preswyl a chartrefi nyrsio. I sicrhau bod gwasanaethau o'r fath ar gael, mae'n rhaid i ni gael gweithlu cynaliadwy, o ansawdd da ar waith ar draws y sector, gyda'r sgiliau a'r profiad i'w darparu. Mae'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yn fawr ac yn parhau i dyfu. Ar hyn o bryd, mae dros 70,000 o aelodau o staff yn y sector, 53 y cant ohonynt yn gweithio i gyflogwyr preifat a gwirfoddol. Rhagwelir y bydd angen o leiaf 2,000 o aelodau newydd o staff yn y sector bob blwyddyn am y pum mlynedd nesaf, wrth i'r ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau dyfu ac amrywio. O bersbectif economaidd, mae gofal cymdeithasol yn gyflogwr mawr yng Nghymru, sef dros 5 y cant o gyfanswm y gweithlu sy'n gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol i'r economi ac i ansawdd bywyd llawer o bobl yng Nghymru. Mae ein staff gofal cymdeithasol yn cyflawni gwaith anodd a beichus o dan amgylchiadau heriol, sy'n gofyn am sgiliau a rhinweddau arbennig. Rhaid inni gydnabod gwerth y staff hynny a'u gwaith. Rhaid iddynt fod yng nghanol ein hagenda i godi safonau a gwella diogelwch.

Cefnogaf welliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan ar rôl bwysig gweithwyr cymdeithasol. Mae gwella delwedd a phroffil staff a'u gwaith yn hanfodol, ac mae gwaith ar hyn wedi cychwyn. Gydag amser, bu pryder cynyddol ynglŷn â recriwtio a chadw staff yn y gweithlu ac ynglŷn â sut y mae'r anawsterau hyn yn effeithio ar y gallu i ddarparu gwasanaethau. Er y codwyd y pryderon ar y cychwyn, ynglŷn â gweithwyr cymdeithasol yn y gwasanaethau plant a theuluoedd, mae'n amlwg bod y pryderon hyn yn ymwneud â

to all service areas—to public, private and voluntary sector employers alike. The problems are complex and multidimensional and they cannot be resolved quickly or simply.

In order to set out a strategic framework to tackle these issues, I established a specialist task and finish group at the beginning of this year, chaired by Graham Williams, chief inspector of the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales. The group has reported to me and to the Health and Social Services Committee with recommendations to enable the sector to deliver the change required. The messages from the task and finish group are clear: if we are to protect and develop services for vulnerable people, we must reverse the developing workforce trends, through sustainable, long-term action and investment. We must take that action together and embrace the message that this is one workforce for one sector. Therefore, there must be consistent standards throughout that workforce.

I endorse the recommendations set out in the report of the task and finish group. They set out clearly the work that must be pursued in Wales. In that respect, I support the spirit of amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies in relation to the implementation of the recommendations. I accept that this amendment is applicable where we are responsible for implementing the recommendations. Others, such as the Care Council for Wales and employers, also have that responsibility. We must ensure that we monitor the implementation of the recommendations.

The social care workforce will look forward to our debate today, as we give the sector the profile it deserves.

David Lloyd: Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwaneger y pwynt canlynol ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar y Llywodraeth Llafur-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i weithredu argymhellion y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar faterion gweithlu.

phob maes gwasanaeth—â chyflogwyr y sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol fel ei gilydd. Mae'r problemau yn gymhleth ac yn amlochrog ac ni ellir eu datrys yn gyflym nac yn syml.

Er mwyn gosod fframwaith strategol i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn, sefydlais grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen arbenigol ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn hon, dan gadeiryddiaeth Graham Williams, prif arolygydd Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru. Mae'r grŵp wedi cyflwyno adroddiad i mi a'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gydag argymhellion i alluogi'r sector i ddarparu'r newid sydd ei angen. Mae negeseuon y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yn glir: er mwyn diogelu a datblygu gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl ddiamddiffyn, mae'n rhaid inni droi tueddiadau datblygiadol y gweithlu o chwith, drwy weithredu a buddsoddi'n gynaliadwy dros y tymor hir. Rhaid inni gymryd y camau hynny gyda'n gilydd a derbyn y neges mai un gweithlu ar gyfer un sector yw hwn. Felly, dylid sicrhau bod safonau cyson ledled y gweithlu hwnnw.

Cymeradwyaf yr argymhellion a nodwyd yn adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen. Amlinellwyd yn glir y gwaith y dylid ei gyflawni yng Nghymru. Yn hynny o beth, cefnogaf ysbryd gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies ynglŷn â gweithredu'r argymhellion. Derbyniaf fod y gwelliant hwn yn berthnasol lle yr ydym yn gyfrifol am weithredu'r argymhellion. Mae gan eraill hefyd, megis Cyngor Gofal Cymru a chyflogwyr, y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw hefyd. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn monitro'r gwaith o weithredu'r argymhellion.

Bydd y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yn edrych ymlaen at ein dadl heddiw, wrth inni roi i'r sector y proffil y mae'n ei haeddu.

David Lloyd: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Labour-Liberal Democrat Government to implement the recommendations of the task and finish group on workforce issues.

Datganaf fy muddiant arferol fel meddyg teulu ac aelod o Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe.

I declare my usual interest as a general practitioner and a member of Swansea City and County Council.

Mae hwn yn ddiwrnod da a phwysig: yr ydym yn cynnal dadl ar ofal cymdeithasol ac yn codi proffil y gwaith drwy wneud hynny. Croesawaf adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffenn ar faterion yn ymwneud â gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol. Mae'r adroddiad yn ddadansoddiad trwyadl a manwl o'r pwnc. Mae hwn yn fater hollbwysig gan fod argyfwng yn y sector a rhaid inni weithredu ar fyrder. Wynebwn sialens sylweddol wrth geisio recriwtio a chadw staff yn y sector. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r pwysau gwaith, y morâl a'r statws isel, yr amodau gwaith sydd yn llai na pherffaith a'r cyflogau gwael. Yr ydym hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r trosiant uchel o weithwyr cymdeithasol. Yr wyf felly yn ategu nifer o bwyntiau Jane Hutt ynglŷn â'r sector hwn.

This is a good and important day: we are debating and raising the profile of social care. I welcome the task and finish group's report on issues relating to the social care workforce. The report is a thorough and detailed analysis of the subject. This is a pressing matter as the sector is in crisis and we must take urgent action. We face a considerable challenge in trying to recruit and retain social care staff. We are aware of the pressures of work, the low morale and status, the working conditions that are less than perfect and the poor salaries. We are also aware of the high turnover of social workers. I therefore endorse several points raised by Jane Hutt about this sector.

Yr wyf am danlinellu rhai o argymhellion yr adroddiad. Yn gyntaf, mae angen gwybodaeth sicr am y gweithlu—o ran niferoedd a'i natur. Yn ail, fel y soniodd Jane Hutt, mae angen cyflogi staff ag arbenigedd ym maes cysylltiadau cyhoeddus i roi gwell delwedd i'r sector hollbwysig hwn. Yn drydydd, mae angen annog cydweithio rhwng gwahanol gyrff, awdurdodau lleol a'r Cynulliad i hybu strategaethau recriwtio a chadw staff, a chydweithio ar gyflogau ac amodau gwaith. Yn bennaf, mae angen gweithredu'r argymhellion hyn ar fyrder.

I will highlight some of the report's recommendations. First, we need definitive information about the workforce—in terms of numbers and its nature. Secondly, as Jane Hutt said, we need to employ staff with public relations skills to promote a better image of this all-important sector. Thirdly, we must encourage collaboration between the various organisations, local authorities and the Assembly to promote recruitment and retention strategies, and collaboration on wages and working conditions. Above all, these recommendations must be implemented without delay.

11:35 a.m.

David Melding: I propose amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

David Melding: Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegwch y pwynt canlynol ar ddiwedd y cynnig

recognises the professionalism and dedication of social workers and the need for the National Assembly to promote a more positive public understanding of the role they play in delivering social care.

yn cydnabod gwaith proffesiynol ac ymroddiad gweithwyr cymdeithasol a'r angen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hybu dealltwriaeth fwy cadarnhaol o'r rhan a chwaraeir ganddynt mewn darparu gofal cymdeithasol.

I am pleased to propose this amendment on behalf of the Welsh Conservative group. I thank the Minister for saying she supports the amendment. It was meant to be constructive and to highlight social workers in particular,

Yr wyf yn falch o gynnig y gwelliant hwn ar ran grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ddweud ei bod yn cefnogi'r gwelliant. Bwriadwyd iddo fod yn adeiladol gan amlygu gweithwyr cymdeithasol yn

although they are but a section of a large workforce that includes over 70,000 people in Wales. They are the key players in the social care workforce and their role has been poorly understood among the public for many years. Politicians have to take some of the blame for that, because demands on social workers have continued to grow since the 1970s. As we have become more demanding about the level of standards that we expect in social care, the challenges facing social workers have grown considerably.

arbennig, er mai dim ond un adran ydynt o weithlu mawr sy'n cynnwys dros 70,000 o bobl yng Nghymru. Hwyl yw'r prif chwaraewyr yn y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol a phrin iawn oedd y ddealltwriaeth o'u rôl ymhlith y cyhoedd am lawer o flynyddoedd. Rhaid i wleidyddion gymryd rhywfaint o'r bai am hynny, oherwydd bod y galw ar weithwyr cymdeithasol wedi parhau i dyfu ers y 1970au. Wrth inni roi pwyslais trymach ar lefel y safonau y disgwyliwn o fewn gofal cymdeithasol, mae'r her sy'n wynebu gweithwyr cymdeithasol wedi tyfu'n sylweddol.

I remind you of recent revelations about the standard of children services, particularly where there has been a heavy reliance on residential homes. We have seen the Waterhouse report. There have been other massive shifts in the delivery of social care since the early 1990s. For example, the move to community care and sustaining those who are vulnerable within our communities such as people with learning difficulties, as well as the elderly and the frail, who are now being encouraged to live in the community and have far higher expectations than previously.

Fe'ch atgoffaf o'r wybodaeth ddiweddar a ddatgelwyd ynglŷn â safon gwasanaethau plant, yn enwedig lle y cafwyd dibyniaeth gref ar gartrefi preswyl. Gwelsom adroddiad Waterhouse. Bu symudiadau sylweddol eraill ym maes darparu gofal cymdeithasol ers y 1990au cynnar. Er enghraifft, y symudiad at ofal yn y gymuned a chynnal y rhai sy'n ddiameddiffyn yn ein cymunedau, megis pobl ag anableddau dysgu, yn ogystal â'r henoed a'r eiddil, sydd bellach yn cael eu hannog i fyw yn y gymuned ac yn disgwyl llawer mwy nag yr oeddent yn flaenorol.

We need to send a message to those who are considering taking a postgraduate social work qualification that they are entering a career with a high level of vocational commitment but which has the backing of all political parties in the Assembly. It is a most worthy career choice to make. It is not airy and idealistic; it is doing something that will help many of the most vulnerable people in our communities. We must recognise that social workers need consistent support. It is not good enough for us to focus on isolated examples without emphasising that social workers, as a professional body, continue to undertake their duties in a highly professional way.

Mae angen inni anfon neges at y rhai sy'n ystyried astudio am gymhwyster mewn gofal cymdeithasol i ôl-raddedigion eu bod yn dechrau ar yrfa sy'n gofyn am lefel uchel o ymrwymiad galwedigaethol ond sydd â chefnogaeth pob plaid yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n ddewis gyrfa tra haeddiannol. Nid yw'n ddisylwedd nac yn ddelfrydyddol; mae'n golygu gwneud rhywbeth a fydd yn helpu llawer o'r bobl fwyaf diameddiffyn yn ein cymunedau. Rhaid inni sylweddoli bod angen cefnogaeth gyson ar weithwyr cymdeithasol. Nid yw canolbwytio ar enghreifftiau ynysig yn ddigon da heb bwysleisio bod gweithwyr cymdeithasol, fel corff proffesiynol, yn parhau i ymgymryd â'u dyletswyddau mewn ffordd broffesiynol iawn.

We must consider other factors such as career development, the availability of further postgraduate qualifications, how senior practitioners can be retained without going into administration and management and the financial rewards that social workers receive. For example, a social worker dealing with a

Rhaid inni ystyried ffactorau eraill megis datblygu gyrfa, argaeledd cymwysterau ôl-raddedig pellach, sut y gellir cadw uwch ymarferwyr heb symud i faes gweinyddol a rheoli a'r gwobrau ariannol a gaiff gweithwyr cymdeithasol. Er enghraifft, efallai y telir cyflog sylweddol llai i weithiwr cymdeithasol

heavy caseload in children's services may be paid considerably less than a teacher with the same years of experience in his or her profession. That is not a happy comparison. I am concerned about vacancy rates in key areas. Children's services are the worst, but there are vacancy rates across county councils in wide sectors of social care.

On the matter of the more general workforce, we are properly committed to increasing the level of qualifications among people who work in social care. Social workers have always been a highly qualified section of the workforce. It is proper that we look at the rest of the workforce and encourage the introduction of a vocational qualification because many people engaged in social care are unqualified and poorly trained. For example, given that community care sustains so many people in their homes, the emphasis and reliance on domiciliary services and care workers has increased vastly, yet few people in that sector have any level of qualification. It is appropriate that we encourage them to get qualifications and access training. When we do, we have to realise that people's expectations, in terms of pay and conditions, will increase. We face that issue across the social care sector. We must be realistic about the costs that these new, proper, standards that we are demanding of the sector will require. Costs are rising and we must recognise that in our future budgetary provisions.

Finally, the social workers who are employed in county councils across Wales do an excellent job. They have the confidence of the politicians in the National Assembly and we encourage them to be sustained in their chosen profession—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to finish now, David.

David Melding: We look forward to their excellent contribution in years to come.

Christine Gwyther: I welcome this report and the emphasis being placed on this most

sy'n delio â baich gwaith trwm o fewn gwasanaethau plant nag athro neu athrawes sydd â'r un blynyddoedd o brofiad proffesiynol. Nid yw hon yn gymhariaeth foddhaol. Pryderaf am nifer y swyddi gwag mewn meysydd allweddol. Gwasanaethau plant yw'r gwaethaf, ond mae nifer o swyddi gwag ar draws cynghorau sir mewn sectorau eang o ofal cymdeithasol.

O ran y gweithlu mwy cyffredinol, yr ydym yn llwyr ymrwymedig i gynyddu lefel y cymwysterau ymhlith pobl sy'n gweithio ym maes gofal cymdeithasol. Bu gweithwyr cymdeithasol bob amser yn adran dra chymwys o'r gweithlu. Mae'n briodol i ni edrych ar weddill y gweithlu ac annog cyflwyno cymhwyster galwedigaethol gan nad oes cymwysterau gan lawer o'r bobl sy'n ymwneud â gofal cymdeithasol ac nid ydynt wedi cael hyfforddiant digonol. Er enghraifft, gan fod gofal yn y gymuned yn cynnal cymaint o bobl yn eu cartrefi, mae'r pwyslais a'r ddibyniaeth ar wasanaethau cartref a gweithwyr gofal wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol, ond prin iawn yw nifer y bobl yn y sector hwnnw sydd ag unrhyw lefel o gymwysterau. Mae'n briodol inni eu hannog i ennill cymwysterau a chael hyfforddiant. Wrth wneud hynny, rhaid i ni sylweddoli y bydd disgwyliadau pobl, o ran cyflog ac amodau, yn codi. Wynebwn y mater ar draws y sector gofal cymdeithasol. Rhaid inni fod yn realistig ynglŷn â'r costau a fydd yn deillio o'r safonau newydd, cyfiawn hyn yr ydym yn galw amdanynt yn y sector. Mae costau yn codi a rhaid inni gydnabod hynny yn ein darpariaethau cyllidebol yn y dyfodol.

I gloi, mae'r gweithwyr cymdeithasol a gyflogir mewn cynhgorau sir ledled Cymru yn cyflawni gwaith arbennig. Mae ganddynt hyder y gwleidyddion yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac fe'u hanogwn i aros yn eu dewis broffesiwn—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi orffen yn awr, David.

David Melding: Edrychwn ymlaen at eu cyfraniad rhagorol yn ystod y blynyddoedd i ddod.

Christine Gwyther: Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn a'r pwyslais a roddir ar y mater pwysig

important issue of social care. First, I will concentrate on homecare workers. There is a surprising amount of ignorance, often at the highest level of management, of the skills and qualities needed to be a good homecare worker. Interpersonal skills are paramount. Care workers are dealing with the deeply personal issues and problems of our society's most vulnerable members. Organisational skills are vital. Juggling a heavy workload so that clients do not feel rushed or pressurised is difficult. Technical skills, such as the proper use of lifting apparatus, are worth a small fortune to clients, who need to feel safe in the hands of their carers. How have we repaid the years of training, experience and commitment of these workers? For the most part, we ignore and undervalue them. I have seen that time and again as a union representative in my home county.

hwn ynglŷn â gofal cymdeithasol. Yn gyntaf, canolbwyntiaf ar weithwyr gofal cartref. Mae'n syndod faint o anwybodaeth sydd, yn aml ar y lefel rheoli uchaf, am y sgiliau a'r rhinweddau sydd eu hangen i fod yn weithiwr gofal cartref da. Mae sgiliau rhyngbersonol yn hanfodol. Mae gweithwyr cymdeithasol yn delio â materion a phroblemau tra phersonol aelodau mwyaf diamddiffyn ein cymdeithas. Mae sgiliau trefniadol yn hanfodol. Mae ceisio cydbwysu baich gwaith trwm er mwyn sicrhau nad yw cleientiaid yn teimlo fel pe baent yn cael eu brysio neu o dan bwysau yn anodd. Mae sgiliau technegol, megis y defnydd cywir o offer codi, yn werthfawr iawn i gleientiaid, sydd angen teimlo'n ddiogel yn nwylo eu gofalwyr. Sut yr ydym wedi ad-dalu blynyddoedd o hyfforddiant, profiad ac ymrwymiad y gweithwyr hyn? Ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf, yr ydym yn eu hanwybyddu ac yn eu tanbrisio. Yr wyf wedi gweld hynny dro ar ôl tro fel cynrychiolydd undeb yn fy sir.

Pembrokeshire County Council and Carmarthenshire County Council have an enormous problem with their homecare workforce. That is primarily due to the lack of fixed hours contracts. The banding system gives only limited protection of hours and allocation of hours is largely in the hands of local organisers. Weekend working, now recognised as very necessary, has the most minimal of enhanced payments. Unsocial hours working has increased due to the continual shift towards personal rather than domestic care. Personal care tends to be built around getting clients up, washed and dressed in the morning and getting them to bed. Those are often difficult times for the carers themselves. Homecare workers in rural counties are particularly disadvantaged. For example, in Pembrokeshire, homecare workers are only paid mileage to reach their first client and after visiting their last. Anything in between—and try to picture how large a county Pembrokeshire is—is the homecare worker's responsibility. They pay for the privilege of travelling around to care for people.

Mae gan Gyngor Sir Penfro a Chyngor Sir Caerfyrddin broblem enfawr â'u gweithlu gofal cartref. Yn bennaf, mae hynny o ganlyniad i'r prinder contractau oriau sefydlog. Dim ond diogelwch cyfyngedig o ran oriau a ddarperir gan y system fandio ac mae'r gwaith o ddyrannu oriau yn bennaf yn nwylo'r trefnwyr lleol. Prin iawn yw'r taliadau ychwanegol a gynigir am waith ar y penwythnos, a gydnabyddir bellach fel gwaith angenrheidiol iawn. Mae gweithio oriau anghymdeithasol wedi cynyddu yn sgîl y symudiad parhaus tuag at ofal personol yn hytrach na gofal domestig. Mae gofal personol yn tueddu i ymwneud â chodi cleientiaid, eu golchi a'u gwisgo yn y bore a'u rhoi yn eu gwely. Mae'r rheini yn aml yn amserau anodd i'r gofalwyr eu hunain. Mae gweithwyr gofal cartref mewn siroedd gwledig o dan anfantais arbennig. Er enghraifft, yn Sir Benfro, dim ond ar gyfer y daith i gyrraedd eu cleient cyntaf a'r daith ar ôl ymweld â'u cleient olaf y telir costau teithio i weithwyr gofal cartref. Cyfrifoldeb y gweithiwr gofal cartref—a cheisiwch ddychmygu cymaint yw maint Sir Benfro—yw unrhyw deithiau rhyngddynt. Talant am y fraint o deithio o amgylch yn gofalu am bobl.

More generally, there is an issue among those at professional level where neighbouring

Yn fwy cyffredinol, mae problem ymhlith y rhai sydd ar lefel broffesiynol lle mae

authorities offer higher salaries and better conditions. David Melding alluded to the difficulties of recruiting and retaining staff when there are different levels of reward. We also see this in the health service, and social care recruitment practice only exacerbates the overall problem. I agree that there must be a public relations strategy; appendix 5 of the report lays that out. However, we must ensure that our social care workers are valued and that their commitment, and how much they value the people in their care, is recognised. If we get it right, social care will become a profession to which people at all levels will be proud to belong. However, we will not buy off a disaffected workforce with slogans, adverts and glossy literature. We must recognise their worth.

I welcome Jane Hutt's personal commitment—which was obvious in her statement—and her understanding that people who look after others deserve our support. This report is the first step on the social care road to recovery.

Helen Mary Jones: I welcome the opportunity to take part in this important debate on a serious issue. Colleagues will be aware that almost a year ago, the Central Council for Education and Training in Social Work in Wales and the Association of Directors of Social Services jointly published a report, which stated that 25 per cent of childcare and social work jobs in Wales were vacant. A quarter of the jobs needed to protect and care for our most vulnerable children could not be filled. Some of these jobs, as the Minister knows, have been vacant for months, some for more than a year. At almost the same time, the Government of Wales report on progress in implementing the Waterhouse report's recommendations made it clear to the Health and Social Services Committee that some of those recommendations were hard to implement because of the staff shortage, particularly the recommendation that looked after children, whether in foster care or in children's homes, should be visited regularly by a social worker from their home community. That is apparently difficult to implement and does not happen regularly for many looked after

awdurdodau cyfagos yn cynnig cyflogau uwch ac amodau gwell. Cyfeiriodd David Melding at anawsterau recriwtio a chadw staff pan geir lefelau gwahanol o wobrau. Gwelwn hyn hefyd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, a dim ond dwysáu'r broblem gyffredinol a wna ymarfer recriwtio gofal cymdeithasol. Cytunaf y dylid cael strategaeth cysylltiadau cyhoeddus; noda atodiad 5 yr adroddiad hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein gweithwyr gofal cymdeithasol yn cael eu gwerthfawrogi ac y cydnabyddir eu hymrwymiad, ynghyd â chymaint y maent yn gwerthfawrogi'r bobl yn eu gofal. Os cymerwn y camau cywir, daw gofal cymdeithasol yn broffesiwn y bydd pobl ar bob lefel yn falch i fod yn rhan ohono. Fodd bynnag, ni phrynwn ffafr gweithlu anafdlon gyda sloganau, hysbysebion a llenyddiaeth sgleiniog. Rhaid inni gydnabod eu gwerth.

Croesawaf ymrwymiad personol Jane Hutt—a oedd yn amlwg yn ei datganiad—a'i dealltwriaeth bod pobl sy'n gofalu am eraill yn haeddu ein cefnogaeth. Yr adroddiad yw'r cam cyntaf tuag at wella gofal cymdeithasol.

Helen Mary Jones: Croesawaf y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl bwysig hon ar fater difrifol. Bydd fy nghyd-Aelodau yn ymwybodol, bron flwyddyn yn ôl, i'r Cyngor Canolog dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant mewn Gwaith Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru a Chymdeithas y Cyfarwyddwyr Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gyhoeddi adroddiad ar y cyd, a oedd yn datgan bod 25 y cant o swyddi gofal plant a gwaith cymdeithasol yng Nghymru yn wag. Nid oedd modd llenwi chwarter o'r swyddi yr oedd eu hangen i warchod a gofalu am ein plant mwyaf diamddiffyn. Bu rhai o'r swyddi hyn, fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, yn wag am fisoedd, rhai am dros flwyddyn. Ar bron yr un pryd, amlygodd adroddiad Llywodraeth Cymru ar gynnydd wrth weithredu argymhellion adroddiad Waterhouse i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y ffaith bod rhai o'r argymhellion hynny yn anodd i'w gweithredu oherwydd y prinder staff, yn enwedig yr argymhelliad y dylai plant sy'n derbyn gofal, pa un a ydynt mewn gofal maeth neu mewn cartrefi plant, dderbyn ymweliadau cyson gan weithiwr cymdeithasol o'u cymuned cartref.

children. I know that the Minister understands the seriousness of the situation. With regard to childcare vacancies, I would appreciate more information from her, either today or in written form, about whether or not we still face such a serious position. We would all agree that 25 per cent of those jobs being vacant constitutes a crisis. I am sure that the Minister will also agree that those kinds of figures must give enormous impetus to the urgent implementation of this report.

Mae hynny, i bob golwg, yn anodd ei weithredu ac nid yw'n digwydd yn aml i lawer o blant sy'n derbyn gofal. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn deall difrifoldeb y sefyllfa. O ran swyddi gwag ym maes gofal plant, byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi cael mwy o wybodaeth ganddi, naill ai heddiw neu ar ffurf ysgrifenedig, ynglŷn â pha un a ydym yn wynebu sefyllfa ddifrifol o hyd ai peidio. Byddem oll yn cytuno bod y ffaith bod 25 y cant o'r swyddi hynny yn wag yn argyfyngus. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Gweinidog hefyd yn cytuno bod yn rhaid bod y math hynny o ffigurau yn rhoi hwb enfawr i'r broses o weithredu'r adroddiad hwn ar fyrder.

11:45 a.m.

I agree with everything that David Melding said about the importance of social and care workers. As a former social and community worker, I know that it is a hard and often challenging role, but that it can also be incredibly rewarding. As David Melding rightly said, it is incredibly important. As many contributors to this debate have also already said, we must send the message to social workers and care workers that they are valued. The crisis of the Children's Society shows how much we need those people and skills. However, while jobs are unfilled and while we have, as Christine Gwyther said, an undermotivated workforce who are often looking for work elsewhere—sadly, often across the border—children and other vulnerable young people are at risk. Can the Minister give us a timeframe for the implementation of this report—certainly for those aspects that are within the Assembly's direct control? Also, will she report back to the Health and Social Services Committee on a timeframe for those aspects that rely on partnerships?

Cytunaf â phopeth a ddywedodd David Melding am bwysigrwydd gweithwyr cymdeithasol a gweithwyr gofal. Fel cyn weithiwr cymdeithasol a chymunedol, gwn ei bod yn rôl anodd sy'n aml yn heriol, ond gall roi cryn foddhad hefyd. Fel y dywedodd David Melding yn gywir, mae'n hynod o bwysig. Fel y dywedodd llawer o gyfranwyr at y ddadl hon eisoes, rhaid inni anfon y neges at weithwyr cymdeithasol a gweithwyr gofal eu bod yn cael eu gwerthfawrogi. Dengys argyfwng Cymdeithas y Plant gymaint y mae angen y bobl hynny a'r sgiliau hynny arnom. Fodd bynnag, tra bod swyddi heb eu llenwi a thra bod gennym, fel y dywedodd Christine Gwyther, weithlu prin o gymhelliant sy'n aml yn edrych am waith mewn mannau eraill—yn anffodus, ar draws y ffin—mae plant a phobl ifanc ddiamddiffyn eraill mewn perygl. A all y Gweinidog roi cyfradd amser inni ar gyfer gweithredu'r adroddiad hwn—yn sicr ar gyfer yr agweddau hynny sydd o fewn rheolaeth uniongyrchol y Cynulliad? Yn ogystal, a wnaiff adrodd yn ôl i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar amserlen ar gyfer yr agweddau hynny sy'n dibynnu ar bartneriaethau?

Peter Law: I declare an interest as a member of the GMB and that some of my family members work in the social services and in the health service. I welcome the report and commend and thank Graham Williams and his team on their work. I have been pleased on occasion in this Chamber to pay tribute to doctors, professional nurses, professionals

Peter Law: Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o'r GMB a chan fod rhai o aelodau fy rheulu yn gweithio ym maes gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Croesawaf yr adroddiad a chymeradwyaf a diolchaf i Graham Williams a'i dîm ar eu gwaith. Yr wyf wedi bod yn falch, ar adegau yn y Siambr hon i dalu teyrnged i feddygon,

allied to medicine, dentists and pharmacists. I have strongly supported the Minister's efforts to recognise those people. However, I take the opportunity today to highlight the great contribution of community care social services staff, and particularly homecarers. I was glad that Christine Gwyther referred to them. I also mention the nursing assistants and the general ancillary staff of the NHS. They are not part of this report, but it is important to mention them. Many of these people are proud members of the General Municipal Workers Union, UNISON, the Transport and General Workers Union and the Manufacturing, Science and Finance Union and play an important role in caring for patients and clients. It is too easy to miss the valued approach of these frontline professionals. Too often, they have been referred to as manual workers. They work hard and are just as committed as any other member of staff, whether that be the director of social services or the chief executive of a trust, right through to the excellent domestic and catering staff that work for our patients and clients throughout Wales.

At one time or another, all our lives, or the lives of someone in our family, will be touched by these good people's work. I pay particular tribute to the great professionals who work so well for local authorities—the homecarers. The Tories wanted, and would still like to, privatise that profession. The difference between the homecarers and the Tories is that the homecarers make a valued commitment to society and the Tories are political dross. Throughout Wales, there are efficient and dedicated armies of carers working in our public sector authorities. These carers are fully trained to the best standards. That is not always the case in the private sector, which is why this report is important. I know that for a fact. In Blaenau Gwent in particular, we rely a great deal on the Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council social services department and the homecare team, which are first class and a credit to that authority. They are fully trained and work to the best standards. These good people are out in all weathers, often, as Christine Gwyther

nyrsys proffesiynol, gweithwyr proffesiynol sy'n ymwneud â meddygaeth, deintyddion a fferyllwyr. Rhoddais gefnogaeth gref i ymdrechion y Gweinidog i gydnabod y bobl hynny. Fodd bynnag, cymeraf y cyfle heddiw i amlygu cyfraniad aruthrol y staff gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gofal cymunedol, ac yn arbennig gofalwyr cartref. Yr oeddwn yn falch bod Christine Gwyther wedi cyfeirio atynt. Crybwyllaf hefyd y cynorthwyyr nyrsio a staff atodol cyffredinol yr NHS. Nid ydynt yn rhan o'r adroddiad hwn, ond mae'n bwysig eu crybwyll. Mae llawer o'r rhain yn aelodau balch o Undeb Cyffredinol y Gweithwyr Trefol, UNSAIN, Undeb y Gweithwyr Trafnidiaeth a Chyffredinol a'r Undeb Gweithgynhyrchu, Gwyddoniaeth a Chyllid ac maent yn chwarae rôl bwysig wrth ofalu am gleifion a chleientiaid. Mae'n rhy hawdd colli ymagwedd werthfawr y gweithwyr proffesiynol rheng flaen hyn. Yn rhy aml, cyfeiriwyd atynt fel gweithwyr llaw. Gweithiant yn galed ac maent yr un mor ymrwymedig ag unrhyw aelod arall o'r staff, boed yn gyfarwyddwr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol neu'n brif weithredwr ymddiriedolaeth, neu'r staff domestig a'r staff arlwyo ardderchog sy'n gweithio dros ein cleifion a'n cleientiaid ledled Cymru.

Ar ryw adeg neu'i gilydd, bydd gwaith y bobl dda hyn yn cyffwrdd â bywyd bob un ohonom, neu fywydau rhywun yn ein teulu. Talaf deyrnged arbennig i'r gweithwyr proffesiynol gwych sy'n cyflawni gwaith cystal i awdurdodau lleol—y gofalwyr cartref. Yr oedd y Torïaid yn awyddus, ac maent o hyd, i breifateiddio'r proffesiwn hwnnw. Y gwahaniaeth rhwng y gofalwyr cartref a'r Torïaid yw'r ffaith bod y gofalwyr cartref yn gwneud ymrwymiad gwerthfawr i gymdeithas ac mae'r Torïaid yn llawn sbwriel gwleidyddol. Ledled Cymru, ceir lluoedd effeithlon ac ymroddedig o ofalwyr sy'n gweithio yn ein hawdurdodau sector cyhoeddus. Caiff y gofalwyr hyn eu hyfforddi'n drwyadl i'r safonau gorau. Nid dyna'r achos bob amser yn y sector preifat, a dyna'r rheswm pam bod yr adroddiad hwn yn bwysig. Gwn hynny fel ffaith. Ym Mlaenau Gwent yn arbennig, dibynnwn yn helaeth ar adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent a'r tîm gofal cartref, sy'n cyflawni gwaith o'r safon

said, being paid inadequate mileage allowances. It is a disgrace. These people work in all weathers, sometimes walking to clients' homes to give support and care in order to ensure that they can stay with their families, at home in the community. I cannot pay them enough tribute.

uchaf ac sy'n glod i'r awdurdod hwnnw. Cânt eu hyfforddi'n llawn a gweithiant i'r safonau gorau. Mae'r bobl dda hyn yn mentro allan ymhob tywydd, ac yn aml, fel y dywedodd Christine Gwyther, yn derbyn lwfansau annigonol am y milltiroedd a deithiant. Mae'n warthus. Gweithia'r bobl hyn ymhob tywydd, weithiau yn cerdded i gartrefi cleientiaid i roi cymorth a gofal er mwyn sicrhau y gallant aros gyda'u teuluoedd, gartref yn y gymuned. Ni allaf dalu digon o deyrnged iddynt.

Often they may be the only outside contact that those patients—many of them elderly—have each day. They are an army of professionals, who work quietly but dedicatedly. We have much to thank them for. Let us recognise and record our thanks to these wonderful people for all that they do. Let us think of them over Christmas and the new year, when we are relaxed and taking it easy, because they will be there for us. That army of homecarers, in particular, will be out in the community, looking after our loved ones, our patients and our elderly. They will be making a difference. They can be proud of that, and we can be proud of them. We owe them so much. In future, we must ensure that they receive fair and adequate remuneration and conditions.

Yn aml, efallai mai hwy fydd yr unig gyswllt o'r tu allan y bydd y cleifion hynny—llawer ohonynt yn hen—yn ei gael bob dydd. Maent yn fyddin o weithwyr proffesiynol, sy'n gweithio'n dawel ond yn ymroddedig. Mae gennym lawer i ddiolch iddynt amdano. Gadewch inni gydnabod a chofnodi ein diolch i'r bobl arbennig hyn am bopeth a wnânt. Gadewch inni feddwl amdanynt dros y Nadolig a'r flwyddyn newydd, pan fyddwn yn ymlacio ac yn laesu dwylo, oherwydd byddant yno i ni. Bydd y fyddin honno o ofalwyr cartref, yn arbennig, yn gweithio yn y gymuned, yn gofalu am ein hanwyliaid, ein cleifion a'n henoed. Byddant yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Gallant ymfalchïo yn hynny, a gallwn ninnau ymfalchïo ynddynt hwy. Mae arnom gymaint iddynt. Yn y dyfodol, rhaid inni sicrhau eu bod yn derbyn cydnabyddiaeth ac amodau teg a digonol.

Peter Black: I declare an interest as a member of Swansea City and County Council. I agree with much of what has already been said, particularly the references to the shortages of social care staff, and difficulties with recruitment and retention. We must remember that the voluntary or independent sector, as well as local councils, also experiences such difficulties, in terms of social care workers who work with children, with drug and alcohol abuse, and in many other services. They often compete with local authorities to attract suitable social care workers, without being able to offer the same remuneration, job security, training or other considerations important to retain staff.

Peter Black: Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe. Cytunaf â'r rhan fwyaf o'r hyn a ddywedwyd eisoes, yn enwedig y cyfeiriadau at y prinder staff gofal cymdeithasol, a'r anawsterau o ran recriwtio a chadw staff. Rhaid inni gofio bod y sector gwirfoddol neu annibynnol, yn ogystal â chynghorau lleol, hefyd yn cael anawsterau o'r fath, o ran gweithwyr gofal cymdeithasol sy'n gweithio gyda phlant, pobl a fu'n camddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol, ac o fewn llawer o wasanaethau eraill. Maent yn aml yn cystadlu ag awdurdodau lleol i ddenu gweithwyr gofal cymdeithasol addas, heb allu cynnig yr un gydnabyddiaeth, diogelwch o ran swydd, hyfforddiant neu ystyriaethau pwysig eraill i gadw staff.

Any workforce planning document must address the voluntary or independent sector as well as the statutory sector services

Dylai unrhyw ddogfen cynllunio'r gweithlu fynd i'r afael â'r sector gwirfoddol neu annibynnol yn ogystal â'r gwasanaethau

provided by local authorities. I welcome the commitment in this document to obtaining more information on trends in order to improve the recruitment, training and retention of staff. We need to consider how can we retain the quality social care workers that we need in Wales to deliver the valuable services referred to by many speakers today. It is important that we have the right levels of remuneration and training to ensure that we get and retain high quality of staff. That will ensure that we can deliver the services that are so vital to many vulnerable people in Wales.

Karen Sinclair: I welcome the report of the task and finish group on workforce issues in social care, and its acknowledgement that the workforce is central to the delivery of essential services. The protection of the welfare of our elderly and vulnerable people is paramount.

However, I raise a problem that is currently a potential time bomb in the care sector, and ask how we can circumvent it. If we do not do so, there is a real danger that the sector could grind to a halt. In my heart, I believe that all residential care should be provided through the public sector, but it is not. We need a reality check on that. We have some good private homes. In real terms—*[Interruption.]*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. That mobile telephone should not be ringing. I do not know where it is. Hold on, Karen, we cannot have this.

Karen Sinclair: Actually, it is my telephone and I apologise profusely. My Plaid Cymru colleague is switching it off.

Peter Law: That is cross-party working for you. *[Laughter.]*

Karen Sinclair: Indeed.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I hope that it will be the last such interruption.

Karen Sinclair: In real terms, payment for

sector statudol a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol. Croesawaf yr ymrwymiad yn y ddogfen hon i gael mwy o wybodaeth ar dueddiadau er mwyn gwella'r broses o recriwtio, hyfforddi a chadw staff. Mae angen inni ystyried sut y gallwn gadw'r gweithwyr gofal cymdeithasol o safon uchel y mae eu hangen arnom yng Nghymru i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau gwerthfawr y cyfeiriwyd atynt gan lawer o siaradwyr heddiw. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym y lefelau cywir o gydnabyddiaeth a hyfforddiant i sicrhau ein bod yn cael ac yn cadw staff o safon uchel. Bydd hynny'n sicrhau y gallwn ddarparu'r gwasanaethau sydd mor hanfodol i lawer o bobl ddiamddiffyn yng Nghymru.

Karen Sinclair: Croesawaf adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar faterion y gweithlu mewn gofal cymdeithasol, a'i gydnabyddiaeth bod y gweithlu yn ganolog i ddarparu gwasanaethau hanfodol. Mae gwarchod lles ein henoed a phobl ddiamddiffyn yn hanfodol.

Fodd bynnag, codaf broblem sydd, ar hyn o bryd, yn fom amser posibl yn y sector gofal, a gofynnaf sut y gallwn ei osgoi. Os na allwn wneud hynny, mae perygl gwirioneddol y gallai'r sector arafu a dod i stop. Yn fy nghalon, credaf y dylid darparu gofal preswyl yn gyfan gwbl drwy'r sector cyhoeddus, ond ni chaiff ei ddarparu felly. Mae angen gwirio'r realiti. Mae gennym rai cartrefi preifat da. Mewn gwirionedd—*[Torri ar draws]*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni ddylai'r ffôn symudol hwnnw fod yn canu. Ni wn ymhle y mae. Arhoswch funud, Karen, ni allwn ganiatáu hyn.

Karen Sinclair: A dweud y gwir, fy ffôn i sy'n canu ac ymddiheuraf. Mae fy nghyd-Aelod o Blaid Cymru yn ei ddiffodd.

Peter Law: Dyna beth yw gweithio trawsbleidiol. *[Chwerthin.]*

Karen Sinclair: Yn wir.

Y Diprwy Lywydd: Gobeithio na fydd torri ar draws pellach.

Karen Sinclair: Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r

care in the private sector has dropped drastically over the years. While we must acknowledge that, in years gone by, big profits were made in the care sector, at present many providers are flying close to the profit margin. In that context, I raise the matter of mandatory police checks on carers working in such establishments, and the time delay faced by homes attempting to check potential staff. I am totally in support of police checks; please do not misconstrue what I am saying, Jane. However, staff can leave for many reasons, not least ill-health or domestic arrangements. When that is the case, staff replacement must be swift. I am told that checks on potential replacements can take as long as three months. The only way to bridge that gap is through agency staffing.

taliadau am ofal yn y sector preifat wedi gostwng yn sylweddol dros y blynyddoedd. Er bod yn rhaid inni gydnabod mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol, y gwnaethpwyd elw mawr yn y sector gofal, ar hyn o bryd mae llawer o ddarparwyr yn gweithio'n galed i wneud elw. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, codaf fater gwiriadau gorfodol gan yr heddlu ar ofalwyr sy'n gweithio mewn sefydliadau o'r fath, a'r oedi o ran amser a wynebwr gan gartrefi wrth geisio gwirio darpar staff. Yr wyf yn llwyr o blaid gwiriadau gan yr heddlu; peidiwch â chamddechongli'r hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud, Jane. Fodd bynnag, gall staff adael am sawl rheswm, yn sgîl salwch neu drefniadau domestig yn aml. Pan ddigwydd hynny, mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod staff ar gael i gymryd eu lle ar frys. Deallaf y gall gwiriadau ar y staff hynny gymryd cyhyd â thri mis. Yr unig ffordd i gau'r bwlch hwnnw yw drwy gael staff asiantaeth.

11:55 a.m.

Agency staffing has unarguably higher administrative charges, and the financial margin can sometimes be stretched beyond the establishment's means. That could lead to financial crisis, which could seriously undermine the stability of provision. That is important. A way must be found to fast-track such checks. The checks take only minutes to complete; the hold up occurs in the in and out trays of the police checking system. I ask Jane to find a method of fast-tracking before a crisis occurs. It is imperative that the matter is addressed before April, or we could face huge disruption to the lives of care recipients—the very people whose vulnerability we are trying so hard to protect through implementing these measures.

Mae talu am staff asiantaeth, yn ddi-os, yn golygu costau gweinyddol uwch, ac weithiau gall y ffin ariannol gael ei hymestyn y tu hwnt i allu'r sefydliad. Gallai hynny arwain at argyfwng ariannol, a allai danseilio sefydlogrwydd y ddarpariaeth honno yn ddifrifol. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Rhaid dod o hyd i ffordd i gyflymu gwiriadau o'r fath. Dim ond munudau y cymer y gwiriadau i'w cwblhau; digwydd yr oedi ar ddesgiau'r rhai sy'n rheoli system wirio'r heddlu. Gofynnaf i Jane ddod o hyd i ddull o gyflymu'r gwiriadau cyn y digwydd argyfwng. Mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r mater cyn Ebrill, neu gall fywydau'r sawl sy'n derbyn gofal wynebu ymyrraeth fawr—yr union bobl yr ydym yn ymdrechu mor galed i warchod eu natur ddiamddiffyn drwy weithredu'r mesurau hyn.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): Thank you for that positive discussion and debate. The Assembly has shown its support for the social care workforce, for its hard work, contribution and dedication. I thank Dai for his positive contribution. We have already started to implement the report's recommendations, and I have allocated £500,000 in this financial year to put our plans into action. In response to Helen Mary,

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Diolch ichi am y drafodaeth gadarnhaol honno. Dangosodd y Cynulliad ei gefnogaeth i'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, am ei waith caled, ei gyfraniad a'i ymrwymiad. Diolch i Dai am ei gyfraniad cadarnhaol. Yr ydym eisoes wedi dechrau gweithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad, a dyrennais £500,000 yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon i weithredu ein cynlluniau. Mewn ymateb i Helen Mary, rhaid inni sicrhau ein

we must ensure that we closely monitor progress through the Health and Social Services Committee. I will report on progress in my monthly reports to that Committee. The new care council will help us to drive that agenda forward for action. It is vital that we get the information required for workforce planning, which the commissioners of services and local authorities need to take this forward.

David Melding and Helen Mary's point on the vacancy rate is important. In 1998, the vacancy rate for statutory social services jobs in Wales was 3.5 per cent; turnover was 6.7 per cent. Helen Mary drew attention to the statistics on the childcare workforce, which helped inform our taskforce report, from the Association of Directors of Social Services and the Central Council for Education and Training in Social Work/Training Organisation for the Personal Social Services. It is a barrier in implementing our response to the Waterhouse report, namely the Children First programme, in terms of the need to ensure that we have a childcare workforce.

It is interesting that in 1999, 380 qualified social workers were recruited; yet we had a high turnover that year. We must address that problem in planning workforce recruitment and retention.

On training and support, David, few people were recruited to study for the diploma of social work in the late 1990s, but we have started to turn that around. We have also managed to maintain the output level of newly qualified workers. We have done so through expanding open-learning routes, developing part-time routes—important at the University of Wales Institute Cardiff and North East Wales Institute of Higher Education—the development of an accreditation of prior (experiential) learning route, and a distance learning route. We must encourage people to enter the social work profession and to receive training through those routes.

Thank you, David, for your support for social

bod yn monitro cynnydd yn agos drwy'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Cyflwynaf adroddiad ar gynnydd yn fy adroddiadau misol i'r Pwyllgor hwnnw. Bydd y cyngor gofal newydd yn ein helpu i lywio'r agenda honno yn ei blaen er mwyn ei gweithredu. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cael y wybodaeth sydd ei hangen ar gyfer cynllunio'r gweithlu, y mae ei angen ar gomisiynwyr gwasanaethau ac awdurdodau lleol er mwyn datblygu hyn.

Mae pwynt David Melding a Helen Mary ar nifer y swyddi gwag yn bwysig. Yn 1998, cyfradd y swyddi gwasanaethau cymdeithasol statudol gwag yng Nghymru oedd 3.5 y cant; yr oedd trosiant yn 6.7 y cant. Cyfeiriodd Helen Mary at yr ystadegau ar y gweithlu gofal plant, a helpodd i lywio adroddiad y tasglu, gan Gymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a Chyngor Canolog Addysg a Hyfforddiant mewn Gwaith Cymdeithasol/y Sefydliad Hyfforddi ar gyfer Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Personol. Mae'n rhwystr wrth weithredu ein hymateb i adroddiad Waterhouse, sef y rhaglen Plant yn Gyntaf, o ran yr angen i sicrhau bod gennym weithlu gofal plant.

Mae'n ddiddorol nodi, yn 1999, y recriwtiwyd 380 o weithwyr cymdeithasol cymwys; ond gwelwyd trosiant uchel y flwyddyn honno. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno wrth gynllunio i recriwtio a chadw gweithlu.

O ran hyfforddiant a chefnogaeth, David, prin iawn oedd nifer y bobl a recriwtiwyd i astudio ar gyfer diploma mewn gwaith cymdeithasol yn yr 1990au hwyr, ond yr ydym wedi dechrau newid y sefyllfa honno. Llwyddwyd hefyd i gynnal lefel allbwn y gweithwyr sydd newydd ennill y cymwysterau angenrheidiol. Gwnaethom hynny drwy ehangu llwybrau dysgu agored, datblygu llwybrau rhan amser—sy'n bwysig yn Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru Caerdydd ac Athrofa Addysg Uwch Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru—datblygu llwybr achredu dysgu blaenorol (drwy brofiad), a llwybr dysgu o bell. Rhaid inni annog pobl i ymgymryd â gwaith cymdeithasol ac i dderbyn hyfforddiant drwy'r llwybrau hynny.

Diolch i chi, David, am eich cefnogaeth i

workers. We strongly support nurses and doctors in the Chamber, but how often do we talk about the social care workforce and social workers? Christine and Peter Law reinforced that with their contributions about the homecare workforce—people who work at the sharp end—in terms of pay recognition. This taskforce report recognises that we need a human resources strategy and to provide advice. We need to value our workforce. The trade unions were represented on the task and finish group, and it was important that a partnership worked on this report.

Karen made points on the pressures on the private and independent sector in particular. I recently announced £5 million to ease the pressures on care homes with local authorities acting as commissioners. As the consultation on that proceeds, and that money is spent in those homes, that will have a beneficial impact on the social care workforce.

I recognise the issue about police checks. I know that all of us in this Assembly endorse those checks. I will get advice on how we are progressing in terms of fast-tracking and report back to the Assembly on that.

Peter Black made an important contribution and showed that we need to take this forward in terms of support. We must develop a strategy to improve recruitment in the sector, which is not simply about a PR campaign, but about improving the public image and profile of the sector. We begin with a series of job fairs over the next few weeks in Wales. We will also ensure that we make additional funding available for training opportunities and to enable social work students to overcome their financial difficulties. Many of them experience hardship while training. We must back them all the way.

I am grateful to Members for their universal support of the social care workforce today. As Christine said, people who look after

weithwyr cymdeithasol. Rhown cryn gefnogaeth i nyrsys a meddygon yn y Siambr, ond pa mor aml y siaradwn am y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol a gweithwyr cymdeithasol? Atgyfnerthodd Christine a Peter Law hynny gyda'u cyfraniadau ynglŷn â'r gweithlu gofal cartref—pobl sy'n gweithio o dan amodau anodd—o safbwynt cydnabyddiaeth o ran tâl. Mae adroddiad y tasglu yn cydnabod bod angen strategaeth adnoddau dynol arnom ac inni ddarparu cyngor. Mae angen inni werthfawrogi ein gweithlu. Cynrychiolwyd yr undebau llafur yn y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, ac yr oedd yn bwysig bod partneriaeth yn gweithio ar yr adroddiad hwn.

Cyfeiriodd Karen at y pwysau ar y sector preifat ac annibynnol yn arbennig. Yn ddiweddar cyhoeddais £5 miliwn i leddfu'r pwysau ar gartrefi gofal gydag awdurdodau lleol yn gweithredu fel comisiynwyr. Wrth i'r ymgynghori ar hynny barhau, ac wrth i'r arian hwnnw gael ei wario yn y cartrefi hynny, bydd hynny yn cael effaith fuddiol ar y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol.

Cydnabyddaf y mater ynglŷn â gwiriadau'r heddlu. Gwn fod pob Aelod yn cymeradwyo'r gwiriadau hynny. Caf gyngor ynglŷn â sut yr ydym yn datblygu o ran cyflymu'r broses a chyflwynaf adroddiad i'r Cynulliad ar hynny.

Gwnaeth Peter Black gyfraniad pwysig a dangosodd fod angen inni ddatblygu hyn o ran cefnogaeth. Rhaid inni ddatblygu strategaeth i wella'r broses recriwtio yn y sector, nad yw yn ymwneud ag ymgyrch cysylltiadau cyhoeddus yn unig, ond yn ymwneud â gwella delwedd gyhoeddus a phroffil y sector. Dechreuwn gyda chyfres o ffeiriau swyddi dros yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf yng Nghymru. Byddwn hefyd yn sicrhau ein bod yn neilltuo arian ychwanegol ar gyfer cyfleoedd hyfforddi ac er mwyn galluogi myfyrwyr gwaith cymdeithasol i oresgyn eu hanawsterau ariannol. Mae llawer ohonynt yn profi cyni yn ystod eu cyfnod hyfforddi. Rhaid inni eu cefnogi bob cam o'r ffordd.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelodau am eu cefnogaeth gyffredinol i'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol heddiw. Fel y dywedodd

others deserve our support. We should give them more attention, time, space and resources, because we are talking here about health and social care and our concern to promote the health and wellbeing of the people of Wales. We will not achieve that unless we give the social care workforce the attention it needs.

Christine, mae pobl sy'n gofalu am eraill yn haeddu ein cefnogaeth. Dylem roi mwy o sylw, amser, lle ac adnoddau iddynt, am ein bod yn sôn am iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a'n hawydd i hybu iechyd a lles pobl yng Nghymru. Ni chyflawnwn hynny oni roddwn y sylw angenrheidiol i'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Amendment 1: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Williams, Phil

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 2: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Williams, Phil

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.

Amended motion:

the National Assembly:

Cynnig a ddiwygiwyd:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

- | | |
|---|---|
| <p>1. notes that the delivery of quality social care services is dependent on there being a quality workforce in place and recognises that staff must be at the centre of our agenda to raise standards and improve protection for those who use those services;</p> | <p>1. yn nodi bod darparu gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol o ansawdd yn dibynnu ar fod gweithlu o ansawdd ar gael ac yn cydnabod bod yn rhaid i'r holl staff fod yn ganolog i'n hagenda i godi safonau a gwella diogelwch y sawl sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau hyn;</p> |
| <p>2. notes that there are complex, long-term recruitment and retention difficulties in the social care workforce which are affecting the ability to deliver quality services to all who need them;</p> | <p>2. yn nodi bod anawsterau cymhleth a hirdymor o ran recriwtio a chadw staff yn y maes gofal cymdeithasol sy'n effeithio ar y gallu i ddarparu gwasanaethau o ansawdd i bob un sydd eu hangen;</p> |
| <p>3. notes that the recommendations of the task and finish group on workforce issues provide the framework for long-term strategies to tackle these issues through sustainable, long-term action which must be taken in partnership with all employers, planners, commissioners, regulators, trainers and with the staff themselves;</p> | <p>3. yn nodi bod argymhellion y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar faterion gweithlu yn rhoi'r fframwaith ar gyfer strategaethau hirdymor i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn trwy weithredu cynaliadwy, hirdymor y mae'n rhaid ei wneud mewn partneriaeth â'r holl gyflogwyr, cynllunwyr, comisiynwyr, rheoleiddwyr, hyfforddwyr a'r staff eu hunain;</p> |
| <p>4. calls on the Labour-Liberal Democrat Government to implement the recommendations of the task and finish group on workforce issues;</p> | <p>4. yn galw ar y Llywodraeth Llafur-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i weithredu argymhellion y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar faterion gweithlu;</p> |
| <p>5. recognises the professionalism and dedication of social workers and the need for the National Assembly to promote a more positive public understanding of the role they play in delivering social care.</p> | <p>5. yn cydnabod gwaith proffesiynol ac ymroddiad gweithwyr cymdeithasol a'r angen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hybu dealltwriaeth fwy cadarnhaol o'r rhan a chwaraeir ganddynt mewn darparu gofal cymdeithasol.</p> |

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue

Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Angen Cymru am Weinidog Dros Ddathblygu Economaidd Llawn Amser Wales's Need for a Full-time Economic Development Minister

Alun Cairns: In line with convention, I will give a minute of my time each to allow Glyn Davies, Janet Ryder and Mick Bates to contribute. It is pleasing to note that so many Members are present. I understand that there is a three-line whip on Labour Members to be present. I am not sure whether that is to support the Liberal Democrats or to support the First Minister in his current capacity.

I am familiar with many of the arguments that will be given, because of the briefings that have been circulated to Labour Members on a range of initiatives such as the macro situation, delivering economic development and focusing on outcomes. It is a shame that they cannot react and seek to defend the

Alun Cairns: Yn unol â chonfensiwn, rhoddaf funud o'm hamser i ganiatáu i Glyn Davies, Janet Ryder a Mick Bates gyfrannu. Mae'n bleser gweld bod cymaint o'r Aelodau yn bresennol. Deallaf fod chwip tair llinell ar yr Aelodau Llafur i fod yn bresennol. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny er mwyn cefnogi'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ynteu er mwyn cefnogi Prif Weinidog Cymru yn rhinwedd ei swydd bresennol.

Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â llawer o'r dadleuon a gaiff eu cyflwyno, oherwydd y nodiadau briffio a ddosbarthwyd i'r Aelodau Llafur ar ystod o fentrau megis y sefyllfa facro, cyflwyno datblygu economaidd a chanolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau. Mae'n drueni na allant ymateb a cheisio amddiffyn y

Minister. It is also a shame that the Minister cannot defend himself on the outcomes that we will discuss.

I was pleased to win the ballot for the short debate and to give us the opportunity to formally debate an issue that has dogged the running of the National Assembly since we returned from recess six weeks ago.

You will be aware that several questions and points of order have been raised about the First Minister balancing the time he spends on the role of economic development Minister and that of First Minister. It is fair to say that several of those questions and points of order were politically motivated. However, I will say at the outset that the only motivation in deciding the title and topic of this debate is the interests of the Welsh economy and my concern that Wales is missing out.

Needless to say, an enormous amount of responsibility falls on the shoulders of the First Minister. This would be the case for any individual, but, in this instance, it is fair to say that we probably expect more of Rhodri Morgan than we would of anyone else.

The loss of Alun Michael compounded the hopes and trust that were placed in Rhodri Morgan, and his popularity exaggerated the expectations still further. Furthermore, one of the key benefits of devolution presented at the time of the referendum was the additional focus and attention that each policy area would receive given a full-time Minister addressing the needs of each portfolio in Wales. The argument was won but, at the same time, generated high expectations. When these two factors—the expectations of the First Minister personally and the additional focus on policy priorities—come together, a judgment can be made on how the Assembly is succeeding. A great deal of the public confidence in this institution has been invested in the First Minister, which is why this matter is so important.

12:05 p.m.

The First Minister previously sought to

Gweinidog. Mae'n drueni hefyd na all y Gweinidog amddiffyn ei hun ar y canlyniadau y byddwn yn eu trafod.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o ennill y bleidlais ar gyfer y ddadl fer ac o roi'r cyfle inni gyflwyno dadl yn ffurfiol ar fater sydd wedi plagio gweithrediad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ers inni ddychwelyd o'r toriad chwe wythnos yn ôl.

Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod sawl cwestiwn a phwynt o drefn wedi eu codi ynglŷn â'r modd y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn cydbwysu'r amser a dreulia ar rôl y Gweinidog dros ddatblygu economaidd a rôl Prif Weinidog Cymru. Mae'n deg dweud bod llawer o'r cwestiynau a'r pwyntiau hynny o drefn wedi eu hysgogi gan wleidyddiaeth. Fodd bynnag, dywedaf ar y cychwyn mai'r unig ysgogiad wrth benderfynu ar deitl a phwnc y ddadl hon yw buddiannau economi Cymru a'm pryder bod Cymru ar ei cholled.

Afraid dweud bod cyfrifoldeb enfawr ar ysgwyddau Prif Weinidog Cymru. Byddai hyn yn wir i unrhyw unigolyn, ond, yn yr achos hwn, mae'n deg dweud ein bod yn disgwyl mwy gan Rhodri Morgan nag y byddem gan unrhyw un arall.

Mae colli Alun Michael wedi dwysáu'r gobeithion a'r ymddiriedaeth a roddwyd yn Rhodri Morgan, a chwyddodd ei boblogrwydd y disgwyliadau ymhellach. At hynny, un o fuddiannau allweddol datganoli a gyflwynwyd ar adeg y refferendwm oedd y ffocws a'r sylw ychwanegol y byddai pob maes polisi yn ei gael yn sgîl penodi Gweinidog llawn amser i ymdrin ag anghenion pob portffolio yng Nghymru. Enillwyd y ddadl ond, ar yr un pryd, fe arweiniodd hi at ddisgwyliadau mawr. Pan ddaw'r ddau ffactor hyn—disgwyliadau Prif Weinidog Cymru yn bersonol a'r ffocws ychwanegol ar flaenoriaethau polisi—at ei gilydd, gellir rhoi barn ar sut y mae'r Cynulliad yn llwyddo. Rhoddwyd llawer iawn o hyder y cyhoedd yn y sefydliad hwn ym Mhrif Weinidog Cymru, a dyna pam ei fod yn fater mor bwysig.

Cyn hyn, yr oedd Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi

balance the portfolios under the premise that he would save taxpayers' money in so doing. However, when the Lib-Lab pact was created, he conceded to the argument that he could not cope with both responsibilities and appointed a full-time Minister for Economic Development. We all recall the events leading up to the resignation of the former Minister for Economic Development and how the First Minister left the Chamber when the matter was being discussed. He left his Assembly Members to carry the can, only to return, with the widest grin on his face, after the embarrassing events had concluded.

When the First Minister assumed sole responsibility for the economic development role, there was a considerable amount of goodwill from all sides of the Chamber. At that time, he said that the economic development portfolio could be combined with that of the First Minister over:

ceisio cydbwysu'r portffolios dan y cynsail y byddai'n arbed arian y trethdalwyr wrth wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, pan grëwyd clymblaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol-Llafur, cyfaddefodd na allai ymdopi â'r ddau gyfrifoldeb a phenodwyd Gweinidog llawn amser dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Cofia pob un ohonom y digwyddiadau cyn i'r cyn-Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ymddiswyddo a'r modd y gadawodd Prif Weinidog Cymru y Siambr pan gafodd y mater ei drafod. Gadawodd i'w Aelodau ddwyn y cyfrifoldeb, dim ond i ddychwelyd, gyda'r wên fwyaf ar ei wyneb, ar ôl i'r digwyddiadau annifyr ddod i ben.

Pan dderbyniodd Prif Weinidog Cymru gyfrifoldeb cyfan gwbl dros rôl datblygu economaidd, bu cryn dipyn o ewyllys da o bob cyfeiriad yn y Siambr. Ar y pryd, dywedodd y gallai'r portffolio datblygu economaidd gael ei gyfuno ag un y Prif Weinidog yn ystod:

'summer recess, when demands are entirely different.'

He went on to say that he would:

Aeth yn ei flaen i ddweud na fyddai yn:

'not be tied down with questions, Committees and Plenaries as we are when the Assembly is in session. The demands are entirely different and far more flexible.'

We appreciated the difficult circumstances and accepted his argument. Few would doubt the Minister's hopes and intentions in managing both roles. He is clearly working as many hours as possible, but in this instance, two people would be better than one. I speak from experience as a backbencher who planned to work on a limited basis for a high street bank, which was my former employer. I could not cope with that, and I gave it up last November around 12 months ago.

Yr oeddem yn sylweddoli bod yr amgylchiadau'n anodd a derbyniasom ei ddadl. Prin yw'r rhai a fyddai'n amau gobeithion a bwriadau'r Gweinidog wrth reoli'r ddwy rôl. Yn amlwg mae'n gweithio cymaint o oriau â phosibl, ond yn yr achos hwn, byddai dau berson yn well nag un. Siaradaf o brofiad fel aelod o'r meinciau cefn a oedd yn bwriadu gweithio ar sail gyfyngedig ar gyfer un o fanciau'r stryd fawr, sef fy nghyn-gyflogwr. Ni allwn ymdopi â hynny, a rhoddais y gorau i'r swydd fis Tachwedd diwethaf tua 12 mis yn ôl.

That is the context in which today's debate is taking place. The First Minister has consistently called on us to judge him on the outcomes of his actions. The national economic development strategy consultation ended on 6 July—the same day that the First Minister assumed complete responsibility for the document. It was due to be debated in Plenary on 30 October. However, it has now

Dyna'r cyd-destun ar gyfer dadl heddiw. Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi galw arnom yn gyson i'w farnu ar ganlyniadau ei weithredoedd. Daeth yr ymgynghori ar y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol i ben ar 6 Gorffennaf—yr un diwrnod ag y derbyniodd y Prif Weinidog gyfrifoldeb llwyr am y ddogfen. Yr oedd disgwyl iddi gael ei thrafod yn y Cyfarfod

been delayed and it will not be debated until 13 December—around 11 months after the first draft was presented to the Economic Development Committee. This is one case in which outcomes can be judged easily—the Welsh economy is obviously losing out.

Other methods of judging outcomes relate to the First Minister's activity. Questions were tabled asking him to report on the number of invitations that he had received, accepted and declined in an official capacity, according to his ministerial responsibilities. Although I understand that the First Minister has the benefit of a diary secretary, I was told that the task could only be completed at a disproportionate cost for the months for which I had requested the information. Further questions were posed asking him to publish information for one particular week. The answer simply read 'no'.

It is clear that the First Minister is seeking to withhold information. When points of order are raised about such disrespectful answers, the Presiding Officer has rightly said that ministerial answers are not a matter for him. Therefore, we can only judge the Minister by his replies. In withholding such information, he is preventing us from scrutinising his activities. We can only conclude that the Welsh economy is losing out because he cannot physically meet the people he needs to develop it.

However, other examples are easier to monitor. Assembly Committee obligations are key duties of any Minister. The Economic Development Committee has visited north Wales twice in recent weeks. The briefing sessions on hydro, gas and nuclear power will play an important part in the energy review that is being undertaken. The First Minister was not present. It was his duty to be there. The first formal meeting of the Committee held outside Cardiff was in Wrexham in the week when the First Minister suffered poor health. It would have been more than understandable had he been unable to attend on health grounds. However, he had no intention of attending the Committee meeting in Wrexham. The First Minister had planned to attend a conference at Liège, but he was

Llawn ar 30 Hydref. Fodd bynnag, cafodd ei gohirio ac ni chaiff ei thrafod tan 13 Rhagfyr—tua 11 mis ar ôl i'r drafft cyntaf gael ei gyflwyno i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Dyma un achos lle y gellir barnu canlyniadau yn hawdd—mae economi Cymru yn amlwg ar ei cholled.

Mae dulliau eraill o farnu canlyniadau yn ymwneud â gweithgaredd y Prif Weinidog. Cyflwynwyd cwestiynau yn gofyn iddo gyflwyno adroddiad ar nifer y gwahoddiadau yr oedd wedi eu derbyn a'u gwrthod yn rhinwedd ei swydd, yn ôl ei gyfrifoldebau gweinidogol. Er y deallaf fod gan Brif Weinidog Cymru ysgrifenyddes dyddiadur, dywedwyd wrthyf mai dim ond am gost anghymesur y gellid cwblhau'r dasg am y misoedd y gofynnais am y wybodaeth ar eu cyfer. Gofynnwyd mwy o gwestiynau yn gofyn iddo gyhoeddi gwybodaeth am un wythnos yn arbennig. Yr ateb yn syml oedd 'na'.

Mae'n amlwg bod Prif Weinidog Cymru yn ceisio atal gwybodaeth. Pan godir pwyntiau o drefn ynglŷn ag atebion amharchus o'r fath, mae'r Llywydd wedi dweud, a hynny'n briodol, nad mater iddo ef yw atebion gweinidogol. Felly, dim ond yn ôl ei atebion y gallwn farnu'r Gweinidog. Wrth atal gwybodaeth o'r fath, mae'n ein hatal ni rhag craffu ar ei weithgareddau. yr unig gasgliad y gallwn ddod iddo yw bod economi Cymru ar ei cholled gan na all gyfarfod yn y cnawd â'r bobl y mae eu hangen arno i'w datblygu.

Fodd bynnag, mae enghreifftiau eraill yn haws i'w monitro. Mae rhwymedigaethau Pwyllgor y Cynulliad yn ddyletswyddau allweddol sy'n dod i ran unrhyw Weinidog. Mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd wedi ymweld â'r Gogledd ddwy waith yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf. Bydd y sesiynau briffio ar hydro, nwy a phŵer niwclear yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn yr adolygiad ynni a gynhelir. Nid oedd y Prif Weinidog yn bresennol. Ei ddyletswydd ef oedd bod yno. Cynhaliwyd cyfarfod ffurfiol cyntaf y Pwyllgor y tu allan i Gaerdydd yn Wrecsam yn ystod yr wythnos pan oedd Prif Weinidog Cymru yn anhwylyd. Byddai wedi bod yn fwy na dealladwy pe na bai wedi gallu bod yn bresennol oherwydd salwch. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd yn fwriad ganddo i fynychu cyfarfod y Pwyllgor yn

forced to cancel his plan due to ill-health. The First Minister's specific responsibility for north Wales only exacerbates the current situation and the difficulties facing us. Given good health, it was the First Minister's obligation to attend the Economic Development Committee meeting in Wrexham a week or so ago. It is obvious that the Welsh economy is losing out.

The economic grounds, however, are probably the most important mode of scrutinising the outcome. The Welsh economy began the year with mass redundancies, with 5,000 manufacturing jobs lost in the first five weeks. Since the end of the summer recess, manufacturing redundancies have sadly continued to follow the same trend. The First Minister has announced 2,872 jobs lost in Wales over that period. To balance my analysis, however, we must also note his reporting of the creation of 1,700 jobs over the same period. The First Minister will no doubt seek to highlight that unemployment is at its lowest level for many years. That is obviously welcome. The net losses, however, are worrying. Therefore, I hope that he accepts that our economic outlook is not as encouraging as the unemployment figures may suggest. Although unemployment fell last month by 10,000, it was alarming to note that inactivity rates, which probably contribute significantly to our low levels of gross domestic product per capita—possibly more so than unemployment—also rose by 26,000. The latest Dunn and Bradstreet survey showed business bankruptcies continuing a worrying trend, with a bleak outlook. Manufacturing is officially in recession: output levels have fallen by a worrying 3.2 per cent over the last quarter. That is a much quicker decline than in the rest of the UK. Revised GDP per capita figures now put Wales's economy at 80 per cent of the UK average, compared with 83 per cent previously. Independent forecasters show worrying figures compared to the rest of the UK, and the reality is that the wealth gap between Wales and England is widening.

Wrecsam. Bwriad Prif Weinidog Cymru oedd mynychu cynhadledd yn Liège, ond bu'n rhaid iddo newid ei gynlluniau oherwydd salwch. Dim ond gwaethygu'r sefyllfa bresennol a'r anawsterau sy'n ein hwynebu a wna cyfrifoldeb penodol Prif Weinidog Cymru dros y Gogledd. O gael iechyd da, dyletswydd y Prif Weinidog oedd mynychu cyfarfod y pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn Wrecsam wythnos neu ddwy yn ôl. Mae'n amlwg bod economi Cymru ar ei cholled.

Fodd bynnag, y rhesymau economaidd mae'n siŵr, yw'r dull pwysicaf o graffu ar y canlyniad. Ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn, collodd economi Cymru lawer iawn o swyddi, a chollwyd 5,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yn y pum wythnos cyntaf. Ers diwedd toriad yr haf, mae'r swyddi gweithgynhyrchu a gollwyd yn anffodus wedi parhau i ddilyn yr un duedd. Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi cyhoeddi i 2,872 o swyddi gael eu colli yng Nghymru yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. I gydbwyso fy nadansoddiad, fodd bynnag, rhaid inni nodi'r modd y cyflwynodd adroddiad ar greu 1,700 o swyddi yn ystod yr un cyfnod. Yn ddi-os, bydd Prif Weinidog Cymru yn ceisio pwysleisio bod diweithdra ar ei lefel isaf ers sawl blwyddyn. Mae hynny'n amlwg yn newyddion i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, mae'r colledion net yn achosi pryder. Felly, gobeithiaf y bydd yn derbyn nad yw ein rhagolygon economaidd mor galonogol ag yr awgrymir gan y ffigurau diweithdra. Er i ddiweithdra ostwng 10,000 y mis diwethaf, yr oedd yn frawychus nodi bod cyfraddau anweithgarwch, sy'n cyfrannu'n sylweddol, yn ôl pob tebyg, at ein lefelau isel o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen—mwy felly o bosibl na diweithdra—wedi codi 26,000 hefyd. Dangosodd arolwg diweddaraf Dunn a Bradstreet fod methdaliadau ymhlith busnesau yn parhau i fod yn duedd sy'n achosi pryder, ac nid yw'r rhagolygon yn dda. Mae gweithgynhyrchu yn swyddogol mewn dirwasgiad: mae lefelau cynnyrch wedi gostwng 3.2 y cant dros y chwarter diwethaf ac mae hynny'n achosi pryder. Mae hynny'n ostyngiad cyflymach o lawer na'r hyn a geir yng ngweddill y DU. Mae'r ffigurau CMC y pen diwygiedig yn rhoi economi Cymru ar 80 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU yn awr, o gymharu ag 83 y cant cyn hynny. Dengys y proffwydi annibynnol ffigurau truenus o'u cymharu â gweddill y

DU, a'r realiti yw bod y bwlch o ran cyfoeth rhwng Cymru a Lloegr yn lledu.

The Confederation of British Industry Wales's latest quarterly Welsh industrial trends survey is also worrying. It shows that we are operating at 41 per cent below capacity; our orders are down by 19 per cent; our output is 9 per cent lower; and employment prospects are 22 per cent lower. The summary for Wales reads:

Mae'r arolwg chwarterol diweddaraf o dueddiadau diwydiannol Cymru gan Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain Cymru yn achosi pryder hefyd. Dengys ein bod yn gweithredu ar 41 y cant yn is na'r capasiti; mae 19 y cant yn llai o archebion gennym; mae cynnyrch 9 y cant yn is; ac mae'r rhagolygon cyflogaeth 22 y cant yn is. Darllena'r crynodeb ar gyfer Cymru fel a ganlyn:

'Overall Business confidence fell for the fourth consecutive Survey, the fall on this occasion being the largest on record. Export optimism also declined very sharply. Total orders fell quite sharply after two years of stability. An even steeper decline is expected in the next four months.'

The Welsh economy is losing out.

Mae economi Cymru ar ei cholled.

Furthermore, a Cardiff-based, independent think-tank, Robert Huggins Associates, last week reported that the Welsh competitive performance had fallen further behind the rest of the United Kingdom. We are placed eleventh out of 12 in competitive ranking. The report notes that we are below any other devolved region within the United Kingdom. We are bottom of the league table for knowledge-based businesses, which, it states,

At hynny, nododd Robert Huggins Associates, cwmni ystyried annibynnol yng Nghaerdydd, yr wythnos diwethaf fod perfformiad cystadleuol Cymru wedi syrthio ymhellach ar ôl gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Fe'n gosodir ar yr unfed safle ar ddeg allan o 12 yn gystadleuol. Noda'r adroddiad ein bod yn is nag unrhyw ardal ddatganoledig arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr ydym ar waelod y gynghrair ar gyfer busnesau sy'n seiliedig ar wybodaeth, ac mae hynny, fe noda,

'is a worrying trend in the light of the importance of knowledge based businesses to the overall economic success of regional and national economies.'

The report adds that the test for the National Assembly will be its capacity to execute a strategy quickly and effectively.

Ychwanega'r adroddiad mai'r prawf i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fydd ei allu i weithredu strategaeth yn gyflym ac yn effeithiol.

Barclays Bank also published a report last week, showing that the number of business start ups in Wales is also in decline—down by 28 per cent. That is again a greater margin than for the rest of the United Kingdom. This follows the administration's poor performance in meeting its business birth rate strategy targets, to be delivered through the Welsh Development Agency, which reported its half-yearly figures to the Economic Development Committee a few weeks ago. Only 1,244 businesses were created against an annual target of 4,236. In the Objective 1 area, which is a big challenge for the

Cyhoeddodd Banc Barclays adroddiad yr wythnos diwethaf hefyd, yn dangos bod nifer y busnesau newydd yng Nghymru yn gostwng hefyd—gostyngiad o 28 y cant. Unwaith eto mae hwn yn fwy o wahaniaeth na'r hyn a geir yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae hyn yn dilyn perfformiad gwael y weinyddiaeth wrth gyrraedd ei thargedau strategaeth cyfradd busnesau newydd, i'w cyflawni drwy Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, a gyflwynodd ei ffigurau hanner blwyddyn i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ychydig wythnosau yn ôl. Dim ond 1,244 o fusnesau a grëwyd yn erbyn targed blyneddol o 4,236.

Assembly, the figures are even more worrying. Only 883 jobs were created against an annual target of 3,061. The Welsh economy is obviously losing out.

It is pleasing to note that an additional £9 million is being spent to help correct this deficit, but there must be a Minister in place to drive the project through and to make the decisions.

Those brief points highlight the scale of the challenge facing the First Minister. The Welsh economy is being left to stagnate by not having the support of a full-time Minister for Economic Development. I do not understand his persistence in balancing both roles. He has a range of options. Why not make John Griffiths, the current Deputy Minister for Economic Development, the Minister for Economic Development? Why not put him in that decision-making role? The First Minister is undermining the role of the Deputy Ministers if, in a crisis such as this, he is not prepared to make them decision-makers. Alun Pugh, another Deputy Minister, or even Peter Law, who has Cabinet experience, would relish the opportunity. If the First Minister needs to keep two Liberals in the Cabinet, what about Mick Bates as Minister for Rural Affairs, and Carwyn Jones as Minister for Economic Development? There are a whole host of choices before him.

12:15 p.m.

However, business is complaining that it does not have the economic relationship that it wants. It must be almost impossible, physically, to manage two jobs. If there are any benefits in conducting both roles, we might as well go back to having a Secretary of State and junior Ministers for Wales. We need to be proactive, not reactive, in staving off as much of the recession as possible. The national economic development strategy must not only be completed, but executed. Almost all economic indicators seem to be against us. Business is opposed to the proposal of supplementary business rates, and Objective 1 continues to be dogged by bureaucracy.

Yn ardal Amcan 1, sydd yn her fawr i'r Cynulliad, mae'r ffigurau yn achosi hyd yn oed mwy o bryder. Dim ond 883 o swyddi a grëwyd yn erbyn targed blyneddol o 3,061. Mae economi Cymru yn amlwg ar ei cholled.

Mae'n bleser nodi bod £9 miliwn ychwanegol yn cael ei wario i helpu i unioni'r diffyg hwn, ond rhaid penodi Gweinidog i ddatblygu'r prosiect ac i wneud y penderfyniadau.

Mae'r pwyntiau byr hynny yn dangos pa mor fawr yw'r her sy'n wynebu Prif Weinidog Cymru. Gadewir economi Cymru yn ei hunfan drwy beidio â rhoi iddi gefnogaeth Gweinidog llawn amser dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Ni ddeallaf paham ei fod yn dal ati i gydbwyso'r ddwy rôl. Mae ganddo ystod o opsiynau. Pam nad yw'n penodi John Griffiths, y Dirprwy Weinidog presennol dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd? Pam nad yw'n ei roi yn y rôl honno o wneud penderfyniadau? Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn tanseilio rôl y Dirprwy Weinidogion os nad yw, mewn argyfwng o'r fath, yn barod i roi'r awdurdod iddynt wneud penderfyniadau. Byddai Alun Pugh, Dirprwy Weinidog arall, neu hyd yn oed Peter Law, sydd â phrofiad o fod yn y Cabinet, yn ymhyfrydu yn y cyfle. Os oes angen i Brif Weinidog Cymru gadw dau o aelodau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Cabinet, beth am Mick Bates fel y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, a Carwyn Jones fel y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd? Mae llw o ddewisiadau o'i flaen.

Fodd bynnag, mae busnesau'n cwyno nad oes ganddynt y berthynas economaidd sydd ei hangen arnynt. Rhaid ei bod bron yn amhosibl, yn gorfforol, i reoli dwy swydd. Os oes unrhyw fanteision i gyflawni'r ddwy rôl, waeth inni fynd yn ôl at gael Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ac is-Weinidogion Cymru. Mae angen inni fod yn rhagweithiol, nid yn adweithiol, wrth gadw cymaint o'r dirwasgiad â phosibl draw. Rhaid i'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol nid yn unig gael ei chwblhau ond cael ei gweithredu. Ymddengys fod bron pob dangosydd economaidd yn ein herbyn. Mae busnesau'n gwrthwynebu'r cynnig o

Yet, the First Minister says that he can cope. Is it that the First Minister is putting his personal and political interests before that of the Welsh economy?

I hope that the First Minister can answer these vital points satisfactorily. If he can, he will receive our full support. If he cannot, we are likely to return to this issue, but next time, I suspect that we will be given the opportunity to vote on it.

The Deputy Presiding Office: If the three Members who wish to speak are going to do so, you have about 20 seconds each.

Glyn Davies: Alun Cairns is concerned about the consequences for Wales of a part-time Minister for Economic Development. My main concern about the present arrangements is different. I cannot accept that the position of First Minister of the National Assembly for Wales in these crucial early years of its development can be anything but a full-time job. I say to Rhodri Morgan: go home, have a good rest, and tomorrow morning, appreciate how important your job as First Minister of the National Assembly is, how much the people of Wales have invested in you, and the extent to which the Assembly is struggling, because it is in desperate need of full-time leadership. Stop dancing to the Liberal Democrat tune, and do the job that you have been so privileged to be elected to do full-time. The current position is untenable. We know it, the Labour AMs know it, and I think that, in your heart of hearts, you know it.

The Deputy Presiding Office: There is no time for further contributions. I call on the First Minister to reply to the debate.

The First Minister: We all had a good laugh hearing Alun Cairns claim that this short debate does not have anything to do with politics. I was reminded, when he rather hysterically and overexcitedly went through what he thought were the bad signs in the Welsh economy, of my description of him

gael trethi busnes ychwanegol, ac mae Amcan 1 yn parhau i gael ei blagio gan fiwrocratiaeth. Eto, dywed prif Weinidog Cymru y gall ymdopi. Ai'r gwir yw bod y Prif Weinidog yn rhoi ei fuddiannau personol a gwleidyddol ei hun o flaen economi Cymru?

Gobeithiaf y gall y Prif Weinidog ateb y pwyntiau hollbwysig hyn yn foddhaol. Os gall, fe'i cefnogwn yn llawn. Os na all, yr ydym yn debygol o ddychwelyd at y mater hwn, ond y tro nesaf, tybiaf y cawn y cyfle i bleidleisio arno.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Os yw'r tri Aelod sy'n dymuno siarad yn mynd i wneud hynny, mae gennych tua 20 eiliad yr un.

Glyn Davies: Mae Alun Cairns yn pryderu ynglŷn â'r hyn y mae cael Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd rhan amser i Gymru yn ei olygu. Mae fy mhrif bryder ynglŷn â'r trefniadau presennol yn wahanol. Yn sicr, mae gwaith Prif Weinidog Cymru yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn y blynyddoedd cynnar hollbwysig hyn yn swydd llawn amser. Dywedaf wrth Rhodri Morgan: ewch adref, gorffwyswch, a bore fory, gwerthfawrogwch pa mor bwysig yw eich swydd fel Prif Weinidog Cymru yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, cymaint y mae pobl Cymru yn disgwyl gennych, ac i ba raddau y mae'r Cynulliad yn brwydro, gan fod angen dybryd am arweinyddiaeth llawn amser arno. Rhowch y gorau i gael eich arwain gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a gwnewch y gwaith y cawsoch y fraint o gael eich ethol i'w wneud yn llawn amser. Ni ellir cynnal y sefyllfa bresennol. Gwyddom hynny, fe ŵyr yr Aelodau Llafur yn y Cynulliad hynny, ac fe gredaf, yn eich calon, y gwyddoch chithau hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nid oes rhagor o amser ar gyfer cyfraniadau pellach. Galwaf ar Brif Weinidog Cymru i ymateb i'r ddadl.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cawsom i gyd hwyl wrth glywed Alun Cairns yn honni nad oes gan y ddadl fer hon unrhyw beth i'w wneud â gwleidyddiaeth. Fe'm hatgoffwyd, pan soniodd braidd yn orffwyll a gorgynhyrfus, am yr hyn a oedd yn arwyddion gwael yn ei farn ef yn economi Cymru, o'm disgrifiad

some 18 months ago, when he did the same, as a Victorian undertaker praying for a hard winter.

The problem, Alun, is that you love making allegations, but you do not do your homework, and you cannot back them up. Once again this morning you have shown your inadequate understanding of economics. You have once again referred to the economy being in recession, as you did some months ago, when I had to correct you. I must point out to you that, while the manufacturing industry is in recession, it forms 28 per cent of the economy. The economy as a whole is not that 28 per cent. As a former bank clerk, you should understand figures. The whole economy is 100 per cent, and is clearly not in recession. You also repeated that this morning, although I had corrected you on it some months ago. Your problem is that you make allegations but you cannot back them up because you do not do your homework. You repeated the allegation this morning that a recent exercise by Government statisticians shows that the Welsh economy has gone from a GDP per head of 83 per cent of the UK average, to 80 per cent.

Lorraine Barrett: I am sorry to interrupt, Rhodri, but I thought it was appropriate. As Members know, the Labour Party group office helpfully reminded us that Dafydd Wigley was quoted in the *South Wales Echo* this month as saying that Wales is now seen as having a buoyant economy and positive outlook. That supports what you were just saying.

The First Minister: Indeed. I do not know if Dafydd will speak in this debate. He is not present in the Chamber at the moment. No doubt, if he does, he will repeat that statement about the buoyant economy and positive outlook. It is important that we clarify our current position in the economy. It is not about trying to find every announcement of a job loss and assuming that it confirms the economy's position: the economy is the totality of the economy. We have statistics relating to that, and that is what you should concentrate on.

ohono tua 18 mis yn ôl, pan wnaeth yr un peth, fel trefnydd angladdau Fictoraidd yn gweddïo am aeaf caled.

Y broblem, Alun, yw eich bod wrth eich bodd yn gwneud honiadau, ond nid ydych yn gwneud eich gwaith cartref, ac ni allwch ddarparu unrhyw beth i'w hategu. Unwaith eto y bore yma yr ydych wedi dangos nad ydych yn deall economeg yn ddigonol. Unwaith eto, yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at yr economi mewn dirwasgiad, fel y gwnaethoch rai misoedd yn ôl, pan fu'n rhaid imi eich cywiro. Rhaid imi nodi mai 28 y cant o'r economi yw'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, er ei fod mewn dirwasgiad. Nid y 28 y cant hwnnw yw'r economi gyfan. Fel cyn glerc banc, dylech ddeall ffigurau. Mae'r economi gyfan yn 100 y cant, ac yn amlwg nid yw mewn dirwasgiad. Ailadroddwyd hynny gennych y bore yma hefyd, er imi eich cywiro rai misoedd yn ôl. Eich problem chi yw eich bod yn gwneud honiadau ond nid ydych eu hategu gan nad ydych yn gwneud eich gwaith cartref. Ailadroddwyd yr honiad gennych y bore yma fod ymarfer diweddar gan ystadegwyr y Llywodraeth yn dangos bod economi Cymru wedi mynd o CMC y pen o 83 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU, i 80 y cant.

Lorraine Barrett: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf dorri ar draws, Rhodri, ond credais ei bod yn briodol. Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, fe'n hatgoffwyd gan swyddfa grŵp y Blaid Lafur fod Dafydd Wigley wedi ei ddyfynnu yn y *South Wales Echo* y mis hwn yn dweud bod Cymru yn awr yn cael ei hystyried yn wlad sydd ag economi ffyniannus a rhagolygon cadarnhaol. Mae hynny'n ategu'r hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yn wir. Ni wn a fydd Dafydd yn siarad yn y ddadl hon. Nid yw'n bresennol yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd. Yn ddi-os, os gwnaiff, bydd yn ailadrodd y datganiad ynglŷn â'r economi ffyniannus a'r rhagolygon cadarnhaol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn egluro ein sefyllfa bresennol yn yr economi. Nid yw'n golygu dod o hyd i bob cyhoeddiad am swyddi a gollir a chymryd yn ganiataol ei fod yn cadarnhau sefyllfa'r economi: yr economi yw'r economi yn ei chrynswth. Mae gennym ystadegau yn ymwneud â hynny, a dyna'r hyn y dylech

ganolbwyntio arno.

Janet Ryder *rose—*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Will you give way to Janet Ryder?

The First Minister: In a second, Janet. Let me finish this litany of the problems with Alun's homework. He made this comment again this morning, which we have already corrected, but he insists on repeating it. I do not know where he gets his briefing from, but it is bad-quality briefing. The exercise showed that the Welsh GDP per capita, which was previously believed to be 83 per cent of the UK average, is now thought to have been 80 per cent of the UK average. That is not an indication of a 3 per cent fall; it is simply a statistical rebasing exercise, indicating that the Welsh economy always was at 79 or 80 per cent, and is going up and not coming down. If you do not understand the difference between a 3 per cent fall in the economy and a statistician's exercise indicating that the previous statistics were wrong, and that we always were at 80 per cent, then that shows me that you need to go back and do your homework again, Alun. You must not make these absurd allegations unless you can back them up.

In today's debate on the Audit Committee you did it again. You puffed yourself up, in all your self-importance, and said that you made serious allegations about the Assembly having approved, about 18 months ago, the transfer of £6 billion from the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation to Cardiff council, which was being spent on the conventional responsibilities of Cardiff council. You made those allegations yesterday in the Economic Development Committee, when you were given the opportunity to question the civil servants. You said that you thought that that money might be being spent on items that every other local authority must fund, not on Cardiff's special duties in relation to the Cardiff Bay barrage. We asked you for examples of that expenditure on normal Cardiff council expenditure. The best example you could come up with was the access road for the barrage. If there were no barrage, there would be no need for an access road to it. I did not mind that point being made yesterday, but it was repeated today.

Janet Ryder *a gododd—*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A ildiwch i Janet Ryder?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mewn eiliad, Janet. Gadewch imi orffen y litani hon o'r problemau sydd ynghlwm wrth waith cartref Alun. Gwnaeth y sylw hwn eto y bore yma, sylw yr ydym eisoes wedi ei gywiro, ond mae'n mynnu ei ailadrodd. Ni wn o ble y caiff ei nodiadau briffio, ond maent yn nodiadau briffio gwael. Dangosodd yr ymarfer fod CMC y pen yng Nghymru tua 80 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU, nid 83 y cant fel y credwyd yn flaenorol. Nid yw hynny'n awgrymu gostyngiad o 3 y cant; ymarfer ailseilio ystadegol syml ydyw, sy'n nodi mai 79 neu 80 y cant fu economi Cymru erioed, a'i bod yn codi ac nid yn gostwng. Os na ddeallwch y gwahaniaeth rhwng gostyngiad o 3 y cant yn yr economi ac ymarfer ystadegydd sy'n dangos bod yr ystadegau blaenorol yn anghywir ac mai ar 80 y cant y buom erioed, yna dengys hynny fod angen i chi fynd yn ôl a gwneud eich gwaith cartref eto, Alun. Peidiwch â gwneud yr honiadau gwirion hyn os na allwch eu hategu.

Yn y ddadl heddiw ar y Pwyllgor Archwilio, gwnaethoch yr un peth eto. Yr ydych wedi boddi yn eich hunan-bwysigrwydd ac wedi dweud ichi wneud honiadau difrifol ynglŷn â'r Cynulliad gan ddweud iddo gymeradwyo, tua 18 mis yn ôl, i £6 biliwn gael ei drosglwyddo o Gorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd i gyngor Caerdydd, a'i fod yn cael ei wario ar gyfrifoldebau confensiynol cyngor Caerdydd. Gwnaethoch yr honiadau hynny ddoe yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, pan gawsoch y cyfle i holi'r gweision sifil. Dywedasoeh y gallai'r arian hwnnw, yn eich barn chi, gael ei wario ar eitemau y mae'n rhaid i bob awdurdod lleol arall eu hariannu, nid ar ddyletswyddau arbennig Caerdydd mewn perthynas â morglawdd Bae Caerdydd. Gofynasom ichi am enghreifftiau o'r gwariant hwnnw ar wariant arferol cyngor Caerdydd. Yr enghraifft orau a gynigiwyd gennych oedd y ffordd fynediad ar gyfer y morglawdd. Pe na bai morglawdd, ni fyddai angen ffordd fynediad iddo. Nid y ffaith i'r pwynt hwnnw

Did you ever see such a ludicrous display of self-important posturing as Alun Cairns saying 'I have made some serious allegations'? If you make serious allegations, back them up. That is what you said in today's Plenary.

Rod Richards *rose—*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. The First Minister is not giving way at the moment.

The First Minister: Finally, Alun, you made serious allegations about the question on the molten metal breakouts from blast furnace no. 5. Corus has invited you, Alun, to go to Port Talbot. You have not gone there. Why will you not go there so that you can withdraw those allegations?

Nick Bourne: What does this have to do with the debate?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. We cannot have two people standing at the same time in a debate.

Nick Bourne: I am just keen that he returns to the debate.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. The First Minister is not giving way.

The First Minister: I am sorry, Deputy Presiding Officer, I was trying to get some water; I did not catch that.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I have called on you to continue, First Minister.

Rod Richards: Will the First Minister give way while he is taking a swig?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. It is clear that the First Minister is not giving way. He said that he would give way to Janet Ryder later.

The First Minister: I am sorry, Deputy Presiding Officer, I thought that you said that

gael ei wneud ddoe sydd yn fy mhoeni, ond yn hytrach y ffaith y bu i chi ei ailadrodd heddiw. A welsoch erioed y fath arddangosfa wirion o rodresa hunan-bwysig ag Alun Cairns yn dweud 'Gwneuthum rai honiadau difrifol'? Os ydych yn gwneud honiadau difrifol, rhaid ichi eu hategu. Dyna'r hyn a ddywedasoeh yn y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw.

Rod Richards *a gododd—*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw Prif Weinidog Cymru yn ildio ar hyn o bryd.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yn olaf, Alun, gwnaethoch honiadau difrifol am y gollyngiadau metel toddeg o ffwrnais chwyth rhif 5. Mae Corus wedi eich gwahodd, Alun, i fynd i Bort Talbot. Nid ydych wedi mynd yno. Pam nad ewch yno fel y gallwch dynnu'r honiadau hynny yn ôl?

Nick Bourne: Beth a wnelo hyn â'r ddadl?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni allwn gael dau berson yn sefyll ar yr un pryd mewn dadl.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn awyddus iddo ddychwelyd at y ddadl.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw Prif Weinidog Cymru am ildio.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Ddirprwy Lywydd, yr oeddwn yn ceisio cael ychydig o ddŵr; ni chlywais yr hyn a ddywedwyd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. yr wyf wedi galw arnoch i barhau, Brif Weinidog.

Rod Richards: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ildio tra ei fod yn yfed llwnc o ddŵr?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r Prif Weinidog am ildio. Dywedodd y byddai'n ildio i Janet Ryder yn ddiweddarach.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Ddirprwy Lywydd, credais ichi

there was a point of order. I thought that because Alun was suffering and hoping that the sneermeister-in-chief of the Tory party would help him. I do not think that that is necessary, Nick; if Alun wants to start a debate, he had better understand that he must be able to back up his allegations.

12:25 p.m.

Let us consider the state of the economy in Wales. It was made clear yesterday that the UK economy is forecast to sustain steady and stable growth with low inflation and sound public finances, and to grow at 2.25 per cent this year in line with the budget forecast. That is the strongest economic growth in the Group 7 countries. The unemployment benefit claimant count has dropped below 50,000 in Wales for the first time on a consistent statistical basis since June 1975. That means that most of the university students in Britain, including Alun Cairns, grew up during a period when unemployment was not as low as it is today. It is below 50,000 and, usually, if you have low unemployment, it would be combined with pressure on the labour market, high inflation, high mortgage rates and problems in dealing with the pressure on the economy. In fact, it is currently combined with the lowest interest rates since 1963 and is one of the reasons why the housing market is so strong in Wales, as it is elsewhere. As Dafydd Wigley said earlier, and I can confirm that from the figures, youth unemployment in Wales has fallen by approximately three-quarters and long-term unemployment for over 25-year-olds has fallen by approximately two-thirds since 1997.

I listened to Alun today but I did not pick up one piece of evidence of a delay or a lack of continuity on our behalf, other than that provided by our partner organisations' demands to have more time sometimes in which to consult with us. Since July, regional selective assistance offers have totalled over £55 million, which should create over 3,000 new jobs and safeguard 1,300 existing ones. Eleven individual projects have been announced during that period, creating over 1,200 new jobs and safeguarding nearly

ddweud bod pwynt o drefn. Credais hynny am fod Alun yn dioddef ac yn gobeithio y byddai pengrechwenwr y blaid Doriadaidd yn ei helpu. Ni chredaf fod angen hynny, Nick; os yw Alun am ddechrau dadl, mae'n well iddo ddeall bod yn rhaid iddo allu ategu ei honiadau.

Gadewch inni ystyried cyflwr yr economi yng Nghymru. Eglurwyd ddoe bod y rhagolygon yn dangos twf cyson a sefydlog yn economi'r DU gyda chwyddiant isel ac arian cyhoeddus cadarn, ac y bydd yn codi 2.25 y cant eleni yn unol â rhagolygon y gyllideb. Dyna'r twf economaidd cryfaf yng ngwledydd Grŵp 7. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n gwneud cais am fudd-dâl diweithdra wedi gostwng o dan 50,000 yng Nghymru am y tro cyntaf ar sail ystadegol gyson ers Mehefin 1975. Golyga hynny fod y rhan fwyaf o'r myfyrwyr prifysgol ym Mhrydain, gan gynnwys Alun Cairns, wedi tyfu i fyny yn ystod cyfnod pan nad oedd diweithdra mor isel ag y mae heddiw. Mae o dan 50,000 ac, fel arfer, os oes gennych ffigur diweithdra isel, câi ei gyfuno â phwysau ar y farchnad lafur, chwyddiant uchel, cyfraddau morgais uchel a phroblemau wrth ddelio â'r pwysau ar yr economi. Mewn gwirionedd, fe'i cyfunir ar hyn o bryd gyda'r cyfraddau llog isaf ers 1963 ac mae'n un o'r rhesymau pam bod y farchnad dai mor gryf yng Nghymru, fel y mae mewn ardaloedd eraill. Fel y dywedodd Dafydd Wigley yn gynharach, a gallaf gadarnhau hynny o'r ffigurau, mae diweithdra ymhlith ieuenctid yng Nghymru wedi gostwng tua thri chwarter ac mae diweithdra hirdymor i bobl dros 25 mlwydd oed wedi gostwng tua dwy ran o dair ers 1997.

Gwrandewais ar Alun heddiw ond ni chlywais unrhyw dystiolaeth o oedi neu ddiffyg parhad ar ein rhan, heblaw'r hyn a ddarparwyd gan ein sefydliadau partner pan ofynnwyd am fwy o amser weithiau i ymgynghori â ni. Ers Gorffennaf, mae cynigion am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol wedi dod i gyfanswm o dros £55 miliwn, a ddylai greu dros 3,000 o swyddi newydd a diogelu 1,300 o swyddi presennol. Cyhoeddwyd 11 o brosiectau unigol yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, gan greu dros 1,200 o

1,500 others. These include projects at Legal & General—

swyddi newydd a diogelu bron 1,500 o rai eraill. Ymhlith y prosiectau hyn mae rhai yn Legal & General—

Rod Richards: Will the Minister give way?

Rod Richards: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ildio?

The First Minister: I will in a second. These include projects at Legal & General, BT Ignite, Elev8—creating some 800 jobs in Cardiff and Ammanford—Continental Teves in Ebbw Vale, Desklinc in Tredegar, which will create 190 jobs and safeguard 160 others. There are projects to safeguard 800 jobs at Calsonic in Llanelli, 450 jobs at Cosy, which is taking over the Revlon plant at Maesteg, plus 150 jobs created at that plant. There is also a major project to support Mostyn port that has enabled the launch of a new ferry service to Ireland.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gwnaf mewn eiliad. Ymhlith y prosiectau hyn mae Legal & General, BT Ignite, Elev8—gan greu tua 800 o swyddi yng Nghaerdydd a Rhydaman—Continental Teves yng Nglynebwy, Desklinc yn Nhredeggar, a fydd yn creu 190 o swyddi ac yn diogelu 160 o rai eraill. Mae prosiectau i ddiogelu 800 o swyddi yn Calsonic yn Llanelli, 450 o swyddi yn Cosy, sydd yn cymryd gwaith Revlon drosodd ym Maesteg, ynghyd â 150 o swyddi newydd yn y gwaith hwnnw. Mae prosiect mawr hefyd i gefnogi porthladd Mostyn sydd wedi arwain at lansio gwasanaeth fferi newydd i Iwerddon.

Janet Ryder: Despite the newspaper headlines, people in north Wales do not feel that the economy is healthy. Over the past two months, we have seen the loss of over 800 jobs. You not only have two powerful, influential roles as First Minister and Minister for Economic Development, you are also the Minister with responsibility for north Wales, as you keep telling us. No one can fulfil those three roles and give them the attention that they need. For the sake of the Assembly and Wales, think again and share those jobs out among your colleagues so that they have that attention.

Janet Ryder: Er gwaethaf y penawdau yn y papurau newydd, nid yw pobl yn y gogledd yn teimlo bod yr economi yn iach. Dros y ddau fis diwethaf, collwyd dros 800 o swyddi. Nid yn unig mae gennych ddwy rôl bwyrus, ddylanwadol fel Prif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, ond chi hefyd yw'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y Gogledd, fel y dywedwch wrthym yn barhaus. Ni all neb gyflawni'r tair rôl hynny a rhoi'r sylw haeddiannol iddynt. Er mwyn y Cynulliad a Chymru, a wnewch chi ailfeddwl a rhannu'r swyddi hynny ymhlith eich cyd-Aelodau fel y cânt y sylw hwnnw?

The First Minister: Consider the outcomes and not the process, Janet. The process is not as important as the outcome, which is that unemployment is at its lowest since June 1975. Do not try to cast doom and gloom, otherwise you are joining the Alun Cairns camp. Dafydd Wigley probably left the Chamber because he does not want me to mention his comments in the *South Wales Echo* on 19 November about the buoyant economy. Are you saying that your economic spokesman, Dafydd Wigley, a former leader of your party, is wrong, or are you in the negative and pessimistic camp, whereas he is in the positive camp? Perhaps you should discuss that with Dafydd. You certainly seem to have a problem in Plaid Cymru—a split on that as on so many other issues.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ystyriwch y canlyniadau ac nid y broses, Janet. Nid yw'r broses mor bwysig â'r canlyniad, sef bod diweithdra ar ei isaf ers Mehefin 1975. Peidiwch â cheisio bod yn ddigalon ac anobeithiol, neu fe fyddwch yn ymuno â charfan Alun Cairns. Gadawodd Dafydd Wigley y Siambr mae'n debyg gan nad yw am imi sôn am ei sylwadau yn y *South Wales Echo* ar 19 Tachwedd ynglŷn â'r economi ffyniannus. A ddywedwch fod eich llefarydd economaidd, Dafydd Wigley, cyn arweinydd eich plaid, yn anghywir, neu a ydych yn rhan o'r garfan negyddol a phesimistaidd, tra ei fod ef yn y garfan gadarnhaol? Efallai y dylech drafod hynny gyda Dafydd. Yn amlwg, mae gennych broblem ym Mhlaid Cymru—rhwyg ar y mater hwn fel sydd ar

gymaint o faterion eraill.

Rod Richards: The First Minister mentioned the road to the barrage. Does he recall the five years that he spent opposing the construction of the Cardiff Bay barrage? Does he recall how frequently during those five years that he warned that the water table under the bay, and particularly Splott, would rise and flood out the residents? Was he wrong or did he simply not do his homework?

The First Minister: I understand that the ground-water piping scheme, which was developed as a result of pressure from witnesses, particularly John Miles, the civil engineering lecturer at Cardiff University, is working, and I am pleased about that. However, I do not know what that has to do with today's debate. I cannot see its relevance.

Was any evidence given this morning about delays in Objective 1? I have noticed, Alun, that you have stopped talking about delays with Objective 1. I am pleased about that, because some £266 million has now been committed from Objective 1 funding, including match funding, to nearly 400 projects since October last year. Some £550 million has been committed to projects in west Wales and the Valleys and, in terms of the percentage of the total economic development commitment, that is an indication that we are ahead of the three other Objective 1 regions.

Christine Chapman: I suggest that the Tories stop reading their briefs and get out to see the projects in action, as I have done over the last month. We are not simply talking about figures on paper, but about benefits to real people in our communities and that is due to the work of this Labour-led Assembly.

The First Minister: You have a problem in making that request to the Tories, Christine, as they have an aversion to good news and they would rather hear what they want to hear. Therefore, they stay well away. They are bad news junkies. If they think that an area has become a success under the

Rod Richards: Soniodd Prif Weinidog Cymru am y ffordd i'r morglawdd. A yw'n cofio'r pum mlynedd a dreuliodd yn gwrthwynebu adeiladu morglawdd Bae Caerdydd? A yw'n cofio sut y rhybuddiodd yn aml yn ystod y pum mlynedd hynny y byddai'r lefel trwythiad o dan y bae, ac yn arbennig Sblot, yn codi ac yn achosi llifogydd i'r trigolion? A oedd yn anghywir neu a anghofiodd wneud ei waith cartref?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Deallaf fod y cynllun pibellau dŵr daear, a ddatblygwyd o ganlyniad i bwysau gan dystion, yn arbennig John Miles, y darlithydd mewn peirianeg sifil ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd, yn gweithio, ac yr wyf yn falch o glywed hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni wn beth a wnelo hynny â dadl heddiw. Ni allaf weld ei berthnasedd.

A roddwyd unrhyw dystiolaeth y bore yma ynglŷn ag oedi o ran Amcan 1? Sylwais, Alun, eich bod wedi rhoi'r gorau i sôn am oedi o ran Amcan 1. Yr wyf yn falch o hynny, oherwydd mae tua £266 miliwn bellach wedi ei neilltuo o arian Amcan 1, gan gynnwys arian cyfatebol, ar gyfer bron 400 o brosiectau ers Hydref y llynedd. Neilltuwyd tua £550 miliwn ar gyfer prosiectau yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd ac, o ran canran cyfanswm yr arian a neilltuwyd ar gyfer datblygu economaidd, mae hynny'n arwydd ein bod ar y blaen i'r tair ardal Amcan 1 arall.

Christine Chapman: Awgrymaf fod y Torïaid yn rhoi'r gorau i ddarllen eu nodiadau briffio ac yn mynd i weld y prosiectau ar waith, fel y gwneuthum i yn ystod y mis diwethaf. Nid siarad am ffigurau ar bapur yn unig a wnawn, ond am y buddiannau i bobl yn ein cymunedau ac mae hynny o ganlyniad i'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan y Cynulliad hwn o dan arweiniad Llafur.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae gennych broblem yn gofyn hynny i'r Torïaid, Christine, am eu bod yn casáu newyddion da a byddai'n well ganddynt glywed yr hyn y maent am ei glywed. Felly, cadwnt draw. Maent yn jyncis newyddion drwg. Os credant fod ardal wedi llwyddo o dan y Cynulliad,

Assembly, they stay well away. Therefore, I fear that not many of them will take you up on that offer.

I have never claimed that the present situation is anything other than temporary and I have never claimed that it is ideal. It is neither ideal nor permanent. However, let me point out that there are times when it is ideal, namely in conducting overseas trade missions. Then it is an advantage that the First Minister is also the Minister for Economic Development, because otherwise it would be necessary to take two Ministers. The First Minister has political clout, which opens the doors for trade delegations. In the trade delegations that I led to Argentina combined with—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will the First Minister give way?

The First Minister: I am just finishing—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will the First Minister give way?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

The First Minister: I have said that I am finishing.

The Deputy Presiding Office: Order. I am afraid that there are only 40 seconds left for this debate.

The First Minister: In that case, I can give way. I am sorry, I thought that I had already run out of time.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: One of the central arguments in this issue, Rhodri, is that on 10 July you said that it was possible for you to combine both roles over the summer months, because you had no Committees to attend, no questions to answer and no Plenary debates to which to reply. That set the parameters against which you judged your own performance. We have been back for five weeks and circumstances have changed. Why do you not acknowledge that you have changed your mind on this issue?

maent yn cadw draw. Felly, ofnaf na fydd llawer ohonynt yn derbyn eich cynnig.

Nid wyf erioed wedi honni bod y sefyllfa bresennol yn ddim ond rhywbeth dros dro ac nid wyf erioed wedi honni ei bod yn ddelfrydol. Nid yw'n ddelfrydol nac yn barhaol. Fodd bynnag, gadewch imi nodi bod adegau pan ei bod yn ddelfrydol, sef wrth gynnal teithiau masnach dramor. Yna mae'n fanteisiol bod Prif Weinidog Cymru yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd hefyd, neu byddai angen mynd â dau Weinidog. Mae gan Brif Weinidog Cymru ddylanwad gwleidyddol, sy'n agor drysau i ddirprwyaethau masnach. Yn y dirprwyaethau masnach a arweiniais i'r Ariannin ynghyd â—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ildio?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf ar fin gorffen—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ildio?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf wedi dweud fy mod ar fin gorffen.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Yn anffodus, dim ond 40 eiliad sydd ar ôl ar gyfer y ddadl hon.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Os felly, gallaf ildio. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, credais fod fy amser eisoes wedi dod i ben.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Un o'r dadleuon canolog yn y mater hwn, Rhodri, yw eich bod wedi dweud ar 10 Gorffennaf ei bod yn bosibl i chi gyfuno'r ddwy rôl yn ystod misoedd yr haf, gan nad oedd gennych unrhyw Bwyllgorau i'w mynychu, dim cwestiynau i'w hateb a dim dadleuon mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn i ymateb iddynt. Gosododd hynny'r paramedrau y gwnaethoch farnu eich perfformiad eich hun yn eu herbyn. Yr ydym wedi dychwelyd ers pum wythnos ac mae'r amgylchiadau wedi newid. Pam na chydabyddwch eich bod wedi newid eich

meddwl ar y mater hwn?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Time has run out, but in view of the urgency, I will extend the debate by a minute. However, I am going against Standing Orders in doing so.

The First Minister: I am slightly confused as to whether I have time to speak or not.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You have one minute.

The First Minister: When we conducted the overseas trade missions to Argentina, Chile, California and South Africa, it was an advantage to be First Minister and Minister for Economic Development. It was helpful in that it opened doors for members of the trade mission and enabled us to secure some £8 million of orders from the 50 companies that were present.

In response to Ieuan's point, I cannot put a time limit on this and put pressure on the South Wales Police to do something by a certain date, by saying that otherwise it would inconvenience the First Minister. I leave it to them to make up their own minds, in their own time, on how to conduct the investigation. It is not up to me and I will not engage in any behaviour which could be construed as putting pressure on them. The situation is temporary and it is not ideal, but I challenge you to produce any results to indicate that the Welsh economy is suffering because of it.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Daeth yr amser i ben, ond o gofio'r brys, rhoddaf funud arall i'r ddadl. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn mynd yn groes i'r Rheolau Sefydlog wrth wneud hynny.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi drysu ychydig. A oes gennyf amser i siarad ai peidio?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae gennych funud.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Pan gynhaliwyd y teithiau masnach dramor i'r Ariannin, Chile, Califfornia a De'r Affrig, yr oedd yn fanteisiol i fod yn Brif Weinidog Cymru ac yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Yr oedd yn ddefnyddiol yn yr ystyr ei fod wedi agor drysau i aelodau teithiau masnach ac wedi'n galluogi i sicrhau tua £8 miliwn o archebion o'r 50 o gwmnïau a oedd yn bresennol.

Mewn ymateb i bwynt Ieuan, ni allaf roi terfyn amser ar hyn a rhoi pwysau ar Heddlu De Cymru i wneud rhywbeth erbyn dyddiad penodol, drwy ddweud y byddai fel arall yn anghyfleus i Brif Weinidog Cymru. Gadawaf iddynt benderfynu drostynt eu hunain, yn eu hamser eu hunain, sut i gynnal yr ymchwiliad. Nid fy mhenderfyniad i ydyw ac ni fyddaf yn ymddwyn mewn unrhyw ffordd a allai gael ei dehongli fel rhoi pwysau arnynt. Sefyllfa dros dro ydyw ac nid yw'n ddelfrydol, ond fe'ch heriaf i gynhyrchu unrhyw ganlyniadau sy'n dangos bod economi Cymru yn dioddef o ganlyniad i hyn.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Alun Pugh: Point of order.

Alun Pugh: Pwynt o drefn.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Is it an urgent point? Must it be taken now?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A yw'n bwynt brys? A oes rhaid ei gymryd yn awr?

Alun Pugh: Yes. I raise this point of order under Standing Order No. 6.26. There were no questions to the House Committee this morning and I know that I bear some responsibility in this matter. However, before

Alun Pugh: Oes. Codaf y pwynt hwn o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.26. Nid oedd unrhyw gwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ y bore yma a gwn fy mod yn gyfrifol am hyn i ryw raddau. Fodd bynnag, cyn y bwrir y

those questions are consigned to history, I ask the House Committee to consider the redundancies to diary journalists, print workers and foresters that will inevitably follow.

cwestiynau hynny i ebargofiant, gofynnaf i Bwyllgor y Tŷ ystyried y swyddi y bydd newyddiadurwyr colofnau, gweithwyr argraffu a choedwigwyr yn anochel yn eu colli.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Journalists' expectations are not a point of order for me. That brings the proceedings to a close.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw disgwyliadau newyddiadurwyr yn bwynt o drefn imi. Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12:31 p.m.
The session ended at 12:31 p.m.*