



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth 11 Rhagfyr 2001

Tuesday 11 December 2001

Cynnwys Contents

- 3 Teyrnged i Syr Ray Powell
Tribute to Sir Ray Powell
- 3 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru
Questions to the First Minister
- 22 Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement
- 26 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order
- 27 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Ffurflenni a Manylion a Ragnodir)
(Diwygiad Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Diwygiad Rhif
2) (Cymru) 2001 a Rheoliadau Grantiau Adleoli (Ffurflenni Cais) (Diwygio Rhif 2)
(Cymru) 2001
*Approval of the Housing Renewal Grants (Prescribed Forms and Particulars)
(Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001, Housing Renewal Grants (Amendment No.
2) (Wales) Regulations 2001 and of the Relocation Grants (Forms of Application)
(Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001*
- 35 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol
Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 3) (Cymru) 2001
*Approval of the NHS (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (No. 3) (Wales)
Regulations 2001*
- 39 Adolygiad Polisi ar Drafnidiaeth Gyhoeddus Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a
Thrafnidiaeth
*The Environment, Planning and Transport Committee's Policy Review of Public
Transport*
- 65 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Mae Angen Prif Weinidog Llawn Amser ar
Gymru
Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): The Need for a Full-time First Minister

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2.00 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2.00 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Teyrnged i Syr Ray Powell Tribute to Sir Ray Powell

The Presiding Officer: Before we begin, I would like us to record the passing of a great warrior of Welsh politics, Sir Ray Powell, and to extend our deepest sympathy to Janice Gregory and the family. I ask you all to stand.

Y Llywydd: Cyn inni ddechrau, carwn inni nodi marwolaeth Syr Ray Powell, ymladdwr mawr yng ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru, ac i estyn ein cydymdeimlad dyfnaf i Janice Gregory a'r teulu. Gofynnaf i chi i gyd sefyll.

*Safodd AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD am funud o dawelwch.
ASSEMBLY MEMBERS stood for a minute's silence.*

Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister

Jiwbilî Aur Golden Jubilee

C1 David Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch dathliadau swyddogol Jiwbilî Aur Ei Mawrhydi y Frenhines yng Nghymru? (OAQ14615)

Q1 David Davies: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the official celebrations of Her Majesty the Queen's Golden Jubilee in Wales? (OAQ14615)

Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan): Yn dilyn fy nghyfarfodydd cyson gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, gallaf ddweud y bydd y Frenhines yn ymweld â Chymru fel rhan o'i dathliadau Jiwbilî Aur rhwng 11 a 13 Mehefin 2002, yn syth ar ôl y penwythnos canolog, sef 1 i 4 Mehefin. Bydd manylion ymweliad y Frenhines ar gael i'r cyhoedd yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd. Gobeithiwn y bydd y Frenhines yn teithio ar draws Cymru a chyfarfod â chynifer o bobl Cymru â phosibl yn ystod ei hymweliad.

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Following my regular meetings with the Secretary of State for Wales, I can announce that the Queen will visit Wales as part of her Golden Jubilee celebrations between 11 and 13 June 2002, immediately after the main weekend of celebration on 1 to 4 June. The details of the Queen's visit will be available to the public early in the new year. We hope that the Queen will travel across Wales and meet as many of the people of Wales as possible during her visit.

David Davies: Fe'ch llongyfarchaf ar y ffaith bod y Frenhines yn dod i Gymru. Mae'n bwysig cofio mai hi yw pennaeth gwladwriaeth Prydain Fawr ac yr wyf wrth fy modd ei bod yn dod i Gymru.

David Davies: I congratulate you on the fact that the Queen is coming to Wales. It is important to remember that she is Great Britain's head of state and I am delighted that she is coming to Wales.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cytunaf â phob gair.

The First Minister: I agree with every word.

Ann Jones: Do you share my disappointment that the Queen's baton relay race, which is

Ann Jones: A ydych yn rhannu fy siom na fydd ras gyfnewid y Frenhines, sy'n mynd o

going around the UK in celebration of the Queen's Jubilee, will not go along the north Wales coast, which denies many of my constituents the opportunity to take part?

The First Minister: I am sorry that the runners of Rhyl and Prestatyn will not have the opportunity to take part in the relay. However, Ann, I am sure you will appreciate that it is impossible to accommodate the wishes of every community in Wales in that relay race. As an ex-runner—and I emphasise the 'ex'—I understand the disappointment of potential relay runners. I am sure they will be able to find an outlet for their energies in celebrating the Golden Jubilee in some other way.

Owen John Thomas: Y flwyddyn 2002 yw chwe chan mlwyddiant llwyddiant Owain Glyndwr wrth ryddhau trefi caerog Cymru megis Caerdydd o dra-arglwyddiaeth yr Engl-Normanïaid. Yn sgîl hyn, daeth cyfnod o dair canrif i ben pan oedd pobl Cymru yn cael eu—

Y Llywydd: A wnewch chi ofyn cwestiwn?

Owen John Thomas: Fel Prif Weinidog Cymru, a gytunwch fod dathlu chwe chan mlwyddiant rhyddhau trefi Cymru yn fwy addas ac urddasol na dathlu penblwydd coroni Brenhines Lloegr?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni fyddai neb yn anghytuno bod Owain Glyndwr yn un o wladgarwyr mwyaf ein hanes. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny yn ein gwahardd rhag dathlu Jiwbilî Aur y Frenhines. Bu'n Frenhines y Deyrnas Unedig dros hanner canrif.

Peter Law: Does the First Minister share my disappointment that Buckingham Palace has, to date, refused to schedule a visit by Her Majesty to Blaenau Gwent during the Golden Jubilee year? There has been great sadness there given the closure of the steelworks after 70 years, with 800 people being pushed through the door. Such a visit would boost morale and Blaenau Gwent has not had a visit from the sovereign for more than three decades.

gwmpas y DU i ddathlu Jiwbilî'r Frenhines, yn mynd ar hyd arfordir gogledd Cymru, sy'n gwarafun y cyfle i lawer o'm hetholwyr ymuno ynddi?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf na chaiff rhedwyr Rhyl a Phrestatyn y cyfle i redeg yn y ras gyfnewid. Fodd bynnag, Ann, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn gwerthfawrogi ei bod yn amhosibl cynnwys dymuniadau pob cymuned yng Nghymru yn y ras gyfnewid honno. Fel cyn-redwr—a phwysleisiaf y 'cyn'—gallaf ddeall siom darpar redwyr y ras gyfnewid. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant yn llwyddo mewn ffyrdd eraill i ddathlu'r Jiwbilî Aur.

Owen John Thomas: The year 2002 is the six hundredth anniversary of Owain Glyndwr's successful liberation of the walled towns of Wales, such as Cardiff, from Anglo-Norman domination. As a result, a period of 300 years came to an end where the people of Wales—

The Presiding Officer: Will you ask a question?

Owen John Thomas: As First Minister, do you agree that celebrating the six hundredth anniversary of the liberation of the towns of Wales would be more appropriate and dignified than celebrating the Queen of England's Jubilee?

The First Minister: No-one would dispute the fact that Owain Glyndwr was one of the most important patriots in our history. However, that does not prevent us from celebrating the Queen's Golden Jubilee. She has been the Queen of the United Kingdom for 50 years.

Peter Law: A yw Prif Weinidog Cymru yn rhannu fy siom fod Palas Buckingham, wedi gwrthod, hyd yn hyn, i drefnu ymweliad gan Ei Mawrhydi â Blaenau Gwent yn ystod blwyddyn y Jiwbilî Aur? Bu tristwch mawr yno o gofio cau'r gwaith dur ar ôl 70 mlynedd, ac 800 o bobl yn cael eu gwrthio drwy'r drws. Byddai ymweliad o'r fath yn hwb i'r ysbryd ac ni chafodd Blaenau Gwent ymweliad gan y frenhines am dros dri degawd.

The First Minister: I understand that Buckingham Palace knows of your wish, as the local Assembly Member, that Blaenau Gwent be included in the Queen's visit to Wales in 2002. However, I am sure you will appreciate, Peter, that Buckingham Palace is not able to meet everyone's wishes in the time available. Royal visits are a matter for the palace, in consultation with the Lord Lieutenants and other organisations, as appropriate. I understand that the Royal visit will include a visit to each of the Welsh lieutenancies, which includes Gwent, but not Blaenau Gwent.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Deallaf fod Palas Buckingham yn gwybod am eich dymuniad, fel yr Aelod Lleol, i Flaenau Gwent gael ei gynnwys yn ymweliad y Frenhines â Chymru yn 2002. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch, Peter, yn gwerthfawrogi nad yw Palas Buckingham yn gallu diwallu dyheadau pawb yn yr amser sydd ar gael. Mater i'r palas yw ymweliadau brenhinol, mewn ymgynghoriad ag Arglwyddi Rhaglaw a chyrff eraill, fel y bo'n briodol. Deallaf y bydd yr ymweliad Brenhinol yn cynnwys ymweliad â phob rhaglawiaeth yng Nghymru, sy'n cynnwys Gwent, ond nid Blaenau Gwent.

Rod Richards: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol bod David Davies yn un o ddisgynyddion Owain Glyndwr? Onid yw'r ffaith ei fod wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwn, sy'n dangos ei deyrngarwch at y Frenhines, yn profi bod y Frenhines wedi tynnu holl genhedloedd y Deyrnas Unedig at ei gilydd?

Rod Richards: Is the First Minister aware that David Davies is a descendant of Owain Glyndwr? Does not the fact that he has asked this question show his loyalty to the Queen and prove that the Queen has drawn all of the people of the United Kingdom together?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid oeddwn yn gwybod bod cysylltiad gwaed rhwng David Davies ac Owain Glyndwr, ond gallaf weld elfen o'r cysylltiad hwnnw yn natur ryfelgar David o bryd i'w gilydd.

The First Minister: I did not know that David Davies and Owain Glyndwr share a bloodline, but I can see some element of that connection in David's occasionally belligerent nature.

Adleoli Staff y Fyddin Relocation of Army Personnel

Q2 David Melding: Has the First Minister had, or does he plan to have, discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales on the relocation of army personnel to RAF St Athan? (OAQ14606)

C2 David Melding: A yw Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi cael trafodaethau, neu'n bwriadu cael trafodaethau, gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch adleoli staff y fyddin i RAF Sain Tathan? (OAQ14606)

The First Minister: The Secretary of State and I recently met and discussed, among many other matters, the possibility of having a number of army personnel—I believe that two battalion-sized units is the technical expression—relocated to RAF St Athan as part of the withdrawal of personnel from Germany and other overseas postings and their relocation to home soil. The Ministry of Defence's decision on this is some way off, but there would be considerable benefits to the local economy. The Welsh Assembly Government will provide any information that will assist the MoD's detailed options study. That options study must provide a

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cyfarfu'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a minnau'n ddiweddar a thrafod, ymysg llawer o bethau eraill, y posibilrwydd o gael nifer o aelodau'r fyddin—credaf mai dwy uned maint bataliwn yw'r ffordd dechnegol o'i ddweud—wedi eu hadleoli i'r Awyrlu yn Sain Tathan fel rhan o'r ymarfer i dynnu personél o'r Almaen a lleoliadau tramor eraill a'u hadleoli gartref. Bydd hi'n beth amser eto cyn y ceir penderfyniad y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn ar hyn, ond byddai'n dod â lles i'r economi leol. Bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn darparu unrhyw wybodaeth a fydd yn cynorthwyo astudiaeth ddewisiadau fanwl y

business case for that relocation to St Athan and must stand on its own two feet.

Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn. Rhaid i'r astudiaeth ddewisiadau roi achos busnes i gyfiawnhau'r adleoliad i Sain Tathan.

2.10 p.m.

David Melding: The people of the Vale of Glamorgan are grateful to the administration and the Government for their efforts to develop RAF St Athan and to secure its future. Will you ensure that residents' views are taken into account in such developments as the relocation of army personnel and the Welsh Development Agency's consideration of a possible extension of the runway to secure the Defence Aviation Repair Agency redevelopment? It is essential that we take local people with us.

David Melding: Mae pobl Bro Morgannwg yn ddiolchgar i'r weinyddiaeth a'r Llywodraeth am eu hymdrechion i ddatblygu Awyrlu Sain Tathan ac i sicrhau ei ddyfodol. A wnewch chi sicrhau bod barn y trigolion yn cael ei hystyried mewn datblygiadau megis adleoli personél y fyddin a'r estyniad posibl i'r rhedfa, sydd yn cael ei ystyried gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, i sicrhau ailddatblygiad yr Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn? Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn ennill ymddiriedaeth pobl leol.

The First Minister: I agree. We are dealing with two possibilities. One is the relocation of army units to the west camp at St Athan. That is alongside the Red Dragon project to develop part of the St Athan site, which is being undertaken jointly by the WDA and DARA, the Government agency that has taken over 90 per cent of the work at St Athan. The one drawback, as far as the locals are concerned, is that the runway must be extended. The problem is that, if the runway is not extended, then DARA will not look favourably on locating the new Red Dragon project—the revitalised repair workshops—there. If we do not have follow-on from DARA, now that it has been formed as a separate commercial trading agency, that would cause employment difficulties. The runway extension is the one drawback and we are trying to find a way around that which meets the objections of people living in St Athan.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cytunaf. Yr ydym yn delio â dau bosibilrwydd. Un yw adleoli unedau o'r fyddin i'r gwersyll gorllewinol yn Sain Tathan. Mae hwnnw ynghyd â phrosiect y Ddraig Goch i ddatblygu rhan o safle Sain Tathan, yr ymgwymerir ag ef ar y cyd gan y WDA a DARA, asiantaeth y Llywodraeth sydd bellach yn gyfrifol am dros 90 y cant o'r gwaith yn Sain Tathan. Yr unig ddiffyg, ym meddwl y bobl leol, yw bod rhaid ymestyn y rhedfa. Yr anhawster yw, os nad ymestynnir y rhedfa, yna ni fydd DARA yn edrych yn ffafriol ar leoli prosiect newydd y Ddraig Goch—y gweithdai atgyweirio a adfywiwyd—yno. Os na chawn ddilyniant gan DARA, gan ei fod bellach yn asiantaeth fasnachu ar wahân, byddai hynny'n peri anawsterau cyflogaeth. Ymestyn y rhedfa yw'r unig broblem ac yr ydym yn ceisio datrys hynny mewn ffordd a fydd yn bodloni gwrthwynebiadau pobl sy'n byw yn Sain Tathan.

Pauline Jarman: Following the terrorist attack on 11 September, is RAF St Athan officially categorised as a military target of low, medium or high risk?

Pauline Jarman: Ar ôl yr ymosodiad gan derfysgwyr ar 11 Medi, a yw Awyrlu Sain Tathan wedi ei gategoreiddio'n swyddogol fel targed milwrol risg isel, canolig neu uchel?

The First Minister: I will write to you, as I do not know the answer.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ysgrifennaf atoch, gan nad wyf yn gwybod yr ateb.

Y Llywydd: Mae cwestiwn 3 (OAQ14612) wedi'i dynnu yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 3 (OAQ14612) has been withdrawn.

Ailenwi'r Weinyddiaeth yn y Cynulliad Renaming of the Assembly Administration

C4 David Lloyd: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch ailenwi'r weinyddiaeth yn y Cynulliad? (OAQ14614)

Q4 David Lloyd: What discussion has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the renaming of the administration in the Assembly? (OAQ14614)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni chefais drafodaethau ymlaen llaw, ond yr wyf wedi hysbysu Paul Murphy, fel Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, a Phrif Weinidog y DU ar y mater hwnnw.

The First Minister: I did not have discussions beforehand, but I have kept Paul Murphy, as the Secretary of State for Wales, and the Prime Minister informed on this issue.

David Lloyd: A fydd WAG yn aros felly?

David Lloyd: Will WAG remain then?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Wrth gwrs.

The First Minister: Of course.

The Presiding Officer: I call on the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives to ask his supplementary question.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru i ofyn ei gwestiwn atodol.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): I requested a supplementary question to question 11 rather than question 4.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Gofynnais am gael gofyn cwestiwn atodol i gwestiwn 11 yn hytrach na chwestiwn 4.

The Presiding Officer: I am sorry.

Y Llywydd: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf.

Symudwn felly i gwestiwn 5 Peter Black.

We will move therefore to Peter Black's question 5.

Datganiad Rhag-gyllidebol y Canghellor The Chancellor's Pre-budget Statement

Q5 Peter Black: Will the First Minister make a statement on the impact on Wales of the Chancellor's pre-budget statement? (OAQ14600)

C5 Peter Black: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar effaith datganiad rhag-gyllidebol y Canghellor ar Gymru? (OAQ14600)

The First Minister: I welcome the additions to the Assembly's budget announced by the Chancellor in his pre-budget statement. It means that we will receive an increase in our departmental expenditure limit of £49.9 million for the financial year starting 1 April. Wales will also benefit from other measures announced on 27 September, such as the removal of stamp duty on commercial and residential property transactions of up to £150,000 in deprived areas—which covers 47 per cent of Wales—and the new working tax credit and pensioner credit.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Croesawaf yr ychwanegiadau at gyllideb y Cynulliad a gyhoeddwyd gan y Canghellor yn ei ddatganiad rhag-gyllidebol. Golyga y byddwn yn derbyn ychwanegiad yn ein terfyn gwariant adrannol o £49.9 miliwn ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol sy'n dechrau ar 1 Ebrill. Bydd Cymru hefyd yn elwa o fesurau eraill a gyhoeddwyd ar 27 Medi, megis dileu'r dreth stamp ar drafodion eiddo masnachol a phreswyl hyd at £150,000 mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig—sef 47 y cant o'r wlad—a'r credyd treth newydd i bobl sy'n gweithio a

chredyd pensiynwyr.

Peter Black: Do you agree that the Prime Minister's pledge to increase UK spending on the national health service to EU levels by 2005 is important? Will you press him to keep to that promise?

The First Minister: Details of this remain to be worked out, as you are aware. There is a three to four-month consultation period on the Wanless report on how to bring about that rise in NHS expenditure across the UK to bring us up to the average European expenditure levels of around 8 per cent of gross domestic product. That is still being worked out, as are the implications for Wales. However, we have that period of consultation, in which we will play a full part.

Dafydd Wigley: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn nad yw datganiad Gordon Brown yn rhoi sicrwydd y cawn ddefnyddio amrywiadau ariannol i ddatblygu'r economi o fewn ardaloedd Amcan 1? Pryd y mae'n disgwyl i Gordon Brown ddechrau sylwi ar bolisiau ei Lywodraeth ei hun?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Y ffaith ei fod wedi eithrio'r doll stampiau mewn ardaloedd Amcan 1—

Dafydd Wigley: Abersoch.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Wel, mae'r ardal bron cymesur ag ardal Amcan 1 ac mae'n ymwneud â gwerthiant eiddo o hyd at £150,000. Mae hynny'n gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Byddai pawb yn derbyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, dywed Gordon Brown y bydd yn parhau gyda'i drafodaethau â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd er mwyn lledaenu'r eithriadau hyn fel bod llai o doll stampiau mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig nag yng ngweddill y wlad.

Alun Pugh: I am delighted to see that extra resources will go to health. Wales has some real inequalities in health. Can this money go towards tackling the underlying causes of ill-health and health inequalities?

The First Minister: You are talking about

Peter Black: A gytunwch fod ymrwymiad y Prif Weinidog i gynyddu gwariant y DU ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol i lefelau'r UE erbyn 2005 yn bwysig? A wnewch chi bwysio arno i gadw'r addewid hwnnw?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Fel y gwyddoch, mae angen gwneud gwaith pellach ar y manylion. Mae cyfnod ymgynghori o dri i bedwar mis ar adroddiad Wanless ar sut y gellir cynyddu'r gwariant ar yr NHS ar draws y DU er mwyn inni gyrraedd cyfartaledd lefelau gwariant Ewrop, sef 8 y cant o'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth. Parheir i weithio ar hyn, yn ogystal a'r goblygiadau i Gymru. Fodd bynnag mae gennym y cyfnod ymgynghori hwnnw, y byddwn yn cyfrannu'n llawn iddo.

Dafydd Wigley: Does the First Minister accept that Gordon Brown's statement does not give any assurance that we can use fiscal variations to develop the economy within Objective 1 areas? When does he expect Gordon Brown to start to take note of his own Government's policies?

The First Minister: His decision to abolish stamp duty in the Objective 1 areas—

Dafydd Wigley: Abersoch.

The First Minister: Well, the area is almost commensurate with the Objective 1 area and deals with property sales of up to £150,000. That is a step in the right direction. Everyone would accept that. However, Gordon Brown says that he will continue his discussions with the European Commission to extend these exemptions so that there will be less stamp duty in disadvantaged areas than in the rest of the country.

Alun Pugh: Mae'n dda gennyf weld y caiff adnoddau ychwanegol eu rhoi i iechyd. Mae anghydraddoldebau iechyd gwirioneddol gan Gymru. A all yr arian hwn gael ei roi i fynd i'r afael â'r achosion wrth wraidd afiechyd ac anghydraddoldebau iechyd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Soniwch am faterion

difficult, but nevertheless hugely important, lifestyles issues in relation to smoking and to heavy and binge drinking, which can damage the liver, and so on. We have all read a great deal over the past few days about the effects of excessive drinking. The health gap between the south and north of England is huge. If Wales were to be included in those statistics, we would probably be worse than the north of England, and certainly not like the south of England. Encouraging people to make lifestyle changes would save the NHS money—though its purpose, obviously, is not to save money but to improve people's health. However, persuading people to change their lifestyles so as not to damage their health is a huge task. The gap between the health of the south-east of England and the rest of the country or, to put it in terms of income groups, that between relatively well-off people with relatively safe occupations, and those with dirty, dangerous or anti-social occupations, is widening.

anodd, ond eithriadol bwysig serch hynny, o ran ffyrdd o fyw, sy'n ymwneud ag ysmegu ac yfed trwm a goryfed achlysurol, a all wneud niwed i'r afu, ac yn y blaen. Yr ydym wedi darllen llawer dros y dyddiau diwethaf am effaith goryfed. Mae'r gwahaniaeth rhwng iechyd pobl yn ne a gogledd Lloegr yn enfawr. Pe bai Cymru'n cael ei chynnwys yn yr ystadegau hynny, byddem, yn fwy na thebyg, yn waeth na gogledd Lloegr, ac yn sicr ddim byd tebyg i dde Lloegr. Byddai annog pobl i newid eu ffordd o fyw yn arbed arian i'r NHS—er, mae'n amlwg nad arbed arian mo'i bwrpas, ond gwella iechyd pobl. Fodd bynnag, mae perswadio pobl i newid eu ffordd o fyw i'w hamddiffyn rhag niweidio'u hiechyd yn dasg anferth. Mae'r bwlch rhwng iechyd pobl yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr a gweddill y wlad, neu, i'w rhoi yng nghydestun grwpiau incwm, y gwahaniaeth rhwng pobl cymharol gyfoethog mewn swyddi cymharol ddiogel, a'r rheini sydd mewn swyddi brwnt, peryglus neu wrthgymdeithasol, yn lledu.

Cydlynu Polisi ar Ardaloedd Gwledig **Co-ordination of Policy on Rural Areas**

Q6 Mick Bates: Will the First Minister make a statement on the continued co-ordination of Assembly policy on rural areas? (OAQ14620)

The First Minister: 'Plan for Wales 2001', and our national economic development strategy, 'A Winning Wales', underline our commitment to supporting rural Wales in a co-ordinated way. 'Planning Policy Wales' contains guidance on the rural economy, including encouragement for rural diversification, and is now being finalised for issue in March 2002. On 21 November 2001, the Minister for Rural Affairs, Carwyn Jones, published a strategy for the future of farming in Wales.

Mick Bates: A great deal of prosperity will be gained through renewable energy projects in Wales. What has the Cabinet done to promote renewable energy projects in Wales, for example, the Newbridge-on-Wye integrated sawmill and power station?

The First Minister: It is often a case of not

C6 Mick Bates: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y modd y mae polisi'r Cynulliad ar ardaloedd gwledig yn parhau i gael ei gydlynu? (OAQ14620)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Pwysleisia 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001', a'n strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, 'Cymru ar ei Hennill', ein hymrwymiad i gefnogi Cymru wledig mewn dull cydlynol. Mae 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' yn cynnwys arweiniad ar yr economi wledig, ynghyd ag anogaeth ar gyfer arallgyfeirio gwledig, ac mae'n cael ei gwblhau i'w gyhoeddi ym mis Mawrth 2002. Cyhoeddodd Carwyn Jones, y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, strategaeth ar gyfer dyfodol ffermio yng Nghymru ar 21 Tachwedd 2001.

Mick Bates: Enillir cryn ffyniant drwy brosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru. Beth a wnaeth y Cabinet i hyrwyddo prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru, er enghraifft, melin goed a gorsaf bŵer integredig y Bontnewydd ar Wŷ?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yn aml, mae'n fater

being able to set aside the planning objections which are maintained, sometimes based on strong community reactions. That may be true of Newbridge-on-Wye, or at least that is how it appears. It caused Powys County Council to not make a positive or negative decision—I cannot remember which—which means that British Biofuels has not been able to complete the plans for the proposed energy development linked with the sawmills development at Newbridge on Wye. On the other hand, it is not all bad news for renewable energy. Yesterday, Brian Wilson, the Minister of State for Industry, Energy and the Environment, gave the go ahead for the Cefn Croes windfarm above Aberystwyth, which will possibly be the biggest windfarm in the UK.

Janet Ryder: I am sure that you would agree that maintaining manufacturing capacity in rural areas is important. It was sad therefore to hear the news about Dolgarrog. I am sure that you are aware that the local councillor, Emlyn Thomas, is working closely with his community and the unions to put together a package that would keep the manufacturing capacity in Dolgarrog. To date, neither you nor your officials have supported this group. That is different to your approach on Llanwern. The group is asking for money to help develop its work. Will you explain why you are not supporting it?

The First Minister: I am not sure that I am on your wavelength. My understanding is that the company determined on closure and that councillors, possibly assisted by the local authority, wanted to hire consultants to complete an alternative business model which could be used to persuade the overall management of Alcoa—the multinational that owns the Dolgarrog plant—to change its mind. It is not the same as the Corus situation, to which you made, I think, a false parallel. Actions were put in place to remedy the side effects of that closure on the community. It was not a consultancy study with a view to persuade a company to change its mind. If I am wrong about that, Janet, please write to me and I will ensure that you receive a fuller reply. However, that is my understanding and why I think that the parallel that you made was false.

o fethu ag anwybyddu gwrthwynebiadau cynllunio sy'n cael eu coleddu, weithiau, ar sail ymateb cymunedol cryf. Gallai hynny fod yn wir am y Bontnewydd ar Wŷ, neu o leiaf, ymddengys felly. Parodd i Gyngor Sir Powys beidio â gwneud penderfyniad cadarnhaol na negyddol—ni allaf gofio pa un—sy'n golygu nad yw British Biofuels wedi gallu cwblhau cynlluniau ar gyfer y datblygiad ynni arfaethedig a gysylltir â'r datblygiad melin goed ym Mhontnewydd ar Wŷ. Ar y llaw arall, nid yw'n newyddion drwg i gyd i ynni adnewyddadwy. Ddoe, rhoddodd Brian Wilson, y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Ddiwydiant, Ynni a'r Amgylchedd, ganiatâd i ddatblygu fferm wynt Cefn Croes uwchlaw Aberystwyth, sef, o bosibl, y fferm wynt fwyaf yn y DU.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod cynnal capasiti gweithgynhyrchu mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn bwysig. Yr oedd yn drist felly i glywed y newyddion am Ddolgarrog. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol fod Emlyn Thomas, y cynghorwr lleol, yn gweithio'n agos gyda'i gymuned a'r undebau i baratoi pecyn a fyddai'n cadw'r capasiti gweithgynhyrchu yn Nolgarrrog. Hyd yma, ni wnaethoch chi na'ch swyddogion gefnogi'r grŵp hwn. Mae hynny'n wahanol iawn i'ch ymagwedd tuag at Lanwern. Mae'r grŵp yn gofyn am arian i'w helpu i ddatblygu ei waith. A wnewch chi esbonio pam nad ydych yn ei gefnogi?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni chredaf fy mod yn eich deall yn llwyr. Fy nealltwriaeth yw bod y cwmni'n benderfynol o gau, a bod cynghorwyr, efallai gyda help yr awdurdod lleol, am logi ymgynghorwyr i gwblhau model busnes amgen y gellid ei ddefnyddio i berswadio rheolaeth gyffredinol Alcoa—y cwmni, rhyngwladol sy'n berchen ar waith Dolgarrog—i newid ei feddwl. Nid yw yr un fath â sefyllfa Corus, y gwnaethoch chi gymhariaeth anghywir ag ef, yn fy marn i. Cymerwyd camau i gywiro sgîl-effeithiau y cau hwnnw ar y gymuned. Nid astudiaeth ymgynghorol gyda'r bwriad i berswadio cwmni i newid ei feddwl ydoedd. Os wyf yn anghywir ynglŷn â hynny, Janet, ysgrifennwch ataf, ac fe sicrhaf y cewch ateb llawnach. Fodd bynnag, dyna yw fy nealltwriaeth a pham yr wyf yn credu bod y gymhariaeth a wnaethoch yn un ddi-sail.

Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru Wales Trades Union Congress

Q7 Christine Chapman: Will the First Minister report on recent meetings he has had with the Wales Trade Union Congress? (OAQ14609)

The First Minister: I last met the Wales TUC on 27 June and will meet it again on Thursday this week. Representatives of the Wales TUC also attended the Business Partnership Council meeting on 23 November.

2.20 p.m.

Christine Chapman: Do you agree that the way forward in Wales is in partnership with all interested parties, including the Wales TUC, on matters arising from the debate over the delivery of strong public services through to our economy and maximising the use of Objective 1 funds? Do you agree, Rhodri, that Wales TUC is one of the parties that should be brought to the table to ensure that we move forward in consensus? Such consensus and inclusivity are vital if devolution is to work for the people of Wales.

The First Minister: I agree. That is why we have funded the Wales Social Partners Unit, which the Wales TUC owns jointly with Business Wales. It has been agreed that the TUC will take the chair for the first year, then it will alternate with Business Wales. That is a useful way of ensuring consensus between the business and trade union side so that they can participate fully in Objective 1 and so that many other matters can proceed. I saw the spirit of consensus, as did the acting Deputy First Minister and the Minister for Health and Social Services, when we had the privilege of visiting the Broughton plant, as part of its thirtieth anniversary celebrations. I have never seen such a dramatic example of an under pressure consensual approach being taken by a company. It has been in difficulties since 11 September. The unions and management were discussing how best to get through that crisis in order to keep the human resource skill base, pending the

C7 Christine Chapman: A all Prif Weinidog Cymru adrodd ar ei gyfarfodydd diweddar gyda TUC Cymru? (OAQ14609)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Y tro diwethaf i mi gwrdd â TUC Cymru oedd ar 27 Mehefin a byddaf yn cwrdd â hwy eto ddydd Iau yr wythnos hon. Hefyd mynychodd cynrychiolwyr TUC Cymru gyfarfod y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes ar 23 Tachwedd.

Christine Chapman: A gytunwch mai'r ffordd ymlaen yng Nghymru yw drwy bartneriaeth gyda'r holl bartïon sydd â diddordeb, gan gynnwys TUC Cymru, ar faterion yn codi o'r ddadl ar gyflwyno gwasanaethau cyhoeddus cryf, ein heconomi a gwneud y defnydd gorau o arian Amcan 1? A gytunwch, Rhodri, fod TUC Cymru yn un o'r cyrff y dylid ei wahodd i'n trafodaethau i sicrhau ein bod yn symud ymlaen yn gytûn? Mae consensws a chynhwysedd o'r fath yn hollbwysig os yw datganoli i weithio dros bobl Cymru.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cytunaf. Dyna paham yr ydym wedi ariannu Uned Partneriaid Cymdeithasol Cymru, y mae TUC Cymru yn gyd-berchnogion arno gyda Busnes Cymru. Cytunwyd mai'r TUC fydd yn cadeirior am y flwyddyn gyntaf, ac yna am yn ail â Busnes Cymru. Mae hynny'n ddull defnyddiol o sicrhau consensws rhwng yr ochr fusnes ac ochr yr undebau llafur fel eu bod yn gallu cyfranogi'n llawn yn Amcan 1 ac fel bod nifer o faterion eraill yn gallu mynd rhagddynt. Gwelais ysbryd consensws, fel y gwnaeth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog dros dro a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, pan gawsom y fraint o ymweld â gwaith y Brychdwn, fel rhan o'i dathliadau pen-blwydd yn ddeng mlynedd ar hugain oed. Ni welais erioed y fath enghraifft drawiadol o ymagwedd consensws o dan bwysau gan gwmni. Bu mewn anawsterau ers 11 Medi. Yr oedd yr

upturn, which should come in early 2004.

undebau a'r rheolwyr yn trafod y ffordd orau i oresgyn yr argyfwng er mwyn cadw'r sylfaen sgiliau adnoddau dynol, hyd nes y daw gwelliant, a ddylai ddigwydd yn gynnar yn 2004.

David Davies: A wnewch chi siarad â'r TUC ynghylch ei chefnogaeth i'r ewro a gofyn pam ei fod am weld pŵer dros ein heconomi ni yn cael ei drosglwyddo i fancwyr yn Frankfurt?

David Davies: Will you talk to the TUC about its support for the euro and ask why it wants to see control over our economy transferred to bankers in Frankfurt?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Bydd yr ewro yn cael ei chyflwyno fel arian i 12 gwlad o'r gymuned Ewropeaidd o fewn y tair wythnos nesaf. Bydd yn cael effaith ar Brydain Fawr os yw Prydain yn aelod neu beidio, oherwydd bydd ymwelwyr â Phrydain yn gwario ewros ar y ffordd i Iwerddon ac wrth adael Iwerddon, ac ar hyd yr M4 a'r M5 pan ddônt i gefnogi eu timau rygbi, megis Ffrainc a'r Eidal, yn chwarae yn erbyn Cymru yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm. Bydd yr ewro yn dod i'n system ariannol os ydym yn aelodau neu beidio. Mae eisiau inni gynefino â'r ewro a'i defnyddio fel cyfle ac nid fel bygythiad.

The First Minister: The euro will be introduced as currency in 12 countries of the European community in about three weeks' time. It will have an effect on Great Britain whether Britain is a member or not, because visitors to Britain will spend euros on the way to or from Ireland and along the M4 and M5 when they come to support their rugby teams, such as France and Italy, playing against Wales in the Millennium Stadium. The euro will come into our financial system whether we are members or not. We need to get used to the euro and treat it as an opportunity rather than a threat.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae TUC Cymru wedi bod yn gyson feirniadol o ddiffyg polisi gweithredol y Llywodraeth hon ynglŷn â'r economi. Mae adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd heddiw yn dweud bod mwy o bobl ar gymhorthdal incwm nawr, nag oedd pan ddaeth Llafur i rym yn 1997. A fydd Rhodri Morgan yn ceryddu ei Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd am wastraffu amser yn busnesa ym mhortffolio Prif Weinidog Cymru, ac ym mhortffolio'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y Gogledd, yn lle canolbwyntio ar sicrhau bod economi Cymru'n hyfyw?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: TUC Wales has been consistently critical of this Government's lack of operational policy regarding the economy. A report published today states that there are more people on income support now than when Labour came to power in 1997. Will Rhodri Morgan castigate his Minister for Economic Development for poking his nose into the First Minister's portfolio, and the portfolio of the Minister responsible for north Wales, rather than concentrating on ensuring that the Welsh economy is viable?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn siŵr, Rhodri Glyn, os ydych yn cofio'r tro diwethaf i ddiweithdra fod dan 50,000 yng Nghymru, ond yr oedd dros 26 mlynedd yn ôl yn haf 1975. Felly, nid oes unrhyw sail i'ch beirniadaeth. Mae yr un mor ddi-sail â'ch honiad rhyw fis yn ôl bod Côr Orpheus Treforys wedi cynnal cyngerdd yn y Carnegie Hall lle yr oedd mwy o bobl ar y llwyfan nac yn y gynulleidfa. Mewn gwirionedd, yr oedd y tocynnau i gyd wedi'u gwerthu. Nid wyf yn deall pam yr ydych yn gwneud yr honiadau di-sail hyn heb wirio eich ffeithiau.

The First Minister: I am not sure, Rhodri Glyn, whether you remember the last time that unemployment was under 50,000 in Wales, but it was over 26 years ago in the summer of 1975. Therefore, there is no basis to that criticism. It is as unfounded as your claim about a month ago that performers outnumbered the audience at a concert held by the Morriston Orpheus Choir in Carnegie Hall, when, in fact, the tickets had sold out. I do not understand why you make these unfounded claims without verifying your facts.

Mae'n wir bod TUC Cymru wedi dweud bod y sector gweithgynhyrchu—y sector ffatrioedd yng Nghymru—dan wasgedd. Mae pawb yn derbyn hynny. Mae oherwydd sefyllfa'r bunt ac oherwydd bod yr ewro wedi bod yn wan ers ei chyflwyno rhyw dair blynedd yn ôl. Mae'n bwysig ceisio trefnu materion fel bod yr ewro yn cryfhau a'r bunt yn gwanhau. Mae pawb yn disgwyl i'r bunt wanhau a'r ewro gryfhau yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf, gan gynnwys Banc Lloegr—dywedodd hynny bythefnos yn ôl. Bydd hynny'n gwneud lles i'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru.

It is true that the Wales TUC has said that the manufacturing sector—the factory sector in Wales—is under pressure. Everyone accepts that. It is because of the pound's position and because the euro has been weak since its introduction about three years ago. It is important to try to arrange matters so that the euro strengthens and the pound weakens. Everyone expects the pound to weaken and the euro to strengthen during the next year, including the Bank of England—it said so a fortnight ago. That will benefit the manufacturing sector in Wales.

Pwerau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru Powers of the National Assembly for Wales

Q8 Jonathan Morgan: What meetings has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales in connection with increasing the National Assembly's devolved powers? (OAQ14607)

C8 Jonathan Morgan: Pa gyfarfodydd y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch datganoli mwy o bwerau i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? (OAQ14607)

The First Minister: I have regular discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales and that is one of the topics that is raised from time to time. Since the Assembly's formation, responsibilities for the European social fund have been transferred to the Assembly. We are currently requesting that responsibility for animal health matters be transferred. As I have said before, we were offered responsibility for S4C, but decided not to accept it.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Caf drafodaethau cyson gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a hwn yw un o'r pynciau a godir o bryd i'w gilydd. Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, trosglwyddwyd y cyfrifoldebau am y gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd i'r Cynulliad. Yr ydym ar hyn o bryd yn gwneud cais i drosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros faterion iechyd anifeiliaid. Fel y dywedais yn barod, cynigiwyd y cyfrifoldeb am S4C inni, ond penderfynwyd na fyddem yn ei dderbyn.

Jonathan Morgan: Paul Murphy, the Secretary of State for Wales, hinted this month at extra powers for the Assembly. Indeed, one of your Deputy Ministers, Alun Pugh, suggested the possibility of a parliament for Wales. As the governing party, do you accept that it is vital that the Assembly learns how to operate and deliver within the devolved remit provided to it through the referendum, instead of pandering to the nationalists who seem to want to float Wales off as an independent socialist people's republic?

Jonathan Morgan: Y mis hwn awgrymodd Paul Murphy, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, y gallai'r Cynulliad gael pwerau ychwanegol. Yn wir, awgrymodd Alun Pugh, un o'ch Dirprwy Weinidogion, y posibilrwydd o senedd i Gymru. Fel y blaid sy'n llywodraethu, a ydych yn derbyn ei bod yn hollbwysig bod y Cynulliad yn dysgu sut i weithredu a chyflwyno o fewn y cylch gwaith datganoledig a dderbyniodd drwy'r refferendwm, yn hytrach na rhyngu bodd y cenedlaetholwyr sy'n ymddangos fel pe baent am fwrw Cymru i'r dŵr fel gweriniaeth sosialaidd annibynnol y bobl?

The First Minister: There was an element of headline hype in that description of what Paul Murphy actually said—not that we are

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr oedd elfen o heip penawdau yn y disgrifiad hwnnw o'r hyn a ddywedodd Paul Murphy—nid nad ydym yn

unfamiliar with headline hype in matters relating to devolution. You must accept that the process of transferring power from Whitehall and Westminster to Wales is hardly likely to have stopped with devolution. It has been going on since 1964 when the Welsh Office was first established, and went on quite as much under Tory Governments as under Labour Governments.

Eleanor Burnham: When will the commission be established, and how will it work?

The First Minister: We hope to make the appointments in the first quarter of next year. It would run from approximately late spring 2002 to autumn 2003—an 18-month period. It would take evidence as independent commissions usually do, and then report to the Assembly when it is able to look back on the Assembly's full four-year term. It will be able to work out to what degree we were frustrated from being able to do what we wanted, and from what point of view we were able to do exactly what we wanted within the Government of Wales Act 1998. It would then make a recommendation to the Welsh Assembly Government, which would put it to the Assembly as a set of recommendations. If it involved requests for more powers requiring primary legislation—not just transfer of functions Orders—it would be a matter for the Westminster Government and for different parties to take views as regards the next general election in 2005 or 2006.

Jocelyn Davies: You sometimes argue, First Minister, that we must justify extra powers by proving ourselves with our current inadequate ones. Is your Government ever likely to demonstrate that we are using our current powers to the full, when research into a random sample of our subordinate legislation found that 80 per cent of it was virtually identical to that passed at Westminster?

The First Minister: I have heard these allegations that Plaid Cymru keeps coming up with that we make too much legislation that is identical to that made at Westminster, or that Westminster is passing legislation that

gyfarwydd â heip penawdau mewn materion yn ymwneud â datganoli. Rhaid ichi dderbyn na fydd y broses o drosglwyddo pwerau o Whitehall a San Steffan i Gymru yn debyg o fod wedi peidio gyda datganoli. Bu'n digwydd ers 1964 pan sefydlwyd y Swyddfa Gymreig gyntaf, a pharhaodd i ddigwydd i'r un graddau o dan Lywodraethau Ceidwadol ag a wnaeth o dan Lywodraethau Llafur.

Eleanor Burnham: Pa bryd gaiff y comisiwn ei sefydlu, a sut y bydd yn gweithio?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gobeithiwn wneud y penodiadau yn ystod chwarter cyntaf y flwyddyn nesaf. Byddai'n gweithredu o tua diwedd gwanwyn 2002 hyd yr hydref 2003—cyfnod o 18 mis. Byddai'n gwrandao ar dystiolaeth fel y bydd comisiynau annibynnol yn ei wneud fel arfer, ac yna'n cyflwyno adroddiad i'r Cynulliad pan fydd yn gallu edrych yn ôl ar dymor pedair blynedd llawn y Cynulliad. Bydd yn gallu gweld i ba raddau y cawsom ein rhwystro rhag gwneud yr hyn a ddymunem, ac ym mha ffordd y llwyddasom i wneud yn union yr hyn a ddymunem o fewn Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Byddai wedyn yn rhoi argymhelliaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a fyddai'n ei roi ger bron y Cynulliad fel cyfres o argymhellion. Os bydd yn golygu gofyn am ragor o bwerau a alwai am ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol—nid Gorchmynion trosglwyddo swyddogaethau yn unig—mater i Lywodraeth San Steffan ac i wahanol bleidiau fyddai i benderfynu ar eu hagwedd gyda golwg ar yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf yn 2005 neu 2006.

Jocelyn Davies: Byddwch weithiau'n dadlau, Brif Weinidog, y dylem gyfiawnhau pwerau ychwanegol drwy brofi ein hunain â'n pwerau annigonol presennol. A yw eich Llywodraeth fyth yn debyg o ddangos ein bod yn defnyddio'n pwerau cyfredol i'r eithaf, pan ddarganfu ymchwil i sampl ar hap o'n his-ddeddfwriaeth fod 80 y cant ohono bron yn union yr un fath a'r hyn a basiwyd yn San Steffan?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Clywais y cyhuddiadau hyn a godir yn barhaus gan Blaid Cymru ein bod yn creu gormod o ddeddfwriaeth sydd yr un fath yn union â'r hyn wneir yn San Steffan, neu bod San

we should be passing. It is completely untrue. It is just part of the Plaid Cymru psychology—it claims that the Assembly is failing to work when we believe that it is working. We are happy to consider ways in which it can be made to work better, but we do not accept that it is not working. It is part of the Oliver Twist psychology in which Plaid Cymru trades.

Steffan yn pasio deddfwriaeth y dylem ni fod yn ei basio. Nid yw'n wir o gwbl. Rhan o seicoleg Plaid Cymru yn unig yw hyn—haera fod y Cynulliad yn methu â gweithio pan fyddwn ni'n credu ei fod. Yr ydym yn barod i ystyried ffyrdd y gellir ei wneud i weithio'n well, ond nid ydym yn barod i dderbyn nad yw'n gweithio. Mae'n rhan o'r seicoleg Oliver Twist y bydd Plaid Cymru yn ei borthi.

Y Llywydd: Mae cwestiwn 9 (OAQ14602) wedi ei dynnu yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 9 (OAQ14602) has been withdrawn.

Cydlynu Materion Trawsbynciol Co-ordination of Cross-cutting Matters

C10 Cynog Dafis: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar ei rôl fel cydlynnydd materion trawsbynciol o fewn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? (OAQ14601)

Q10 Cynog Dafis: Will the First Minister make a statement on his role as co-ordinator of cross-cutting matters within the National Assembly? (OAQ14601)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r tair thema arweiniol, sef datblygu cynaliadwy, cynhwysedd cymdeithasol a chyfle cyfartal, ar flaen y gad o ran ein polisiau. Mae'r rhain yn mynd ar drywydd materion trawsbynciol eraill, megis iechyd. Yn fy rôl fel cydlynnydd themâu trawsbynciol, byddaf yn sicrhau bod y themâu hyn yn ategu popeth a wnawn er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cyflawni i bobl Cymru. Yr wyf hefyd yn cadeirio is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

The First Minister: The three guiding themes of sustainable development, social inclusion and equality of opportunity, are at the forefront of our policies. These pick up other cross-cutting issues, such as health. In my role as co-ordinator of cross-cutting themes, I will ensure that these themes underpin all we do in order that we deliver for the people of Wales. I also chair the Cabinet sub-committee on sustainable development.

Cynog Dafis: Mewn perthynas â datblygu economaidd, datblygu gwledig a thwristiaeth, a ydych yn ymwybodol o'r perygl i ddyfodol Twristiaeth Canolbarth Cymru, ac efallai rhai o'r sefydliadau twristiaeth eraill, yn sgîl y trawsnewid i'r system newydd? Byddai colli'r cwmni hwn a chwmnïau tebyg yn ddifrifol. A ydych yn fodlon ystyried ymyrryd drwy warantu nifer o gontractau dros gyfnod o tua chwe mis neu flwyddyn tra bo'r cwmni yn ymaddasu i'r amgylchiadau newydd? A rowch ystyriaeth gadarnhaol i'r posibilrwydd hwnnw?

Cynog Dafis: In relation to economic development, rural development and tourism, are you aware of the threat to the future of Mid Wales Tourism, and perhaps some other tourism organisations, following the conversion to the new system? Losing this company and similar ones would be serious. Are you willing to consider intervening by guaranteeing several contracts over a period of about six months or a year while the company adapts to the new circumstances? Will you give serious consideration to that possibility?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf, wrth gwrs, yn fodlon ystyried y posibilrwydd. Yr wyf wedi trafod y mater hwn—nid yr union fater hwnnw, ond y trosglwyddiad o'r hen system i'r system newydd—gyda Phillip Evans, cadeirydd Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, yn ddiweddar. Yr oeddwn ar ddeall fod popeth

The First Minister: I am, of course, willing to consider the possibility. I have discussed this matter—not exactly that matter, but the transfer from the old to the new system—with Phillip Evans, the chairman of the Wales Tourist Board, recently. I understood that everything was going reasonably smoothly,

yn mynd yn weddol llyfn, wrth ystyried y gall unrhyw newid niweidio pobl a chreu dosbarth o enillwyr ac o gollwyr. Byddaf yn trafod y mater unwaith eto â chadeirydd Bwrdd Croeso Cymru.

bearing in mind that any change can come as a blow and can create winners and losers. I will discuss the matter again with the chairman of the Wales Tourist Board.

2.30 p.m.

William Graham: Will you make a statement on your role in co-ordinating the National Assembly Cabinet's response to the quinquennial review of the Ordnance Survey? Do the responses include representations about the effect of the Ordnance Survey's activities on the Welsh economy?

William Graham: A wnewch chi ddatganiad ar eich rôl yn cydlyn ymateb Cabinet y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i adolygiad pum mlynedd yr Arolwg Ordnans? A yw'r ymatebion yn cynnwys sylwadau am effaith gweithgareddau'r Arolwg Ordnans ar economi Cymru?

The First Minister: I am not aware of a direct approach by either party for participation in the Ordnance Survey's quinquennial review. However, I am happy to take up any points that you would like to make about that. I am not aware of any dissatisfaction with the workings of the Ordnance Survey or whether any change is proposed to the Ordnance Survey that might threaten the excellence of its mapping work on our and the Welsh public's behalf. I have always greatly admired the Ordnance Survey's accuracy. It is a phenomenal organisation and the maps produced by it are among the best, if not the best, produced by any equivalent body in the world.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o gais uniongyrchol gan y naill barti na'r llall i gael rhan yn adolygiad pum mlynedd yr Arolwg Ordnans. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn fodlon delio ag unrhyw bwyntiau y carech eu rhoi ynglŷn â hynny. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw anfodlonrwydd gyda gweithrediad yr Arolwg Ordnans na bod unrhyw newid yn cael ei gynnig i'r Arolwg Ordnans a allai fygwth rhagoriaeth ei waith mapio ar ein rhan ni ac ar ran pobl Cymru. Yr wyf bob amser wedi edmygu cywirdeb yr Arolwg Ordnans. Mae'n sefydliad cwbl arbennig ac mae'r mapiau a gynhyrchir ganddo ymhlith y gorau, os nad y gorau, a gynhyrchir gan unrhyw gorff cyfatebol yn y byd.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Mae'r berthynas rhwng iechyd ac allgáu cymdeithasol yn fater trawsbynciol. A ydych yn cydnabod, o ran iechyd, bod eich ymgais i wireddu un o'r prif addewidion yn eich maniffesto ar gyfer y Cynulliad wedi bod yn fethiant llwyr hyd yn hyn? Fe'ch atgoffaf i chi ddweud na fyddai'n rhaid i neb aros mwy na chwe mis am driniaeth allanol. Heddiw, mae dros 60,000 o bobl yn disgwyl am driniaeth o'r fath. Dywedasoch na fyddai neb, erbyn 2003, yn gorfod disgwyl 18 mis am driniaeth mewn ysbyty. Mae dros 4,000 o bobl yn disgwyl am driniaeth o'r fath heddiw. A allwch roi eich llaw ar eich calon a dweud y byddwch wedi cyflawni'r addewid a wnaethoch yn 1999 erbyn etholiad 2003?

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): The relationship between health and social exclusion is a cross-cutting matter. Do you accept, with regard to health, that your efforts to fulfil one of the main pledges in your Assembly manifesto have been an utter failure thus far? I remind you that you said that no-one would have to wait more than six months for outpatient treatment. Today, over 60,000 people are waiting for such treatment. You said that by 2003 no-one would have to wait 18 months for hospital treatment. Over 4,000 people are waiting for such treatment today. Can you put your hand on your heart and say that you will have fulfilled the pledges that you made in 1999 by the 2003 election?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dyna'r nod. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n bosibl rhagweld yn union

The First Minister: That is the aim. However, it is impossible to foresee exactly

yr hyn a fydd wedi digwydd erbyn diwedd y 18 mis hynny. Yr ydym yn gobeithio cyflawni'r nod hwnnw. Yr ydym yn ceisio cyflawni pob addewid a wnaethom yn y manifesto. Mae wedi cymryd mwy o amser nag y gallai unrhyw un fod wedi ei ragweld i bwmpio'r arian i mewn i un pen o'r system a chael yr hyn yr oeddem am ei gael o'r pen arall. Mae rhai materion yn amlwg. Mae'n cymryd 10 mlynedd i hyfforddi ymgynghorydd meddygol a phedair blynedd i baratoi nyrs gydag unrhyw fath o brofiad. Gallwch ragweld yr ochr honno o'r sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, ni ellid rhagweld y gofynion ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Gan fod gofynion yn parhau i gynyddu mae'n anodd gweld sut y gall y rhestrau aros ostwng mor gyflym ag yr oeddem yn ei ddisgwyl.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Fe'ch atgoffaf nad nod oedd yn eich manifesto ond addewid. O ganlyniad, a ydych yn derbyn mai camgymeriad oedd gwneud yr addewid hwnnw? Yn eich sylwadau yn ddiweddar i Seflydliad Bevan, bu i chi gydnabod y byddai effaith gwasgfa fformiwla Barnett yn ei gwneud yn anodd i Gymru gael yr un cynnydd mewn gwariant ar iechyd â Lloegr. Yn ôl *The Western Mail*, mae Uned Gyfansoddiad Coleg Prifysgol Llundain wedi disgrifio setliad Barnett fel:

'one of the worst settlements in the industrial world because it takes no account of Welsh needs'.

A ydych yn barod yn awr felly i ddatgan bod setliad Barnett yn fargen wael i Gymru? A wnewch chi ddweud, yn etholiad 2003, eich bod am gael fformiwla sy'n ystyried anghenion Cymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Y mae'r fformiwla yn ystyried anghenion Cymru yn yr ystyr bod y fantais oedd gennym yn 1978 yn parhau i fodoli. Fodd bynnag, po fwyaf o arian a roddir gan Gordon Brown i'r sector cyhoeddus, mwyaf y bydd hynny'n gwasgu ar Gymru. Nid yw'n gwneud niwed; mae'n dda derbyn yr arian hwnnw. Mae'n well derbyn y £50 miliwn ychwanegol annisgwyl ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf na pheidio â'i dderbyn. Mae hynny'n gwneud lles i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, mae bodolaeth fformiwla Barnett yn golygu bod yr arian yn gwneud mwy o les i Loegr. Dyna'r broblem. Mae'n

what will have happened by the end of this 18-month period. We hope to achieve that aim. We are trying to deliver on every pledge made in the manifesto. It has taken longer than anyone could have foreseen to pump the money into one end of the system and to get the desired outcome at the other. Some issues are obvious. It takes 10 years to train a medical consultant and four years to train a nurse with any sort of experience. You can foresee those issues. However, the demands placed on the national health service could not have been foreseen. As the demands continue to increase it is difficult to see how the waiting lists can fall as quickly as we had expected.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I remind you that it was not an aim, but a pledge in your manifesto. As a result, do you accept that it was a mistake to make that pledge? In your recent remarks to the Bevan Foundation, you acknowledged that pressures caused by the Barnett formula would make it difficult for Wales to achieve the same increase in health spending as England. According to *The Western Mail*, University College London's Constitution Unit has described the Barnett settlement as:

Are you now prepared, therefore, to state that the Barnett settlement is a bad deal for Wales? Will you say, in the 2003 election, that you want a formula that takes Wales's needs into account?

The First Minister: The formula takes Wales's needs into account in the sense that the advantage we had in 1978 still exists. However, the more money Gordon Brown gives to the public sector, the more pressure it puts on Wales. It does not do harm; we benefit from that money. It is better to receive an unexpected £50 million for next year than not to do so. That benefits Wales. However, the existence of the Barnett formula means that the money benefits England more. That is the problem. It is still better to get the additional money than to go without. However, that places more pressure

dal yn well cael yr arian ychwanegol na pheidio â'i gael. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n gwasgu mwy ar fformiwla Barnett. Yr ydym yn gwybod hynny ers 1978.

on the Barnett formula. We have known that since 1978.

Ad-drefnu'r Cabinet Reorganisation of the Cabinet

Q11 Pauline Jarman: Will the First Minister comment on any plans he has to reorganise his Cabinet? (OAQ14613)

C11 Pauline Jarman: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar unrhyw gynlluniau sydd ganddo i ad-drefnu ei Gabinet? (OAQ14613)

The First Minister: I have no plans to reorganise my Cabinet, and therefore I have no comment.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid oes gennyf gynlluniau i ad-drefnu fy Nghabinet, ac felly nid oes gennyf sylw i'w wneud.

Pauline Jarman: You recall that Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales last year asked you to appoint a Minister for the Valleys to shadow the brilliant work of Geraint Davies AM as the Valleys spokesperson for Plaid Cymru. In view of the revolt of Labour Assembly Members and Ministers in publishing 'Valleys First', will you now consider appointing a Minister for the Valleys?

Pauline Jarman: Fe gofiwch i Blaid Cymru—The Party of Wales ofyn y llynedd ichi benodi Gweinidog i'r Cymoedd i gysgodi gwaith gwyh Geraint Davies AC fel llefarydd Plaid Cymru dros y Cymoedd. O gofio gwrthryfel Aelodau a Gweinidogion Llafur y Cynulliad wrth gyhoeddi 'Y Cymoedd yn Gyntaf', a wnewch chi nawr ystyried penodi Gweinidog i'r Cymoedd?

The First Minister: I am not sure that shadowing a shadow is a full-time job. I am a great admirer of Geraint; he is a valued Member of the Assembly, but that does not mean that he should have a Cabinet Minister to trail after him.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn siŵr fod cysgodi cysgod yn waith amser llawn. Yr wyf yn edmygu Geraint yn fawr; mae'n Aelod gwerthfawr o'r Cynulliad, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu y dylai gael Gweinidog Cabinet i'w ddilyn.

Nick Bourne: I am relieved that you have not sought to take on that title yourself, to add to all your other jobs. I also compliment Geraint, and we have been happy to support his campaign.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n rhyddhad i mi nad ydych wedi ceisio meddiannu'r teitl hwnnw eich hunan, i ychwanegu at eich holl swyddi eraill. Talaf innau hefyd deyrnged i Geraint, ac yr ydym wedi bod yn falch o gefnogi ei ymgyrch.

This week, Alcan has announced further job losses, which means that there are job losses in north and south Wales; NTL has announced job losses; Airbus has projected job losses; manufacturing—as you have admitted—is in recession; the national economic development strategy document is late, not to mention in tatters. The much criticised Objective 1 implementation is, at the very least, off to a slow start and floundering, and the private sector—in particular small and medium-sized businesses—is not properly involved. It is too

Yr wythnos hon, cyhoeddodd Alcan ddiswyddiadau pellach, sy'n golygu fod swyddi'n diflannu yn y gogledd a'r de; cyhoeddodd NTL ddiswyddiadau; mae Airbus yn rhagweld colli swyddi; mae gweithgynhyrchu—fel y bu i chi gyfaddef—mewn dirwasgiad; mae'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol yn hwyr, heb sôn am fod yn yfflon. Mae gweithrediad Amcan 1 a feirniadwyd yn fawr, a dweud y lleiaf, wedi cael dechrau araf ac mewn anrhefn, ac nid oes lle priodol i'r sector preifat—yn enwedig busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Mae'n

bureaucratic. Is it not time that we had a full-time Minister for Economic Development—but not the person who has vacated the position—to take care of these issues to allow you to concentrate on what you should be doing properly?

In relation to that, I ask the question asked two weeks ago, and reiterated last week, why is there not a target for cancer care in 'Plan for Wales 2001'? I have still received no response.

The First Minister: You are jumping from one topic to another in a difficult way. I am not sure how you have set your priorities in those questions. I will write to you on the cancer care issue. I understood that you had an answer on that, but I will ensure that you are sent a reply.

On Objective 1, that is the first time in a long time that I have heard mention of it floundering, now that some £275 million has been allocated, which, including match funds, means that £550 million has been allocated for Objective 1 projects.

On the national economic development strategy document being late, that was not caused by the administration, but because the consultees wanted a longer period of consultation. Perhaps you should take note of today's *South Wales Echo*, in which I understand that the Confederation of British Industry in Wales and Chamber Wales say that they do not consider the fact that the First Minister also holds the economic development portfolio to be a problem. Usually, members of your party take notice of what people in business say.

Nick Bourne: The *South Wales Echo* was not in Brussels with you last week, but I was, when we discussed Objective 1. We were told by Ronnie Hall, Chef de Cabinet, that if structural funds plans were not in place in 2002, it was unlikely that the money would be spent by 2006 on an even spread. He also raised the question of why, of all the regions in Europe, Wales, almost uniquely, had not submitted a document indicating what would happen after 2006. You, First Minister, had to ask him whether we had submitted the

rhy fiwrocataidd. Onid yw'n bryd i ni gael Gweinidog amser llawn dros Ddatblygu Economaidd—ond nid y person sydd wedi gadael y swydd—i ofalu am y materion hyn i ganiatáu i chi ganolbwyntio'n llawn ar yr hyn y dylech fod yn ei wneud yn iawn?

O ran hynny, gofynnaf y cwestiwn a ofynnwyd bythefnos yn ôl, a'i ailadrodd yr wythnos diwethaf, pam nad oes targed i ofal canser yn 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'? Yr wyf yn dal i aros am ateb.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydych yn neidio o un pwnc i'r llall mewn ffordd anodd. Nid wyf yn siŵr sut y gwnaethoch osod eich blaenoriaethau gyda'r cwestiynau hynny. Ysgrifennaf atoch ar bwnc gofal canser. Yr oeddwn wedi deall eich bod wedi derbyn ateb ar hynny, ond gwnaf yn siŵr y cewch ateb.

O ran Amcan 1, dyma'r tro cyntaf ers amser hir imi glywed ei fod mewn anrhefn, gan fod rhyw £275 miliwn bellach wedi ei roi iddo, sy'n golygu, wrth gynnwys arian cyfatebol, fod £550 miliwn wedi ei ddosrannu ar gyfer prosiectau Amcan 1.

Ar fater bod y ddogfen strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol yn hwyr, nid achoswyd hynny gan y weinyddiaeth, ond oherwydd bod y rhai yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy am gael mwy o gyfnod ymgynghori. Efallai y dylech nodi'r hyn sydd yn y *South Wales Echo* heddiw, lle gwelir, yn ôl a ddeallaf i, Gyddfederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yng Nghymru a Siambr Cymru yn datgan nad ydynt yn ystyried bod y ffaith fod y Prif Weinidog hefyd yn dal portffolio datblygu economaidd yn broblem. Fel rheol, bydd aelodau eich plaid yn sylwi ar yr hyn a ddywedir gan bobl fusnes.

Nick Bourne: Nid oedd y *South Wales Echo* gyda chi ym Mrwsel yr wythnos diwethaf, ond yr oeddwn i, pan drafodwyd Amcan 1 gennym. Dywedwyd wrthym gan Ronnie Hall, y Chef de Cabinet, oni fydd cynlluniau'r arian strwythurol wedi eu sefydlu erbyn 2002, ei bod yn annhebygol y byddai'r arian wedi ei wario erbyn 2006 ac yn gyson dros y cyfnod. Hefyd holodd y cwestiwn pam, o holl ranbarthau Ewrop, bron yn unigryw, nad oedd Cymru wedi cyflwyno dogfen yn dangos beth a ddigwyddai ar ôl

document; you did not even know. Is that not an example of your falling down in your duty as Minister for Economic Development? It was serious and embarrassing that you had to ask whether you had submitted a document and were told that you had not, and that it was now too late. It was only after I made a plea that we were told the document could be submitted provided it arrived before Christmas. I hope that you are on top of matters now, as you clearly were not last week.

The First Minister: I sympathise with your feeling embarrassed, Nick. I realise how difficult that must be for you socially. Anyone who tries to claim that Wales is behind the game in Objective 1 should examine the figures of commitment and expenditure compared with the three Objective 1 regions in England. That includes a region that had previously held Objective 1 status, and already had systems up and running. There was no criticism from Ronnie Hall, Chef de Cabinet to Michel Barnier, and I am sure that you will recall—although you chose not to mention it—that this was an excellent occasion in which Michel Barnier and I were able to co-sign the urban programme for the west Wrexham area. I will ensure that you get a reply on the document to which you referred, and I hope that that will meet your need not to be embarrassed over Christmas, Nick.

2.40 p.m.

‘Cynllun i Gymru 2001’ (Ewrop) ‘Plan for Wales 2001’ (Europe)

Q12 Nick Bourne: In setting out the Welsh Assembly Government’s policies in the ‘Plan for Wales 2001’, to what extent did the First Minister consider how other countries in Europe do things? (OAQ14617)

The First Minister: I am pleased that you have latched onto the new title of the Welsh Assembly Government so quickly, Nick, as I understood that you were still wedded to

2006. Bu’n rhaid i chi Brif Weinidog, ofyn iddo a oeddem wedi cyflwyno’r ddogfen; nid oeddech yn gwybod hyd yn oed. Onid yw hynny’n enghraifft ohonoch yn methu yn eich dyletswydd fel Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd? Yr oedd yn ddifrifol ac yn embaras eich bod yn gorfod holi a oeddech wedi cyflwyno dogfen ac yna gael gwybod nad oeddech wedi gwneud, a’i bod bellach yn rhy hwyr. Dim ond ar ôl i mi roi plê y dywedwyd wrthym y gallai’r ddogfen gael ei chyflwyno cyhyd â’i bod yn cyrraedd cyn y Nadolig. Gobeithiaf eich bod yn ymdopi â phethau yn awr, gan ei bod yn amlwg nad oeddech yr wythnos diwethaf.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cydymdeimlaf â chi Nick gan eich bod wedi teimlo embaras. Sylweddolaf pa mor anodd oedd hynny i chi’n gymdeithasol. Dylai unrhyw un sy’n ceisio haeru fod Cymru ar ei hôl hi o ran Amcan 1 astudio’r ffigurau clustnodi a gwariant o’u cymharu â’r tri rhanbarth Amcan 1 yn Lloegr. Mae hynny’n cynnwys rhanbarth a oedd yn flaenorol wedi dal statws Amcan 1 lle yr oedd systemau eisoes yn barod ac yn gweithredu. Ni chafwyd beirniadaeth gan Ronnie Hall, Chef de Cabinet Michel Barnier, ac yr wyf yn credu y cofiwch—er ichi ddewis peidio â sôn amdano—fod hwn yn ddigwyddiad ardderchog pryd y llwyddodd Michel Barnier a minnau i gydarwyddo rhaglen drefol ar gyfer ardal gorllewin Wrecsam. Gwnaf yn siŵr eich bod yn cael ateb ynglŷn â’r ddogfen y cyfeiriasoch ati, a gobeithiaf y gwnaiff hynny, Nick, eich bodloni’n ddigonol i’ch achub rhag teimlo embaras dros y Nadolig.

C12 Nick Bourne: Wrth amlinellu polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ‘Cynllun i Gymru 2001’, pa ystyriaeth a roddodd Prif Weinidog Cymru i’r modd y gwneir pethau mewn gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop? (OAQ14617)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cydio yn nheitl newydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru mor gyflym Nick, gan fy mod yn deall eich bod yn

using the term 'Government of Wales'. I will try to help you on that issue, as on many others. European best practice has influenced our work in several areas, including ICT and spatial planning. I am pleased that our work on sustainable development and health impact assessments is providing examples of good practice for our European colleagues. This is obviously a two-way process.

Nick Bourne: I referred to the WAG as the Table Office insisted that I did so.

With regard to Europe, would you agree that we have a lot to learn from the way national health services operate overseas? Would you not welcome initiatives that take account of how private and public service can work together for the better health of all, and have we not a lot to learn from other European countries in that respect?

The Presiding Officer: Order. Before the First Minister answers that question, I make it clear that the Table Office would not have insisted that you use Welsh Assembly Government.

The First Minister: More embarrassment, then.

I realise that this is a sore point for you, Nick, because Iain Duncan Smith cancelled a meeting with you because he wanted to visit a hospital in Sweden to see how they did things there. There are aspects from which we can learn. We never have closed minds in the way that we run the national health service. Most other countries have the defect that patients have to pay up-front and reclaim the money, for which there is a huge amount of paperwork. I have always been an admirer of Scandinavian health service systems, but most have that problem. Unless you are on a means-tested or unemployed basis, you must pay up-front, before going to your mutual insurance company to claim the money back. You do get the money back, but the glory of the British system is that you do not have to pay at all, with the occasional exception of prescriptions and so forth.

parhau'n ffyddlon i'r arfer o ddefnyddio 'Llywodraeth Cymru'. Ceisiaf eich helpu yn y mater hwnnw, fel â llawer mater arall yn wir. Mae'r arfer gorau Ewropeaidd wedi dylanwadu ar ein gwaith mewn sawl maes, yn cynnwys TGCh a chynllunio gofodol. Yr wyf yn falch o nodi bod ein gwaith ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac asesiadau effaith ar iechyd yn enghreifftiau o arfer da i'n cyfeillion yn Ewrop. Mae hon yn amlwg yn broses ddwy-ffordd.

Nick Bourne: Cyfeiriais at WAG oherwydd i'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno fynnu imi wneud hynny.

Gyda golwg ar Ewrop, a gytunwch fod gennym lawer i'w ddysgu gan y dull y mae'r gwasanaethau iechyd gwladol yn gweithredu dramor? Oni fydddech yn croesawu mentrau sy'n gweld sut y gall gwasanaeth preifat a chyhoeddus weithio ar y cyd i roi iechyd gwell i bawb, ac onid oes gennym lawer i'w ddysgu gan wledydd Ewropeaidd yn hynny o beth?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cyn i'r Prif Weinidog ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw, hoffwn egluro na fyddai'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno wedi mynnu eich bod yn defnyddio Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dyna ragor o embaras.

Sylweddolaf fod hyn yn anodd i chi, Nick, gan i Iain Duncan Smith ganslo cyfarfod gyda chi oherwydd ei fod am ymweld ag ysbyty yn Sweden i weld sut y maent yn gwneud pethau yno. Y mae agweddau y gallwn ni ddysgu ganddynt. Nid ydym fyth yn cau'n meddwl ynglŷn â gweithredu ein gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Mae gan y rhan fwyaf o wledydd eraill y diffyg fod cleifion yn gorfod talu ymlaen llaw a hawlio'r arian yn ôl, sy'n golygu llawer o waith papur. Bûm yn edmygydd o systemau gwasanaeth iechyd gwledydd Llychlyn erioed ond y mae'r broblem honno gan y rhan fwyaf ohonynt. Os nad ydych yn derbyn prawf modd neu'n ddi-waith, rhaid i chi dalu ymlaen llaw cyn mynd at eich cwmni yswiriant cydfuddiannol i hawlio'ch arian yn ôl. Cewch eich arian yn ôl, ond gogoniant y system Brydeinig yw nad oes rhaid ichi dalu o gwbl, ac eithrio rhai

achosion megis presgripsiynau ac yn y blaen.

Phil Williams: Many small European countries have moved from poverty to prosperity, and a common feature in many—if not most—is that they followed the pattern set by Sweden in Saltsjöbaden in 1938, where the Government, industry and trade unions met to prepare an agreed economic strategy. As this seems to be a significant, if not prerequisite, ingredient of success, why has the Assembly Government rejected the idea of an economic policy board?

Phil Williams: Symudodd llawer o wledydd bach Ewrop o dlodi i ffyniant, a nodwedd sy'n gyffredin i lawer ohonynt—os nad y mwyafrif—yw eu bod yn dilyn y patrwm a osodwyd gan Sweden yn Saltsjöbaden yn 1938, lle cyfarfu'r Llywodraeth, diwydiant a'r undebau llafur i baratoi strategaeth economaidd gytûn. Gan fod hyn yn ymddangos yn rhan arwyddocaol, os nad yn amod, llwyddiant, pam bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwrthod y syniad o fwrdd polisi economaidd?

The First Minister: I am not familiar with the 1938 Swedish meeting to which you referred. I do not doubt that it took place. Being neutral during the Second World War was also probably of great assistance to Sweden in increasing its prosperity. The example that we tend to consider is the Irish Republic, simply because it is next door to us, and it was a basket case until about 1992. It was hugely in debt and getting nowhere, and now it is flying. In 2000, it had a growth rate of 11.5 per cent; this year it will probably be 6 per cent, which it considers a bad performance—here, it would be considered wonderful; then 4 per cent next year, and probably back up to 7 or 8 per cent after that. Given that it is our next door neighbour, and as it had Objective 1 funding in the early 1990s, we tend to think of what we can learn from the Irish experience. We cannot do everything that Ireland did because the whole of Ireland had Objective 1, compared with only two thirds of Wales. However, if we could do half of what Ireland did over the first decade of this century, as First Minister, I would feel proud.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â chyfarfod 1938 Sweden y cyfeiriwch ato. Nid wyf yn amau iddo ddigwydd. Bu bod yn niwtral yn ystod yr Ail Ryfel Byd hefyd, yn fwy na thebyg, o gymorth mawr i Sweden i gynyddu ei ffyniant. Yr enghraifft y tueddwn ni ei hystyried yw un Gweriniaeth Iwerddon, yn syml oherwydd ei bod drws nesaf inni, a'i bod yn gwbl ddiffygiol tan tua 1992. Yr oedd yn drwm mewn dyled a heb wneud cynnydd o gwbl, ond yn awr mae'n hedfan. Yn 2002, yr oedd ganddi raddfa twf o 11.5 y cant; eleni bydd fwy na thebyg yn 6 y cant, perfformiad gwael yn ei thyb—i ni byddai hynny'n wych; yna 4 y cant y flwyddyn nesaf, ac yn fwy na thebyg wedi hynny yn ôl i 7 neu 8 y cant. O gofio'i bod drws nesaf inni ac iddi gael arian Amcan 1 yn y 1990au cynnar, tueddwn i feddwl beth y gallwn ni ddysgu gan brofiad Iwerddon. Ni allwn wneud popeth a wnaeth Iwerddon oherwydd cafodd Iwerddon gyfan statws Amcan 1 o gymharu â dwy ran o dair o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, pe gallem wneud hanner yr hyn a wnaeth Iwerddon, yn ystod degawd cyntaf y ganrif hon, byddwn, fel Prif Weinidog, yn teimlo'n falch iawn.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): Before I turn to the business for the next three weeks, I inform Members that this week's business is as programmed, with the exception of a statement on Thursday on the public-private partnerships and the private finance initiative by the Minister for Finance, Local

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cyn imi droi at y busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf, hysbysaf yr Aelodau fod busnes yr wythnos hon yn unol â'r hyn a raglennwyd, ac eithrio datganiad ddydd Iau ar y partneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat a'r fenter cyllid preifat gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, Edwina Hart.

Government and Communities, Edwina Hart.

Following discussion in this morning's Business Committee, the business for the next three weeks is shown on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. There are some additions, of which I informed the business managers this morning. Members will wish to be aware that at this morning's Business Committee meeting, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined that, under Standing Order No. 22.5, the Education (School Day and School Year) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002 need not be referred to a Subject Committee. I will arrange to post a copy of the business statement to the intranet and internet.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments on the business statement?

Helen Mary Jones: Will the Minister for Assembly Business schedule a debate, as soon as possible in the next Assembly term, on the implications for ethnic minority citizens in Wales of the Home Secretary's remarks about immigrants needing to, and I quote, 'conform to British norms of acceptability'? What these norms are, in his view, is unclear. I do not know whether he thinks that wearing a headscarf, as many Muslim women do, is conforming. I wonder whether he thinks that speaking Welsh conforms. Concern has been expressed following the Home Secretary's remarks. I am sure that I am not the only Member who has received representations from people from ethnic minority communities. The Assembly needs an opportunity to set to rest some of the concerns in Wales, and to reinforce its belief that maintaining one's own faith, language and culture is entirely compatible with full citizenship of Wales.

Alun Pugh: Statements are important, and I, as well as people living along the north Wales coast, would like to hear a statement on the Sellafield plant. As he said on 27 November, statements are not very important to the leader of Plaid Cymru. Will you give us a breakdown of business and comment on the balance of Government statements and

Yn dilyn trafodaeth yn y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, nodir y busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf ar we'r Siambr o dan dogfennau ategol. Ceir rhai ychwanegiadau, yr hysbysais y rheolwyr busnes amdanynt y bore yma. Bydd yr Aelodau hefyd am fod yn ymwybodol i'r Dirprwy Lywydd, yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, benderfynu, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, na fyddai angen cyfeirio Rheoliadau Addysg (Diwrnod Ysgol a Blwyddyn Ysgol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002 i Bwyllgor Pwnc. Trefnaf i gopi o'r datganiad busnes gael ei osod ar y fewnwyd a'r rhyngwyd.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes?

Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Trefnydd drefnu dadl, cyn gynted â phosibl yn nhymor nesaf y Cynulliad, ar oblygiadau sylwadau'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref bod angen i fewnfudwyr, a dyfynaf '*conform to British norms of acceptability*', i ddinasyddion o leiafrifoedd ethnig yng Nghymru? Nid yw union gynnwys y normau hyn, yn ei farn ef, yn eglur. Ni wn a gred fod gwisgo penwisg, fel y gwna lawer o ferched Moslemaidd, yn cydymffurfio. Tybed a yw o'r farn bod siarad Cymraeg yn cydymffurfio. Mynegwyd pryder yn dilyn sylwadau'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad fi yw'r unig Aelod sydd wedi derbyn sylwadau gan bobl o gymunedau lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Mae angen cyfle ar y Cynulliad i dawelu rhai o'r pryderon yng Nghymru, ac i atgyfnerthu ei gred bod cynnal ffydd, iaith a diwylliant personol yn gwbl gydnaws â dinasyddiaeth lawn yng Nghymru.

Alun Pugh: Mae datganiadau yn bwysig, ac fe hoffwn i, ynghyd â'r bobl sy'n byw ar hyd arfordir gogledd Cymru, glywed datganiad ar safle Sellafield. Fel y dywedodd ar 27 Tachwedd, nid yw datganiadau yn bwysig iawn i arweinydd Plaid Cymru. A roddwch ddadansoddiad inni o'r busnes a gwneud sylw ar y cydbwysedd rhwng datganiadau a

motions?

David Melding: Following the House Committee's recommendation that no further action be taken on the publication of Members' allowances, will you allocate time for my no named day motion to allow Plenary to make a decision on this important matter of public concern, as to whether the Assembly as a whole publishes these allowances? Given recent developments in Parliament and the statement by the chairman of the Public Accounts Committee that it publishes allowances, surely we do not want to be in the slow lane and the last institution in Britain to make this information public as a matter of routine.

Andrew Davies: That is a matter for the House Committee, David. If that Committee, and other Members, feel that it is appropriate, I will consider requests made.

On Helen Mary's points, as I have always said, if Members make requests for debates I will discuss the matter with the appropriate Minister and return to the Assembly with a response.

That is what I have done in terms of Alun Pugh's question. Alun will know that I have scheduled a statement by my ministerial colleague, Jane Hutt, on the health implications of Sellafeld, for the first Plenary session following the Christmas recess.

It would be helpful if I put on record a fuller response to Ieuan Wyn Jones's question of 27 November. At that time, I refuted allegations that Plenary business was being misused and that too much time was taken up by Cabinet statements. It would be helpful for Members to receive a broader explanation of how business is handled and time allocated. From 14 October to 6 December, the Assembly spent 55.5 hours in Plenary session. Taking away the time spent on oral Assembly questions and short debates—which is allocated in Standing Orders—a total of 37.5 hours has been available for other Plenary business. Only eight hours was spent on oral Cabinet statements, which is 27 per cent of debating time, not 40 per cent as Ieuan Wyn Jones stated on 27 November. Members

chynigion y Llywodraeth?

David Melding: Yn dilyn argymhelliad Pwyllgor y Tŷ na ddylid gweithredu ymhellach ar gyhoeddi lwfansau'r Aelodau, a wnewch neilltuo amser i'm cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod er mwyn caniatáu i'r Cyfarfod Llawn wneud penderfyniad ar y mater pwysig hwn o bryder i'r cyhoedd, o ran a yw'r Cynulliad yn cyhoeddi'r lwfansau hyn? O gofio'r datblygiadau diweddar yn y Senedd a'r datganiad gan gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus ei fod yn cyhoeddi lwfansau, does bosibl ein bod am fod ar ei hôl hi a'r sefydliad olaf ym Mhrydain i gyhoeddi'r wybodaeth hon fel mater o arfer.

Andrew Davies: Mater i Bwyllgor y Tŷ yw hwnnw, David. Os bydd y Pwyllgor hwnnw, ac Aelodau eraill, yn teimlo ei bod yn briodol, ystyriaaf unrhyw geisiadau a wneir.

O ran pwyntiau Helen Mary, fel y dywedais erioed, os bydd yr Aelodau yn gwneud ceisiadau am ddadleuon trafodaf y mater gyda'r Gweinidog priodol gan ddychwelyd i'r Cynulliad gydag ymateb.

Dyna a wneuthum o ran cwestiwn Alun Pugh. Gŵyr Alun fy mod wedi amserlennu datganiad gan fy nghyd-Aelod gweinidogol, Jane Hutt, ar oblygiadau iechyd Sellafeld, ar gyfer y Cyfarfod Llawn cyntaf yn dilyn toriad y Nadolig.

Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe cofnodwn ymateb mwy cyflawn i gwestiwn Ieuan Wyn Jones ar 27 Tachwedd. Bryd hynny, gwrthbrofais yr honiadau bod busnes y Cyfarfod Llawn yn cael ei gamddefnyddio a bod gormod o amser yn cael ei neilltuo i ddatganiadau Cabinet. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol i'r Aelodau gael esboniad llawnach o'r ffordd y caiff busnes ei drin ac y caiff amser ei neilltuo. O 14 Hydref hyd at 6 Rhagfyr, treuliodd y Cynulliad 55.5 o oriau mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn. O dynnu'r amser a dreuliwyd ar gwestiynau llafar gan y Cynulliad a dadleuon byr—a neilltuir o fewn y Rheolau Sefydlog—bu cyfanswm o 37.5 o oriau ar gael ar gyfer materion eraill o fewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn. Dim ond wyth awr a dreuliwyd ar ddatganiadau llafar gan y Cabinet, sef 27 y cant o'r amser dadlau, nid

should also be aware that the Business Committee agreed in 1999 that oral statements on important issues should be made to Plenary and not elsewhere. This is an issue taken up by the House of Commons. We have accorded to the principle that statements should be made in the Chamber, which has allowed 104 speakers, mostly, but not exclusively, from opposition parties, to scrutinise and speak about the issue under discussion, and question Ministers.

We have spent 14 hours on major debates—which is almost 40 per cent of available Plenary time—to discuss major items such as the approval of the budget; the Queen's Speech; NHS structures; the homelessness strategy; and quinquennial reviews, because we believe in holding Assembly sponsored public bodies to scrutiny. We have considered and approved 28 items of legislation, of which 14 were debated in Plenary. Transfer of functions, delegation of powers and special grant reports are also discussed in Plenary. During this term we have considered and approved 10 of these important items, which have given the Assembly additional responsibilities and powers and provided grants to organisations that need them.

Members should pay particular attention to the fact that over 2.25 hours were spent on points of order in 16 Plenary Sessions. Many of those points of order, as indicated by the Presiding Officer and the Deputy Presiding Officer, were not matters for this Chamber or the Assembly. Members should also be aware that the remaining time was taken up with items that I am required to bring forward under Standing Orders, such as the business statement, Plaid Cymru and Conservative minority party debates—of which there have been four this year—periodic timetable statements and elections to Committees and partnership councils. I refute absolutely any allegation that Plenary business is being misused. We have more than adequate time in which to hold debates.

40 y cant fel y dywedodd Ieuan Wyn Jones ar 27 Tachwedd. Dylai'r Aelodau hefyd fod yn ymwybodol bod y Pwyllgor Busnes wedi cytuno yn 1999 y dylid cyflwyno datganiadau llafar ar faterion pwysig i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ac nid unrhyw le arall. Mae hwn yn fater a drafodwyd yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Gweithredwyd yn unol â'r egwyddor y dylid cyflwyno datganiadau yn y Siambr, sydd wedi rhoi cyfle i 104 o siaradwyr, o'r gwrthbleidiau yn bennaf, ond nid yn llwyr, i graffu a siarad am y pwnc o dan drafodaeth, ac i holi'r Gweinidogion.

Yr ydym wedi treulio 14 awr ar ddadleuon mawr—sydd yn gyfwerth ag ymron i 40 y cant o'r amser sydd ar gael mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn—i drafod eitemau pwysig fel cymeradwyo'r gyllideb; Araith y Frenhines; strwythurau'r NHS; y strategaeth digartrefedd; ac adolygiadau pum mlynedd, gan ein bod o'r farn y dylid archwilio cyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad yn graff. Yr ydym wedi ystyried a chymeradwyo 28 o eitemau o ddeddfwriaeth, gan ddadlau 14 ohonynt mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn. Trafodir trosglwyddo swyddogaethau, dirprwyo pwerau ac adroddiadau grantiau arbennig hefyd mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn. Yn ystod y tymor hwn yr ydym wedi ystyried a chymeradwyo 10 o'r eitemau pwysig hyn, gan roi cyfrifoldebau a phwerau ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad a darparu grantiau i sefydliadau ag arnynt eu hangen.

Dylai'r Aelodau roi sylw arbennig i'r ffaith y treuliwyd dros 2.25 awr ar bwyntiau o drefn mewn 16 Cyfarfod Llawn. Nid oedd llawer o'r pwyntiau o drefn hynny, fel y nodwyd gan y Llywydd a'r Dirprwy Lywydd, yn faterion i'r Siambr hon na'r Cynulliad. Dylai'r Aelodau hefyd fod yn ymwybodol y defnyddiwyd yr amser a oedd yn weddill ar eitemau y mae'n ofynnol imi eu cyflwyno o dan Reolau Sefydlog, megis y datganiad busnes, dadleuon plaid leiafrifol Plaid Cymru a'r Ceidwadwyr—y cynhaliwyd pedair ohonynt eleni—datganiadau amserlen rheolaidd ac etholiadau i Bwyllgorau a chynghorau partneriaeth. Gwrthodaf yn llwyr unrhyw honiad bod busnes y Cyfarfodydd Llawn yn cael ei gamddefnyddio. Mae gennym hen ddigon o amser i gynnal dadleuon.

2.50 p.m.

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Point of order. We have heard a lengthy statement from the Minister for Assembly Business and the problem is that we do not have the opportunity to question him on its content. Is it in order for the Minister to use an opportunity, resulting from a planted question, to give a detailed response on which he cannot be questioned by another Member? I suggest that that is an abuse of our system and that he should table a statement on which he could be questioned.

The Presiding Officer: I am not aware of any planting of questions. I encourage questions from all parts of the Assembly at all time, provided that they are in order. The business statement refers to future business. Although I have not had time to check the Record of Proceedings for the day to which the Minister for Assembly Business referred, I will do so. It is my understanding that he replied extensively to a question that he was previously asked.

There is always an opportunity to ask questions or to comment on the business statement. I have always interpreted such opportunities widely. In the new year, I anticipate that the leader of the opposition may wish to return to the material in much the same way as the Minister for Assembly Business produced some historical research for our study today.

Phil Williams: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6.8 relating to statements. Given that the Prime Minister recently announced changes in the Ministerial Code to ensure that major policy changes are first announced to Parliament rather than to the media, are there any plans to change our code to ensure that major policy announcements, such as the final draft of the national economic development strategy, are presented to Members at Plenary or, in this case, the Economic Development Committee, before they are presented to the media?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Pwynt o drefn. Clywsom ddatganiad hir gan y Trefnydd a'r broblem yw na chawn gyfle i'w holi ar ei gynnwys. A yw mewn trefn i'r Gweinidog achub ar gyfle, yn deillio o gwestiwn bwriadol, i roi ymateb manwl na all Aelod arall ei holi yn ei gylch? Awgrymaf fod hyn yn enghraifft o gamddefnyddio ein system ac y dylai gyflwyno datganiad y gellir ei holi yn ei gylch.

Y Llywydd: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw ymgais i ragarfaethu cwestiynau. Anogaf gwestiynau o bob rhan o'r Cynulliad ar bob adeg, ar yr amod eu bod mewn trefn. Mae'r datganiad busnes yn cyfeirio at fusnes ar gyfer y dyfodol. Er na chefais amser i edrych ar y Cofnod ar gyfer y diwrnod y cyfeiriodd y Trefnydd ato, fe wnaif hynny. Yr wyf ar ddeall iddo roi ymateb cynhwysfawr i gwestiwn y gofynnwyd iddo cyn hynny.

Ceir cyfle bob amser i ofyn cwestiynau neu i gyflwyno sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes. Yr wyf bob amser wedi dehongli cyfleoedd o'r fath yn eang. Yn y flwyddyn newydd, rhagwelaf y bydd arweinydd yr wrthblaid, o bosibl, am ddychwelyd at y deunydd yn yr un ffordd, fwy neu lai, ag y cynhyrchodd y Trefnydd rywfaint o ymchwil hanesyddol i'n hastudiaeth heddiw.

Phil Williams: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.8 sy'n ymwneud â datganiadau. O gofio i'r Prif Weinidog gyhoeddi newidiadau yn y Cod Gweinidogol yn ddiweddar i sicrhau y cyhoeddir newidiadau polisi pwysig i'r Senedd yn gyntaf yn hytrach nag i'r cyfryngau, a oes unrhyw gynlluniau i newid ein cod i sicrhau y cyflwynir cyhoeddiadau polisi pwysig, megis drafft terfynol y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, i'r Aelodau mewn Cyfarfod Llawn neu, yn yr achos hwn, i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, cyn eu cyflwyno i'r cyfryngau.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful for prior notice of this point of order, which enabled the Clerk and myself to refresh our memories as to the content of the Ministerial Code and the debate that was held last week. Point 3.1 of the Ministerial Code would, I believe, answer your question.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar imi gael rhybudd ymlaen llaw o'r pwynt o drefn hwn, a roddodd gyfle i'r Clerc a minnau ymgyswrtio eto â chynnwys Cod y Gweinidogion a'r ddadl a gynhaliwyd yr wythnos diwethaf. Credaf y byddai pwynt 3.1 o God y Gweinidogion yn ateb eich cwestiwn.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Ffurflenni a Manylion a Ragnodir) (Diwygiad Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001; Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Diwygiad Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001; a Rheoliadau Grantiau Adleoli (Ffurflenni Cais) (Diwygio Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001

Approval of the Housing Renewal Grants (Prescribed Forms and Particulars) (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001; Housing Renewal Grants (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001; and of the Relocation Grants (Forms of Application) (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Housing Renewal Grants (Prescribed Forms and Particulars) (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 6 November 2001. (NDM887)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Ffurflenni a Manylion a Ragnodir) (Diwygiad Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM887)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Housing Renewal Grants (Prescribed Forms and Particulars) (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Ffurflenni a Manylion a Ragnodir) (Diwygiad Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001; ac

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 6 November 2001 and the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 30 November 2001. (NDM888)

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Tachwedd 2001 a'r memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM888)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Housing Renewal Grants

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu

(Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 6 November 2001. (NDM889)

Tai (Diwygiad Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM889)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Housing Renewal Grants (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Diwygiad Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001; ac

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 6 November 2001. (NDM890)

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM890)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Relocation Grants (Forms of Application) (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 6 November 2001. (NDM891)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Grantiau Adleoli (Ffurflenni Cais) (Diwygio Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM 891)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Relocation Grants (Forms of Application) (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adleoli (Ffurflenni Cais) (Diwygio Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001; ac

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 6 November 2001 and the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 30 November 2001. (NDM892)

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Tachwedd 2001 a'r memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM892)

The regulations are interrelated. The intended effect of the change is to amend the relevant forms and the test of resources associated with housing renovation grants so that trust

Mae'r rheoliadau yn gydberthynol. Effaith arfaethedig y newid yw diwygio'r ffurflenni perthnasol a'r profion adnoddau sy'n gysylltiedig â grantiau adnewyddu tai er

payments, set up by the Department of Health, to those who have contracted Creutzfeldt-Jakob disease and their immediate families are disregarded in the tests of resources for disabled facilities grants or renovation grants. No additional financial implications arise from making these regulations. All the changes to routine statutory instruments that underpin existing policy on private sector renewal are technical. I urge you to support these regulations as they will allow local authorities to disregard trust payments made by the Department of Health to sufferers of human variant CJD from the test of resources. This is a good measure to help the victims of such a terrible disease.

mwyn i daliadau ymddiriedolaeth, a sefydlwyd gan yr Adran Iechyd, i'r rheini sy'n dioddef afiechyd Creutzfeldt-Jakob a'u teuluoedd agos, gael eu diystyru wrth gynnal profion adnoddau ar gyfer grantiau cyfleusterau i'r anabl neu grantiau adnewyddu. Ni chyfyd unrhyw oblygiadau ariannol ychwanegol yn sgîl llunio'r rheoliadau hyn. Mae'r holl newidiadau i offerynnau statudol arferol sy'n sylfaen i'r polisi presennol ar adnewyddu yn y sector preifat yn dechnegol. Erfyniaf arnoch i gefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn gan y byddant yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol i ddiystyru taliadau ymddiriedolaeth a wnaed gan yr Adran Iechyd i bobl sy'n dioddef o amrywiolyn dynol CJD wrth gynnal prawf adnoddau. Mae hwn yn fesur da i helpu dioddefwyr afiechyd mor ofnadwy.

Janet Davies: I welcome these Orders. It is important that they are passed because CJD is a terrible disease that severely affects young people. It is important that every assistance available is provided to them and their carers. It is particularly important in this context, where you could say that the previous Conservative Government was partly responsible for the fact that some people contracted the disease, particularly when you recall John Gummer happily feeding meat to his young child at that time.

Janet Davies: Croesawaf y Gorchmynion hyn. Mae'n bwysig inni eu derbyn gan fod CJD yn afiechyd erchyll sy'n effeithio'n ddifrifol ar lawer o bobl ifanc. Mae'n bwysig darparu'r holl gymorth sydd ar gael iddynt hwy a'u gofalwyr. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig yn y cyd-destun hwn, lle y gallech ddweud mai'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol oedd yn rhannol gyfrifol am y ffaith bod rhai pobl wedi dal yr afiechyd, yn arbennig wrth gofio gweld John Gummer yn gwbl fodlon wrth fwydo cig i'w blentyn ifanc bryd hynny.

The Presiding Officer: I call for a vote on the principle of the Housing Renewal Grants (Prescribed Forms and Particulars) (Amendment No.2) (Wales) Regulations 2001.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais ar egwyddor Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Ffurflenni a Manylion a Ragnodir) (Diwygio Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001.

Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn

Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Presiding Officer: I call for a vote on **Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais ar
the approval of the regulations. gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau.

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael

Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Presiding Officer: I now call for a vote on the principle of the Housing Renewal Grants (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001. **Y Llywydd:** Galwaf yn awr am bleidlais ar egwyddor Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Diwygio Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001.

*Cynnig: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael

Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Presiding Officer: I call for a vote on **Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais ar
the approval of the regulations. gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau.

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Presiding Officer: I call for a vote on the principle of the Relocation Grants (Forms of Application) (Amendment No.2) (Wales) Regulations 2001.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais ar egwyddor Rheoliadau Grantiau Adleoli (Ffurflenni Cais) (Diwygio Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001.

*Cynnig: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine

Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Presiding Officer: I call for a vote on **Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais ar
the approval of the regulations. gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau.

*Cynnig: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane

Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

3.00 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau
 Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 3) (Cymru) 2001
 Approval of the NHS (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (No. 3) (Wales)
 Regulations 2001**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the National Health Service (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (No. 3) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001. (NDM893)

I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the National Health Service (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (No. 3) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 27 November 2001; and

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 3) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM893)

Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 3) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Tachwedd 2001; ac

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001.* (NDM894)

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001.* (NDM894)

These regulations further amend the National Health Service (General Dental Services) Regulations 1992, which regulate the terms by which general dental services are provided under the National Health Service Act 1977. They remove all references to general anaesthesia from the principal regulations, and thereby remove the availability of treatment under general anaesthesia from general dental services with effect from 31 December 2001.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn diwygio ymhellach Reoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) 1992, sy'n rheoleiddio'r amodau y darperir gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol oddi tanynt o dan Ddeddf y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol 1977. Maent yn dileu pob cyfeiriad at anaesthesia cyffredinol o'r prif reoliadau, a thrwy hynny yn dileu argaeledd triniaeth o dan anaesthesia cyffredinol o wasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol o 31 Rhagfyr 2001.

In June, I was pleased that the interim arrangements to regulate the provision of treatment under general anaesthesia in general dental services received all-party support. At that time, I indicated that this was a temporary measure until the end of this year. The regulations debated today will complete the implementation of the main recommendations for general dental services which flow from 'A Conscious Decision', the review of the use of general anaesthesia and conscious sedation in primary dental care. General anaesthesia should only be undertaken when absolutely necessary. From 31 December 2001, general anaesthesia for dental treatment should only take place a hospital settings. Therefore, from 1 January 2002, the administration of general anaesthesia for dental treatment will be confined to hospital settings with facilities for the provision of critical care. Additional funding of £1.5 million has been allocated to Welsh health authorities to commission suitable alternative provision where necessary.

Ym mis Mehefin, yr oeddwn yn falch i'r trefniadau dros dro i reoleiddio'r ddarpariaeth o driniaeth o dan anaesthesia cyffredinol mewn gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol dderbyn cefnogaeth pob plaid. Bryd hynny, nodais mai mesur dros dros fyddai hyn tan ddiwedd y flwyddyn. Bydd y rheoliadau a ddadleuir heddiw yn cwblhau'r broses o weithredu'r prif argymhellion ar gyfer gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol sy'n deillio o 'A Conscious Decision', yr arolwg o'r defnydd o anaesthesia cyffredinol a llonyddiad ymwybodol mewn gofal deintyddol sylfaenol. Dim ond pan fydd anaesthesia cyffredinol yn hanfodol y dylid ei ddefnyddio. O 31 Rhagfyr 2001, dim ond mewn ysbytai y dylid defnyddio anaesthesia cyffredinol ar gyfer triniaeth ddeintyddol. Felly, o 1 Ionawr 2002, cyfyngir ar weinyddu anaesthesia cyffredinol ar gyfer triniaeth ddeintyddol i ysbytai gyda chyfleusterau ar gyfer darparu gofal critigol. Neilltuwyd £1.5 miliwn ychwanegol i awdurdodau iechyd yng Nghymru i gomisiynu darpariaeth amgen addas lle bo angen.

David Lloyd: Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r datblygiad pwysig hwn. Yr ydym yn falch mai dim ond mewn ysbytai y gellir defnyddio anaesthesia cyffredinol ar gyfer triniaeth ddeintyddol o hyn ymlaen. Soniodd Jane am yr adroddiad a oedd yn cynnwys yr argymhelliad hwn. Croesawn y mesur hwn. Mae'n gam sylweddol ymlaen i wella ansawdd gofal cleifion. Mae Plaid Cymru yn croesawu'r datblygiad.

David Lloyd: I declare an interest as a general practitioner. Plaid Cymru welcomes this important development. We are pleased that, from now on, general anaesthesia can only be used for dental treatment in hospital settings. Jane mentioned the report which included this recommendation. We welcome this measure. It is a considerable step forward to improving the quality of patient care. Plaid Cymru welcomes the development.

David Melding: The Welsh Conservatives were pleased to support the interim measures announced in June, and we support this development also.

Peter Black: The Welsh Liberal Democrats also support these measures. It is important that general anaesthesia is only carried out in hospital settings. This is a health and safety issue. The introduction of these measures is long overdue. It brings us up to date with current practice in many European countries.

Jane Hutt: I am grateful for the support voiced by Dai, David and Peter. It follows the all-party support for the interim measures in June. There is always a risk involved in administering general anaesthesia. There have been personal tragedies as a result of general anaesthesia being used for dental treatment. We must take this forward. Funding is available to ensure the provision of facilities in hospitals. I am grateful for the Assembly's support.

Y Llywydd: Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn.

David Melding: Yr oedd Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn falch o gefnogi'r mesurau dros dro a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mehefin, a chefnogwn y datblygiad hwn hefyd.

Peter Black: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru hefyd yn cefnogi'r mesurau hyn. Mae'n bwysig mai dim ond mewn ysbytai y defnyddir anaesthesia cyffredinol. Mae'n fater iechyd a diogelwch. Mae'n hen bryd cyflwyno'r mesurau hyn. Mae'n golygu y bydd ein harfer yn gyson â'r arfer cyfredol mewn llawer o wledydd Ewrop.

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y gefnogaeth a ddatganwyd gan Dai, David a Peter. Mae'n dilyn y gefnogaeth a gafwyd gan bob plaid i'r mesurau dros dro ym mis Mehefin. Ceir risg bob amser wrth weinyddu anaesthesia cyffredinol. Gwelwyd trasiedïau personol o ganlyniad i ddefnyddio anaesthesia cyffredinol ar gyfer triniaeth ddeintyddol. Rhaid inni weithredu. Mae arian ar gael i sicrhau y darperir cyfleusterau mewn ysbytai. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gefnogaeth y Cynulliad.

The Presiding Officer: We will now vote on the principle of the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

Y Llywydd: Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar **The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on
gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn. the approval of the Order.

Cynnig: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.02 p.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.02 p.m.*

**Adolygiad Polisi ar Drafnidiaeth Gyhoeddus Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd,
 Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth
 The Environment, Planning and Transport Committee's Policy Review of Public
 Transport**

Richard Edwards: I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. *notes the consultation report of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee entitled, 'Policy Review of Public Transport', which can be located using this hyperlink:*
http://www.wales.gov.uk/keypubassemblies/content/policy_review-e.pdf

2. *notes the report of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee entitled, 'Policy Review of Public Transport - Final Report', which was laid in Table Office on 3 December 2001. (NDM895)*

I am pleased to present the recommendations of the Committee's first policy review. They come at a time when a survey by the UK Commission for Integrated Transport shows a transport network that has been starved of investment for half a century. Our reports call for a visionary approach, backed up with considerable public and private resources, to

Richard Edwards: Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi adroddiad ymgynghori Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, 'Adolygiad Polisi Trafnidiaeth Gyhoeddus', y gellir ei ddarllen drwy glicio ar:
http://www.cymru.gov.uk/keypubassemblies/content/policy_review-w.pdf

2. *yn nodi adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, 'Adolygiad Polisi Trafnidiaeth Gyhoeddu—Adroddiad Terfynol', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Rhagfyr 2001. (NDM895)*

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno argymhellion adolygiad polisi cyntaf y Pwyllgor. Cânt eu cyflwyno ar adeg pan fo arolwg gan Gomisiwn Trafnidiaeth Integredig y DU yn dangos na fu digon o fuddsoddiad yn y rhwydwaith trafndiaeth ers hanner canrif. Mae ein hadroddiadau yn galw am weledigaeth, wedi'i hategu gan gryn dipyn o

address these historic levels of underinvestment. We have set that vision. We want public transport in Wales to be integrated, accessible, affordable and an attractive alternative to the car.

Our review was a two-stage process. First, we looked at what improvements could be made within the existing statutory, regulatory and organisational framework. Secondly, we considered options for changes to the existing structures that may require primary legislation. We concentrated on bus, rail and community transport, but we recognise that other forms of transport, including taxis, walking and cycling, make an important contribution. Air services are also significant, particularly in terms of economic development and inward investment. Today, I will set out the background to our review and outline our recommendations for short-term improvements and longer-term organisational change. We also identified the main barriers to improvements in the longer-term, namely, lack of powers and investment. I will set out our recommendations for addressing these issues.

First, the background. We heard from a range of passenger groups, local authorities, transport providers and others, and visited examples of best practice in integrated public transport in the UK and mainland Europe. People in Wales want to use public transport, but are dismayed by lack of provision and poor service quality. We saw what was possible in other European cities, where there was large public sector provision of services, unlike the UK. Our consultation report, which was published in July, made the following recommendations for stage one of our review: quality should be driven up by establishing a quality kitemark for public transport services in Wales; regional transport strategies should guide decisions on funding made by the National Assembly and that should be targeted alongside local authorities' own investment to achieve maximum effect; voluntary groupings of regional consortia should be strengthened by clarifying their constitutional basis—including National Assembly

adnoddau cyhoeddus a phreifat, i fynd i'r afael â'r fath danfuddsoddi. Yr ydym wedi llunio'r weledigaeth honno. Yr ydym am sicrhau bod trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn integredig, yn hygyrch, yn fforddiadwy ac yn ddewis amgen deniadol i ddefnyddio ceir.

Cynhaliwyd ein hadolygiad mewn dau gam. Yn gyntaf, ystyriwyd y gwelliannau y gellid eu gwneud o fewn y fframwaith statudol, rheoliadol a threfniadol sy'n bodoli eisoes. Yn ail, ystyriwyd opsiynau ar gyfer newid y strwythurau presennol, a fyddai'n gofyn am ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol o bosibl. Canolbwyntiwyd ar wasanaethau bysiau, rheilffyrdd a thrafnidiaeth gymunedol, ond yr ydym yn cydnabod bod dulliau teithio eraill, gan gynnwys tacsis, cerdded a seiclo yn gwneud cyfraniad pwysig hefyd. Mae gwasanaethau hedfan hefyd yn arwyddocaol yn enwedig o ran datblygu economaidd a mewnfuddsoddiad. Heddiw, amlinellaf y cefndir i'n hadolygiad a'n hargymhellion ar gyfer gwelliannu yn y tymor byt a newidiadau trefniadol yn y tymor hwy. Nodwyd hefyd y prif rwystrau i welliannau hirdymor, sef diffyg pwerau a buddsoddiad. Nodaf ein hargymhellion i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn.

Yn gyntaf, y cefndir. Cawsom sylwadau gan amrywiaeth o grwpiau teithwyr, awdurdodau lleol, darparwyr trafndiaeth ac eraill, ac yr ydym wedi ymweld ag enghreifftiau o arfer gorau o ran trafndiaeth gyhoeddus integredig yn y DU ac ar dir mawr Ewrop. Mae pobl yng Nghymru am ddefnyddio trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, ond maent yn gresynu at y diffyg darpariaeth ac ansawdd gwael y gwasanaethau. Gwelsom yr hyn y gellid ei gyflawni mewn dinasoedd eraill yn Ewrop, lle y darperir nifer fawr o wasanaethau gan y sector cyhoeddus, yn wahanol i'r DU. Gwnaeth ein hadroddiad ymgynghori, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Gorffennaf, yr argymhellion canlynol ar gyfer cam un o'n hadolygiad: dylid codi safonau drwy sefydlu nod barcud ansawdd ar gyfer gwasanaethau trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru; dylai penderfyniadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar ariannu gael eu llywio gan strategaethau trafndiaeth rhanbarthol a dylai'r rheini gael eu targedu ochr yn ochr â buddsoddiad yr awdurdodau lleol eu hunain er mwyn gwneud

representation—and common objectives should be delivered by allocating joint staff and financial resources and raising their profile; and an evaluation framework for measuring the benefits of targeted public transport investment at national, regional and local levels should be developed, contributing to a base of evidence for future policy development. The Committee felt strongly that passengers should be involved in drawing up the framework and evaluating individual public transport schemes. Drawing on our experience of public transport in other European cities, there is scope for us to learn about what does and does not work elsewhere, and apply that in developing more effective public transport services in Wales.

Our key recommendations are already progressing. A working group will be developing a kite mark. Local authorities have agreed to prepare draft public transport strategies by June 2002, with final strategies by April 2003. Proposals are being developed to ensure that the Assembly targets its investment alongside local authorities' own investment to achieve maximum effect. However, this alone will not achieve the step change in the level of provision that we believe is essential.

That brings me to the second stage of our review, which considered whether alternative structures were needed in the longer-term to deliver our vision. We consulted on three options. First, a passenger transport authority for the whole of Wales. Secondly, a PTA for south-east Wales, and thirdly, strengthening the existing consortia arrangements. We made it clear that any model would need to be specifically designed to meet the requirements of Wales. While there was unanimous support for our vision, consultees were divided on solutions for the long-term. Passengers supported the creation of an all-Wales PTA or a similar national co-

y defnydd gorau o'r buddsoddiad hwnnw; dylid atgyfnerthu consortia rhanbarthol a drefnir yn grwpiau gwirfoddol drwy wneud eu sylfaen gyfansoddiadol yn eglur—gan gynnwys cynrychiolaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol—a dylid cyflawni amcanion cyffredin drwy ddosbarthu staff ac adnoddau ariannol ar y cyd, a thrwy godi eu proffil; dylid datblygu fframwaith gwerthuso ar gyfer mesur manteision buddsoddiad wedi'i dargedu mewn trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn genedlaethol, yn rhanbarthol ac yn lleol, gan gyfrannu at y sylfaen o dystiolaeth ar gyfer llunio polisiau yn y dyfodol. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn gryf o'r farn y dylid cynnwys teithwyr yn y gwaith o lunio'r fframwaith a gwerthuso cynlluniau trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus unigol. Gan ddefnyddio ein profiad o drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus mewn dinasoedd eraill yn Ewrop, mae lle inni ddysgu am yr hyn sy'n llwyddo a'r hyn nad yw'n llwyddo mewn mannau eraill, a chymhwyso hynny wrth ddatblygu gwasanaethau trafnidiaeth cyhoeddus mwy effeithiol yng Nghymru.

Mae ein hargymhellion allweddol eisoes ar waith. Bydd gweithgor yn datblygu nod barcud. Mae'r awdurdodau lleol wedi cytuno i baratoi strategaethau trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus drafft erbyn Mehefin 2002, gan eu rhoi ar eu gwedd derfynol erbyn Ebrill 2003. Datblygir cynigion ar hyn o bryd i sicrhau y bydd y Cynulliad yn targedu ei fuddsoddiad ochr yn ochr â buddsoddiad yr awdurdodau lleol eu hunain er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y buddsoddiad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd hyn ar ei ben ei hun yn gwneud y newid sylweddol yn lefel y ddarpariaeth y credwn ni sydd ei angen.

Daw hynny â mi at ail gam ein hadolygiad, a ystyriodd a oedd angen strwythurau amgen yn y tymor hwy er mwyn gwireddu ein gweledigaeth. Ymgynghorwyd ar dri opsiwn. Yn gyntaf, awdurdod trafnidiaeth teithwyr i Gymru gyfan, Yn ail, awdurdod trafnidiaeth teithwyr yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, ac yn drydydd, atgyfnerthu'r trefniadau consortia presennol. Eglurwyd y byddai angen i unrhyw fodel gael ei gynllunio'n benodol i fodloni gofynion Cymru. Er bod cefnogaeth unfrydol i'n gweledigaeth, yr oedd gwahaniaeth barn ymhlith y rhai yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy ynglŷn â'r atebion yn yr hirdymor. Yr oedd teithwyr o blaid creu

ordinating body, while providers supported strengthening existing regional consortia. We are not convinced that our vision can be achieved without some enabling legislation. In the short term, we support strengthening existing consortia. Passengers have expressed concern whether there is commitment to change. We believe that statutory pressure may be needed to assist the consortia to deliver improvements. We examined arguments for and against an all-Wales PTA and a PTA for south-east Wales. We believe that the details of the costs and benefits of these options should be considered further. Any changes should focus on delivering our vision and must be the most effective means of improving services to passengers. Any new arrangements should put the needs of the travelling public first and focus on delivering a fully integrated, accessible, and affordable system for all modes. New organisations must be open and transparent and not unnecessarily bureaucratic. These organisations should be accountable to passengers and the Assembly. Cross-border England-Wales co-operation must also be addressed, particularly in north-east Wales.

awdurdod trafnidiaeth teithwyr i Gymru gyfan neu gorff cydlynu cenedlaethol cyffelyb, tra bod darparwyr o blaid atgyfnerthu'r consortia rhanbarthol presennol. Nid ydym yn argyhoeddedig y gellid gwireddu ein gweledigaeth heb rywfaint o ddeddfwriaeth alluogi. Yn y tymor byr, yr ydym o blaid atgyfnerthu'r consortia presennol. Mynegodd teithwyr bryderon ynghylch a oes ymrwymiad i newid. Credwn fod angen camau statudol o bosibl i helpu'r consortia i wella gwasanaethau. Gwnaethom archwilio'r dadleuon dros ac yn erbyn sefydlu awdurdod trafnidiaeth teithwyr i Gymru gyfan ac awdurdod trafnidiaeth teithwyr i dde-ddwyrain Cymru. Credwn y dylid ystyried manylion am gostau a manteision yr opsiynau hyn ymhellach. Dylai unrhyw newidiadau ganolbwyntio ar wireddu ein gweledigaeth a rhaid iddynt fod y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o wella gwasanaethau i deithwyr. Dylai unrhyw drefniadau newydd roi anghenion teithwyr yn gyntaf gan ganolbwyntio ar gyflwyno system hygyrch, fforddiadwy a chwbl integredig â phob dull teithio. Rhaid i sefydliadau newydd fod yn agored ac yn atebol ac nid yn orfiwrocataidd. Dylai'r sefydliadau hyn fod yn atebol i'r teithwyr a'r Cynulliad. Rhaid mynd i'r afael hefyd â chydweithrediad trawsffiniol rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, yn enwedig yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru.

3:10 p.m.

We make a number of recommendations. We invite the Minister for Environment and her officials to work up proposals for options for organisational change—including the PTA options—report progress to the Committee, and report to Plenary on the preferred option within six months. We suggest that as well as setting out how our vision will be delivered, the proposals set out the impact on the existing structures and include a framework for enabling primary legislation. The analysis should also estimate the cost of implementing the new arrangements, the benefits—both strategically and locally—and the impact on cross-cutting objectives.

Gwnawn nifer o argymhellion. Gwahoddwn y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd a'i swyddogion i lunio cynigion ar gyfer newidiadau trefniadol—gan gynnwys yr opsiynau ar gyfer Awdurdodau Trafnidiaeth Teithwyr—a chyflwyno adroddiad cynnydd i'r Pwyllgor ac adroddiad gerbron Cyfarfod Llawn ar y dewis opsiwn o fewn chwe mis. Yn ogystal â nodi'r ffordd y caiff ein gweledigaeth ei gwireddu, awgrymwn y dylai'r cynigion nodi'r effaith ar y strwythurau presennol a chynnwys fframwaith ar gyfer deddfwriaeth sylfaenol alluogi. Dylai'r dadansoddiad amcangyfrif hefyd beth fydd y gost o roi'r trefniadau newydd ar waith, y manteision—yn strategol ac yn lleol—a'r effaith ar amcanion trawsbynciol.

On the issue of powers, our review identified O ran pwerau, nododd ein hadolygiad y prif

the main barriers we face in delivering our vision. These reflect the distribution of public transport responsibilities between Whitehall and Wales—in particular with regard to rail—and within Wales, between the Assembly and local authorities. This needs to be addressed if we are to deliver our vision. We consider that the National Assembly should seek enabling primary legislative powers for organisational change. As regards the railways, gaining powers to direct and guide the Strategic Rail Authority would enable the Assembly to secure greater coherence in developing integrated transport policy. This is increasingly relevant given the Assembly's commitment to investing in rail infrastructure. We invite the Minister to seek the power for the National Assembly to direct the SRA, along the lines of the Scottish model, and as part of the work on PTA options seek a delegation to the National Assembly of management responsibility for the Valley Lines, which could be implemented through a PTA or statutory consortium. We consider that the National Assembly should seek the right to nominate a member of the SRA and seek representation for Wales on Railtrack's successor body.

We considered the regulation of bus services and concluded that the traffic commissioner should have an office in Wales. In the long term, we invite the Minister for Environment and the traffic commissioner to consider making that office accountable to the Assembly.

Finally, as well as gaining additional powers, we need to address historic levels of underinvestment in public transport. In the short term, we recognise the need for adequate funding to strengthen the consortia, and consider that there is merit in ring fencing part of local authorities' revenue support grant so that it can be passed on to the consortia. We have already recommended that Assembly funding is targeted alongside the resources of local authorities to maximise the delivery of improvements locally. This is being taken forward. Significant long-term public and private sector investment is

rwystrau a wynebwn i wireddu ein gweledigaeth. Mae'r rhain yn adlewyrchu'r ffordd y caiff cyfrifoldebau dros drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus eu dosbarthu rhwng Whitehall a Chymru—yn enwedig o ran rheilffyrdd—ac yng Nghymru, rhwng y Cynulliad a'r awdurdodau lleol. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â hyn er mwyn inni wireddu ein gweledigaeth. Yn ein barn ni, dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol geisio pwerau deddfwriaethol sylfaenol galluogi. O ran y rheilffyrdd, byddai pwerau newydd i gyfarwyddo a llywio'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i sicrhau gwell cydlyniaeth wrth ddatblygu polisi trafnidiaeth integredig. Daw hyn yn fwyfwy perthnasol o ystyried ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i fuddsoddi yn seilwaith y rheilffyrdd. Gwahoddwn y Gweinidog i fynnu'r pŵer i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyfarwyddo'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, ar lun y model yn yr Alban, ac fel rhan o'r gwaith ar opsiynau awdurdodau trafnidiaeth teithwyr i wneud cais i'r cyfrifoldeb dros reoli Valley Lines gael ei ddirprwyo i'r Cynulliad drwy awdurdod trafnidiaeth teithwyr neu gonsortium statudol. Yn ein barn ni, dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fynnu'r hawl i enwebu aelod o'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol a chynrychiolaeth i Gymru ar y corff olynol i Railtrack.

Ystyriwyd y ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau bysiau eu rheoleiddio a deuthum i'r casgliad y dylai'r comisiynydd traffig agor swyddfa yn Nghymru. Yn yr hirdymor, gwahoddwn y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd a'r comisiynydd traffig i ystyried gwneud y swydd honno yn atebol i'r Cynulliad.

Yn olaf, yn ogystal â sicrhau pwerau ychwanegol newydd, mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r diffyg buddsoddiad mewn trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn y gorffennol. Yn y byrdymor, yr ydym yn cydnabod bod angen arian digonol i atgyfnerthu'r consortia, ac yn ein barn ni, mae gwerth mewn clustnodi rhan o grant cymorth refeniw awdurdodau lleol fel y gellir ei drosglwyddo i'r consortia. Yr ydym eisoes wedi argymhell y dylid targedu arian y Cynulliad ochr yn ochr ag adnoddau awdurdodau lleol er mwyn gwneud y gorau o welliannau yn lleol. Mae hyn yn mynd rhagddo. Mae angen i'r sector cyhoeddus a'r

needed if we are to deliver our vision. This must be met from the Assembly's own resources, those of the UK Government and its agencies, and the private sector. We suggest that an analysis is undertaken of the investment needed to deliver a modern public transport system, building on information from local transport plans and other sources. There is a need for a similar analysis at UK level. In light of the recent difficulties, to put it euphemistically, in the rail industry, we believe that now is the time to question whether public sector subsidy of private companies—in effect public expenditure with little or no public accountability—is sustainable or desirable in the long term.

sector preifat fuddsoddi'n sylweddol yn yr hirdymor er mwyn inni wireddu ein gweledigaeth. Rhaid defnyddio adnoddau'r Cynulliad ei hun, adnoddau Llywodraeth y DU a'i hasiantaethau, a'r sector preifat yn hynny o beth. Awgrymwn y dylid dadansoddi'r buddsoddiad sydd ei angen i ddarparu system drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus fodern, gan adeiladu ar wybodaeth o gynlluniau trafnidiaeth lleol a ffynonellau eraill. Mae angen gwneud dadansoddiad tebyg ar lefel y DU. Yng ngoleuni'r anawsterau y mae'r rheilffyrdd wedi eu hwynebu'n ddiweddar, os caf eu disgrifio'n garedig felly, yr ydym o'r farn bod yr amser wedi dod i holi a yw cymhorthdal i gwmnïau preifat o arian cyhoeddus—hynny yw gwariant cyhoeddus i bob diben heb braidd dim atebolrwydd i'r cyhoedd os o gwbl—yn gynaliadwy neu'n ddymunol yn yr hirdymor.

I thank Committee members for their contributions to the review. While there are different political views, all members share the Committee's vision for public transport. Apart from David Davies, there is consensus on our recommendations. I thank the Minister for building on our recommendations in her transport framework. I thank our adviser, Denys Morgan, for his unremunerated assistance. I also thank the Committee Secretariat—Siwan Davies and her team—for the immense amount of work they have put in to compile these reports. I commend them to Plenary.

Hoffwn ddiolch i aelodau'r Pwyllgor am eu cyfraniadau i'r adolygiad. Er gwaethaf y safbwyntiau gwleidyddol gwahanol, mae pob aelod yn rhannu gweledigaeth y Pwyllgor ar gyfer trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Ar wahân i David Davies, mae pawb yn gytûn ynglŷn â'n hargymhellion. Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am adeiladu ar ein hargymhellion yn ei fframwaith trafnidiaeth. Diolchaf i'n cynghorydd, Denys Morgan, am y cymorth a roddodd yn ddi-dâl. Diolchaf hefyd i Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Pwyllgor—Siwan Davies a'i thîm—am y gwaith sylweddol a wnaethant i baratoi'r adroddiadau hyn. Argymhellaf hwy i'r Cyfarfod Llawn.

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): I welcome the Committee's review and, as a member of the Committee, I have been pleased with the way the whole review was conducted. The Committee has worked well together and with the adviser, and I have been glad that Assembly transport officials provided support where appropriate. It has been an inclusive process and one with which the Assembly as a whole can be pleased.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Croesawaf adolygiad y Pwyllgor ac, fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor, yr oedd yn dda gennyf weld y ffordd y cafodd yr adolygiad ei gynnal. Bu'r Pwyllgor yn gweithio'n dda gyda'i gilydd a chyda'r ymgynghorydd, ac yr oedd yn dda gennyf nodi bod swyddogion trafnidiaeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi cymorth lle y bo hynny yn briodol. Bu'n broses gynhwysol ac un y gall y Cynulliad cyfan ymfalchïo ynddi.

When I was Chair of the former Local Government and Environment Committee, I was keen that we should address public transport early on in the Assembly's life. The issues of accessibility, congestion and choice are key, and were addressed in the transport

Pan oeddwn yn Gadeirydd ar gyn-Bwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd, yr oeddwn yn awyddus inni fynd i'r afael â thrafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn gynnar yn oes y Cynulliad. Mae'r materion sy'n ymwneud â hygyrchedd, tagfeydd a dewis yn allweddol,

framework published on 23 November. Demand for transport increases with economic growth. Increases in car ownership and use create pressure in some areas, and we must ensure that we meet these challenges in developing a sustainable transport system. I frequently state that transport is central, not marginal, to our lives, which is recognised by this report.

This review complements the framework and, in dealing specifically and comprehensively with the underlying shortcomings and opportunities—I stress the word ‘opportunities’—for public transport, it provides an excellent platform to plan ahead for the next 10 years. I welcome the emphasis placed on the views of consumer organisations, and I support the recommendation that passengers should be involved in evaluating individual public transport schemes. To use the same words again, passengers should be central, not marginal, to transport.

For too long, public transport has languished, but there is cross-party support—I look at David—to bring about improvements, and much is being done already. There are good developments taking place throughout Wales, which we can all support. These involve a partnership approach between local authorities and bus and train operators, with increasing levels of financial support from the Assembly Government. Some examples include the Smart Card scheme in Caerphilly, the quality bus partnerships in Gwynedd, the park and ride scheme in Bridgend and Passenger Transport Information Cymru. All of these schemes involve partnership working.

Janet Ryder *rose—*

Sue Essex: I will finish my speech, and I am sure that you will then have a chance to contribute, Janet.

Ten years from now, the review foresees a choice of high-quality services including rail, bus and community transport, drawing in taxis and linked to walking and cycling

ac aethpwyd i'r afael â hwy yn y fframwaith trafnidiaeth a gyhoeddwyd ar 23 Tachwedd. Mae'r galw am drafnidiaeth yn cynyddu ar y cyd â thwf economaidd. Mae cynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy'n berchen ar gar a'r defnydd a wneir ohonynt yn creu pwysau mewn rhai ardaloedd, a rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn wynebu'r heriau hyn wrth ddatblygu system drafnidiaeth gynaliadwy. Dywedaf yn aml mai rhywbeth canolog, nid ymylol, yw trafnidiaeth yn ein bywydau a chydabyddir hynny yn yr adroddiad hwn.

Mae'r adolygiad hwn yn ategu'r fframwaith ac, wrth ymdrin â'r gwendidau a'r cyfleoedd sylfaenol mewn ffordd benodol a chynhwysfawr—pwysleisaf y gair ‘cyfleoedd’—ar gyfer trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, mae'n rhoi llwyfan ardderchog i flaengynllunio ar gyfer y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Croesawaf y pwyslais ar farn sefydliadau defnyddwyr, a chefnogaf yr argymhellion y dylai teithwyr fod yn rhan o'r broses o werthuso cynlluniau trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus unigol. I ddefnyddio'r un geiriau eto, dylai teithwyr fod yn ganolog, nid yn ymylol, i drafnidiaeth.

Ers gormod o amser, bu trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn llesgáu ond ceir cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol—edrychaf ar David—i wella gwasanaethau, ac mae llawer eisoes ar y gweill. Mae datblygiadau da, y gallwn oll eu cefnogi, ar droed ledled Cymru. Maent yn ymwneud â phartneriaeth rhwng awdurdodau lleol a chwmnïau bysiau a threnau, gyda rhagor o gymorth ariannol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Ymhlith yr enghreifftiau mae cynllun *Smart Card* yng Nghaerffili, y partneriaethau bysiau o safon yng Ngwynedd, y cynllun parcio a theithio ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr a Gwybodaeth Trafnidiaeth Teithwyr Cymru. Mae pob un o'r cynlluniau hyn yn golygu gweithio mewn partneriaeth.

Janet Ryder *a gododd—*

Sue Essex: Gorffennaf fy araiht, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y cewch gyfle wedyn i gyfrannu, Janet.

Ymhen 10 mlynedd, mae'r adolygiad yn rhagweld y bydd dewis o wasanaethau o safon, gan gynnwys rheilffyrdd, gwasanaethau bysiau a thrafnidiaeth

strategies. It envisages real progress in ensuring that people with disabilities can use the transport system with ease. We need improvements that include: the introduction of modern fleets for bus and rail, through-ticketing, good information, dependability and more frequent services; improved infrastructure including interchanges and better traffic management to make it easier for buses and cyclists; and improved accessibility and bringing community transport more into the mainstream of transport in areas where it can make a real difference.

Taken as a whole, the list of recommendations is challenging. We have already started work on some of the key recommendations and I am glad that local authorities and operators have welcomed the quality kitemark, to which Richard referred. We must ensure that incremental improvements meet agreed standards and, once achieved, are monitored and maintained. Achieving quality services is one aspect, but continuing maintenance is the key to attracting support for public transport.

A sustained programme of investment is needed, not only from Assembly resources, but from local authorities' funds, the UK Government through the Strategic Rail Authority, and private sector operators. We need better targeting of investment to develop a critical mass, which I will pursue. The Committee's report recommends that we analyse the investment needed—capital and revenue—to bring about the required changes, and I am happy to undertake that work.

The report concludes that to achieve a step change we should seek powers to direct the SRA along with enabling primary legislative powers for organisational change. There were differing views on this among the bodies that responded to the consultation. However, in general, there is much support for seeking a degree of control over rail. I am glad to say that, in practice, there is a good working

gymunedol, gan ddefnyddio tacsis ac yn cysylltu â strategaethau cerdded a seiclo. Mae'n rhagweld cynnydd gwirioneddol o ran sicrhau y bydd yn hawdd i bobl ag anableddau ddefnyddio'r system drafnidiaeth. Mae angen inni wneud gwelliannau sy'n cynnwys: cyflwyno cerbydau modern i wasanaethau bysiau a rheilffyrdd, tocynnau taith gyfan, gwybodaeth dda, dibynadwyedd a gwasanaethau amlach; gwell seilwaith ac iddi gyfnewidfeydd a gwell rheolaeth traffig er mwyn hwyluso pethau i fysiau a seiclwr; a gwneud trafnidiaeth yn fwy hygyrch a sicrhau bod i drafnidiaeth gymunedol ran fwy canolog mewn ardaloedd lle y gall wneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol.

O edrych arni yn ei chyfanrwydd, mae'r rhestr o argymhellion yn un heriol. Yr ydym eisoes wedi dechrau gwaith ar rai o'r argymhellion allweddol ac yr wyf yn falch o nodi bod yr awdurdodau lleol a chwmnïau trafnidiaeth wedi croesawu'r nod barcud ansawdd, y cyfeiriodd Richard ato. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gwelliannau cynyddol yn bodloni'r safonau y cytunwyd arnynt, a'u bod yn cael eu monitro a'u cynnal unwaith y byddwn yn eu cyrraedd. Mae darparu gwasanaethau o safon yn un agwedd ar ein gwaith, ond mae gwaith cynnal a chadw parhaus yn allweddol i ennill cefnogaeth i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus.

Mae angen rhaglen o fuddsoddiad parhaus, nid yn unig o adnoddau'r Cynulliad, ond o arian awdurdodau lleol, Llywodraeth y DU drwy'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, a chwmnïau yn y preifat sector. Mae angen inni dargedu buddsoddiad yn well i ddatblygu mäs critigol. Af ar drywydd hynny. Argymhella adroddiad y Pwyllgor ein bod yn dadansoddi faint o fuddsoddiad sydd ei angen—o ran cyfalaf a refeniw—i wneud y newidiadau angenrheidiol, ac yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i wneud y gwaith hwnnw.

Er mwyn newid pethau'n sylweddol daw'r adroddiad i'r casgliad y dylem fynnu pwerau i gyfarwyddo'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol ochr yn ochr â'r pwerau galluogi deddfwriaeth sylfaenol ar gyfer newid trefniadol. Bu gwahaniaeth barn ar hyn ymhlith y cyrff a ymatebodd i'r ymgynghoriad. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, mae cryn gefnogaeth i'r awgrym y dylid

relationship between the Assembly and the SRA, which has built up since its inception. However, there are obvious advantages in securing greater control, which will require legislative changes.

In doing this, there are complications that must be addressed, especially as the Wales and Borders franchise covers services in England. We need to look in detail at the organisational and funding arrangements. Nevertheless, securing powers—equivalent to those of the Scottish Parliament—to direct the SRA would provide us with an added influence on rail development. We are committed to spending over £60 million in the next five years on rail infrastructure, and we should have a greater say on how services are provided in Wales. The Valley Lines is a self-contained unit within the Wales and Borders franchise, and a degree of management delegation might be achieved, provided that an appropriate organisational structure is in place. Finally, we will need to consider any possible changes on the future of Railtrack.

3.20 p.m.

In the case of buses, deregulation meant that local authorities had no ability—apart from the subsidising of services—to influence developments. The Transport Act 2000 has changed that position with the introduction of quality bus contracts. However, there is now the opportunity to re-examine this, and to consider whether certain changes should be made to enable us to improve bus provision where required. We must bear in mind that bus and rail operations are commercial, and local authorities and the Assembly are limited in what they can do.

There are important issues to be considered in the context of organisational changes. I am keen to investigate in more detail how we can strengthen the local authority consortia in discussion with the Welsh Local Government Association. There are several scenarios,

ceisio rhywfaint o reolaeth dros y rheilffyrdd. Yr wyf yn falch o nodi bod perthynas waith dda rhwng y Cynulliad a'r awdurdod yn ymarferol, sydd wedi datblygu ers sefydlu'r awdurdod. Fodd bynnag, mae manteision amlwg i sicrhau mwy o reolaeth, a fydd yn gofyn am newidiadau deddfwriaethol.

Wrth wneud hyn, cyfyd cymhlethdodau y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hwy, yn enwedig am fod masnachfaint Cymru a'r Gororau yn cwmpasu gwasanaethau yn Lloegr. Mae angen inni edrych yn fanwl ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â threfniadaeth a chyllid. Eto i gyd, byddai sicrhau pwerau—sy'n cyfateb â phwerau Senedd yr Alban—i gyfarwyddo'r awdurdod yn fodd arall inni ddylanwadu ar y ffordd y bydd y rheilffyrdd yn datblygu. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i wario dros £60 miliwn yn y pum mlynedd nesaf ar seilwaith y rheilffyrdd, a dylem gael mwy o lais ar y ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau eu darparu yng Nghymru. Mae trenau Valley Lines yn uned ar wahân o fewn masnachfaint Cymru a'r Gororau, ac efallai y byddai modd dirprwyo rhywfaint o'r cyfrifoldeb dros ei rheoli, ar yr amod bod strwythur trefniadol addas ar waith. Yn olaf, bydd angen inni ystyried unrhyw newidiadau posibl i ddyfodol Railtrack.

Yn achos bysiau, yn dilyn dadreoleiddio nid oedd yn bosibl—ar wahân i'r cymorthdaliadau i wasanaethau—i awdurdodau lleol ddylanwadu ar ddatblygiadau. Mae Deddf Trafnidiaeth 2000 wedi newid y sefyllfa honno drwy gyflwyno contractau bysiau o safon. Fodd bynnag, erbyn hyn mae cyfle i ailedrych ar hyn, ac ystyried a ddylid gwneud rhai newidiadau a fydd yn ein galluogi i wella darpariaeth gwasanaethau bysiau lle bo angen. Rhaid inni gofio mai cwmnïau masnachol yw cwmnïau bysiau a rheilffordd, a chyfyngedig yw'r hyn y gall awdurdodau lleol a'r Cynulliad ei wneud yn y maes hwn.

Mae materion pwysig i'w hystyried yng nghyd-destun y newidiadau trefniadol. Yr wyf yn awyddus i ymchwilio'n fanylach i'r ffordd y gallwn atgyfnerthu consortia awdurdodau lleol mewn trafodaeth gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Mae

including local authorities using their existing powers to establish consortia on a statutory basis. We must also consider in more detail whether a passenger transport authority model—either for the whole of Wales, or perhaps for the south-east Wales area only—is appropriate to secure the integration, reliability and quality of public transport that passengers, and potential passengers require.

The terms ‘passenger transport authority’, and ‘passenger transport executive’ are used by the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee because they were used in the English and Scottish models.

I know that there are sensitivities about this issue, and as a Committee member, I wish to emphasise that I do not consider this as an attack on local government’s powers—far from it, since a PTA is wholly made up of local councillors. It is about strengthening the capacity of local authorities to deliver a challenging agenda over the next decade, and we must consider all possible options. I shall be considering how we can best ensure that the Assembly and local government make the most effective contribution possible in creating improvements in partnership with transport operators. The key factor must be to ensure that we have the powers and the organisations to deliver improvements. In response to the Committee’s recommendations 17 and 18, I shall be examining the issues in detail. I am happy to report to the Committee and Plenary within six months.

I conclude by saying that I welcome the Committee’s report, and the positive recommendations that it contains. Like Richard, I want to place on record my thanks to everyone involved: Committee members, Richard Edwards as Chair, Denys Morgan, the adviser, the staff who have supported the Committee and the Transport Directorate, and everyone who has presented evidence to the Committee.

Helen Mary Jones: I would like to commend this report to the National Assembly, and to the Government of Wales, and I welcome the Minister’s commitment to

sawl posibilrwydd, gan gynnwys awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio eu pwerau presennol i sefydlu consortia ar sail statudol. Rhaid inni ystyried yn fanylach hefyd a yw model awdurdod trafndiaeth teithwyr—boed hynny i Gymru gyfan neu i ardal de-ddwyrain Cymru yn unig—yn addas i sicrhau bod trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yn integredig, yn ddibynadwy ac o’r safon a fyn teithwyr, a darpar deithwyr.

Defnyddia Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth y termau ‘awdurdod trafndiaeth teithwyr’ a ‘gweithrediaeth trafndiaeth teithwyr’ am mai’r rheini a ddefnyddir ym model Lloegr ac ym model yr Alban.

Gwn fod y mater hwn yn un sensitif, ac fel aelod Pwyllgor, hoffwn bwysleisio nad yw hyn yn ymosodiad ar bwerau llywodraeth leol yn fy marn i—i’r gwrthwyneb, gan mai cynghorwyr lleol fydd aelodau unrhyw awdurdod trafndiaeth teithwyr. Mae a wnelo ag atgyfnerthu gallu awdurdodau lleol i gyflwyno agenda ymestynnol dros y degawd nesaf, a rhaid inni ystyried pob opsiwn posibl. Byddaf yn ystyried y ffordd orau o sicrhau y gall Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol wneud y cyfraniad mwyaf effeithiol posibl wrth greu gwelliannau mewn partneriaeth gyda’r cwmnïau cludiant. Y ffactor allweddol yw sicrhau bod gennym y pwerau a’r sefydliadau i wella gwasanaethau. Mewn ymateb i argymhellion 17 a 18 y Pwyllgor, byddaf yn ystyried y materion yn fanwl. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i roi adroddiad i’r Pwyllgor a gerbron Cyfarfod Llawn o fewn chwe mis.

Gorffennaf drwy ddweud fy mod yn croesawu adroddiad y Pwyllgor a’r argymhellion cadarnhaol ynddo. Fel Richard, hoffwn gofnodi fy nioch i bawb a gymerodd ran: aelodau’r Pwyllgor, Richard Edwards fel Cadeirydd, Denys Morgan, yr ymgynghorydd, y staff a roddodd gymorth i’r Pwyllgor a’r Gyfarwyddiaeth Trafnidiaeth, a phawb a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth i’r Pwyllgor.

Helen Mary Jones: Hoffwn argymhell yr adroddiad hwn i’r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac i Lywodraeth Cymru, a chroesawaf ymrwymiad y Gweinidog i ymateb i

respond to the Committee's recommendations within an agreed time frame.

In commending the report to the Assembly, I congratulate Richard Edwards on the way in which he has chaired this process. We have had some robust discussions and strong debates. We have put some of those giving evidence on the spot, and given them what Richard would describe as a good grilling, but this was always done in the best of humour. This process has been conclusive proof that inclusive politics in the Assembly, while it may be a little poorly, is far from dead. I welcome that, and thank Richard for all his work in ensuring that the process has remained on track.

There was, in the evidence received by the Committee and in the conclusions drawn, a remarkable degree of consensus, although not everyone agreed on everything. While everyone agreed on the problems, not everyone would agree on the solutions.

I will concentrate on the recommendations for long-term structural change. First, on rail, during the Committee's inquiry, it became clear that there was no support for the current position. There was concern about the potential for confusion and the difficulty presented by the current lack of power over rail in terms of driving forward the Assembly's and the Committee's vision for a public transport system. The majority of respondents felt that Scottish powers would be appropriate, along with a devolved budget. This must be one example where most of us agree that the National Assembly's present powers are insufficient to meet the needs of the people of Wales.

We must have the same powers as the Scottish Parliament over rail, as well as its budget. That is not a new proposition. I know that it has been the Minister's view and that of the Government of Wales. I trust that the Committee's report, given the evidence behind it, will strengthen the Minister's hand in pushing that agenda forward with Westminster colleagues. I hope that an opportunity arises to do so, given the current

argymhellion y Pwyllgor o fewn amserlen benodedig.

Wrth argymell yr adroddiad i'r Cynulliad, llongyfarchaf Richard Edwards am y ffordd y mae wedi cadeirio'r broses hon. Cawsom drafodaethau bywiog a dadleuon cadarn. Rhoesom rai o'r bobl a roddodd dystiolaeth dan y chwyddwydr, gan eu croesholi'n fanwl, fel y byddai Richard yn cytuno, er nad oeddem byth yn gas. Bu'r broses hon yn brawf diamwys bod gwleidyddiaeth gynhwysol y Cynulliad, er ei bod mewn cyflwr gwael, yn bell o fod ar ei gwely angau. Croesawaf hynny, a diolchaf i Richard am ei holl waith wrth sicrhau bod y broses yn cadw ar y trywydd iawn.

Bu cytundeb rhyfeddol, o ran y dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r Pwyllgor a'r casgliadau y daethpwyd iddynt, er nad oedd pawb yn cytuno ar bopeth. Er bod pawb yn gytûn ynglŷn â'r problemau, ni chytunai pawb ar yr atebion.

Canolbwyntiaf ar yr argymhellion ar gyfer newid strwythurol hirdymor. Yn gyntaf, o ran y rheilffyrdd, yn ystod ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor, daeth yn amlwg nad oedd neb am i'r sefyllfa bresennol barhau. Bu pryder ynglŷn â'r dryswch posibl a'r anhawster a allai godi am nad oes gan y Cynulliad bwerau dros y rheilffyrdd ar hyn o bryd o ran datblygu gweledigaeth y Cynulliad a'r Pwyllgor ar gyfer system drafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Teimlai'r rhan fwyaf o'r rhai a ymatebodd y byddai pwerau yn debyg i bwerau'r Alban yn addas, ynghyd â chyllideb ddatganoledig. Rhaid bod hon yn enghraifft lle y mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn cytuno nad oes gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bwerau digonol ar hyn o bryd i ddiwallu anghenion pobl Cymru.

Rhaid inni fynnu'r un pwerau ag sydd gan Senedd yr Alban o ran y rheilffyrdd, yn ogystal â'i gyllideb. Nid awgrym newydd mohono. Gwn mai dyna farn y Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Cymru. Hyderaf y bydd adroddiad y Pwyllgor, o ystyried y dystiolaeth sy'n ei ategu, yn cryfhau sefyllfa y Gweinidog wrth hybu'r agenda honno gyda'i chyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan. Gobeithiaf y daw cyfle i wneud hynny, o

discussions about Railtrack there. Hopefully, we can also secure any necessary primary legislation.

The second question—the Minister and the Chair have both referred to this—is how to achieve integration of services nationally. There was not a total consensus on this matter; rather, there were two polar views. Passengers' representatives told us that they wanted co-ordination at a national level. Call it a passenger transport authority for short. The providers said that they wanted to carry on with what they were doing, but maybe wanted to do it a little better. One response might be 'they would say that, wouldn't they'. Having heard evidence, I have concluded that this debate is at risk of becoming polarised and sterile. Perhaps the use of the term 'passenger transport authority' has led to unnecessary concerns in Welsh local government. This debate is not about the name that we use, but about the issues involved. As Plaid Cymru sees it, the issues are how best to achieve integration at national level and secure the most effective cross-border integration—vital in terms of rail—while maintaining maximum flexibility and local democratic accountability. Given the variety of communities across Wales, one public transport model will not be suitable for all.

The Committee report asks the Minister to undertake further work, and Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales agrees with that. We are convinced of the need for all-Wales integration, call it a passenger transport authority, or look for another model—

Janet Ryder: I ask the Minister through you, is she aware that there are three passenger transport information call centres in Wales? One of those, in Ynys Môn, is offered through the disability forum, Fforwm Anabledd Taran Cyf., and is the only Welsh-medium service of its kind. However, it is currently suffering problems. It is not receiving the necessary number of calls because of problems with its equipment. Will the Minister raise the issue with Taran and

gofio'r trafodaethau ar Railtrack sy'n mynd yn eu blaen yno. Gobeithiaf y gallwn sicrhau unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol sydd ei hangen hefyd.

Yr ail gwestiwn—a chyfeiriodd y Gweinidog a'r Cadeirydd at hyn—yw sut y gellir integreiddio'r gwasanaethau'n genedlaethol. Ni fu cytundeb llwyr ar y mater hwn; yn hytrach, bu dwy farn gwbl groes. Dywedodd cynrychiolwyr teithwyr wrthym eu bod am i'r gwasanaethau gael eu cydlynu'n genedlaethol, sef rhyw fath o awdurdod trafnidiaeth teithwyr, yn fyr. Dywedodd y darparwyr eu bod am barhau i wneud yr hyn yr oeddent yn ei wneud, ond efallai ei wneud ychydig yn well. Un ymateb i hynny fyddai 'dywedant hynny, wrth gwrs'. Ar ôl clywed y dystiolaeth, deuthum i'r casgliad fod perygl y gall y ddadl hon hollti a dod yn ddiwerth. Efallai bod y term 'awdurdod trafnidiaeth teithwyr' wedi peri pryder diangen i lywodraeth leol Cymru. Nid yw'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â'r enw a ddefnyddiwn, ond y materion dan sylw. O safbwynt Plaid Cymru, y materion dan sylw yw dod o hyd i'r ffordd orau o sicrhau bod gwasanaethau wedi'u hintegreiddio'n genedlaethol a'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o integreiddio gwasanaethau trawsffiniol—sy'n hanfodol i'r rheilffyrdd—tra'n cadw'r hyblygrwydd a'r atebolrwydd democrataidd lleol mwyaf posibl. O ystyried amrywiaeth cymunedau ledled Cymru, ni fydd un model trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn addas i bawb.

Mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog wneud rhagor o waith a chytuna Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales ar hynny. Yr ydym yn argyhoeddedig bod angen integreiddio gwasanaethau ar lefel Cymru gyfan boed hynny drwy awdurdod trafnidiaeth teithwyr neu drwy fodel arall—

Janet Ryder: Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog, trwoch chi, a yw'n ymwybodol bod tair canolfan gwybodaeth trafnidiaeth i deithwyr yng Nghymru? Darperir un ohonynt, yn Ynys Môn, drwy'r fforwm anabledd, Fforwm Anabledd Taran Cyf., a'r ganolfan honno yw'r unig wasanaeth Cymraeg o'i fath. Fodd bynnag, mae'n cael problemau ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw'n derbyn y nifer angenrheidiol o alwadau oherwydd problemau gyda'i hoffer. A wnaiff y Gweinidog godi'r mater gyda

with the people supplying its equipment, as it is important to provide information to passengers, and to provide it bilingually?

Helen Mary Jones: The Committee would have been keen to ensure that information is available to passengers in whichever format is best for them, whether in braille, verbally or in Welsh. I will raise that matter with the Minister on your behalf.

On the models of management, legislation is needed to enable the Government of Wales to suggest proposals for that integration to the Assembly. Nobody need get hung-up on terminology. What is important is that we achieve the twin aims of maximum democratic local control and accountability, and maximum national integration.

There is clear consensus on one thing: our public transport system in Wales is a shambles. Committee members regularly hear agonising stories from Eleanor Burnham about the train route from north to south Wales. It is almost unbearable to hear what she must put up with sometimes.

Geraint Davies: I remind you of the problems facing Valley Lines, which seems to suffer tremendously on a daily basis. People are jammed into only two carriages, and we must consider the safety aspects of that. Such conditions of travel are not acceptable in the twenty-first century. We cannot wait for the strategy, we must do something about it quickly.

Helen Mary Jones: The Committee would agree with that, Geraint.

Finally, we have a plan for action. The Committee has come forward with its recommendations, and I welcome the Minister's commitment to respond within six months. We are clear on the problem. We now need the Government—here and in Westminster—to take action, and to invest.

Alun Pugh: I want to see a mediocre, second-rate train service running between north and south Wales. My reason for that is

Taran a'r bobl sy'n cyflenwi ei hoffer gan ei bod yn bwysig bod teithwyr yn cael y wybodaeth hon, a hynny yn ddwyieithog?

Helen Mary Jones: Byddai'r Pwyllgor wedi bod yn awyddus i sicrhau bod gwybodaeth ar gael i deithwyr ar ba ffurf bynnag sydd orau ganddynt, boed hynny ar ffurf braille, ar lafar neu yn Gymraeg. Codaf y mater hwnnw gyda'r Gweinidog ar eich rhan.

O ran modelau rheoli, mae angen deddfwriaeth a fydd yn galluogi Llywodraeth Cymru i awgrymu cynigion ar gyfer integreiddio gwasanaethau yn y fath fodd i'r Cynulliad. Ni ddylai neb boeni am y derminoleg. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ein bod yn cyflawni dau nod sef y rheolaeth a'r atebolrwydd lleol democrataidd gorau, a'r integreiddio cenedlaethol mwyaf.

Mae pawb yn amlwg yn gytûn ynglŷn ag un peth: mae ein system drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn draed moch. Mae aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn clywed hanesion arswydus gan Eleanor Burnham yn rheolaidd ynglŷn â'r trenau o'r Gogledd i'r De. Mae'n annioddefol bron gwrando ar yr hyn y mae'n rhaid iddi ei oddef weithiau.

Geraint Davies: Hoffwn eich atgoffa o'r problemau a wyneba trenau Valley Lines. Ymddengys y cânt broblemau enbyd yn feunyddiol. Caiff pobl eu gwasgu i mewn i ddau gerbyd yn unig a rhaid inni ystyried yr agwedd diogelwch ar hynny. Nid yw amodau teithio o'r fath yn dderbyniol yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Ni allwn aros am y strategaeth, rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â hyn yn ddi-oed.

Helen Mary Jones: Byddai'r Pwyllgor yn cytuno â hynny, Geraint.

Yn olaf, mae gennym gynllun gweithredu. Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi cyflwyno ei argymhellion, a chroesawaf ymrwymiad y Gweinidog i ymateb o fewn chwe mis. Mae'r broblem yn amlwg inni. Mae angen bellach i'r Llywodraeth—yma ac yn San Steffan—i weithredu, ac i fuddsoddi.

Alun Pugh: Hoffwn weld gwasanaeth trên cyffredin, eilradd rhwng y Gogledd a'r De. Mae fy rheswm dros ddweud hynny yn un

simple: it would be a huge improvement on what is currently on offer. I accept that we will not achieve excellence in public transport between north and south Wales. If you want excellence, look for the letters DB or SNCF on the side of the train, rather than Wales & Borders. Consistent mediocrity should be our goal.

3.30 p.m.

You need only visit the new regional cinema and entertainment complex in Llandudno Junction to see an example of current practice in the UK. Adjacent to Llandudno Junction railway station there was a large parcel of unused land, on which there used to be a set of railway sidings. Railtrack sold the land to a property company. The new development is hugely popular and thousands of people visit the complex every week. However, they come by car, for the simple reason that there is a large car park adjacent to the complex and the complex cannot be accessed from the railway station. Rail passengers must make a long and dangerous detour, even when it is raining, along a main road to reach the cinema. Railtrack has shown no interest in building a bridge between the station and the brand new complex. If there were a bridge, it would only take 30 seconds to walk from the station to the complex. It would also be a safe journey, as opposed to the current 10-minute trudge across a busy road. However, a short-term fix delivers a larger short-term profit to Railtrack, at the expense of the long-term growth in the number of railway passengers that we all want to see.

Railtrack's myopia on infrastructure is neatly matched by the new Wales & Borders franchise. There is only one direct train from north to south Wales in the morning. This should be a strategic express service, uniting our nation and serving the 0.5 million people who live in north Wales and who might want to travel to our nation's capital for a day of business or leisure. We have a third-world service. I use that term advisedly, as I believe that I am the only Assembly Member who has travelled on the Trans-Siberian Express or on Peruvian railways. At least you can get a cup of tea on Peruvian railways. The Trans-

syml: byddai'n welliant enfawr ar yr hyn a gynigir ar hyn o bryd. Derbynïaf na chawn drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ragorol rhwng y Gogledd a'r De. Os mynnwch wasanaethau rhagorol, edrychwch am y llythrennau DB neu SNCF ar ochr y trêen, yn hytrach na *Wales & Borders*. Dylai gwasanaethau cyffredin cyson fod yn nod inni.

Nid oes ond rhaid ichi ymweld â'r sinema a'r ganolfan adloniant ranbarthol newydd yng Nghyffordd Llandudno i weld enghraifft o'r arfer cyfredol yn y DU. Wrth ymyl gorsaf reilffordd Cyffordd Llandudno, yr oedd darn mawr o dir nas defnyddiwyd, lle y bu cilffyrdd rheilffordd yn gynt. Gwerthodd Railtrack y tir i gwmni eiddo. Mae'r datblygiad newydd yn boblogaidd iawn ac mae miloedd o bobl yn ymweld â'r ganolfan bob wythnos. Fodd bynnag, gyrru yno y maent, am y rheswm syml bod maes parcio mawr wrth ymyl y ganolfan ac na ellir cyrraedd y ganolfan o'r orsaf reilffordd. Rhaid i deithwyr rheilffordd gerdded ar hyd darn hir a pheryglus o'r briffordd, hyd yn oed pan fo'n bwrw glaw, er mwyn cyrraedd y sinema. Nid yw Railtrack wedi dangos unrhyw ddiddordeb mewn codi pont rhwng yr orsaf a'r ganolfan newydd sbon. Pe bai pont, ni fyddai ond yn cymryd 30 eiliad i gerdded o'r orsaf i'r ganolfan. Byddai'n ddiogel i gerddwyr hefyd, yn wahanol i'r daith lafurus o 10 munud y maent yn gorfod ei gwneud ar draws ffordd brysur ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, mae ateb byrdymor yn rhoi elw byrdymor mwy i Railtrack, ar draul y twf hirdymor yn nifer y bobl sy'n teithio ar y rheilffordd yr hoffem oll ei weld.

Caiff diffyg gweledigaeth Railtrack ynglŷn â'r seilwaith ei adlewyrchu'n dda ym masnachfaint newydd *Wales & Borders*. Dim ond un trêen uniongyrchol a ddarperir o'r Gogledd i'r De yn y bore. Dylai hwn fod yn wasanaeth cyflym strategol, sy'n uno ein cenedl ac yn gwasanaethu'r 0.5 miliwn o bobl sy'n byw yn y Gogledd ac a hoffai deithio i brifddinas ein cenedl am ddiwrnod o fusnes neu hamdden. Gwasanaeth trydydd byd sydd gennym. Defnyddiaf y term hwnnw yn ddoeth, gan mai fi yw'r unig Aelod Cynulliad, fe gredaf, sydd wedi teithio ar y Trans-Siberian Express neu ar reilffyrdd ym

Siberian Express makes a few stops, but I believe that the planner for that service must be an economic migrant who has moved to Cardiff, because our so-called express trundles slowly through Cheshire, stopping at every minor halt. It is perfectly possible to get a train from north Wales to Cardiff in three and a half hours, even with a clapped-out train running on obsolete infrastructure. Wales & Borders needs to raise its game and aspire to mediocrity.

David Davies: As some Members know, over the last year I have been conducting informal research—at my own expense, incidentally—into the public transport system of several German and Hungarian cities. Following on from Alun Pugh's comments, I admit that standards in Wales and across the UK are pretty poor. There are no easy answers as to why this is, despite what many politicians would have us believe. The Conservative Party points, with some justification, to the lack of direction from Labour over the past four years. 'Chronic under-investment during the Tory years', is the usual reply from Labour, hoping that endlessly repeating this tired mantra, as Brian Gibbons is doing now, will let it off the hook. It is even included in the second recommendation in the final report.

In fairness, Richard Edwards came closer to the heart of the problem. If we are honest, this problem dates back to the late 1950s and the early 1960s, when rising standards of living in this country led to a huge growth in car ownership. Since then, there has been a general trend towards more expenditure on roads at the expense of support for public transport. That went on under successive Conservative and Labour Governments. This has led to a cycle that is difficult to break. As more people use cars, fewer people use trains and buses, which means that there are fewer services, which then encourages more people to use cars. As Richard said, this has been going on for more than half a century.

Mheriw. O leiaf gallwch brynu cwpanaid o de ar y rheilffordd ym Mheriw. Mae'r Trans-Siberian Express yn stopio ychydig o weithiau, ond rhaid mai mudwr economaidd sydd wedi symud i Gaerdydd yw'r sawl a gynlluniodd y gwasanaeth hwnnw, am fod y trên cyflym honedig sydd gennym ni yn ymlwybro'n araf drwy Sir Gaer, gan stopio ym mhob arosfa fach. Mae'n bosibl i drên o'r Gogledd i Gaerdydd gyrraedd mewn tair awr a hanner, hyd yn oed ar drên wedi darford amdano yn rhedeg ar seilwaith hynafol. Mae angen i *Wales & Borders* godi ei safonau ac anelu at ddarparu gwasanaeth didda ddiddrwyg.

David Davies: Fel y gŵyr rhai Aelodau, yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yr wyf wedi bod yn gwneud ymchwil anffurfiol—ar fy nghost fy hun, gyda llaw—i'r system drafndiaeth gyhoeddus mewn sawl dinas yn yr Almaen a Hwngari. Yn dilyn sylwadau Alun Pugh, rhaid imi gyfaddef mae gwael ar y cyfan yw safonau yng Nghymru ac ar draws y DU. Nid oes atebion hawdd i egluro pam, er gwaethaf yr hyn y mae llawer o wleidyddion am inni ei gredu. Noda'r Blaid Geidwadol y diffyg cyfeiriad o ran Llafur yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf, gyda rhywfaint o gyfiawnhad. 'Diffyg buddsoddi hirdymor o dan y Torïaid' yw ateb arferol Llafur, gan obeithio y caiff ddihangfa os bydd yn rhygnu ar yr un tant, fel y gwna Brian Gibbons yn awr. Caiff ei gynnwys hyd yn oed yn ail argymhelliad yr adroddiad terfynol.

Chwarae teg i Richard Edwards, daeth ef yn agosach at hanfod y broblem. Os ydym yn onest, mae'r broblem hon yn dyddio yn ôl i ddiwedd y 1950au a dechrau'r 1960au, pan welwyd twf enfawr yn nifer y bobl a oedd yn berchen ar geir yn sgîl y cynnydd yn safonau byw yn y wlad hon. Ers hynny, bu tuedd i wario mwy ar ffyrdd a hynny ar draul trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Digwyddodd hynny o dan gyfres o Lywodraethau Ceidwadol a Llafur, gan greu cylch sy'n anodd ei dorri. Wrth i fwy a mwy o bobl ddefnyddio eu ceir, mae llai a llai o bobl yn defnyddio trenau a bysiau, sy'n golygu bod llai o wasanaethau, ac mae hynny yn ei dro yn annog mwy o bobl i ddefnyddio eu ceir. Fel y dywed Richard, mae hyn wedi bod yn digwydd ers hanner canrif a mwy.

There is consensus in the Committee, despite what some Members will have you believe. We all agree that we should try to reverse this cycle and encourage people to get out of their cars and on to buses and trains. This review could form part of the solution, because it contains worthwhile suggestions. However, I am worried about the emphasis in the overall transport strategy on sticks rather than carrots to get motorists out of their cars. Car drivers should not be seen as the problem. Yet, all too often, we see the Government using and developing measures that will price the motorists off the road without giving them a real alternative.

There are 22 recommendations in the report. Much as I would like to, I fear that I will not be able to mention more than a few. Several recommendations relate directly to the railways, some of which would involve giving extra powers to the Assembly. I would not be able to support that. In any case, the future of the railways is currently bleak, and it will be quite difficult to discuss whether or not some of those recommendations can even be implemented until we know what the future holds for the railways. The Government's decision to effectively bankrupt Railtrack makes future private investment, which the chairman of this Committee said was important, highly unlikely. All I can say is that, never again should Ministers seek to turn something as important as our railway system into a political football. [*Laughter.*]

You can all laugh. If anyone wants to intervene, I would be happy to take a constructive intervention.

Alun Pugh: Can you tell us which is the easier process—taking an integrated unit and smashing it into 100 pieces, or getting 100 ill co-ordinated pieces back together to work again?

David Davies: The integrated units—I believe you are talking about British Rail, which was never terribly popular—since privatisation saw an enormous amount of private money going in, and an improvement in services, which was going on until your

Mae'r Pwyllgor yn gytûn, er gwaethaf yr hyn y mae rhai Aelodau am ichi ei gredu. Yr ydym oll yn gytûn y dylem geisio gwyrddroi'r cylch hwn ac annog pobl i beidio â defnyddio eu ceir ac i deithio ar fysiau a threnau. Gallai'r adolygiad hwn fod yn rhan o'r ateb, am ei fod yn cynnwys awgrymiadau da. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf ynglŷn â'r pwyslais yn y strategaeth drafnidiaeth gyffredinol ar gosbi modurwyr am ddefnyddio eu ceir yn hytrach na'u darbwyllo i beidio â'u defnyddio. Ni ddylid ystyried gyrwyr ceir yn broblem. Ac eto, yn rhy aml, gwelwn y Llywodraeth yn defnyddio ac yn datblygu mesurau a fydd yn atal modurwyr rhag gyrru oherwydd y gost heb sicrhau bod dulliau teithio amgen ar gael iddynt.

Mae 22 o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad hwn. Ofnaf na fydd modd imi grybwyll ond ychydig ohonynt, gwaetha'r modd. Mae nifer o argymhellion yn ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â'r rheilffyrdd, y mae rhai ohonynt yn golygu rhoi pwerau ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad. Ni allwn gefnogi hynny. Sut bynnag, mae'n edrych yn ddu ar y rheilffyrdd ar hyn o bryd, a bydd yn eithaf anodd trafod a fydd modd hyd yn oed weithredu rhai o'r argymhellion hynny hyd nes y cawn wybod beth yw dyfodol y rheilffyrdd. Yn sgîl penderfyniad y Llywodraeth i yrru Railtrack i'r wal i bob diben, mae'n annhebygol iawn y cawn fuddsoddiad preifat yn y dyfodol, sy'n bwysig yn ôl geiriau cadeirydd y Pwyllgor hwn. Y cyfan sydd gennyf ei ddweud yw ni ddylai Gweinidogion byth eto geisio troi rhywbeth mor bwysig â'n system reilffyrdd yn gêm wleidyddol. [*Chwerthin.*]

Cewch chwerthin. Os hoffai unrhyw un ymyrryd, byddaf yn fwy na pharod i dderbyn ymyriad adeiladol.

Alun Pugh: A allwch chi ddweud wrthym beth sydd hawsaf—chwalu uned integredig yn 100 o ddarnau, neu roi 100 o ddarnau digyswllt yn ôl at ei gilydd i weithio eto?

David Davies: Ers preifateiddio buddsoddwyd cryn dipyn o arian preifat i'r unedau integredig—credaf mai sôn am British Rail yr ydych, na fu erioed yn boblogaidd iawn—a gwelwyd gwelliant yn y gwasanaethau, a oedd yn parhau nes i'ch

Government started to undermine it. Let us not pretend that privatisation is a problem, because the Labour Party has wholeheartedly embraced it.

Rod Richards: When you were being shown the roads in Hungary, was your driver using a gear stick or was she on automatic?

David Davies: I will tell you later.

We also await with interest the outcome of the PTA proposals, but instinctively believe that strengthening regional consortia, which are currently run by local authorities, will provide a better, more stable basis for improving transport.

Bus lanes are mentioned throughout the original report. In certain circumstances they may work. However, all too often they make congestion worse. If you want a good example, look at what is happening in Newport, where the bus lane system is a shambles. I have seen the traffic backed up so far sometimes, that the buses cannot get onto the bus lanes. If the local authorities want to bring in bus lanes, they should be audited regularly to ensure that they are working properly.

Rosemary Butler: I wonder how long it is since you travelled on a bus in my constituency. The bus service there is excellent. It is hoped that more people will have the opportunity to ride on buses and get to work on time, without being clogged up in traffic jams.

David Davies: It is a long time since I caught a bus in your constituency, and I would not be tempted to do it while the buses are stuck in the same congestion as all the cars.

There are some perfectly reasonable aspects to this report. I would certainly support feasibility studies into light rail schemes, and encouraging local authority transport planners to explore what works around the country would also be sensible. It might have prevented the problem with the bus lane that we have just been talking about. Piloting

Llywodraeth chi ddechrau ei danseilio. Gadewch inni beidio â chymryd arnom mai preifateiddio yw'r broblem am fod y Blaid Lafur yn ei gefnogi i'r carn bellach.

Rod Richards: Pan welsoch y ffyrdd yn Hwngari, ai defnyddio ffon newid gêr oedd eich gyrwraig ynteu'n gyrru'n awtomatig?

David Davies: Dywedaf wrthyh yn nes ymlaen.

Disgwyliwn yn eiddgar hefyd am ganlyniad y cynigion ar gyfer Awdurdod Trafnidiaeth Teithwyr, ond credaf yn reddfodl mai atgyfnerthu'r consortia rhanbarthol, a redir gan yr awdurdodau lleol ar hyn o bryd, fydd yn sail well, fwy sefydlog dros wella trafndiaeth.

Crybwyllir lonydd bysiau drwy gydol yr adroddiad gwreiddiol. Gallant weithio o dan rai amgylchiadau. Fodd bynnag, yn llawer rhy aml maent yn creu mwy o dagfeydd. Am enghraifft dda edrychwch ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghasnewydd, lle mae'r system lonydd bysiau yn gawlach. Yr wyf wedi gweld tagfeydd mor hir weithiau fel nad oes modd i fysiau gyrraedd y lonydd bysiau. Os hoffai awdurdodau lleol gyflwyno lonydd bysiau, dylent gael eu harchwilio'n rheolaidd i sicrhau eu bod yn gweithio.

Rosemary Butler: Tybed pryd yr oedd y tro diwethaf ichi deithio ar fws yn fy etholaeth i. Mae'r gwasanaeth bysiau yn rhagorol yno. Y gobaith yw y caiff mwy o bobl gyfle i deithio ar fysiau a chyrraedd y gwaith yn brydlon, heb orfod dioddef tagfeydd traffig.

David Davies: Mae'n amser maith ers imi ddal bws yn eich etholaeth chi, ac ni fyddwn wedi fy nhemtio i wneud hynny tra bod bysiau yn cael eu dal yn yr un tagfeydd â cheir.

Mae rhai agweddau hollol resymol ar yr adroddiad hwn. Yn sicr yr wyf o blaid gwneud astudiaethau ymarferoldeb o gynlluniau rheilffyrdd ysgafn, a byddai annog cynllunwyr trafndiaeth awdurdodau lleol i ymchwilio i'r hyn sy'n llwyddo mewn gwahanol rannau o'r wlad yn gwneud synnwyr hefyd. Efallai y byddai hynny wedi

information centres is an excellent idea, and I wonder how far we could take this. For example, I represent a rural constituency where the bus service is regular but infrequent. Given how IT is developing, I wonder whether it would be possible for people who want to catch a bus to log on to a computer and find out where the bus is so that they are not waiting too long for it.

Labour's transport policy reminds me of a train in the days of British Rail—late, expensive and going in the wrong direction anyway. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh'.] That was better than any of Alun Pugh's jokes. The motion merely asks us to note the policy review on public transport. Since nobody wishes to ignore it, we can quite happily vote in favour of noting the review without necessarily agreeing with all the suggestions contained therein.

3.40 p.m.

John Griffiths: Quite a lot of common ground has come through in Committee deliberations and, to some extent, in this debate. Everybody agrees that we need to take a huge step forward in terms of improving public transport in Britain and in Wales. This requires major resources, and therein lies the difficulty. There is a general consensus that it is the only way forward to radically improve public transport and to get people back onto our buses and trains. We could quote plenty of examples: one, no doubt close to Peter Law's heart, is the re-establishment of a passenger rail link between Newport and Ebbw Vale. That illustrates public transport's economic importance because it would be a two-way benefit for Ebbw Vale if we could do that. It is a matter of encouraging industry to base itself in Ebbw Vale while making it easier for people to travel from Ebbw Vale to work in Newport and other areas. There is great economic significance in improving public transport as one part of infrastructure improvement in Wales.

Air transport is another good example. It has

atal y broblem o ran y lonydd bysiau yr ydym newydd sôn amdanynt. Mae cynlluniau peilot ar gyfer canolfannau gwybodaeth yn syniad ardderchog. Tybed i ba raddau y gellid datblygu hynny. Er enghraifft, yr wyf yn cynrychioli etholaeth wledig lle mae'r gwasanaeth bysiau yn gyson, ond nid yw'n fynych. O ystyried y ffordd y mae TG yn datblygu, tybed a fyddai modd i bobl sydd am ddal bws logio i mewn i gyfrifiadur i wybod lle mae'r bws fel nad ydynt yn gorfod aros yn rhy hir amdano.

Mae polisi trafnidiaeth Llafur yn fy atgoffa o drên yn nyddiau British Rail—yn hwyr, yn ddrud ac yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir sut bynnag. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'.] Yr oedd hynny yn rhagori ar unrhyw jôc gan Alun Pugh. Nid yw'r cynnig ond yn gofyn inni nodi'r adolygiad polisi o drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Gan nad oes neb am ei anwybyddu, mae pob rhyddid inni bleidleisio o blaid nodi'r adolygiad heb gytuno ar bob un o'r awgrymiadau sydd ynddo o reidrwydd.

John Griffiths: Mae cryn gytundeb wedi dod i'r golwg yn ystod trafodaethau'r Pwyllgor ac yn y ddadl hon, i ryw raddau. Mae pawb yn gytûn bod angen inni gymryd cam enfawr ymlaen i wella trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ym Mhrydain ac yng Nghymru. Bydd hyn yn gofyn am lawer o adnoddau, a dyna'r anhawster. Mae pawb yn gytûn yn gyffredinol mai dyna'r unig ffordd ymlaen i wella trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn sylweddol a darbwylllo pobl i ddefnyddio bysiau a threnau unwaith eto. Gellid dyfynnu digon o enghreifftiau: un enghraifft, sy'n agos at galon Peter Law, mae'n siŵr, yw ailagor cyswllt rheilffordd i deithwyr rhwng Casnewydd a Glynabwy. Dengys hynny bwysigrwydd economaidd trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus oherwydd byddai mantais ddeufin i Lynebwy pe gallem wneud hynny. Mae'n fater o annog diwydiannau i leoli yng Nglynabwy tra'n ei gwneud yn haws i bobl deithio o Lynebwy i weithio yng Nghasnewydd ac mewn ardaloedd eraill. Mae arwyddocâd economaidd mawr i wella trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus fel rhan o wella seilwaith yng Nghymru.

Mae trafnidiaeth awyr yn enghraifft dda arall.

been mentioned here often that great improvements in terms of accessibility to Cardiff International Airport would have great economic benefit. Much is happening on that front and we must build on it and take it forward as quickly as possible. I repeatedly hear from businessmen that better accessibility to the airport, combined with a greater number of services to the European capitals, would have a major, beneficial economic impact on Wales.

I also emphasise the report's valuable commitment to community transport. In many of our disadvantaged communities—the Valleys communities are a prime example—there is low car-ownership and a greater reliance on public transport. Unfortunately, especially since bus deregulation, there have been great problems in having an adequate bus service in those disadvantaged communities. Further developing and improving community transporting would be of great benefit to those communities. I do not know if it might benefit groups in my constituency such as Disabled Open Opportunities Ringland Social. This is a group that meets regularly; it organises trips and various events. It has been reliant on a local organisation called Shopmobility, which has provided transport for people from their homes to meetings and out and about. That is no longer possible from the middle of this month. It is vital for these people, who would be alone in their homes if this service was not available. It is something we could consider in terms of developing community transport. Groups such as this, which has rapidly grown to around 40 members in only seven months, should have greater support in terms of community transport. I wonder if we could consider developing community transport to the extent that it would be available to groups such as these in my constituency.

Janet Davies: All Members want high-quality public transport: achieving it is the difficult part. Effort has been put into improving public transport over many years, but with little result. The comparison between the eighties and the nineties in the report shows a worsening position. However, we must be fair and say that even Conservative bus policies—greatly mistaken

Sonnir yn aml yma y byddai buddiannau economaidd mawr pe gellid sicrhau bod Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd yn llawer haws ei gyrraedd. Mae llawer ar y gweill o ran hynny a rhaid inni adeiladu ar hyn a'i ddatblygu mor gyflym â phosibl. Dywed dynion busnes wrthyf dro ar ôl tro y byddai maes awyr mwy hygyrch, ynghyd â rhagor o wasanaethau i brifddinasoedd Ewrop, yn fanteisiol iawn yn economaidd i Gymru.

Pwysleisïaf hefyd yr ymrwymiad gwerthfawr yn yr adroddiad i drafnidiaeth gymunedol. Mewn llawer o'n cymunedau difreintiedig—mae cymunedau'r Cymoedd yn enghraifft amlwg—nifer fach o bobl sy'n berchen ar geir ac maent yn dibynnu'n fwy ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Yn anffodus, yn enwedig ers dadreoleiddio gwasanaethau bysiau, cafwyd problemau mawr o ran darparu gwasanaeth bws digonol i'r cymunedau difreintiedig hynny. Byddai datblygu a gwella trafnidiaeth gymunedol o fudd mawr i'r cymunedau hynny. Ni wn a fyddai grwpiau yn fy etholaeth megis clwb cymdeithasol Ringland Cyfleoedd Agored i'r Anabl yn elwa ar hyn. Mae'r grŵp hwn yn cwrdd yn rheolaidd; mae'n trefnu teithiau a digwyddiadau gwahanol. Bu'n dibynnu ar sefydliad lleol o'r enw *Shopmobility*, a fu'n cludo pobl o'u cartrefi i gyfarfodydd ac yma a thraw. Nid oedd modd parhau â hynny o ganol y mis hwn. Mae'n hanfodol i'r bobl hyn, a fyddai ar eu pennau eu hunain yn eu cartrefi pe na bai'r gwasanaeth hwn ar gael. Mae'n rhywbeth y gallwn ei ystyried o ran datblygu trafnidiaeth gymunedol. Dylai grwpiau o'r fath, sydd wedi cynyddu'n gyflym i 40 o aelodau mewn saith mis yn unig, gael rhagor o gefnogaeth o ran trafnidiaeth gymunedol. Tybed a allwn ystyried datblygu trafnidiaeth gymunedol i'r fath raddau fel y byddai ar gael i grwpiau megis y grwpiau hyn yn fy etholaeth i.

Janet Davies: Mae pob Aelod am weld trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus o safon uchel: gwireddu hynny yw'r peth anodd. Bu ymdrech i wella trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ers blyneddau maith, ond heb fawr o lwyddiant. Dengys y gymhariaeth yn yr adroddiad rhwng yr wythdegau a'r nawdegau fod y sefyllfa wedi gwaethygu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod yn deg a dweud bod hyd yn

though they were—may have been intended to improve the bus services that had been going downhill before Mrs Thatcher got her teeth into them. However, it defies belief that the running-down and privatisation of the rail services had any good intentions.

Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales believes that the National Assembly can and should take on the leadership and strategic roles, working with local authorities, which can deliver local strategies and services. Trying to work within local authorities' discrete boundaries would be difficult. Therefore the steps that they have taken to assemble as regional groupings are welcome. Looking back, there have been occasions when local government-generated partnerships have fallen apart, and one or more partners have pulled out. Therefore, in Plaid Cymru's view, the National Assembly should take the lead.

We must also acknowledge that the positive schemes already set up by local government cost a great deal of money, and they have a strong case for assistance from the National Assembly budget.

On concessionary fares, when Taff Ely Borough Council instituted free buss passes and 50 per cent discounts for the over-60s in 1995, with free travel for the over-75s, it was expensive, even though it was only operated in Mid Glamorgan. I well remember the difficulty we had in finding adequate financing, and the battle with the then Conservative administration in Wales as to whether it could be legally justified.

John Griffiths mentioned community transport, and it is important that concessionary fares are extended to community transport. However, that will not be easy. People who are unable to reach bus stops or train stations on foot need that help.

Finally, we must ensure that through-ticketing and enough buses to meet demand—which is certainly a problem for

oed polisïau'r Ceidwadwyr ynglŷn â gwasanaethau bysiau—er mor gyfeiliornus oeddent—â'r bwriad o wella gwasanaethau bysiau a oedd yn dirywio cyn i Mrs Thatcher fynd i'r afael â hwy. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anodd credu bod gan y Torïaid unrhyw fwriadau da wrth wanhau a phreifateiddio gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd.

Cred Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales y gall, ac y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol arwain ac ymgymryd â rôl strategol yn hyn o beth, gan gydweithio â'r awdurdodau lleol, a all gyflwyno strategaethau a gwasanaethau lleol. Byddai'n anodd ceisio gweithio o fewn ffiniau penodol awdurdodau lleol. Felly croesawn y camau a gymeradwywyd ganddynt i gynnull grwpiau rhanbarthol. O edrych yn ôl, bu adegau pan chwalodd partneriaethau a grëwyd gan lywodraeth leol, a phan dynnodd un neu fwy o'r partneriaid yn ôl. Felly mae Plaid Cymru o'r farn y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gymryd yr awenau yn hyn o beth.

Rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod bod y cynlluniau cadarnhaol a sefydlwyd eisoes gan lywodraeth leol yn costio llawer o arian, ac mae dadl gref dros roi cymorth o gyllideb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol iddynt.

O ran tocynnau mantais bws, pan sefydlodd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Taf Elai docynnau bysiau am ddim a gostyngiad o 50 y cant i bobl dros 60 mlwydd oed yn 1995, a theithio am ddim i bobl dros 75 mlwydd oed, yr oedd yn gostus, er mai dim ond ym Morgannwg Ganol y cafodd ei weithredu. Cofiaf yn dda yr anhawster a gawsom i ddod o hyd i arian digonol a'r frwydr gyda'r weinyddiaeth Geidwadol yng Nghymru ar y pryd ynghylch a ellid ei gyfiawnhau'n gyfreithiol ai peidio.

Crybwyllodd John Griffiths drafndiaeth gymunedol, ac mae'n bwysig y caiff tocynnau mantais bws eu hymestyn i drafndiaeth gymunedol. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd hynny yn hawdd. Mae angen y cymorth hwnnw ar bobl nad ydynt yn gallu cyrraedd arosfeydd bysiau a gorsafoedd rheilffordd ar droed.

Yn olaf, rhaid inni sicrhau bod tocynnau taith gyfan a digon o fysiau ar gael i ateb y galw—sy'n broblem yn sicr i bobl ym mhen uchaf

people in the Upper Afan Valley—are in place. Buses are not only often full, with standing room only, but people are left behind at bus stops because of lack of room. The lack of through-ticketing down the valley means that people with little money must pay more for their bus fares than should otherwise be the case. This is an example that highlights the difficulties of monitoring and achieving our aims in terms of public transport.

Eleanor Burnham: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this report and its recommendations, and we share the Committee's vision of integrated, accessible and affordable public transport in Wales. I feel that I have waited all my life to join the National Assembly's Environment, Transport and Planning Committee to discuss the effects of the Babbie report on north-south links. We need to move from the dark ages to the twenty-first century. I know that under the Minister's leadership that will probably happen soon. I have a vision of opening Rossett station, and even a more fanciful vision of reopening the Beeching-shut Barmouth to Ruabon line, which would probably increase tourism and assist economic development in that part of Wales. There is no need to go to Siberia or Peru. I cannot think of a more delightful train journey than that between Barmouth and Ruabon. It is fantastic.

Unlike Scotland, the Assembly has no formal powers to direct the Strategic Rail Authority, and we are only consultees in the franchise process. We have consistently argued for the Assembly to have the power to direct the SRA and to appoint a representative. These points were included in the partnership agreement. It is therefore welcome that the Committee's report recommends that the Minister for Environment seeks power of direction for the National Assembly with regard to the SRA, and seeks the right for the National Assembly to nominate a member of the SRA. With the demise of Railtrack, it is essential that Wales is represented on any successor body, and we agree with the Committee's recommendation that the Assembly should seek to ensure that that

Cwm Afan. Mae bysiau nid yn unig yn llawn yn aml, gyda lle i sefyll yn unig, ond caiff pobl eu gadael ar yr arosfa am nad oes digon o le. Mae diffyg tocynnau taith gyfan i lawr y cwm yn golygu bod yn rhaid i bobl nad oes ganddynt lawer o arian dalu mwy am eu tocynnau bysiau nag y dylent fel arall. Mae hon yn enghraifft sy'n amlygu anawsterau monitro a chyflawni ein nodau o ran trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn a'i argymhellion, a rhannwn weledigaeth y Pwyllgor ar gyfer trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig, hygyrch a fforddiadwy yng Nghymru. Teimlaf fy mod wedi aros ar hyd fy oes i ymuno â Phwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a Chynllunio yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i drafod effaith adroddiad Babbie ar y cysylltiadau rhwng y gogledd a'r de. Mae angen inni symud o'r oesoedd tywyll i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. Gwn y bydd hynny yn digwydd yn fuan mae'n siŵr o dan arweiniad y Gweinidog. Yn fy nychymyg gallaf weld fy hun yn agor gorsaf yr Orsedd Goch, neu hyd yn oed y llinell rhwng Abermo a Rhiwabon a gaewyd gan Beeching. Byddai hynny yn fwy na thebyg yn cynyddu nifer yr ymwelwyr ac yn helpu datblygiad economaidd yn y rhan honno o Gymru. Nid oes angen mynd i Siberia na Pheriw. Nid oes taith drên fwy dymunol na'r daith rhwng Abermo a Rhiwabon yn fy marn i. Mae'n wych.

Yn wahanol i'r Alban, nid oes gan y Cynulliad unrhyw bwerau ffurfiol i gyfarwyddo'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, a dim ond ymgynghori â ni ynglŷn â'r broses fasnachfaint a wna. Yr ydym wedi dadlau'n gyson o blaid rhoi'r pŵer i'r Cynulliad gyfarwyddo'r Awdurdod ac i benodi cynrychiolydd. Mae'r pwyntiau hyn yn y cytundeb partneriaeth. Felly croesawn y ffaith bod adroddiad y Pwyllgor yn argymhell y dylai'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd fynnu'r pŵer i'r Cynulliad gyfarwyddo'r Awdurdod, a mynnu'r hawl i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol enwebu aelod o'r Awdurdod. Ar ôl tranc Railtrack, mae'n hanfodol bod Cymru yn cael ei chynrychioli ar unrhyw gorff olynol, a chytunwn ag argymhellion y Pwyllgor y dylai'r Cynulliad geisio sicrhau

happens.

The report makes it clear that the National Assembly must secure a significant investment from its own resources, or from the Westminster Government, along with private sector investment, if the vision of an integrated, accessible and affordable public transport system in Wales is to be realised. Quality public transport is essential in terms of provision for those who do not have access to cars, many of whom, such as pensioners and the disabled, tend to be the most vulnerable in society. It is also essential in terms of reducing the impact of cars on the environment and reducing congestion in urban areas. The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the recommendation that the Minister for Environment should develop proposals for organisational change, and, in particular, develop a passenger transport authority, the main advantage of which would be to increase direct control over public transport provision throughout Wales. It would also give the Assembly the ability to fulfil its vision of an integrated, accessible and affordable transport system.

3.50 p.m.

Owen John Thomas: I welcome the Committee's report. However, I have two concerns. First, it is now two and a half years since we first called upon authorities to provide a rail service linking north and south Wales, from Holyhead, through Wrexham to Cardiff. The complaints about rail services are legendary. In October, Helen Mary Jones and I experienced a five and a half-hour journey when we returned after a meeting from Colwyn Bay to Cardiff. That is atrocious. We have been promised a service that will provide three or four return journeys a day, taking three and a half hours from Cardiff to Holyhead, and two hours to Wrexham. Cardiff is the capital city of Wales and it houses many of our national institutions. Access to those institutions is the birthright of everyone living in Wales. They should be easily and comfortably accessible. A two hour trip to Wrexham for example, if there were three services a day, would enable people to come to Cardiff, do their business and return. They could also visit an

bod hynny yn digwydd.

Eglura'r adroddiad fod yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol sicrhau buddsoddiad sylweddol o'i adnoddau ei hun, neu o Lywodraeth San Steffan ochr yn ochr â'r buddsoddiad gan y sector preifat, er mwyn gwireddu gweledigaeth o system trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig, hygyrch a fforddiadwy yng Nghymru. Mae trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus o safon yn hanfodol i ddarparu ar gyfer y rhai nad ydynt yn berchen ar geir, y mae llawer ohonynt, megis pensiynwyr neu'r anabl, yn tueddu i fod ymhlith y mwyaf diamddiffyn mewn cymdeithas. Mae'n hanfodol hefyd o ran lleihau effaith ceir ar yr amgylchedd a lleihau tagfeydd mewn ardaloedd trefol. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r argymhelliaid y dylai'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ddatblygu cynigion ar gyfer newid trefniadol, ac, yn enwedig, datblygu awdurdod trafnidiaeth teithwyr. Prif fantais hynny fyddai gwell rheolaeth uniongyrchol dros ddarpariaeth trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ledled Cymru. Byddai hefyd yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i wireddu ei weledigaeth ar gyfer system drafnidiaeth integredig, hygyrch a fforddiadwy.

Owen John Thomas: Croesawaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf ddau bryder. Yn gyntaf, mae dwy flynedd a hanner wedi mynd heibio ers inni alw ar yr awdurdodau i ddarparu gwasanaeth rheilffordd sy'n cysylltu'r gogledd a'r de, o Gaerdydd, drwy Wrexham i Gaerdydd. Mae'r cwynion ynglŷn â'r gwasanaethau rheilffordd yn ddiamhebol. Ym mis Hydref, cymerodd bum awr a hanner i Helen Mary Jones a minnau ddychwelyd i Gaerdydd o gyfarfod ym Mae Colwyn. Mae hynny yn ofnadwy. Addawyd inni wasanaeth a fyddai'n darparu tair neu bedair taith ddwyffordd y dydd, gan gymryd tair awr a hanner o Gaerdydd i Gaerdydd, a dwy awr i Wrexham. Prifddinas Cymru yw Caerdydd. Mae'n gartref i lawer o'n sefydliadau cenedlaethol. Mae cael ymweld â'r sefydliadau hynny yn enedigaeth-fraint i bawb sy'n byw yng Nghymru. Dylent fod yn hawdd ac yn hwylus eu cyrraedd. Pe bai gwasanaeth dwy awr o Wrexham, er enghraifft, deirgwaith y dydd byddai modd i bobl ddod i Gaerdydd, ymgymryd â'u busnes

institution. If Cardiff were accessible, there would be less Cardiff phobia and less complaints about Cardiff getting this and that. As Assembly Members, it is our duty to ensure that that happens, not in the distant future, but soon.

My second concern is about the service from the Valleys to Cardiff. The Valleys, Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan have a population of 1 million and the region has great potential for economic development. If we were to provide a hybrid, light rail service from the Valleys to Cardiff and the Vale, we would drive modernity into the Valleys. We would unify a compact region of 1 million people and mobilise the region's critical mass. That would reap the benefit of a large market with a concentration of talents, facilities and environmental diversity.

Geraint Davies: Owen, you mentioned the importance of trains coming from the Valleys to Cardiff, but it is also important that people from Cardiff go up to the Valleys.

Owen John Thomas: I am coming to that point. Nothing would more effectively bring about the modernisation of the Valleys, and open them up for development, than a modern rail service. It would be similar to the M4, which serves as a corridor for economic growth. Such a rail service would provide a conduit for business to develop and to attract cultural institutions. Cardiff is campaigning to be the European Capital of Culture. It cannot do that without the support of areas such as the Valleys and the Vale. A rail service would unite this area and would give Wales an economic centre, which could drive the economy of the whole country.

I read in *The Western Mail* this morning about people taking three and a half hours to travel from Aberdare to Cardiff. Three and a half hours to travel 20 miles! Alun Pugh is right, it is a third-world service. It is on the doorstep of the capital city and as a National Assembly, we should be ashamed of it. We must act swiftly and press for changes. Objective 1 funding is available where economic and social benefit would accrue. I am sure this would be the case. This single

a dychwelyd. Gallent hefyd ymweld ag un o'r sefydliadau. Pe bai Caerdydd yn gyfleus, byddai llai o ragfarn yn ei herbyn a llai o gwynion bod Caerdydd yn cael hyn a'r llall. Fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, mae dyletswydd arnom i sicrhau bod hynny yn digwydd, nid yn y dyfodol pell, ond yn fuan.

Mae fy ail bryder yn ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth o'r Cymoedd i Gaerdydd. Mae 1 filiwn o bobl yn byw yn y Cymoedd, Caerdydd a Bro Morgannwg ac mae gan y rhanbarth botensial mawr o ran datblygu economaidd. Pe baem yn darparu gwasanaeth rheilffordd ysgafn, cymysg o'r Cymoedd i Gaerdydd a'r Fro, byddai hynny yn fodd inni foderneiddio'r Cymoedd. Byddem yn uno rhanbarth cryno ei ffiniau, sy'n cynnwys 1 filiwn o bobl, gan ddefnyddio poblogaeth y rhanbarth. Byddai hynny'n manteisio ar farchnad fawr lle y crynhoir doniau, cyfleusterau ac amrywiaeth amgylcheddol.

Geraint Davies: Owen, bu ichi sôn am bwysigrwydd darparu trenau o'r Cymoedd i Gaerdydd, ond mae'n bwysig hefyd bod pobl o Gaerdydd yn mynd i'r Cymoedd.

Owen John Thomas: Dof at y pwynt hwnnw. Ni fyddai dim yn moderneiddio'r Cymoedd, a'u hagog i ddatblygiad, yn fwy na gwasanaeth rheilffordd modern. Byddai'n debyg i'r M4, sy'n goridor ar gyfer twf economaidd. Byddai gwasanaeth rheilffordd yn gyfrwng i fusnesau datblygu a denu sefydliadau diwylliannol. Mae Caerdydd yn ymgyrchu i fod yn Brifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop. Ni all wneud hynny heb gefnogaeth ardaloedd megis y Cymoedd a'r Fro. Byddai gwasanaeth rheilffordd yn uno'r ardal hon ac yn rhoi canolfan economaidd i Gymru, a allai yrru economi'r wlad gyfan.

Darllenais yn *The Western Mail* y bore yma am bobl sy'n cymryd tair awr a hanner i deithio o Aberdâr i Gaerdydd. Tair awr a hanner i deithio 20 milltir! Mae Alun Pugh yn llygad ei le. Gwasanaeth trydydd byd ydyw. Mae ar garreg drws y brifddinas ac fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, dylem gywilyddo dros hynny. Rhaid inni weithredu'n gyflym a phwyso am newidiadau. Mae arian Amcan 1 ar gael lle y gellid sicrhau manteision economaidd a chymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn siŵr

franchise with Objective 1 offers a unique opportunity. I call on the Minister for Environment to bring local authorities together and lobby the Strategic Rail Authority to ensure that there will be improvements to the service between north and south Wales and between the Valleys and Cardiff without further delay.

Richard Edwards: I thank everyone who has contributed to the debate. Public transport policy is at last emerging from the shadows and climbing up the political agenda; and not before time. However, as many speakers have pointed out, we have much ground to make up. We must remember that the different modes should not be seen in isolation. Transport in the round impacts on every key policy priority, such as health and education, and also on our cross-cutting objectives of sustainable development and equality of opportunity. The Minister mentioned the valuable work that she is already pioneering, and her proactive approach and obvious commitment to the agenda are welcome. Our report's recommendations will mean a great deal more work for her and her officials. I am grateful to her for indicating that she will pursue those recommendations with gusto.

I thank Helen Mary Jones for her kind words. Inclusive politics—I can hardly hear myself speaking above the din of the Conservatives—can be made to work. We should not necessarily be defensive about that. This is one issue where there is almost unanimous agreement that our powers are insufficient. How can you have an integrated transport system when the administrative arrangements are not integrated?

Alun Pugh, Eleanor Burnham and Owen John Thomas mentioned the lack of integration between north and south Wales and that is well documented. It will be of little consolation to those Members who travel back and forth from west Wales.

Peter Law: I congratulate you and the Committee on your excellent work. I was pleased to read about strengthening the consortia and the excellent job that the local

y byddai hyn yn wir yn yr achos hwn. Mae'r fasnachfaint unigol hon ynghyd ag Amcan 1 yn gyfle unigryw. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd i ddod â'r awdurdodau lleol ynghyd a lobio'r Awdurdod Rheilffordd Strategol i sicrhau y caiff y gwasanaeth rhwng y gogledd a'r de a rhwng y Cymoedd a Chaerdydd ei wella yn ddioed.

Richard Edwards: Diolchaf i bawb a gyfrannodd i'r ddadl. O'r diwedd mae polisi ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn dod i'r golwg o'r cysgodion ac yn codi ar yr agenda wleidyddol; ac mae'n hen bryd i hynny ddigwydd. Fodd bynnag, fel y nododd llawer o'r siaradwyr, mae tipyn o dir inni ei adennill. Rhaid inni gofio na ddylid ystyried y gwahanol ddulliau yn annibynnol. Mae trafnidiaeth yn ei holl agweddau yn effeithio ar bob blaenoriaeth bolisi allweddol, megis iechyd ac addysg, a hefyd ein hamcanion trawsbynciol sef datblygu cynaliadwy a chyfle cyfartal. Crybwyllodd y Gweinidog y gwaith gwerthfawr, arloesol a wnaed ganddi eisoes a rhaid croesawu ei hymagwedd ragweithiol a'i hymrwymiad amlwg i'r agenda. Bydd argymhellion ein hadroddiad yn golygu cryn dipyn o waith ychwanegol iddi a'i swyddogion. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddi am nodi y bydd yn mynd ar drywydd yr argymhellion hynny yn frwd.

Diolchaf i Helen Mary Jones am ei geiriau caredig. Mae modd sicrhau bod gwleidyddiaeth gynhwysol—prin y gallaf glywed fy hun yn siarad uwchben ystŵr y Ceidwadwyr—yn llwyddo. Ni ddylem fod yn amddiffynnol o reidrwydd ynglŷn â hynny. Mae hwn yn fater lle mae bron pawb yn gytŷn nad oes pwerau digonol gennym. Sut y gellir sicrhau system drafnidiaeth integredig pan na fo'r trefniadau gweinyddol wedi eu hintegreiddio?

Crybwyllodd Alun Pugh, Eleanor Burnham ac Owen John Thomas ddiffyg integreiddio rhwng y gogledd a'r de ac mae cryn dystiolaeth ynglŷn â hynny. Ni fydd hynny fawr o gysur i'r Aelodau hynny sy'n teithio yn ôl ac ymlaen o orllewin Cymru.

Peter Law: Hoffwn eich llongyfarch chi a'r Pwyllgor ar eich gwaith rhagorol. Yr oedd yn dda gennyf ddarllen am y cynnig i atgyfnerthu'r consortia a'r gwaith rhagorol a

government has done with that. Will you assure me that the Welsh Local Government Association will be fully informed and consulted on how the integrated transport strategy for Wales will be developed in future as part of a partnership approach?

Richard Edwards: I give you that assurance. The WLGA has made oral and written presentations to the Committee. The Minister will consult it fully when the detailed proposals for each of the options are worked out.

John Griffiths and Janet Davies mentioned community transport. The Minister has established a working group to move that agenda forward. All parties on the Committee have worked consensually as far as possible to further the agenda, in recognition of the urgent need for progress. I say all parties, but I mean all parties but one. In fairness to David Davies, he has not been destructive in Committee, indeed, he has been quite a pussy cat. The whiff of grease paint is no doubt less enticing in Committee than in Plenary. We are most gratified that you take an interest in public transport, David, given Margaret Thatcher's maxim that anyone over 30 who uses public transport is a loser. David has assured us that not even he subscribes to that lunacy, although it does help to explain why public transport is in such a mess. In case you decide to join us on the train to Treorchy tomorrow, David, I am happy to draw you a picture so that you will know what to catch.

The number of public transport users is increasing. The big problem is capacity. At the beginning of this debate, I referred to the need for step change in integrated public transport provision. If we are to achieve that step change we must have the right structural and operational arrangements. We must have the appropriate powers to facilitate integration across the different modes of transport and we need a great deal of resources, targeted and ring-fenced from other competing demands on the public

wnaeth llywodraeth leol yn y maes hwnnw. A wnewch roi sicrwydd imi y bydd y Cynulliad yn rhoi'r holl wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac yn ymgynghori â hi ynglŷn â'r ffordd y caiff strategaeth drafnidiaeth integredig i Gymru ei datblygu yn y dyfodol fel rhan o ymagwedd partneriaeth?

Richard Edwards: Rhoddaf y sicrwydd hwnnw ichi. Gwnaeth Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru sylwadau ysgrifenedig ac ar lafar i'r Pwyllgor. Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymgynghori'n llawn â hi pan fydd yn gweithio ar y cynigion manwl ar gyfer pob un o'r opsiynau.

Crybwyllodd John Griffiths a Janet Davies drafnidiaeth gymunedol. Sefydlodd y Gweinidog weithgor i ddatblygu'r agenda honno. Bu pob plaid ar y Pwyllgor yn gweithio drwy gonsensws gymaint â phosibl i ddatblygu'r agenda, fel cydnabyddiaeth o'r angen brys am gynnydd. Dywedaf bob plaid, ond yr wyf yn meddwl pob plaid namyn un. A bod yn deg â David Davies, ni fu'n ddinistriol yn y Pwyllgor, yn wir, bu'n eithaf tirion. Yn ddiau mae'r ffaith i Bwyllgorau ddenu llai o sylw na'r Cyfarfod Llawn yn llai o atyniad iddo. Yr ydym yn ymfalchïo'n fawr iawn yn y ffaith eich bod yn ymddiddori mewn trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, David, o gofio gwreth Margaret Thatcher fod pawb dros 30 sy'n defnyddio trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn fethiant. Mae David wedi rhoi sicrwydd inni nad yw ef hyd yn oed yn cytuno â'r safbwynt gwirion hwnnw, er ei bod yn helpu i egluro pam bod trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn gymaint o gawlach. Rhag ofn ichi benderfynu ymuno â ni ar y trê'n i Dreorci yfory, David, yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i dynnu llun ichi wybod beth y dylech ei ddal.

Mae nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn cynyddu. Capasiti yw'r broblem fawr. Ar ddechrau'r ddadl hon, cyfeiriais at yr angen am newid sylweddol yn narpariaeth trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig. Er mwyn inni wneud y newid sylweddol hwnnw rhaid inni sicrhau bod y trefniadau strwythurol a gweithredol cywir ar waith. Rhaid inni feddu ar y pwerau priodol i hwyluso'r broses o integreiddio gwasanaethau ar draws gwahanol ddulliau trafnidiaeth ac mae angen cryn dipyn o

purse. That is what we ask the Minister and her officials to explore. The needs of passengers and the travelling public must be paramount; that is the crux. Passengers must be involved as a matter of right in further planning and delivery. After all, that is in keeping with the philosophy that underpins devolution; that decision-making should be brought as close as possible to the people affected by such decisions, within a strategic framework. That must be at the heart of any strategy to integrate public transport in Wales and to make it affordable, accessible and attractive.

adnoddau arnom, wedi eu targedau a'u clustnodi'n benodol o'r meysydd eraill sy'n galw ar bwrs y wlad. Dyna'r hyn y gofynnwn i'r Gweinidog a'i swyddogion ymchwilio iddo. Rhaid i anghenion teithwyr a'r cyhoedd fod o'r pwys mwyaf; dyna graidd y mater. Rhaid i deithwyr gael eu cynnwys yn y gwaith pellach o gynllunio a chyflwyno gwasanaethau fel hawl. Wedi'r cwbl, mae hynny yn gydnaws â'r athroniaeth sy'n sail i ddatganoli; y dylid gwneud penderfyniadau mor agos â phosibl i'r bobl yr effeithia'r penderfyniadau hynny arnynt, o fewn fframwaith strategol. Rhaid i hynny fod wrth wraidd strategaeth i integreiddio trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru a'i gwneud yn fwy fforddiadwy, yn hygyrch ac yn ddeniadol.

Cynnig: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom

Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Mae Angen Prif Weinidog Llawn
Amser ar Gymru
Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): The Need for a Full-time First
Minister**

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Andrew Davies and amendment 2 in the name of Mick Bates.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Andrew Davies a gwelliant 2 yn enw Mick Bates.

Alun Carins: I propose that

Alun Cairns: Cynigiaf y

the National Assembly for Wales would be better served by a full-time First Minister.
(NDM886)

byddai'n well i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gael Prif Weinidog amser llawn.
(NDM886)

My topic for the short debate is the concern that the Welsh economy is not getting the Assembly's full attention. Calls were made for the First Minister to relinquish one of his posts. The same can be said for the First Minister's role. We are told to judge outcomes, and in the debate two weeks ago that is what I sought to do. I quoted from several economic surveys and forecasts by a range of organisations: the Confederation of British Industry; Barclays Bank; Dunn and Bradstreet; Business Strategies Limited; Robert Huggins Associates; Cambridge Econometrics; and the Assembly's half-yearly review of the Welsh Development Agency, to name only a few.

Fy mhwc ar gyfer y ddadl fer yw'r pryder nad yw economi Cymru yn cael sylw llawn y Cynulliad. Galwyd ar i Brif Weinidog Cymru roi'r gorau i un o'i swyddi. Gellir dweud yr un peth am rôl Prif Weinidog Cymru. Dywedir wrthym i farnu canlyniadau, ac yn y ddadl bythefnos yn ôl dyna'r hyn y ceisiais ei wneud. Dyfynnais o sawl arolwg economaidd a rhagolygon economaidd gan ystod o sefydliadau: Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain; Banc Barclays; Dunn a Bradstreet; Business Strategies Cyfyngedig; Robert Huggins Associates; Cambridge Econometrics; ac adolygiad hanner blwyddyn y Cynulliad o Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, ac enwi ychydig ohonynt.

4.00 p.m.

I will not repeat the details of those reports—some claim that statistics can be used to support almost any argument. However, I hope that Members will agree that the general thrust in terms of the economy was worrying

Ni wnaif ailadrodd manylion yr adroddiadau hynny—honna rhai y gellir defnyddio ystadegau i ategu bron unrhyw ddadl. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau yn cytuno bod y byrdwn cyffredinol o ran yr

and that a fair case was presented to warrant a full-time Minister for Economic Development. I do not recall any specific rejections on the economic case from the First Minister. I look forward to his response today if he seeks to justify the outcome. There is no doubt that a great deal of confidence and hope has been invested in the First Minister. A fledgling Assembly, with a history of censure and no confidence motions, needs stability and credibility. To the former Deputy First Minister's credit, when he resigned he said that he did so partly for those reasons. On Radio 4 on 6 July he said that he resigned to protect the Assembly and the Government of Wales. Stability and credibility can only be achieved through delivery. The Assembly needs to deliver if it is ever to win the hearts and minds of the electorate. The First Minister has said that some posts, such as that of the Minister for Economic Development, tie in with the First Minister's role. On some occasions, no doubt, that may be the case.

Brian Gibbons: You listed many reports that discuss the economic situation in Wales. Will you list how many of those reports mention the particular problem that you are trying to highlight as being the source of difficulties?

Alun Cairns: In response to such matters, I will focus on the points made by the First Minister when he says that we should measure outcomes. Those reports have questioned output, unemployment, and the recession in manufacturing. I will highlight those issues. If the First Minister thinks that he can give economic development his full-time attention, he is clearly neglecting his responsibilities as First Minister.

Alun Pugh: Do you accept that it is possible to combine two roles? Ken Clarke combines the role of MP for Nottingham with that of selling cigarettes to children in the third world.

Alun Cairns: I am glad that Alun Pugh has led me on to my next point. The benefits of devolution—as it was presented at the time of the referendum—meant that Ministers, across

economi yn peri gofid ac y cyflwynwyd achos teg i warantu Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd llawn amser. Nid wyf yn cofio i'r Prif Weinidog wneud yr un gwrthwynebiad penodol ar yr achos economaidd. Edrychaf ymlaen at ei ymateb heddiw os ceisia gyfiawnhau'r canlyniad. Yn ddiau buddsoddwyd llawer o hyder a gobaith ym Mhrif Weinidog Cymru. Mae angen sefydlogrwydd a hygredd ar Gynulliad newydd, sydd â hanes o gynigion o gerydd a diffyg hyder. Er tegwch i gyn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru, pan ymddiswyddodd dywedodd iddo wneud hynny'n rhannol am y rhesymau hynny. Ar Radio 4 ar 6 Gorffennaf dywedodd iddo ymddiswyddo i ddiogelu'r Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cymru. Dim ond drwy gyflwyno y gellir cyflawni sefydlogrwydd a hygredd. Mae angen i'r Cynulliad gyflawni os yw am ennill cefnogaeth lwyr yr etholwyr. Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi dweud bod rhai swyddi, fel un y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, yn cydbblethu â rôl Prif Weinidog Cymru. Ar rai achlysuron, yn ddiau, gallai hynny fod yn wir.

Brian Gibbons: Gwnaethoch restru sawl adroddiad sy'n trafod y sefyllfa economaidd yng Nghymru. A wnewch chi restru sawl un o'r adroddiadau hynny sy'n sôn am y broblem benodol yr ydych yn ceisio ei hamlygu fel ffynhonnell yr anawsterau?

Alun Cairns: Mewn ymateb i faterion o'r fath, canolbwyntiaf ar y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Brif Weinidog Cymru pan ddywed y dylem fesur canlyniadau. Mae'r adroddiadau hynny wedi codi amheuan ynglŷn ag allbwn, diweithdra, a'r dirwasgiad gweithgynhyrchu. Amlygaf y materion hynny. Os cred y Prif Weinidog y gall roi ei sylw'n llawn amser i ddatblygu economaidd, mae'n amlwg yn esgeuluso ei gyfrifoldebau fel Prif Weinidog.

Alun Pugh: A dderbyniwch ei bod yn bosibl cyfuno dwy rôl? Mae Ken Clarke yn cyfuno rôl AS Nottingham ynghyd â rôl gwerthu sigarêts i blant yn y trydydd byd.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn falch bod Alun Pugh wedi fy arwain at fy mhwynt nesaf. Yr oedd manteision datganoli—fel y'i cyflwynwyd ar adeg y refferendwm—yn

the Cabinet divide, would focus on their responsibilities, such as developing the Welsh economy, the health service and the education service. You cannot have it both ways. You either have the benefits of devolution with Ministers focused on their duties or you have a system where the Secretary of State takes responsibilities for all duties. At the moment, we have neither.

golygu y byddai Gweinidogion, ar draws y Cabinet, yn canolbwyntio ar eu cyfrifoldebau, fel datblygu economi Cymru, y gwasanaeth iechyd a'r gwasanaeth addysg. Ellwch chi mo'i chael hi bob ffordd. Gallwch naill ai gael manteision datganoli gyda Gweinidogion yn canolbwyntio ar eu dyletswyddau neu system lle mae'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn gyfrifol am bob dyletswydd. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r naill na'r llall gennym.

Since our recent short debate on Wales's need for a full-time Minister for Economic Development, there have been additional examples where the duties of First Minister and Minister for Economic Development have not supported each other. The day after the debate, a British-Irish Council meeting was held in Dublin. The First Minister needed to be there, of course, particularly in mind of the recent events in Northern Ireland. However, there was also a meeting with British Aerospace in Broughton at the same time. The company could have been in a position where they would be forced to announce that 17,000 highly skilled manufacturing workers were to be made redundant. Fortunately, that was not the case. However, because of the physical impossibilities of conducting both roles, the First Minister could only get to Broughton by 4 p.m. that day. What sort of message does that send to a major private sector investor in north Wales?

Ers ein dadl fer ddiweddar ar angen Cymru am Weinidog llawn amser dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, bu enghreifftiau ychwanegol lle na fu dyletswyddau Prif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn cyd-fynd â'i gilydd. Y diwrnod wedi'r ddadl, cynhaliwyd cyfarfod y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig yn Nulyn. Yr oedd angen i Brif Weinidog Cymru fod yno, wrth gwrs, yn arbennig o gofio'r digwyddiadau diweddar yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd cyfarfod hefyd â British Aerospace ym Mrychdwn yr un pryd. Gallai'r cwmni fod wedi bod mewn sefyllfa lle y byddai'n rhaid iddynt gyhoeddi bod 17,000 o weithwyr gweithgynhyrchu medrus iawn yn cael eu diswyddo. Yn ffodus, nid felly y bu. Fodd bynnag, gan nad oedd yn gorfforol bosibl iddo gyflawni'r ddwy rôl, yr oedd yn 4 p.m. y diwrnod hwnnw ar y Prif Weinidog yn cyrraedd Brychdwn. Pa fath o neges y mae hynny'n ei hanfon at fuddsoddwr mawr yn y sector preifat yn y gogledd?

Tom Middlehurst: Will you acknowledge that, in spite of the First Minister's busy diary, he made every effort, and succeeded, to attend a crucial meeting at Broughton. Preceding that meeting, the factory was visited by the Deputy Minister for Economic Development, John Griffiths. Both visits were warmly welcomed by British Aerospace in Broughton, by the management, the workforce and the wider community. I do not think that anyone could have asked more of the First Minister on that day. His commitment to Broughton is absolute.

Tom Middlehurst: A gydnabyddwch i Brif Weinidog Cymru, er gwaethaf ei ddyddiadur prysur, wneud pob ymdrech, a llwyddo, i fynd i'r cyfarfod holl bwysig ym Mrychdwn. Cyn y cyfarfod hwnnw, ymwelwyd â'r ffatri gan y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, John Griffiths. Croesawyd y ddau ymweliad yn gynnes gan British Aerospace ym Mrychdwn, gan y rheolwyr, y gweithlu a'r gymuned ehangach. Ni chredaf y gallai neb fod wedi gofyn mwy gan y Prif Weinidog y diwrnod hwnnw. Mae ei ymrwymiad i Frychdwn yn ddiamod.

Alun Cairns: Of course I commend the First Minister's visit to Broughton that day. I am not surprised that the management there welcomed it. It was probably a rare occasion because he is so stretched in his duties. More

Alun Cairns: Wrth gwrs, canmolaf y Prif Weinidog ar ei ymweliad â Brychdwn y diwrnod hwnnw. Ni synnaf fod y rheolwyr yno wedi ei groesawu. Yr oedd yn achlysur prin mae'n siŵr gan fod gormod o

importantly, what sort of message does it send out on the international stage that our First Minister cannot give his full-time attention to such an important meeting in Dublin.

Gareth Jones: Yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi ymweld â Rhuthun. A wnewch chi ofyn i'r Prif Weinidog a yw'n debygol o ymweld â Dolgarrog? A fydd yn gwneud hynny cyn y Nadolig, ac os bydd, pa Nadolig?

Alun Cairns: Gobeithiaf y bydd Prif Weinidog y Cynulliad yn fodlon ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw pan gaiff gyfle i siarad yn nes ymlaen. Yr wyf yn siomedig nad yw'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd wedi ymweld â Dolgarrog. Y broblem yw, nid oes gennym Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd.

The second example was highlighted by Nick Bourne in questions to the First Minister earlier today. It relates to an incident at a meeting of the Committee on European Affairs last week when commissioner Barnier's Chef du Cabinet, Ronnie Hall, stated that virtually every region in Europe had submitted a report on the succession arrangements of Objective 1. The First Minister asked Ronnie Hall at that meeting if Wales had submitted its report. He raised an important matter with a senior European official in front of opposition Members. I suspect that Ronnie Hall is a sensitive and sensible individual who did not want to make political waves in such an important meeting. However, raising that point in front of opposition AMs only underlines their concern.

The UK has a reputation for gold plating all requests from Europe—clearly the Assembly and the First Minister cannot do so. He is exhausted and does not appear to be in the best of health, compounded, no doubt, by his over-stretched timetable. That leads me to the specific phrase of today's motion:

'The National Assembly would be better served by a full-time First Minister.'

ddyletswyddau ganddo. Yn bwysicach na hynny, y neges a gaiff ei hanfon ar y llwyfan rhyngwladol yw na all Prif Weinidog Cymru roi ei sylw llawn amser i gyfarfod pwysig o'r fath yn Nulyn.

Gareth Jones: I am glad to hear that the First Minister visited Ruthin. Will you ask the First Minister when is he likely to visit Dolgarrog? Will he visit before Christmas, and if so, which Christmas?

Alun Cairns: I hope that the Assembly's First Minister will be willing to answer that question when he gets an opportunity to speak later. I am disappointed that the Minister for Economic Development has not visited Dolgarrog. The problem is that we do not have a Minister for Economic Development.

Amlygwyd yr ail enghraifft gan Nick Bourne mewn cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru yn gynharach heddiw. Mae a wnelo â digwyddiad yng nghyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor ar Faterion Ewropeaidd yr wythnos diwethaf pan nododd Ronnie Hall, Chef du Cabinet y comisiynydd Barnier, fod bron pob rhanbarth yn Ewrop wedi cyflwyno adroddiad ar drefniadau olynol Amcan 1. Gofynnodd Prif Weinidog Cymru i Ronnie Hall yn y cyfarfod hwnnw a oedd Cymru wedi cyflwyno ei hadroddiad. Cododd fater pwysig gydag uwch swyddog Ewropeaidd ger bron Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau. Credaf fod Ronnie Hall yn unigolyn sensitif a synhwyrol nad oedd am greu trafferthion gwleidyddol mewn cyfarfod mor bwysig. Fodd bynnag, nid yw codi'r pwynt hwnnw ger bron Aelodau Seneddol y gwrthbleidiau ond yn ategu eu pryder.

Mae gan y DU enw da am roi gwedd euraidd ar bob cais gan Ewrop—yn amlwg, ni all y Cynulliad a Phrif Weinidog Cymru wneud hynny. Mae wedi llwyr ymlâdd ac nid yw mewn llawn iechyd, sydd wedi gwaethygu, mae'n siŵr, o ganlyniad i'w amserlen brysur iawn. Mae hynny'n fy arwain at ymadrodd penodol cynnig heddiw:

'Byddai'n well i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gael Prif Weinidog amser llawn.'

Few people can reasonably believe that one leading AM torn between such demanding priorities can do better than two AMs focused on their individual tasks. If the administration's response is that the First Minister is showing leadership—that may or may not be the case—but that should be the subject of a separate debate. Today's motion states that there are physical, and some would say psychological, impossibilities to him taking on two jobs.

I fail to understand why he will not appoint one of the deputy ministers as Minister for Economic Development. If he is duty-bound to re-appoint a Liberal Democrat, why not do so, even temporarily? He should not ignore calls from the private and public sectors—some from industry—and even an ordinary Labour Assembly Member, which highlight the frustration that people feel about this matter.

I will turn briefly to the amendments. Mick Bates's amendment 2 can be dismissed immediately. It is our role to scrutinise the administration's policies and conduct. That is what we are doing. If Mick Bates is uncomfortable with that, then he can say something about it. However, I see that he has given his party priority over the Labour Party in his amendment.

Amendment 1 would be worthy of note in another debate. We are not debating the First Minister's leadership. A vote on such a motion would fall along party lines. We are simply saying that the Assembly would be better served by a full-time First Minister, and pointing out the physical impossibilities of his taking on two jobs. If you want to commend the First Minister on leadership or any policy area, that is up to you. However, you still cannot say that even he would serve the Assembly better than a person acting on a part-time basis. To do so would be to ignore all reason.

The reality is that the First Minister is putting his personal interest before that of the Assembly. As a result, the Welsh economy and other policy areas are suffering, but the Labour Party will pay the ultimate price at

Prin yw nifer y bobl a all gredu'n rhesymol y gall un AS wedi ei rwygo rhwng blaenoriaethau mor ymestynnol wneud yn well na dau AS yn canolbwyntio ar eu tasgau unigol. Os mai ymateb y weinyddiaeth yw bod y Prif Weinidog yn dangos arweinyddiaeth—efallai fod hynny'n wir neu efallai ddim—ond dylai hynny fod yn destun dadl ar wahân. Noda cynnig heddiw ei bod yn amhosibl iddo, yn gorfforol ac yn seicolegol yn ôl rhai, gyflawni dwy swydd.

Methaf â deall pam na wnaiff benodi un o'r dirprwy weinidogion yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Os yw'n rhwym arno i ailbenodi Democrat Rhyddfrydol, pam na wnaiff hynny, hyd yn oed dros dro? Ni ddylai anwybyddu galwadau gan y sectorau preifat a chyhoeddus—rhai gan ddiwydiant—a hyd yn oed gan Aelod Llafur cyffredin y Cynulliad, sy'n amlygu'r rhwystredigaeth y teimla pobl ynglŷn â'r mater hwn.

Trof yn fyr at y gwelliannau. Gellid gwrthod gwelliant 2 Mick Bates ar unwaith. Ein rôl ni yw craffu ar bolisiâu ac ymddygiad y weinyddiaeth. Dyna a wnawn. Os yw Mick Bates yn anghyffyrddus â hynny, yna gall ddweud rhywbeth am hynny. Fodd bynnag, gwelaf ei fod wedi rhoi'r flaenoriaeth i'w blaid ei hun dros Blaid Lafur yn ei welliant.

Byddai'n werth rhoi sylw i welliant 1 mewn dadl arall. Nid ydym yn dadlau ynghylch arweinyddiaeth Prif Weinidog Cymru. Mewn pleidlais ar gynnig o'r fath byddai'r Aelodau yn pleidleisio ar sail bleidiol. Yn syml, yr hyn a ddywedwn yw y byddai'r Cynulliad yn cael ei wasanaethu'n well gan Brif Weinidog llawn amser, a nodwn pa mor amhosibl ydyw yn gorfforol iddo gyflawni dwy swydd. Os ydych am gymeradwyo'r Prif Weinidog ar arweinyddiaeth neu unrhyw faes polisi, eich dewis chi yw hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch ddweud o hyd y byddai ef hyd yn oed yn gwasanaethu'r Cynulliad yn well na pherson yn gweithio'n rhan amser. Byddai hynny yn groes i bob rheswm.

Y gwir yw bod y Prif Weinidog yn rhoi ei fudd personol o flaen un y Cynulliad. O ganlyniad, mae economi Cymru a meysydd polisi eraill yn dioddef, ond y Blaid Lafur fydd yn talu'r pris yn y pen draw yn yr

the next election. Do you honestly think that the electorate will thank you and the Liberal Democrats during the next election campaign for holding the post open for a Liberal Democrat AM?

If you believe in devolution, in the success of the Assembly and in this administration, help out the First Minister—and I address this to the Liberal Democrats in particular—support the motion and reject the amendments.

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I propose amendment 1 in the name of Andrew Davies. Delete all after 'Wales' and add as new points:

1. *congratulates the First Minister on his leadership of the Welsh Assembly Government;*
2. *recognises the huge contribution he has made to the establishment of effective government in Wales; and*
3. *looks forward to his continuing contribution to the development of policies aimed at meeting the needs of the people of Wales.*

Mick Bates: I propose amendment 2. Delete all after 'served by' and insert:

a Conservative and Plaid Cymru opposition that is able to match the high standard of the performance of the Welsh Liberal Democrat/Labour partnership Government.

It gives me great pleasure to propose this amendment. I would never say that everything is perfect with government. That applies to this Government. For example, who likes to be called a toerag?

4.10 p.m.

Peter Law rose—

Mick Bates: I will not give way. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Give way.']

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

etholiad nesaf. A gredwch o ddifrif y bydd yr etholwyr yn diolch i chi ac i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn yr ymgyrch etholiadol nesaf am ddal y swydd ar agor i AC y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol?

Os credwch mewn datganoli, yn llwyddiant y Cynulliad ac yn y weinyddiaeth hon, helpwch y Prif Weinidog—a chyfeiriau hyn at y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn benodol—cefnogwch y cynnig a gwrthodwch y gwelliannau.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Andrew Davies. Dileu popeth ar ôl 'Cymru' ac ychwanegu'r pwyntiau newydd hyn:

1. *yn llongyfarch y Prif Weinidog ar ei arweinyddiaeth o Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru;*
2. *yn cydnabod y cyfraniad enfawr y mae wedi'i wneud i sefydlu llywodraeth effeithiol yng Nghymru; ac*
3. *yn edrych ymlaen at ei gyfraniad parhaus i ddatblygiad polisïau sydd wedi'u hanelu at ddiwallu anghenion pobl Cymru.*

Mick Bates: Cynigiau welliant 2. Dileu popeth ar ôl 'Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru' ac ychwanegu:

pe bai perfformiad y Ceidwadwyr a Phlaid Cymru fel gwrthbleidiau o'r un safon uchel â pherfformiad Llywodraeth Bartneriaeth Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru/Llafur.

Mae'n bleser mawr imi gynnig y gwelliant hwn. Ni fyddem byth yn dweud bod popeth yn berffaith gyda llywodraeth. Mae hynny'n wir am y Llywodraeth hon. Er enghraifft, pwy sy'n hoffi cael ei alw yn toerag?

Peter Law a gododd—

Mick Bates: Nid ildiaf. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Ildiwch.']

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn.

Mick Bates: However, in terms of achievement and high standards of performance, the partnership Government has delivered and will continue to do so. This is the beginning of an empowerment for the people of Wales which will improve the quality of life for all, including those in Blaenau Gwent, Conwy and Montgomeryshire.

The sponsors of this motion, the WC—that is, the Welsh Conservatives—do not understand devolution. They do not understand how to empower the people of Wales, they do not understand fairer votes and they do not understand how to be constructive about building a future for Wales based on stability, not the chaos of the pre-partnership days. Their continued attempts to undermine this partnership have been ineffective in comparison with the partnership Government's achievements.

David Davies *rose—*

Mick Bates: I will not give way. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Go on.']

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

Mick Bates: Let us consider this Government's performance. For example, on agriculture, we have provided an additional £60 million for rural development. We have established Farming Connect, and an independent appeals panel. The Tories savaged the agriculture industry. They cut a quarter of vital hill payments, and they killed co-operation. Their pursuit of competition at all costs crushed many family farms. Yes, little boys, you know the cost of everything and the value of nothing.

Alun Cairns: May I raise a point of order?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: No.

Mick Bates: There are examples of this Government delivering on health. Prescription prices have been frozen and we have introduced exemptions for under 26-year-olds. We have introduced dental

Mick Bates: Fodd bynnag, o ran cyflawni a safonau cyflawni uchel, mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi cyflawni a bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny. Dyma ddechrau rhoi grym i bobl Cymru a fydd yn gwella ansawdd bywyd pawb, gan gynnwys y rhai ym Mlaenau Gwent, Conwy a Sir Drefaldwyn.

Nid yw noddwyr y cynnig hwn, sef Ceidwadwyr Cymru, yn deall datganoli. Ni ddeallant sut i roi grym i bobl Cymru, ni ddeallant bleidleisiau tecach ac ni ddeallant sut i fod yn adeiladol ynglŷn ag adeiladu dyfodol i Gymru ar sail sefydlogrwydd, nid anhrefn y dyddiau cyn y bartneriaeth. Bu eu hymdrechion parhaus i danseilio'r bartneriaeth hon yn aneffeithiol o'u cymharu â chyflawniadau'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth.

David Davies *a gododd—*

Mick Bates: Nid ildiaf. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL Y CYNULLIAD: 'Ildiwch.']

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn.

Mick Bates: Gadewch inni ystyried perfformiad y Llywodraeth hon. Er enghraifft, o ran amaethyddiaeth, darparasom £60 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer datblygu gwledig. Sefydlasom Cyswllt Ffermio, a phanel apeliadau annibynnol. Tynnodd y Toriaid y diwydiant amaethyddiaeth yn gareiau. Torrwyd chwarter o daliadau hanfodol tir uchel, a difethwyd cydweithio. Yn eu cais am gystadleuaeth ar bob cyfrif difethwyd llawer o ffermydd teuluol. Ie, fechgyn bach, gwyddoch gost popeth a gwerth dim.

Alun Cairns: A allaf godi pwynt o drefn?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Na allwch.

Mick Bates: Mae enghreifftiau o'r Llywodraeth hon yn cyflawni o ran iechyd. Rhewyd prisiau presgripsiynau a gwnaethom gyflawni eithriadau i bobl dan 26 oed. Cyflwynasom eithriadau deintyddol i bobl

exemptions for young and old and we have delivered a new human resource strategy.

Alun Cairns: Imagine what a full-time First Minister could do.

Mick Bates: Will you be quiet, please? On education, we have introduced free school milk and we are piloting a Welsh baccalaureate. We are implementing the reforms recommended by the Rees Commission and have already increased hardship funding—

David Davies: Does this mean that you are making a pitch for a Minister's job?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Mick must be heard. The Assembly must settle down.

Mick Bates: On economic development, we had the resolve to ensure the effective implementation of Objective 1. More resources have been given to the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board. We made a fresh commitment to innovation and enterprise and have introduced new, streamlined enterprise support grants for investment of between £5,000 and £50,000. As for the Welsh Conservatives' criticism of the partnership Government's running of the Welsh economy, that will be met by howls of laughter outside the Chamber. People remember. We are all painfully aware of the systematic destruction of Wales by Jac Coed Coch—that great sorry soul, John Redwood—and his sidekick, William Hague.

On culture, we have introduced the Assembly's first culture strategy and free entry to museums. We have made new resources available for the Welsh Language Board and *mentrau iaith*.

You cannot reverse 18 years of Tory rule in 18 months. However, the partnership Government is having a damn good try. We will not fail through lack of commitment or lack of belief in the future of Wales.

The Tories—sorry, the Welsh Conservatives—are part of an Assembly that

ifanc a'r henoed, a strategaeth adnoddau dynol newydd.

Alun Cairns: Dychmygwch beth y gallai Prif Weinidog llawn amser ei wneud.

Mick Bates: A fyddwch yn dawel, os gwelwch yn dda? O ran addysg, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno llaeth am ddim i ysgolion ac yn cynnal rhaglen beilot o'r fagloriaeth Gymreig. Gweithredwn y diwygiadau a argymhellwyd gan Gomisiwn Rees ac eisoes yr ydym wedi cynyddu arian caledi—

David Davies: A yw hyn yn golygu eich bod yn gwneud cynnig am swydd Gweinidog?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid i Mick gael ei glywed. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad ymdawelu.

Mick Bates: O ran datblygu economaidd, gwnaethom y penderfyniad i sicrhau y gweithredir Amcan 1 yn effeithiol. Rhoddwyd mwy o adnoddau i Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ac i Fwrdd Croeso Cymru. Gwnaethom ymrwymiad o'r newydd i arloesedd a menter a chyflwyno grantiau cymorth menter newydd, symlach ar gyfer buddsoddiadau rhwng £5,000 a £50,000. O ran beirniadaeth Ceidwadwyr Cymru o'r ffordd y caiff economi Cymru ei rhedeg gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, bydd pobl yn sgrechian chwerthin y tu allan i'r Siambr. Mae pobl yn cofio. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol iawn o'r ffordd y dinistriwyd Cymru yn systematig gan Jac Coed Coch—y creadur truenus hwnnw, John Redwood—a'i bartner William Hague.

O ran diwylliant, cyflwynasom strategaeth diwylliant gyntaf y Cynulliad a mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd. Sicrhawyd bod adnoddau newydd ar gael i Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg a mentrau iaith.

Ni allwch wyrdroi 18 mlynedd o reolaeth Dori'aid mewn 18 mis. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yn rhoi cynnig da arni. Ni fethwn oherwydd diffyg ymrwymiad nac am nad ydym yn credu yn nyfodol Cymru.

Mae'r Toriaid—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Ceidwadwyr Cymru—yn rhan o Gynulliad

they did not want, elected by a system that all but one of them rejects, and in a country that they tried to destroy. They are jealous of the partnership Government's performance. They lack leadership skills, the courage to stand up for Wales and, above all, the vision to build a future for Wales. By the way, most of what I have said also applies to the nationalists from north Wales and the socialists from south Wales who form that great coalition—Plaid Cymru.

Future generations will see this first attempt to break the conflict mode of British politics as the dawn of a new epoch in Welsh life delivered as a result of the high standard and performance of the Welsh Liberal Democrat/Labour partnership Government.

Glyn Davies: If anyone had asked me before the National Assembly was established what its two greatest challenges would be, I would have said to develop the National Assembly for Wales into a body that the people of Wales could cherish, and to strengthen the economy of Wales in absolute terms—as Brian Gibbons said last week—in comparison with the other parts of Britain; the failure to do so underpinned our Objective 1 bid. The National Assembly has existed for almost three years. Nothing has changed in respect of those two major challenges, except that some of the goodwill, naturally flowing from the 'yes' vote has dissipated. If anyone had predicted that an individual was going to try to lead the fight on both these fronts, taking on the role of First Minister and Minister for Economic Development, I would have dismissed it as a daft idea. Every Labour Assembly Member in this Chamber would have agreed with me, including Rhodri Morgan and the Members who proposed today's amendments, Andrew Davies and Mick Bates.

In Plaid Cymru's minority party debate last week and in Alun Cairns's short debate the week before, good speeches were made outlining the reasons why the National Assembly needs a full-time Minister for Economic Development. My contribution

nad oeddent am ei gael, wedi ei ethol drwy system y mae pob un ohonynt namyn un yn ei gwrthod, ac mewn gwlad y buon yn ceisio ei dinistrio. Maent yn eiddigeddus o berfformiad y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Nid ydynt yn meddu ar sgiliau arwain, y dewrder i sefyll o blaid Cymru ac, yn anad dim, y weledigaeth i adeiladu dyfodol i Gymru. Gyda llaw, mae rhan fwyaf yr hyn a ddywedais yn berthnasol hefyd i'r cenedlaetholwyr o'r gogledd a'r sosialwyr o'r de sy'n ffurfio'r glymblaid fawr honno—Plaid Cymru.

Bydd cenedlaethau i ddod yn ystyried yr ymdrech gyntaf hon i dorri patrwm gwrthdaro gwleidyddiaeth Prydain fel oes newydd yn gwawrio ym mywyd Cymru a gyflawnwyd o ganlyniad i safon a pherfformiad da Llywodraeth bartneriaeth Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/Llafur Cymru.

Glyn Davies: Pe bai rhywun wedi gofyn imi cyn i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gael ei sefydlu beth fyddai ei ddwy her fwyaf, byddwn wedi dweud mai datblygu Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gorff y gallai pobl Cymru ei goledu, a chryfhau economi Cymru yn wirioneddol oeddent—fel y dywedodd Brian Gibbons yr wythnos diwethaf—o'i chymharu â rhannau eraill o Brydain; yr oedd y methiant i wneud hynny yn sail i'n cynnig Amcan 1. Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi bodoli ers tair blynedd bron. Nid oes dim wedi newid o ran y ddwy her fawr hon, heblaw bod peth o'r ewyllys da, sy'n llifo'n naturiol o'r bleidlais 'ie' wedi chwalu. Pe bai rhywun wedi rhagweld y byddai unigolyn yn ceisio arwain y frwydr o ran y ddwy her hyn, gan ymgymryd â rôl Prif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, byddwn wedi ei wfftio fel syniad gwirion. Byddai pob Aelod Llafur yn y Cynulliad yn y Siambr hon wedi cytuno â mi, gan gynnwys Rhodri Morgan a'r Aelodau a gynigiodd welliannau heddiw, Andrew Davies a Mick Bates.

Yn nadl plaid leiafrifol Plaid Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf ac yn nadl fer Alun Cairns yr wythnos flaenorol, gwnaed areithiau da yn amlinellu'r rhesymau pam mae angen Gweinidog llawn amser dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

focused on the failings of the national economic development strategy process—the delays involved in that process and the incredible lack of realism. However, today, I want to fulfil my duty as an opposition member and criticise the consequences of having a part-time First Minister in the National Assembly both before Mike German's appointment to the Cabinet and since the unfortunate denouement of his term as Minister for Economic Development—

William Graham: Perhaps we can offer some advice to help the First Minister to make a permanent appointment for one of the two jobs that he holds. Mike German might be preferred to the House of Lords. He would be known as 'Lord Thrombosis', because he is a threat to circulation and we all know that he is a bloody clot.

Glyn Davies: I do not know how to respond to that because my next line is that I have no interest in personal attacks. [*Laughter.*] I hope that Rhodri, if he is watching on television, will not take my criticism in any way other than the positive spirit in which it is intended. I also hope that he does not live up to the new title that he now has among the Tory groups and continue to lose his 'rag-wag'. I prefer—for those of us who speak Welsh—the Welsh title of '*pen-wag*'.

The main problem is the lack of focus on the job of First Minister. Consequently, there has not been enough time for him to follow decisions through and consult with his own Assembly Members, judging by the look of shock and anger that we sometimes see on their faces after announcements. There is a limit to what one person can do. There have been damaging ministerial announcements, such as the one on the new building, which was suspended for three months and which probably cost us almost £500,000. There was also the announcement that his Cabinet was going to be called the Welsh Assembly Government, without realising that his Ministers would be known as 'wags' or the Cabinet known as a 'wag-bag'. Other thoughtless actions have inflicted a great deal of damage on this Assembly because we do

Canolbwyntiodd fy nghyfraniad ar fethiannau proses y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol—yr oedi a oedd ynghlwm wrth y broses honno a'r diffyg realaeth anhygoel. Fodd bynnag, heddiw, yr wyf am gyflawni fy nyletswydd fel aelod o'r wrthblaid a beirniadu canlyniadau cael Prif Weinidog rhan amser yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyn penodi Mike German i'r Cabinet ac ers diwedd glo anffodus ei dymor mewn swydd fel y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd—

William Graham: Efallai y gallwn gynnig peth cyngor i helpu'r Prif Weinidog wneud penodiad parhaol ar gyfer un o'r ddwy swydd a ddeil. Gellid dyrchafu Mike German i Dŷ'r Arglwyddi. Fe'i hadwaenid fel yr 'Arglwydd Thrombosis', oherwydd ei fod yn fygythiad i gylchrediad y corff a gŵyr pob un ohonom ei fod yn uffach o glot.

Glyn Davies: Ni wn sut i ymateb i hynny oherwydd fy llinell nesaf yw nad oes diddordeb gennyf mewn ymosodiadau personol. [*Chwerthin.*] Gobeithiaf na fydd Rhodri, os yw'n gwyllo ar y teledu, yn cymryd fy meirniadaeth mewn unrhyw ffordd heblaw yn yr ysbryd cadarnhaol y'i bwriedir. Gobeithiaf hefyd nad yw'n bodloni'r teitl newydd sydd ganddo erbyn hyn ymhlith y grwpiau Toriaidd gan barhau i golli ei 'rag-wag'. Mae'n well gennyf—i'r rheini ohonom sy'n siarad Cymraeg—y teitl Cymraeg sef pen-wag.

Y broblem fwyaf yw'r diffyg canolbwyntio ar swydd Prif Weinidog Cymru. O ganlyniad, ni fu digon o amser ganddo i weithredu ar benderfyniadau ac ymgynhgori â'i Aelodau Cynulliad ei hun, a barnu yn ôl y syndod a'r dictter a welwn weithiau ar eu hwynebau ar ôl cyhoeddiadau. Mae pen draw i'r hyn y gall unigolyn ei wneud. Bu cyhoeddiadau gweinidogol niweidiol, fel yr un ar yr adeilad newydd, a ohiriwyd am dri mis ac a gostiodd bron £500,000 i ni mae'n siŵr. Yr oedd cyhoeddiad hefyd y câi ei Gabinet ei alw yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, heb sylweddoli y byddai ei Weinidogion yn cael eu galw yn 'wags' neu'r Cabinet fel 'wag-bag'. Mae gweithrediadau difeddwl eraill wedi achosi llawer o niwed i'r Cynulliad hwn gan nad oes gennym Brif Weinidog sydd yn feistr ar ei waith. Nid oes neb yn cadw trefn

not have a First Minister who is on top of the job. Nobody is keeping a tight reign on the Minister for Assembly Business, who, on Tory corridors, is rather unfairly known as oily-wag. The kind of decision I mean, and that angered me most—

Gareth Jones *rose—*

Glyn Davies: I will give way in a minute, Gareth. What angered me most was the decision to allow the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to move her Plenary question session to a different day for her own convenience. That was a poor example of leadership. If the National Assembly for Wales is to be regarded as a serious institution of government, we must have full respect for our procedures.

Gareth Jones: Ymfalchiwn yn y ffaith bod nifer o'r Aelodau yn dysgu Cymraeg. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai Aelodau yn cael trafferthion gyda rhai treigladau o bryd i'w gilydd. Pan gyfeirioch at 'pen-wag', ai at ben gwag yr oeddech yn bwriadu cyfeirio?

4.20 p.m.

Glyn Davies: Pan drafodais y pwnc hwn gyda'm hathrawes, dywedodd fod 'pen-wag' gystal â phen gwag.

Before he was elected First Minister, Rhodri Morgan was a popular and witty person. In some ways, he still is. In other ways, he has sacrificed his popularity and his good humour for the sake of the Liberal Democrats—and Mike German in particular—on the altar of old brag-wag himself. However, the truth is that, since the coalition, the First Minister has completely lost his way. For one person to take on the two important jobs of First Minister and Economic Development Minister is an extremely bad idea. In his heart—big and generous as it is—the First Minister knows this. It lets down the National Assembly, the Welsh economy and Wales itself.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I point out to Glyn that Jane Davidson did not ask to move her question session. It was agreed by the Business Committee, which I chair. I trust

ar y Trefnydd, sydd, ar goridorau'r Torïaid, yn cael ei alw, a hynny braidd yn annheg, yn 'oily-wag'. Y math o benderfyniad a olygaf, a'r un a'm gwylltiodd fwyaf—

Gareth Jones *a gododd—*

Glyn Davies: Ildiaf mewn munud, Gareth. Yr hyn a'm gwylltiodd fwyaf oedd y penderfyniad i ganiatáu i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes symud ei sesiwn holi mewn Cyfarfod Llawn i ddiwrnod gwahanol er hwylustod iddi. Yr oedd hynny'n enghraifft wael o arweinyddiaeth. Os yw Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i gael ei ystyried yn sefydliad llywodraethu difrifol, rhaid inni barchu ein gweithdrefnau yn llawn.

Gareth Jones: We are proud of the fact that many Members are learning Welsh. However, some of them occasionally have difficulties with some mutations. When you referred to 'pen-wag' did you mean 'pen gwag', which means an empty head?

Glyn Davies: When I discussed this matter with my teacher, she said that 'pen-wag' was as good as 'pen-gwag', that is, an empty head.

Cyn iddo gael ei ethol yn Brif Weinidog, yr oedd Rhodri Morgan yn boblogaidd a ffraeth. Mewn sawl ystyr, y mae o hyd. Mewn ffyrdd eraill, y mae wedi aberthu ei boblogrwydd a'i hiwmor er mwyn y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—a Mike German yn benodol—ar allor yr hen brag-wag ei hun. Fodd bynnag, y gwir yw bod y Prif Weinidog, ers y glymblaid, wedi colli ei ffordd yn llwyr. Mae cael un person i ymgymryd â dwy swydd bwysig Prif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn syniad eithriadol o wael. Yn nwf ei galon—mawr a hael fel y mae—gŵyr y Gweinidog hyn. Mae'n siomi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, economi Cymru a Chymru ei hun.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Dywedaf wrth Glyn na ofynnodd Jane Davidson i gael symud ei sesiwn holi. Cytunwyd ar hynny gan y Pwyllgor Busnes, yr wyf yn ei gadeirio.

that you were not attacking the Chair on this occasion. It was in fact a procedural motion that was brought forward and passed by the Assembly. That was the reason why the question session was moved. I do not want for the Assembly to be misled.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: The wording of the amendments before us today throw some light on the Government of Wales's difficulties in seeking to promote the idea that the First Minister is doing a first class job for Wales. When asked over the weekend whether he intended to discontinue the use of the term 'WAG' to describe his Government, he is quoted as saying, 'you must be joking'. If those were his words, then he really has problems, as I am sure that he has now realised that the joke is not on us but on him. Amendment 1 shows that the WAG will continue. We saw what fun *Wales on Sunday* had with this. We now have a competition to name each one of the WAG Members. He tells us that this was discussed for 15 minutes in Cabinet. Was this the most inspired discussion that you have had in Cabinet, First Minister? I am sure that it would not take 15 minutes to change your mind. For your own sake and the sake of the good name of your Government, ditch the 'WAG' at the earliest opportunity.

We have Mick Bates's wonderful amendment 2. This is worth more than a cursory look. During the past few weeks, I am sure that we have all been struck by the determined way that Members of the Cabinet have been at pains to describe the coalition as Labour-led. They seem to place great emphasis on this whenever Mick Bates rises to speak. Carwyn Jones made a pointed reference to the Lib-Dems' role when, in his reply to Mick Bates on Thursday's statement on the future of farming, he said,

'I welcome any Liberal Democrat policy into a document produced by a Labour Minister.'

Carwyn said that with much feeling. However, Mick Bates was in no way deterred by such a put-down. He no doubt

Hyderaf nad oeddech yn ymosod ar y Cadeirydd y tro hwn. Yr oedd yn gynnig trefniadol mewn gwirionedd a ddygwyd ymlaen ac a basiwyd gan y Cynulliad. Dyna'r rheswm y symudwyd y sesiwn holi. Nid wyf am i'r Cynulliad gael ei gamarwain.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae geiriad y gwelliannau sydd ger ein bron heddiw yn taflu peth goleuni ar yr anawsterau sy'n wynebu Llywodraeth Cymru wrth geisio hyrwyddo'r syniad bod Prif Weinidog Cymru yn gwneud gwaith ardderchog i Gymru. Pan ofynnwyd iddo dros y penwythnos a oedd yn bwriadu rhoi'r gorau i ddefnyddio'r term 'WAG' i ddisgrifio ei Lywodraeth, meddai, a dyfynnaf, '*you must be joking*'. Os mai dyna a ddywedodd, mae ganddo broblemau gwirioneddol, gan ei fod yn siŵr wedi sylweddoli erbyn hyn mai ef yn awr yw'r testun sbort ac nid nyni. Dengys gwelliant 1 y bydd y WAG yn parhau. Gwelsom yr hwyl a gafodd *Wales on Sunday* gyda hyn. Mae gennym gystadleuaeth yn awr i enwi pob un o Aelodau WAG. Dywed wrthym i hyn gael ei drafod am 15 munud yn y Cabinet. Ai dyna'r drafodaeth fwyaf ysbrydoledig a gawsoch yn y Cabinet, Brif Weinidog? Yr wyf yn siŵr na chymer 15 munud i newid eich meddwl. Er eich mwyn eich hun, ac er mwyn enw da eich Llywodraeth, rhowch y gorau i ddefnyddio 'WAG' cyn gynted â phosibl.

Mae gennym welliant 2 gwych Mick Bates. Mae'n werth ei ystyried yn fanwl. Yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, yr wyf yn siŵr inni oll gael ein taro gan y ffordd benderfynol y mae Aelodau'r Cabinet wedi ymdrafferthu i ddisgrifio'r glymblaid fel un a arweinir gan Lafur. Ymddengys eu bod yn rhoi pwyslais mawr ar hyn pryd bynnag y bydd Mick Bates yn ceisio siarad. Gwnaeth Carwyn Jones gyfeiriad miniog at rôl y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol pan ddywedodd, yn ei ateb i Mick Bates ar ddatganiad dydd Iau ar ddyfodol ffermio,

'croesawaf unrhyw bolisi o eiddo'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i mewn i ddogfen a gynhyrchir gan Weinidog Llafur.'

Dywedodd Carwyn hynny gyda chryn deimlad. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd sarhad o'r fath yn mennu dim ar Mick Bates. Yn ddiau

passionately believes that this is a Lib-Dem led coalition because, in his amendment, strangely tabled in his own name, he espouses the virtues of the 'Welsh Liberal Democrat/Labour partnership Government'. Note the order: the Lib-Dems come first. It will be interesting to see how many Labour Members support this amendment.

David Melding: I am grateful to the Leader of the Opposition for his observation. Given Mick Bates's incredibly stirring speech, I wonder whether there is a more radical solution. The First Minister enjoyed being Minister for Economic Development greatly. Given the strain of two jobs now, perhaps he will step down temporarily from being First Minister, and invite Mick to fill that role.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: That is an interesting suggestion, which I am sure the First Minister will want to take on board. The evidence of what the First Minister's Government has achieved during the last eight weeks is ample testimony to the fact that the First Minister should concentrate on the top job.

A few weeks ago I mentioned to the Minister for Assembly Business the amount of time that has been allocated for debate in the Assembly since 15 October. He responded to that today. I repeat that since 15 October we have spent 80 per cent of our time responding to statements, commentating on consultation papers, debating ombudsman reports, or noting progress on this or that. That can hardly be described as a programme for Government.

The First Minister leads a Government that is characterised by inaction. It fails to see the big picture and its agenda is clearly dominated by Westminster. For example, the Bill setting out far reaching reforms to the health service was debated in Westminster, even before those reforms were agreed in the National Assembly. It shows that Tony Blair is still the boss—so much for Welsh solutions to Welsh problems.

cred yn angerddol fod hon yn glymblaid a arweinir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol oherwydd, yn ei welliant ef, a gyflwynwyd yn rhyfedd iawn yn ei enw ef ei hun, mae'n mabwysiadu rhinweddau 'Llywodraeth bartneriaeth Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru/Llafur'. Nodwch y drefn: daw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gyntaf. Bydd yn ddiddorol gweld sawl Aelod Llafur fydd yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwn.

David Melding: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid am ei sylw. O gofio araith rymus iawn Mick Bates, tybiaf a oes ateb mwy radical. Mwynhaodd Prif Weinidog Cymru fod yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn fawr. O gofio pwysau dwy swydd yn awr, efallai y bydd yn ymddiswyddo dros dro fel Prif Weinidog Cymru ac yn gwahodd Mick i lenwi'r rôl honno.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae hynny'n awgrym diddorol, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Prif Weinidog am ei ystyried. Mae tystiolaeth yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi ei gyflawni yn ystod yr wyth wythnos diwethaf yn dyst digonol i'r ffaith y dylai'r Prif Weinidog ganolbwyntio ar y swydd fawr.

Ychydig wythnosau yn ôl soniais wrth y Trefnydd am yr amser a neilltuwyd ar gyfer cynnal dadleuon yn y Cynulliad ers 15 Hydref. Ymatebodd i hynny heddiw. Hoffwn ailadrodd ein bod, ers 15 Hydref, wedi treulio 80 y cant o'n hamser yn ymateb i ddatganiadau, rhoi sylwadau ar bapurau ymgynghori, cynnal dadleuon ar adroddiadau ombwdsmon neu nodi cynnydd ar hyn a'r llall. Prin y gellid disgrifio hynny fel rhaglen ar gyfer Llywodraeth.

Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn arwain Llywodraeth a nodweddir gan anweithgarwch. Mae'n methu â gweld y darlun mawr a rheolir ei agenda yn amlwg gan San Steffan. Er enghraifft, cynhaliwyd dadl ar y Mesur sy'n nodi diwygiadau pellgyrhaeddol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn San Steffan, hyd yn oed cyn iddynt gael eu cytuno yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Dengys mai Tony Blair yw'r meistr o hyd—beth ddigwyddodd i atebion Cymru i broblemau

Cymru.

What has the Government achieved since 15 October? Precious little. The only new policy achievement I can find is the giving of concessionary bus fares to pensioners. Yes, that is an achievement, but it is only one policy initiative in eight weeks. No wonder the electorate believes that this Government is under-performing.

There is, however, one matter on which the First Minister excels, namely on his defence of his embattled former Minister for Economic Development. He stubbornly refuses to appoint anyone in his place. His press officer said that the First Minister will wait as long as is necessary to bring Mike German back into his Cabinet. This display of loyalty may be laudable, but it is obviously misplaced. It seems that nothing will budge the First Minister. The whole Government may be paralysed as he seeks to juggle three jobs. Ordinary Assembly Members from his own party are becoming restless, but nothing deters him.

Our advice to the First Minister is clear: his duty is to provide leadership and devote his energies wholeheartedly to the task of leading his Government. The way he dissipates his energies is debilitating. It is causing immense damage to his position and to the authority of his Government. It must stop now.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: It is time for you to wind up.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: The First Minister should appoint a Minister for Economic Development and get on with the job of being First Minister. We remind him that it is a job, which this Assembly elected him to discharge.

Peter Rogers: People in north Wales have suffered a triple whammy in 'three-jobs-Morgan', because he is also the Minister with responsibility for north Wales. The stubbornness of the First Minister in retaining these three jobs is damaging to that area. I live in an area that has bucked the general trend: unemployment figures rose at the last

Beth a gyflawnodd y Llywodraeth ers 15 Hydref? Fawr ddim. Yr unig bolisi newydd hyd y gwelaf i yw rhoi tocyn mantais bws i bensiynwyr. Ydyw, mae hynny'n gyflawniad, ond dim ond un fenter polisi ydyw mewn wyth wythnos. Nid oes ryfedd bod yr etholwyr yn credu bod y Llywodraeth hon yn tangyflawni.

Fodd bynnag, mae un mater y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn rhagori arno, sef y modd y mae'n amddiffyn ei gyn-Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Mae'n gyndyn iawn i benodi unrhyw un yn ei le. Dywedodd ei swyddog y wasg y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn aros cyhyd ag y bydd angen i ddod â Mike German yn ôl i'w Gabinet. Mae arddangos teyrngarwch o'r fath i'w ganmol efallai, ond yn amlwg mae wedi ei gamgyfeirio. Ymddengys na fydd dim yn newid meddwl y Prif Weinidog. Efallai y caiff y Llywodraeth gyfan ei pharlysu wrth iddo geisio ymdopi â thair swydd. Mae Aelodau Cynulliad cyffredin o'i blaid ei hun yn dechrau aflonyddu, ond nid oes unrhyw beth yn mennu arno.

Mae ein cyngor i'r Prif Weinidog yn glir: ei ddyletswydd yw darparu arweinyddiaeth ac ymroi yn gyfan gwbl i'r dasg o arwain ei Lywodraeth. Mae'r modd y mae'n gwastraffu ei egni yn ei wanhau. Mae'n achosi niwed aruthrol i'w statws ac i awdurdod ei Lywodraeth. Rhaid i hyn ddod i ben yn awr.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae'n bryd ichi ddirwyn i ben.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Dylai'r Prif Weinidog benodi Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o fod yn Brif Weinidog Cymru. Hoffem ei atgoffa mai swydd ydyw, y cafodd ei ethol gan y Cynulliad hwn i'w chyflawni.

Peter Rogers: Mae pobl yn y gogledd wedi dioddef tair melltith yn 'Morgan teirswydd', oherwydd ef hefyd yw'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y gogledd. Mae ystyfnigrwydd y Prif Weinidog wrth gadw'r tair swydd yn gwneud niwed i'r ardal honno. Yr wyf yn byw mewn ardal sydd wedi gwrthod y duedd gyffredinol: cododd ffigurau diweithdra y tro

count. We are also faced with the latest report that, by 2016, up to 10 per cent of the working population will have left Anglesey due to lack of opportunity.

We need commitment, but Rhodri has taken his eye off the ball. For example, he has neglected a developing crisis in north Wales regarding Objective 1. Môn Training runs two projects, worth over £10 million to the area, namely the skills for business, and skills for employment projects. However, because of the bureaucracy left unchallenged by the First Minister, it has had to close both schemes to new applications. This closure was announced in September.

Christine Chapman: I remind you of Objective 1 projects that have been successful in north Wales. Over the last few weeks, I have spent some time in north Wales and, while many projects are coming on board, several projects are already happening in that area.

Peter Rogers: I am sorry that I let you speak at that stage. If I had finished my contribution, I would have said that these projects were involved in training people and equipping them with skills in those areas. The rise in unemployment and the forecast for 2016 must be addressed.

4.30 p.m.

The closure was announced in September and the project was due to resume yesterday. However, the situation has worsened and Môn Training will not accept any more schemes until the end of March. It had an audit two weeks ago. In that audit, the auditor asked if he could have all the paperwork in two boxes to examine in another room. The staff asked him whether he must be joking, because there were six filing cabinets full of paperwork. This is the sort of problem that must be addressed. Other providers will not touch this scheme with a barge pole, because their operations would simply grind to a halt.

diwethaf. Yr ydym hefyd yn wynebu'r adroddiad diweddaraf y bydd hyd at 10 y cant o'r boblogaeth sy'n gweithio, erbyn 2016, wedi gadael Ynys Môn oherwydd prinder cyfleoedd.

Mae angen ymrwymiad arnom, ond mae Rhodri wedi tynnu ei lygad oddi ar y bêl. Er enghraifft, esgeulusodd argyfwng sy'n datblygu yn y gogledd o ran Amcan 1. Mae Hyfforddiant Môn yn rhedeg dau brosiect, gwerth dros £10 miliwn i'r ardal, sef prosiectau sgiliau ar gyfer busnes a sgiliau ar gyfer cyflogaeth. Fodd bynnag, gan nad yw Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi herio'r fiwrocratiaeth, bu'n rhaid cau'r ddau gynllun i geisiadau newydd. Cyhoeddwyd hynny ym mis Medi.

Christine Chapman: Hoffwn eich atgoffa o brosiectau Amcan 1 sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus yn y gogledd. Dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf, treuliais beth amser yn y gogledd, ac er bod sawl prosiect yn cael ei ystyried, mae sawl un eisoes ar waith yn yr ardal honno.

Peter Rogers: Mae'n edifar gennyf imi adael ichi siarad bryd hynny. Pe bawn wedi gorffen fy nghyfraniad, byddwn wedi dweud bod y prosiectau hyn yn cynnwys hyfforddi pobl a rhoi sgiliau iddynt yn y meysydd hynny. Rhaid ymdrin â'r cynnydd mewn diweithdra a'r rhagolwg ar gyfer 2016.

Cyhoeddwyd diwedd y cynlluniau ym mis Medi ac yr oedd disgwyl i'r prosiect ailddechrau ddoe. Fodd bynnag, mae'r sefyllfa wedi gwaethygu ac ni fydd Hyfforddiant Môn yn derbyn rhagor o gynlluniau tan ddiwedd Mawrth. Cafodd ei archwilio bythefnos yn ôl. Yn yr archwiliad hwnnw, gofynnodd yr archwilydd a allai gael y gwaith papur mewn dau flwch i'w archwilio mewn ystafell arall. Gofynnodd y staff iddo a oedd o ddifrif oherwydd yr oedd chwe chwpwrdd ffeilio yn llawn gwaith papur. Dyna'r math o broblem y mae'n rhaid ymdrin â hi. Ni fydd darparwyr eraill yn gwneud dim â'r cynllun hwn, oherwydd byddai eu gweithrediadau yn arafu ac yn peidio â bod.

Earlier, Rhodri said that the Objective 1 programme was developing well, but I have a message for him. First Minister, you may say that the money has been allocated, but it is not going anywhere. Young people are being denied training and businesses cannot develop their staff. This is the result of your stubbornness in hanging on to three jobs. It is about time we had a fresh start and met the needs of Wales as a whole.

Peter Law: My friend, the First Minister, is undoubtedly a good man who cares about Wales and its people. He is a full-time First Minister. There is no strain on him—I have no doubt about that. He is able to do the work. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: Where is he then?]

He is probably watching us on television.

This debate should not be about the First Minister, whose commitment is unquestionable. It gives me an opportunity to comment on a constitutional situation, which concerns me. I support amendment 1. Amendment 2 is infantile, which is what you would expect from the Liberal Democrats. It is a waste for them to be here.

However, when I consider the motion, I expect nothing else from this bunch of political charlatans, known as the Conservative Party, because it seeks to wreak havoc and make capital on any chief political points it wants. However, I am concerned about the First Minister and the good work that he is doing. I am also concerned that the National Assembly Government of Wales should have an appropriate approach to dealing with the people of Wales.

To suggest that the First Minister has not been able to carry out the economic development portfolio is nonsense and an insult in my opinion. He has ably carried out that portfolio along with his special responsibility for north Wales. I compliment him on that. He has carried out these roles with efficiency, commitment and belief for the last six months. He knows economic development backwards. He was the first Secretary for Economic Development, and nobody knows this subject better than him. This job has been in safe hands over the past

Yn gynharach, dywedodd Rhodri fod y rhaglen Amcan 1 yn datblygu'n dda, ond mae gennyf neges iddo. Brif Weinidog, efallai y dywedwch fod yr arian wedi ei neilltuo, ond nid yw'n mynd i unman. Ni chaiff pobl ifanc y cyfle i hyfforddi ac ni all busnesau ddatblygu eu staff. Dyma ganlyniad eich ystyfnigrwydd wrth ddal eich gafael ar dair swydd. Mae'n hen bryd inni ddechrau o'r newydd a diwallu anghenion Cymru gyfan.

Peter Law: Mae fy ffrind, y Prif Weinidog, yn ddiau, yn ddyn da sy'n gofidio am Gymru a'i phobl. Mae'n Brif Weinidog llawn amser. Nid oes unrhyw bwysau arno—yr wyf yn sier o hynny. Gall wneud y gwaith. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL Y CYNULLIAD: Ble mae ef felly?]

Mae'n siŵr ei fod yn ein gwyllo ar y teledu.

Ni ddylai'r ddadl hon ymwneud â'r Prif Weinidog, y mae ei ymrwymiad yn ddi-gwestiwn. Rhydd gyfle imi roi sylwadau ar sefyllfa gyfansoddiadol, sy'n fy ngofidio. Cefnogaf welliant 1. Mae gwelliant 2 yn blentynnaidd, sef yr hyn y byddech yn ei ddisgwyl gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Nid oes diben iddynt fod yma.

Fodd bynnag, pan ystyriaf y cynnig, nid wyf yn disgwyl unrhyw beth arall gan y criw hwn o dwyllwyr gwleidyddol, a adwaenir fel y Blaid Geidwadol, oherwydd ceisia wneud llanast o unrhyw bwynt gwleidyddol mawr a ddymuna gan droi'r dŵr i'w melyn ei hun. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf am y Prif Weinidog a'r gwaith da a wna. Credaf hefyd y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru fabwysiadu ymagwedd briodol tuag at ddelio â phobl Cymru.

Mae awgrymu nad yw Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi gallu cyflawni'r portffolio datblygu economaidd yn nonsens ac yn sarhad yn fy marn i. Cyflawnodd y portffolio hwnnw yn fedrus ynghyd â'i gyfrifoldeb arbennig dros y gogledd. Hoffwn ei ganmol am hynny. Mae wedi cyflawni'r rolau hyn gydag effeithlonrwydd, ymrwymiad a chred dros y chwe mis diwethaf. Gŵyr y cyfan am ddatblygu economaidd. Ef oedd yr Ysgrifennydd dros Ddatblygu Economaidd cyntaf, ac ni ŵyr neb am y pwnc yn well nag ef. Bu'r swydd hon mewn dwylo diogel dros

six months, but it has been a difficult time.

y chwe mis diwethaf, ond bu'n gyfnod anodd.

His approach to Mike German throughout his personal difficulties has been sympathetic, sincere, understanding and noble. I respect that as an Assembly Member and a human being. However, it is time to draw a line under what is becoming a difficult situation, which is to some extent is a constitutional aberration.

Bu'n gydymdeimladol, diffuant, deallgar a bonheddig yn ei ymagwedd tuag at Mike German drwy gydol ei anawsterau personol. Parchaf hynny fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad a bod dynol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bryd dod â sefyllfa sy'n mynd yn anodd i ben, sydd i ryw raddau yn wyriad cyfansoddiadol.

As democrats, people loan us power. We know that when we come here. We must remember that the structure laid down in the Government of Wales Act 1998 is a Government of nine Secretaries. That is how it was planned. Therefore, should we tamper with this structure? Should we change it? I do not know of any government in the world where a place at a cabinet table is kept open for six months, as has been the case here. The First Minister needs a full team. I ask him to start 2002 with such a team, and with a new Minister. I hope that that new Minister will come from the Labour Members, because heaven knows that there is enough commitment and belief among my Labour colleagues to be able to provide what is necessary to serve the people of Wales.

Fel democratiaid, mae pobl yn benthgrym i ni. Gwyddom hynny pan ddaethom yma. Rhaid inni gofio mai Llywodraeth o naw Ysgrifennydd oedd y strwythur a bennwyd yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Dyna sut y cafodd ei chynllunio. Felly, a ddylem ymyrryd â'r strwythur hwn? A ddylem ei newid? Ni wn am unrhyw lywodraeth yn y byd lle y cedwir lle yn y cabinet yn rhydd am chwe mis fel y gwnaethpwyd yma. Mae angen tîm llawn ar Brif Weinidog Cymru. Gofynnaf iddo ddechrau 2002 gyda thîm o'r fath, a chyda Gweinidog newydd. Gobeithiaf y daw'r Gweinidog newydd o blith yr Aelodau Llafur, oherwydd Duw a wŷr mae digon o ymrwymiad a chred ymhlith fy nghyd-Aelodau Llafur i allu darparu'r hyn sydd ei angen i wasanaethu pobl Cymru.

I do not take kindly to Alun Cairns's suggestion about appointing a Liberal Democrat Minister. We should not do that just because the administration has become a home for vagrant Liberal Democrats, especially where 'Give us a job, Bates' is concerned. His strategy must be to change overnight from 'toe-rag' to 'toe-wag'. That is what I think about him.

Nid wyf yn croesawu awgrym Alun Cairns ynglŷn â phenodi Gweinidog o blith y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Ni ddylem wneud hynny am fod y weinyddiaeth wedi dod yn gartref i Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol crwydrol, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â 'Rhowch swydd imi, Bates'. Rhaid iddo fabwysiadu strategaeth i newid dros nos o 'toe-rag' i 'toe-wag'. Dyna fy marn i amdano.

The First Minister's loyalty to Mike German has been unquestionable. However, loyalty is a two-way street. The last six months have been difficult for Mike, and we have heard of the difficulties that he has had to deal with. Having said that, he knows that, as far as many people are concerned, his current position is virtually untenable regarding a post as a member of the Cabinet. I publicly plead with him to release the First Minister from his pledge to hold the job open. It is neither appropriate nor fair.

Bu teyrngarwch Prif Weinidog Cymru i Mike German yn ddi-gwestiwn. Fodd bynnag, mae teyrngarwch yn gweithio ddwy ffordd. Bu'r chwe mis diwethaf yn gyfnod anodd i Mike, a chlywsom am yr anawsterau y bu'n rhaid iddo ddelio â hwy. Ar ôl dweud hynny, fe wŷr fod ei sefyllfa bresennol, i lawer o bobl, bron yn anghynnaladwy o ran swydd fel aelod o'r Cabinet. Erfyniaf arno i ryddhau'r Prif Weinidog o'i addewid i gadw'r swydd ar agor. Nid yw'n briodol nac yn deg.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful to Peter for giving way. However, does he not agree, in the last analysis, that it is for the First Minister to demonstrate leadership? He is, after all, the First Minister, and it is for him to make it clear that he needs a separate Minister for Economic Development. It is not fair to blame the former Deputy First Minister. I can understand why he would want to do so—to shift the blame to the other side of the partnership Government. It is for the First Minister—and I wish he were present—to show leadership on this occasion.

Peter Law: You just cost me 30 seconds. Although I do not agree with it, we have this abominable partnership, which is equal—I am informed—as far as Labour and the Liberal Democrats are concerned. A responsibility of loyalty lies with both sides, which is why I plead with the leader of the Liberal Democrats to make that public announcement. Over the past six months, the people of Wales—and indeed many in the Liberal Democrat Party—have looked on with anxiety and some consternation, and they agree with me that a line should now be drawn.

It is not so much a personal matter for the First Minister as an obligation to the nation. I look forward to the new year and to the First Minister's opportunity to appoint a new Minister, to help take forward the important policies that he is designing and developing for the good of all the people of Wales. The way forward—the way to improve the quality of life for the people of Wales—is a new Cabinet team.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Peter am ildio. Fodd bynnag, oni chytuna, yn y diwedd, mai penderfyniad y Prif Weinidog yw arddangos arweinyddiaeth? Ef wedi'r cyfan, yw Prif Weinidog Cymru, a'i ddyletswydd ef yw egluro bod angen Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ar wahân arno. Nid yw'n deg beio'r cyn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog. Gallaf ddeall pam y byddai am wneud hynny—rhoi'r bai ar ochr arall y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Dyletswydd y Prif Weinidog—a hoffwn pe bai yn bresennol—yw dangos arweinyddiaeth ar yr achlysur hwn.

Peter Law: Yr ydych newydd golli 30 eiliad i mi. Er na chytunaf â hi, mae'r bartneriaeth ffaidd hon gennym, sydd yn gyfartal—fe'm hysbysir—o ran Llafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae gan y ddwy ochr gyfrifoldeb o ran teyrngarwch, a dyna pam yr erfyniaf ar arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i wneud y cyhoeddiad cyhoeddus hwnnw. Dros y chwe mis diwethaf, mae pobl Cymru—ac yn wir llawer ym Mhlaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—wedi gwyllo gyda phryder a rhywfaint o syndod, a chytunant â mi y dylid dod â'r mater i ben yn awr.

Nid yw gymaint yn fater personol i'r Prif Weinidog ond rhwymedigaeth i'r genedl. Edrychaf ymlaen at y flwyddyn newydd ac at gyfle'r Prif Weinidog i benodi Gweinidog newydd, er mwyn helpu i ddatblygu'r polisïau pwysig y mae'n eu cynllunio a'u datblygu er budd pawb yng Nghymru. Y ffordd ymlaen—y ffordd o wella ansawdd bywyd pobl Cymru—yw drwy gael tîm Cabinet newydd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Gobeithiaf y bydd pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad, o ba blaidd bynnag, yn cytuno mai'r swydd wleidyddol bwysicaf yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd yw swydd Prif Weinidog Cymru, ac mae angen iddo ganolbwyntio'n gyfan gwbl ar y swydd honno i gynnig arweiniad i'r Cynulliad yn ystod ei flynyddoedd cynnar, wrth inni geisio sefydlu gwleidyddiaeth ddemocrataidd yng Nghymru. Mae angen gweledigaeth ac arweiniad arno, ac mae angen iddo yrru'r prosiect hwnnw ymlaen os yw gwleidyddiaeth Cymru, o ran datganoli grym, am fod yn broses ac nid yn ddigwyddiad. Tra bod amheuaeth ynghylch gallu'r Prif Weinidog i dreulio'r amser angenrheidiol ar y swydd, er mwyn gyrru'r prosiect ymlaen, mae perygl y bydd gwleidyddiaeth ddatganoledig yng Nghymru yn ddigwyddiad ac nid yn broses.

Un o aelodau'r Blaid Lafur, John Morris, a ddywedodd nad yw'r sefydliad hwn eto wedi ystyried o ddifrif y pwerau sydd ganddo; nad yw eto wedi ceisio defnyddio'r pwerau hynny i'r eithaf. Os yw hynny'n wir—a daw'r feirniadaeth o'r Blaid Lafur—pwy sydd ar fai? Syrthia'r bai ar arweinydd y Llywodraeth, Prif Weinidog Cymru. Dylai'r swydd honno fod yn swydd amser llawn.

Ni fyddai unrhyw un yn dadlau yn erbyn y gosodiad bod angen Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd amser llawn arnom. Dangosodd ystadegau a ryddhawyd heddiw bod mwy o bobl Cymru a Phrydain ar gymorth incwm yn awr na phan ddaeth y Llywodraeth Lafur i rym yn 1997. Nid fy ffigurau i mohonynt, ond ffigurau'r Llywodraeth. Gwyddom fod problemau gydag economi Cymru, ac mae Ewrop wedi cydnabod hynny drwy estyn Amcan 1 inni, nid fel rhodd o Ewrop, ond fel cydnabyddiaeth bod rhan helaeth o Gymru yn gymharol dlawd o'i chymharu â Phrydain ac Ewrop. Mae angen Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd amser llawn i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hynny.

Gwyddom oll fod problemau yn bodoli yng ngogledd Cymru. Mae pobl y Gogledd yn teimlo nad ydynt yn rhan o'r broses o ddatganoli grym gwleidyddol i Gymru, ac nad yw'r Cynulliad yn berthnasol iddynt. Byddai'n swydd amser llawn i geisio

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I hope that all Assembly Members, from whichever party, agree that the most important political post in Wales currently is that of First Minister, and that he needs to concentrate fully on that post to offer leadership to the Assembly during its early years, as we try to establish democratic politics in Wales. He needs vision and leadership, and must drive that project forward if Welsh politics, and devolution itself, is to be a process and not an event. While doubt persists over the First Minister's ability to devote the necessary time to the post, to drive that project forward, there is a danger that devolved politics in Wales will be an event and not a process.

It was a Labour Party member, John Morris, who said that this institution had yet to seriously consider the powers that it has; it has not yet tried to take full advantage of those powers. If that is true—and the criticism comes from the Labour Party—who is to blame? The blame lies with the leader of the Government, the First Minister. That post should be a full-time post.

No-one would argue with the claim that we need a full-time Minister for Economic Development. Statistics released today show that more people in Wales and Britain are on income support now than when the Labour Government came to power in 1997. Those are the Government's figures, not mine. We know that Wales has economic problems, and Europe has acknowledged that by making Objective 1 funding available to us, not as a gift from Europe, but as acknowledgement that a large part of Wales is relatively poor compared with Britain and Europe. We need a full-time Minister for Economic Development to tackle those problems.

We all know that problems exist in north Wales. People in north Wales feel that they are not part of the process of devolving political power to Wales, and that the Assembly is irrelevant to them. It would be a full-time job to convince the residents of

argyhoeddi trigolion y Gogledd i ymrwymo i'r broses o ddatganoli grym gwleidyddol i Gymru.

north Wales to commit themselves to the process of devolving political power to Wales.

4:40 p.m.

Beth bynnag yw rhinweddau Rhodri Morgan—ac nid oes neb yn amau ei allu—nid oes modd i un person wneud y swyddi hynny i gyd. Beth bynnag fo'i allu a'i brofiad gwleidyddol, y mae'n sicr o fethu. Nid yw'n ymarferol bosibl, a dyna pahan y penderfynodd Grŵp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, wrth edrych ar swyddogaethau'r sefydliad, fod angen naw ysgrifennydd i gyflawni'r gwaith. Dyna oedd yr awgrym. Serch hynny, y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ceisio cyflawni dwy swydd, ac yn methu. Nid yw hynny oherwydd diffyg gallu, ond oherwydd ei bod yn ddynol amhosibl i unrhyw un wneud hynny.

Whatever Rhodri Morgan's virtues may be—and no-one doubts his ability—it is impossible for one person to carry out all of those jobs. Despite his ability and political experience, he is bound to fail. It is not practically possible, which is why the National Assembly Advisory Group decided, when it considered the institution's functions, that nine secretaries were needed to undertake the work. That was the recommendation. However, the First Minister is trying to carry out two jobs, and failing. It is not due to lack of ability, but because it is not humanly possible for someone to do that.

On the wonderful term adopted to describe the Assembly Government—the WAG—we must ask whether a full-time First Minister would have allowed for that to be used. The consultation process cost £7,000, and the focus group said that there was a danger that the term could be considered to be slightly ridiculous. We could argue about 'slightly', but not about 'ridiculous'. It is the subject of ridicule in Wales. If we had a full-time First Minister, he would have been aware of the problem and would not have allowed it to happen. We now have a rudderless and leaderless Government because Rhodri Morgan, who could ably carry out his functions as First Minister, is trying to do the impossible in trying to carry out three jobs.

O ran y term gwych a fabwysiadwyd i ddisgrifio Llywodraeth y Cynulliad—y WAG—rhaid inni ofyn a fyddai Prif Weinidog llawn amser wedi caniatáu i hwnnw gael ei ddefnyddio. Costiodd y broses ymgynghori £7,000, a dywedodd y grŵp ffocws bod perygl y gellid ystyried bod y term braidd yn hurt. Gellid dadlau ynghylch 'braidd' ond nid am 'hurt'. Mae'n destun hwyl yng Nghymru. Pe byddai gennym Brif Weinidog llawn amser, byddai'n ymwybodol o'r broblem ac ni fyddai wedi caniatáu iddo ddigwydd. Bellach mae gennym Lywodraeth heb lyw a heb arweinydd oherwydd bod Rhodri Morgan, a allai gyflawni ei swyddogaethau fel Prif Weinidog Cymru'n hawdd, yn ceisio cyflawni'r amhosibl drwy gyflawni tair swydd.

Rod Richards *a gododd—*

Rod Richards *rose—*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You are almost out of time, Rhodri.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae eich amser bron ar ben, Rhodri.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I will take an intervention.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Derbyniaf ymyriad.

Rod Richards: A ydych yn cytuno bod llawer o bobl yng Nghymru yn gresynu at y ffaith mai Rhodri Morgan sydd bellach yn gyfrifol am yr economi, o gofio iddo wneud ei enw yn San Steffan drwy erlid Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru?

Rod Richards: Do you agree that many people in Wales deplore the fact that Rhodri Morgan is now responsible for the economy in Wales, given that he made his name in Westminster by persecuting the Welsh Development Agency?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cytunaf, yn sicr. Pe bai Rhodri Morgan yn Aelod cyffredin o'r Cynulliad, ef fyddai'r cyntaf i feirniadu unrhyw un a fyddai'n ceisio cyflawni tair swydd yn hytrach na chanolbwyntio ar un. Dyna a wnaeth yn San Steffan pan oedd yn Aelod Seneddol ar y meinciau cefn.

We have a WAG, a Government, a Cabinet, a First Minister and Minister for Economic Development who are all wilfully trying to avoid governing Wales.

Ron Davies: All of us understand that, behind this debate today, there are difficult personal circumstances for Mike German. I understand and have sympathy for the difficulty he is facing. I do not know how the matter will be resolved as a result of the police inquiry or what the Crown Prosecution Service will decide. I do not know and I do not really care. However, I hope that it is resolved to your advantage, Mike. I have not seen anything that suggests that you were deliberately culpable of any wrongdoing. My personal hope is that you will be acquitted as a result of the investigations.

David Davies *rose—*

Ron Davies: That had to be said. However, having said that, the Assembly now faces a difficult set of circumstances. Even Rhodri understands, because he has said that present circumstances are unsatisfactory, that he does not want them to continue and would like for them to be resolved as soon as possible. Everyone understands that it is not possible for Rhodri to carry out two jobs effectively. I made it clear to him that it was not unreasonable to carry out two jobs for a few months during the summer recess, in the hope that the difficulties would be resolved as a result of an early resolution of the circumstances surrounding Mike German. That did not happen, and we now face the prospect of six months of Rhodri attempting, to the very best of his considerable ability, to do two jobs and doing them well. However, there is no prospect of an early resolution of the circumstances surrounding Mike German. If we received an indication from the police, the CPS or the Attorney General that they

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I agree, certainly. Were Rhodri Morgan an ordinary Assembly Member, he would be the first to criticise someone for trying to carry out three jobs instead of concentrating on one. That is what he did in Westminster when he was a backbench Member of Parliament.

Mae gennym WAG, Llywodraeth, Cabinet, Prif Weinidog a Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd â phob un ohonynt yn gwneud eu gorau i osgoi llywodraethu Cymru.

Ron Davies: Mae pawb ohonom yn deall bod amgylchiadau personol anodd i Mike German y tu ôl i'r ddadl hon heddiw. Yr wyf yn deall yr anhawster y mae'n ei wynebu ac yn cydymdeimlo ag ef. Ni wn sut y caiff y mater ei ddatrys o ganlyniad i ymchwiliad yr heddlu na beth fydd penderfyniad Gwasanaeth Erlyn y Goron. Ni wn ac nid wyf yn poeni ynglŷn â hynny. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y caiff ei ddatrys er budd i chi, Mike. Nid wyf wedi gweld unrhyw beth sy'n awgrymu eich bod yn fwriadol euog o unrhyw drosedd. Yn bersonol yr wyf yn gobeithio y cewch eich dyfarnu'n ddiueuog o ganlyniad i'r ymchwiliadau.

David Davies *a gododd—*

Ron Davies: Yr oedd yn rhaid dweud hynny. Fodd bynnag, wedi dweud hynny, mae'r Cynulliad bellach yn wynebu amgylchiadau anodd. Mae hyd yn oed Rhodri'n deall, oherwydd dywedodd fod yr amgylchiadau presennol yn anfoddhaol, nad yw'n dymuno iddynt barhau a'i fod yn dymuno iddynt gael eu datrys cyn gynted â phosibl. Mae pawb yn deall nad yw'n bosibl i Rhodri gyflawni dwy swydd yn effeithiol. Eglurais iddo nad oedd yn afresymol iddo gyflawni dwy swydd am ychydig fisoedd yn ystod toriad yr haf, yn y gobaith y caiff yr anawsterau eu datrys o ganlyniad i benderfyniad buan ar sefyllfa Mike German. Ni ddigwyddodd hynny, a bellach yr ydym yn wynebu'r tebygolrwydd o gael chwe mis o Rhodri'n ceisio, hyd eithaf ei allu sylweddol, i gyflawni dwy swydd a'u gwneud yn dda. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n debygol y caiff sefyllfa Mike German ei datrys yn fuan. Pe byddem wedi cael arwydd gan yr heddlu, Gwasanaeth Erlyn y Goron neu'r Twrnai Cyffredinol y caiff ei datrys yn

will be resolved shortly, we could agree to wait a further fortnight or three weeks perhaps for that to happen. However, there is a continuing police investigation in which the European Union anti-fraud unit is involved, and it will take the CPS a considerable time after that to examine the case. It is my understanding that, even if the CPS decides on a course of action, it will have to refer it to the Attorney General because a public figure is involved, and believe me, that process will not be dealt with expeditiously.

David Melding *rose—*

Ron Davies: Let me develop my argument, David. There is a long process in front of us, therefore. It is not as if Rhodri doing two jobs was the only way out of this. There are many alternatives. There would be no shortage of volunteers from your own party, Mike. I am sure that if Rhodri wanted to be expansive and wanted to broaden his coalition, he could even ask Phil Williams to do the job. I daresay that there would be one or two willing hands in the Labour Party who would be prepared to help out in these difficult circumstances. Why has Rhodri not done it? He need not necessarily make a permanent appointment. It could be made on the clear understanding that it was a temporary appointment. Therefore, why has it not been done?

That is the question that I have kept asking myself, and it has not been answered. I can only assume, Mike, that it is because, somehow or other, the Liberal Democrats have decided that they will exercise some sort of veto, or that you, Mike, have entered into some sort of arrangement with Rhodri that has not been made clear but which is blocking Rhodri from making that appointment. That is a disappointment in your own terms. I believe in co-operative politics. I broadly agree with inter-party co-operation—sometimes I would like to think that we could have intra-party co-operation. You, Mike, wanted to establish coalition politics. Entering into that agreement meant a commitment and concessions on your part. You have a responsibility now to ask yourself whether this arrangement that you have—either spoken or unspoken—with the First

fuan, gallem gytuno i aros am bythefnos neu dair wythnos arall efallai i hynny ddigwydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r heddlu yn parhau â'i ymchwiliad ac mae uned gwrth-dwyll yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ynghlwm ag ef, a bydd Gwasanaeth Erlyn y Goron yn cymryd amser sylweddol ar ôl hynny i archwilio'r achos. Yr wyf ar ddeall, hyd yn oed os bydd Gwasanaeth Erlyn y Goron yn penderfynu ar y camau i'w cymryd, y bydd angen cyfeirio'r mater i'r Twrnai Cyffredinol oherwydd bod ffigwr cyhoeddus dan sylw, a chredwch fi, ni chaiff y broses honno ei chyflawni'n fuan.

David Melding *a gododd—*

Ron Davies: Gadewch imi ddatblygu fy nadl, David. Mae proses hir o'n blaenau, felly. Nid cael Rhodri i gyflawni dwy swydd yw'r unig ffordd o ddatrys hyn. Mae sawl dewis arall. Ni fyddai prinder gwirfoddolwyr yn eich plaid chi, Mike. Yr wyf yn siŵr pe byddai Rhodri am fod yn eangfrydig ac am ymestyn ei glymblaid, y gallai hyd yn oed ofyn i Phil Williams wneud y swydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai un neu ddau Aelod o'r Blaidd Lafur yn barod i helpu o dan yr amgylchiadau anodd hyn. Pam nad yw Rhodri wedi gwneud hyn? Ni fyddai angen iddo benodi'n barhaol o anghenraid. Gallai benodi ar y ddealltwriaeth glir ei fod yn benodiad dros dro. Felly, pam nad yw wedi'i wneud eisoes?

Dyna'r cwestiwn y bûm yn ei ofyn i'm hunan, ac ni chefais ateb. Cymeraf, Mike, mai'r rheswm yw bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, rywsut neu'i gilydd, wedi penderfynu y byddant yn gweithredu rhyw fath o waharddiad, neu eich bod chi, Mike, wedi dod i ryw fath o gytundeb gyda Rhodri na wnaed yn glir ond sy'n atal Rhodri rhag gwneud y penodiad hwnnw. Mae hynny'n siom yn eich termau chi. Credaf mewn gwleidyddiaeth gydweithredol. Cytunaf yn gyffredinol â chydweithrediad rhyngbleidiol—weithiau hoffwn feddwl y gallem gael cydweithrediad o fewn pleidiau. Yr oeddech chi, Mike, am sefydlu gwleidyddiaeth glymblaid. Yr oedd gwneud y cytundeb hwnnw'n golygu ymrwymiad a chonhesiynau ar eich rhan. Mae cyfrifoldeb arnoch bellach i ofyn a yw'r cytundeb sydd gennych—ar lafar neu beidio—gyda'r Prif

Minister and the administration, is such that you cannot make that gesture, and whether you want this unsatisfactory set of circumstances to continue. That is unreasonable. You believe in the coalition, you have a deep commitment to the future of the Welsh economy and you understand that the present arrangements cannot be discharged satisfactorily.

I believe that you, Mike, understand that the best interests of the Assembly are greater than the best interests of individuals. I cannot believe that you would knowingly or willingly sacrifice the best interests of the National Assembly for your own personal interest or for the best interests, as you see them, of the Liberal Democrat party. I do not believe that if Rhodri were to take any other course of action, you and your party would sabotage the coalition. I do not believe that if you were faced with that choice that that is what you would do. Therefore, you and your party have a clear responsibility now to make it clear to Rhodri that you will remove from him any residual obligation that he might have to keep this unsatisfactory state of affairs in existence any longer.

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I am pleased to respond to this debate on behalf of the Cabinet. As it is the festive season and the season of goodwill, I shall try to temper my comments accordingly.

This is the time of year when we all attend carol services and school concerts. Last night, I attended a fire brigade carol concert. The priest spoke about the plight of the homeless and the countryless—the asylum seekers who are fleeing war, pestilence and persecution. This morning I was at an infants school in Gowerton—the infants school that I attended—where I watched the nativity play and saw the hopeful faces and heard the hopeful voices celebrating. Then I come here this afternoon to hear the same old record playing time and time again. Those of us who are conviction politicians, like the First Minister and myself, came into politics to change people's lives for the better. This resolution as it stands does nothing for the people of Wales. What arrogance this resolution shows. As Peter Law often

Weinidog a'r weinyddiaeth, yn golygu na allwch wneud hynny, ac a ydych yn dymuno i'r amgylchiadau anfoddhaol hyn barhau. Mae hynny'n afresymol. Yr ydych yn credu yn y glymblaid, mae gennych ymrwymiad mawr i ddyfodol economi Cymru ac yr ydych yn deall na ellir cyflawni'r trefniadau presennol yn foddhaol.

Credaf eich bod chi, Mike, yn deall bod budd y Cynulliad yn bwysicach na budd unigolion. Ni chredaf y byddech yn aberthu budd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn fwriadol nag o wirfodd er eich budd eich hun nag er budd plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, fel y gwelwch hwy. Ni chredaf pe byddai Rhodri'n gweithredu mewn modd gwahanol, y byddech chi a'ch plaid yn tanseilio'r glymblaid. Ni chredaf mai dyna y byddech yn ei wneud pe byddech yn gorfod wynebu'r dewis hwnnw. Felly, mae arnoch chi a'ch plaid gyfrifoldeb clir bellach i egluro i Rhodri y byddwch yn ei ryddhau oddi wrth unrhyw rwymedigaeth weddilliol bosibl i barhau â'r sefyllfa anfoddhaol hon yn hwy.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Mae'n bleser gennyf ymateb i'r ddadl hon ar ran y Cabinet. Gan ein bod yn dymor o ddathlu ac o ewyllys da, ceisiaf gymedroli fy sylwadau'n briodol.

Dyma'r adeg o'r flwyddyn pan fydd pawb ohonom yn mynychu gwasanaethau carolau a chyngherddau ysgol. Neithiwr, bûm yng nghyngherdd carolau y frigâd dân. Siaradodd yr offeiriad am sefyllfa'r digartref a'r di-wlad—y ceiswyr lloches sy'n dianc rhag rhyfel, haint ac erledigaeth. Y bore yma yr oeddwn mewn ysgol fabanod yn Nhre-gŵyr—yr ysgol fabanod a fynychais i—lle gwyliais ddrama'r geni gan weld yr wynebâu llawn gobaith a chlywed y lleisiau llawn gobaith yn dathlu. Yna deuthum yma y prynhawn yma i glywed pobl yn rhygnu ar yr un tant. Daeth y rhai ohonom sy'n wleidyddion ag argyhoeddiad, fel Prif Weinidog Cymru a minnau, i'r byd gwleidyddol i newid bywydau pobl er gwell. Ni wna'r cynnig hwn, fel y saif, unrhyw beth ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Mae'n dangos

reminds us, when the Conservatives were in Government, Wales was a political wasteland, without hope and with record unemployment, a generation with no future.

Nick Bourne *rose—*

Edwina Hart: We have heard enough from you this afternoon, Nick. Youth unemployment is now at 25 per cent of its level during those Tory years. Now they want to tell us—and this is absolute arrogance—how to run the country, after their history of colonialism and, as I think we all acknowledge, their recent pragmatic conversion to devolution.

4.50 p.m.

Central to the economic development of Wales in the coming years is how well we use the benefits of Objective 1 status. The social partners drive Objective 1 projects. That is the nature of the programme. The Assembly Government cannot drive this agenda on its own. However, it can provide guidance, leadership, back-up and co-ordination. Providing such support and co-ordination requires not only the involvement of a Minister for Economic Development, but the active intervention of the whole Cabinet, both individually and collectively. Christine Chapman mentioned the many successful Objective 1 projects in north Wales. Such projects are now being implemented across the Objective 1 area.

Economic development cannot be wholly compartmentalised. In order to drive forward our economy, we must address issues across the boundaries of responsibilities, whether they be health and social services, education and lifelong learning, local government, community development, transport, environment or any of the other portfolios in this administration. Therefore, it is crucial that whoever is responsible for economic development brings these elements together. The First Minister does so day after day, and it is fully compatible with his role as Minister for Economic Development.

haerllugrwydd. Fel y mae Peter Law yn aml yn ein hatgoffa, pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr yn llywodraethu, yr oedd Cymru'n ddiffeithwch gwleidyddol, heb obaith a chyda'r diweithdra mwyaf erioed, yn genhedlaeth heb ddyfodol.

Nick Bourne *a gododd—*

Edwina Hart: Yr ydym wedi clywed digon gennych chi y prynhawn yma, Nick. Mae diweithdra ymysg ieuenctid bellach 25 y cant o'r hyn a gafwyd yn ystod blynyddoedd y Toriaid. Yn awr maent am ddweud wrthym—ac mae hyn yn haerllugrwydd llwyr—sut i redeg y wlad, ar ôl eu hanes o wladychiaeth ac, fel y credaf y mae pawb ohonom yn ei gydnabod, eu tröedigaeth bragmatig i ddatganoli.

Yr hyn sy'n ganolog i ddatblygiad economaidd Cymru yn y blynyddoedd i ddod yw pa mor dda yr ydym yn defnyddio manteision statws Amcan 1. Mae'r partneriaid cymdeithasol yn gyrru prosiectau Amcan 1. Dyna natur y rhaglen. Ni all Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yrru'r agenda hon ar ei phen ei hun. Fodd bynnag, gall roi canllaw, arweiniad, cefnogaeth a chydlynu'r gwaith. Mae rhoi cymorth a chydlynu'r gwaith yn y fath fodd yn golygu cynnwys nid yn unig y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, ond ymyriad gweithredol y Cabinet cyfan, yn unigol ac ar y cyd. Soniodd Christine Chapman am y prosiectau Amcan 1 llwyddiannus niferus yng ngogledd Cymru. Mae prosiectau o'r fath bellach yn cael eu gweithredu ledled y ardal Amcan 1.

Ni ellir rhoi datblygu economaidd yn un adran ar ei ben ei hun. Er mwyn gyrru ein heconomi ymlaen, rhaid inni ymdrin â materion sy'n rhychwantu gwahanol gyfrifoldebau, boed yn iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, addysg a dysgu gydol oes, llywodraeth leol, datblygu cymunedol, trafnidiaeth, yr amgylchedd neu unrhyw rai o'r portffolios eraill yn y weinyddiaeth hon. Felly, mae'n hanfodol bod y sawl sy'n gyfrifol am ddatblygu economaidd yn dwyn yr elfennau hyn ynghyd. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn gwneud hyn ddydd ar ôl dydd, ac mae'n hollol gydnaws â'i rôl fel Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu

Economaidd.

Cynog Dafis: The Minister is winding up this debate effectively. However, the logic of what she has just said is that the First Minister should fulfil the two roles for the duration. She cannot be serious about that.

Edwina Hart: I am serious about everything that I say. The First Minister has performed an exemplary co-ordinating role in this area. The Tories do not accept that the First Minister can also perform the role of Minister for Economic Development. However, they have so far been silent as to their vision on how the job should be done differently. You are reverting to your stock-in-trade of criticism for criticism's sake.

Rhodri Morgan has set out to create a fundamental change in political leadership. He has created a genuinely collective leadership of all Ministers. He has devolved and shared responsibility among Ministers, but the emphasis on individual ministerial responsibility has been accompanied by effective co-ordination across Ministries.

In Wales, we have an economy of scale that enables us to tackle problems in the round. Most of the challenges that face us involve the economy, education, health and social services. In Whitehall, these policy areas are dealt with by massive, separate departments, housed in huge, mutually discrete buildings. Devolution has changed Wales. Empire-building is not on our agenda. You have heard the First Minister refer to Team Wales. This is not spin. It is an accurate shorthand description of how we work to benefit everybody in Wales and to have partnership in Wales.

When we entered our successful partnership with the Liberal Democrats, we redefined the role of First Minister. One important feature of that role was co-ordination. The First Minister would bring together the work of all Ministers. I admit that this is not a new idea. Clem Attlee, who, in retrospect, is viewed as a successful twentieth century Prime

Cynog Dafis: Mae'r Gweinidog yn dirwyn y ddadl hon i ben yn effeithiol. Fodd bynnag, rhesymeg yr hyn a ddywedodd yw y dylai'r Prif Weinidog gyflawni'r ddwy rôl hyd nes y bydd y mater hwn wedi'i ddatrys. Ni all fod o ddifrif ynghylch hynny.

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf o ddifrif ynghylch popeth a ddywedaf. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi cyflawni rôl gydgysylltiol ragorol yn y maes hwn. Nid yw'r Toriaid yn derbyn y gall y Prif Weinidog hefyd gyflawni rôl y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Fodd bynnag, hyd yma buont yn dawedog o ran eu gweledigaeth o'r ffordd y dylid cyflawni'r swydd yn wahanol. Yr ydych yn troi at eich dull arferol o feirniadu dim ond er mwyn beirniadu.

Mae Rhodri Morgan wedi mynd ati i greu newid sylfaenol mewn arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol. Mae wedi creu cyd-arweinyddiaeth wirioneddol o'r holl Weinidogion. Mae wedi datganoli a rhannu cyfrifoldebau ymysg Gweinidogion, ond bu'r pwyslais ar gyfrifoldeb unigol Gweinidogion ochr yn ochr â chydweithrediad effeithiol ar draws y Gweinyddiaethau.

Yng Nghymru, mae gennym arbedion maint sy'n ein galluogi i ymdrin â phroblemau yn eu holl agweddau. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r heriau a wynebwn yn ymwneud â'r economi, addysg, iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Yn Whitehall, ymdrinnir â'r meysydd polisi hyn gan adrannau anferth, annibynnol, wedi'u lleoli mewn adeiladau anferth, ar wahân. Mae datganoli wedi newid Cymru. Nid yw adeiladu ymerodraeth ar ein hagenda. Yr ydych wedi clywed y Prif Weinidog yn cyfeirio at Dîm Cymru. Nid sbin mo hynny. Mae'n ddisgrifiad cryno o'r ffordd yr ydym yn gweithio er budd pawb yng Nghymru ac er mwyn partneriaeth yng Nghymru.

Pan luniwyd ein partneriaeth lwyddiannus â'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, diffiniwyd rôl y Prif Weinidog o'r newydd. Un nodwedd bwysig oedd cydgysylltu. Byddai'r Prif Weinidog yn dod â gwaith yr holl Weinidogion ynghyd. Yr wyf yn cyfaddef nad yw hyn yn syniad newydd. Yr oedd Clem Attlee, a gaiff ei ystyried, o edrych yn ôl, fel

Minister, saw himself as the Cabinet Chair. This is not to deny the First Minister's leadership role. Most people in Wales without an axe to grind acknowledge the First Minister's leadership role. If you go out and about on the streets with the First Minister—

un o Brif Weinidogion llwyddiannus yr ugeinfed ganrif, yn gweld ei hun fel Cadeirydd y Cabinet. Nid yw hyn yn diystyru rôl arweinyddiaeth y Prif Weinidog. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yng Nghymru nad oes ganddynt asgwrn i'w bigo yn cydnabod rôl arweinyddiaeth y Prif Weinidog. Pe byddech yn crwydro'r strydoedd gyda'r Prif Weinidog—

David Melding: Will you give way?

David Melding: A wnewch chi ildio?

Edwina Hart: No. When we go out and about—[*Interruption.*]

Edwina Hart: Na wna. Pan fyddwn yn crwydro'r—[*Torri ar draws.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn.

Edwina Hart: Can we have silence, please? When we go out and about with the First Minister daily to meet the people of Wales, we see that they understand who leads Wales. They identify with Rhodri Morgan, whether he is watching them playing rugby or whether he is talking to them in an old people's home. That is what the opposition hates more than anything. He is clearly defined as the First Minister and the leader of Wales.

Edwina Hart: A gawn ni ddistawrwydd, os gwelwch yn dda? Pan fyddwn yn crwydro gyda'r Prif Weinidog bob dydd i gwrdd â phobl Cymru, gwelwn eu bod yn deall pwy sy'n arwain Cymru. Maent yn uniaethu â Rhodri Morgan, pan fo'n eu gwyllo'n chwarae rygbi neu'n sgwrsio â hwy mewn cartref yr henoed. Dyna'r hyn y mae'r wrthblaid yn ei gasáu fwyaf. Caiff ei ddiffinio'n glir fel Prif Weinidog Cymru ac arweinydd Cymru.

The First Minister takes all his roles seriously. Peter Rogers said that north Wales is losing out. I believe that the First Minister has achieved much in ensuring that this is not a Cardiff-based Government. People—particularly those in north and west Wales—recognise that the First Minister is thinking about Wales and its future with various initiatives regarding the location of Government offices.

Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru'n cymryd ei holl rolau o ddifrif. Dywedodd Peter Rogers fod gogledd Cymru ar ei cholled. Credaf fod y Prif Weinidog wedi cyflawni llawer wrth sicrhau nad yw hon yn Llywodraeth a leolir yng Nghaerdydd. Mae pobl—yn enwedig y rhai hynny yng ngogledd a gorllewin Cymru—yn cydnabod bod y Prif Weinidog yn meddwl am Gymru a'i dyfodol gyda mentrau amrywiol o ran lleoliad swyddfeydd y Llywodraeth.

The economy is central to all these issues. The First Minister's co-ordination of issues involving the economy has been unprecedented. The last time that the Tories brought this old chestnut to the Assembly, the First Minister successfully defended his economic development portfolio. He then left the Chamber to address a conference on governance, which was attended by Canadian delegates. He addressed the conference in French, Welsh and English. I do not want to embarrass the First Minister and say nice things about him—even though it is the season of goodwill—but he has been an

Mae'r economi'n ganolog i'r hoff faterion hyn. Bu gwaith y Prif Weinidog o gydgyssylltu'r materion sy'n ymwneud â'r economi yn ddiglyffelyb. Y tro diwethaf i'r Toriaid ddod â'r hen ffefryn hwn i'r Cynulliad, amddiffynnodd y Prif Weinidog ei bortffolio datblygu economaidd yn llwyddiannus. Yna gadawodd y Siambr i annerch cynhadledd ar lywodraeth, a fynychwyd gan gynadleddwyr o Ganada. Anerchodd y gynhadledd yn Ffrangeg, yn Gymraeg ac yn Saesneg. Nid wyf am greu embaras i'r Prif Weinidog drwy ddweud pethau dymunol amdano—er ei bod yn

inspirational leader. His profile has benefited the administration. It has also benefited Wales, in that the First Minister has led delegations abroad, and that he is keen to attract investment to Wales.

I, therefore, respond to this debate with pleasure on behalf of the administration. Be under no illusions: the people of Wales are not interested in this debate. The people of Wales are interested in the issues that affect the homeless and the hungry, and issues such as education in schools. All you are doing is undervaluing the role of the Assembly across Wales. The First Minister is in charge, and I am certain that he will remain in charge after the next election. Let us not pretend that the Tory Party have any hope of coming to power here—you will never be elected to run Wales, and any notion, Nick, that you will be First Minister is the stuff of *Fantasy Island*.

Nick Bourne: We all remember the last badly-timed entrance by the First Minister, as it led to the departure of the then Deputy First Minister. I am sure that we will remember this one too. It is notable that the response given had obviously been written some time ago, and had not been tailored to the debate. It is extraordinary that there were only two speeches given by the Labour Party today, and, however Labour Members vote, the speeches were in support of the motion. This makes it clear that they have no truck with the First Minister holding two key roles in Wales.

Goodness knows why the Cabinet decided that the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities should speak on this, instead of the First Minister—or indeed the Minister for Economic Development. It did you no credit today. It was a speech that was not tailored to today's contributions. The debate is not about the record of the 18 years when the Conservative Government was in place, or the Labour Party's record in running this show—some of the time with the Liberal Democrats—it is about how the Assembly, the people of Wales, and Wales in general would be better-

dymor ewyllys da—ond bu'n arweinydd ysbrydoledig. Mae ei broffil wedi bod o fudd i'r weinyddiaeth. Mae hefyd wedi bod o fudd i Gymru, am fod y Prif Weinidog wedi arwain dirprwyaethau dramor a'i fod yn awyddus i ddenu buddsoddiad i Gymru.

Felly, mae'n bleser gennyf ymateb i'r ddadl hon ar ran y weinyddiaeth. Peidiwch â chael eich camarwain: nid oes gan bobl Cymru ddiddordeb yn y ddadl hon. Yr hyn y mae gan bobl Cymru ddiddordeb ynddo yw'r materion sy'n effeithio ar y digartref a'r newynog, a materion fel addysg mewn ysgolion. Y cwbl yr ydych yn ei wneud yw tanbrizio rôl y Cynulliad ledled Cymru. Y Prif Weinidog sydd wrth y llyw, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn parhau i fod wrth y llyw ar ôl yr etholiad nesaf. Peidiwch â gadael inni dwyllo ein hunain fod gan Blaid y Torïaid unrhyw obaith o ddod i rym yma—ni chewch eich ethol i redeg Cymru fyth, ac mae unrhyw syniad, Nick, mai chi fydd yn Brif Weinidog ar Gymru yn ffantasi llwyr.

Nick Bourne: Mae pawb ohonom yn cofio mynediad anamserol diwethaf y Prif Weinidog, gan iddo arwain at ymadawiad y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ar y pryd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn cofio hwn hefyd. Mae'n amlwg i'r ymateb a roddwyd gael ei ysgrifennu beth amser yn ôl, ac nad oedd wedi'i deilwra i'r ddadl. Mae'n anhygoel mai dim ond dwy araith a roddwyd gan y Blaid Lafur heddiw, a sut bynnag y bydd yr Aelodau Llafur yn pleidleisio, yr oedd yr areithiau o blaid y cynnig. Mae hyn yn ei gwneud yn amlwg nad ydynt yn cytuno y dylai'r Prif Weinidog gyflawni dwy rôl allweddol yng Nghymru.

Duw a wŷr pam y penderfynodd y Cabinet mai'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau a ddylai siarad ar hyn, yn hytrach na'r Prif Weinidog—neu y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd hyd yn oed. Ni ddaeth hyn â chlod ichi heddiw. Yr oedd yn araith na chafodd ei theilwra i'r cyfraniadau heddiw. Nid yw'r ddadl yn ymwneud â record y 18 mlynedd pan oedd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol mewn grym, na record y Blaid Lafur wrth fod wrth y llyw yma—gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol rywfaint o'r amser—mae'n ymwneud â sut y byddai'r Cynulliad, pobl Cymru, a Chymru

served by a full-time First Minister. We all know that that is the truth.

This partnership agreement, 'Putting Wales First', was supposed to bring respectability and stability to Wales. How are we putting Wales first when the First Minister is trying to do two jobs? We are also told that the partnership agreement requires goodwill and mutual trust. I agree with Peter Law and Ron Davies on that. If the former Deputy First Minister is holding up the appointment of a full-time Minister for Economic Development, it is time for Michael German to make clear that he will have no truck with that for the future. If it is, as I suspect, the First Minister delaying the process, it is time he listened to people—not just in my party, but those in Plaid Cymru, the Liberal Democrats, and many in his own party. I do not know to whom he has been listening.

If Rhodri Morgan felt that he must appoint another Liberal Democrat, I can understand his hesitation, particularly having heard Mick Bates' contribution—he mysteriously said 'in conclusion' halfway through his speech, having not had a beginning or a middle. I can understand why the First Minister would be worried about appointing a Liberal Democrat.

However—without looking at the personalities and without wishing to ruin too many political careers—there are many former Ministers, for example, Ron Davies, Tom Middlehurst, Peter Law, Christine Gwyther, and Rosemary Butler, and deputies, such as Alun Pugh and John Griffiths who could do the job on a temporary or on a permanent basis. How it can be said that it would be against the interests of Wales to have someone doing the job full-time, goodness only knows Minister. I do not know where you have been.

The First Minister has argued on previous occasions—although he did not argue this today, and I welcome him belatedly to the debate—that this is something to do with the South Wales Police. This is complete nonsense. How can the First Minister stepping aside for somebody on a temporary

yn well eu byd o gael eu gwasanaethu gan Brif Weinidog llawn amser. Gŵyr pawb ohonom mai dyna'r gwirionedd.

Yr oedd y cytundeb partneriaeth hwn, 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf', i fod i ddod â pharch a sefydlogrwydd i Gymru. Sut y gallwn fod yn rhoi Cymru'n gyntaf pan fo'r Prif Weinidog yn ceisio gwneud dwy swydd? Dywedwyd wrthym hefyd fod y cytundeb partneriaeth yn gofyn am ewylllys da ac ymddiriedaeth ar y cyd. Cytunaf â Peter Law a Ron Davies ar hynny. Os yw'r cyn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog yn rhwystro penodiad Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd llawn amser, mae'n bryd i Michael German egluro na fydd yn parhau i wneud yn y dyfodol. Os, fel yr wyf yn amau, mai'r Prif Weinidog sy'n gohirio'r broses, mae'n bryd iddo wrando ar bobl—nid yn unig yn fy mhlaid i, ond rhai ym Mhlaid Cymru, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a llawer yn ei blaid ei hun. Ni wn ar bwy y bu'n gwrando.

Os oedd Rhodri Morgan yn teimlo bod yn rhaid iddo benodi Democrat Rhyddfrydol arall, gallaf ddeall pam ei fod yn petruso, yn enwedig wedi clywed cyfraniad Mick Bates—dywedodd 'i gloi' yn anesboniadwy hanner ffordd drwy ei araith, nad oedd ganddi gychwyn na chanol. Gallaf ddeall pam y byddai'r Prif Weinidog yn poeni am benodi Democrat Rhyddfrydol.

Fodd bynnag—heb edrych ar y personoliaethau a heb ddymuno difetha gormod o yrfaeodd gwleidyddol—mae llawer o gyn Weinidogion, er enghraifft, Ron Davies, Tom Middlehurst, Peter Law, Christine Gwyther, a Rosemary Butler, a dirprwyon, fel Alun Pugh a John Griffiths a allai wneud y swydd dros dro neu'n barhaol. Sut y gellid dweud na fyddai er budd Cymru i gael rhywun yn gwneud y swydd yn llawn amser, ni wn Weinidog. Ni wn ble y buoch.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi dadlau ar achlysuron blaenorol—er na wnaeth ddadlau hyn heddiw, a chroesawaf ef yn hwyr i'r ddadl—fod hyn yn rhywbeth sy'n ymwneud â Heddlu De Cymru. Mae hyn yn nonsens llwyr. Sut y gall penderfyniad y Prif Weinidog i sefyll o'r neilltu i wneud lle i

or permanent basis place pressure on the South Wales Police? It is the perpetuation of this ridiculous situation of running the two jobs together that is putting pressure on the police.

No democratic parliamentary institution in the world would tolerate the nonsense we have here. Can it be contemplated that Tony Blair would not appoint someone on a temporary or permanent basis? We were told on 10 July, that during a recess:

‘demands are entirely different. In some areas, such as tourism, they are greater, but we will not be as tied down with questions, Committees and Plenaries as we are when the Assembly is in session. The demands are entirely different and far more flexible’.

That ended when we returned at the beginning of October. We are now halfway through December, and the First Minister is saying that he will continue to hold both positions for as long as it takes. I suggest, First Minister, that you, the Cabinet and the riff-raff in the Liberal Democrat Group put your heads together and sort this mess out now, in the interests of Wales, before it is too late.

5.00 p.m.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Point of order. Is it possible to vote on the amendments in alphabetical order and, therefore, to vote on Mick Bates’s amendment first?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: No, we must vote on the amendments in the order that they appear on the agenda. If amendment 1 is carried, amendment 2 will fall. [PLAID CYMRU MEMBERS: ‘Oh, come on.’] There may be lessons in this for those who draft amendments, but not for me.

rywun dros dro neu’n barhaol roi pwysau ar Heddlu De Cymru? Parhad y sefyllfa hurt hon o redeg y ddwy swydd gyda’i gilydd sy’n rhoi pwysau ar yr heddlu.

Ni fyddai unrhyw sefydliad gwleidyddol democrataidd yn y byd yn goddef y nonsens sydd gennym yma. A ellir ystyried na fyddai Tony Blair yn penodi rhywun dros dro neu’n barhaol? Dywedwyd wrthym ar 10 Gorffennaf, yn ystod toriad y bydd:

‘gofynion yn hollol wahanol. Mewn rhai meysydd, megis twristiaeth, maent yn fwy, ond ni fyddwn mor gaeth i gwestiynau, Pwyllgorau a Chyfarfodydd Llawn â phan fo’r Cynulliad yn cyfarfod. Mae’r gofynion yn hollol wahanol ac yn llawer mwy hyblyg’.

Daeth hynny i ben pan ddychwelsom ddiwedd mis Hydref. Yr ydym bellach hanner ffordd drwy fis Rhagfyr, ac mae’r Prif Weinidog yn dweud y bydd yn parhau i ddal y ddwy swydd gyhyd ag y bydd angen iddo wneud hynny. Awgrymaf, Brif Weinidog, eich bod chi, y Cabinet a’r gwehilion yng Ngrŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn dod ynghyd i ddatrys hyn, er budd Cymru, cyn y bydd yn rhy hwyr.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Pwynt o drefn. A yw’n bosibl pleidleisio ar y gwelliannau yn nhrefn y wyddor ac, felly, pleidleisio ar welliant Mick Bates yn gyntaf?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nac ydyw, rhaid inni bleidleisio ar y gwelliannau yn y drefn y maent yn ymddangos ar yr agenda. Os caiff gwelliant 1 ei dderbyn, bydd gwelliant 2 yn methu. [AELODAU PLAID CYMRU: ‘O, dewch ymlaen.’] Efallai fod gwersi yma ar gyfer y rhai sy’n drafftio’r gwelliannau, ond nid i mi.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 20.
Amendment 1: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 20.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David

Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried*

*Methodd gwelliant 2.
Amendment 2 fell.*

Amended motion:

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio;

the National Assembly for Wales:

bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. congratulates the First Minister on his leadership of the Welsh Assembly Government;

1. yn llongyfarch y Prif Weinidog ar ei arweinyddiaeth o Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru;

2. recognises the huge contribution he has made to the establishment of effective government in Wales; and

2. yn cydnabod y cyfraniad enfawr y mae wedi'i wneud i sefydlu llywodraeth effeithiol yng Nghymru; ac

3. looks forward to his continuing contribution to the development of policies aimed at meeting the needs of the people of Wales.

3. yn edrych ymlaen at ei gyfraniad parhaus i ddatblygiad polisiau sydd wedi'u hanelu at ddiwallu anghenion pobl Cymru.

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 20.
Amended motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 20.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David

Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
Amended motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close. **Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.59 p.m.
The session ended at 4.59 p.m.*