Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)

The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)

Dydd Mawrth 25 Mawrth 2003

Tuesday 25 March 2003

Cynnwys
Contents

3 Cwestiynau i’r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister

24 Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement

27 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order

30 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

32 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

34 Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio
Annual Report of the Audit Committee

45 Adolygiad Polisi Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar Adfywio Cymunedol—‘Meithrin Gallu a Hyfforddiant’
Local Government and Housing Policy Review on Community Regeneration—‘Capacity Development and Training’

65 Adroddiad Interim y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar Ysgolion y Dyfodol
The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee’s Interim Report on Schools of the Future

80 Cymeradwyo Newid i Brif Grŵp Gwariant Swyddfa'r Llywydd
Approval of a Change to the Main Expenditure Group for the Presiding Office

81 Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i’r Prif Grŵpiau Gwariant
Approval of Changes to the Main Expenditure Groups

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o’r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister

Y Gyllideb
The Budget

C1 Dafydd Wigley: Pa sylwadau a gyflwynwyd gan y Prif Weinidog i Ganghellor y Trysorlys mewn perthynas â'i gyllideb nesaf? (OAQ23559)

Q1 Dafydd Wigley: What representations has the First Minister made to the Chancellor of the Exchequer regarding his forthcoming budget? (OAQ23559)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Cyflwynodd Edwina Hart, Gweinidog Cyllid y Cynulliad, ein hargymhellion ryw chwe mis yn ôl. Yr wyf am gymeradwyo polisïau euraidd presennol y Canghellor. Mae cyflogaeth wedi codi gan fod 50,000 o swyddi newydd wedi eu creu yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf; mae diweithdra ar ei isaf ers 28 mlynedd, ac y mae cyfraddau llog ar eu hisaf ers 40 mlynedd.

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Edwina Hart, the Assembly's Finance Minister, presented our recommendations some six months ago. I want to applaud the Chancellor's current brilliant policies. Employment has risen as 50,000 new jobs have been created during the past year; unemployment is at its lowest for 28 years, and interest rates are at their lowest for 40 years.

Dafydd Wigley: O gofio brwdfrydedd y Prif Weinidog dros gefnogi Tony Blair a'i Lywodraeth mewn perthynas â'r rhyfel yn erbyn Irac, a ddangosodd yr un brwdfrydedd i bwyso ar y Canghellor i sicrhau arian digonol i ddelio â chanlyniadau'r rhyfel hwnnw?

Dafydd Wigley: Given the First Minister's enthusiasm in supporting Tony Blair and his Government over war with Iraq, has he shown the same enthusiasm in pressing the Chancellor to secure sufficient funding to deal with the consequences of that war?

Y Prif Weinidog: O ran faint o arian ychwanegol y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei gael, mae'r cyfanswm wedi codi o £8 biliwn i £11 biliwn, ac yn ôl yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant presennol, bydd yn codi i dros £12 biliwn yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf. Nid oes lle i gwyno ar y cyfrif hwnnw.

The First Minister: In terms of the extra funding the Assembly receives, the total has risen from £8 billion to £11 billion, and according to the present comprehensive spending review, it will rise to over £12 billion in the next three years. There is no room for complaint on that score.

Peter Black: First Minister, do you agree that one of the best things the Chancellor could do for Wales in the next budget is to announce a review of the Barnett formula, so that we can ensure that the Assembly has sufficient resources to deal with the needs of Wales?

Peter Black: Brif Weinidog, a gytunwch mai un o'r pethau gorau y gallai'r Canghellor ei wneud dros Gymru yn y gyllideb nesaf yw cyhoeddi adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett, fel y gallwn sicrhau y caiff y Cynulliad adnoddau digonol i ddiwallu anghenion Cymru?

The First Minister: That question is slightly academic because we can secure money over and above the Barnett formula by other means. It does not matter whether you call it a review of the Barnett formula, or that you are getting Barnett plus funding. We have

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n un academaidd braidd oherwydd gallwn sicrhau arian mwy nag a geid yn ôl fformiwla Barnett drwy ddulliau eraill. Nid yw o bwys a elwir ef yn adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett, neu a geir cyllid ar ben yr hyn a geir yn ôl

secured extra funding through the public expenditure mechanism for expenditure on Objective 1. The UK Government accepted our case for funding over and above Barnett. Most people realise that we have money over and above Barnett and that is all credit to us and the flexibility of the Chancellor in realising the unique position that Wales was in.

fformiwla Barnett. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau cyllid ychwanegol drwy'r mecanwaith gwariant cyhoeddus ar gyfer gwariant ar Amcan 1. Gwnaeth Llywodraeth y DU dderbyn ein dadl o blaid cael cyllid ar ben yr hyn a geir yn ôl fformiwla Barnett. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn sylweddoli ein bod wedi cael arian ar ben yr hyn a geir yn ôl fformiwla Barnett ac mae hynny'n glod i ni ac i hyblygrwydd y Canghellor wrth sylweddoli bod Cymru mewn sefyllfa unigryw.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): I welcome the First Minister's statement earlier that Wales would not bear a disproportionate share of expenditure on any conflict in the Gulf; that information is welcome throughout Wales. You have mentioned money over and above Barnett, but we are still concerned that there is a shortfall in relation to Objective 1. We have often heard the incantation that no project has gone without money, but that is because it has been driven from the wrong end. If the money was there and we were being told to come up with the projects to spend it we would be in a much better position than we now find ourselves in. Also, has the First Minister calculated how much extra finance we would need from the Chancellor to deal with the dreadful situation in health? In Wales, one in every 35 people is waiting more than six months for an out-patient appointment, whereas the figure in England is one in every 76,000.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Croesawaf y datganiad gan y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach i'r perwyl na fyddai Cymru'n dwyn cyfran anghyfartal o wariant ar unrhyw ymladd yn y Gwlff; croesewir y wybodaeth honno ledled Cymru. Yr ydych wedi sôn am arian ar ben yr hyn a geir yn ôl fformiwla Barnett, ond yr ydym yn bryderus o hyd fod diffyg mewn cysylltiad ag Amcan 1. Yr ydym yn gyfarwydd iawn â'r gân na fu'r un prosiect heb arian, ond mae hynny am fod hyn wedi'i yrru o'r pen anghywir. Pe byddai'r arian yno a ninnau'n cael archiad i feddwl am brosiectau er mwyn ei wario, byddem mewn gwell sefyllfa o lawer nag yr ydym yn awr. Hefyd, a yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi cyfrifo faint o arian ychwanegol y byddai arnom ei angen gan y Canghellor i ddelio â'r sefyllfa enbyd o ran iechyd? Yng Nghymru, mae un ym mhob 35 o bobl yn disgwyl yn hwy na chwe mis am apwyntiad fel claf allanol, tra bo'r ffigur yn Lloegr yn un ym mhob 76,000.

The First Minister: There are an exceptional number of new innovations in care that we have introduced in health, which mean that there is a large increase in the numbers and types of treatments that are now available in Wales, compared to previously. We now have practice nurses at the primary care level and other innovations in the care system. Physiotherapists are playing an outstanding role, alongside consultants, general practitioners, orthopaedic specialists, in dealing with people who are in pain from orthopaedic muscular-skeletal problems. There is a much wider variety of treatments and care. Money is not the issue. However, we are awaiting the outcome of the Wanless report that we commissioned and which will be the subject of discussion for the incoming

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno nifer eithriadol o ddulliau gofal arloesol mewn iechyd, sy'n golygu bod mwy o lawer o driniaethau o ran nifer a math ar gael yng Nghymru bellach. Yn awr mae gennym nyrsys ymarfer ar lefel gofal sylfaenol a mentrau eraill yn y system gofal. Mae ffisiotherapyddion yn chwarae rôl eithriadol, ochr yn ochr ag ymgynghorwyr, ymarferwyr cyffredinol ac arbenigwyr orthopedig, wrth ddelio â rhai sydd mewn poen oherwydd problemau cyhyrol-ysgerbydol orthopedig. Mae'r triniaethau a'r gofal yn fwy amrywiol o lawer. Nid arian yw'r mater pwysig. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn disgwyl canlyniad adroddiad Wanless a gafodd ei gomisiynu gennym ac a fydd ar gael i'w drafod gan y Cabinet a ddaw i mewn ar 2 Mai neu'n fuan

Cabinet on 2 May or shortly after and between the then Minister for Health and Social Services Minister, Finance Minister and First Minister. Those discussions will determine how much of that health allocation will be used, and in what ways, in order to continue to improve health in Wales.

wedyn a rhwng y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, y Gweinidog Cyllid a'r Prif Weinidog bryd hynny. Y trafodaethau hynny fydd yn pennu pa faint o'r dyraniad hwnnw ar gyfer iechyd a ddefnyddir, ac ym mha fodd, er mwyn parhau i wella iechyd yng Nghymru.

Nick Bourne: You seem to paint this picture of a nirvana of healthcare in Wales. I wish that were true. It has nothing to do with the professionals, who are uniformly excellent. It is not the case that we are any further forward in Wales than in England. All these new treatments that are being made available in Wales are also being made available in England. You will know—or at least you should know—that if you speak to people in healthcare, in hospitals in Wales, they are putting English patients ahead of Welsh patients. In Wales, English patients are being treated first, because the system is not being run properly. I agree that it is not just a matter of finance, but it remains the case that the healthcare position in Wales is far worse than it is England. There is no doubt about that. The Government has not apologised for this mess. What are you doing to address this awful situation?

Nick Bourne: Ymddengys eich bod yn tynnu llun dedwydd o ofal iechyd yng Nghymru. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe byddai hynny'n wir. Nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim â'r gweithwyr proffesiynol, sydd oll yn rhagorol. Nid yw'n wir ein bod ymhellach ar y blaen yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Mae'r holl driniaethau newydd hyn a ddarperir yng Nghymru yn cael eu darparu yn Lloegr hefyd. Gwyddoch—neu dylech wybod o leiaf—os siaradwch â phobl mewn gofal iechyd, mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru, eu bod yn rhoi cleifion o Loegr o flaen rhai o Gymru. Yng Nghymru, cleifion o Loegr a gaiff eu trin yn gyntaf, am nad yw'r system yn cael ei rhedeg yn briodol. Yr wyf yn cytuno nad mater o gyllid yn unig ydyw, ond mae'n wir, er hynny, fod y sefyllfa o ran gofal iechyd yng Nghymru'n waeth o lawer nag ydyw yn Lloegr. Nid oes dwywaith am hynny. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi ymddiheuro am y llanastr hwn. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i ymdrin â'r sefyllfa ofnadwy hon?

The First Minister: You should look at the figures, Nick. During the last five years of the Conservative Government, 1992 to 1997, the number of general practitioner training places in Wales halved. I do not understand how a Government can do that, but the Conservatives managed to do that in Wales. The number fell from, I think, 136 to about 60—[*Interruption.*]

Y Prif Weinidog: Dylech edrych ar y ffigurau, Nick. Yn ystod pum mlynedd olaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, o 1992 i 1997, hanerwyd nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi ar gyfer meddygon teulu yng Nghymru. Ni allaf ddeall sut y gallai Llywodraeth wneud hynny, ond dyna a wnaeth y Ceidwadwyr yng Nghymru. Gostyngodd y nifer, fe gredaf, o 136 i tua 60—[*Torri ar draws.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

The First Minister: What on earth William Hague, John Redwood and the other Conservative Secretaries of State for Wales thought they were doing in halving the number of GP training Wales during the last five years of Conservative Government has yet to be revealed. Is it any wonder that it is difficult to recruit GPs in Wales when you halved the number of training places in Wales in your last five years? You then have the cheek to stand up and accuse us of being

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chanfuwyd eto beth ar y ddaear a oedd ym meddwl William Hague, John Redwood a'r Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol Ceidwadol eraill dros Gymru wrth haneru nifer y meddygon teulu a hyfforddid yng Nghymru yn ystod pum mlynedd olaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. A oes ryfedd ei bod yn anodd recriwtio meddygon teulu yng Nghymru a chithau wedi haneru nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi yng Nghymru yn eich pum mlynedd olaf? Wedyn, yr ydych mor

unable to recruit sufficient doctors. We are now investing in medical training so that the next Assembly will have the advantage of that increase in investment in medical and nurse training. [*Interruption*.]

ddigywilydd â sefyll ar eich traed a'n cyhuddo o fethu â recriwtio digon o feddygon. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi mewn hyfforddiant meddygol yn awr fel y caiff y Cynulliad nesaf y fantais o'r cynnydd hwnnw yn y buddsoddiad mewn hyfforddiant meddygol a hyfforddi nyrsys. [*Torri ar draws*.]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will not allow the Assembly to deteriorate, in its final days, to the level of the House of Commons. When I call the next questions, I expect one supplementary question from each Member, except party leaders, who are already blessed with two supplementaries—though some, it seems, are trying to ask three.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni adawaf i'r Cynulliad ddirywio, yn ei ddyddiau olaf, i lefel Tŷ'r Cyffredin. Pan alwaf y cwestiynau nesaf, disgwyliaf gael un cwestiwn atodol gan bob Aelod, heblaw am arweinwyr y pleidiau, sydd eisoes yn cael y fraint o ofyn dau gwestiwn atodol—er yr ymddengys bod rhai'n ceisio gofyn tri.

Tynnwyd cwestiwn 2 (OAQ23565) yn ôl.

Question 2 (OAQ23565) is withdrawn.

'GwellCymru.com'
'BetterWales.com'

Q3 Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the targets outlined in the 'BetterWales.com' document that will be achieved by March 2003? (OAQ23572)

C3 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y targedau a amlinellwyd yn nogfen 'GwellCymru.com' a fydd yn cael eu cyflawni erbyn Mawrth 2003? (OAQ23572)

The First Minister: 'Plan for Wales 2001' lays out the strategic agenda that we have been pursuing since October 2001. Under this plan, we have achieved success in many areas, not least in ensuring that infant class sizes of no more that 30 pupils are the norm in Wales.

Y Prif Weinidog: 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001' sy'n nodi'r agenda strategol yr ydym yn ei dilyn ers Hydref 2001. O dan y cynllun hwn, yr ydym wedi sicrhau llwyddiant mewn llawer maes, ac un o'r pwysicaf yw sicrhau mai 30 o ddisgyblion yw'r norm ar gyfer maint dosbarthiadau babanod yng Nghymru.

Helen Mary Jones: In 'BetterWales.com', you also set a target of creating 34,000 net jobs in west Wales and the Valleys by March 2003. In January 2003 you said that, by November 2002, the number of jobs created since the launch of 'BetterWales.com' was 10,000. How likely is it that you will reach the target of 34,000 jobs by the end of this month? If you do not reach it, will you be honest about it and apologise to the people of west Wales and the Valleys—and the people of Llanelli in particular—for making empty promises that you should have known that you would not be able to keep?

Helen Mary Jones: Yn 'GwellCymru.com', gwnaethoch hefyd osod targed o greu 34,000 o swyddi net yn y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd erbyn Mawrth 2003. Yn Ionawr 2003 dywedasoch mai nifer y swyddi a grewyd erbyn Tachwedd 2002, ers lansio 'GwellCymru.com', oedd 10,000. Pa mor debygol ydyw y byddwch yn cyrraedd y targed o 34,000 o swyddi erbyn diwedd y mis hwn? Os na chyrhaeddwch ef, a wnewch ddweud y gwir am hynny ac ymddiheuro i bobl y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd—a phobl Llanelli yn enwedig—am wneud addewidion gwag y dylasech wybod na allech eu cadw?

The First Minister: That was the usual Helen Mary Jones claptrap. The figures for job creation below all-Wales levels are not

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna lol arferol Helen Mary Jones. Nid yw'r ffigurau am greu swyddi ar lefel is na Chymru gyfan yn

reliable. That must be said. That is the statistical difficulty that we face. However, we know that 65 per cent of Wales's population lives in west Wales and the Valleys and that 75 per cent of the fall in unemployment is in the claimant count areas, unemployment benefit areas and the local authorities of west Wales and the Valleys. Therefore, unemployment is falling more rapidly in west Wales and the Valleys than elsewhere. Something is clearly going right there. Employment is rising more rapidly in Wales than elsewhere in the UK and unemployment is crashing down in west Wales and in the Valleys. It is falling more rapidly there than elsewhere in Wales. That area is benefiting greatly and its economic activity rate is rising. We are giving preference to west Wales and the Valleys and the fact that 75 per cent of the fall in unemployment in Wales is in those areas demonstrates that.

ddibynadwy. Rhaid dweud hynny. Dyna'r anhawster a wynebwn o ran ystadegau. Er hynny, gwyddom fod 65 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru'n byw yn y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd a bod 75 y cant o'r gostyngiad mewn diweithdra wedi bod yn ardaloedd cyfrif hawlwyr, ardaloedd budd-dal diweithdra ac awdurdodau lleol y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd. Gan hynny, mae diweithdra'n disgyn yn gynt yn y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd nag ydyw mewn mannau eraill. Mae'n amlwg bod rhyw fath o lwyddiant yno. Mae cyflogaeth yn cynyddu'n gynt yng Nghymru nag mewn mannau eraill yn y DU ac mae diweithdra'n cwympo yn y Gorllewin ac yn y Cymoedd. Mae'n disgyn yn gynt yno nag mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru. Mae'r ardal honno'n elwa'n fawr ac mae ei chyfradd gweithgarwch economaidd yn codi. Yr ydym yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i'r Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd ac mae'r ffaith mai yno y cafwyd 75 y cant o'r gostyngiad mewn diweithdra yng Nghymru yn dangos hynny.

Kirsty Williams: 'Plan for Wales 2001' talks about improving access to healthcare as well as improving the health and wellbeing of the population of Wales. What progress has been made in implementing the Assembly's resolution to allow people with chronic illnesses to receive free prescriptions?

Kirsty Williams: Mae 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001' yn sôn am wella'r mynediad i ofal iechyd yn ogystal â gwella iechyd a lles pobl Cymru. Pa gynnydd a wnaed wrth roi ar waith penderfyniad y Cynulliad y dylid caniatáu i bobl ag anhwylderau cronig gael presgripsiynau rhad ac am ddim?

The First Minister: We have a proud record on prescriptions and have frozen prescription charges. A measure has come through this Assembly, by means of a vote, to extend the categories of those who can receive free prescriptions to those with lifetime or long-term dependency on certain prescriptions. Such dependencies can prove expensive to those who are not exempt from charges. The Minister for Health and Social Services is currently considering the matter.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gennym record dda ar bresgripsiynau ac yr ydym wedi rhewi taliadau presgripsiwn. Penderfynwyd ar fesur drwy'r Cynulliad hwn, drwy bleidlais, i ychwanegu'r rhai sy'n dibynnu ar rai presgripsiynau gydol eu hoes neu dros y tymor hir at y categorïau o'r rhai sy'n gallu cael presgripsiynau am ddim. Gall dibyniaeth o'r fath fod yn ddrud i'r rhai nad ydynt wedi'u heithrio rhag taliadau. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ystyried y mater ar hyn o bryd.

2.10 p.m.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn bod prinder difrifol o ddeintyddion sydd yn gweithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd ym mhob rhan o Gymru? Mae'r broblem mor ddifrifol mewn ardaloedd gwledig fel bod fy etholwyr yn gorfod teithio 60 milltir i dderbyn

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Does the First Minister accept that there is a serious shortage of dentists working in the health service in every part of Wales? The problem is so serious in rural areas that my constituents have to travel 60 miles to access national health service dental services.

gwasanaeth deintyddol dan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Nid yw'n rhyfedd, felly, fod y Gymdeithas Ddeintyddol Brydeinig yn dweud heddiw fod deintyddion sy'n gweithio yn y GIG yn dioddef o straen difrifol. Pa neges a roddwch i'r bobl hynny, ar y naill law, sy'n methu â chofrestru â deintydd, a'r deintyddion, ar y llaw arall, sy'n gweithio dan gymaint o bwysau yn y GIG?

It is no wonder, therefore, that the British Dental Association has today said that dentists working in the NHS suffer severe stress. What do you say to those people, on the one hand, who find it impossible to register with a dentist, and to NHS dentists, on the other hand, who are under so much pressure?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hwn yn gwestiwn pwysig, a chredaf fod Ieuan, fel arweinydd yr wrthblaid, yn derbyn iddi fod yn broblem ddifrifol ers o leiaf saith neu wyth mlynedd yng Nghymru wledig. Yn anffodus, mae wedi gwasgaru erbyn hyn i rannau o Gymru drefol hefyd. Yr ateb yw buddsoddi mewn hyfforddi mwy o ddeintyddion. Heddiw, cynhelir seremoni agoriadol yn yr ysbyty deintyddol yng Nghaerdydd—lle yr hyfforddir y rhan fwyaf o'n deintyddion—i nodi buddsoddiad o £10 miliwn. Bu'r buddsoddiad enfawr hwnnw yn gyfrifol am ailadeiladu, bron â bod, yr ysbyty deintyddol. Gall hynny arwain at well gwasanaethau yn y gymuned ynghyd â gwell gwasanaethau arbenigol. Buddsoddiad o'r fath yw'r unig ffordd o wneud gyrfa fel deintydd yn fwy deniadol i bobl ifanc. Drwy gynnig y cyfleusterau gorau posibl—yr wyf yn sicr mai dyna'r achos erbyn hyn, yn dilyn cwblhau'r rhaglen ailadeiladu—bydd gyrfa fel deintydd yn llawer mwy deniadol nag y bu yn y gorffennol.

The First Minister: This is an important question, and I believe that Ieuan, as leader of the opposition, accepts that it has been a serious problem for at least the last seven or eight years in rural Wales. Unfortunately, it has also now spread to parts of urban Wales. The answer is to invest in training more dentists. Today, an opening ceremony is being held at Cardiff's dental hospital—where most of our dentists are trained—to mark a £10 million investment. This huge investment has, to a great extent, paid for rebuilding the dental hospital. This could lead to improved community services as well as improved specialist services. This kind of investment is the only way of making a career in dentistry more attractive to young people. By offering the best facilities possible—I am certain that that is now the case, now that the rebuilding programme is completed—a career in dentistry will be much more attractive than was the case in the past.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydych yn iawn i bwysleisio'r ffaith nad yw'r sefyllfa wedi gwella dros y pedair neu bum mlynedd diwethaf: mae wedi gwaethygu. Ateb rhannol yw denu mwy o bobl ifanc i hyfforddi fel deintyddion. Yr hyn sy'n digwydd wedi ichi hyfforddi pobl ifanc, gydag ymrwymiad mawr gan y GIG, yw bod y pwysau sydd arnynt, ynghyd â'r contract a'r prisiau, yn peri iddynt adael y gwasanaeth iechyd o fewn blwyddyn neu ddwy, gan fynd i weithio mewn gwasanaeth preifat. Golyga hynny y bydd nifer fawr o ddeintyddion oed gwaith yn cael eu colli o'r gwasanaeth iechyd dros y blynyddoedd nesaf, yn ogystal â'r rhai a fydd yn ymddeol. Felly, mae'n rhaid gwneud dau beth: mae'n rhaid cynyddu'r niferoedd, ac mae'n rhaid datrys problem y contract. A ydych yn derbyn bod yn rhaid i chi sicrhau dealltwriaeth gyda'r gwasanaeth er mwyn i

Ieuan Wyn Jones: You are right to emphasise the fact that the situation has not improved over the last four or five years: it has deteriorated. Attracting more young people to train as dentists is only a partial answer. What happens after you train young people, with great commitment on behalf of the NHS, is that the pressure that they face, together with the contract and prices, means that they leave the health service after a year or two to work in private practice. This means that a large number of working age dentists will be lost to the health service over the next few years, in addition to those who retire. Therefore, two issues must be dealt with: numbers must be increased, and the problem of the contract must be resolved. Do you accept that you must come to an understanding with the service so that dentists are able to serve the NHS, and that

ddeintyddion allu gwasanaethu'r GIG, a bod yn rhaid i chi sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu talu'n iawn?

you must ensure that they are adequately paid?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn derbyn hynny; byddwn hefyd yn ychwanegu trydydd categori, yr ydych wedi anghofio amdano, sef deintyddion sy'n penderfynu gweithio ar ochr gymunedol deintyddiaeth. Gall deintyddion weithio yn breifat, gallant weithio ar y contract arferol, neu gallant weithio yn y gwasanaeth cymunedol. Un o gryfderau Cymru yw'r agwedd gymunedol. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch—gan roi copi o'r llythyr yn y Llyfrgell—ynglŷn â rhagolygon recriwtio a hyfforddi mwy o ddeintyddion yn dilyn y buddsoddiad enfawr yr ydym wedi'i wneud.

The First Minister: I accept that; I would also add a third category, which you have forgotten, namely dentists who decide to work on the community aspect of dentistry. Dentists can work in private practice, they can work on the standard contract, or they can work in the community service. The community aspect is one of Wales's strengths. I will write to you—and place a copy of the letter in the Library—with regard to the prospects for recruiting and training more dentists as a result of our huge investment.

Gwariant Ymchwil a Datblygu
Research and Development Expenditure

Q4 Alun Cairns: Would the First Minister make a statement on the progress he has made in growing the research and development spend in Wales? (OAQ23583)

C4 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y llwyddiant a gafodd wrth gynyddu'r gwariant ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru? (OAQ23583)

The First Minister: Welsh higher education institutions' share of UK research council funding grew from 2.8 per cent in 1996-97, at the time of the previous research assessment exercise, to 3.3 per cent in 2000-01, moving towards our target of 4.5 per cent of such income. Wales's share of UK business research and development spend was 1.1 per cent in the latest figures, in 2001.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bu cynnydd yn y gyfran o gyllid cynghorau ymchwil y DU a gaiff sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru o 2.8 y cant yn 1996-97, ar adeg yr ymarfer asesu ymchwil blaenorol, i 3.3 y cant yn 2000-01, sy'n agosach at ein targed o 4.5 y cant o incwm o'r fath. Cyfran Cymru o'r gwariant ymchwil a datblygu gan fusnes yn y DU oedd 1.1 y cant yn y ffigurau diweddaraf, yn 2001.

Alun Cairns: I note that you said that the share of business research and development spend was 1.1 per cent. Is it not the case that in 'BetterWales.com', you said that business research and development spend would double by October 2003? What you omitted to say was that the figure has dropped from 1.7 per cent of UK business research and development spend to the current 1.1 per cent. That demonstrates, once again, the dismal performance of the Assembly Government—and the mess in our economy—in growing the so-called added-value jobs on which you placed such a great emphasis when you were elected in May 1999. Will you apologise for failing, yet again, on this target?

Alun Cairns: Sylwaf ichi ddweud mai 1.1 y cant oedd y gyfran o wariant busnes ar ymchwil a datblygu. Oni ddywedasoch, yn 'GwellCymru.com', y byddai'r gwariant gan fusnes ar ymchwil a datblygu'n dyblu erbyn Hydref 2003? Bu ichi hepgor nodi bod y ffigur wedi gostwng o 1.7 y cant o'r gwariant gan fusnes yn y DU ar ymchwil a datblygu i'r 1.1 y cant presennol. Mae hynny, unwaith eto, yn dangos perfformiad truenus Llywodraeth y Cynulliad—a'r llanastr a geir yn ein heconomi—o ran creu'r swyddi â gwerth ychwanegol, fel y'u gelwir, y rhoesoch gymaint o bwyslais arnynt pan y'ch etholwyd ym Mai 1999. A wnewch ymddiheuro am fethu, unwaith eto, ar y targed hwn?

The First Minister: There was one freakish

Y Prif Weinidog: Bu un flwyddyn

year, with a disproportionately high figure, which is out of line with every other year since 1993—that was, of course, the year that you chose, 1999. The figure shot up by 50 per cent in one year, and then fell again. There is no evidence of a decline, apart from that one freak year. The reason for that is a matter for the Office for National Statistics. However, it is true that when you consider the kind of support that we have given to companies like General Dynamics UK Ltd, in Oakdale, and Cogent Defence and Security Networks, in Newport, and to the roll-out of the Technium concept—Technium is a remarkably successful concept, first established in Swansea, and it will soon be at nine or 10 such sites—we are making progress. We also supported the successful bid for one of the six gene park projects. It is an all-Wales project, involving the medical school and several of the universities. We were not supposed to be part of the competition, but we decided to have a go and we won one of the six gene park projects for Wales. We are building on this sector and investing for the future to create high levels of research and development and to correct a historic deficit in the amount of UK research and development spend that comes to Wales.

anghyffredin, pan gafwyd ffigur anghymesur o uchel, sy'n anghyson â phob blwyddyn arall ers 1993—a honno, wrth gwrs, oedd y flwyddyn y gwnaethoch ei dewis, sef 1999. Neidiodd y ffigur o 50 y cant mewn un flwyddyn, a disgyn eto. Nid oes tystiolaeth o ddirywiad, heblaw am yr un flwyddyn anghyffredin honno. Mater i'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yw'r rheswm am hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n wir, pan ystyriwch y math o gymorth a roesom i gwmnïau fel General Dynamics UK Cyf, yn Oakdale, a Cogent Defence and Security Networks, yng Nghasnewydd, ac ar gyfer lledaenu cysyniad y Technium—mae'r Technium yn gysyniad hynod lwyddiannus, a sefydlwyd yn Abertawe'n gyntaf, ac fe'i ceir cyn hir mewn naw neu 10 o safleoedd o'r fath—ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd. Rhoesom gymorth hefyd i'r cais llwyddiannus am un o'r chwe phrosiect parc genynnau. Prosiect i Gymru gyfan ydyw, sy'n cynnwys yr ysgol feddygol a nifer o'r prifysgolion. Nid oeddem i fod yn rhan o'r gystadleuaeth, ond penderfynasom roi cynnig arni ac enillasom un o'r chwe phrosiect parc genynnau i Gymru. Yr ydym yn datblygu'r sector hwn ac yn buddsoddi ar gyfer y dyfodol er mwyn creu lefelau uchel o ymchwil a datblygu a chywiro'r diffyg hanesyddol o ran y swm o wariant ar ymchwil a datblygu yn y DU a gaiff Cymru.

Phil Williams: Yr ydwyf yn sicr y byddech yn cytuno mai ymchwil fydd sail economi'r dyfodol a bod angen cynyddu'r gwariant ar ymchwil yng Nghymru i 5 y cant o gyfanswm gwariant y Deyrnas Gyfunol ar ymchwil. A ydych yn cytuno mai un o fethiannau mwyaf y pedair mlynedd diwethaf yw'r methiant i gynyddu'r cyfanswm gwariant ar ymchwil yn y sector cyhoeddus yn uwch na 2.2 y cant, yn ogystal â'r gostyngiad i 1.1 y cant a welwyd yn y sector preifat? Sut y gallwn berswadio'r Llywodraeth ganolog i gyfeirio mwy o arian ymchwil i Gymru?

Phil Williams: I am sure that you would agree that research will be the foundation of the economy of the future and that we need to increase expenditure on research in Wales to 5 per cent of the United Kingdom's total research expenditure. Do you agree that one of the greatest failures of the last four years is the failure to increase the total expenditure on research in the public sector above 2.2 per cent, in addition to the reduction to 1.1 per cent in the private sector? How can we persuade central Government to direct more research funding to Wales?

Y Prif Weinidog: Problem hanesyddol yw hon. Fe'i trafodwyd gan Phil, gennyf i, a chan lawer o bobl eraill am oesoedd—ymddengys yn agos at genedlaethau—am fod cyn lleied o sefydliadau yng Nghymru yn cael eu hariannu gan y Llywodraeth ganolog. Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas ac Amgylcheddol yn Aberystwyth yw'r unig

The First Minister: This is a historical problem. Phil and I and many others have been discussing this for ages—almost for generations it seems—because so few institutions in Wales are funded by central Government. The Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research in Aberystwyth is the only institution of this kind in Wales. It is

sefydliad o'r fath yng Nghymru. Mae'n anffodus ond mae sefydliadau eraill o'r fath wedi cau, er enghraifft yr uned ymchwil niwmoconiosis yn Llandochau, gan nad oedd eu hangen mwyach. Dyna sydd yn digwydd. Os ydych am adeiladu at y dyfodol, rhaid ceisio annog Llywodraeth y DU i roi gwell ystyriaeth i Gymru fel lleoliad ar gyfer sefydliadau newydd wrth ystyried ymhle y dylai wario'i harian. Mae'r sector preifat hefyd yn bwysig a dyna pam y crybwyllais y parc genynnau, Technium, General Dynamics yn Oakdale, a Cogent Defence yng Nghasnewydd.

unfortunate but other such institutions have closed, for example, the pneumoconiosis research unit at Llandough, because they were no longer needed. That is what happens. If you want to build for the future, you must try to encourage the UK Government to give more consideration to Wales as a location for new institutes when it considers where it should spend its money. The private sector is also important and that is why I mentioned the gene park, Technium, General Dynamics in Oakdale, and Cogent Defence in Newport.

Cydgysylltydd Polisi'r Llywodraeth yn y Gogledd
Co-ordinator of Government Policy in North Wales

Q5 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement on his role as co-ordinator of Government policy in north Wales over the last six months? (OAQ23563)

C5 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ei rôl fel cydgysylltydd polisi'r llywodraeth yng ngogledd Cymru dros y chwe mis diwethaf? (OAQ23563)

The First Minister: The most notable event of the last six months was the official opening of the £77 million east factory at Airbus's Broughton complex on 31 January, at which I was able to be present. It is part of an overall £510 million investment programme at the plant, which is the largest manufacturing plant in Britain and has the largest amount of manufacturing investment of any plant in Britain. It also has the largest number of apprentices in training of any workplace in Britain.

Y Prif Weinidog: Digwyddiad mwyaf nodedig y chwe mis diwethaf oedd agoriad swyddogol y ffatri ddwyreiniol werth £77 miliwn yng nghanolfan Airbus ym Mrychdyn ar 31 Ionawr, y gallais fod yn bresennol ynddo. Mae'n rhan o raglen fuddsoddi gyffredinol o £510 miliwn yn y gwaith, sef y gwaith gweithgynhyrchu mwyaf ym Mhrydain a'r un lle cafwyd y buddsoddiad mwyaf mewn gweithgynhyrchu. Yno hefyd y ceir y nifer fwyaf o brentisiaid o dan hyfforddiant mewn unrhyw weithle ym Mhrydain.

Janet Ryder: Thank you for the answer. However, one of the main aims of your Government is to alleviate child poverty. Do you share my concern that over half the children in Wales live on low incomes and a third live below the poverty line? Do you agree that the best way to alleviate child poverty is to raise the level of women's wages? As policy co-ordinator for north Wales, what have you done to ensure that the health authorities and local authorities carry out equal pay appraisals to ensure that the many women that they employ get a fair wage?

Janet Ryder: Diolch i chi am yr ateb. Fodd bynnag, un o brif nodau'ch Llywodraeth yw lliniaru tlodi plant. A ydych yn pryderu, fel yr wyf fi, fod mwy na hanner y plant yng Nghymru'n byw ar incwm isel a bod un rhan o dair yn byw o dan y llinell dlodi? A gytunwch mai'r modd gorau i liniaru tlodi plant yw codi lefel cyflogau menywod? Fel cydgysylltydd polisi ar gyfer y Gogledd, beth a wnaethoch i sicrhau bod yr awdurdodau iechyd a'r awdurdodau lleol yn cynnal gwerthusiadau tâl cyfartal i sicrhau bod y nifer fawr o fenywod a gyflogant yn cael cyflog teg?

The First Minister: I accept that entirely. You will know that, as an employer of civil servants, and the equivalent of a Government

Y Prif Weinidog: Llwyr dderbyniaf hynny. Gwyddoch am y farn ein bod wedi gwneud a chyflawni ymrwymiad o bwys, fel cyflogwr

department in England, we are regarded as having made and executed a major commitment in carrying out an equal pay audit of our staff. You will also have noticed and will welcome—because it will have a major impact in north Wales—the rise in the minimum wage. Two rises in the minimum wage have been announced. One will be introduced shortly and the other, I believe, will be introduced in six or 12 months' time and will bring it up to £4.80 per hour. The rise will have a major impact in certain sectors and it will have a larger impact in Wales because of the concentration of low wage employment here. It is important that we have seen that the minimum wage has not inhibited the growth of employment in Wales, despite the fears of some about its impact. As I mentioned in answer to Dafydd Wigley earlier, there are now 60,000, or 56,000, more people in work than there were a year ago.

gweision sifil, a'r hyn sy'n cyfateb i adran Llywodraeth yn Lloegr, drwy gynnal archwiliad tâl cyfartal o'n staff. Byddwch hefyd wedi nodi ac yn croesawu—gan y caiff effaith fawr yn y Gogledd—y cynnydd yn yr isafswm cyflog. Cyhoeddwyd dau godiad yn yr isafswm cyflog. Cyflwynir un cyn hir a chyflwynir y llall, yr wyf yn credu, ymhen chwe neu 12 mis a bydd yn ei godi i £4.80 yr awr. Caiff y codiad effaith fawr mewn rhai sectorau a chaiff effaith fwy yng Nghymru am fod llawer yn gweithio ar gyflogau isel yma. Mae'n bwysig ein bod wedi sicrhau nad yw'r isafswm cyflog wedi cyfyngu ar dwf cyflogaeth yng Nghymru, er gwaethaf ofnau rhai pobl am ei effaith. Fel y dywedais wrth ateb Dafydd Wigley yn gynharach, mae 60,000, neu 56,000, yn rhagor o bobl mewn gwaith yn awr nag yr oedd flwyddyn yn ôl.

Eleanor Burnham: First Minister, the last time Plaid Cymru asked this question you mentioned the relocation of Assembly offices to north Wales. We all welcome the recent relocation of Assembly jobs to Merthyr, but will you provide an update on the identification of sites for similar offices in north Wales?

Eleanor Burnham: Brif Weinidog, y tro diwethaf y gofynnodd Plaid Cymru y cwestiwn hwn, gwnaethoch sôn am ail-leoli swyddfeydd y Cynulliad yn y Gogledd. Yr ydym oll yn croesawu yr ail-leoli ar swyddi y Cynulliad ym Merthyr Tudful yn ddiweddar, ond a wnewch roi gwybod am yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd ers hynny o ran dod o hyd i safleoedd ar gyfer swyddfeydd tebyg yn y Gogledd?

The First Minister: You cannot do everything at once; it is as simple as that. The order in which we do it is a matter of when we get a good bid from a local authority in terms of when it will make the land available, how it will make the land available and what assistance it can offer: then we can move in. Before long, Assembly Government offices will not only be located in the Valleys, but in mid and north Wales.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni ellir gwneud popeth ar unwaith; mae cyn symled â hynny. Mae'r drefn a ddilynwn wrth wneud hyn yn dibynnu pa bryd y cawn gais da gan awdurdod lleol o ran pa bryd y gwnaiff ddarparu'r tir, pa fodd y gwnaiff hynny a pha gymorth y gall ei gynnig: wedyn gallwn symud i mewn. Cyn hir, bydd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad swyddfeydd yn y Canolbarth a'r Gogledd yn ogystal â'r Cymoedd.

2.20 p.m.

David Ian Jones: Is not the crisis in care homes in north Wales at least in part the result of the inequality in the financial treatment of the private and public sectors? Will you meet representatives of the fair price for care campaign when they visit the Assembly tomorrow and assure them of your support for a fair pricing structure for care

David Ian Jones: Onid yw'r argyfwng mewn cartrefi gofal yn y Gogledd yn rhannol yn ganlyniad i anghydraddoldeb yn y dull o drin y sectorau preifat a chyhoeddus yn ariannol? A wnewch gwrdd â chynrychiolwyr yr ymgyrch pris teg am ofal pan ymwelant â'r Cynulliad yfory a'u sicrhau eich bod o blaid fframwaith prisio teg ar gyfer cartrefi gofal

homes in north Wales?

yn y Gogledd?

The First Minister: If I can make time to do so, I will talk to them. I presume that you refer to an event in the milling area. When I have five minutes, I try to talk to people in the milling area; that is a good example of the extension of democracy that the Assembly has introduced over the past four years. I cannot guarantee anything at the moment, but I will try to meet them. On the issue that you raised, you must be aware of the case mix and the different employment practices in the local authority sector, which is pretty small, and the much larger private sector, where there is not always the same provision—or not yet—for holiday and sick pay for staff, let alone the same gross wage bill.

Y Prif Weinidog: Os gallaf gael amser i wneud hynny, siaradaf â hwy. Cymeraf eich bod yn cyfeirio at ddigwyddiad yn y neuadd. Pan fo gennyf bum munud, ceisiaf siarad â phobl yn y neuadd; mae hynny'n enghraifft dda o'r ddemocratiaeth ehangach a gyflwynodd y Cynulliad dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Ni allaf warantu dim ar y funud, ond gwnaf geisio cwrdd â hwy. Ynghylch y mater y gwnaethoch ei godi, rhaid ichi fod yn ymwybodol o'r cymysgedd achosion a'r gwahanol arferion cyflogaeth yn y sector awdurdod lleol, sy'n eithaf bach, a'r sector preifat, sy'n fwy o lawer, a lle na cheir yr un ddarpariaeth ym mhob achos—neu nid ar hyn o bryd—ar gyfer tâl gwyliau a salwch i staff, heb sôn am yr un bil cyflogau crynswth.

Busnesau yng Nghwm Cynon
Businesses in the Cynon Valley

Q6 Christine Chapman: Will the First Minister make a statement about the level of funding for business support provided to businesses in the Cynon Valley? (OAQ23571)

C6 Christine Chapman: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch lefel y cymorth ariannol ar gyfer cymorth busnes a roddwyd i fusnesau yng Nghwm Cynon? (OAQ23571)

The First Minister: Regional selective assistance is available in the Cynon valley and we are anxious to encourage more companies to move there because it has historically been an area of high unemployment. The Assembly investment grant is also available for those small and medium-sized enterprises that would find the bureaucratic burdens that applying for big grants entail too much. There is a marked improvement in the Cynon valley, which has seen one of the biggest falls in unemployment in Wales in the past four years, of 46 per cent.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol ar gael yng nghwm Cynon ac yr ydym yn awyddus i annog rhagor o gwmnïau i symud yno gan iddi fod yn ardal lle y cafwyd diweithdra uchel yn hanesyddol. Mae grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad ar gael hefyd i'r busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint hynny a gâi fod y beichiau biwrocrataidd o ymgeisio am grantiau mawr yn ormod iddynt. Mae gwelliant pendant yng nghwm Cynon, lle y cafwyd un o'r gostyngiadau mwyaf mewn diweithdra yng Nghymru yn y pedair blynedd diwethaf, sef 46 y cant.

Christine Chapman: I welcome your remarks on the Assembly investment grant. We must also include Objective 1 funding, which is helping small businesses. Given this record, do you agree that Labour is turning around economic activity in our former mining communities, such as the Cynon valley, following the devastation of the Tory years? Will you welcome the encouraging news from the Cynon valley businesses with

Christine Chapman: Croesawaf eich sylwadau am grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad. Rhaid inni hefyd gynnwys cyllid Amcan 1, sy'n helpu busnesau bach. O gofio'r record hon, a gytunwch fod Llafur yn gweddnewid gweithgarwch economaidd yn ein cymunedau cyn lofaol, fel cwm Cynon, ar ôl dinistr blynyddoedd y Torïaid? A wnewch groesawu'r newyddion calonogol oddi wrth fusnesau yng nghwm Cynon yr wyf wedi

which I have recently spoken? They comment that businesses in the area are now expanding and developing with the assistance of Labour economic development policies. Do you also agree that we must continue this work? This area has suffered for a long time, and we must continue to increase its prosperity.

siarad â hwy’n ddiweddar? Dywedant fod busnesau yn yr ardal yn ehangu ac yn datblygu’n awr gyda chymorth polisïau datblygu economaidd Llafur. A ydych hefyd yn cytuno bod rhaid inni barhau â’r gwaith hwn? Mae’r ardal hon wedi dioddef yn hir, a rhaid inni barhau i hybu ei ffyniant.

The First Minister: We have a full raft of options available: small or medium-sized enterprises can access Assembly investment grants; larger companies can access regional selective assistance. Tourism projects have the section 4 grants and there is assistance to export and the support for products under research and small firms merit award for research and technology grants for those developing new products or processes. It is notable that the four constituencies that have seen a fall in claimant-count unemployment in excess of 40 per cent are all in the Objection 1 area. They are Caernarfon, Conwy, Cynon Valley and Rhondda.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gennym amrediad llawn o ddewisiadau ar gael: gall busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint wneud cais am grantiau buddsoddi’r Cynulliad; gall cwmnïau mwy wneud cais am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Mae grantiau adran 4 ar gyfer prosiectau twristiaeth ac mae cymorth ar gael i allforio a’r grantiau cymorth ymchwil i gynhyrchion a gwobr teilyngdod ymchwil a thechnoleg ar gyfer cwmnïau bach ar gyfer y rhai sy’n datblygu cynhyrchion neu brosesau newydd. Mae’n drawiadol mai yn ardal Amcan 1 y mae pob un o’r pedair etholaeth a welodd ostyngiad o fwy na 40 y cant yn nifer y rhai sy’n hawlio budd-dal diweithdra, sef Caernarfon, Conwy, Cwm Cynon a Rhondda.

Geraint Davies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog groesawu cynlluniau Cyngor Bwrdeisdref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf, o dan arweiniad Plaid Cymru, ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint? Ymrywmwyd bron y cyfan o gyllideb y cynllun hwn a chynlluniau tebyg eisoes. A wnaiff sicrhau bod Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yn ehangu’r cyllid sydd ar gael yn rhaglen Amcan 1 ar gyfer busnesau bach fel y gall cynifer o fusnesau â phosibl fanteisio ar y cyfle unigryw hwn?

Geraint Davies: Will the First Minister welcome Plaid Cymru-led Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council’s schemes for small and medium-sized enterprises? Most of the budget for this and similar schemes has already been committed. Will he ensure that the Wales European Funding Office makes more funding available under the Objective 1 programme for small businesses so that as many businesses as possible can benefit from this unique opportunity?

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth gyfeirio at yr arfau all hybu twf yn yr economi, anghofiais sôn am y cynlluniau a ariennir gan Amcan 1 sy’n cael eu rhedeg gan yr awdurdodau lleol. Mae cynllun Rhondda Cynon Taf yn eu plith a deallaf ei fod yn llwyddiannus. Yr wyf yn falch y gall arian Amcan 1 oddi wrthym ni ac Ewrop gael ei wario ar fath gynlluniau. Mae hynny ar yr amod eu bod yn cael eu rhedeg yn effeithiol fel—a chymeraf eich gair ar hynny—y rhedir cynllun Rhondda Cynon Taf.

The First Minister: In referring to the tools that can promote economic growth, I forgot to mention the Objective 1-funded schemes run by local authorities. Rhondda Cynon Taf’s scheme is one such scheme and I understand that it is successful. I am pleased that Objective 1 funding from us and Europe can be spent on such schemes. That is on condition that they are run effectively, as—and I take your word for it—Rhondda Cynon Taf’s scheme is.

Alun Cairns: In response to Christine Chapman, the First Minister sought to highlight some of the business support

Alun Cairns: Wrth ateb Christine Chapman, ceisiodd y Prif Weinidog dynnu sylw at rai o’r mentrau cymorth busnes y mae ei

initiatives that his Government proposes. In 'A Winning Wales' and 'BetterWales.com', the First Minister said that his Government would cut the number of business support programmes. We now have almost 90 business support programmes administered by the WDA, as well as the additional programmes administered by the Assembly. Is this what he meant by progress on simplifying business support?

Lywodraeth yn eu cynnig. Yn 'Cymru'n Ennill' a 'GwellCymru.com', dywedodd y Prif Weinidog y byddai ei Lywodraeth yn cwtogi ar nifer y rhaglenni cymorth busnes. Bellach mae gennym ymron i 90 o raglenni cymorth busnes a weinyddir gan y WDA, yn ogystal â'r rhaglenni ychwanegol a weinyddir gan y Cynulliad. Ai hynny a olygodd wrth sôn am gynnydd mewn symleiddio cymorth i fusnes?

The First Minister: It is interesting that you did not allege that any of these programmes duplicated each other. If you have examples of duplication, I would be grateful if you would draw them to my attention, either here, if you want to do that in a high-profile political way—as is your right—or by way of a letter to me. The point that I made earlier, in answer to Christine and to Geraint, is that we want to tell businesses that, whatever their circumstances—even if they are potential businesses that have not been established yet—we have the programme to assist them. Some programmes apply to the whole of Wales, such as Assembly investment grants, some apply to the Objective 1 areas only, and others apply to specific sectors, such as process and product development, export development, tourism, agricultural support, and so on. We have tried to cover the waterfront. However, the programmes must not—and I think that this is your point—duplicate one another, as that would only sow confusion.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n ddiddorol na wnaethoch haeru bod unrhyw un o'r rhaglenni hyn yn dyblygu'i gilydd. Os oes gennych enghreifftiau o ddyblygu, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn tynnu fy sylw atynt, naill ai yma, os ydych am wneud hynny mewn modd gwleidyddol amlwg—yn unol â'ch hawl—neu drwy anfon llythyr ataf. Y pwynt a wneuthum yn gynharach, mewn ymateb i Christine ac i Geraint, yw ein bod am ddweud wrth fusnesau bod gennym raglen briodol i'w cynorthwyo, beth bynnag fo'u hamgylchiadau—hyd yn oed os mai busnesau dichonol ydynt sydd heb eu sefydlu eto. Mae rhai rhaglenni'n gweithredu ledled Cymru, fel grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, mae rhai'n gweithredu mewn ardaloedd Amcan 1 yn unig, ac mae eraill yn berthnasol i sectorau penodol, fel datblygu prosesau a chynhyrchion, datblygu allforio, twristiaeth, cymorth amaethyddol, ac yn y blaen. Yr ydym wedi ceisio ateb pob galw. Fodd bynnag, ni chaiff y rhaglenni ddyblygu'i gilydd—a chredaf mai dyna'r pwynt sydd gennych—gan na fyddai hynny ond yn creu dryswch.

The Presiding Officer: Question 7 (OAQ23566) is withdrawn.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 7 (OAQ23566) yn ôl.

Heddlu Gogledd Cymru
North Wales Police

Q8 Alison Halford: What discussions has the First Minister had with the UK Government regarding North Wales Police? (OAQ23582)

C8 Alison Halford: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU mewn perthynas â Heddlu Gogledd Cymru? (OAQ23582)

The First Minister: I have not had any discussions with the Westminster Government about North Wales Police. However, Edwina Hart, as the Minister responsible for finance, local government and communities, meets the chief constable and

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chefais unrhyw drafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan am Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae Edwina Hart, fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gyllid, llywodraeth leol a chymunedau, yn cwrdd â phrif gwnstabl a

the chair of the North Wales Police Authority regularly.

chadeirydd Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn rheolaidd.

Alison Halford: The budget for North Wales Police has risen by 197 per cent since 1997. The chief constable regularly brings out the begging bowl and demands a larger precept under the threat of less police cover. All four chief constables have indicated their willingness to come under Assembly control, and, in order to open up the vagaries of police budgets and to simplify complex Home Office formulae, will you, with your Finance Minister, press for policing to be devolved to the Assembly?

Alison Halford: Mae'r gyllideb i Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wedi codi 197 y cant er 1997. Mae'r prif gwnstabl yn cardota'n aml ac yn gofyn praesept mwy gan fygwth llai o ddarpariaeth gan yr heddlu. Mae pob un o'r pedwar prif gwnstabl wedi nodi ei fod yn barod i ddod o dan reolaeth y Cynulliad, ac, er mwyn amlygu anghysonderau cyllidebau'r heddlu a symleiddio fformiwlâu cymhleth o eiddo'r Swyddfa Gartref, a wnewch chi, gyda'r Gweinidog Cyllid, bwyso am ddatganoli plismona i'r Cynulliad?

The First Minister: It is for us to continue to press for this if that is in response to a view that is widely held within the police authorities—not just among the chief constables. I have heard rumours to that effect, but have not received a formal approach to that end. However, I understand that that is the position and, therefore, we may want to take the issue further once the views of the four police authorities in Wales are clear. I understand that they are in favour of devolving police powers but I need to receive a formal approach.

Y Prif Weinidog: Dylem barhau i bwyso am hynny os gwneir hynny mewn ymateb i farn sy'n gyffredin yn yr awdurdodau heddlu—nid yn unig ymysg y prif gwnstabliaid. Clywais sïon i'r perwyl hwnnw, ond ni chysylltwyd â mi'n ffurfiol i'r diben hwnnw. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn deall mai felly y mae'r sefyllfa a, gan hynny, efallai y byddwn am fynd â'r mater ymhellach pan geir barn bendant gan y pedwar awdurdod heddlu yng Nghymru. Deallaf eu bod o blaid datganoli pwerau'r heddlu ond rhaid imi gael cynnig ffurfiol.

Gareth Jones: Cyn imi ofyn fy nghwestiwn atodol, yr wyf yn sicr, Brif Weinidog, y byddech am inni, fel Cynulliad, ddatgan ein cydymdeimlad dwysaf â theulu'r milwr ifanc, Llywelyn Evans o Landudno, cyn-ddisgybl o Ysgol John Bright, a fu farw o dan amodau trist yn ystod un o ymgyrchoedd rhyfel Irac yr wythnos diwethaf.

Gareth Jones: Before I ask my supplementary question, I am sure, First Minister, that you would want us, as an Assembly, to express our deepest sympathies to the family of the young soldier, Llywelyn Evans from Llandudno, a former pupil of Ysgol John Bright, who died in sad circumstances during one of the Iraq war campaigns last week.

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwn, ar bob cyfrif. Credaf fy mod yn siarad, fel chi, Gareth, ar ran pob plaid a phob Aelod wrth gydymdeimlo â'i deulu, ei ffrindiau a Chlwb Rygbi Llandudno, yr oedd yn aelod blaenllaw ohono. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at y teulu.

The First Minister: Yes, by all means. I believe that I, like you, Gareth, speak on behalf of every party and every Member in extending our sympathies to his family, his friends and Llandudno Rugby Club, of which he was a prominent member. I will be writing to the family.

Gareth Jones: Diolch, Brif Weinidog. A ydych yn cytuno, yn bersonol, â phrif gwnstabl Heddlu Gogledd Cymru y dylid datganoli rheolaeth dros heddlu ein gwlad i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol?

Gareth Jones: Thank you, First Minister. Do you, personally, agree with the chief constable of North Wales Police that control over our country's police should be devolved to the National Assembly?

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y dywedais yn

The First Minister: As I said earlier, this is

gynharach, nid mater i'r pedwar prif gwnstabl yw hyn ond i'r pedwar awdurdod heddlu. Deallaf fod siarad am hynny ymysg awdurdodau'r heddlu, ond, hyd y gwn i, nid ydynt wedi ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch hynny. Pe byddent yn gwneud hynny, byddwn yn awyddus i ymateb oherwydd byddai'n rhaid imi godi gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref a fyddai'n fodlon trosglwyddo'r swyddogaethau i ni. Fodd bynnag, pe byddai'n gwneud hynny, byddai'n rhaid iddi drosglwyddo cyllid hefyd.

not a matter for the four chief constables but for the four police authorities. I am given to understand that police authorities are dicussing this, but, as far as I know, they have not written to me about it. If they were to do so, I would be eager to respond because I would have to approach the Home Office to gauge its willingness to transfer the functions to us. However, if it were to do that, it would also have to transfer funding.

Rhaid inni dalu rhywfaint o arian pan fo buddsoddiad menter cyllid preifat, ac mae hynny'n bwnc llosg o ran Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, gan fod cynllun mawr menter cyllid preifat ganddo. Rhaid i'r Swyddfa Gartref gymeradwyo'r cyfalaf, ond nid oes gennym ddewis: rhaid inni dalu'r llog blynyddol.

We have to pay a certain amount when a private finance initiative investment is made, and that is a burning issue with regard to North Wales Police Authority, because it has a major PFI scheme. The Home Office must approve the capital, but we do not have any choice: we have to pay the annual interest.

2.30 p.m.

David Ian Jones: You are no doubt aware that the police council tax precept in north Wales has just been increased by some 31 per cent, ostensibly to pay the cost of another 50 police officers. Do you agree that the presence of another 50 police officers should be a powerful deterrent to criminals, provided of course that those officers are employed in visible community policing and not in making life miserable for motorists on the A55?

David Ian Jones: Mae'n siŵr y gwyddoch fod praesept treth gyngor yr heddlu yn y Gogledd newydd godi tua 31 y cant a hynny, yn ôl pob golwg, er mwyn cwrdd â chost 50 heddwas arall. A gytunwch fod presenoldeb 50 heddwas arall yn debygol o fod yn atalfa gadarn i droseddwyr, ar yr amod, wrth gwrs, y caiff yr heddweision hynny eu defnyddio ar gyfer plismona gweladwy yn y gymuned ac nid i beri diflastod i fodurwyr ar yr A55?

The First Minister: You should not allow yourself to be fitted into the stereotype of the white middle-aged male with a reasonably rapidly moving car, in which you believe that you are invariably peace-loving, and when you hear of a speeding motorist having to pay a fine you say, 'There, but for the grace of God, go I' and so on. We all know the picture. People have different perceptions as to what is a criminal, and what is an offender. You should never say that speeding should be condoned. There are, however, different priorities for different types of crimes. The police authority has to maintain a balance and has to ensure that speeding is reduced. That kind of crime has been cut back substantially by increased use of cameras, which means that the rate of accidents on our roads has been reduced.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni ddylech adael i chi'ch hun gael eich ffitio i stereoteip y gwryw canol-oed gwyn a chanddo gar eithaf cyflym, a chithau'n eich gweld eich hun yn un sy'n heddychlon bob amser, ac yn dweud, pan glywch am un a fu'n goryrru'n gorfod talu dirwy, 'Gallai hynny yn hawdd fod wedi digwydd i mi' ac yn y blaen. Yr ydym i gyd yn gyfarwydd â hynny. Mae gan bobl wahanol ganfyddiadau o'r hyn yw troseddwr, a'r hyn yw tramgwyddwr. Ni ddylech byth ddweud y dylid goddef goryrru. Er hynny, mae gwahanol flaenoriaethau ar gyfer gwahanol fathau o droseddau. Rhaid i'r awdurdod heddlu gadw'r ddysgl yn wastad a rhaid iddo sicrhau y ceir llai o oryrru. Cwtogwyd yn sylweddol ar y math hwnnw o drosedd drwy wneud mwy o ddefnydd o gamerâu, a golyga hynny fod y gyfradd

damweiniau ar ein ffyrdd wedi gostwng.

Dyfodol Gwaith Allied Steel and Wire
The Future of the Allied Steel and Wire Works

Q9 Owen John Thomas: What communication has the First Minister had recently regarding the future of the Allied Steel and Wire works? (OAQ23584)

C9 Owen John Thomas: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar ynghylch dyfodol gwaith Allied Steel and Wire? (OAQ23584)

The First Minister: The Minister for Economic Development and I have spoken to Celsa's senior management team. There has recently been an exchange of correspondence between us, but they are still holding fire on the final decision about restarting production. We have regular discussions with the Iron and Steel Trades Confederation and other interested parties about what is to happen to the former ASW works in Cardiff. We have noticed that the transfer of the bar mill and the caster from the former ASW mill at Shearness is continuing and their installation in Cardiff has almost been completed.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a minnau wedi siarad ag uwch dîm rheoli Celsa. Bu gohebu rhyngom yn ddiweddar ond maent yn dal i ohirio'r penderfyniad terfynol ar ailgychwyn cynhyrchu. Cawn drafodaethau rheolaidd â Chydffederasiwn y Crefftau Haearn a Dur a rhai eraill sy'n gysylltiedig am yr hyn a ddigwydd i gyn waith ASW yng Nghaerdydd. Yr ydym wedi sylwi bod y gwaith o drosglwyddo'r felin farrau a'r peiriant bwrw o gyn felin ASW yn Shearness yn dal i fynd rhagddo a bod y gwaith o'u gosod yng Nghaerdydd bron â dod i ben.

Owen John Thomas: Many of the former workforce are as anxious about their pensions entitlements as they are about the future of the works. The Westminster Government's Green Paper on pensions did not propose a solution that would guarantee the pension entitlement of those, such as the former ASW workers, after their pension trust entered into the end of the wind-up process. Has the National Assembly Government responded to the Green Paper, and, if so, has it called for the establishment of a pensions guarantee authority, that would ensure the full pension entitlement of the former Allied Steel and Wire workforce and pension trusts in similar situations?

Owen John Thomas: Mae llawer o'r cyn-weithwyr mor bryderus am eu hawliadau pensiwn ag y maent am ddyfodol y gwaith. Nid oedd Papur Gwyrdd Llywodraeth San Steffan ar bensiynau'n cynnig ateb a fyddai'n gwarantu hawliadau pensiwn rhai fel cyn-weithwyr ASW, wedi i'w hymddiriedolaeth bensiwn gyrraedd diwedd y broses dirwyn i ben. A yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi ymateb i'r Papur Gwyrdd, ac, os ydyw, a alwodd am sefydlu awdurdod gwarantu pensiynau, a fyddai'n sicrhau hawliadau pensiwn llawn i gyn-weithwyr Allied Steel and Wire ac ymddiriedolaethau pensiwn mewn sefyllfaoedd tebyg?

The First Minister: We have responded to the pensions Green Paper on behalf of the Assembly Government. The key point that you are missing is whether proposals to modernise pensions in this country can be made retrospectively so that they can apply to the problems of Allied Steel and Wire. My understanding is that Ian McCartney, the Minister of State for Pensions, has not totally shut the door on retrospection, although it is rare in British legislation.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi ymateb i'r Papur Gwyrdd ar bensiynau ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Y pwynt allweddol yr ydych yn ei fethu yw a ellir gwneud cynigion i foderneiddio pensiynau yn y wlad hon yn rhai ôl-weithredol fel y gallant fod yn berthnasol i broblemau Allied Steel and Wire. O'r hyn yr wyf fi'n ei ddeall, nid yw Ian McCartney, y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Bensiynau, wedi diystyru ôl-weithredu'n llwyr, er bod hynny'n anghyffredin mewn deddfwriaeth Brydeinig.

Atebolrwydd a Thryloywder
Accountability and Transparency

Q10 William Graham: Will the First Minister make a statement concerning the guidance given to Assembly Ministers to ensure accountability and transparency within their departmental responsibilities? (OAQ23576)

C10 William Graham: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad mewn perthynas â'r canllawiau a roddwyd i Weinidogion y Cynulliad er mwyn sicrhau atebolrwydd a thryloywder o fewn eu dyletswyddau adrannol? (OAQ23576)

The First Minister: The Ministerial Code clearly sets out Ministers' responsibilities in these and related areas. The current version of the code was approved by the Assembly in December 2001.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Cod y Gweinidogion yn nodi'n eglur gyfrifoldebau Gweinidogion yn y meysydd hyn a rhai cysylltiedig. Cymeradwywyd fersiwn cyfredol y cod gan y Cynulliad yn Rhagfyr 2001.

William Graham: You will obviously conduct an investigation into the failure of the Assembly's education and training department regarding ELWa. What lessons can be learned from that as to how accountability can be further enhanced?

William Graham: Mae'n amlwg y byddwch yn cynnal ymchwiliad i fethiant adran addysg a hyfforddiant y Cynulliad mewn cysylltiad ag ELWa. Pa wersi y gellir eu dysgu oddi wrth hynny o ran y modd y gellir wella atebolrwydd?

The First Minister: I wondered what your supplementary question would be. It is rather sad that, despite the frequency with which I have repeated this, I must repeat it yet again. Whereas Ministers are responsible for ensuring in their remit letters what the policy guidance is to Assembly sponsored public bodies, they are not responsible for individual acts by officers of those ASPBs that may or may not fall outside the compliance rules. Those are matters to be picked up by the ASPB's own internal audit mechanisms. If we hear of such acts, then we will refer them to internal audit. Likewise, it is for the National Audit Office to audit ASPBs independently. Those procedures are invariably carried out. They are monitored by the Permanent Secretary as the chief accounting officer. They are the responsibility of the individual chief executive of each ASPB. That is why each chief executive holds the status of accounting officer beneath the overall responsibility of the Permanent Secretary for accounting matters of that kind, whether they are regularity and propriety matters, or value for money matters.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oeddwn yn ceisio dyfalu beth fyddai'ch cwestwn atodol. Mae'n drist braidd, er amled y bu'n rhaid imi ailadrodd hyn, fod rhaid imi ei ddweud eto. Tra bo Gweinidogion yn gyfrifol am bennu'r canllawiau polisi yn eu llythyrau cylch gwaith i gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, nid ydynt yn gyfrifol am gamau gweithredu unigol gan swyddogion y cyrff hynny a allai fod yn anghyson â'r rheolau cydymffurfio. Mae materion o'r fath i'w codi drwy fecanweithiau archwilio mewnol y cyrff eu hunain. Os clywn am weithredu o'r fath, yna fe'i cyfeiriwn i archwiliad mewnol. Yn yr un modd, mater i'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yw archwilio cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad yn annibynnol. Cyflawnir y gweithdrefnau hynny'n ddieithriad. Cânt eu monitro gan yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol fel y prif swyddog cyfrifo. Maent yn gyfrifoldeb i brif weithredwr unigol pob corff a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Dyna pam y mae pob prif weithredwr yn meddu ar statws swyddog cyfrifo o dan gyfrifoldeb cyffredinol yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol dros faterion cyfrifo o'r fath, pa un a ydynt yn faterion o reoleidd-dra a gweddustra, neu'n faterion gwerth am arian.

Richard Edwards: A recognition that

Richard Edwards: Mae cydnabyddiaeth o

accountability and transparency are important in government is implicit in William Graham's question. Do you, like me, welcome this turnaround in Conservative Party thinking about the governance of Wales?

bwysigrwydd atebolrwydd a thryloywder mewn llywodraeth yn oblygedig yng nghwestiwn William Graham. A ydych chi, fel minnau, yn croesawu'r newid meddwl hwn gan y Blaid Geidwadol am lywodraethu Cymru?

The First Minister: The purpose of Plenary and Committee meetings is to correct the democratic deficit that existed in Wales before 1999. For me, that was a lifelong campaign, and it was for Richard too. I am pleased that we are here for that reason, and I am interested in doing anything possible to correct that democratic deficit. However, it would be a mess if we were to allocate responsibility to an accounting officer, appoint a board, and then say to that board that Ministers, and not the board, were responsible for what it did. Ministers are responsible for policy, but not for infractions of the compliance culture, which we, and the Assembly's Permanent Secretary as chief accounting officer, must inculcate into staff and the chief executives of the Assembly sponsored public bodies.

Y Prif Weinidog: Pwrpas y Cyfarfod Llawn a chyfarfodydd Pwyllgor yw cywiro'r diffyg democrataidd a fu yng Nghymru cyn 1999. Bûm i, fel Richard, yn brwydro am hynny gydol fy oes. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yma am y rheswm hwnnw, ac yr wyf am wneud unrhyw beth y gellir ei wneud i gywiro'r diffyg democrataidd hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, byddai llanastr pe byddem yn dyrannu cyfrifoldeb i swyddog cyfrifo, yn penodi bwrdd, ac wedyn yn dweud wrth y bwrdd mai Gweinidogion, ac nid y bwrdd, a oedd yn gyfrifol am yr hyn a wnâi. Mae Gweinidogion yn gyfrifol am bolisi, ond nid am unrhyw dramgwyddo yn erbyn yr arferion cydymffurfio, y mae'n rhaid inni, ac Ysgrifennydd Parhaol y Cynulliad fel prif swyddog cyfrifo, eu hargraffu ar feddwl staff a phrif weithredwyr y cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad.

Helen Mary Jones: We all understand the process—you have taken a lot of trouble to explain it to us, and some of us have looked it up for ourselves. However, do you accept that the problems with ELWa go beyond specific actions that may, or may not, have happened, and that may, or may not, need investigation? Do you accept that someone must take political responsibility for this mess? Your Government set this body up and, clearly, that was not done effectively. Will you take political responsibility for this mess because your Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning does not have the nerve or authority to do so?

Helen Mary Jones: Yr ydym oll yn deall y broses—aethoch i lawer o drafferth i'w hegluro inni, ac mae rhai ohonom wedi ymchwilio iddi ein hunain. Fodd bynnag, a dderbyniwch fod y problemau sydd ynglŷn ag ELWa yn mynd y tu hwnt i gamau gweithredu penodol a allai fod wedi digwydd, neu y gallai fod angen ymchwilio iddynt? A dderbyniwch fod rhaid i rywun dderbyn cyfrifoldeb gwleidyddol am y llanastr hwn? Eich Llywodraeth chi a sefydlodd y corff hwn ac mae'n amlwg na wnaed hynny'n effeithiol. A wnewch dderbyn cyfrifoldeb gwleidyddol am y llanastr hwn gan nad oes gan eich Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yr hyder na'r awdurdod i wneud hynny?

The First Minister: Again, that is the politics of smear. Helen Mary keeps falling into the trap of thinking that such a cheapskate remark will get her credit in Llanelli or with the people of Wales; it will not. All you must consider is whether the audit systems are working properly. Why not leave it to Dafydd Wigley? He chairs the Audit Committee, and is a member of your

Y Prif Weinidog: Unwaith eto, dyna wleidyddiaeth taflu baw. Mae Helen Mary yn dal i syrthio i'r fagl o gredu y bydd sylw israddol o'r fath yn dod â chlod iddi yn Llanelli neu yng ngolwg pobl Cymru; ni wnaiff. Y cwbl y dylech ei ystyried yw a yw'r systemau archwilio'n gweithio'n briodol. Beth am ei adael i Dafydd Wigley? Ef yw Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio, ac

party. He and the National Audit Office are doing a good job—they are the backstop. If there is a failure of compliance, they will sort it out. The National Audit Office reports—independently of us—to Dafydd, as Chair of the Audit Committee. They decide how serious an offence of compliance is. That is not a matter for Ministers, but for the system that has been set up. Dafydd is one of the lynchpins of that system, and he is doing a good job. Helen Mary does not need to second-guess it.

mae'n aelod o'ch plaid chi. Mae ef a'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn gwneud gwaith da—hwy yw'r ôl-stop. Os oes methiant i gydymffurfio, gwnant hwy ei ddatrys. Mae'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn adrodd—yn annibynnol arnom ni—i Dafydd, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Hwy sy'n penderfynu pa mor ddifrifol yw tramgwydd yn erbyn cydymffurfiad. Nid yw hynny'n fater i Weinidogion, ond i'r system a sefydlwyd. Dafydd yw un o gonglfeini'r system honno, ac mae'n gwneud gwaith da. Nid oes angen i Helen Mary geisio rhagweld ei ganlyniad.

Darparu Gwasanaethau Newydd-anedig
Neonatal Service Provision

Q11 Janice Gregory: Does the Assembly Government have any plans to review neonatal service provision in Wales? (OAQ23579)

C11 Janice Gregory: A oes gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad unrhyw gynlluniau i adolygu'r ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau newydd-anedig yng Nghymru? (OAQ23579)

The First Minister: The Welsh Assembly Government has a strong commitment to the provision of neonatal services. Earlier this month, Jane Hutt officially launched the universal neonatal hearing screening scheme for Wales, the first of its kind in the UK. The first babies to be screened under the services will be seen at North East Wales NHS Trust and Conwy and Denbighshire NHS Trust on 31 March.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo'n gadarn i'r ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau newydd-anedig. Yn gynharach y mis hwn, cafodd y cynllun sgrinio clyw newydd-anedig cyffredinol i Gymru, y cyntaf o'i fath yn y DU, ei lansio'n swyddogol gan Jane Hutt. Bydd y babanod cyntaf i'w sgrinio o dan y gwasanaethau'n cael eu gweld gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Siroedd Conwy a Dinbych ar 31 Mawrth.

From 1 April, Health Commission Wales will be taking forward a review of neonatal intensive care in Wales. That review will inform the development of service standards that will form part of the children's national service framework for the health service in Wales.

O 1 Ebrill, bydd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn bwrw ymlaen ag adolygiad o ofal dwys newydd-anedig yng Nghymru. Bydd yr adolygiad hwnnw'n hysbysu'r gwaith o ddatblygu safonau gwasanaeth a fydd yn rhan o'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i blant ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru.

Janice Gregory: Thank you for that positive response. I had the pleasure of visiting the neonatal unit at the Princess of Wales Hospital at the beginning of this month. It is incumbent upon us all to visit these units to see what wonderful work is being undertaken to save these tiny lives. Neonatal nurses in Wales are frustrated that there has not been a review of neonatal nursing. Will you reiterate our commitment to take forward a review, so

Janice Gregory: Diolch i chi am yr ateb cadarnhaol hwnnw. Cefais y pleser o ymweld â'r uned newydd-anedig yn Ysbyty Tywysoges Cymru ddechrau'r mis hwn. Dylem oll ymweld â'r unedau hyn er mwyn gweld y gwaith rhyfeddol a wneir i achub y bywydau bychain hyn. Mae nyrsys y gwasanaethau newydd-anedig yng Nghymru'n rhwystredig am na fu adolygiad o nyrsio newydd-anedig. A wnewch ailddatgan

that neonatal nurses get the recognition that they truly deserve?

ein hymrwymiad i fwrw ymlaen ag adolygiad, fel y caiff nyrsys y gwasanaethau newydd-anedig y gydnabyddiaeth y maent yn ei gwirioneddol haeddu?

The First Minister: I accept that. As part of the development of the children's national service framework, the maternity module—one of the six modules within the children's NSF—will carry out a baseline review of all services for children, including neonatal services, throughout Wales. It will map current provision and identify any gaps in the service; it will also inform the process of implementing the NSF.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn derbyn hynny. Fel rhan o'r gwaith o ddatblygu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i blant, bydd y modiwl mamolaeth—un o'r chwe modiwl yn y fframwaith i blant—yn cynnal adolygiad sylfaenol o'r holl wasanaethau i blant, gan gynnwys gwasanaethau newydd-anedig, ledled Cymru. Bydd yn disgrifio'r ddarpariaeth bresennol ac yn nodi unrhyw fylchau yn y gwasanaeth; bydd hefyd yn hysbysu'r broses o roi'r fframwaith ar waith.

Janet Davies: Over the years, the mortality rate of newborn babies has decreased tremendously. Many factors, which caused the high mortality rates in the past, no longer play a part. However, in recent years, heavy smoking among young women, and older women having babies for the first time, have increased the areas of risk. Will you ensure that these factors are taken into account in the review?

Janet Davies: Dros y blynyddoedd, bu gostyngiad aruthrol yng nghyfradd marwolaethau babanod newydd-anedig. Nid yw llawer o'r ffactorau a achosai'r cyfraddau marwolaethau uchel yn y gorffennol yn chwarae rhan bellach. Fodd bynnag, yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae ysmygu trwm ymysg menywod ifanc, a menywod hŷn sy'n cael babanod am y tro cyntaf, wedi ychwanegu at y meysydd risg. A wnewch sicrhau y caiff y ffactorau hyn eu hystyried yn yr adolygiad?

The First Minister: That is not a matter for me—it is for the professionals to determine. However, everything you say fits in with what I think is the reason why there has not been a further fall in the mortality rate. The rate has decreased from 13 per thousand to five and a half per thousand, but it has stuck at that. The reason why it is not decreasing below that to Scandinavian or Dutch levels—which is, I believe, about four per 1,000—is probably because of the number of smokers. Additionally, women in the prime age group—between 20 and 30-years-old—are giving birth safely. It tends to be more prevalent among teenagers, although I am pleased that the teenage pregnancy rate has dropped for the last three years. However, smoking and the tendency for the first baby to be born when the mother is quite a lot older than before because of the dependency on a wife's or partner's income, are factors.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw hynny'n fater i mi—mae'n rhywbeth i'w benderfynu gan y gweithwyr proffesiynol. Er hynny, mae popeth a ddywedwch yn gyson â'r hyn a gredaf yw'r rheswm pam na fu gostyngiad pellach yn y gyfradd marwolaethau. Mae'r gyfradd wedi gostwng o 13 y fil i bump a hanner y fil, ond arhosodd yn y fan honno. Y rheswm nad yw'n gostwng yn is na hynny i lefelau gwledydd Llychlyn neu'r Iseldiroedd—sef tua phedwar y fil, yr wyf yn credu—yw nifer yr ysmygwyr, yn ôl pob tebyg. Yn ogystal, mae menywod yn y prif grŵp oedran—rhwng 20 a 30 mlwydd oed—yn rhoi genedigaeth yn ddiogel. Mae'n tueddu i fod yn fwy cyffredin ymysg rhai yn eu harddegau, er fy mod yn falch bod y gyfradd beichiogrwydd ymysg rhai yn eu harddegau wedi gostwng dros y tair blynedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, mae ysmygu a'r duedd i'r baban cyntaf gael ei eni pan fo'r fam yn hŷn o lawer nag o'r blaen oherwydd y ddibyniaeth ar incwm gwraig neu gymar, yn ffactorau.

2.40 p.m.

Gorchmynion Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol (Y Gogledd)
Anti-social Behaviour Orders (North Wales)

Q12 Alun Pugh: Will the First Minister make a statement on the number of anti-social behaviour orders issued in north Wales? (OAQ23577)

C12 Alun Pugh: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am nifer y gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a ddyfarnwyd yng ngogledd Cymru? (OAQ23577)

The First Minister: Since the Crime and Disorder Act 1998 was introduced, nine anti-social behaviour orders have been issued in north Wales—seven in Wrexham and two in Conwy.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ers cyflwyno'r Ddeddf Trosedd ac Anhrefn 1998, rhoddwyd naw gorchymyn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yng ngogledd Cymru—saith yn Wrecsam a dau yng Nghonwy.

Alun Pugh: Do you accept that anti-social behaviour orders can improve behaviour? However, do you also agree that if individuals persistently flout them, commit further crimes, and generally make life hell for their neighbours—particularly in the small hours of the morning—the only place for them is behind bars?

Alun Pugh: A ydych yn derbyn bod gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn gallu gwella ymddygiad? Fodd bynnag, a ydych hefyd yn cytuno, os yw unigolion yn eu diystyru'n barhaus, yn cyflawni troseddau pellach, ac yn gyffredinol yn troi bywydau eu cymdogion yn uffern ar y ddaear—yn enwedig yn oriau mân y bore—mai'r carchar yw'r priod le iddynt?

The First Minister: I do not know what the answer is, but any Member who conducts a surgery, as we all do, will be aware of such complaints. Intense frustration is felt among pensioners, especially, but also among law-abiding citizens, those who must get up early for work or who must get children ready for school, if they are woken at 2 a.m. or 3 a.m. by miscreant youths who have nothing better to do, and who should be in bed getting ready for school, or training, or a job in the morning. When anti-social behaviour orders were first introduced, magistrates were rather slow to take them up. However, they are catching on, and the number issued in the last few months is much higher than before. I am pleased with that development.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wn beth yw'r ateb, ond bydd unrhyw Aelod sy'n cynnal cymhorthfa, fel y mae pob un ohonom, yn ymwybodol o gwynion o'r fath. Teimlir rhwystredigaeth fawr ymysg pensiynwyr, yn enwedig, ond hefyd ymysg dinasyddion sy'n barchus o'r gyfraith, sef y rhai sy'n gorfod codi'n gynnar i fynd i'w gwaith neu'n gorfod cael plant yn barod i fynd i'r ysgol, os cânt eu deffro am 2 a.m. neu 3 a.m. gan ddrwgweithredwyr ifanc nad oes ganddynt ddim gwell i'w wneud, ac a ddylai fod yn eu gwelyau i fod yn barod ar gyfer yr ysgol, neu hyfforddiant, neu waith yn y bore. Pan gyflwynwyd gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn gyntaf, bu ynadon braidd yn hir cyn dechrau eu defnyddio. Fodd bynnag, maent yn dod yn fwy cyffredin, a rhoddwyd nifer fwy o lawer yn y misoedd diwethaf nag o'r blaen. Yr wyf yn falch o weld y datblygiad hwnnw.

David Ian Jones: Do you agree that anti-social behaviour orders should be a last resort? Do you also agree that the system of acceptable behaviour contracts, which is being successfully trialled in north Wales, has a great deal to commend it, as it gives the potential offender a last chance to mend his or her ways before the anti-social behaviour

David Ian Jones: A ydych yn cytuno mai ar ôl i bopeth arall fethu y dylid troi at orchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol? A ydych hefyd yn cytuno bod llawer i'w ganmol yn y system o gontractau ymddygiad derbyniol, y ceir rhagbrawf llwyddiannus arnynt yn y Gogledd, gan ei bod yn rhoi un cyfle olaf i'r troseddwr dichonol ddod at ei

order is made?

goed cyn gwneud y gorchymyn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol?

The First Minister: It is far better if you can nip it in the bud before it gets to the stage where an anti-social behaviour order is necessary. I commend that. However, my earlier point was that magistrates were not failing to issue anti-social behaviour orders because they thought that there was an alternative, but because they were seeking barristers' advice, thus making the procedure costly. Now that they are more used to the procedure, they have less regard for the high cost. Therefore, they are not daunted by the new procedure, and the number of anti-social behaviour orders is rising quite rapidly, as was originally intended.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwell o lawer yw gallu lladd rhywbeth yn yr egin cyn bod angen gorchymyn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Cymeradwyaf hynny. Er hynny, y pwynt a wneuthum yn gynharach oedd nad peidio â rhoi gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol am eu bod yn credu bod dewis arall yr oedd ynadon, ond am eu bod yn ceisio cyngor gan fargyfreithwyr, gan beri i'r weithdrefn fod yn un ddrud. Gan eu bod bellach yn fwy cyfarwydd â'r weithdrefn, nid ydynt yn rhoi cymaint o ystyriaeth i'r gost uchel. Felly, nid yw'r weithdrefn newydd yn codi ofn arnynt, ac mae nifer y gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn codi'n eithaf cyflym, yn ôl y bwriad gwreiddiol.

Janet Ryder: Another alternative is to work with the families of young offenders, and help and support them. The Local Government and Housing Committee recently visited Dublin where we saw family intervention work being carried out successfully, especially with the families of young people who had committed several offences. The North Wales Regional Committee has also had representations from groups in Wrexham that do similar work. As policy co-ordinator for north Wales, will you consider the issues and projects being developed in north Wales along these lines of family intervention, family development, and family services, to help those families before their situation deteriorates to such an extent that orders are necessary?

Janet Ryder: Dewis arall yw gweithio gyda theuluoedd troseddwyr ifanc, a'u helpu a'u cefnogi. Yn ddiweddar bu'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar ymweliad â Dulyn lle y gwelsom waith ataliol teuluol yn cael ei gyflawni'n llwyddiannus, yn enwedig gyda theuluoedd pobl ifanc a oedd wedi cyflawni sawl trosedd. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd wedi derbyn sylwadau gan grwpiau yn Wrecsam sy'n gwneud gwaith tebyg. Fel cydgysylltydd polisi'r Gogledd, a wnewch ystyried y materion a'r prosiectau a ddatblygir yn y Gogledd ar ffurf ymyrryd teuluol, datblygu teuluol, a gwasanaethau teuluol, i helpu'r teuluoedd hynny cyn i'w sefyllfa ddirywio i'r fath raddau fel bod angen gorchmynion?

The First Minister: This may be the penultimate questions session to the First Minister in this Assembly, but there is much cross-party unity on this subject. I believe that we all agree that the hierarchy should be: first, family intervention; secondly, behaviour contracts, and thirdly, and only as a sign of failure—but if it must be done it must be done—the acceptable anti-social behaviour orders.

Y Prif Weinidog: Er mai hon yw sesiwn gwestiynau olaf ond un y Prif Weinidog yn y Cynulliad hwn, mae llawer o gytundeb ar draws y pleidiau ar y pwnc hwn. Credaf ein bod ni oll yn cytuno mai'r hierarchiaeth briodol yw: yn gyntaf, ymyrryd teuluol; yn ail, contractau ymddygiad, ac yn drydydd, a dim ond fel arwydd o fethiant—ond os oes rhaid ei wneud, boed felly—y gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol derbyniol.

Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): There are three changes to this week's

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Mae tri newid i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae datganiad

business. Today's statement on the foot and mouth contingency plan has been postponed. I will inform the Business Committee as soon as I have a revised date for that statement. Tomorrow, the motion to approve the Preserved Counties (Amendment to Boundaries) (Wales) Order 2003 has been moved to 1 April, and the motion to approve the Care Homes (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2003 has been moved to 2 April. Next week's business is as shown on the draft statement, which is on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. I have no determinations to report under Standing Order No. 22.5.

heddiw ar gynllun wrth gefn clwy'r traed a'r genau wedi'i ohirio. Rhoddaf wybod i'r Pwyllgor Busnes cyn gynted ag y bydd gennyf ddyddiad newydd ar gyfer y datganiad hwnnw. Yfory, mae'r cynnig i gymeradwyo Gorchymyn Siroedd Wedi'u Cadw (Newid Ffiniau) (Cymru) 2003 wedi'i symud i 1 Ebrill, ac mae'r cynnig i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cartrefi Gofal (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2003 wedi'i symud i 2 Ebrill. Mae busnes yr wythnos nesaf fel y'i dangosir yn y datganiad drafft, sydd ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw benderfyniadau i'w hadrodd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiadiadau i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes sylwadau? Gwelaf fod. Galwaf ar gynrychiolydd o bob grŵp i ymateb i'r datganiad.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments? I see that there are. I call on a representative from each group to respond to the statement.

Nick Bourne: I have two points. The first relates to security in the Assembly following the incidents that took place last week. If there should be proposals by the House Committee—

Nick Bourne: Mae gennyf ddau bwynt. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â diogelwch yn y Cynulliad ar ôl y digwyddiadau a fu yr wythnos diwethaf. Os ceir cynigion gan Bwyllgor y Tŷ—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I ask the leader of the Welsh Conservatives to consider whether it is appropriate for him to breach the established convention of not referring to internal and security matters in Plenary, which are more appropriately dealt with in private.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gofynnaf i arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru ystyried a yw'n briodol iddo dorri'r confensiwn sefydledig o beidio â chyfeirio yn y Cyfarfod Llawn at faterion mewnol a materion diogelwch, y mae'n fwy priodol eu trafod yn breifat.

Nick Bourne: I will do so at your suggestion. However, I do hope that the House Committee addresses the issue as it is in everyone's interest and is important.

Nick Bourne: Gwnaf hynny ar eich awgrym. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y bydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn ymdrin â'r mater gan ei fod er budd pawb ac mae'n bwysig.

My second point relates to an issue that has been aired many times, namely Education and Learning Wales, but not only to the accounting issues that have been raised. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning is ultimately responsible for political matters. That is not a party political issue: it is a plain and simple fact that she is ultimately responsible for the actions of that ASPB—or quango, as we used to call it when we were in power.

Mae'r ail bwynt sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â mater a wyntyllwyd lawer gwaith, sef Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, ond nid â'r materion cyfrifo a godwyd yn unig. Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes sy'n gyfrifol yn y pen draw am faterion gwleidyddol. Nid mater pleidiol wleidyddol yw hwnnw: mae'n ffaith syml mai hi sy'n gyfrifol yn y pen draw am weithredoedd y CCNC hwnnw—neu gwango, fel yr arferem ni ei alw pan oeddem mewn grym.

Tom Middlehurst: That was a long time

Tom Middlehurst: Yr oedd hynny amser

ago.

maith yn ôl.

Nick Bourne: It was a long time ago, although people seem to forget that when we are blamed for everything.

Nick Bourne: Yr oedd hynny amser maith yn ôl, er ei bod yn ymddangos bod pobl yn anghofio hynny pan roddir y bai arnom ni am bopeth.

Regarding the structure of ELWa, which was mentioned last week in discussions on restructuring. We have asked for an urgent statement from the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning and we ask again for it to be scheduled for tomorrow. There is uncertainty in the sector regarding the breaking up of ELWa into its component parts and transferring the knowledge exploitation fund to the Welsh Development Agency. I would welcome an assurance from the Minister that a statement would be forthcoming if that were to happen.

Ynghylch strwythur ELWa, a grybwyllwyd yr wythnos diwethaf mewn trafodaethau ar ailstrwythuro. Yr ydym wedi gofyn am gael datganiad brys gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a gofynnwn eto am ei amserlennu ar gyfer yfory. Mae ansicrwydd yn y sector ynghylch rhannu ELWa yn gydrannau a throsglwyddo'r gronfa defnyddio gwybodaeth i Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Byddwn yn falch o gael sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y ceir datganiad pe byddai hynny'n digwydd.

Cynog Dafis: Cefnogaf sylwadau Nick Bourne ynglŷn ag ELWa. Deallaf fod posibilrwydd y bydd y Gweinidog yn gwneud datganiad i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ddydd Iau ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, teimlwn ei fod yn fater taer o ddiddordeb cyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd a bod trafod eang yn ei gylch. Felly, dylid ei drafod yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog wneud datganiad yfory cyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor ddydd Iau.

Cynog Dafis: I support Nick Bourne's comments about ELWa. I am given to understand that the Minister may make a statement to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee on Thursday on this issue. However, we feel that it is an urgent issue of public interest and that it is being widely discussed. Therefore, it should be discussed in Plenary. We hope that the Minister can make a statement tomorrow prior to Thursday's Committee meeting.

Yn ail, a wnewch drefnu amser ar gyfer trafod sefyllfa ariannol Cyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru a'r adroddiad diweddar bod yn rhaid iddo ad-dalu £1.5 miliwn i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn dilyn ymchwiliad i weithgareddau'r uned Ewropeaidd? Yr ydym yn galw am ddadl neu ddatganiad ar y mater. Un posibilrwydd fyddai i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes roi datganiad ar effaith yr adfachu hwnnw ar weithgareddau CBAC. Mae sôn y gallai CBAC fod wedi dirwyn i ben pe na roddid y ddarpariaeth honno. Posibilrwydd arall fyddai datganiad gan y Prif Weinidog ar gyfrifoldeb y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor o ran y sefyllfa alaethus a ddatblygodd. Er i lefarydd ar ran Mike German ddweud yn *The Western Mail* nad oedd a wnelo ef o gwbl â'r adfachiad, mae adroddiad Bentley Jennison ar y mater yn sefydlu cysylltiad clir rhwng gweithredoedd Mike German a'r

Secondly, will you arrange a time to debate the financial position of the Welsh Joint Education Committee and the recent report that it has to reimburse the European Commission to the tune of £1.5 million following an investigation into the European unit's activities? We call for a debate or a statement on the issue. One option would be for the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to make a statement on the impact of that clawback on the activities of the WJEC. There have been rumours that the WJEC could have been wound up had that provision not been made. Another option would be a statement from the First Minister regarding the responsibility of the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad given the appalling situation that developed. Although a spokesperson for Mike German stated in *The Western Mail* that the clawback has nothing to do with him, the Bentley Jennison

posiblirwydd o adfachiad, sydd bellach yn ffaith. Felly, yn enw tryloywder corff cyhoeddus ac er mwyn cael gwybodaeth gywir a sefydlu hygrededd Mike German fel Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, credaf ei bod yn hanfodol i'r Cynulliad drafod y mater.

report on the issue has established a clear link between Mike German's actions and the possibility of clawback, which has now become reality. Therefore, in the name of the transparency of a public body and in order to get accurate information and to establish Mike German's credibility as Deputy First Minister, I believe that it is essential that the Assembly debates the issue.

Peter Law: On the comments on WJEC, many of us have feared this for some time. Some of us would describe the situation as the toerags coming home to roost. Will you arrange an opportunity for us to question the great loss of public money, which will endanger WJEC's financial standing and that of the local authorities involved and which will probably have to be taken from the Welsh block of the Assembly budget? How can we have confidence in the Deputy First Minister when he is overshadowed, as the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats, by the incompetence shown by WJEC's European unit, in which he was centrally involved?

Peter Law: Ynghylch y sylwadau am CBAC, mae llawer ohonom yn ofni hyn ers cryn amser. Disgrifiad rhai ohonom o'r sefyllfa fyddai rhacs yn taro'n ôl. A wnewch drefnu inni gael cyfle i holi am y swm mawr o arian cyhoeddus a gollwyd, a fydd yn peryglu statws ariannol CBAC a'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n gysylltiedig, ac y bydd yn rhaid ei gymryd o floc Cymru yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad, yn ôl pob tebyg? Sut y gallwn fod â hyder yn y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ac yntau, fel arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, dan gysgod y bwnglera a welwyd yn uned Ewropeaidd CBAC, y bu ganddo ran ganolog ynddi?

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): The House Committee will need to consider the first point that Nick Bourne raised.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Bydd yn rhaid i Bwyllgor y Tŷ ystyried y pwynt cyntaf a gododd Nick Bourne.

In terms of the situation regarding ELWa, I am sure that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will clarify the situation over the course of the next week or so. The Minister must inform Members of the present situation, either in the Chamber or via a committee. If an urgent statement is requested, I shall respond then.

O ran y sefyllfa ynghylch ELWa, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn rhoi gwedd eglurach ar y sefyllfa dros yr wythnos nesaf, fwy neu lai. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog hysbysu Aelodau am y sefyllfa bresennol, un ai yn y Siambr neu drwy bwyllgor. Os gofynnir am ddatganiad brys, ymatebaf bryd hynny.

Neither the National Assembly nor its Government run the WJEC. Any further questions on the matter must, therefore, be raised in other fora.

Nid y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol na'i Lywodraeth sy'n rhedeg CBAC. Gan hynny, rhaid codi unrhyw gwestiynau pellach ar y mater mewn fforymau eraill.

Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.
Business statement adopted.

2.50 p.m.

Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Point of order. This

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn

relates to Standing Order No. 17.4, which states that

'A Member may inspect any documents in the possession or under the control of the Assembly which contain material relating to any proceedings of the Assembly.'

On 10 March 2003, I received a written reply from the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning about Education and Learning Wales. I had asked whether the Minister would publish details of the information provided to her and her officials by the National Council for Education and Training when they sought her authority to enter into a contract with Avanti. She replied that the National Audit Office would have access to all documents relating to the Pop Factory project as part of its current investigation and that it would report its findings to the Audit Committee in due course.

The fact that the National Audit Office has access to the documents is no good to me, because information is being made available to a body outside the Assembly but not to Members. It is important that there is a ruling on this matter, because in her statement to the Assembly—a written statement was followed by an oral statement in response to another matter on 26 February—the Minister confirmed that ELWa provided her with information on the Avanti contract, which she signed off on the basis of that information.

In his reply to Helen Mary Jones, the First Minister gave the impression that aspersions were being cast against ELWa. We are all in the dark about the Minister's role, Presiding Officer. We need the Minister to be open and transparent, because Section 70 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 clearly requires the Assembly to have procedures entitling Members to receive copies of documents relevant to Assembly proceedings, unless there are special reasons for not providing that information. I can find nothing in Standing Order No. 17.5 that prohibits the Minister from disclosing that information to me, given that she has already indicated that she is prepared to disclose it to the NAO. As the guardian of our Standing

yn ymwneud â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.4, sy'n datgan

'Gall Aelod archwilio unrhyw ddogfennau sydd ym meddiant neu o dan reolaeth y Cynulliad ac sy'n cynnwys deunydd ynglŷn ag unrhyw un o drafodion y Cynulliad.'

Ar 10 Mawrth 2003, cefais ateb ysgrifenedig oddi wrth y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru. Yr oeddwn wedi gofyn a wnâi'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi manylion y wybodaeth a ddarparwyd ar ei chyfer hi a'i swyddogion gan y Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant pan geisiodd awdurdod ganddi i wneud contract ag Avanti. Atebodd y byddai'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn cael gweld yr holl ddogfennau a oedd yn ymwneud â phrosiect y Pop Factory fel rhan o'i hymchwiliad presennol ac y rhoddai adroddiad ar ei chanfyddiadau i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio gyda hyn.

Nid yw'r ffaith bod y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn cael gweld y dogfennau o unrhyw werth i mi, gan fod gwybodaeth yn cael ei darparu i gorff y tu allan i'r Cynulliad ond nid i Aelodau. Mae'n bwysig y ceir dyfarniad ar y mater hwn, oherwydd yn ei datganiad i'r Cynulliad—ar ôl cael datganiad ysgrifenedig, cafwyd datganiad llafar mewn ymateb i fater arall ar 26 Chwefror—cadarnhaodd y Gweinidog fod ELWa wedi darparu gwybodaeth ar ei chyfer am gontract Avanti, a'i bod wedi cytuno arno ar sail y wybodaeth honno.

Yn ei ateb i Helen Mary Jones, rhoddodd y Prif Weinidog yr argraff bod ELWa dan gabl. Nid oes gan yr un ohonom syniad am rôl y Gweinidog, Lywydd. Mae arnom angen i'r Gweinidog fod yn agored ac yn dryloyw, gan ei bod yn amlwg bod Adran 70 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn mynnu y caiff y Cynulliad weithdrefnau sy'n rhoi hawl i Aelodau gael copïau o ddogfennau sy'n berthnasol i drafodion y Cynulliad, oni bai fod rhesymau arbennig dros beidio â darparu'r wybodaeth honno. Ni allaf ganfod dim yn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.5 sy'n gwahardd y Gweinidog rhag datgelu'r wybodaeth honno i mi, o ystyried ei bod eisoes wedi nodi ei bod yn barod i'w datgelu i'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol. Fel

Orders, Presiding Officer, I ask you to rule on whether I am entitled to that information and if so, to rule that the Minister should provide it to me.

gwarcheidwad ein Rheolau Sefydlog, Lywydd, gofynnaf ichi ddyfarnu a oes gennyf hawl i gael y wybodaeth honno ac, os felly, i ddyfarnu y dylai'r Gweinidog ei darparu i mi.

Dafydd Wigley: Further to that point of order, reference was made today, as previously, to the roles of the Auditor General, the NAO and the Audit Committee in these matters. I have discussed these issues with the NAO. In the process of its investigation, it comes across pieces of information, which may be relevant to its inquiry but which it cannot publish. It may deem that publication is inappropriate or that the information is not directly material to its report, although it may be relevant to matters of policy. The Assembly should not regard the audit function as the primary means of delivering information for policy determination. That must come from the Assembly sponsored public body or from the Minister concerned. The Audit Committee must take care to safeguard the sources of its information, which are necessary for it to undertake its audit investigation reports; we are responsible for handling those. Often, matters come before us and we must draw a line between audit investigation and policy. That line should not be fudged and, to safeguard against that, those in charge of policy must be answerable for the policy aspects, in the same way as we must handle the audit aspects.

Dafydd Wigley: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, cyfeiriwyd heddiw, fel o'r blaen, at rolau'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol, y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol a'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn y materion hyn. Yr wyf wedi trafod y materion hyn gyda'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol. Yn ystod ei hymchwil, daw ar draws darnau o wybodaeth, a all fod yn berthnasol i'w hymchwiliad ond na all eu cyhoeddi. Gall farnu nad yw'n briodol cyhoeddi'r wybodaeth neu nad yw'n uniongyrchol berthnasol i'w hadroddiad, er y gallai fod yn berthnasol i faterion polisi. Ni ddylai'r Cynulliad ystyried y swyddogaeth archwilio'n brif fodd i ddarparu gwybodaeth ar gyfer penderfynu polisi. Rhaid i honno ddod oddi wrth y corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad neu oddi wrth y Gweinidog dan sylw. Rhaid i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ofalu diogelu ffynonellau ei wybodaeth, y mae'n rhaid iddo wrthynt er mwyn ymgymryd â'i adroddiadau ymchwil archwilio; ni sy'n gyfrifol am drafod y rheini. Yn aml, daw materion ger ein bron a rhaid inni dynnu llinell rhwng ymchwil archwilio a pholisi. Ni ddylid ystumio'r llinell honno ac, er mwyn gwarchod rhag hynny, rhaid i'r rhai sy'n gyfrifol am bolisi fod yn atebol am yr agweddau polisi, yn yr un modd ag y mae'n rhaid i ni drafod yr agweddau archwilio.

Nick Bourne: Further to that point of order—and bearing in mind the First Minister's response to Richard Edwards's question on enhancing transparency in the Assembly—it is high time that the Minister made a statement on the financial accountability and governance of ELWa. So many issues have been raised, week after week, session after session, and each time, the Minister has sought to hide behind either the Audit Committee or ELWa.

Nick Bourne: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw—a chan gofio ymateb y Prif Weinidog i gwestiwn Richard Edwards am hyrwyddo tryloywder yn y Cynulliad—mae'n hen bryd i'r Gweinidog wneud datganiad am atebolrwydd ariannol a llywodraethu ELWa. Codwyd cynifer o faterion, wythnos ar ôl wythnos, mewn sesiwn ar ôl sesiwn, a bob tro mae'r Gweinidog wedi ceisio cuddio y tu ôl i un ai'r Pwyllgor Archwilio neu ELWa.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful for Members' comments, and concur with Dafydd Wigley on the function of the Audit Committee. Indeed, that is confirmed clearly in Standing Order No. 12.4, for example, which states that the Audit Committee

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am sylwadau Aelodau, ac yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â Dafydd Wigley ar swyddogaeth y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Yn wir, cadarnheir hynny'n bendant yn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.4, er enghraifft, sy'n datgan

‘shall not question the merits of the policy objectives of the Assembly’.

‘ni fydd y Pwyllgor yn amau rhagoriaethau amcanion polisi’r Cynulliad’.

Therefore, the distinction between policy and audit, as we understand those words, is clear in our practices.

Gan hynny, mae’r gwahaniaeth rhwng polisi ac archwilio, fel yr ydym ni’n deall y geiriau hynny, yn eglur yn ein harferion.

Turning to the substantive point raised by the leader of the opposition and supported by the leader of the Welsh Conservatives, section 70 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 was quoted, which has the heading ‘openness’, and our Standing Orders rely on that Act for provision on openness. Standing Orders clearly indicate the presumption in favour of Members having access to documents within the Assembly’s control. Standing Order No. 17.5 provides a list of five exemptions from that duty to disclose.

Gan droi at y pwynt pwysig a godwyd gan arweinydd yr wrthblaid ac a ategwyd gan arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, dyfynnwyd o adran 70 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, sydd ag ‘openness’ yn bennawd iddi, ac mae ein Rheolau Sefydlog yn dibynnu ar y Ddeddf honno am eu darpariaeth ar gyfer gweithredu agored. Mae’r Rheolau Sefydlog yn nodi’n eglur y rhagdybiaeth o blaid hawl Aelodau i weld dogfennau sydd o dan reolaeth y Cynulliad. Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.5 yn rhoi rhestr o bump eithriad oddi wrth y ddyletswydd honno i ddatgelu.

Should the leader of the opposition wish to pursue this matter and inspect a particular document, the onus is on whoever possesses the document—in this case, the Minister—to allow him to inspect it or, if not, to identify clearly and explicitly the exemption that applies under Standing Order No. 17.5.

Os yw arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn dymuno dilyn y mater hwn ac archwilio dogfen benodol, cyfrifoldeb pwy bynnag y mae’r ddogfen yn ei feddiant—y Gweinidog, yn yr achos hwn—yw caniatáu iddo ef ei harchwilio neu, os na wnaiff, nodi’n eglur ac yn bendant yr eithriad sy’n berthnasol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17.5.

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

Y Llywydd: O dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 22.25, 23.10 a 23.11, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order Nos 22.25, 23.10 and 23.11, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhifau 22.25, 23.10 a 23.11:

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order Nos. 22.25, 23.10 & 23.11:

1. yn cymeradwyo:

1. approves:

a) y fersiwn ddrafft o Orchymyn y Cyngor Ymchwil Afalau a Gellyg (Diddymu), y gosodwyd copi ohoni yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Mawrth 2003; a’r

a) the draft Apple and Pear Research Council (Dissolution) Order 2003, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 17 March 2003; and

b) memorandwm esboniadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau drwy’r e-bost ar 18 Mawrth 2003;

b) the explanatory memorandum laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 18 March 2003.

2. yn cymeradwyo:

a) y fersiwn ddrafft o Orchymyn y Cyngor Datblygu Garddwriaeth (Diwygio), y gosodwyd copi ohoni yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Mawrth 2003; a'r

b) memorandwm esboniadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau drwy'r e-bost ar 18 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1424)

2. approves:

a) the draft Horticultural Development Council (Amendment) Order 2003, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 17 March 2003; and

b) the explanatory memorandum laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 18 March 2003. (NDM1424)

Cynnig (NDM1424): O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1424): For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25:

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25:

1.a. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau Ychwanegion Bwyd Amrywiol (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003;

1.a. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Miscellaneous Food Additives (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003;

b. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Ychwanegion Bwyd Amrywiol (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003;

b. approves the Miscellaneous Food Additives (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003;

2.a. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Gorchymyn Addysg (Ciniawau Ysgol Rhad ac am Ddim) (Credydau Treth Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2003;

2.a. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Education (Free School Lunches) (Prescribed Tax Credits) (Wales) Order 2003;

b. yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Addysg (Ciniawau Ysgol Rhad ac am Ddim) (Credydau Treth Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003;

b. approves the Education (Free School Lunches) (Prescribed Tax Credits) (Wales) Order 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003;

3.a. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Addysg (Ciniawau Ysgol) (Gofyniad Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2003;

3.a. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Education (School Lunches) (Prescribed Requirement) (Wales) Order 2003;

b. yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Addysg (Ciniawau Ysgol) (Gofyniad Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003;

b. approves the Education (School Lunches) (Prescribed Requirement) (Wales) Order 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003;

4.a. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno

4.a. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office on 18

ar 18 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau Addysg (Peidio â Chodi Tâl sy'n Ymwneud â Theithiau Preswyl) (Cymru) 2003;

March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Education (Remission of Charges Relating to Residential Trips) (Wales) Regulations 2003;

b. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Peidio â Chodi Tâl sy'n Ymwneud â Theithiau Preswyl) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003;

b. approves the Education (Remission of Charges Relating to Residential Trips) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003;

5.a. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau Addysg (Datganiadau Alldro) (Cymru) 2003;

5.a. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Education (Outturn Statements)(Wales) Regulations 2003;

b. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Datganiadau Alldro) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1422)

b. approves the Education (Outturn Statements)(Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003. (NDM1422)

Cynnig (NDM1422): O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1422): For 39, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny

Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

3.00 p.m.

Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio
Annual Report of the Audit Committee

Dafydd Wigley: Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi'r Adroddiad gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio o'r enw 'Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio: Medi 2001—Medi 2002 ac Adroddiad Ychwanegol ar y Gweithgarwch hyd at ddiwedd Mawrth 2003', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2003. (NNDM1421)

Mae'n bleser cyflwyno, am y tro olaf, adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Dyma drydydd adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor. Adroddiad ar gyfer 2001-02 ydyw, ond mae'n cyfeirio hefyd at waith y Pwyllgor hyd at ddiwedd y Cynulliad hwn—hynny yw, gwaith sy'n mynd ymlaen ar hyn o bryd ac a gwblheir yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf.

Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, cyfrifoldeb y Pwyllgor yw sicrhau y caiff adnoddau cyllidol y Cynulliad eu gwario'n effeithiol a bod y Cynulliad a'r cyrff sy'n atebol iddo yn cynnal safonau uchel o reolaeth gyllidol ar bob achlysur. Fel y nodwyd yn ystod y pwyntiau o drefn, nid yw adolygu polisïau'r Llywodraeth yn rhan o waith y Pwyllgor. Mater i Bwyllgorau Pwnc yw hynny, nid i ni.

Diolchaf i staff clercyddol y Pwyllgor. Diolchaf hefyd i'm cyd-aelodau am eu gwaith dyfal yn ystod y cyfnod, ac am weithredu ar draws ffiniau pleidiol wrth lunio argymhellion. Gwaith y Pwyllgor yw sefydlu'r ffeithiau drwy groesholi tystion ar sail adroddiadau gan y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol, y cytunwyd ar eu cywirdeb ffeithiol ymlaen llaw. Felly, nid trafod ffeithiau a wna'r Pwyllgor ond, yn hytrach,

Dafydd Wigley: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales notes the report of the Audit Committee entitled 'Annual Report of the Audit Committee September 2001—September 2002 and Additional Report on Activity to End March 2003' which was laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2003. (NNDM1421)

It is a pleasure to present, for the last time, the annual report of the Audit Committee. This is the Committee's third annual report. The report covers the 2001-02 period, but it also refers to the Committee's work up until the end of this Assembly—that is, work that is currently ongoing and which will be completed during the coming weeks.

As Members know, it is the Committee's responsibility to ensure that the Assembly's financial resources are spent effectively and that the Assembly and the bodies accountable to it maintain high standards of fiscal control at all times. As was noted during the points of order, reviewing Government policy is not part of the Committee's job. That is a matter for Subject Committees, not for us.

I thank the Committee's secretariat. I also thank my fellow members for their diligent work during the period, and for working across party lines in drawing up recommendations. It is the Committee's job to establish the facts by cross-examining witnesses on the basis of National Audit Office reports, the factual accuracy of which has already been agreed upon. Therefore, the Committee does not discuss facts but, rather,

ddehongli o'r ffeithiau pa wersi sydd i'w dysgu. O groesholi tystion, gallwn lunio argymhellion ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cymru.

interprets from the facts what lessons are to be learnt. By cross-examining witnesses, we can draw up recommendations for the Government of Wales.

Mae ein gwaith yn llwyr ddibynnol ar waith trwyadl a chynhwysfawr staff y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol. Datganaf fy ngwerthfawrogiad o waith Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, Syr John Bourn, a'i staff. Dyna a'n galluogodd i wneud ein gwaith yn effeithiol. I'r graddau y daeth llwyddiant drwy waith y Pwyllgor, mae'r diolch yn sicr i staff y swyddfa archwilio.

Our work is entirely dependent upon the thorough and comprehensive work of NAO staff. I express my appreciation of the work of the Auditor General for Wales, Sir John Bourn, and his staff. That is what enabled us to carry out our work effectively. To the extent that success has been achieved through the Committee's work, the thanks is certainly due to NAO staff.

Diolchaf hefyd i'r tystion niferus sydd wedi ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor ac wedi ateb ein hymholiadau. Mae pob tyst y gofynasom iddo ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor wedi cytuno i wneud hynny. Bu sôn yn y gorffennol y dylem gael y pŵer i roi gwŷs i dystion ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor, ond ni fu angen hynny oherwydd bu i'r tystion ymddangos o'u gwirfodd, a gorau oll hynny.

I also thank the numerous witnesses who have appeared before the Committee and responded to our questioning. All witnesses whom we have invited to appear before the Committee have agreed to do so. There has been talk in the past of giving us the power to summon witnesses to appear before the Committee, but that has not been necessary because the witnesses have come before the Committee of their own volition, and that is for the best.

Diolchaf hefyd i'r Llywodraeth am ymateb yn gadarnhaol, gan fwyaf, i argymhellion y Pwyllgor. Mae hynny'n rhan hollbwysig o'r broses. Ein bwriad yw bod ein hargymhellion yn arwain at adolygiad gan y Llywodraeth o'r materion a godwyd—weithiau mae ganddi resymau da dros beidio â derbyn yr holl argymhellion, ond yn gyffredinol mae'n gweithredu arnynt—a, chyda lwc, bydd hynny'n arwain at arbedion ariannol, neu well llywodraeth, neu'r ddau.

I also thank the Government for responding positively, in the main, to the Committee's recommendations. That is a crucial part of the process. Our aim is that our recommendations lead to a review by the Government of the issues raised—sometimes it has good reasons for not accepting all the recommendations, but it generally acts on them—and, with luck, that will lead to financial savings, or better government, or both.

When Sir John Bourn first presented his various budget models to the Committee, and we confirmed that he could have the optimum budget that he sought, he committed to giving the Assembly a seven-fold return on our spending on the audit function. That was quite a commitment, and some Committee members remarked at the time that they looked forward to that commitment being realised. In his estimate of income and expenses for the coming year, until 31 March 2004, Sir John states that, since 1999, he and his team have identified £40 million of potential savings to the public purse. That is a significant sum. There is clearly an audit function to ensure that these

Pan gyflwynodd Syr John Bourn ei wahanol fodelau cyllideb i'r Pwyllgor am y tro cyntaf, a ninnau'n cadarnhau y câi'r gyllideb fwyaf ffafriol a geisiai, ymrwymodd i sicrhau enillion a fyddai'n saith gwaith gymaint â'n gwariant ar y swyddogaeth archwilio. Yr oedd hwnnw'n eithaf ymrwymiad, a dywedodd rhai aelodau o'r Pwyllgor ar y pryd eu bod yn edrych ymlaen at weld cyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Yn ei amcangyfrif o incwm a threuliau ar gyfer y flwyddyn i ddod, hyd 31 Mawrth 2004, dywed Syr John ei fod ef a'i dîm, ers 1999, wedi canfod £40 miliwn o arbedion dichonol i bwrs y wlad. Mae hwnnw'n swm sylweddol. Mae'n amlwg mai un o

potential savings are realised, and that is part of our duty.

swyddogaethau archwilio yw sicrhau'r arbedion dichonol hynny, ac mae hynny'n rhan o'n dyletswydd.

A good example of our follow-up work comes before the Audit Committee at its meeting this week. In December 2000, the Committee considered the Auditor General's report, 'Maximising Income from Prescription Charges', which estimated that £15 million a year was being lost. The Committee made recommendations on this, which the Government accepted. By October 2002, Jane Hutt was in a position to announce that the NHS had succeeded in reducing losses from £15 million to £8 million. The methodology used to establish those savings was agreed with the NAO and the actions taken built directly on recommendations made by the Audit Committee. I take advantage of this opportunity to pay tribute to my predecessor in the Chair, Janet Davies, for the work that she undertook at that time, which we all appreciated and on which the Committee builds.

Daw un enghraifft dda o'n gwaith dilynol gerbron y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn ei gyfarfod yr wythnos hon. Yn Rhagfyr 2000, gwnaeth y Pwyllgor ystyried adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, 'Mwyhau'r Incwm Mwyaf oddi wrth Daliadau Presgripsiynau', a amcangyfrifai fod £15 miliwn y flwyddyn yn cael ei golli. Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor argymhellion ar hyn, a dderbyniwyd gan y Llywodraeth. Erbyn Hydref 2002, yr oedd Jane Hutt mewn sefyllfa i allu cyhoeddi bod y GIG wedi llwyddo i leihau'r colledion o £15 miliwn i £8 miliwn. Cytunwyd ar y fethodoleg a ddefnyddiwyd i gadarnhau'r arbedion hynny gyda'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol ac yr oedd y camau a gymerwyd wedi'u seilio'n uniongyrchol ar argymhellion gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i dalu teyrnged i'm rhagflaenydd yn y Gadair, Janet Davies, am y gwaith a wnaeth bryd hynny, yr oeddem oll yn ei werthfawrogi ac sy'n sylfaen i waith y Pwyllgor.

Another good example of savings achieved was with regard to procurement in the further education sector. Our report indicated significant potential savings on a budget of around £79 million. A progress report on this has indicated an encouraging start where a million or two may have already been saved. However, a comprehensive update on savings achieved will be published next month. That, again, indicates the importance of follow-up and the comprehensive way in which the NAO goes about its responsibilities.

Enghraifft dda arall o'r arbedion a sicrhawyd yw un sy'n gysylltiedig â chaffael yn y sector addysg bellach. Nododd ein hadroddiad arbedion sylweddol y gellid eu sicrhau ar gyllideb o tua £79 miliwn. Mae adroddiad gwaith am hyn yn dangos dechrau calonogol a'r posibilrwydd bod miliwn neu ddwy wedi'u harbed eisoes. Fodd bynnag, cyhoeddir gwybodaeth gynhwysfawr am yr arbedion a sicrhawyd y mis nesaf. Unwaith eto, mae hynny'n dangos mor bwysig yw gwaith dilynol a dull cynhwysfawr y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol o fynd ynghylch ei chyfrifoldebau.

Another important area of the Committee's work relates to the Assembly's ability to manage risk, for example, when entering into contracts with the private sector or when restructuring certain public sector organisations. That is important because there is significant potential for things to go wrong if risk is not properly assessed or if the danger of risk is not properly managed. I have no doubt that we will return to these questions and to the extent to which the Assembly Government succeeds in managing

Un o'r meysydd pwysig eraill yng ngwaith y Pwyllgor yw'r un sy'n ymwneud â gallu'r Cynulliad i reoli risg, er enghraifft, wrth wneud contractau gyda'r sector preifat neu wrth ailstrwythuro rhai cyrff yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae hynny'n bwysig gan fod cryn botensial i bethau fynd o chwith os na chaiff risg ei asesu'n briodol neu os na reolir y perygl o risg yn briodol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn dychwelyd at y cwestiynau hyn ac yn ystyried i ba raddau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn llwyddo i reoli risg.

risk.

I also mention how the Auditor General has followed up on subjects raised with the Committee by the public—Talgarth hospital is a good example. After our hearing on the hospital, I was gratified to receive a letter from a member of the public stating that it had restored his faith in the Assembly's relevance. That underlines the importance of our work. The Talgarth issue is ongoing, from which lessons have been learnt.

Cyfeiriaf hefyd at y modd y mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol wedi dilyn materion a godwyd gyda'r Pwyllgor gan y cyhoedd—mae ysbyty Talgarth yn enghraifft dda o hynny. Ar ôl ein gwrandawiad ynghylch yr ysbyty, yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael llythyr oddi wrth aelod o'r cyhoedd yn datgan bod hwnnw wedi adfer ei ffydd ym mherthnasedd y Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n tynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd ein gwaith. Mae mater Talgarth yn parhau, a dysgwyd gwersi oddi wrth hynny.

Before closing, I refer to the comprehensive nature of the report before us. I have heard members of the Public Accounts Committee in the House of Commons suggest that this model could be developed further there. I am glad that we are making progress in that direction. In looking forward, the question of legislation is actively under consideration, in order to have a unified audit function in Wales. I recently visited Scotland and saw how its audit function undertakes its work in a unified manner. There is no doubt that benefits will arise from that. Before the election on 1 May, I hope that we will have an opportunity to see a draft Bill and that Audit Committee members' comments will be taken on board before the final Bill goes through the House of Commons and the House of Lords.

Cyn cloi, cyfeiriaf at natur gynhwysfawr yr adroddiad sydd ger ein bron. Yr wyf wedi clywed aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yn awgrymu y gellid datblygu'r model hwn yn y fan honno. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw. Wrth edrych ymlaen, mae'r cwestiwn o ddeddfwriaeth yn cael ei ystyried yn weithredol, er mwyn cael swyddogaeth archwilio unedig yng Nghymru. Ymwelais â'r Alban yn ddiweddar a gweld sut y mae ei swyddogaeth archwilio'n ymgymryd â'r gwaith mewn modd unedig. Nid oes dwywaith na cheir manteision o hynny. Cyn yr etholiad ar 1 Mai, gobeithiaf y cawn gyfle i weld Mesur drafft ac y caiff sylwadau aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Archwilio eu hystyried cyn i'r Mesur terfynol fynd drwy Tŷ'r Cyffredin a Thŷ'r Arglwyddi.

I wish those who take over responsibility in the Audit Committee well. I am sure that the investigations that we have started will need to be taken on in a thorough and conscientious manner. The work that has been undertaken by the Audit Committee is relevant to the Assembly and to other public bodies in Wales. By tightening the regime and ensuring that the fundamentals are right, we will not only build confidence in those bodies, but also in the Assembly and in the effectiveness of democracy in Wales.

Dymunaf yn dda i'r rhai a fydd yn ymgymryd â chyfrifoldeb o'r newydd yn y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn rhaid ymgymryd mewn modd trwyadl a chydwybodol â'r ymchwiliadau yr ydym ni wedi'u cychwyn. Mae'r gwaith a wnaed gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn berthnasol i'r Cynulliad ac i gyrff cyhoeddus eraill yng Nghymru. Drwy dynhau'r gyfundrefn a sicrhau bod yr hanfodion yn iawn, byddwn yn ennyn hyder yn y cyrff hynny, a hefyd yn y Cynulliad ac yn effeithiolrwydd democratiaeth yng Nghymru.

3.10 p.m.

Alison Halford: The Audit Committee has done a sterling job in its first Assembly term. As a key scrutineer, it has tried to ensure that civil servants do their jobs and that public

Alison Halford: Mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio wedi gwneud gwaith rhagorol yn ei dymor Cynulliad cyntaf. Fel archwilydd allweddol, mae wedi ceisio sicrhau bod gweision sifil yn

money is not abused. As a member since the beginning, I cannot recall a time when it has failed to tackle thorny issues. Admittedly we have caused a few sleepless nights for our witnesses, including our most regular and cherished visitor, Sir Jon Shortridge. That is exactly how it should be.

gwneud eu gwaith ac na chaiff arian cyhoeddus ei gamddefnyddio. A minnau'n aelod ers y dechrau, ni allaf gofio adeg pan fethodd â mynd i'r afael â materion dyrys. Rhaid cyfaddef ein bod wedi peri ambell noson ddi-gwsg i'n tystion, gan gynnwys ein hymwelydd mwyaf rheolaidd ac annwyl, Syr Jon Shortridge. Felly'n union y dylai fod.

As I depart for pastures new, I have some points to make. Sir Jon Shortridge comes before the Committee for almost all audit reports, as he is the Assembly's only accounting officer. To an outsider, he may appear—and he is—a professional witness, grown familiar with the Committee's ways. That is no criticism of Sir Jon. If the Assembly is a beacon of open government, why does it only have one accounting officer when Whitehall has long appointed one for each Government department? We could easily justify seven or eight accounting officers, in line with the Westminster model, thus ensuring that each department delivers value for money.

A minnau ar fin newid porfa, mae gennyf rai pwyntiau i'w gwneud. Daw Syr Jon Shortridge gerbron y Pwyllgor ar gyfer bron pob un o'r adroddiadau archwilio, gan mai ef yw unig swyddog cyfrifo'r Cynulliad. Yng ngolwg un o'r tu allan, gallai ymddangos yn dyst proffesiynol—a dyna ydyw—sydd wedi ymgynefino â dulliau'r Pwyllgor. Nid beirniadaeth ar Syr Jon yw honno. Os mai patrwm o lywodraeth agored yw'r Cynulliad, pam mai un swyddog cyfrifo'n unig sydd ganddo tra bo Whitehall yn penodi un ar gyfer pob adran Llywodraeth ers amser maith? Byddai'n hawdd inni gyfiawnhau saith neu wyth swyddog cyfrifo, yn unol â model San Steffan, gan sicrhau bod pob adran yn rhoi gwerth am arian.

The turning point in the role of the Committee was the decision to demand explanation from former office holders of the Centre for Visual Arts. The CVA has cost the taxpayer nearly £9.4 million and has given virtually no value for that money, closing 14 months after it opened, with mounting debt. The Committee will remember the £85,000 spent on a wondrous desk, and what happened to the £20,000 for office equipment? That question, among others, has never been answered. Pressure was apparently applied behind the scenes not to call former officials, but the Committee persisted. We felt that it was wrong to question a new chief executive, who was appointed only six weeks earlier, about a decade-old event. Although he did well, we wanted to question the officials who were in charge at the time. We persevered and, as the Auditor General's report painted a sorry picture of inexperience and naivety, it was important to allow the former officials to give an account of what went wrong. We are now in a much better position to prevent further mistakes. The opportunity to offer explanations on how public money disappeared is a vital offshoot of devolution.

Y trobwynt yn rôl y Pwyllgor oedd y penderfyniad i fynnu eglurhad gan gyn ddeiliaid swyddi'r Ganolfan Celfyddydau Gweledol. Mae'r ganolfan wedi costio ymron i £9.4 miliwn i'r trethdalwr gan roi bron ddim gwerth am yr arian hwnnw, a chau 14 mis ar ôl ei hagor, gyda dyled gynyddol. Bydd y Pwyllgor yn cofio am y £85,000 a wariwyd ar ddesg ryfeddol, a beth a ddigwyddodd i'r £20,000 ar gyfer offer swyddfa? Ni chafwyd ateb fyth i'r cwestiwn hwnnw, ymysg eraill. Mae'n ymddangos bod pwysau wedi'u rhoi y tu ôl i'r llenni i beidio â galw cyn-swyddogion, ond dyfalbarhaodd y Pwyllgor. Teimlem nad oedd yn iawn holi prif weithredwr newydd, nas penodwyd ond chwe wythnos ynghynt, am rywbeth a ddigwyddodd ddegawd yn ôl. Er iddo wneud yn dda, yr oeddem am holi'r swyddogion a oedd mewn gofal ar y pryd. Gwnaethom ddyfalbarhau a, gan fod adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol wedi tynnu darlun trist o ddiffyg profiad a naïfrwydd, yr oedd yn bwysig gadael i'r cyn-swyddogion ddisgrifio'r hyn a aeth o'i le. Yr ydym bellach mewn sefyllfa well o lawer i allu atal camgymeriadau pellach. Y cyfle i gynnig esboniadau am y modd y diflannodd arian

Hopefully, the Auditor General will consider agreeing his reports with those who made the decisions at the time, and not rely solely on current officials.

cyhoeddus yw un o ffrwythau hollbwysig datganoli. Gobeithio y gwnaiff yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol ystyried cytuno ar ei adroddiadau gyda'r rhai a wnaeth y penderfyniadau ar y pryd, a pheidio â dibynnu ar swyddogion cyfredol yn unig.

Commercial confidentiality will be a key battleground for the post-election Audit Committee. Assembly Ministers and officials, sadly, continue to use that to block probing questions or to possibly prevent the release of politically awkward information. The Committee must refuse to accept such blanket excuses. Happily, when the Committee met such intransigence with regard to the profits of Siemens' OSIRIS—the company that provides our information technology—it did not give way and the profit figures were released, thus setting an important precedent.

Bydd cyfrinachedd masnachol yn faes brwydr allweddol i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ar ôl yr etholiad. Gwaetha'r modd, mae Gweinidogion a swyddogion y Cynulliad yn dal i ddefnyddio hynny i atal cwestiynau treiddgar neu i geisio atal rhyddhau gwybodaeth a allai fod yn wleidyddol anghyfleus. Rhaid i'r Pwyllgor wrthod esgusion hollgynhwysol o'r fath. Yn ffodus, pan ddaeth y Pwyllgor wyneb yn wyneb ag anhyblygrwydd o'r fath mewn cysylltiad ag elw OSIRIS Siemens—y cwmni sy'n darparu ein technoleg gwybodaeth—nid ildiodd a rhyddhawyd y ffigurau am yr elw, gan osod cynsail bwysig.

None of us can emulate Gwyneth Dunwoody, as we do not have as many levers of power to pull as Westminster. That is why I would like to see the Committee empowered to order the attendance of witnesses, including past and present officials and Ministers. As the Assembly progresses, more of its past decisions will come under scrutiny and more former officials should come before the Committee. The power to summon witnesses is vital in Westminster, and its mere existence means that it is rarely used. We do not have that luxury in the Assembly. Is it possible that sooner or later officials will refuse to co-operate, making the Committee a toothless watchdog? That almost happened when the chair of the Harbour Authority, the colourful Russell Goodway, originally refused access to his files not only to the accounting officer, but also to the Auditor General. The cheek of it took the Committee's breath away, and it took eight months and the threat of legal action by the Audit Committee, to get some access to the Harbour Authority's financial records.

Ni all yr un ohonom efelychu Gwyneth Dunwoody, gan nad oes gennym gymaint o ddylanwad ag sydd gan San Steffan. Dyna pam y carwn weld y Pwyllgor yn cael pŵer i orchymyn tystion, gan gynnwys swyddogion a Gweinidogion presennol a blaenorol, i fod yn bresennol. Wrth i'r Cynulliad fynd yn ei flaen, creffir ar fwy o'i benderfyniadau yn y gorffennol a dylai rhagor o gyn-swyddogion ddod gerbron y Pwyllgor. Mae'r pŵer i wysio tystion yn hollbwysig yn San Steffan, ac mae ei fodolaeth yn ddigon ac yn golygu mai'n anaml y'i defnyddir. Nid ydym yn meddu ar y moethusrwydd hwnnw yn y Cynulliad. A yw'n bosibl y bydd swyddogion, yn hwyr neu'n hwyrach, yn gwrthod cydweithredu, gan beri i'r Pwyllgor fod yn ddiddannedd? Bu bron i hynny ddigwydd pan wnaeth cadeirydd yr Awdurdod Porthladd, Russell Goodway liwgar, wrthod caniatáu yn wreiddiol i'r swyddog cyfrifo, ac i'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol hefyd, gael gweld ei ffeiliau. Yr oedd y digywilydd-dra hwnnw'n ddigon i fynd â gwynt y Pwyllgor, a chymerodd wyth mis a bygythiad o achos cyfreithiol gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio, i gael gweld rhai o gofnodion ariannol yr Awdurdod Porthladd.

The Committee hopes that ELWa does not become another CVA, and that the Auditor General's only interest in the burgeoning

Mae'r Pwyllgor yn gobeithio na fydd ELWa yr un fath â'r Ganolfan Celfyddydau Gweledol, ac mai unig ddiddordeb yr

Wales Millennium Centre will not be going to see a play. The Audit Committee must continue to be the watchdog of public funds in Wales. The Committee has learned not to accept the proffered comfortable course of action, but to probe deeply to ensure that profligate spending does not occur again. I hope that the successor committee will take that advice in the manner in which it is offered. If it does, the governance of Wales will be stronger and even more accountable.

Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn yr hyn a ddaw'n Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru fydd mynd i weld drama yno. Rhaid i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio barhau i fod yn geidwad cyllid cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi dysgu peidio â derbyn y cwrs gweithredu cyfforddus a gynigir, ac i dreiddio'n ddwfn er mwyn sicrhau na cheir gwario afradlon eto. Gobeithiaf y bydd y pwyllgor sy'n ei olynu'n derbyn y cyngor hwnnw yn yr ysbryd y'i cynigir. Os gwnaiff, bydd llywodraethu Cymru'n gryfach ac yn fwy atebol byth.

Janet Davies: I thank the NAO and civil servants for their work on behalf of the Committee. I also pay tribute to Dafydd Wigley as Chair of the Committee, with whom it was easy to work. I also thank the Committee Secretariat and witnesses who have come before us. I was pleased to see, in the agenda for Thursday's meeting, that the Permanent Secretary has made the point that witnesses must always be open—I cannot remember the exact wording—and come clean. I felt, on occasion, that one or two witnesses used long-winded answers to cut down the number of questions that we were able to ask.

Janet Davies: Diolchaf i'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol a'r gweision sifil am eu gwaith ar ran y Pwyllgor. Talaf deyrnged hefyd i Dafydd Wigley fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor, y bu'n hawdd cydweithio ag ef. Diolchaf hefyd i Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Pwyllgor a'r tystion a ddaeth ger ein bron. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld, yn yr agenda ar gyfer y cyfarfod ar ddydd Iau, fod yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol wedi nodi bod rhaid i dystion fod yn agored bob amser—ni allaf gofio'r union eiriau—a dweud y cwbl. Teimlwn, ar adegau, fod un neu ddau o dystion yn defnyddio atebion hirwyntog i gwtogi ar nifer y cwestiynau y gallem eu gofyn.

It is important to realise that the Audit Committee is not only about financial probity—although that is an important aspect—it is also about achieving best value. Since its inception, the Audit Committee has tried to work with Assembly sponsored public bodies and with the Government to try to improve administration methods and ways of working rather than causing conflict and being destructive. There were a few occasions when we were concerned about what had happened and Alison Halford referred to one of them. I remember, specifically, the issue concerning the National Museum and Galleries of Wales in 1999 and what happened to the desk at the Centre for Visual Arts. At times, I felt that I was nit-picking by continually asking what happened to that desk, but I got an answer of sorts in the end.

Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli nad uniondeb ariannol yw unig faes y Pwyllgor Archwilio—er ei fod yn agwedd bwysig—a'i fod yn ymwneud hefyd â sicrhau'r gwerth gorau. Ers ei sefydlu, mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio wedi ceisio gweithio gyda chyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a chyda'r Llywodraeth i geisio gwella dulliau gweinyddu a dulliau o weithio yn hytrach na pheri gwrthdaro a bod yn ddinistriol. Bu rhai adegau pan oeddem yn bryderus am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd a chyfeiriodd Alison Halford at un ohonynt. Cofiaf, yn benodol, y mater a oedd yn ymwneud ag Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru yn 1999 a'r hyn a ddigwyddodd i'r ddesg yn y Ganolfan Celfyddydau Gweledol. Ar adegau, teimlwn fy mod yn pigo beiau drwy ofyn o hyd am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd i'r ddesg honno, ond cefais ateb o ryw fath yn y diwedd.

Many concerns have also been expressed to me about how the Committee operates and that we interview accounting officers. There

Mynegwyd llawer o bryderon imi hefyd am y modd y mae'r Pwyllgor yn gweithredu a'r ffaith ein bod yn cyfweld swyddogion

have been moments when I have felt uncomfortable that we are restricted to questioning accounting officers, although, most of the time, I feel that it works well. We must think around this issue and recognise when accountability lies with the accounting officers. However, if the Committee felt, for example, that the chair of an Assembly sponsored public body was not acting as well as he might, it should be made clear to the public who would take action in that situation.

cyfrifo. Ambell dro teimlwn yn anfodlon ein bod yn cael ein cyfyngu i holi swyddogion cyfrifo, er fy mod yn teimlo bod hynny'n gweithio'n dda y rhan fwyaf o'r amser. Rhaid inni fyfyrio ynghylch y mater hwn a chanfod ym mha achosion y mae'r swyddogion cyfrifo'n atebol. Fodd bynnag, os teimlai'r Pwyllgor, er enghraifft, nad oedd cadeirydd corff cyhoeddus sy'n cael ei noddi gan y Cynulliad yn gweithredu cystal ag y gallai, dylid rhoi ar ddeall i'r cyhoedd pwy a gymerai gamau mewn sefyllfa o'r fath.

The national health service has been at the sharp end of our inquiries. There have been more hearings on the health service than on any other subject—which is understandable, as it is the largest area of the Committee's jurisdiction. We have been concerned with such issues as prescription charges, the estate—its management and disposal—its summarised accounts each year, and clinical negligence. Over the years I have been perturbed to hear, so often, that certain issues were not major priorities and that other issues were low priorities. The Audit Committee pointing out that it should prioritise some issues has probably helped the NHS. Our last meeting will be this Thursday and the NHS's director is again appearing, so we are taking it to the wire with the NHS. We will be looking into how prescriptions and drugs are sorted out and the reorganisation of the health service. This hearing will be extremely complex and I am sure that we will have many questions to ask the director.

Y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a gafodd y sylw pennaf yn ein hymchwiliadau. Bu mwy o wrandawiadau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd nag ar unrhyw bwnc arall—ac mae hynny'n ddealladwy, gan mai hwnnw yw'r maes mwyaf sydd dan awdurdodaeth y Pwyllgor. Buom yn ymwneud â materion fel taliadau presgripsiwn, yr ystâd—o ran ei rheoli a'i gwaredu—ei chyfrifon cryno bob blwyddyn, ac esgeulustod clinigol. Dros y blynyddoedd cefais fy anesmwytho o glywed, mor aml, fod rhai materion nad oeddent yn uchel o ran eu blaenoriaeth a bod blaenoriaeth isel i faterion eraill. Mae'r ffaith bod y Pwyllgor Archwilio wedi dweud y dylai roi blaenoriaeth i rai materion wedi helpu'r GIG yn ôl pob tebyg. Bydd ein cyfarfod olaf y dydd Iau yma a bydd cyfarwyddwr y GIG yn ymddangos eto, felly yr ydym yn ei dilyn i'r pen gyda'r GIG. Byddwn yn ystyried y dull o drefnu presgripsiynau a chyffuriau ac ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Bydd y gwrandawiad hwn yn gymhleth tu hwnt ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd gennym lawer o gwestiynau i'w gofyn i'r cyfarwyddwr.

Being a member of the Audit Committee has been an enjoyable experience. Some say that it must be a boring Committee, but I have never found it boring, or at least hardly ever—I had better qualify it a little. It has been a useful and interesting way of getting a broad view of the range of the Assembly's functions.

Profiad pleserus oedd bod yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. Dywed rhai ei fod yn sicr o fod yn Bwyllgor diflas, ond ni chefais i ef yn ddiflas erioed, neu bron byth o leiaf—byddai'n well imi amodi hynny ychydig. Bu'n fodd buddiol a diddorol i gael golwg eang ar yr amrediad o swyddogaethau sydd gan y Cynulliad.

Eleanor Burnham: I also welcome the third annual report and praise all the people involved: Sir John Bourn; our revered Chair; the National Audit Office, and the secretariat. It has been a privilege for me to be involved with the Committee for nearly 18 months. The Audit Committee is essential in ensuring

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu'r trydydd adroddiad blynyddol ac yn canmol pawb a fu'n gysylltiedig: Syr John Bourn; ein Cadeirydd hybarch; y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol, a'r ysgrifenyddiaeth. Bu'n fraint imi fod yn gysylltiedig â'r Pwyllgor am ymron i 18 mis.

that the people of Wales get value for money from the Assembly and other public bodies. It is vital that the Assembly and the other public bodies not only operate, but are also seen to operate. I agree with Alison that, to have more teeth, we should question the actual and relevant officials as opposed to making retrospective inquiries. However, I am sure that somebody with more authority than me can tell me if that is possible. The Committee acknowledged that NHS Wales is making good progress in addressing poor financial performance while recognising that much remains to be done. It is a crucial issue, as strong financial management of the NHS—and any other body in Wales—is vital to optimising the significant extra resources currently being invested. I am pleased that the recommended NHS director's recovery plan, for North East Wales NHS Trust for instance, is being progressed as a matter of urgency. In terms of the re-organisation of NHS Wales, I welcome the ongoing cost and risk analysis. The Committee's 2002 report on NHS finances stressed that the NHS re-organisation and the additional provision of funding from the budget provides an opportunity for a fresh start to ensure that financial management is rigorous and effective and that its resources are used to best effect.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio'n hollbwysig o ran sicrhau bod pobl Cymru'n cael gwerth am arian gan y Cynulliad a chyrff cyhoeddus eraill. Mae'n hollbwysig bod y Cynulliad a'r cyrff cyhoeddus eraill yn gweithredu, a hefyd eu bod yn cael eu gweld yn gweithredu. Cytunaf ag Alison mai'r hyn y dylem ei wneud, er mwyn bod yn fwy effeithiol, yw holi'r swyddogion priodol a pherthnasol yn hytrach na chynnal ymchwiliadau adolygol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd rhywun a chanddo fwy o awdurdod na mi'n gallu dweud wrthyf a oes modd gwneud hynny. Cydnabu'r Pwyllgor fod GIG Cymru yn gwneud cynnydd da o ran ymdrin â pherfformiad ariannol gwael er ei fod yn sylweddoli bod llawer i'w wneud o hyd. Mae'n fater hanfodol, gan fod rheoli ariannol cadarn ar y GIG—ac unrhyw gorff arall yng Nghymru—yn hollbwysig er mwyn gwneud y defnydd gorau posibl o'r adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol a fuddsoddir ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf yn falch bod y cynllun adfer a argymhellwyd gan gyfarwyddwr y GIG, ar gyfer Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru, er enghraifft, yn cael ei weithredu fel mater o frys. Yng nghyd-destun ad-drefnu GIG Cymru, croesawaf y dadansoddiad cost a risg sy'n mynd rhagddo. Yr oedd adroddiad y Pwyllgor yn 2002 ar gyllid y GIG yn pwysleisio bod ad-drefnu'r GIG a darparu cyllid ychwanegol o'r gyllideb yn cynnig cyfle i gael dechreuad newydd er mwyn sicrhau rheoli ariannol trwyadl ac effeithiol a'r defnydd mwyaf effeithiol posibl o'i adnoddau.

The report on OSIRIS caused me some concern. It is another extremely complex arena and a near can of worms on the lack of prior political judgment. I hope that we can learn from that experience and ensure that the lessons are seen in the specifications for the new MERLIN system, on which Professor Phil Williams has been so helpful in co-ordinating information. ELWa also concerns me. There are many lessons to be learned from what happened with that body. Its impact on the Welsh heartlands causes me extreme concern and headteachers constantly lobby me on that point.

Yr oedd yr adroddiad ar OSIRIS yn peri peth pryder i mi. Mae'n faes arall sy'n astrus dros ben ac a oedd bron â chodi helynt o ran diffyg doethineb gwleidyddol o flaen llaw. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ddysgu o'r profiad hwnnw a sicrhau bod y gwersi a ddysgwyd yn amlwg yn y manylebau ar gyfer y system MERLIN newydd, y bu'r Athro Phil Williams mor gymwynasgar wrth gyd-drefnu gwybodaeth arni. Mae ELWa yn peri pryder imi hefyd. Mae llawer o wersi i'w dysgu o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn achos y corff hwnnw. Mae ei effaith ar gadarnleoedd y Gymraeg yn peri pryder mawr iawn i mi ac mae penaethiaid ysgol yn fy lobïo'n gyson ar y pwynt hwnnw.

I also agree that chairs should be called

Yr wyf hefyd yn cytuno y dylai cadeiryddion

before the Committee, and I have raised this matter behind the scenes. It was explained to me that it is the accounting officer and the chief executives who are accountable, but I feel that the chair, in business terms, is ultimately accountable. However, I commend everybody else's comments that the Audit Committee must be the strongest possible form of scrutiny for best value and practice for the people of Wales. I am one of those sad people who sometimes tune in to Sky television to watch the equivalent scrutiny in the House of Commons. We all have much to learn from each other. The experience has been a privilege for me.

gael eu galw gerbron y Pwyllgor, ac yr wyf wedi codi'r mater hwn y tu ôl i'r llenni. Eglurwyd imi mai'r swyddog cyfrifo a'r prif weithredwyr sy'n atebol, ond teimlaf fi mai'r cadeirydd, yng nghyd-destun busnes, sy'n atebol yn y pen draw. Fodd bynnag, cymeradwyaf sylwadau pawb arall i'r perwyl y dylai'r Pwyllgor Archwilio gynnig y ffurf gryfaf posibl o graffu er mwyn sicrhau'r gwerth a'r arferion gorau i bobl Cymru. Yr wyf fi'n un o'r trueiniaid hynny sydd weithiau'n troi at deledu Sky i wylio'r archwilio cyfatebol yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Mae gan bob un ohonom lawer i'w ddysgu oddi wrth ein gilydd. Bu'r profiad yn fraint i mi.

3.20 p.m.

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): I have a brief response, which is simply to state that the Assembly Government supports the Committee's excellent work. Dafydd, as Committee Chair, has ensured that the high standards established by his predecessor have been continued and the Committee has established a reputation for rigorous and independent work. I welcome Dafydd's reiteration of the point that the Audit Committee deals with audit matters rather than policy, which is absolutely right. The potential savings to the public purse identified in the Auditor General's reports are of great use. The reports identify important issues and important lessons that must be learned for the future administration of Wales. I am sure that the Audit Committee's work will stand future Members in good stead. That aside, I need only welcome the Audit Committee's report on the Government's behalf and thank its members, who have undertaken a job that is at times testing and at times perhaps not as interesting as other Assembly work, but which has nevertheless been pursued with diligence by all its members.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Mae gennyf ymateb byr sef, yn syml, bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi gwaith rhagorol y Pwyllgor. Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor, mae Dafydd wedi sicrhau parhad y safonau uchel a sefydlwyd gan ei ragflaenydd ac mae'r Pwyllgor wedi ennill enw da am ei waith trwyadl ac annibynnol. Croesawaf yr ailddatganiad gan Dafydd o'r pwynt bod y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn delio â materion archwilio yn hytrach na pholisi, ac mae hynny'n gwbl briodol. Mae'r arbedion posibl i bwrs y wlad a nodir yn adroddiadau'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn ddefnyddiol dros ben. Mae'r adroddiadau'n nodi materion pwysig a gwersi pwysig y mae'n rhaid eu dysgu ar gyfer gweinyddu Cymru yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd gwaith y Pwyllgor Archwilio o fudd i Aelodau yn y dyfodol. Wedi dweud hynny, ni wnaf ond croesawu adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio ar ran y Llywodraeth a diolch i'w aelodau, a ymgymerodd â gwaith sydd weithiau'n ymestynnol ac ar adegau heb fod mor ddiddorol o bosibl â gwaith arall y Cynulliad, ond a gyflawnwyd yn gydwybodol, er hynny, gan ei holl aelodau.

Dafydd Wigley: Diolchaf i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl. Mae natur y ddadl yn adlewyrchu'r ffordd drawsbleidiol o weithredu sydd gan y Pwyllgor; felly y dylai pethau fod. Trafodwyd themâu y mae angen edrych arnynt yn y Cynulliad nesaf gan bwy bynnag fydd yn gyfrifol am y Pwyllgor Archwilio bryd hynny. Cododd Alison bwyntiau megis pwy yw'r tystion mwyaf priodol i ymddangos ger ein bron, ac a ddylai Gweinidog ymddangos ger ein bron. Yn gyffredinol, nid Gweinidogion sy'n ymddangos gerbron y fath bwyllgorau, ond nid yw'n hynny'n rheswm i beidio ag ystyried y mater. Hefyd, cododd y cwestiwn a oes angen y grym cyfreithiol arnom i fynnu bod tystion yn ymddangos, i sicrhau nad oes temtasiwn i wrthod. Efallai ei bod yn fanteisiol i gadw hynny yn y cefndir, heb ddisgwyl ei ddefnyddio, gan fod bygythiad, weithiau, yn fwy effeithiol na gweithred.

Dafydd Wigley: I thank everyone who has contributed to the debate. The nature of the debate reflects the Committee's cross-party approach; that is how it should be. We have discussed themes that will need to be considered by whoever will be responsible for the Audit Committee in the next Assembly. Alison raised points such as who are the most appropriate witnesses to appear before us and should Ministers appear before us. Generally, it is not Ministers who appear before such committees, but that is not to say that the matter should not be considered. Also, the question was raised of whether we need the legal power to summon witnesses, to ensure that there is no temptation to refuse. It might be advantageous to keep that in the background, without expecting to use it, because the threat is sometimes more effective than the action.

Codwyd pwyntiau hefyd ar gydbwysedd gwaith y Pwyllgor a sut yr ydym yn sicrhau bod gwerth am arian yn cael ei wireddu. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd angen gwaith sylweddol ychwanegol gan y Pwyllgor newydd ar ôl yr etholiad. Bydd y gwaith hwn, gobeithio, yn helpu i greu hygrededd yn y sefydliad hwn, fel y gellid ystyried y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fel arf sydd wedi agor gweithrediad llywodraeth yng Nghymru, a drwy hynny, wedi cael y fargen orau i bobl Cymru.

Points were also made on the balance of the Committee's work and how we ensure that value for money is achieved. I am certain that substantial additional work will be needed from the new Committee after the election. This work, hopefully, will help to create credibility for this institution, so that the National Assembly is seen as a tool that has opened up the actions of government in Wales, and has thereby obtained the best deal for the people of Wales.

Cynnig (NDM1421): O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1421): For 31, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth

Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.26 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Office took the Chair at 3.26 p.m.

'Adolygiad Polisi Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar Adfywio Cymunedol—Meithrin Gallu a Hyfforddiant'
'Local Government and Housing Policy Review on Community Regeneration—Capacity Development and Training'

Gwenda Thomas: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales notes the report of the Local Government and Housing Committee entitled 'Local Government and Housing Policy Review on Community Regeneration—Capacity Development and Training', which was e-mailed to Members on 11 March 2003. (NNDM1420)

Gwenda Thomas: Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi'r adroddiad gan y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai o'r enw 'Adolygiad Polisi Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar Adfywio Cymunedol—Meithrin Gallu a Hyfforddiant', a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 11 Mawrth 2003. (NNDM1420)

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno adroddiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, yn dilyn ei adolygiad polisi o adfywio cymunedol, meithrin gallu a hyfforddiant.

I am pleased to present the Local Government and Housing Committee's report, following its policy review of community regeneration, capacity development and training.

This is the second part of the Committee's review into community regeneration. The first report, which was completed in July 2002, examined the streamlining of existing programmes, improved delivery, finance, and partnership working. It proposed 18 recommendations, all of which, I am happy to say, the Minister accepted, and many of which have already been implemented. The Committee was also asked to identify the further issues that needed to be addressed to take the community regeneration process forward.

Dyma'r ail ran o adolygiad y Pwyllgor o adfywio cymunedol. Yn yr adroddiad cyntaf, a gwblhawyd yng Ngorffennaf 2002, ymchwiliwyd i'r symleiddio ar y rhaglenni presennol, gwell dulliau darparu, cyllid, a gweithio mewn partneriaeth. Cynigiodd 18 o argymhellion, y derbyniwyd pob un ohonynt gan y Gweinidog, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud, a rhoddwyd llawer ohonynt ar waith eisoes. Gofynnwyd i'r Pwyllgor hefyd ganfod y materion pellach yr oedd angen ymdrin â hwy er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â'r broses adfywio cymunedol.

Increasingly, social policy attempts to involve stakeholders in the design and delivery of programmes, especially those

Yn fwyfwy, mae polisi cymdeithasol yn ceisio cynnwys rhanddeiliaid yn y gwaith o gynllunio a chyflawni rhaglenni, yn enwedig

programmes designed to promote social inclusion. In gathering information for the first review, it quickly became clear that insufficient thought and attention was being given to achieving high levels of community participation, or the skills which community members would require to enable this to happen. Organisations were telling us that, not only was there a basic shortage of qualified community regeneration workers, but also that there was no identifiable means of redressing the situation. As a result, the necessary support mechanism for support volunteers and non-professional local community workers was missing. This was the background to the Committee's decision to consider capacity development and training.

y rhaglenni hynny sydd â'r bwriad o hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Wrth gasglu gwybodaeth ar gyfer yr adolygiad cyntaf, daeth yn amlwg yn fuan nad oedd digon o feddwl a sylw'n cael ei roi i sicrhau lefelau uchel o gyfranogiad cymunedol, neu'r sgiliau y byddai ar aelodau o'r gymuned eu hangen er mwyn hwyluso hynny. Dywedai cyrff wrthym fod prinder sylfaenol o weithwyr adfywio cymunedol cymwysedig, a hefyd nad oedd modd amlwg i adfer y sefyllfa. Oherwydd hynny, nid oedd mecanwaith cynnal ar gyfer cynorthwywyr gwirfoddol a gweithwyr cymunedol lleol nad ydynt yn weithwyr proffesiynol. Dyna oedd y cyd-destun i benderfyniad y Pwyllgor i ystyried meithrin gallu a hyfforddiant.

What do we mean by capacity development? For the purpose of its review, the Committee decided that this described the wide range of formal and informal learning activities that raise the confidence, skills and general competence of community members in order for them to become active in their communities. Capacity development is therefore concerned with providing opportunities for people to learn through experience—opportunities which otherwise may not have been available to them. It is about involving people in collective effort so that they gain confidence in their abilities and in their abilities to influence outputs which affect them.

Beth a olygwn wrth feithrin gallu? I ddiben ei adolygiad, penderfynodd y Pwyllgor fod hyn yn cynnwys amrediad eang o weithgareddau dysgu ffurfiol ac anffurfiol sy'n meithrin hyder, sgiliau a gallu cyffredinol aelodau o'r gymuned fel y gallant ddod yn weithredol yn eu cymunedau. Mae meithrin gallu'n ymwneud felly â chynnig cyfleoedd i bobl ddysgu drwy brofiad—cyfleoedd nad oeddent ar gael iddynt fel arall, o bosibl. Mae'n ymwneud â chynnwys pobl mewn cydymdrech fel eu bod yn magu hyder yn eu galluoedd ac yn eu gallu i ddylanwadu ar allbynnau sy'n effeithio arnynt.

3.30 p.m.

Individual involvement and collective activity go hand in hand. The aim is to encourage people to join together with others in the community so as to provide, through collective effort, what the community needs, and, at the same time, to develop individuals' potential as members of society.

Mae'r rhan a gymer yr unigolyn a gweithgaredd ar y cyd yn mynd law yn llaw. Y nod yw annog pobl i ddod at ei gilydd gydag eraill yn y gymuned fel eu bod yn darparu, drwy gydymdrech, ar gyfer anghenion y gymuned, ac, ar yr un pryd, yn meithrin potensial unigolion fel aelodau o gymdeithas.

In conducting its review, the Committee invited more than 100 organisations to participate, either by responding in writing, or by making oral presentations in formal Committee sessions. The Committee also embarked on a series of visits to practitioners in Wales and Ireland. In examining capacity development and training, the Committee

Wrth gynnal ei adolygiad, gwahoddodd y Pwyllgor fwy na 100 o gyrff i gymryd rhan un ai drwy ymateb mewn ysgrifen, neu drwy roi cyflwyniadau llafar mewn sesiynau ffurfiol o'r Pwyllgor. Ymgymerodd y Pwyllgor hefyd â chyfres o ymweliadau ag ymarferwyr yng Nghymru ac Iwerddon. Wrth ymchwilio i feithrin gallu a hyfforddiant,

also looked back on the evidence it had gathered in its earlier work. Through this process, the Committee received information from organisations as diverse as the Black Voluntary Sector Network Wales, the University of Wales, Bangor, the children of Cofis Cwl Cadnant, and the Ballyfermot partnership in Ireland.

gwnaeth y Pwyllgor fwrw golwg yn ôl hefyd ar y dystiolaeth yr oedd wedi'i chasglu yn ei waith cynharach. Drwy'r broses hon, cafodd y Pwyllgor wybodaeth gan gyrff mor amrywiol â Rhwydwaith Sector Gwirfoddol Pobl Dduon Cymru, Prifysgol Cymru, Bangor, plant Cofis Cwl Cadnant, a phartneriaeth Ballyfermot yn Iwerddon.

Despite the variety of organisations involved, several common key themes emerged. First is that involving community members in identifying the problems and their solutions is essential to successful community development. However, it must be recognised that that is easier said than done. Raising a community's capacity to participate requires long-term strategies and community and personal development programmes. That takes time and depends upon the provision of adequate resources. All too often, spending money on training and development is seen as taking money away from meeting the main objective. The Committee believes, however, that such activities should be fully resourced and supported by a range of mechanisms. When the Committee visited the Ballyfermot partnership outside Dublin, I was particularly impressed by its provision of crèche facilities. The route to the crèche was signposted on the main road—which I have yet to see done over here. All the partnership schemes that we visited had integrated crèche facilities or childcare support, because adequate childcare provision must underpin capacity development. Without such provision, key target groups are unable to participate.

Er mor amrywiol oedd y cyrff a oedd yn gysylltiedig, daeth sawl thema allweddol gyffredin i'r amlwg. Y gyntaf yw ei bod yn hollbwysig cynnwys aelodau o'r gymuned yn y gwaith o ganfod y problemau a'r atebion iddynt er mwyn sicrhau datblygu cymunedol llwyddiannus. Er hynny, rhaid cydnabod mai haws dweud na gwneud. Er mwyn meithrin gallu cymuned i gymryd rhan, rhaid wrth strategaethau hirdymor a rhaglenni datblygu cymunedol a phersonol. Mae hynny'n cymryd amser ac yn dibynnu ar ddarparu adnoddau digonol. Yn rhy aml o lawer, ystyrir bod gwario arian ar hyfforddi a datblygu yn golygu mynd ag arian oddi wrth gyflawni'r brif nod. Cred y Pwyllgor, fodd bynnag, yw y dylid darparu adnoddau llawn ar gyfer gweithgareddau o'r fath a'u cynnal drwy amrediad o fecanweithiau. Pan ymwelodd y Pwyllgor â phartneriaeth Ballyfermot ger Dulyn, gwnaed argraff arbennig arnaf gan ei darpariaeth o gyfleusterau meithrinfa. Yr oedd arwyddion ar y brif ffordd i ddangos sut i gyrraedd y feithrinfa—ac ni welais hynny yma eto. Yr oedd cyfleusterau meithrinfa neu gymorth gofal plant integredig yn yr holl gynlluniau partneriaeth yr ymwelsom â hwy, oherwydd rhaid cael darpariaeth ddigonol o ofal plant er mwyn meithrin gallu. Heb ddarpariaeth o'r fath, ni all grwpiau targed allweddol gymryd rhan.

A recurring theme in the review was the ability of statutory and voluntary organisations to work with the community. The regeneration process has meant that many members of staff in these organisations have had their roles redefined, yet the appropriate skills and training that would allow them to adapt have not been provided. It is not sufficient to rename a post and expect the jobholder to immediately acquire skills in community work. This criticism also extended to elected members of local authorities, especially in the new cabinet

Un thema a gododd dro ar ôl tro yn yr adolygiad oedd gallu cyrff statudol a gwirfoddol i weithio gyda'r gymuned. Mae'r broses adfywio wedi golygu ailddiffinio rolau llawer o aelodau staff yn y cyrff hyn, ac eto ni ddarparwyd y sgiliau a'r hyfforddiant priodol a fyddai'n eu galluogi i ymaddasu. Nid digon ailenwi swydd a disgwyl i'r deiliad feithrin sgiliau mewn gwaith cymunedol ar unwaith. Yr oedd y feirniadaeth hon yn berthnasol hefyd i aelodau etholedig awdurdodau lleol, yn enwedig yn y system newydd o lywodraethu drwy gabinet.

system of governance. It was felt that much could be done to promote greater awareness and understanding in this regard.

Teimlwyd y gellid gwneud mwy o lawer i hybu ymwybyddiaeth a dealltwriaeth yn hyn o beth.

Perhaps the most significant problem identified was the shortage of qualified staff. The Committee recognised that the regeneration programme is handicapped by the shortage of qualified community workers. This shortfall must be addressed as a priority if the regeneration programme is to be implemented successfully. The shortage means that not only are there insufficient numbers of qualified staff to meet the needs of existing programmes, but that the support mechanisms to help unskilled and unqualified members of the community to become professionally qualified community regeneration workers also suffer. The Committee strongly believes that members of the community should be employed to work as community workers within their own communities. However, that depends upon a ladder of opportunity being available to ensure that an individual can be carried through from the acquisition of basic skills to professional qualifications. In this regard, the report examines the availability and quality of training. The provision varies and is concentrated along the M4 and A55 corridors. No internet courses are available, and there is a shortage of bilingual trainers and material. What training is available is provided by an ad hoc array of providers. Accreditation is not uniform, and there are no effective quality control mechanisms at present. That situation cannot be addressed overnight. The Committee believes that long-term solutions are possible, but that they will require the key providers to collaborate in the design and delivery of training at all levels. It may be that the Local Government and Housing Committee can hold a joint meeting with the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee after the election to discuss how best to take this forward.

Efallai mai'r broblem fwyaf a ganfuwyd oedd prinder staff cymwys. Cydnabu'r Pwyllgor fod y rhaglen adfywio wedi'i llesteirio gan brinder gweithwyr cymunedol cymwysedig. Rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i ymdrin â'r diffyg hwn os ydyw'r rhaglen adfywio i'w gweithredu'n llwyddiannus. Mae'r prinder hwn yn golygu nad oes digon o staff cymwys i ddiwallu anghenion y rhaglenni presennol, ac mae'n amharu hefyd ar y mecanweithiau cynnal i helpu aelodau o'r gymuned sydd heb sgiliau a chymwysterau i ddod yn weithwyr adfywio cymunedol â chymhwyster proffesiynol. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn credu'n gryf y dylid cyflogi aelodau o'r gymuned i weithio fel gweithwyr cymunedol yn eu cymunedau eu hun. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn gwneud hynny, rhaid darparu ysgol o gyfleoedd i sicrhau y gall yr unigolyn symud oddi wrth ddysgu sgiliau sylfaenol at gymwysterau proffesiynol. Yn hyn o beth, mae'r adroddiad yn ystyried ansawdd hyfforddiant a'r cyfle i'w dderbyn. Mae'r ddarpariaeth yn amrywiol ac mae'r rhan fwyaf ohoni ar hyd coridorau'r M4 a'r A55. Nid oes cyrsiau ar gael ar y rhyngrwyd, ac mae prinder hyfforddwyr a deunydd dwyieithog. Mae hynny o hyfforddiant sydd ar gael yn cael ei ddarparu gan gasgliad *ad hoc* o ddarparwyr. Nid yw'r achredu'n unffurf, ac nid oes mecanweithiau rheoli ansawdd effeithiol ar hyn o bryd. Ni ellir rhoi sylw i'r sefyllfa honno dros nos. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn credu bod modd cael atebion hirdymor, ond bydd hynny'n gofyn cydweithrediad gan y darparwyr allweddol yn y gwaith o gynllunio a darparu hyfforddiant ar bob lefel. Efallai y bydd y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yn gallu cynnal cyfarfod ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar ôl yr etholiad i drafod y dull gorau o fwrw ymlaen â hyn.

The Committee has produced a good report, and has identified several ways in which the barriers to community regeneration associated with capacity development and training can be removed. It has been greatly assisted by the various organisations involved, which have made high-quality, comprehensive presentations to Committee.

Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad da, ac wedi nodi sawl modd i ddymchwel y rhwystrau i adfywio cymunedol sy'n ymwneud â meithrin gallu a hyfforddiant. Cafodd gymorth mawr gan y gwahanol gyrff a fu'n gysylltiedig, a roddodd gyflwyniadau cynhwysfawr o ansawdd da i'r Pwyllgor. Yn olaf, diolchaf i'r cynghorwr arbennig, yr

Finally, I thank the special adviser, Professor Dave Adamson, who has assisted the Committee on this project. Professor Adamson is an acknowledged leader in community regeneration, and it has been a privilege to work with him. He has been helpful in guiding the Committee in its deliberations. I also thank Roger Chaffey, Claire Griffiths and Dan Collier of the Committee Secretariat. I am delighted to present this report to Plenary. The Assembly Cabinet will no doubt consider the Committee's recommendations in the context of its overall regeneration strategy, and I am sure that Edwina Hart will keep Members informed of those deliberations.

Athro Dave Adamson, a gynorthwyodd y Pwyllgor yn y prosiect hwn. Mae'r Athro Adamson yn arweinydd cydnabyddedig ym maes adfywio cymunedol, a braint oedd gweithio gydag ef. Bu o gymorth wrth arwain y Pwyllgor yn ei drafodaethau. Diolchaf hefyd i Roger Chaffey, Claire Griffiths a Dan Collier o Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Pwyllgor. Yr wyf wrth fy modd yn cyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae'n sicr y bydd Cabinet y Cynulliad yn ystyried argymhellion y Pwyllgor yng nghyd-destun ei strategaeth adfywio gyffredinol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Edwina Hart yn rhoi gwybod i Aelodau am y trafodaethau hynny.

Janet Ryder: I add my thanks to Dave Adamson and to the staff of Committee Secretariat for the work and support that they have provided during this review.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf finnau'n diolch i Dave Adamson ac i staff Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Pwyllgor am eu gwaith a'u cymorth yn ystod yr adolygiad hwn.

As the Chair said, this is the second part of the Committee's review into community regeneration. When we debated the first report, I asked whether the recommendations would be set against the Communities First programme as it now stands. The Minister said that they would, and that the recommendations would all be taken on board. It became evident as we took evidence that not all those recommendations have yet been acted upon. For example, on one occasion a grant was made available late in the financial year. All the groups that gave evidence said that they need time to plan, to bring everybody into the partnership, and to decide on priorities. A grant becoming available late in the year can therefore have a devastating rather than a helpful effect on those plans, especially when the grant is restricted. The Committee report criticises the Government on that point, because partnerships need to be able to plan for the long-term if they are to work. I hope that the Minister will therefore properly consider the recommendations that come forward this time, and set them against the parameters of Communities First.

Fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, dyma'r ail ran o adolygiad y Pwyllgor o adfywio cymunedol. Pan gawsom ddadl ar yr adroddiad cyntaf, gofynnais a fyddai'r argymhellion yn cael eu cymhwyso i'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf fel y mae ar hyn o bryd. Dywedodd y Gweinidog y byddent, ac y byddai'r holl argymhellion yn cael eu derbyn. Daeth yn amlwg wrth inni gymryd tystiolaeth nad yw pob un o'r argymhellion hynny wedi'i roi ar waith eto. Er enghraifft, ar un achlysur darparwyd grant yn hwyr yn y flwyddyn ariannol. Dywedodd yr holl grwpiau a roddodd dystiolaeth fod arnynt angen amser i gynllunio, i gynnwys pawb yn y bartneriaeth, ac i bennu blaenoriaethau. Os darperir grant yn hwyr yn y flwyddyn, gall hynny gael effaith ddinistriol yn hytrach nag un llesol ar y cynlluniau hynny, yn enwedig os yw'r grant yn gyfyngedig. Mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor yn beirniadu'r Llywodraeth ar y pwynt hwnnw, am fod angen i'r partneriaethau allu cynllunio ar gyfer y tymor hir os ydynt i lwyddo. Gan hynny, gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried yn briodol yr argymhellion a roddir gerbron y tro hwn, a'u cymhwyso i Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

As the Chair mentioned, the visit to Ballyfermot coloured much of the report. We saw in Ballyfermot an excellent example of how an estate with many problems had

Fel y soniodd y Cadeirydd, yr ymweliad â Ballyfermot a liwiodd lawer o'r adroddiad. Yn Ballyfermot gwelsom enghraifft ragorol o'r modd yr oedd ystâd a chanddi lawer o

turned itself around in a few years through the strength of the local partnership. There are many differences in the political circumstances in northern Dublin and the circumstances in Wales, but we can learn many lessons from that partnership on implementing successful community regeneration programmes here. One of them, which the Chair touched upon, is childcare provision. Every facility that we visited in Ballyfermot had childcare provision, and no bid was approved unless childcare provision was written into it. That is vital. When we have visited groups throughout Wales, what we have been asked for, above all, is childcare provision. If we are to get to grips with community regeneration we must ensure that adequate, accessible and affordable childcare provision is available. That has an immense impact on the educational attainment and on the social lives of people in those communities. That need has been noted in recommendation 6 of the Committee report.

broblemau wedi'i gweddnewid ei hun mewn ychydig flynyddoedd drwy gryfder y bartneriaeth leol. Mae llawer o wahaniaethau rhwng yr amgylchiadau gwleidyddol yng ngogledd Dulyn a'r amgylchiadau yng Nghymru, ond gallwn ddysgu llawer o wersi gan y bartneriaeth honno ar weithredu rhaglenni adfywio cymunedol llwyddiannus yma. Un ohonynt, y cyfeiriodd y Cadeirydd ato, yw darpariaeth o ofal plant. Ym mhob cyfleuster y gwnaethom ymweld ag ef yn Ballyfermot yr oedd darpariaeth o ofal plant, ac ni chymeradwyid yr un cais oni bai ei fod yn cynnwys darpariaeth o ofal plant. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig. Pan ymwelsom â grwpiau ledled Cymru, yr hyn a ofynnwyd gennym, yn fwy na dim, oedd darpariaeth o ofal plant. Os ydym i fynd i'r afael ag adfywio cymunedol rhaid inni sicrhau bod darpariaeth ddigonol, hygyrch a fforddiadwy o ofal plant ar gael. Caiff hynny effaith aruthrol ar gyrhaeddiad addysgol ac ar fywydau cymdeithasol y bobl yn y cymunedau hynny. Nodwyd yr angen hwnnw yn argymhelliad 6 yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor.

3.40 p.m.

The development of a strong credit union has also had a big impact in Ballyfermot. People can access safe, low repayment loans, which takes them away from loan sharks and the cycle of debt. We perhaps need to consider again developing a strong system of credit unions throughout Wales if we are to regenerate communities here. The real strength in Ballyfermot, however, was its partnership. Although it was mainly elected, unlike partnerships here, its strength, as the Chair said, was in its ability to bring all the providers together so that they realised that that they should implement the partnership's aims through their programmes. That also applied to funding. We have a long way to go in Wales before our partnerships can take on that role, and we have much work to do with them. We also have a long way to go with other bodies, such as health bodies, ELWa and the WDA, to ensure that they support the partnerships as they should.

Mae'r undeb credyd cadarn a ddatblygwyd yn Ballyfermot wedi cael effaith fawr hefyd. Mae pobl yn gallu cael benthyciadau diogel, gydag ad-daliadau bach, ac mae hynny'n mynd â hwy oddi wrth usurwyr a'r cylch o ddyled. Efallai y dylem ailystyried datblygu system gadarn o undebau credyd ledled Cymru os ydym i adfywio cymunedau yma. Fodd bynnag, y gwir gryfder yn Ballyfermot oedd ei bartneriaeth. Er ei bod yn un etholedig gan mwyaf, yn wahanol i bartneriaethau yma, yr oedd ei chryfder, fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, yn ei gallu i ddod â'r holl ddarparwyr at ei gilydd fel eu bod yn sylweddoli y dylent roi nodau'r bartneriaeth ar waith drwy eu rhaglenni. Yr oedd hynny'n wir am gyllid hefyd. Mae gennym lawer iawn i'w wneud eto yng Nghymru cyn y bydd ein partneriaethau'n gallu ymgymryd â'r rôl honno, ac mae gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud gyda hwy. Mae gennym lawer i'w wneud eto hefyd gyda chyrff eraill, fel cyrff iechyd, ELWa a'r WDA, i sicrhau eu bod yn cefnogi'r partneriaethau fel y dylent.

Finally, on training, as the Chair said, much informal learning has taken place in the

Yn olaf, ynghylch hyfforddiant, fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, mae llawer o ddysgu

partnerships to date. Many people have become involved in developing structures and facilities in their communities and we need to develop a way of accrediting that training and of establishing a national standard for community development workers. I hope that the Minister will take those recommendations forward this time and set them against the Communities First programme to see how we can adapt it to deliver on the report's recommendations.

anffurfiol wedi digwydd yn y partneriaethau hyd yma. Mae llawer o bobl wedi dechrau cymryd rhan yn y gwaith o ddatblygu strwythurau a chyfleusterau yn eu cymunedau a rhaid inni ddatblygu dull o achredu'r hyfforddiant hwnnw a sefydlu safon genedlaethol ar gyfer gweithwyr datblygu cymunedol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn bwrw ymlaen â'r argymhellion hynny y tro hwn ac yn eu cymhwyso at raglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i weld sut y gallwn ei haddasu i gyflawni argymhellion yr adroddiad.

Eleanor Burnham: I also thank Dave Adamson and the secretariat and I welcome this motion on behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats. The report highlights the importance of communities—rural and urban, Welsh and English, in north and south Wales—to the lives of the people of Wales. The partnership Government's commitment to regenerating communities continues, particularly through Communities First, a valuable programme that the Welsh Liberal Democrats have pushed hard for as part of the partnership Government and prior to that. [*Interruption.*] My remarks have obviously touched a nerve there. A key issue is the need to reform the Barnett formula so that it is based on need rather than population. That would lead to poorer areas receiving the vital funds that they desperately need to meet demands, and avoid money having to be taken from other budgets. I have visited several partnerships in various areas of north Wales and I note that capacity development and training depends not only on funding but on having committed partnerships, as others have mentioned. That is vital.

Eleanor Burnham: Diolchaf finnau i Dave Adamson ac i'r ysgrifenyddiaeth a chroesawaf y cynnig hwn ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd cymunedau—rhai gwledig a threfol, rhai Cymraeg a Saesneg, yn y Gogledd a'r De—i fywydau pobl Cymru. Mae ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i adfywio cymunedau'n parhau, yn enwedig drwy Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, rhaglen werthfawr y mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi pwyso'n galed drosti fel rhan o'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth a chyn hynny. [*Torri ar draws.*] Mae'n amlwg bod fy sylwadau wedi taro ar wendid. Y mater allweddol yw'r angen i ddiwygio fformiwla Barnett fel ei bod yn seiliedig ar angen yn hytrach nag ar boblogaeth. Drwy hynny byddai ardaloedd tlotach yn cael y cyllid hollbwysig y mae arnynt ei daer angen i fodloni gofynion, fel na fydd yn rhaid mynd ag arian o gyllidebau eraill. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â sawl partneriaeth mewn gwahanol rannau o'r Gogledd a nodaf fod meithrin gallu a hyfforddiant yn dibynnu nid yn unig ar gyllid ond ar bartneriaethau ymrwymedig hefyd, fel y mae eraill wedi dweud. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig.

Voluntary groups are particularly important and I pay tribute to the voluntary groups in north Wales, such as the Association of Voluntary Organisations in Wrexham and others, which work extremely hard. I agree with other speakers that childcare provision is particularly important, as are credit union facilities—I have seen many successful examples. I agree with the comments made about loan sharks, who have a dreadful hold on people. Their interest rates can be almost

Mae grwpiau gwirfoddol yn arbennig o bwysig a thalaf deyrnged i'r grwpiau gwirfoddol yn y Gogledd, fel Cymdeithas Cyrff Gwirfoddol Wrecsam ac eraill, sy'n gweithio'n galed dros ben. Cytunaf â siaradwyr eraill fod gofal plant yn arbennig o bwysig, fel y mae cyfleusterau undeb credyd—gwelais lawer o enghreifftiau llwyddiannus. Cytunaf â'r sylwadau am usurwyr, sydd â gafael ofnadwy ar bobl. Gall eu cyfraddau llog fod yn anfoesol bron—

immoral—I read in one report recently of a 300 per cent interest rate. It is incumbent upon all Members to continue with the vital work of improving communities that are still struggling. I look forward to returning to the Assembly and working with others on this after May.

darllenais mewn un adroddiad yn ddiweddar am gyfradd llog o 300 y cant. Dylai'r holl Aelodau barhau â'r gwaith hanfodol o hybu cymunedau sy'n dal i fod mewn trafferthion. Edrychaf ymlaen at ddychwelyd i'r Cynulliad a gweithio gydag eraill ar hyn ar ôl mis Mai.

William Graham: I also pay tribute to our officers, our special adviser and those who gave evidence. I am also grateful to the Finance Minister and to the Chair for her patience during our deliberations.

William Graham: Talaf finnau deyrnged i'n swyddogion, ein hymgynghorydd arbennig a'r rhai a roddodd dystiolaeth. Yr wyf hefyd yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog Cyllid ac i'r Cadeirydd am ei hamynedd yn ystod ein trafodaethau.

There is agreement on the need to regenerate many communities throughout Wales. Therefore, the Welsh Conservative group offers its total support for policies that encourage and empower neighbourhoods to implement projects that improve their social, economic and environmental conditions.

Mae cytundeb ar yr angen i adfywio llawer o gymunedau ledled Cymru. Gan gynny, mae grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cynnig ei gefnogaeth lwyr i bolisïau sy'n annog ac yn galluogi cymdogaethau i roi prosiectau ar waith sy'n gwella eu cyflwr cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol.

In all debates concerning community regeneration policies, and whenever these matters were discussed by the Local Government and Housing Committee, I outlined my concerns about transparency and accountability with regard to projects that have more than one funding source or when project managers have responsibility for more than one regeneration scheme. Sadly, those concerns remain.

Yn yr holl ddadleuon am bolisïau adfywio cymunedol, a phryd bynnag y trafodwyd y materion hyn gan y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, disgrifiais fy mhryderon am dryloywder ac atebolrwydd mewn cysylltiad â phrosiectau sydd â mwy nag un ffynhonnell gyllid a rhai lle y mae rheolwyr prosiectau'n gyfrifol am fwy nag un cynllun adfywio. Gwaetha'r modd, mae'r pryderon hynny'n aros.

The availability of enough suitably trained and qualified community workers is also a concern. That problem was amplified when local authorities recruited many of those qualified people into management and administrative positions, offering far higher salaries than those paid by community regeneration organisations. Local authorities continue to advertise such vacancies and, therefore, are still seeking to recruit suitably qualified workers from other local authorities, or from community regeneration organisations.

Mater arall sy'n peri pryder yw'r gallu i gael digon o weithwyr cymunedol sydd wedi'u hyfforddi ac wedi ymgymhwyso'n briodol. Gwaethygwyd y broblem honno pan wnaeth awdurdodau lleol recriwtio llawer o'r bobl gymwys hynny i swyddi rheoli a gweinyddu, gan gynnig cyflogau uwch o lawer na'r rhai a delir gan gyrff adfywio cymunedol. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn dal i hysbysebu swyddi gwag o'r fath ac, felly, maent yn dal i geisio recriwtio gweithwyr â chymwysterau addas o awdurdodau lleol eraill, neu o gyrff adfywio cymunedol.

This administration has introduced many initiatives to alleviate social exclusion and deprivation that, on the surface, are positive. They all have gloss, but, sadly, fail in-depth scrutiny. That is highlighted in many of the review's recommendations, and is graphically illustrated in recommendation 8:

Mae'r weinyddiaeth hon wedi cyflwyno llawer o fentrau i liniaru allgáu cymdeithasol ac amddifadedd sy'n rhai cadarnhaol, ar yr wyneb. Mae sglein arnynt i gyd, ond, gwaetha'r modd, nid ydynt yn dal eu harchwilio'n fanwl. Tynnir sylw at hynny yn llawer o argymhellion yr adolygiad, ac fe'i

dangosir yn eglur yn argymhelliad 8:

‘That the Welsh Assembly Government engage in discussions with the WLGA to promote dissemination of good practice and develop guidance for local authorities in the development of the community-working capacity of their staff and elected members.’

‘Bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cynnal trafodaethau â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru er mwyn hyrwyddo’r broses o ledaenu arferion da a datblygu canllawiau ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol wrth ddatblygu gallu eu staff a’u haelodau etholedig i weithio yn y gymuned.’

All the previous community regeneration initiatives included a similar recommendation, yet there is little sign of progress. There are examples of active community schemes achieving their objectives and making great improvements to social, economic and environmental conditions but, so far, there have been no codes of good practice or guidance. Furthermore, there is a failure to recognise the limitations of the cabinet structures that the majority of our local authorities have adopted.

Yr oedd yr holl fentrau adfywio cymunedol blaenorol yn cynnwys argymhelliad tebyg, ac eto nid oes fawr o arwydd o gynnydd. Mae enghreifftiau o gynlluniau cymunedol egnïol sy’n cyflawni eu hamcanion ac yn sicrhau gwelliannau mawr mewn amodau cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol ond, hyd yn hyn, ni chafwyd unrhyw godau o arfer da neu ganllawiau. At hynny, mae methiant i gydnabod cyfyngiadau’r strwythurau cabinet y mae’r rhan fwyaf o’n hawdurdodau lleol wedi’u mabwysiadu.

I appreciate that the essence of these initiatives is to develop local solutions to local problems, and that those involved in these schemes must not be subjected to pressure to succeed. However, an overall national objective is needed, under which all such information would be provided. The failure to determine a national objective is at the heart of the ineffective use of Objective 1 funding.

Sylweddolaf mai hanfod y mentrau hyn yw datblygu atebion lleol i broblemau lleol, ac na ddylai’r rhai sy’n gysylltiedig â’r cynlluniau hyn gael eu rhoi o dan bwysau i lwyddo. Er hynny, mae angen amcan cenedlaethol cyffredinol y byddid yn darparu’r holl wybodaeth o’r fath oddi tano. Y methiant i bennu amcan cenedlaethol sydd wrth wraidd y defnydd aneffeithiol o gyllid Amcan 1.

The recommendation also highlights the failure of community schemes to appreciate the need to engage with the independent sector. Our local authorities are overloaded with bureaucracy and, in many ways, their structures do not allow the flexibility or the immediacy required for many of these community development programmes. The independent sector is at the cutting edge of new management practices, and has much to offer in developing strategies to regenerate our communities.

Mae’r argymhelliad yn tynnu sylw hefyd at y ffaith bod cynlluniau cymunedol wedi methu â gwerthfawrogi’r angen i ymwneud â’r sector annibynnol. Mae ein hawdurdodau lleol wedi’u llethu gan fiwrocratiaeth ac, ar lawer ystyr, nid yw eu strwythurau’n caniatáu’r hyblygrwydd neu’r uniongyrchedd sydd ei angen ar gyfer llawer o’r rhaglenni datblygu cymunedol hyn. Mae’r sector annibynnol yn arwain y ffordd ar arferion rheoli newydd, ac mae ganddo lawer i’w gynnig wrth ddatblygu strategaethau i adfywio ein cymunedau.

Too many of these recommendations are well-intended but would drain resources without producing tangible results, particularly with regard to training and providing facilities to promote and encourage people to gain suitable qualifications in

Mae llawer o’r argymhellion hyn yn llawn bwriadau da ond byddent yn dreth ar adnoddau heb ddod â chanlyniadau pendant, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â hyfforddiant a darparu cyfleusterau i gymell ac annog pobl i ennill cymwysterau addas mewn gwaith

community work. I appreciate the need to have suitably trained community workers—I have referred to the problems related to this issue—but funding for training should come from other sources.

cymunedol. Gwerthfawrogaf yr angen i gael gweithwyr cymunedol a hyfforddwyd yn briodol—yr wyf wedi cyfeirio at y problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r mater hwn—ond dylai cyllid ar gyfer hyfforddiant ddod o ffynonellau eraill.

The Welsh Conservative group acknowledges the positive work developed in our communities by people and organisations committed to improving living conditions and quality of life. We do not wish to impede progress in our communities, but this policy review papers over many cracks and underlying problems. Those need to be properly addressed. If they are not, many community regeneration projects will go the way of many Objective 1 and Communities First projects—down an increasing spiral of bureaucracy, leading nowhere. We hope that further reviews will address these issues.

Mae grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cydnabod y gwaith cadarnhaol a ddatblygwyd yn ein cymunedau gan bobl a chyrff sydd wedi ymrwymo i wella amodau byw ac ansawdd bywyd. Ni ddymunwn lesteirio cynnydd yn ein cymunedau, ond mae'r adolygiad polisi hwn yn celu llawer o feiau a phroblemau sylfaenol. Rhaid ymdrin â'r rhain yn briodol. Os na wneir hynny, bydd llawer o brosiectau adfywio cymunedol yn mynd i ddilyn llawer o brosiectau Amcan 1 a Cymunedau yn Gyntaf—gan ddisgyn i drobwll o fiwrocratiaeth gynyddol nad yw'n arwain i unman. Gobeithiwn y bydd adolygiadau pellach yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn.

Janice Gregory: I will begin by paying tribute to all those who work so hard in community regeneration, and the people at the grass roots in our communities, who often face challenging circumstances. I have almost lost count of the constituents with whom I have spoken who are trying to build a better future for their communities, but constantly find hurdles in their way. The simplest tasks are made 10 times more difficult, not only because barriers need to be negotiated but also because those barriers are so unfamiliar. People have not previously encountered such barriers and, as a result, do not have the capacity to deal effectively with the problems at hand. I therefore welcome the proposals to develop community capacity through flexible methods in both formal and informal settings.

Janice Gregory: Dechreuaf drwy dalu teyrnged i bawb sy'n gweithio mor galed ym maes adfywio cymunedol, a'r bobl ar lawr gwlad yn ein cymunedau, sy'n aml yn wynebu amgylchiadau anodd. Yr wyf bron â cholli cyfrif o'r etholwyr yr wyf wedi siarad â hwy sy'n ceisio creu gwell dyfodol i'w cymunedau, ond sy'n canfod rhwystrau ar eu ffordd yn gyson. Gwneir y tasgau symlaf yn 10 gwaith yn fwy anodd, nid yn unig am fod rhaid goresgyn rhwystrau ond am fod y rhwystrau hynny mor anghyfarwydd. Nid yw pobl wedi dod ar draws rhwystrau o'r fath o'r blaen ac, o'r herwydd, nid ydynt yn meddu ar y gallu i ymdrin yn effeithiol â'r problemau a wynebant. Gan hynny, croesawaf y cynigion i feithrin gallu yn y gymuned drwy ddulliau hyblyg mewn lleoliadau ffurfiol ac anffurfiol.

The report mentions local partnerships as a key way to identify needs and deliver change. I hope that partnerships will be imaginative in both their work and their composition. Can they, for example, include local schools, many of which, in my constituency, are addressing the basic skills needs of adults by involving them in the classroom? Can they include local businesses of all sizes, where skills, imagination and initiative, as well as social interaction, surely thrive?

Mae'r adroddiad yn crybwyll partneriaethau lleol fel modd allweddol i ganfod anghenion a chyflawni newid. Gobeithiaf y bydd partneriaethau'n llawn dychymyg o ran eu gwaith a'u cyfansoddiad. Er enghraifft, a allent gynnwys ysgolion lleol, gan fod llawer ohonynt, yn fy etholaeth i, yn ymdrin ag anghenion oedolion am sgiliau sylfaenol drwy roi lle iddynt yn yr ystafell ddosbarth? A allent gynnwys busnesau lleol o bob maint, lle y mae sgiliau, dychymyg a menter, yn ogystal â rhyngweithio cymdeithasol, yn sicr o ffynnu?

3.50 p.m.

Can we be flexible enough to work with employers so that workplace training can be joined-up in order to address capacity development within communities?

A allwn fod yn ddigon hyblyg i weithio gyda chyflogwyr fel y gall hyfforddiant yn y gweithle fod yn gydgysylltiedig er mwyn rhoi sylw i'r angen i feithrin gallu mewn cymunedau?

I welcome the suggestion of more work being carried out with schools in terms of citizenship education. I hope that this will go further than lecturing children about the virtues of community spirit, and will get children and the community to work as one. Children possess a huge wealth of talent that should not be underestimated. Links with the youth service may prove helpful here, particularly as that service is now statutory, thanks to the Welsh Assembly Government.

Croesawaf yr awgrym y dylid gwneud mwy o waith gydag ysgolion yng nghyd-destun addysg dinasyddiaeth. Gobeithiaf y bydd hyn yn amgenach na phregethu wrth blant am rinweddau cymdogaeth dda, ac y bydd yn peri i blant a'r gymuned weithio'n gytûn. Mae plant yn meddu ar stôr enfawr o ddoniau na ddylid ei thanbrisio. Efallai y byddai cysylltiadau â'r gwasanaeth ieuenctid yn fuddiol yn hyn o beth, yn enwedig gan fod y gwasanaeth hwnnw'n un statudol bellach, diolch i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

The report is right to point out that expectations are high. I hope that the recommendations will further this process and not delay it by adding more barriers and bureaucracy.

Mae'n briodol bod yr adroddiad yn nodi bod disgwyliadau mawr. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr argymhellion yn hyrwyddo'r broses hon ymhellach ac nid yn ei llesteirio drwy ychwanegu rhagor o rwystrau a biwrocratiaeth.

Not every member of the community will want to become involved in community regeneration programmes. The people who become involved at present are confident and forthright. They will need training to address their development needs, but others will not want this form of training and will not want to become involved. I hope that we will address the socially-excluded, the ones not involved in regeneration, people who do not have the time or the energy to attend meetings, and the disenfranchised who never become involved. They need jobs, training and support.

Ni fydd pob aelod o'r gymuned am gymryd rhan mewn rhaglenni adfywio cymunedol. Mae'r rhai sy'n cymryd rhan ar hyn o bryd yn hyderus ac yn ddi-flewyn-ar-dafod. Bydd arnynt angen hyfforddiant i ddiwallu eu hanghenion datblygu, ond bydd eraill na fyddant am gael hyfforddiant o'r fath ac ni fyddant yn dymuno cymryd rhan. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn rhoi sylw i'r rhai a allgaewyd yn gymdeithasol, y rhai nad ydynt yn ymwneud ag adfywio, y rhai nad oes ganddynt na'r amser na'r egni i fynychu cyfarfodydd, a'r rhai difreintiedig nad ydynt byth yn cymryd rhan. Mae arnynt angen swyddi, hyfforddiant a chymorth.

Strong and thriving communities will come about where poverty and its causes are tackled and eliminated systematically. I know that the Government takes that challenge seriously, so I welcome the progress made and I am sure that it will continue.

Ceir cymunedau cadarn a ffyniannus pan ymdrinnir â thlodi a'r hyn sy'n ei achosi a'i ddileu mewn modd systematig. Gwn fod y Llywodraeth yn cymryd yr her honno o ddifrif, felly croesawaf y cynnydd a wnaed ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn parhau.

Geraint Davies: I declare an interest as a member of a local Communities First partnership board that is working hard to get

Geraint Davies: Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o bartneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf leol sy'n gweithio'n galed i gychwyn prosiectau.

projects off the ground. Several issues of concern have been raised with me regarding Communities First. The first involves the crucial issue of action plans, and the importance of these following the same format so that they can be compared like with like. There is also concern among staff about the length of contracts. We have already heard that it is difficult to recruit quality staff, so it is important that they are retained. We must have secure employment conditions, with contracts lasting at least three years. There should be a thematic approach to funding rounds, so that bids can be compared like with like.

Codwyd sawl mater sy'n peri pryder gyda mi mewn cysylltiad â Chymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â mater hollbwysig cynlluniau gweithredu, a'r pwysigrwydd o sicrhau eu bod yn dilyn yr un fformat fel y gellir cymharu tebyg â'i debyg. Mae pryder hefyd ymysg staff ynghylch hyd contractau. Clywsom eisoes ei bod yn anodd recriwtio staff o ansawdd da, felly mae'n bwysig eu cadw. Rhaid wrth amodau cyflogaeth sicr, gyda chontractau tair blynedd o hyd o leiaf. Dylid ymdrin â chylchoedd cyllido mewn modd thematig, fel y gellir cymharu ceisiadau tebyg.

My main concern is that Communities First funding processes are hindering rather than facilitating the programme and that they undermine the principle of partnership working. One example that has adversely affected Communities First partnerships in my constituency involves the grant to encourage transport initiatives and provide play areas for children. The local authority received the grant offer letter on the last working day before Christmas last year, with no prior notice or consultation. The closing date for the submission of bids was 12 February, which left less than six weeks in which to carry out the bidding process. While the funding is welcome, that badly thought-out timescale has caused great problems on the ground and has meant that several groups and partnerships have lost out on the chance of funding. Little time has been allowed for consultation with the community, so the most important people have effectively been stopped from taking part in the decision-making process. That contradicts the partnership approach that is essential to deliver effective, bottom-up Communities First programmes and made it difficult to include innovative and new schemes that would benefit the community. The list of projects that were received for consideration under this grant amounted to over £4 million, and the end situation was that projects were chosen for the wrong reasons—for example, if no planning permission was required and if they were likely to be completed within the allocated timescale. I am sure that Members agree that those are not the ideal criteria for deciding on the best-suited projects.

Y pryder pennaf sydd gennyf yw bod prosesau cyllido Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn llesteirio'r rhaglen yn hytrach na'i hwyluso a'u bod yn tanseilio'r egwyddor o weithio mewn partneriaeth. Mae un enghraifft o hynny, sydd wedi amharu ar bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn fy etholaeth i, yn ymwneud â'r grant i hybu mentrau trafnidiaeth ac i ddarparu mannau chwarae ar gyfer plant. Daeth y llythyr cynnig grant i law'r awdurdod lleol ar y diwrnod gwaith olaf cyn y Nadolig y llynedd, heb unrhyw rybudd neu ymgynghori ymlaen llaw. Y dyddiad cau ar gyfer cyflwyno ceisiadau oedd 12 Chwefror, a oedd yn gadael llai na chwe wythnos i gwblhau'r broses ymgeisio. Er bod y cyllid i'w groesawu, mae'r amserlen anystyriol honno wedi peri problemau mawr yn lleol ac wedi golygu bod sawl grŵp a phartneriaeth wedi colli'r cyfle i gael cyllid. Ychydig o amser a ganiatawyd ar gyfer ymgynghori â'r gymuned, felly mae'r bobl bwysicaf wedi'u hatal i bob pwrpas rhag cymryd rhan yn y broses penderfynu. Mae hynny'n groes i'r dull partneriaeth sy'n hanfodol er mwyn cyflawni rhaglenni Cymunedau yn Gyntaf sy'n effeithiol, ac sy'n gweithio o'r gwaelod i fyny, a pharodd ei bod yn anodd cynnwys cynlluniau newydd ac arloesol a fyddai o fudd i'r gymuned. Yr oedd y rhestr o brosiectau a dderbyniwyd i'w hystyried o dan y grant hwn yn dod i gyfanswm o fwy na £4 miliwn, a'r canlyniad oedd bod prosiectau wedi'u dewis am y rhesymau anghywir—er enghraifft, os nad oedd angen caniatâd ac os oeddent yn debygol o gael eu cwblhau o fewn y cyfnod dynodedig. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod Aelodau'n cytuno nad y rhain yw'r meini prawf

delfrydol ar gyfer penderfynu ar y prosiectau mwyaf addas.

If the Government is serious about making Communities First work, it must work harder to ensure that Communities First partnerships have sufficient time to access available funding. The funding processes that I have described do not work, and they are failing to deliver for the communities that are most in need. Communities First is a scheme worthy of support, and it must not be undermined by such practices.

Os yw'r Llywodraeth o ddifrif ynghylch peri i Cymunedau yn Gyntaf weithio, rhaid iddi weithio'n galetach er mwyn sicrhau bod gan bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ddigon o amser i gael unrhyw gyllid sydd ar gael. Nid yw'r prosesau cyllido a ddisgrifiais yn gweithio, ac nid ydynt yn ateb gofynion y cymunedau mwyaf anghenus. Mae Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn gynllun sy'n haeddu cefnogaeth, a rhaid iddo beidio â chael ei danseilio gan arferion o'r fath.

Peter Law: I listened to William Graham's contribution and once again, I was reminded of my usual statement that the Tories seem to know no shame. I was amazed when he damned this report with negativity. I even began to wonder whether William could hear his comments. This report aims to tackle positively the problems that we faced after years of Tory governments, when havoc was wreaked on our communities. This is a good tool for resolving those problems.

Peter Law: Gwrandewais ar gyfraniad William Graham ac, unwaith eto, daeth fy natganiad arferol i'r meddwl, sef na ŵyr y Torïaid ba beth yw cywilydd, yn ôl pob golwg. Fe'm syfrdanwyd pan gollfarnodd yr adroddiad hwn. Gwneuthum hyd yn oed ddechrau meddwl tybed a allai William glywed ei sylwadau. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ceisio ymdrin yn gadarnhaol â'r problemau yr oeddem yn eu hwynebu ar ôl blynyddoedd o lywodraethau Torïaidd, pan wnaed difrod ar ein cymunedau. Mae hwn yn arf da i ddatrys y problemau hynny.

It is an in-depth report, which will challenge and help the Government's positive approach to fighting social exclusion that can be tackled strongly through community regeneration. I will not speak for too long because others have outlined the report's benefits in detail, particularly our excellent Chair. However, capacity building makes a difference in all of these communities. The many helpful examples that we have seen and heard in Committee indicate the way forward.

Mae'n adroddiad manwl, a fydd yn herio ac yn hyrwyddo dull cadarnhaol y Llywodraeth o ymladd yn erbyn allgáu cymdeithasol y gellir mynd i'r afael ag ef drwy adfywio cymunedol. Ni siaradaf yn rhy hir gan fod eraill, a'n Cadeirydd rhagorol yn enwedig, wedi disgrifio buddion yr adroddiad yn fanwl. Fodd bynnag, mae meithrin gallu yn gwneud gwahaniaeth ym mhob un o'r cymunedau hyn. Mae'r nifer fawr o enghreifftiau buddiol yr ydym wedi'u gweld a'u clywed yn y Pwyllgor yn dangos y ffordd ymlaen.

I am pleased to say that a credit union is being established in Blaenau Gwent—I look forward to that. I thank the Minister, who is an example of a 'listening Minister', for making that possible through special funding some time ago. It has now come into fruition, even though it should have been in place a long time ago. The success of credit unions was mentioned earlier. I thank the Minister for the way in which she approaches these reports; she listens and takes part—it is never a 'them and us' situation. The Minister listens

Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod undeb credyd yn cael ei sefydlu ym Mlaenau Gwent—edrychaf ymlaen at hynny. Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog, sy'n enghraifft o 'Weinidog sy'n gwrando', am hwyluso hynny drwy gyllid arbennig beth amser yn ôl. Mae wedi dwyn ffrwyth yn awr, er y dylasai fod ar waith ers talwm. Cyfeiriwyd yn gynharach at lwyddiant undebau credyd. Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am y modd y mae'n ymdrin â'r adroddiadau hyn; mae'n gwrando ac yn cymryd rhan—nid ydyw byth yn sefyllfa o

and she will pick our positive suggestions out of this debate and will hopefully include them in legislation to help Welsh communities.

'ni a hwy'. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwrando a bydd yn codi ein hawgrymiadau cadarnhaol o'r ddadl hon ac yn eu cynnwys, gobeithio, mewn deddfwriaeth i helpu cymunedau yng Nghymru.

I also compliment Gwenda Thomas for her leadership. She is an experienced Chair, with many years of experience in local government, particularly in children's needs and social care. The Committee greatly benefitted from her leadership throughout this review. She has already mentioned the excellent service of Professor Dave Adamson. I also thank the sectretariat: Roger Chaffey, Claire Griffiths, and Daniel Collier for whom nothing was too much trouble.

Canmolaf Gwenda Thomas hefyd am ei harweiniad. Mae'n Gadeirydd profiadol, a chanddi flynyddoedd lawer o brofiad mewn llywodraeth leol, yn enwedig o ran anghenion plant a gofal cymdeithasol. Cafodd y Pwyllgor fudd mawr o'i harweiniad drwy gydol yr adolygiad hwn. Mae eisoes wedi sôn am wasanaeth rhagorol yr Athro Dave Adamson. Diolchaf finnau i'r ysgrifenyddiaeth: Roger Chaffey, Claire Griffiths, a Daniel Collier, nad oedd dim yn ormod o drafferth iddynt.

This has proven to be a useful and beneficial exercise, particularly for excluded communities throughout Wales. It will be warmly welcomed and I look forward to hearing how the Government intends to take these recommendations forward.

Mae hyn wedi profi'n waith defnyddiol a llesol, yn enwedig i gymunedau sydd wedi'u hallgáu ledled Cymru. Caiff groeso brwd ac edrychaf ymlaen at glywed sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu bwrw ymlaen â'r argymhellion hyn.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Fel un na chafodd gyfle i eistedd ar y Pwyllgor hwn wrth iddo ymgymryd â'r adolygiad, bu'n ddiddorol gwrando ar y cyfraniadau y prynhawn yma a chael cyfle i ystyried yr adroddiad. Codwyd nifer o faterion o bwys sy'n ymwneud ag adfywio cymunedau yn ogystal â chyfeiriadau at bolisi'r Llywodraeth glymblaid. Cyflwynwyd her i'r Llywodraeth bresennol a'r Llywodraeth a fydd yn cael ei hethol ar 1 Mai. Fel y nododd Janet Ryder a Geraint Davies, mae nifer o broblemau sy'n ymwneud â gweithredu cynlluniau'n ymarferol yn y maes pwysig hwn.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: As one who did not have the opportunity to sit on this Committee while it conducted the review, it has been interesting to listen to this afternoon's contributions and to have an opportunity to consider the report. Important matters relating to community regeneration were raised as well as references to the coalition Government's policy. A challenge has been issued to the present Government and to the Government that will be elected on 1 May. As Janet Ryder and Geraint Davies indicated, several problems relate to the practical implemention of schemes in this important area.

Cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedwyd ar brif themâu'r adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, nodaf, fel un sy'n cynrychioli etholaeth sydd â mawr angen y math hwn o adfywio, na chafodd y Pwyllgor gyfle i ystyried rhai materion. Efallai y gall y Pwyllgor wneud hynny yn y dyfodol. Soniodd Gwenda Thomas am yr hyn y byddai Aelodau newydd i'r Pwyllgor yn ei etifeddu ar ôl 1 Mai. Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig. Pa fath o arweiniad y gallwn ei gynnig i'r Aelodau a fydd yn ein dilyn ar Bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad?

I agree with what was said on the report's main themes. However, I note, as one who represents a constituency in grave need of such regeneration, that the Committee was not given the opportunity to consider some issues. Perhaps the Committee can do so in the future. Gwenda Thomas mentioned what new Committee Members would inherit after 1 May. That is an important point. What kind of guidance can we offer Members who will succeed us on Assembly Committees?

Derbyniaf fod rhaid targedu yn y maes hwn. Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei pharodrwydd i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem mewn perthynas â ward Llynfell yn fy etholaeth, na chafodd ei chynnwys yn y rhaglen, Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am iddi ddod o hyd i amser, yn ei hamserlen brysur, i gynnwys ward Llynfell yn y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Yr wyf yn ei sicrhau bod trigolion Llynfell yn ddiolchgar iddi am wneud hynny. Mae targedu ardal yn caniatáu inni edrych mewn ffordd gadarnhaol ac effeithiol ar broblemau'r ardal honno, ond nid yw'r ardaloedd sydd heb eu targedu yn derbyn unrhyw fath o gymorth ymarferol, megis grantiau tai. Os nad yw'r ardal wedi'i thargedu, mae'n anodd cael unrhyw fath o gymorth, er y gallai'r ardal fod yn enghraifft deilwng unigol.

I accept that we must set targets in this area. I take advantage of this opportunity to thank the Minister for her willingness to tackle the problem relating to the Llynfell ward in my constituency, which was not included in the Communities First programme. I thank the Minister for finding the time in her busy schedule to include the Llynfell ward in the Communities First programme. I assure her that the residents of Llynfell are grateful to her for doing so. Targeting allows us to look in a positive and effective way at the problems of that area, but areas that have not been targeted do not receive any practical assistance, such as housing grants. If the area is not targeted, it is difficult to get any assistance, although the area might be a worthy individual example.

4.00 p.m.

Nodaf bwysigrwydd diwylliant fel modd i adfywio cymunedau. Nodaf hefyd yr angen i adfywio ein cymunedau gwledig, lle mae mesur tlodi yn llawer anos. Mae'r cymunedau hynny'n haeddu ein sylw.

I note the importance of culture as a means of regenerating communities. I also note the need to regenerate our rural areas, where measuring poverty is far more difficult. Those communities deserve our attention.

The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart): I welcome the Committee's report on the review of capacity development, which is still in the early stages of implementing Communities First, a programme to which the Assembly Government is committed for the next 20 years at least. We must remember that. I note with interest the criticisms made by Janet Ryder and Geraint Davies. They are trying to take advantage of current politics, as we approach the elections, rather than addressing the major issues of Communities First, which is a generational programme. You must be bold in Government, and take a generational approach. You must recognise that you will not get everything right, but be determined to do so in the long run. I vehemently deny that I have not taken any of these issues seriously, or that I have not been prepared to implement them. If I disagreed with the recommendations, I would say so and I would not implement them. I have been prepared to implement all the Committee's recommendations. Some will take longer than others, and some of these will take

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart): Croesawaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar yr adolygiad o feithrin gallu, sy'n dal i fod yn y cyfnod cynnar o weithredu Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, rhaglen y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo iddi am yr 20 mlynedd nesaf o leiaf. Rhaid inni gofio hynny. Nodaf â diddordeb feirniadaethau gan Janet Ryder a Geraint Davies. Maent yn ceisio manteisio ar wleidyddiaeth gyfoes, wrth inni ddynesu at yr etholiadau, yn hytrach nag ymdrin â'r materion pwysig yn Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, sy'n rhaglen a fydd yn parhau am genhedlaeth. Rhaid bod yn eofn mewn Llywodraeth, a chymryd agwedd sy'n parhau dros genhedlaeth gyfan. Rhaid ichi gydnabod na fyddwch yn cael pob dim yn iawn, ond dylech fod yn benderfynol o wneud hynny yn y tymor hir. Gwadaf yn daer fy mod heb gymryd unrhyw un o'r materion hyn o ddifrif, neu fy mod wedi bod yn amharod i'w rhoi ar waith. Pe byddwn yn anghytuno â'r argymhellion, dywedwn hynny ac nis gweithredwn. Bûm yn barod i weithredu holl argymhellion y Pwyllgor. Bydd rhai'n cymryd mwy o amser nag eraill, a bydd rhai'n

longer than five minutes. I am a real politician and I know that some things take 20 years. Some people are new to politics and they believe that things only take five minutes; it might only take five minutes for some parties in the Chamber to make manifesto pledges.

cymryd mwy na phum munud. Gwleidydd go-iawn ydwyf fi a gwn fod rhai pethau'n cymryd 20 mlynedd. Mae rhai'n newydd-ddyfodiaid i wleidyddiaeth a chredant nad yw pethau ond yn cymryd pum munud; efallai mai dim ond pum munud y cymer i rai pleidiau yn y Siambr wneud addewidion maniffesto.

The participation of all stakeholders is the key to Communities First and other policies, which seek to offset the effects of social disadvantage and deprivation. Of those stakeholders, none are more important than the local people who live in Wales's most deprived areas, and who have, at long last, been provided with the opportunity to shape their futures and the future of their communities. However, it is futile to offer the opportunity without the means to empower such communities to contribute in a meaningful way. That is why I welcome the review, as it reinforces the central message of Communities First, which is that communities are given the skills that they need to realise the changes that they want and deserve.

Y rhan a gymerir gan yr holl randdeiliaid yw'r allwedd i Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a pholisïau eraill, sy'n ceisio gwneud iawn am effeithiau anfantais gymdeithasol ac amddifadedd. O'r rhanddeiliaid hynny, nid oes neb pwysicach na'r bobl leol sy'n byw yn ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru, ac sydd wedi cael y cyfle, o'r diwedd, i lunio eu dyfodol a dyfodol eu cymunedau. Er hynny, ofer yw cynnig y cyfle heb y modd i alluogi cymunedau o'r fath i gyfrannu mewn modd ystyrlon. Dyna pam y croesawaf yr adolygiad, gan ei fod yn ategu neges ganolog Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, sef bod cymunedau'n cael y sgiliau y mae arnynt eu hangen i gyflawni'r newidiadau y maent yn eu dymuno a'u haeddu.

I will respond to each of the recommendations. Recommendations 2, 4, and 5 are wholly in line with the central principles of Communities First, and that position has been clarified. I agree wholeheartedly with recommendation 1, and that is why the Communities First support network is advising the Assembly on the guidance for drafting capacity-building plans—advice that will also account for the training, development and needs analysis. The dissemination of best practice is fundamental so that all communities can share both the successes and obstacles identified in developing the capacity of individuals, community groups and organisations. In line with recommendation 3, I am pleased to say that progress is being made. The network is already disseminating best practice to partnerships across Wales, and a conference for co-ordinators was held in November 2002, where examples of good practice, capacity building and partnership work from Africa and Latin America were also highlighted.

Ymatebaf i bob un o'r argymhellion. Mae argymhellion 2, 4 a 5 yn gwbl gyson ag egwyddorion canolog Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac eglurwyd y safbwynt hwnnw. Llwyr gytunaf ag argymhelliad 1, a dyna pam y mae rhwydwaith cymorth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cynghori'r Cynulliad ar y canllawiau ar gyfer drafftio cynlluniau meithrin gallu—cyngor a fydd hefyd yn rhoi cyfrif am y dadansoddiad o hyfforddiant, datblygu ac anghenion. Mae'n hanfodol bwysig lledaenu'r arferion gorau fel y gall yr holl gymunedau rannu'r llwyddiannau a'r rhwystrau a ganfuwyd wrth feithrin gallu unigolion, grwpiau cymunedol a chyrff. Yn unol ag argymhelliad 3, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod cynnydd yn digwydd. Mae'r rhwydwaith eisoes yn lledaenu'r arferion gorau ymysg partneriaethau ledled Cymru a chynhaliwyd cynhadledd i gydlynwyr yn Nhachwedd 2002, lle y tynnwyd sylw hefyd at enghreifftiau o arferion da, meithrin gallu a gweithio mewn partneriaeth yn Affrica ac America Ladin.

I recognise the cost implications for

Cydnabyddaf y goblygiadau o ran cost i

volunteers wishing to invest their time and energy into making Communities First a success. That is why I fully support recommendation 6. Partnerships are able to apply for funding to cover volunteer expenses, particularly to provide for childcare services as support for carers and adults. It is important to remember that skills and talents can be developed through a range of ways and means, but we must not discount the value of formal and accredited learning. Work has commenced on realising recommendation 7, and an initial consultation is already underway with a range of interested parties. This has been driven forward with a view to the production of a training and development framework. We have already begun to promote the dissemination of good practice and guidance for local authorities as advocated in recommendation 8. The Communities First local authority guidance was issued in August 2002 and it included advice on capacity development. I am committed to updating this document in the light of experience and our continuing dialogue with the Welsh Local Government Association.

wirfoddolwyr sy'n dymuno rhoi o'u hamser a'u hegni er mwyn llwyddiant Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Dyna pam y llwyr gefnogaf argymhelliad 6. Mae partneriaethau'n gallu ymgeisio am gyllid i gwrdd â threuliau gwirfoddolwyr, yn enwedig i ddarparu ar gyfer gwasanaethau gofal plant fel cymorth i ofalwyr ac oedolion. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod modd meithrin sgiliau a doniau drwy amryw o ddulliau, ond rhaid inni beidio â diystyru gwerth dysgu ffurfiol ac achrededig. Mae gwaith wedi dechrau ar gyflawni argymhelliad 7, ac mae ymgynghoriad cychwynnol yn mynd rhagddo eisoes gydag amryw o rai cysylltiedig. Hyrwyddwyd hyn gyda golwg ar gynhyrchu fframwaith hyfforddi a datblygu. Yr ydym eisoes wedi dechrau hybu'r gwaith o ledaenu arferion da a chanllawiau ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol yn unol ag argymhelliad 8. Cyhoeddwyd y canllawiau ar Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol yn Awst 2002 ac yr oeddent yn cynnwys cyngor ar feithrin gallu. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i ddiweddaru'r ddogfen hon yng ngoleuni profiad a'n deialog barhaus â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru.

Recommendation 9 is more problematic and we need to consider it further. While I agree that we need to ensure value for money and equity, issues of pay and conditions are, in the spirit of Communities First, matters for local determination. However I will look into the possibility of the Wales Council for Voluntary Action and Community Development Cymru consulting with local community groups on a voluntary code for pay and conditions.

Mae argymhelliad 9 yn fwy dadleuol a rhaid inni ei ystyried ymhellach. Er fy mod yn cytuno bod rhaid inni sicrhau gwerth am arian a thegwch, mae materion sy'n ymwneud â thâl ac amodau, yn unol ag ysbryd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, yn rhai sydd i'w penderfynu'n lleol. Er hynny, ymchwiliaf i'r posibilrwydd o gael ymgynghoriad gan Gyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru a Datblygu Cymunedol Cymru â grwpiau cymunedol lleol ar god gwirfoddol ar dâl ac amodau.

On recommendation 10, it does not make sense to ask local partnerships to decide upon funding applications for a range of different funding organisations. However it is clearly in the interests of all partnership members that information about applications should be widely shared between them. I therefore propose to pursue this recommendation by requiring all funding applications to be reported to local partnerships on this basis.

Ynghylch argymhelliad 10, nid yw'n synhwyrol gofyn i bartneriaethau lleol benderfynu ar geisiadau am gyllid ar gyfer amryw o wahanol gyrff cyllido. Er hynny, mae'n amlwg ei bod er budd holl aelodau partneriaeth i wybodaeth am geisiadau gael ei rhannu'n eang yn eu plith. Gan hynny, bwriadaf ddilyn yr argymhelliad hwn drwy fynnu y rhoddir gwybod am bob cais am gyllid i bartneriaethau lleol ar y sail hon.

I am pleased to accept recommendation 11. I can confirm that a draft bursary scheme is being developed which will be finalised by

Yr wyf yn falch o dderbyn argymhelliad 11. Gallaf gadarnhau bod cynllun bwrsari drafft yn cael ei ddatblygu a gaiff ei gwblhau erbyn

the start of the academic year 2003-04. Likewise work has begun in respect of recommendations 12 and 13 and the Assembly Government has already provided funding to a community development training consortium. This body is helping us to map the existing provision.

dechrau'r flwyddyn academaidd 2003-04. Yn yr un modd, mae gwaith wedi dechrau mewn cysylltiad ag argymhellion 12 a 13 ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes wedi darparu cyllid i gonsortiwm hyfforddiant datblygu cymunedol. Mae'r corff hwn yn ein helpu i fapio'r ddarpariaeth bresennol.

I am not able to give my formal consideration in respect of recommendations 14, 15 and 16, given the obvious implications for education providers and institutions. I intend to consult the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning before either accepting or rejecting these suggestions.

Ni allaf roi barn ffurfiol am argymhellion 14, 15 a 16, yng ngolwg y goblygiadau amlwg i ddarparwyr a sefydliadau addysg. Bwriadaf ymgynghori â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes cyn un ai derbyn neu wrthod yr awgrymiadau hyn.

While I accept recommendation 17, since all key authorities, agencies and partnerships have been encouraged to apply for funding to this end, it must be acknowledged that release of staff to undertake training is a matter for the consideration and judgment of individual organisations.

Er fy mod yn derbyn argymhelliad 17, gan fod yr holl awdurdodau, asiantaethau a phartneriaethau allweddol wedi'u hannog i ymgeisio am gyllid i'r diben hwn, rhaid cydnabod mai mater i'w ystyried a'i benderfynu gan gyrff unigol yw rhyddhau staff i ymgymryd â hyfforddiant.

Lastly, I turn to recommendation 18. Communities First is, as you know, a programme that stresses the benefits and advantages of partnership working, bringing together all those bodies and individuals that are able, by way of their skills and experience, to offer unique insights. In this respect I will consider at some future stage the recommendation that the Assembly Government should establish a community regeneration forum, based on those agencies and individuals actively involved in community regeneration throughout Wales. The Assembly already has a core group of community regeneration specialists which is called upon to offer professional advice and guidance and their expertise has been used at all key stages in the development of Communities First.

Yn olaf, trof at argymhelliad 18. Fel y gwyddoch, mae Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn rhaglen sy'n rhoi pwys ar y buddion a'r manteision o weithio mewn partneriaeth, gan gynnull yr holl gyrff ac unigolion hynny sy'n gallu cynnig mewnweliadau unigryw, yn rhinwedd eu sgiliau a'u profiad. Yn hyn o beth, gwnaf ystyried rywbryd yn y dyfodol yr argymhelliad y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sefydlu fforwm adfywio cymunedol, a fyddai'n seiliedig ar yr asiantaethau a'r unigolion hynny sy'n ymwneud yn weithredol ag adfywio cymunedol ledled Cymru. Mae gan y Cynulliad grŵp craidd o arbenigwyr adfywio cymunedol eisoes, y gelwir arno i gynnig cyngor ac arweiniad proffsiynol a gwnaed defnydd o'u harbenigedd ym mhob un o'r cyfnodau allweddol wrth ddatblygu Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: With respect to the regeneration forum, do you believe that culture has an important part to play in regenerating our communities? Has the experience of Glasgow as Cultural Capital of Europe shown that it can be a driver for the regeneration of not only the fabric of society but the economy as well?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mewn cysylltiad â'r fforwm adfywio, a ydych yn credu bod rhan bwysig i'w chwarae gan ddiwylliant yn y gwaith o adfywio ein cymunedau? A yw profiad Glasgow fel Prifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop wedi dangos y gall ysgogi adfywiad, nid yn unig yng ngwead cymdeithas ond yn yr economi hefyd?

Edwina Hart: I agree. I was about to discuss

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn cytuno. Yr oeddwn

your contribution, Rhodri. Thank you for your comments about the communities within your area. In your contribution you illustrated the difficulties of communities that border on Communities First areas and which have integral links with those communities. We will have to do further work to identify further communities to add to the programme. Your point about culture is well made, as was that about what we are doing in rural areas with Communities First and trhough the whole rural regeneration agenda.

ar fin trafod eich cyfraniad, Rhodri. Diolch i chi am eich sylwadau am y cymunedau yn eich ardal. Yn eich cyfraniad gwnaethoch ddisgrifio anawsterau cymunedau sy'n cydffinio ag ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ac sydd â chysylltiadau annatod â'r cymunedau hynny. Bydd yn rhaid inni wneud gwaith pellach i ddynodi cymunedau pellach i'w hychwanegu at y rhaglen. Yr oedd y pwynt a wnaethoch am ddiwylliant yn un da, fel yr oedd yr un am yr hyn a wnawn mewn ardaloedd gwledig drwy Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a thrwy'r agenda adfywio gwledig drwyddi draw.

I am grateful for all the work that the Local Government and Housing Committee has undertaken. I commend the Chair, the Committee members, the Committee Secretariat, Professor Adamson and all those involved. I will give a much more formal response on the policy review of community regeneration to the Committee.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr holl waith a wnaeth y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai. Canmolaf y Cadeirydd, aelodau'r Pwyllgor, Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Pwyllgor, yr Athro Adamson a phawb a fu'n gysylltiedig. Rhoddaf ymateb mwy ffurfiol o lawer ar yr adolygiad polisi o adfywio cymunedol i'r Pwyllgor.

I value these reports. They give an insight and perspective different from that of Ministers. I am always prepared to take the recommendations on board if they add to discussion and debate. I hope that, in the long run, I will be able to accept all of the report's recommendations, not just those I spoke about today. It is important that Communities First is a 20-year programme. It is not a quick fix that will sort out problems in four years or so. We might, however, see some improvements in 10 years. We have to have guts as politicians to follow this through. It is easy to make decisions about handing out money when you gain a glossy initiative, but is hard to decide that you cannot give out money this year but you can next year. We have to deal with this systematically.

Rhoddaf werth mawr ar yr adroddiadau hyn. Cynigiant fewnwelediad a safbwynt gwahanol i rai'r Gweinidogion. Yr wyf bob amser yn barod i ystyried yr argymhellion os ydynt yn cyfoethogi'r trafod a'r dadlau. Gobeithiaf y byddaf yn gallu derbyn holl argymhellion yr adroddiad, yn y tymor hir, nid yn unig y rhai y cyfeiriais atynt heddiw. Mae'n bwysig cofio mai rhaglen 20 mlynedd o hyd yw Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Nid ateb sydyn ydyw a fydd yn datrys problemau o fewn rhyw bedair blynedd. Er hynny, efallai y gwelwn rai gwelliannau ymhen 10 mlynedd. Rhaid inni fod yn ddigon dewr fel gwleidyddion i ddilyn hyn i'r pen. Digon hawdd yw penderfynu ynghylch rhannu arian pan gewch fenter sgleiniog yn gyfnewid amdano, ond anodd yw penderfynu na allwch rannu arian y flwyddyn hon ond y gallwch y flwyddyn nesaf. Rhaid inni ymdrin â hyn yn systematig.

On comments about money being distributed late, December was early enough. If Rhondda Cynon Taf local authority cannot manage matters better, that is not a matter for me.

Ar sylwadau am ddosbarthu arian yn hwyr, yr oedd Rhagfyr yn ddigon buan. Os na all awdurdod lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf gadw gwell trefn ar ei bethau, nid yw hynny'n fater i mi.

4.10 p.m.

Gwenda Thomas: To recap, Janet Ryder

Gwenda Thomas: Er mwyn atgrynhoi,

emphasised the need for childcare and I agree with that. She also talked about credit unions, of which we have excellent examples in Wales; Peter Law mentioned Blaenau Gwent, and I know that the Llynfi Valley Credit Union is extending. Janet discussed the co-ordinating role of partnerships and the importance of recognising informal learning. Eleanor Burnham mentioned the importance of investment in communities, recognising the voluntary sector, childcare, and the effect of debt on society. William Graham was not altogether negative. He discussed the need to simplify the funding process, the need to value and properly remunerate community workers, the Welsh Local Government Association's crucial role in developing guidance for local authorities, the importance of training community workers, and accrediting training courses.

gwnaeth Janet Ryder bwysleisio'r angen am ofal plant a chytunaf â hynny. Soniodd hefyd am undebau credyd, y mae gennym enghreifftiau rhagorol ohonynt yng Nghymru; cyfeiriodd Peter Law at Flaenau Gwent, a gwn fod Undeb Credyd Cwm Llynfi yn ehangu. Gwnaeth Janet drafod y rôl o gydlynu sydd gan bartneriaethau ac mor bwysig yw cydnabod dysgu anffurfiol. Cyfeiriodd Eleanor Burnham at bwysigrwydd buddsoddi mewn cymunedau, gan gydnabod y sector gwirfoddol, gofal plant, ac effaith dyled ar gymdeithas. Nid oedd William Graham yn gwbl negyddol. Trafododd yr angen am symleiddio'r broses cyllido, yr angen i roi gwerth ar weithwyr cymunedol a'u talu'n briodol, y rôl hollbwysig sydd gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn y gwaith o ddatblygu canllawiau i awdurdodau lleol, y pwysigrwydd o hyfforddi gweithwyr cymunedol, ac achredu cyrsiau hyfforddi.

Janice Gregory mentioned the commitment and effort that already exist in communities and I agree that local schools and businesses should be involved. Geraint Davies talked about the need to attract and retain community regeneration staff. Part 1 of the Committee's review identified the need to simplify the funding process and the Minister accepted that recommendation. Peter Law talked about the importance of capacity building and recognised that excellent examples of community regeneration already exist.

Cyfeiriodd Janice Gregory at yr ymroddiad a'r ymdrech a geir eisoes mewn cymunedau a chytunaf y dylai ysgolion a busnesau lleol gymryd rhan. Soniodd Geraint Davies am yr angen i ddenu a chadw staff adfywio cymunedol. Yn y rhan gyntaf o adolygiad y Pwyllgor, nodwyd yr angen i symleiddio'r broses cyllido a derbyniodd y Gweinidog yr argymhelliad hwnnw. Soniodd Peter Law am y pwysigrwydd o feithrin gallu a chydnabu fod enghreifftiau rhagorol o adfywio cymunedol i'w cael eisoes.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas, bu ichi sôn am yr her i'r dyfodol. Cytunaf, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn fwy nag abl i gwrdd â'r her honno. Cytunaf fod dilyniant a diwylliant yn hollbwysig ac mae esiamplau gwych o hynny mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru. Mae Steer Multimedia Studios, er enghraifft, yn gwneud gwaith o'r fath ac mae pobl ifanc yn cyfranogi ohono.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas, you mentioned the challenge for the future. I agree, but I am sure that we will be more than capable of meeting that challenge. I agree that continuity and culture are essential and there are excellent examples of that in communities throughout Wales. For example, Steer Multimedia Studios does such work, and young people participate in it.

In carrying out the review, the Committee wrote to over 100 organisations, inviting them to comment. It received 25 written responses, oral evidence from seven additional sources, and visited nine projects in Wales and Ireland. It strikes me that the points made in the evidence received have been repeated this afternoon. The report has 18 recommendations and I am grateful to the

Wrth gyflawni'r adolygiad, ysgrifennodd y Pwyllgor at fwy na 100 o gyrff, gan eu gwahodd i gyflwyno eu sylwadau. Cafodd 25 o ymatebion ysgrifenedig, tystiolaeth lafar oddi wrth saith ffynhonnell ychwanegol, ac ymwelodd â naw prosiect yng Nghymru ac Iwerddon. Mae'n fy nharo bod y pwyntiau a wnaed yn y dystiolaeth a gafwyd wedi'u hailadrodd y prynhawn yma. Mae 18 o

Minister for responding to the report today. We will also receive a written response, which we will be able to read in detail. Minister, you seem to think that there would be a benefit from funding applications being taken through local partnerships and I agree with that. I am sure that the Committee will follow progress on these matters with interest.

argymhellion yn yr adroddiad ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ymateb i'r adroddiad heddiw. Byddwn hefyd yn cael ymateb ysgrifenedig, y byddwn yn gallu ei ddarllen yn ofalus. Weinidog, ymddengys eich bod yn credu y byddai'n fuddiol mynd â cheisiadau am gyllid drwy bartneriaethau lleol a chytunaf â hynny. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Pwyllgor yn dilyn y cynnydd ar y materion hyn gyda diddordeb.

Cynnig (NDM1420): O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1420): For 34, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

Adroddiad Interim y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar Ysgolion y Dyfodol
The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's Interim Report on Schools of the Future

Gareth Jones: Cynigiaf fod

Gareth Jones: I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi'r adroddiad gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes o'r enw 'Ysgol y Dyfodol: Adroddiad Interim' a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau drwy'r e-bost ar 18 Mawrth 2003. (NNDM1419)

the National Assembly for Wales notes the report of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee entitled 'School of the Future: Interim Report' which was e-mailed to Members on 18 March 2003. (NNDM1419)

Y mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ar ran y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Dyma'r chweched adolygiad polisi i'r Pwyllgor presennol ei gynnal, a'r olaf. Diolch o galon i bawb a rannodd eu syniadau gyda'r Pwyllgor, yn enwedig y disgyblion a ddaeth â'u hawgrymiadau atom, naill ai'n bersonol, neu drwy eu cynghorau ysgol. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn arbennig o awyddus i glywed barn dysgwyr ac mae safon ac ansawdd yr ymatebion wedi codi ein calonnau ni oll. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i Aelodau'r Pwyllgor am eu gwaith caled ac i aelodau'r grwpiau llywio allanol am eu cyngor a'u cefnogaeth. Rhaid diolch yn arbennig i ysgrifenyddiaeth y Pwyllgor, sef y clerc, Chris Reading, y dirprwy glerc, Holly Pembridge, a'r swyddog gweinyddol, Gareth Woodhead. Maent wedi gwneud gwaith arbennig yn ôl amserlen dynn ac yr wyf yn eu llongyfarch. Diolchaf iddynt am fod yr adroddiad ar gael i ni erbyn 10 a.m. heddiw.

I am pleased to present this report to Plenary on behalf of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. This is the sixth, and final, policy review to be conducted by the present Committee. I thank everyone who shared their ideas with the Committee, especially the pupils who presented their suggestions to us, either in person, or through their school councils. The Committee was especially keen to hear from learners and the standard and quality of the responses has heartened us all. I would also like to thank the Members of the Committee for their hard work and the members of the external steering groups for their advice and support. Also, I give particular thanks to the Committee Secretariat, the clerk, Chris Reading, the deputy clerk, Holly Pembridge, and the administrative officer, Gareth Woodhead. They have accomplished excellent work within a tight deadline and I congratulate them. I thank them for making the report available to us at 10 a.m. today.

Mae'r Pwyllgor yn cydnabod bod safonau a pherfformiad ein hysgolion wedi codi yn sylweddol yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, a llongyfarchaf y disgyblion a'u hathrawon am hynny. Er hynny, mae'r Pwyllgor yn teimlo bod lle i sawl agwedd ar ddysgu ac addysgu wella eto: cau'r bwlch rhwng yr ysgolion sy'n cyflawni orau a'r rhai sy'n cyflawni waethaf; trechu dadrithiad, absenoldebau a chyrhaeddiad isel ymhlith disgyblion sydd wedi'u hamddifadu'n gymdeithasol neu sy'n dioddef oherwydd problemau eraill; hwyluso'r broses i ddisgyblion sy'n symud o'r ysgol gynradd i'r ysgol uwchradd; rhoi'r un parch a bri i ddysgu ac addysgu galwedigaethol ag a roddir i'r ochr academaidd; dyfeisio dulliau gwell o fesur cyrhaeddiad; a denu pobl o bob oedran i fanteisio ar gyfleoedd dysgu gydol oes.

The Committee acknowledges that our schools' standards and performance have improved considerably over the last few years, and I congratulate the pupils and their teachers on that. However, the Committee feels that there is room for further improvement on several aspects of education and learning: in narrowing the gap between the highest and lowest achieving schools; overcoming disaffection, absenteeism and low achievement among pupils who are socially disadvantaged or who have other problems; facilitating the process of pupil transfer from primary to secondary education; according vocational education and learning the same respect and esteem as that accorded to the academic side; devising better means of measuring attainment; and attracting people of all ages to take advantage of lifelong learning opportunities.

Ym marn y Pwyllgor, yr allwedd i wella dysgu ac addysgu dros y 15 mlynedd nesaf

In the Committee's opinion, the key to better education and learning over the next 15 years

yw sicrhau bod yr ysgol yn rhan ganolog o'i chymuned. Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at weledigaeth y Pwyllgor a ddisgrifir ym mhennod 2 yr adroddiad. Nid ydym yn argymell newid sydyn. Rhaid i'r broses o newid fynd yn ei blaen fesul cam, a rhaid ei rheoli'n dda rhag tarfu ar ddisgyblion ac athrawon. Mae Deddf Addysg 2002 yn rhoi cyfle inni ddechrau ar y broses hon o newid. Er enghraifft, gellid rhoi pŵer i gyrff llywodraethu ddarparu gwasanaethau i'w cymunedau lleol, a gellid ei gwneud yn ofynnol i ysgolion uwchradd a'u hysgolion bwydo hwyluso'r broses o symud o'r cynradd i'r uwchradd—cyfnod pwysig yng ngyrfa disgyblion fel dysgwyr.

is to ensure that schools become a central part of communities. I refer you to the Committee's vision, as set out in chapter 2 of the report. We do not recommend a sudden change. The process of change must be taken forward a step at a time, and it must be well managed to avoid disrupting pupils and teachers. The Education Act 2002 provides us with an opportunity to commence this process of change. For example, governing bodies could be given the power to provide services to their local communities, and it could be made a requirement for secondary schools and their feeder schools to facilitate the process of transferring pupils from primary to secondary education during this important period in their learning careers.

Mae'r Pwyllgor yn cydnabod bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes wedi dechrau braenaru'r tir i'r dyfodol. Enghraifft o hyn yw'r ymgynghori diweddar ar y cynigion i newid y cwricwlwm ar gyfer y rhai 14 i 19 oed a'r adroddiad diweddar gan y gweithgor cau'r bwlch.

The Committee acknowledges that the Assembly Government has begun preparing the ground for the future. An example of this is the recent consultation on the proposals to change the curriculum for 14 to 19-year-olds and the recent report by the narrowing the gap working group.

Mae'r Pwyllgor yn credu y bydd ysgol y dyfodol yn chwarae rhan bwysig o ran creu a chynnal Cymru ddwyieithog drwy gynyddu cyfleoedd i ddysgu a defnyddio'r Gymraeg. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn cydnabod gwaith ardderchog Estyn ar y ddau adroddiad diweddar: 'Ysgolion Rhagorol—Gweledigaeth ar gyfer Ysgolion yng Nghymru yn y 21ain Ganrif' ac 'Anelu at Ragoriaeth yng Nghyfnod Allweddol 3'. Rhaid i bawb sy'n gysylltiedig â rheoli a chynllunio ysgol y dyfodol gydweithio os ydym am weld llwyddiant. Mae'r adolygiad polisi hwn wedi dangos bod y cyrff perthnasol, gan gynnwys awdurdodau addysg lleol, athrawon, rhieni, llywodraethwyr ac undebau, yn barod i weithio gyda'i gilydd i gyflawni'r nod hwn. Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi paratoi glasbrint ar gyfer ysgol y dyfodol. Wedi'r etholiadau, gobeithiaf yr aiff y Pwyllgor priodol â'n gwaith yn ei flaen, yn enwedig y polisïau a ddisgrifir ym mhennod 5 yr adroddiad.

The Committee believes that the school of the future will play an important role in creating and sustaining a bilingual Wales by increasing the opportunities to learn and use Welsh. The Committee recognises Estyn's excellent work on its two recent reports: 'Excellent Schools—A Vision for Schools in Wales in the 21st Century' and 'Aiming for Excellence in Key Stage 3'. Co-operation must be secured among those responsible for managing and planning the school of the future if we are to be successful. This policy review has shown that relevant bodies, including the local education authorities, teachers, parents, governors and unions, are willing to work together to reach this goal. The Committee has prepared a blueprint for the school of the future. After the elections, I hope that the relevant Committee will take our work forward, particularly the policies outlined in chapter 5 of the report.

Sylweddolaf na fydd gan y Gweinidog cyfredol ddigon o amser i roi ymateb llawn i argymhellion yr adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, wedi'r etholiad, gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog priodol gyflwyno adroddiad i'r

I realise that the current Minister will not have sufficient time to provide a full response to the report's recommendations. However, after the election, I hope that the relevant Minister will present a report to Plenary on

Cyfarfod Llawn ar ymateb Llywodraeth newydd y Cynulliad—edrychaf ymlaen yn eiddgar at ei glywed. Ar ran y Pwyllgor, cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn i'r Gweinidog ac i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

the new Assembly Government's response—I look forward to hearing it. On behalf of the Committee, I commend this report to the Minister and to the Welsh Assembly Government.

Janice Gregory: As a member of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, it has been a pleasure to participate in this review. I thank all those involved, from our secretariat to the many organisations that have presented evidence to us. I particularly commend the children and young people who gave evidence. It was, perhaps, their words that offered the greatest insight into the workings of the education system today, and their ideas and imagination that pointed to the greatest innovation for the future. Our young people have a wealth of talent and potential. We should never forget that the education system exists to turn this talent into opportunity and success. These young people, guided by teachers and parents, achieve greater success each year, but some still leave school without qualifications. The system has not worked for them: disaffected, they are not achieving their full potential. As long as people slip through the net, we must be prepared to take a long, hard look at how the education system is operating and to make changes where necessary. This review gives us that opportunity. I am glad that it recognises education's crucial role in tackling social disadvantage. Education is perhaps the greatest liberator. It can give people from all walks of life and backgrounds the opportunity to fulfil their true potential. I am glad, therefore that Welsh Labour is committed to a comprehensive education system that delivers for all.

Janice Gregory: Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, bu'n bleser cymryd rhan yn yr adolygiad hwn. Diolchaf i bawb a fu'n gysylltiedig, o'n hysgrifenyddiaeth i'r nifer fawr o gyrff a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth i ni. Canmolaf yn arbennig y plant a phobl ifanc a roddodd dystiolaeth. Eu geiriau hwy, o bosibl, a gynigiai'r mewnwelediad mwyaf i weithrediad y system addysg heddiw, a'u syniadau a'u dychymyg hwy a ddangosai'r ffordd at yr arloesi mwyaf ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae ein pobl ifanc yn meddu ar stôr o ddoniau a photensial. Ni ddylem byth anghofio mai diben y system addysg yw troi'r doniau hyn yn gyfle ac yn llwyddiant. Mae'r bobl ifanc hyn, dan arweiniad athrawon a rhieni, yn cyflawni mwy bob blwyddyn, ond mae rhai'n gadael yr ysgol heb gymwysterau o hyd. Nid yw'r system wedi gweithio yn eu hachos hwy: a hwythau'n anfoddog, nid ydynt yn cyflawni eu holl botensial. Cyhyd ag y bydd rhai'n disgyn drwy'r rhwyd, rhaid inni fod yn barod i fwrw golwg hir a manwl ar y modd y mae'r system addysg yn gweithredu a gwneud newidiadau pan fo angen. Mae'r adolygiad hwn yn rhoi inni'r cyfle hwnnw. Yr wyf yn falch ei fod yn cydnabod y rôl hanfodol sydd i addysg yn y gwaith o fynd i'r afael ag anfantais gymdeithasol. Addysg yw'r rhyddhäwr mwyaf, o bosibl. Gall roi cyfle i bobl o bob cefndir gyflawni eu gwir botensial. Yr wyf yn falch, felly, fod Llafur Cymru wedi ymrwymo i system addysg gyfun sy'n bodloni anghenion pawb.

4.20 p.m.

A one-size-fits-all system, however, does not enable all young people to fulfil their potential. I am glad, therefore, that the report mentions parity of esteem between academic and vocational qualifications, and giving learners a broader range of skills and experiences. I am pleased that the report advocates a community focus. The concept of a school that serves the community and is

Fodd bynnag, nid yw system sy'n cynnig yr un peth i bawb yn galluogi pob person ifanc i gyflawni ei botensial. Yr wyf yn falch, gan hynny, fod yr adroddiad yn sôn am barch cyffelyb at gymwysterau academaidd a galwedigaethol, a chynnig mwy o amrediad o sgiliau a phrofiadau i ddysgwyr. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr adroddiad o blaid canolbwyntio ar y gymuned. Mae'r cysyniad o ysgol sy'n

part of, and at one with, that community, is innovative and, at the same time, in keeping with the best of our traditions. My only concern is that school facilities that are open to the whole community should not compete with pre-existing community facilities. The two should co-operate to achieve shared goals. If we embark upon this process in Wales, it may be revolutionary, but it will certainly be evolutionary. As technology, new ideas, children, young people and their needs develop, we politicians must be ready to develop with them. If we truly wish to create a school of the future, it must be one that will adapt to these demands with innovation and sensitivity. The best lesson that we can teach a child is how to learn, and the best way to create the school of the future is to enable schools to face the future and to confront the challenges that it poses.

gwasanaethu'r gymuned ac yn rhan ohoni, ac yn gytûn â hi, yn un arloesol ac yn gydnaws hefyd â'n traddodiadau gorau. Yr unig bryder sydd gennyf yw na ddylid cael cystadlu rhwng cyfleusterau ysgol sy'n agored i'r gymuned gyfan a chyfleusterau sy'n bod yn y gymuned eisoes. Dylai'r ddau gydweithredu er mwyn cyrraedd nodau a gytunwyd. Os cychwynwn ar y broses hon yng Nghymru, gallai fod yn chwyldroadol, ond bydd yn sicr o fod yn esblygiadol. Wrth i dechnoleg, syniadau newydd, plant, pobl ifanc a'u hanghenion ddatblygu, rhaid i ni'r gwleidyddion fod yn barod i ddatblygu gyda hwy. Os ydym yn gwir ddymuno creu ysgol y dyfodol, rhaid iddi fod yn un a fydd yn ymaddasu i'r gofynion hyn mewn modd arloesol a sensitif. Y wers orau y gallwn ei dysgu i blentyn yw sut i ddysgu, a'r modd gorau i greu ysgol y dyfodol yw galluogi ysgolion i wynebu'r dyfodol a'r heriau y mae'n eu cynnig.

William Graham: On behalf of our education spokesperson, Jonathan Morgan, who is unavailable, I congratulate the Chair on his handling of this review, which was particularly difficult and involved much stargazing into the future. We welcome the degree of consensus, but note some issues of concern. A specific concern is the role of the teacher. The Government will need to focus on problems with teacher recruitment. Many young people are deterred from entering the teaching profession because of issues such as workload, professional development and classroom discipline, which is, perhaps, increasingly important in schools. We should never forget that teachers are there to teach or, more specifically, to encourage pupils to learn.

William Graham: Ar ran ein llefarydd ar addysg, Jonathan Morgan, nad yw ar gael, llongyfarchaf y Cadeirydd ar ei ddull o drafod yr adolygiad hwn, a oedd yn un arbennig o anodd ac yn golygu llawer o ddyfalu ynghylch y dyfodol. Croesawn y graddau o gonsensws a gafwyd, ond nodwn rai materion sy'n peri pryder. Un mater sy'n peri pryder penodol yw rôl yr athro. Bydd rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ganolbwyntio ar broblemau a geir wrth recriwtio athrawon. Caiff llawer o bobl ifanc eu digalonni rhag mynd yn athrawon oherwydd materion fel y llwyth gwaith, datblygu proffesiynol a disgyblaeth yn yr ystafell ddosbarth, sy'n fwyfwy pwysig mewn ysgolion, o bosibl. Ni ddylem byth anghofio mai pwrpas athrawon yw dysgu neu, yn fwy penodol, annog disgyblion i ddysgu.

In terms of governance, the Welsh Conservatives are disappointed that the Committee did not think outside the local authority box. The report foresees a major role for local education authorities in 15 years' time, but has failed to think outside the current model of LEA control. The Government must also convince the education service to commit to providing adequate finance to enable ICT to perform its role.

O ran llywodraethu, mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn siomedig am na wnaeth y Pwyllgor feddwl y tu allan i gyd-destun yr awdurdod lleol. Mae'r adroddiad yn rhagweld y bydd rôl bwysig i awdurdodau addysg lleol ymhen 15 mlynedd, ond methodd â meddwl y tu allan i gyd-destun y model presennol o reolaeth gan AALl. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ddarbwyllo'r gwasanaeth addysg hefyd i neilltuo digon o gyllid fel y gall TGCh gyflawni ei rôl.

Item 3.16 in the report states that:

Mae eitem 3.16 yn yr adroddiad yn datgan bod:

‘Girls currently out-perform boys in almost all areas of the curriculum, particularly in languages. Again the reasons are complex. This gender imbalance appears to be reversed when it comes to finding rewarding jobs and careers.’

‘Ar hyn o bryd mae merched yn perfformio’n well na bechgyn ym mhob agwedd ar y cwricwlwm bron, yn enwedig ieithoedd. Unwaith eto, mae’r rhesymau’n gymhleth. Mae’r anghyfartaledd hwn rhwng y ddau ryw fel pe bai’n cael ei wrthdroi pan ddaw’n fater o ddod o hyd i swyddi a gyrfaoedd da.’

I recommend that the Committee take evidence on this matter, as these issues must be addressed. Schools can help by breaking down gender stereotypes in the curriculum and by providing adequate careers advice.

Yr wyf yn argymell y dylai’r Pwyllgor gymryd tystiolaeth ar y mater hwn, oherwydd rhaid ymdrin â’r materion hyn. Gall ysgolion fod o gymorth drwy chwalu stereoteipio yn ôl rhyw yn y cwricwlwm a thrwy ddarparu cyngor digonol ar yrfaoedd.

We particularly welcome the greater use of school buildings as a community resource. Members will recall that a pilot scheme was undertaken on this issue in Monmouthshire in the 1930s. The use of school buildings has many implications for both management and staffing. These implications must be addressed, particularly where small primary schools require resources. The proposal to use school buildings as a community resource has long been a feature of Conservative local government election manifestos and was rejected many times because of an inability to provide adequate financing to open the schools outside the usual hours. Such is the enormous capital investment in schools that they should be available for community use throughout the year, not just in term time.

Croesawn yn arbennig y defnydd helaethach o adeiladau ysgol fel adnodd cymunedol. Bydd Aelodau’n cofio bod cynllun peilot wedi’i gynnal ar y mater hwn yn Sir Fynwy yn y 1930au. Mae’r defnydd o adeiladau ysgol yn creu llawer o oblygiadau o ran rheoli a staffio. Rhaid ymdrin â’r goblygiadau hyn, yn enwedig pan fo ar ysgolion cynradd bach angen adnoddau. Mae’r bwriad i ddefnyddio adeiladau ysgol fel adnodd cymunedol yn rhan o faniffestos etholiad llywodraeth leol y Ceidwadwyr ers talwm ac fe’i gwrthodwyd lawer gwaith am na ellid darparu digon o gyllid i agor yr ysgolion y tu allan i’r oriau arferol. Gymaint yw’r buddsoddiad o gyfalaf mewn ysgolion fel y dylent fod ar gael i’w defnyddio gan y gymuned drwy gydol y flwyddyn, nid yn ystod y tymhorau ysgol yn unig.

Finally, there seems to be little in this report on the future of the independent sector. You will know that this is the way in which education was first introduced to all members of society a few centuries ago. Those schools were often church schools. Today, schools are primarily funded by the state but the independent sector should not be forgotten and I have no doubt that, in 15 years’ time, the independent sector will be as strong as it is today, if not stronger.

Yn olaf, ymddengys mai ychydig sydd yn yr adroddiad hwn am ddyfodol y sector annibynnol. Gwyddoch mai dyma’r modd y cyflwynid addysg i bob aelod o gymdeithas rai canrifoedd yn ôl. Ysgolion eglwys oedd llawer o’r ysgolion hynny. Heddiw, caiff ysgolion eu cyllido gan y wladwriaeth yn bennaf ond ni ddylid anghofio’r sector annibynnol ac nid wyf yn amau na fydd y sector annibynnol cyn gryfed ymhen 15 mlynedd ag ydyw heddiw, os nad yn gryfach.

Peter Black: I was not involved in the review, but I know from my experience as a school governor, and as an elected representative for nearly 19 years, how

Peter Black: Nid fûm yn gysylltiedig â’r adolygiad, ond gwn o’m profiad fel llywodraethwr ysgol, ac fel cynrychiolydd etholedig ers ymron 19 blynedd, mor ganolog

central the school's role is to the community, and how much potential schools have to contribute to community development. The concept of the community school fits well with the National Assembly's four main themes of social inclusion, equality of opportunity, sustainable development and bilingualism.

yw rôl yr ysgol yn y gymuned, a chymaint y gall ysgolion ei gyfrannu at ddatblygu cymunedol. Mae'r cysyniad o ysgol gymunedol yn cydweddu'n dda â phedair prif thema'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o gynhwysiant cymdeithasol, cyfle cyfartal, datblygu cynaliadwy a dwyieithrwydd.

It will become increasingly important for schools to develop partnerships within local communities. The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that these partners will act as agents for change, bringing new experiences and perspectives for teaching and learning. In partnership with the school of which I am governor, NTL provided a new multi-purpose hall, which was important and useful in the school's development.

Bydd yn fwyfwy pwysig i ysgolion ddatblygu partneriaethau o fewn cymunedau lleol. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn credu y bydd y partneriaid hyn yn gweithredu fel cyfryngau i newid, gan gyflwyno profiadau a safbwyntiau newydd ar gyfer dysgu ac addysgu. Mewn partneriaeth â'r ysgol yr wyf yn llywodraethwr arni, gwnaeth NTL ddarparu neuadd amlbwrpas newydd, a fu'n bwysig ac yn fuddiol yn natblygiad yr ysgol.

We believe that schools in the future should provide childcare and nursery provision on-site, to facilitate family learning. We also believe that schools should remain open throughout the year and for longer hours than at present. The report recommends that school facilities should be made more available to individuals and groups. I welcome the steps that have been taken in this regard in many Welsh local authorities, but much more needs to be done if we are to open schools up to the community and gain a greater acceptance of community use.

Credwn y dylai ysgolion ddarparu gofal plant a chyfleusterau meithrinfa ar y safle yn y dyfodol, er mwyn hwyluso dysgu gan deuluoedd. Credwn hefyd y dylai ysgolion aros yn agored drwy gydol y flwyddyn ac am fwy o oriau nag y maent ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymell y dylid darparu cyfleusterau ysgol ar gyfer unigolion a grwpiau. Croesawaf y camau a gymerwyd yn hyn o beth gan lawer o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, ond rhaid gwneud llawer mwy eto os ydym i agor ysgolion a pheri i ddefnydd gan y gymuned fod yn fwy derbyniol.

As money becomes available as a result of Welsh Assembly Government policies, new schools are being built. It is essential that new school buildings are imaginatively designed, and those who use them should be involved in their design, to accommodate the staff facilities and equipment necessary to provide the range of services which were referred to earlier. These new school buildings should set an example in terms of energy efficiency, local procurement and community use.

Wrth i arian ddod i law o ganlyniad i bolisïau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, codir ysgolion newydd. Mae'n hollbwysig i adeiladau ysgol newydd gael eu cynllunio mewn modd llawn dychymyg, a dylai'r rhai sy'n eu defnyddio gymryd rhan yn y gwaith o'u cynllunio, er mwyn darparu ar gyfer y cyfleusterau staff a'r offer sydd eu hangen i gynnig yr amrediad o wasanaethau y cyfeiriwyd ato'n gynharach. Dylai'r adeiladau ysgol newydd hyn fod yn esiampl o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni, caffael lleol a defnydd gan y gymuned.

Many of our existing school buildings have use problems in terms of investment. I welcome the additional money that the Welsh Assembly Government has invested in this. Much more needs to be done but this investment is beginning to make a difference

Ceir problemau yng nghyd-destun buddsoddi wrth ddefnyddio llawer o'n hadeiladau ysgol presennol. Croesawaf yr arian ychwanegol y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i fuddsoddi yn hyn. Rhaid gwneud llawer mwy eto ond mae'r buddsoddiad hwn yn dechrau

on the ground, as schools are able to make improvements to their buildings. If we can sustain that initiative and focus those resources in the correct way, those school buildings will continue to be improved to modern standards.

gwneud gwahaniaeth yn lleol, gan fod ysgolion yn gallu gwella eu hadeiladau. Os gallwn barhau â'r fenter honno a chyfeirio'r adnoddau hynny'n gywir, parheir i wella'r adeiladau ysgol hynny fel eu bod yn cyrraedd safonau modern.

Schools should take more account of local needs and circumstances in developing a broad and stimulating curriculum that is co-ordinated by the National Assembly for Wales and other relevant agencies. Testing will still be required in the school of the future. The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that this should be used as a tool to help students to learn rather than set up as an obstacle to be overcome. This is important, particularly in terms of the debate on the future of key stage tests in primary and comprehensive schools.

Dylai ysgolion roi mwy o ystyriaeth i anghenion ac amgylchiadau lleol wrth ddatblygu cwricwlwm eang a chyffrous a gydlynir gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ac asiantaethau perthnasol eraill. Bydd angen profion o hyd yn ysgol y dyfodol. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn credu y dylid eu defnyddio fel offeryn i helpu myfyrwyr i ddysgu yn hytrach na'u gosod fel rhwystr i'w oresgyn. Mae hynny'n bwysig, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun y ddadl ar ddyfodol profion cyfnod allweddol mewn ysgolion cynradd a chyfun.

The most effective schools are those with a knowledge and understanding of their current strengths and weaknesses and a clear vision of where they are going. We feel that self-evaluation should be a crucial component of the school of the future. I have visited schools in my region and have discussed the inspection process with headteachers. I hope that the inspection regime will evolve along the lines of the Best Value regime, which puts a much greater emphasis on self-evaluation and risk management and is changing practice in local councils. This would enable headteachers to work in partnership with inspectors to improve the school, rather than having to undergo a sustained period of inspection, which can affect teacher morale as well as the efficient running of the school. That is a much more constructive approach for the future, and I hope that, as we develop our policies on inspection, we will be able to work along those lines.

Yr ysgolion mwyaf effeithiol yw'r rhai sy'n meddu ar wybodaeth a dealltwriaeth am eu cryfderau a'u gwendidau presennol a gweledigaeth bendant o ran eu cyfeiriad. Teimlwn y dylai hunanwerthuso fod yn elfen hanfodol yn ysgol y dyfodol. Yr wyf wedi ymweld ag ysgolion yn fy rhanbarth ac wedi trafod y broses arolygu gyda pheniaethiaid. Hyderaf y bydd y gyfundrefn arolygu'n datblygu'n debyg i'r gyfundrefn Gwerth Gorau, sy'n rhoi mwy o bwyslais o lawer ar hunanwerthuso a rheoli risg ac yn newid arferion mewn cynghorau lleol. Byddai hynny'n galluogi penaethiaid ysgol i weithio mewn partneriaeth ag arolygwyr i wella'r ysgol, yn hytrach na gorfod mynd drwy gyfnod hir o arolygu, sy'n gallu effeithio ar forâl athrawon yn ogystal â'r gallu i redeg yr ysgol yn effeithlon. Mae hynny'n ddull gweithredu mwy adeiladol o lawer ar gyfer y dyfodol, a gobeithiaf, wrth inni ddatblygu ein polisïau ar arolygu, y byddwn yn gallu gweithio mewn modd tebyg i hynny.

I know that the Committee firmly believes that teachers will continue to play a crucial role in the successful operation of the school of the future. While the Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that the teacher's main role will continue to be to direct pupils' learning, we consider that the teachers of the future will need to broaden their range of skills and expertise. Continuing professional development for teachers will become

Gwn fod y Pwyllgor yn credu'n gryf y bydd athrawon yn dal i chwarae rôl hanfodol wrth redeg ysgol y dyfodol yn llwyddiannus. Er bod Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn credu mai prif rôl yr athro o hyd fydd dysgu disgyblion yn uniongyrchol, yr ydym o'r farn y bydd athrawon y dyfodol yn gorfod meddu ar sgiliau ac arbenigedd mwy amrywiol. Bydd datblygu proffesiynol parhaus ar gyfer athrawon yn fwyfwy pwysig, yn enwedig yng

increasingly important, especially in information and communications technology. I have visited schools in my region, and seen that they have had different experiences with the electronic whiteboard initiative. One school had embraced the initiative, had bought five or six additional whiteboards and had made them a central feature of the learning experience. In another school, less than five miles away, the whiteboard was still in its box. Another school had only one whiteboard and was struggling to make it work. We need to find time for teachers to train and develop without increasing the burden of their work. We must ensure that they do not struggle with increasing paperwork and pressure.

nghyd-destun technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Yr wyf wedi ymweld ag ysgolion yn fy rhanbarth i, ac wedi gweld bod eu profiadau o'r fenter byrddau gwyn electronig yn amrywio. Yr oedd un ysgol wedi croesawu'r fenter, ac wedi prynu pump neu chwe bwrdd gwyn ychwanegol ac wedi rhoi lle canolog iddynt yn y profiad dysgu. Mewn ysgol arall, lai na phum milltir i ffwrdd, yr oedd y bwrdd gwyn yn ei flwch o hyd. Dim ond un bwrdd gwyn a oedd gan ysgol arall ac yr oedd yn ei chael yn anodd ei weithio. Rhaid inni ganfod amser i athrawon gael hyfforddi a datblygu heb gynyddu eu baich gwaith. Rhaid inni sicrhau nad ydynt yn gorfod ymgodymu â mwy o waith papur a mwy o bwysau.

4.30 p.m.

Cynog Dafis: Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb sydd wedi helpu i baratoi'r adroddiad hwn, a chyfeiriaf yn arbennig at y grŵp cyfeirio sydd wedi bod ynghlwm â'r mater. Ar gyfer y adroddiad hwn, grŵp cyfeirio a gafwyd yn hytrach nag ymgynghorydd arbenigol. Mae'n drawiadol y ceir cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i'r argymhellion hyn, sydd yn rhai pell-gyrhaeddol. Golygant, o'u gweithredu, saernïo cyfundrefn addysg Gymreig, ac iddi nodweddion gwahanol i'r gyfundrefn addysg yn Lloegr. Adroddiad interim yw hwn, a bydd yn ddiddorol gweld sut y bydd y Pwyllgor newydd yn parhau â'r gwaith o fanylu ar rai o'r argymhellion.

Cynog Dafis: I thank everyone who helped prepare this report, and I refer particularly to the steering group that was involved with this issue. In drawing up this report, we had a steering group, rather than an expert adviser. It is striking that there is cross-party support for these recommendations, which are far-reaching. If implemented, they would lead to the creation of a Welsh education system, with characteristics different to the education system in England. This is an interim report, and it will be interesting to see how the new Committee takes this work forward and continues to work on the detail of some of the recommendations.

Mae Plaid Cymru yn croesawu yn arbennig o gynnes yr ymrwymiad i'r cysyniad o ysgol gymunedol sy'n golygu y byddai'r ysgol yn adnodd ar gyfer y gymuned gyfan, ac yn sefydliad a fyddai wedi ei angori yn y gymuned leol, ddaearyddol. Bydd angen mwy o fanylu ar y cysyniad hwn, a byddai'n briodol cynnal nifer o gynlluniau peilot er mwyn gweld sut y gellir gweithredu'r cysyniad yn ymarferol.

Plaid Cymru warmly welcomes the commitment to the concept of the community school, which means that the school would be a resource for the whole community and an establishment that would be firmly rooted in the local, geographical community. This concept needs to be considered in more detail, and it would be appropriate to hold several pilot schemes to see how the concept could be implemented in practice.

Mae'r cysyniad hwnnw yn her syflaenol i'r dynesiad Thatcheraidd/Blairaidd at ysgolion, sy'n eu hystyried fel unedau busnes ymreolus mewn marchnad gystadleuol. Y dynesiad hwnnw, a gyflwynwyd gan Mrs Thatcher yn yr 1980au, sydd wrth wraidd y dull cyllido sydd gennym o hyd yng Nghymru—dull sydd yn niweidiol ar lawer ystyr. Y theori yw

This concept fundamentally challenges the Thatcherite/Blairite approach to schools, which sees them as autonomous business units in a competitive market. That approach, introduced by Mrs Thatcher in the 1980s, is at the heart of the funding system that we still have in Wales—it is a damaging system in many respects. The theory is that competition

bod cystadleuaeth rhwng ysgolion yn codi safonau. Os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â'r syniad o ysgolion cymunedol, mae angen ailwampio'r fformiwla gyllido. A ydyw'r ewyllys gwleidyddol yn bod i wneud hynny? Os ydym am ymwrthod â'r farchnad gystadleuol i gynnal a chodi safonau, pa ddulliau eraill y gallwn eu datblygu i ochel rhag cysgadrwydd a hunanfodlonrwydd mewn ysgolion? Mae'n hynny'n beryglus, ac yn rhywbeth y mae rhai ohonom yn ei gofio o'r dyddiau cyn y chwyldro Thatcheraidd. Mae angen hefyd i astudio a deall sut y gellir darparu dewis cyfrwng dysgu, Cymraeg a Saesneg, o fewn fframwaith gymunedol. Mae modd ei wneud, ond bydd angen ystyriaeth ddeallus a gwybodus.

between schools drives up standards. If we are serious about the idea of community schools, the funding formula needs to be overhauled. Does the political will exist to do that? If we reject the competitive market as a means of maintaining and raising standards, what other methods can we develop to avoid inertia and complacency in schools? That is dangerous, and is something that many of us remember from the days before the Thatcherite revolution. We must also study and understand how to provide a choice of teaching medium, in Welsh and English, within a community framework. It can be done, but it will need intelligent and informed consideration.

Croesawaf sylwadau Aelodau ar y cwricwlwm. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cytuno, ac wedi cytuno erioed, ar yr egwyddor o gwricwlwm cenedlaethol craidd. Mae hynny'n fanteisiol ac mae wedi dwyn ffrwyth yn y gorffennol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig symud rhagblaen i ddechrau'r broses o lunio cwricwlwm cenedlaethol i Gymru—nid cwricwlwm cenedlaethol gyda chwricwlwm Cymreig fel ychwanegiad, ond cwricwlwm sydd yn tarddu o realiti diwyllianol, cymdeithasol a hanesyddol Cymru. Mae hynny lawn cyn bwysiced â chael cwricwlwm sydd yn meddu ar gwmpas byd-eang gyda datblygu cynaliadwy yn thema bwysig iddo. Mae'r cwricwlwm presennol yn rhy annhyblyg, gorlwythog a haearnaidd. Mae angen, nid yn unig ei ddiwygio, ond ei ailadeiladu o'r gwaelod. Derbyniwn y ddadl yn yr adroddiad o blaid dysgu ar batrwm thematig. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig hefyd peidio â cholli golwg ar werth pynciau, sy'n help i strwythuro ystyr, ac sy'n allwedd ar lawer ystyr i ddealltwriaeth. Mae angen cydbwysedd rhwng y dynesiad thematig a'r dynesiad pynciol.

I welcome Members' comments on the curriculum. Plaid Cymru agrees, and has always agreed, with the principle of a core national curriculum. That is beneficial, and has borne fruit in the past. However, it is important to move forward quickly and to begin the process of creating a national curriculum for Wales—not a national curriculum with a *cwricwlwm Cymreig* added on, but a curriculum derived from the cultural, social and historical reality of Wales. That is just as important as a curriculum that has a global view, with sustainable development as an important theme. The current curriculum is too inflexible, burdensome and rigid. It not only needs to be reformed: it needs to be rebuilt from the bottom up. We accept the argument in the report in favour of teaching on a thematic pattern. However, it is also important that we do not lose sight of the value of subjects, which help to structure meaning, and which are key in many ways to understanding. We need a balance between the thematic approach and the subject-based approach.

Yr wyf yn falch bod yr adroddiad yn derbyn bod argymhellion Plaid Cymru ynglŷn â'r system asesu a phrofi yn gadarn a synhwyrol. Nid yw hynny'n syndod—Richard Daugherty a luniodd argymhellion Plaid Cymru ar hynny, a chyflwynodd dystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor.

I am glad that the report accepts that Plaid Cymru's recommendations on the assessment and testing regime are robust and sensible. That is no surprise—Richard Daugherty prepared Plaid Cymru's recommendations on that, and he gave evidence to the Committee.

Mae pwyslais yma ar sicrhau cwricwlwm perthnasol. Mae hynny'n iawn, ond beth a

There is emphasis here on ensuring a relevant curriculum. That is fine, but what do we

feddyliwn wrth 'berthnasol'? Mae'n allweddol dal gafael ar addysgu fel proses o feithrin y meddwl a chyfaredd, yn ogystal â hyfforddi fel ffordd o baratoi ar gyfer swydd a gyrfa.

mean by 'relevant'? It is vital that we do not lose sight of education as a process that nurtures the mind and instils enchantment, as well as training as a way of preparing for employment and a career.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to wind up now, Cynog.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi gloi'n awr, Cynog.

Cynog Dafis: I gloi, felly—gan hepgor rhai pwyntiau—mae angen inni gael y cydbwysedd iawn rhwng hyfforddiant, ar y naill law, ac addysg ar y llaw arall. Mae angen hyfforddiant fel ffordd o gyflwyno sgiliau penodol a'r gallu i wneud rhai pethau penodol, ond mae angen addysg fel ffordd o ddatblygu'r person cyflawn. Mae addysg yn berthnasol i bob copa walltog yn ein cymdeithas. Mae angen addysg ar bawb, ac mae modd addysgu pawb.

Cynog Dafis: To close, therefore—and omitting a few points—we need to achieve the correct balance between training, on the one hand, and education on the other. We need training as a means of providing specific skills and the ability to do specific things, but we need education as a means of developing the rounded individual. Education is relevant to every single person in our community. Everyone needs education, and it is possible to educate everyone.

Alun Pugh: Much work has gone into producing this report on what the school of the future will look like. The school of today, in too many cases in Wales, looks like the school of yesterday. There is a huge backlog of building work, which the Assembly Government is currently working through. There is a brand new school in Colwyn Bay, in my constituency of Clwyd West. It has good architecture, and it is great to see stained glass in a modern school in Wales. As well as that brand new school, there are improvements in Betws-yn-Rhos and in Llandrillo-yn-Rhos, and every school in my constituency has the technology that it needs to deliver the curriculum of the future. Broadband technology is on its way to Welsh schools.

Alun Pugh: Mae llawer o waith wedi mynd i lunio'r adroddiad hwn ar y wedd a fydd ar ysgol y dyfodol. Mewn gormod o lawer o achosion yng Nghymru, mae ysgol heddiw'n debyg i ysgol ddoe. Mae ôl-groniad enfawr o waith adeiladu, y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn delio ag ef ar hyn o bryd. Mae ysgol newydd sbon ym Mae Colwyn, yng Ngorllewin Clwyd, fy etholaeth i. Mae ei phensaernïaeth yn dda, a braf yw gweld gwydr lliw mewn ysgol fodern yng Nghymru. Yn ogystal â'r ysgol newydd sbon honno, ceir gwelliannau ym Metws-yn-Rhos ac yn Llandrillo-yn-Rhos, ac mae gan bob ysgol yn fy etholaeth i y dechnoleg y mae arni ei hangen i ddarparu cwricwlwm y dyfodol. Mae technoleg y band eang ar ei ffordd i ysgolion Cymru.

This report mentions sustainable development. I am pleased that Ysgol Brynhyfryd in Ruthin is getting a brand new teaching block. Twenty ageing portakabins are being replaced by a brand new block, and children will no longer have to walk through a sea of mud to get to their lessons. However, the exciting part of the development in Ysgol Brynhyfryd is that the electrical power required by the school will be generated by photoelectric cells placed on the roof of the new teaching block. During vacations, the spare power that is not needed by the school will be sold to the national grid. Laboratory equipment in the school will allow pupils to

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn sôn am ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Yr wyf yn falch bod Ysgol Brynhyfryd yn Rhuthun yn cael bloc dysgu newydd sbon. Mae bloc newydd sbon yn cymryd lle 20 o hen *portakabins*, ac ni fydd plant bellach yn gorfod cerdded drwy lyn o fwd i gyrraedd eu gwersi. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n gyffrous am y datblygiad yn Ysgol Brynhyfryd yw y bydd y pŵer trydanol y bydd ar yr ysgol ei angen yn cael ei gynhyrchu gan gelloedd ffotodrydanol a osodir ar do'r bloc dysgu newydd. Yn ystod gwyliau, bydd y pŵer sydd dros ben nad oes ar yr ysgol ei angen yn cael ei werthu i'r grid cenedlaethol. Bydd offer yn labordy'r ysgol

see the output of their in-house power station. That is particularly relevant to Ruthin, which suffered greatly in recent floods. The Welsh Assembly Government is paying for a great deal of flood defence work to be done in the town. However, sustainable development for the future is not about digging bigger ditches to cope with bigger floods. It is about tackling the root causes of global warming. The best place to start is in our schools, giving pupils the skills to understand the biggest challenges facing the human race.

yn gadael i ddisgyblion weld pa faint y mae eu gorsaf drydan fewnol yn ei gynhyrchu. Mae hynny'n arbennig o berthnasol i Ruthun, a ddioddefodd yn fawr oherwydd y llifogydd diweddar. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn talu am lawer o waith amddiffyn rhag llifogydd yn y dref. Fodd bynnag, nid yw datblygu cynaliadwy ar gyfer y dyfodol yn golygu torri ffosydd mwy i ddygymod â llifogydd mwy. Mae'n golygu mynd i'r afael ag achosion sylfaenol y cynhesu byd-eang. Y lle gorau i ddechrau yw ein hysgolion, drwy roi i ddisgyblion y sgiliau y mae arnynt eu hangen i ddeall yr heriau mwyaf sy'n wynebu'r hil ddynol.

Mae gan ysgol y dyfodol ran hanfodol i'w chwarae yn natblygiad cymdeithas ddwyieithog. Mae'n anodd dysgu iaith newydd fel oedolyn—gwn hynny o brofiad—ond mae'n haws i blant. Ar hyn o bryd, mae gennym ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg ac ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg yng Nghymru. Mae angen mwy o ysgolion dwyieithog arnom, megis Ysgol Brynhyfryd yn Rhuthun.

The school of the future has a key part to play in developing a bilingual society. It is difficult to learn a new language as an adult—I know that from experience—but it is easier for children. Currently, we have Welsh-medium schools and English-medium schools in Wales. We need more bilingual schools, such as Ysgol Brynhyfryd in Ruthin.

4.40 p.m.

Brian Hancock: I welcome this interim report. I will raise four brief points. First, on foundation schools, they are the remnants of the grant-maintained schools that caused divisions in our communities. Unfortunately, even the Prime Minister supports them. The continuation and potential extension of foundation schools, where LEAs consider their post-16 education provision, is the thin end of the wedge of complete independence, elitism and selection. Will foundation schools be brought into the full LEA system so that all children in our communities can achieve the highest educational standards?

Brian Hancock: Croesawaf yr adroddiad interim hwn. Codaf bedwar pwynt byr. Yn gyntaf, ynghylch ysgolion sefydledig, hwy yw gweddillion yr ysgolion a gynhelid â grant a barai rwyg yn ein cymunedau. Gwaetha'r modd, mae hyd yn oed y Prif Weinidog o'u plaid. Parhad yr ysgolion sefydledig a'r posibiliad o'u heangu, pan yw AALl yn ystyried eu darpariaeth addysg ôl-16, yw blaen y gyllell o ran annibyniaeth lwyr, elitiaeth a dethol. A gaiff ysgolion sefydledig eu cynnwys yn system lawn yr AALl fel y gall pob plentyn yn ein cymunedau gyrraedd y safonau addysgol uchaf?

On special needs education, there are not enough therapists to meet the needs of the growing number of children that need the assistance of speech and language therapists at an early age—usually between the ages of two and three and definitely before nursery school. The health sector has the prime responsibility for this but the education sector has the ultimate responsibility. That situation should be considered and a decision should be made. Perhaps the education sector should

Ynghylch addysg anghenion arbennig, nid oes digon o therapyddion i ddiwallu anghenion y nifer gynyddol o blant y mae arnynt angen cymorth gan therapyddion iaith a lleferydd yn ifanc—rhwng dwy a thair oed fel arfer ac yn sicr cyn yr ysgol feithrin. Gan y sector iechyd y mae'r prif gyfrifoldeb am hyn ond y sector addysg sy'n gyfrifol yn y pen draw. Dylid ystyried y sefyllfa honno a gwneud penderfyniad. Efallai y dylai'r sector addysg fod yn gyfrifol am blant a phobl ifanc

be responsible for children and young people from birth until the age of 19 and the health sector should be responsible for adults from the age of 19 upwards. Both sectors would then know where they stood and would be able to recruit, train and retain their valuable specialists.

o'u genedigaeth hyd at 19 oed ac y dylai'r sector iechyd fod yn gyfrifol am oedolion o 19 oed ymlaen. Wedyn byddai'r ddau sector yn gwybod ym mhle'r oeddent yn sefyll ac yn gallu recriwtio, hyfforddi a chadw eu harbenigwyr gwerthfawr.

I am also concerned about the number of vacancies on school governing bodies in Wales, particularly in secondary schools where vacancies have increased every year since 1999. I welcome the comments on school governors in paragraphs 4.34 and 4.35 of the report. Does the Minister accept that increased workload is the overriding reason for the difficulties in recruiting and retaining school governors? If so, how can she justify the bureaucratic burdens placed on school governors, which have continued to increase during the past four years? Perhaps the similar bureaucratic burdens placed on our teachers should also be reduced.

Yr wyf hefyd yn bryderus ynghylch nifer y lleoedd gwag mewn cyrff llywodraethu ysgol yng Nghymru, yn enwedig mewn ysgolion uwchradd lle y mae nifer y lleoedd gwag wedi codi bob blwyddyn ers 1999. Croesawaf y sylwadau am lywodraethwyr ysgol ym mharagraffau 4.34 a 4.35 yn yr adroddiad. A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn mai cynnydd yn y llwyth gwaith yw'r prif reswm am yr anawsterau wrth recriwtio a chadw llywodraethwyr ysgol? Os felly, sut y gall gyfiawnhau'r beichiau biwrocrataidd a roddir ar lywodraethwyr ysgol, sydd wedi cynyddu'n barhaus yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf? Efallai y dylid lleihau'r beichiau biwrocrataidd tebyg sydd ar ein hathrawon hefyd.

Finally, I remind all Members that canals and waterways play an important part in education, the environment and the economy and that there is an all-party group meeting on canals and waterways this evening.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn atgoffa'r holl Aelodau bod camlesi a dyfrffyrdd yn chwarae rhan o bwys mewn addysg, yr amgylchedd a'r economi a bod cyfarfod heno o'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar gamlesi a dyfrffyrdd.

Gareth Jones: Diolchaf i bawb am eu cyfraniadau a'r ymateb positif a gafwyd. Cytunaf â sylwadau Janice Gregory pan gyfeiriodd at botensial pobl ifanc a'i bod yn bwysig inni ei gydnabod. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar iddynt am eu cyfraniad gan iddo ychwanegu at ansawdd yr adroddiad. Ond, mae'n rhaid inni gofio hefyd y plant hynny y mae'r gyfundrefn yn eu siomi ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid i ysgol y dyfodol, pan ddaw i fodolaeth, fynd i'r afael â hynny a datrys y broblem.

Gareth Jones: I thank everyone for their contributions and the positive response given. I agree with Janice Gregory's comments in referring to the potential of young people and the importance of recognising that. We are grateful to them for their contribution as it added to the quality of the report. However, we must also remember those children who are currently being let down by the system. The school of the future, when it comes to pass, must tackle that and solve the problem.

Diolchaf i William Graham am ei sylwadau positif. O ran cyfyngu sylwadau i awdurdodau addysg lleol, teimlaf y daw rôl y llywodraethwyr efallai yn bwysicach yn y dyfodol. Ni allaf roi sylw pellach ar hynny. Ar hyn o bryd, rhaid inni ddelio â'r realiti sydd o'n cwmpas, a'r awdurdodau addysg lleol yw'r allwedd—dyna lle mae'r bartneriaeth ar hyn o bryd. Cyfeiriasoch at y gwahaniaeth rhwng perfformiad bechgyn a

I thank William Graham for his positive comments. In terms of limiting the comments to local education authorities, I feel that perhaps the role of the governors will become more prominent in the future. I cannot comment any further on that. We must deal with the situation as it stands and the local education authorities are the key—that is where the partnership currently lies. You referred to the difference in the performance

merched, sy'n bryder mawr i'r Pwyllgor fel y bydd i'r Pwyllgor ar ei newydd wedd. Nid oes gennyf sylw pellach i'w wneud ar y sector annibynnol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai ysgol y dyfodol bob amser yn fodlon cydweithio er lles yr unigolyn. Amser a ddengys.

of boys and of girls, which is of great concern to the Committee and will be to the new Committee. I do not have any more comments to make on the independent sector. However, I am sure that the school of the future will always be prepared to co-operate for the benefit of the individual. Time will tell.

Yr wyf falch i Peter Black ein hatgoffa am egwyddorion y Cynulliad. Ceisiodd y Pwyllgor gadw golwg arnynt yn ystod ei drafodaethau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Peter yn cytuno eu bod yn nodweddu cynnwys yr adroddiad. Bu i Peter sôn hefyd am brofion ac asesu a byddai'r Pwyllgor yn cytuno â'i sylwadau na ddylai asesu fod yn rhwystr i'r broses o ddysgu ond yn hytrach dylai gynnal a helpu'r unigolyn. Byddem hefyd yn dymuno gweld arolygiadau fel rhan o bartneriaeth a dylent fod yn gynhaliol yn hytrach nag yn feirniadol. Bu ichi gyffwrdd ar sawl pwynt pwysig arall yn eich sylwadau, Peter.

I am glad that Peter Black reminded us of the Assembly's principles. The Committee tried to keep those in mind during its discussions. I am sure that Peter would agree that they characterise the content of the report. Peter also mentioned testing and assessment and the Committee would agree with his comments that assessment should not be a barrier to the learning process but should support and assist the individual. I would also wish to see inspections happening in partnership and they should be supportive rather than critical. You also touched upon many other important points in your comments, Peter.

Nododd Cynog fod amcanion yr adroddiad yn bellgyrhaeddol. Mae'n rhoi gogwydd wahanol ac yn dilyn trywydd Cymreig. Mae'r potensial ar gael, a dylem groesawu hynny.

Cynog noted that the report's objectives are far-reaching. It gives a different perspective and follows a Welsh route. The potential is there, and we should welcome it.

Derbyniaf—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Pwyllgor a'r Gweinidog hefyd yn gweld—bod anawsterau yn y system gyllido bresennol, ond mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo i ystyried hynny ac i ailwampio'r fformiwla a'r gyfundrefn ariannu.

I acknowledge—and I am sure that the Committee and the Minister also appreciate—the difficulties of the current funding system, but work is underway to consider that and to overhaul the funding system and formula.

O ran y cwricwlwm, gallaf eich sicrhau Cynog, o'r hyn a dderbyniais i ac a ddeallais o'r hyn a drafododd y Pwyllgor, mai cwricwlwm yn ymwneud â Chymru sydd dan sylw. Cwricwlwm sy'n berthnasol i'n gwlad a'n cenedl ydyw, a chaiff ei ddatblygu yn yr ysgol i'r dyfodol.

In terms of the curriculum, I can assure you, Cynog, from what I have understood from the Committee's deliberations, that the curriculum concerned relates to Wales. It will be relevant to our country and nation and will be developed in the school of the future.

Fe'n hatgoffwyd gan Alun Pugh o'r adeiladau, am y newid yn y dechnoleg pensaernïaeth a bod hynny i'w groesawu. Rhaid mewnoli'r elfen o gynaliadwyaeth a sicrhau lle cadarn iddi yn ysgol y dyfodol. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o glywed Alun yn cyfeirio ati fel ysgol ddwyieithog, gan ddweud bod angen mwy o ysgolion dwyieithog yng Nghymru. Hyderaf i'r Pwyllgor gefnogi'r safbwynt hwnnw.

Alun Pugh reminded us of the buildings, of the change in architectural technology and that it is to be welcomed. Sustainablility must be built in and we must ensure that it plays a prominent role in the school of the future. I was pleased to hear Alun refer to it as a bilingual school, saying that more bilingual schools are needed in Wales. I am confident that the Committee endorses that view.

Cyfeiriodd y siaradwr olaf, Brian Hancock, at ysgolion sylfaen. Cymeraf, fel y bydd pethau yn datblygu, gyda mwy o bwyslais ar y gymuned, na fydd eithrio o hynny. Mae ysgol y dyfodol yno i wasanaethu'r gymuned, a'r gymuned i wasanaethu'r ysgol—y mae'n broses ddwy ffordd. Rhaid inni dderbyn y bydd anghenion addysgol arbennig yn sialens inni. Bydd yn sialens i'r Llywodraeth newydd ac i Bwyllgor addysg newydd y Cynulliad. Eto, yr ydym wedi symud ymlaen rhywfaint ers i'r Cynulliad ddod i rym.

The last speaker, Brian Hancock, referred to foundation schools. I assume, as things develop, with more emphasis being placed on the community, that there will be no exempting from that. The school of the future is there to serve the community, and the community to serve the school—it is a two-way process. We must accept that special educational needs will be a challenge for us. They will be a challenge for the new Government and the Assembly's new education Committee. However, we have moved forward somewhat since the Assembly came to power.

Cytunaf fod angen rhoi sylw i'r cyrff llywodraethu. Mae angen pobl sy'n awyddus i wasanaethu eu cymunedau, gan fod cyrff llywodraethu yn hollbwysig i'r amcan a'r nod dan sylw—sicrhau ysgol yn y gymuned.

I agree that we must give due consideration to governing bodies. We need people who are keen to serve their communities, as governing bodies are essential to the aims and objectives being discussed—ensuring that the school is part of the community.

Diolchaf i bawb a gyfrannodd am yr ymateb positif. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod yr adroddiad interim ger ein bron, inni gael adeiladu arno at y dyfodol. Fe'i cymeradwyaf i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac i'r Llywodraeth newydd pan y daw.

I thank everybody who contributed for their positive response. I am grateful that this interim report is before us, so that we can build on it for the future. I commend it to the Assembly Government and to the new Government when it comes to power.

Cynnig (NNDM1419): O blaid 33, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NNDM1419): For 33, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Law, Peter

Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 4.48 p.m.
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.48 p.m.

Cymeradwyo Newid i Brif Grŵp Gwariant Swyddfa'r Llywydd
Approval of a Change to the Main Expenditure Group for the Presiding Office

The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek): I propose that

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 19.5A, agrees the change in the level of resources allocated to the main expenditure group established for the Presiding Office for 2002-03, 2003-04 and the provisional allocations for the subsequent two years, as set out in the revised presiding office MEG 2002-03 to 2005-06, laid in the Table Office on 17 March 2003. (NDM1417)

Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 19.5A, yn cytuno â'r newid yn lefel yr adnoddau a ddyrannwyd i'r prif grŵp gwariant a sefydlwyd ar gyfer Swyddfa'r Llywydd ar gyfer 2002-03, 2003-04 a'r dyraniadau dros dro ar gyfer y ddwy flynedd yn dilyn hynny, fel y nodwyd ym mhrif grŵp gwariant diwygiedig Swyddfa'r Llywydd ar gyfer 2002-03 i 2005-06, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1417)

The Presiding Officer: I see that no speakers wish to contribute, so we will move to the vote.

Y Llywydd: Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw siaradwyr sy'n dymuno cyfrannu, felly awn ymlaen at y bleidlais.

Cynnig (NDM1417): O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1417): For 31, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian

Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i'r Prif Grŵpiau Gwariant
Approval of Changes to the Main Expenditure Groups

The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart): I propose that

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.5, approves the changes to main expenditure groups for the financial year 2002-03 laid in the Table Office on Monday 17 March. (NDM1423)

I would have liked to follow the Deputy Presiding Officer's example, and just present the motion, but I will continue as planned.

This motion is the second, and last, in a series of motions that I bring before the Assembly each year to explain in-year changes to the budget. In addition to asking the Assembly to approve budgetary transfers across main expenditure groups, I have taken the opportunity to add around £255 million to the Assembly's budget for the current financial year. This increase is as a result of the take-up of carry-forward provision, commonly known as end-year flexibility, transfers to and from Government departments and an increase in annually managed expenditure.

Details of these changes are set out in the table attached to the motion, and the accompanying note. Table 2 provides a breakdown of the allocation of additional end-year flexibility provision in the main

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.5, yn cymeradwyo'r newidiadau i'r prif grwpiau gwariant ar gyfer blwyddyn ariannol 2002-03 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ddydd Llun 17 Mawrth. (NDM1423)

Byddwn wedi hoffi dilyn esiampl y Dirprwy Lywydd, a dim ond rhoi'r cynnig gerbron, ond af ymlaen yn ôl y bwriad.

Y cynnig hwn yw'r ail, a'r olaf, mewn cyfres o gynigion a gyflwynaf i'r Cynulliad bob blwyddyn i egluro newidiadau o fewn y flwyddyn i'r gyllideb. Yn ogystal â gofyn i'r Cynulliad gymeradwyo trosglwyddiadau cyllidebol ar draws y prif grwpiau gwariant, yr wyf wedi achub ar y cyfle i ychwanegu tua £255 miliwn at gyllideb y Cynulliad ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol. Mae'r cynnydd hwn yn ganlyniad i'r defnydd o ddarpariaeth ar gyfer dwyn ymlaen, a elwir fel arfer yn hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn, trosglwyddiadau i adrannau Llywodraeth ac oddi wrthynt a chynnydd yn y gwariant a reolir yn flynyddol.

Nodir manylion y newidiadau hyn yn y tabl ynghlwm â'r cynnig, a'r nodyn sydd gydag ef. Yn nhabl 2 ceir dadansoddiad o'r dyraniad o ddarpariaeth hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn yn y prif grŵp gwariant. Bydd y

expenditure group. The additional end-year flexibility provision that has been drawn down by a spring supplementary estimate will be used to cover the costs of the activities that I announced during the budget planning round, the package of measures announced in the rural recovery plan, the Corus regeneration package, and other in-year pressures. I have previously advised the Assembly that the costs of these packages would be funded from end-year flexibility provision.

ddarpariaeth ychwanegol o hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn a gafwyd drwy amcangyfrif atodol yn y gwanwyn yn cael ei defnyddio i dalu costau'r gweithgareddau a gyhoeddais yn ystod cylch cynllunio'r gyllideb, y pecyn o fesurau a gyhoeddwyd yn y cynllun adfer gwledig, pecyn adfywio Corus, a phwysau eraill o fewn y flwyddyn. Yr wyf wedi hysbysu'r Cynulliad cyn hyn y byddid yn talu costau'r pecynnau hyn drwy ddarpariaeth hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn.

4.50 p.m.

I can announce today that I have provided additional funding to the fire service in the current financial year to meet the costs associated with the new dimension initiative. It is essential that fire officers are properly trained to deal with the consequences of any terrorist attacks. I intend to ensure that the service is properly financed to enable training to take place. I will also provide additional resources in 2003-04.

Gallaf gyhoeddi heddiw fy mod wedi darparu cyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth tân yn y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol i dalu'r costau sy'n gysylltiedig â menter y dimensiwn newydd. Mae'n hollbwysig i swyddogion tân gael eu hyfforddi'n briodol i ddelio â chanlyniadau unrhyw ymosodiadau terfysgol. Bwriadaf sicrhau y caiff y gwasanaeth ei gyllido'n briodol fel y gellir cael hyfforddiant. Gwnaf ddarparu adnoddau ychwanegol hefyd yn 2003-04.

In accordance with my usual practice, I propose to write to all Assembly Members with the details of expenditure during the current financial year, including underspend by main expenditure group, as soon as reasonably final figures are available. A fully updated list of revised budgets for this financial year will appear in the management information system tomorrow. I am happy to answer any points from Members.

Yn ôl fy arfer, bwriadaf ysgrifennu at bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad i roi'r manylion am wariant yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol, gan gynnwys tanwariant fesul prif grŵp gwariant, cyn gynted ag y bydd ffigurau gweddol derfynol ar gael. Bydd rhestr wedi'i diweddaru o gyllidebau diwygiedig ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon yn ymddangos yn y system rheoli gwybodaeth yfory. Byddaf yn falch o ateb unrhyw bwyntiau y mae Aelodau'n eu codi.

Janet Ryder: It is good to see extra money going into the budget. I will touch on one or two matters, especially transfers in the health budget. The funding for accelerated discharge is a small amount but it is welcome. To release bed capacity in hospitals we have to provide the community support, the physiotherapists, the occupational therapists and the additional care home beds necessary to accelerate discharge from hospital; we must ensure that beds are available in the first place.

Janet Ryder: Da yw gweld arian ychwanegol yn mynd i'r gyllideb. Cyfeiriaf at un neu ddau o faterion, ac at drosglwyddiadau yn y gyllideb iechyd yn benodol. Swm bach yw'r cyllid ar gyfer rhyddhau cyflymach ond mae i'w groesawu. Er mwyn rhyddhau capasiti gwelyau mewn ysbytai rhaid inni ddarparu'r cymorth yn y gymuned, y ffisiotherapyddion, y therapyddion galwedigaethol a'r gwelyau ychwanegol mewn cartrefi gofal sydd eu hangen i ryddhau'n gyflymach o ysbytai; rhaid inni sicrhau bod gwelyau ar gael yn y lle cyntaf.

You cannot read a document such as this

Ni ellir darllen dogfen fel hon heddiw heb

today without picking up on the word 'dental'. I am sure that everyone is aware of the report that has come out today on the lack of access to NHS dentists. This document mentions bursaries for dentists. If we could develop a system of bursaries for dentists whereby they were trained and then returned to a certain location for several years, we might be able to start addressing the problem.

sylwi ar y gair 'deintyddol'. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod pawb yn ymwybodol o'r adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd heddiw ar y diffyg o ran y gallu i weld deintyddion GIG. Mae'r ddogfen hon yn sôn am fwrsariaethau ar gyfer deintyddion. Os gallem ddatblygu system o fwrsariaethau ar gyfer deintyddion a fyddai'n fodd i'w hyfforddi a'u dychwelyd wedyn i leoliad penodol am rai blynyddoedd, efallai y gallem ddechrau mynd i'r afael â'r broblem.

One of the major changes is the addition for the forecast of farmers' claims. It is good to see that extra money is being made available, but to the farmers who are still waiting for their late payments it is not much help. I am pleased that more money will be made available to train the fire service, particularly to face any terrorist attack. On Friday night, I talked to the fire service and the unions informed me that they were not aware of any such additional training being made available. I would, therefore, appreciate the Minister's telling us what training will be offered.

Un o'r newidiadau mawr yw'r swm ychwanegol o ran rhagweld hawliadau gan ffermwyr. Da yw gweld bod arian ychwanegol yn cael ei ddarparu, ond ni fydd yn fawr o gymorth i'r ffermwyr sy'n dal i ddisgwyl am eu taliadau hwyr. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd mwy o arian ar gael i hyfforddi'r gwasanaeth tân, yn benodol i wynebu unrhyw ymosodiad terfysgol. Nos Wener, bûm yn siarad â'r gwasanaeth tân ac fe'm hysbyswyd gan yr undebau nad oeddent yn ymwybodol bod unrhyw hyfforddiant ychwanegol o'r fath i'w ddarparu. Gan hynny, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddai'r Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym pa hyfforddiant a gynigir.

It is disappointing that additional money will not be made available for the ambulance service. The Government has a report that demonstrates that an increase in funding of at least £89 million is required to bring the modern ambulance service up to scratch. The service is good, but it does not have sufficient equipment or personnel to provide an adequate response, particularly in rural areas such as Cerrigydrudion, where people still wait for up to 50 minutes following an emergency call-out. Last year's budget allocation to the ambulance service was insufficient. I had hoped that the Minister would revisit that issue today—no doubt she will touch on the matter again tomorrow—but the lack of additional money is a disappointment.

Mae'n siomedig na fydd arian ychwanegol ar gael i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae gan y Llywodraeth adroddiad sy'n dangos bod angen o leiaf £89 miliwn o gyllid ychwanegol i godi'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans cyfoes at y safon. Mae'r gwasanaeth yn dda, ond nid oes ganddo ddigon o offer na staff i gynnig ymateb digonol, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig fel Cerrigydrudion, lle y mae pobl yn dal i ddisgwyl hyd at 50 munud ar ôl gwneud galwad brys. Ni chafwyd dyraniad digonol i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y gyllideb y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio y byddai'r Gweinidog wedi ailystyried y mater hwnnw heddiw—mae'n siŵr y bydd yn cyfeirio at y mater eto yfory—ond mae'r diffyg arian ychwanegol yn destun siom.

Peter Black: I welcome this important extra money. The addition of £255 million to the budget demonstrates the Assembly's commitment to the proper funding of public services. It further illustrates that the Finance Minister's tight financial management has allowed money brought forward through end-year flexibility to be spent on essential

Peter Black: Croesawaf yr arian ychwanegol pwysig hwn. Mae'r ychwanegiad o £255 miliwn at y gyllideb yn dangos ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i gyllido gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn briodol. Mae'n arwydd pellach bod rheolaeth ariannol dynn y Gweinidog Cyllid wedi caniatáu dwyn arian ymlaen drwy hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn i'w wario ar

programmes, such as the rural recovery plan and the Corus regeneration package.

raglenni hanfodol, fel y cynllun adfer gwledig a phecyn adfywio Corus.

Janet Ryder omitted to mention some important issues included in the document, not least the establishment of the broadband Wales unit and the extra money to address important issues with regard to education, lifelong learning and the Home Office. I note that there is a top-slice of £13 million for police funding being returned to the Home Office. My understanding is that the Home Office is effectively repatriating this money as part of its re-evaluation of how to deal with the police service, and that that money will then be available through direct grants in England and Wales. The handling of this matter graphically illustrates the need for the Assembly to have greater control over police finances and authorities. We must make up some of that shortfall from our budget. It is not guaranteed that police forces will receive this money when they bid for the grants and they will be put under pressure as a result. If the Welsh Assembly Government were in charge of police funding, it could set its own agenda in partnership with the police and this top-slicing would not occur. I regret that money is returning to the Home Office in this way.

Anghofiodd Janet Ryder sôn am rai materion pwysig sydd yn y ddogfen, gan gynnwys sefydlu uned band eang Cymru a'r arian ychwanegol i ymdrin â materion pwysig sy'n ymwneud ag addysg, dysgu gydol oes a'r Swyddfa Gartref. Nodaf fod brigdoriad o £13 miliwn ar gyfer cyllido'r heddlu yn cael ei ddychwelyd i'r Swyddfa Gartref. Yr wyf yn deall bod y Swyddfa Gartref yn cymryd yr arian hwn yn ôl, i bob pwrpas, fel rhan o'i hailwerthusiad o'r modd i ymdrin â'r gwasanaeth heddlu, ac y bydd yr arian hwnnw ar gael wedyn drwy grantiau uniongyrchol yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae'r dull o drafod y mater hwn yn dangos yn eglur yr angen i'r Cynulliad gael mwy o reolaeth dros gyllid ac awdurdodau heddlu. Rhaid inni wneud iawn am rywfaint o'r diffyg hwnnw o'n cyllideb. Nid oes sicrwydd y bydd heddluoedd yn cael yr arian hwn ar ôl ymgeisio am y grantiau a byddant o dan bwysau o ganlyniad i hynny. Pe bai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gyfrifol am gyllid yr heddlu, gallai osod ei hagenda ei hun mewn partneriaeth â'r heddlu ac ni cheid y brigdorri hwn. Mae'n ofid imi fod yr arian hwn yn mynd yn ôl i'r Swyddfa Gartref fel hyn.

David Ian Jones: The Conservative group notes the changes to the main expenditure groups, which are of a routine and administrative nature in some respects and which were heralded in the Minister's budget statement previously. However, I will mention one or two issues, particularly the decrease in the reserves of £13.7 million, which has gone to the Home Office for police funding. That seems somewhat surprising, and a case of central Government giving with one hand and taking back with the other.

David Ian Jones: Mae'r grŵp Ceidwadol yn nodi'r newidiadau i'r prif grwpiau gwariant, sy'n rhai cyffredin a gweinyddol ar sawl cyfrif ac a gyhoeddwyd yn natganiad cyllideb y Gweinidog cyn hyn. Fodd bynnag, soniaf am un neu ddau o faterion, yn enwedig y gostyngiad o £13.7 miliwn yn y cronfeydd wrth gefn, a aeth i'r Swyddfa Gartref ar gyfer cyllid yr heddlu. Mae hynny'n ymddangos yn rhyfedd braidd, ac yn enghraifft o Lywodraeth ganolog yn rhoi ag un llaw a chymryd yn ôl â'r llall.

Like Janet Ryder, I welcome the additional funding for the fire service, particularly in the current climate. However, I echo her concern about the lack of similar additional funding for the ambulance service to deal with the increased terrorist threat, which is of concern to us all at the moment.

Fel Janet Ryder, croesawaf y cyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth tân, yn enwedig yn yr hinsawdd bresennol. Fodd bynnag, ategaf ei phryder ynghylch diffyg cyllid ychwanegol tebyg ar gyfer y gwasanaeth ambiwlans i ddelio â'r bygythiad mwy oddi wrth derfysgaeth, sy'n destun pryder i bob un ohonom ar hyn o bryd.

I raise the issue of the reallocation of

Codaf fater yr ailddyrannu ar adnoddau yn y

resources within the rural development budget. There is a transfer of about £1.38 million from agri-environment schemes to various other budget expenditure lines, including £500,000 to publicity. Given that agri-environment schemes attract popular cross-party support, it would be of concern if valuable resources were to be diverted to expenditure such as publicity without further explanation. I would greatly appreciate an explanation at this stage, Minister. Otherwise, no doubt, the matter can be further explained at the next meeting of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee.

gyllideb datblygu gwledig. Ceir trosglwyddiad o tua £1.38 miliwn o gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol i amryw o linellau gwariant cyllideb eraill, gan gynnwys £500,000 at gyhoeddusrwydd. Gan fod cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol boblogaidd i gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol, byddai'n ofid pe byddai adnoddau gwerthfawr yn cael eu troi at wariant fel cyhoeddusrwydd heb eglurhad pellach. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn o gael eglurhad yn awr, Weinidog. Fel arall, mae'n siŵr y gellir egluro'r mater ymhellach yn y cyfarfod nesaf o'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig.

The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart): I assume that you are referring to the transfer of £800,000 from the agriculture and rural development main expenditure group to the environment, planning and transport MEG. That transfer is for the Environment Agency's work with freshwater and salmon fisheries. There is also a transfer of £351,000 from the agriculture and rural development MEG to the central administration MEG for an accounting change for the costs of the Farming and Rural Conservation Agency. I am sure that these matters can be taken up with the Minister. However, if Members agree, and given that there is such an interest in agriculture, I will provide a detailed note about the transfers and place it in the Library.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart): Cymeraf eich bod yn cyfeirio at drosglwyddo £800,000 o brif grŵp gwariant amaethyddiaeth a datblygu gwledig i brif grŵp gwariant yr amgylchedd, cynllunio a thrafnidiaeth. Mae'r trosglwyddiad hwnnw ar gyfer gwaith Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd gyda physgodfeydd eogiaid a dŵr croyw. Ceir trosglwyddiad hefyd o £351,000 o brif grŵp gwariant amaethyddiaeth a datblygu gwledig i brif grŵp gwariant gweinyddu canolog ar gyfer newid mewn cyfrifo ar gyfer costau'r Asiantaeth Ffermio a Chadwraeth Wledig. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gellir codi'r materion hyn gyda'r Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, os yw Aelodau'n cytuno, a chan fod cymaint o ddiddordeb mewn amaethyddiaeth, darparaf nodyn manwl am y trosglwyddiadau a'i osod yn y Llyfrgell.

I thank Peter for his comments on policing. There is an issue about the funding formula. Although the top-slice will return to the Home Office, I assure Members that, compared to the total top-slice, we should receive more money in grants to police authorities. However, it is not a satisfactory way of dealing with police funding, as I have previously commented. It is important that we continue to press the Home Office to ensure greater transparency in the nature of police funding in Wales and to allow more involvement by the National Assembly. It is clear from recent initiatives that we have undertaken with the police in Wales that there is room for further work with police authorities and forces, and it would be much easier if we had more direct access to the criteria used in terms of policing. All those issues must be properly explored. It is

Diolchaf i Peter am ei sylwadau am blismona. Mae mater yn codi ynghylch y fformiwla cyllido. Er y bydd y brigdoriad yn mynd yn ôl i'r Swyddfa Gartref, yr wyf yn sicrhau Aelodau y dylem dderbyn mwy o arian, o'i gymharu â'r brigdoriad, ar ffurf grantiau i awdurdodau heddlu. Er hynny, nid yw'n ddull boddhaol o ddelio â chyllid yr heddlu, fel y dywedais o'r blaen. Mae'n bwysig inni barhau i bwyso ar y Swyddfa Gartref er mwyn sicrhau cyllido mwy tryloyw i'r heddlu yng Nghymru ac i roi mwy o ran i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'n amlwg o'r mentrau yr ydym wedi ymgymryd â hwy'n ddiweddar gyda'r heddlu yng Nghymru fod lle i waith pellach gydag awdurdodau heddlu a heddluoedd, a byddai'n haws o lawer pe byddai gennym gysylltiad mwy uniongyrchol â'r meini prawf a ddefnyddir yng nghyd-destun plismona.

important that we have cross-party support for this. We are all committed to the work of the police, but we want to see simpler funding mechanisms that are transparent for the people of Wales. People notice this issue when they see the police precept included in their council tax bills and, at present, they do not understand how those monetary matters arise.

Rhaid ymchwilio'n iawn i'r holl faterion hynny. Mae'n bwysig inni gael cefnogaeth i hyn gan yr holl bleidiau. Yr ydym i gyd wedi ymrwymo i waith yr heddlu, ond yr ydym am weld mecanweithiau cyllido symlach sy'n dryloyw yng ngolwg pobl Cymru. Mae pobl yn sylwi ar y mater hwn pan welant braesept yr heddlu ar eu biliau treth gyngor ac, ar hyn o bryd, nid ydynt yn deall sut y mae'r materion ariannol hynny'n codi.

I am pleased that we could give additional money to the fire service to deal with the immediate risk of a terrorist attack. There is sufficient money within the block for Ministers to deal with other issues from within their budgets. Janet Ryder alluded to several issues and expressed her disappointment. My only disappointment is that, after four years, Janet still does not understand MEG to MEG transfers. By definition, these are technical changes, as David indicated in speaking on behalf of the Conservative Party, and there are only minimal changes in terms of the money coming in. It is a matter of me showing what I have done and why, and putting into effect what I have indicated that I will do in previous speeches. That is what I have done for several years.

Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi gallu rhoi arian ychwanegol i'r gwasanaeth tân i ddelio â'r risg presennol o ymosodiad terfysgol. Mae digon o arian yn y bloc fel y gall Gweinidogion ddelio â materion eraill o fewn eu cyllidebau eu hun. Cyfeiriodd Janet Ryder at sawl mater a mynegi ei siom. Yr unig siom i mi yw bod Janet, ar ôl pedair blynedd, yn methu â deall trosglwyddiadau rhwng y naill brif grŵp gwariant a'r llall. Drwy ddiffiniad, newidiadau technegol yw'r rhain, fel y nododd David wrth siarad ar ran y Blaid Geidwadol, a dim ond mân newidiadau a geir o ran yr arian sy'n dod i mewn. Yr hyn a wnaf yma yw dangos beth a wneuthum a pham, a rhoi ar waith yr hyn y nodais y byddwn yn ei wneud mewn areithiau blaenorol. Dyna'r hyn yr wyf yn ei wneud ers sawl blwyddyn.

I thank everyone else for their comments.

Diolchaf i bawb arall am eu sylwadau.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister. As ever, sharp.

Y Llywydd: Diolch i chi, Weinidog. Buoch yn graff, fel yr ydych bob amser.

Cynnig (NDM1423): O blaid 24, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1423): For 24, Abstain 10, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

Y Llywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

The Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.02 p.m.
The session ended at 5.02 p.m.